

the price of tea has fallen below the Minimum Support Price. The tea growers in Tamil Nadu are suffering very much due to the shortfall in prices. In order to save the tea growers, the State is now procuring tea from the farmers and selling it to people through PDS. In this process, the State Government is incurring losses. I would like to know whether the Government of India would come forward to compensate the losses suffered by the State Government in this process.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Sir, the Government of Tamil Nadu has to be complimented for taking care of the tea growers, in that sense. But I do hope that they have considered the fact that they have enough resources to do it. I don't know whether your Government has put forward the proposal before the Centre or not, but the point is, every State, whatever they are going to encourage the farmers, the overall financial situation has to be considered before the State Government does anything in this case.

Policy for Writing Text Books

***82. SHRI JIBON ROY:** Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

(a) Whether Government's attention has been drawn to the news item appearing in the Sunday Times of 28th October, 2001, under the caption, "NCERT set to rewrite unity in diversity"; and

(b) Whether Government would announce a transparent policy on syllabus making and the names who are selected for writing text books?

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI): (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) Curriculum development and preparation of syllabus are among the main activities of NCERT, which is an ongoing process. Based on the syllabus, subject-wise Advisory Committees are set up to examine the content and prepare guidelines for writing text-books. As per the long standing practice in NCERT, the draft text-books are

prepared by involving subject experts in NCERT, University Professors and outside experts and reviewed in workshops/seminars before finalisation. There is no fixed panel of experts for writing the text books. When the text-books are finally printed, the names of the experts associated with the development of text books are mentioned in them. There has been no change in this policy.

SHRI JIBON ROY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I had two queries. Firstly, I wanted a policy statement on re-writing the syllabus. Secondly, I wanted the names of the persons selected for text-book writing. The answer given by the hon. Minister is that syllabus-making is an ongoing process; and, therefore, no answer is given. So far as giving the names of the persons selected for writing the books, the hon. Minister has answered that when the textbooks are finally printed, the names of the experts associated with the development of the textbooks are mentioned in them; and, therefore, no answer. It is of course, autocratic; but I leave it to the Minister to consider whether it is fascist too.

The thing is, Mr. Chairman, Sir, Unending debate is going on in the newspapers. Every day, seminars, speeches, meetings, are taking place on the question of syllabus-making. The hon. Minister says that it is an on-going process. As such, I am not against updating the syllabus. It should be on the basis of truth and intellectuality. If there is any difference, it should be resolved through academic debate.

What is the main complaint against the revision? The people, who are in charge of syllabus-making, are communalising the knowledge. This is the biggest complaint. The second complaint, which is of concern to me—the way the news is trickling down—it looks like the textbooks would be printed in a manner where it would be meant only for the elite. An official of the NCERT has mentioned—it is on record and articles have also appeared on this—that 400 pages of text, comprising geography, history, civics, social science and economics would be compressed into one textbook. This is point number one.

Secondly, it is mentioned that the examination would be taken not on the subject taught, but on the knowledge of the children. That means, the books would contain only points, and the children have to

gather their knowledge from newspapers and other media; because the question papers would be prepared on the knowledge alone. In that event, education would be the preserve of students of schools like Doon School, and, for other general students, it would be closed. My point is, in view of the fact that a serious debate is going on all over the country, since academicians are totally divided on it, also since new people are entrusted with the job, I would like to know whether the Government would consider forming a Joint Committee of Parliamentarians, connected with the education field, to go into the entire matter and advise the Government over the issue.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT DR. (SHRIMATI) RITA VERMA: Sir, as we have already pointed out, the process of preparing textbooks in the NCERT remains the same. It was so in the earlier Congress Government's time as well as in the United Front Government's time. The task of writing books is accomplished by involving both internal faculty members of the Council and external expertise and practising teachers as per their field of specialisation, expertise and experience. Thus, writing and editing teams have a composite nature, suiting to the requirements of the subject. In some cases, separate editing teams are formed depending upon the nature of the subject and availability of the faculty with the Council. The cooperation and involvement of the teachers, teacher educators and subject experts is sought in bringing out the textual materials. The requirements are also identified on the similar pattern. The coordination mechanism that follows helps in bringing out the textual materials having coherence of ideas and sequential arrangement of contents. This has been the practice. There is no fixed panel of teachers writing the books. There is a panel. They write and then the product is thoroughly disseminated by a panel of experts. It undergoes many editions, it goes many transformations before it is finally published. Shall I say, Sir, even before seeing the book, is it right to cast aspersions on the integrity of the writers? Let us wait and see the published books before voicing our opinion on it.

SHRI JIBON ROY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, everything is beign kept under the veil of secrecy. ...*(Interruptions)*... Everything is shrouded

under secrecy. ...*(Interruptions)*... At least, they should tell us what they are going to do. ...*(Interruptions)*... They should come officially and contradict the statements that are appearing in the Press. It is being stated in the newspapers that even the people who are writing these books do not know one another. It has appeared in the Press and it is on record that some points are circulated like Mein Kampf of Hitler that they have to write on these points, and different parts are given to the writers. Nobody knows ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Are we having a debate on this subject? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JIBON ROY: Sir, I want to know who those writers are and what the policy of the Government in this regard is ...*(Interruptions)*... I would like to know whether these are facts or not. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, a more disturbing news appeared on November 11, in the Times of India, that Shri D.N. Jha, the convenor of Secondary Education on History was removed because he had objected to the history curriculum. ...*(Interruptions)*... This news appeared in The Times of India, ...*(Interruptions)*... Let them contradict it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Aijazudin Ahmed, an eminent geographer has been dropped from curriculum making. Today also a news item has appeared in the Hindustan Times that the NCERT has ordered deletion of a number of passages from history books written for it. Among those whose books have suffered are Romila Thappar and Ram Sharan Sharma, two of the most eminent historians on ancient India. It has also been alleged that someone who used to write the pamphlets for Vishwa Hindu Parishad and someone who wrote a book on Ramjanmabhoomi have been given the charge of writing history books. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: राम जन्म भूमि पर लिखने वाले को क्या निकालकर बाहर कर दिया जायेगा? इसका क्या मतलब है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI JIBON ROY: The charge is on the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... I do not know what the correct position is. ...*(Interruptions)*... These are the news items appearing in the Press. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Government is not contradicting them.

...(Interruptions)... There is a serious charge against the Government that they are communalising knowledge. Instead of resolving the dispute, they are persecuting the historians. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JIBON ROY: Therefore, I want to know ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, my question is this. ...*(Interruptions)*... My question is, would you please make out the list of the writers public?

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: साम्प्रदायिकता पर डिसकस करना है तो करिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Sir, then he can blame the publication when it is published. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) RITA VERMA: I just want to assure my friend that we have been following, strictly, the policies of the previous Governments. It has always been the policy of the NCERT that the draft textbooks are prepared by involving subject experts and the names of the writers are published on the textbooks when they are finally published. About the other points, my hon. colleague mentioned so many things that, at times, I feel confused. I should only point out that nobody ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: It is about the newspaper reports ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) RITA VERMA: I just say, please wait for the books to be published and allow them to disseminate thoroughly. I should also say that these books are meant for children with impressionable mind. I hope the House will agree with me that the children are very sensitive and they should be protected from casteist and religious bias. If there is something very unpleasant about any religion or any caste, we should take care and see that the young and immature minds are not exposed to them. When these children grow up and when they have their mind matured, they are free to search their truth, to write books as they like, and hold different viewpoints.

[23 November 2001] RAJYA SABHA

But, when you say that a particular religious leader was not behaving in an honourable way, the sensitive child is prejudiced, his mind is prejudiced, and these things are certainly not conducive to a homogeneous society like ours.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, our society is a pluralistic society. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) RITA VERMA: Yes. It is plural. Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Are you talking about the cultural policy? ...*(Interruptions)*... I do not know whether the homogeneous...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: Here, homogeneous means harmonious and cohesive. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, if she needs interpretation, I would explain to the House the statement made, then there is a problem. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, yes...*(Interruptions)*... Have you replied to the supplementary...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) RITA VERMA: Yes, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Sir, with your permission, I would like to put two questions to the hon. Minister.

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: You make it as part (a) and part (b) ...*(Interruptions)*... प्रणब जी बता देंगे। पड़ोस में हैं।...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: You are making a mess of everything and you want me to put my supplementary as (a) and (b)?

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: You are going to make a mess of the questions that you are going to put...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: You have made a mess of the Ministry. You have Talibanised the Ministry.

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: You made a mess of it when you were in that seat...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Sir, at least, three times I came before

Parliament with various policies when I was holding that charge. I am asking the hon. Minister. Has the Ministry's work, the different portions of the work been debated in this Parliament? You are doing everything behind Parliament. It is nothing less than Talibanisation of education in India.

SHRI B. P. SHINGHAL: Sir, I beg your pardon. What does he mean by Talibanisation of education...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, this cannot go like this...*(Interruptions)*... Any Member, at any point of time wanting to express...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, he is making an allegation against the Ministry. He is saying Talibanisation of the Ministry...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी: सभापति महोदय, आप कृपया उन्हें बता दीजिए कि तालिबानाइजेशन का अर्थ क्या है, नहीं तो हम बता देते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह जानना चाहते हैं कि तालिबान का अर्थ क्या है, तालिबानी क्या होते हैं?...*(व्यवधान)*... जो आप कर रहे हैं...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Talibanisation?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, he has said that the Government has Talibanised education...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: You have adopted anti-Hindu policies...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir he is a senior leader. He cannot...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: ...intolerance and lack of perception to the various aspects of our civilization ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir I want a debate in Parliament on education ...*(Interruptions)*... I want a debate...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You give a notice of this ...*(Interruptions)*... You give a notice. We will discuss ...*(Interruptions)*... आप क्वेश्चन तो पूरा कर लीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

[23 November 2001] RAJYA SABHA

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: Sir, what does he mean by that?
...(Interruptions)...

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी: सभापति महोदय, हमारे आदरणीय सांसद जानना चाहते हैं कि तालिबान क्या होता है, उन्हें आप बता दीजिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: He has not even put his question... (Interruptions)...

SHRI P. N. SIVA: Sir, that word must be expunged
...(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: आप अपना सवाल कर दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Why? How can that word be expunged? ... (Interruptions) ... How that word can be expunged? ... (Interruptions) ... If a word is unparliamentary, only then it can be expunged... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, what is this? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, what is this? ... (Interruptions) ... How have you raised this? ... (Interruptions) ... If I say that the Government is controlling the education ... (Interruptions) ... How can you say that it is unparliamentary? ... (Interruptions) ... Under what rule it is unparliamentary? ... (Interruptions) ... Under what rule it is unparliamentary? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI P. N. SIVA: Sir, let him withdraw the word
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: How can you say it is unparliamentary? (Interruptions) - How can you say it is unparliamentary? (Interruptions) It is not unparliamentary. (Interruptions) It is not unparliamentary. (Interruptions) You people are making a mess, and, then, you start getting up and say it is unparliamentary. (Interruptions) Why is it unparliamentary? (Interruptions) Why is it unparliamentary? (Interruptions) What is unparliamentary? (Interruptions) This is going to be... (Interruptions) I have every right to say that you are Talibanis. (Interruptions) Your behaviour is like Talibanis. (Interruptions) In your attitude, you are

Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* You are intolerant. *(Interruptions)* You are behaving like*. *(Interruptions)* You are behaving like Talibanis. *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी: वे पूछ रहे हैं कि तालीबान का रिजल्ट क्या निकला ...*(व्यवधान)*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I will go on saying that your attitude is like Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* You are behaving like Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* You are behaving like* *(Interruptions)* I will say you are Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* You are behaving like Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* Your attitude is like Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* You are* *(Interruptions)* You are Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* I say you are* *(Interruptions)* You are Talibanis. *(Interruptions)* How can you behave in this manner? *(Interruptions)* How can you behave in this manner? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: I do not understand the interpretation of these words, 'Taliban' and* *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Who are you? *(Interruptions)* Who are you? *(Interruptions)* Who are you? *(Interruptions)* Nothing is unparliamentary...*(Interruptions)*. If you behave in this manner, we will not allow you to function. *(Interruptions)* If you behave in this manner, we will not allow you to function. *(Interruptions)* Let us see how you can transact the Business. *(Interruptions)* Let us see how you can transact the Business. *(Interruptions)* We will not allow the Government to transact even a single Business of the House. *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी: सभापति जी, उत्तर प्रदेश में क्या है...*(व्यवधान)*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Let us see how you can carry on any Business. *(Interruptions)* What do you think of yourself? *(Interruptions)* He had hardly put his question, and you people got up and started shouting. *(Interruptions)* Let us have a 3-4 hours. ...*(Interruptions)* No question of withdrawal. *(Interruptions)* No

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

question of withdrawal. (*Interruptions*) Not a single word will be withdrawn. (*Interruptions*) We are not going to withdraw even a single word. (*Interruptions*) Your behaviour is like Talibanis. (*Interruptions*) Your behaviour is like* (*Interruptions*) I will go on saying that you are behaving in a* manner. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. RAMACHANDRAN PILLAI: It is our right to say. (*Interruptions*) Nobody can curtail our right to say. (*Interruptions*) It is our right to say. (*Interruptions*) Intolerance! (*Interruptions*) Intolerance! (*Interruptions*) That is the nature of ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: We are not going to listen to you. (*Interruptions*) You are people. (*Interruptions*) you are Taliban. (*Interruptions*) . You are Taliban; You are* (*Interruptions*)

SHRI O. RAJAGOPAL: Sir, I would like to submit that since the whole country is against Taliban and talibanization, it is better that we avoid that expression. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. RAMACHANDRAN PILLAI: It is our right to say that. (*Interruptions*) And we will continue to say that. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: It may not be an unparliamentary word; but it is an abusive word. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: You find out that from the dictionary. (*Interruptions*) You show me a dictionary which says that 'Taliban' and are unparliamentary words. (*Interruptions*). You show me the dictionary. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, you give your ruling. (*Interruptions*) Please give your ruling. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: We are always prepared for a debate. (*Interruptions*)

श्री एस० एस० अहलवालिया: सर... (व्यवधान) सर(व्यवधान)

SHRI JIBON ROY: You are supporting them at your own peril.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

(Interruptions). They are Talibanising education and you are supporting it. (Interruptions).

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: Sir, you give a ruling ... (Interruptions) ... it should not become a precedent. (Interruptions).

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I think what is happening in the House is most unfortunate. Shri Arjun Singh is one of our senior-most Members. He rose to speak; he had not completed even one sentence when Shri Chaturvedi interrupted him. I think it is not an acceptable behaviour on the part of any hon. Member. (Interruptions)

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: The word 'Taliban' was used in an abusive way. (Interruptions).

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: All the Talibans and are sitting in those benches. (Interruptions)

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: I only said, 'put your question as (a) part and (b) part.' (Interruptions) I did not interrupt. (Interruptions).

SHRI RAMACHANDRAN PILLAI: You tried to interrupt. (Interruptions)

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: We are not going to accept that (Interruptions).

SHRI T. N. CHATURVEDI: ...because somebody said that there are two questions. (Interruptions). So, I said, 'put your questions as (a) and (b),' (Interruptions).

SHRI C. P. THIRUNAVUKKARASU: We want a ruling from the Chair, (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO STARRED QUESTIONS

Recruitment norms for Kendriya Vidyalaya and Navodaya Vidyalaya teachers

*83. DR. ARUN KUMAR SARMA: Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.