

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Every word of mine is going on record and it will become part of history again.

एक माननीय सदस्य : मेरी बात रिकार्ड पर जा रही है। (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : मेरी बात तो रिकार्ड पर जा रही है।... (व्यवधान)

Mr. Prime Minister, they have raised certain issues. It will be in the interests of the House and the Members if you could refer to them also to their satisfaction.

#### MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS-Contd.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Madam, they are precisely first on my agenda. I think there is a sort of telepathy between us. The issue that was being raised by the hon. Members on the other side is precisely the first part of my agenda. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would humbly with folded hands, request you to sit down. Have some patience. Have some tranquilliser. Sit down and listen to him. If you are not satisfied, he is prepared to answer. When did he say 'no'? Why do you want to make an issue of nothing? (Interruptions). Please sit down. Take your seats.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Hon. Subramanian Swamy rightly said that live issues should be addressed. I wish the people gave more life to his party. He would have been livelier than what he is now. But in spite of it, he is lively. (Interruptions).

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): ...find out what you have done...(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Come on. In our anguish let us not leave our sense of humour. Let us keep that sense alive. Sit down. (Interruptions).

It is not between you and him. (Interruptions).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): What is the humour when Kashmir is burning?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, ... (व्यवधान) ... वाक आउट किया था ... (व्यवधान) ... वाक आउट नहीं करेंगे। हम हर चीज का जवाब लेंगे। आपके पास कोई जवाब नहीं है। आप लोगों के सौदागर हैं। श्री सुप्री मोहम्मद सईद की बेटी को बचाने वाले भूतपूर्व विधायक को फाँसी पर लटकवाया गया। आपकाश्मीर के प्रभारी, मंत्री के द्वारा दल बदल कराने और सरकारों को गिराने के लिए बढ़ावा दे रहे हैं ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I again request you humbly...(Interruptions)... I am requesting everybody. You are really becoming very difficult people. I told the Prime Minister to mention the issues which you have raised. Now what is there if he is talking to Mr. Subramanian Swamy?

...(Interruptions)... Mr. Subramanian Swamy also said something. You can't decide. This is not the way. (Interruptions)... Please sit down. Don't make an issue of everything. It does not reflect very well on the Members of Parliament on their seriousness.

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): You can guide us. You can direct us. But don't get anguished. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know which way I shall request the Members to keep quiet. If I just get angry, it is bad; if I say humbly, that is also bad. I do not know which way I should go. Now you decide it yourself.

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI: You cannot control that way...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now this is not fair. Please sit down. I will not allow. I am not allowing Mr.

[The Deputy Chairman]

Jagesh Desai, you are on the Panel of Vice-Chairmen. You should respect the Chair. Sit down. You may disagree... (Interruptions)... It is none of your business.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, the point was raised about Goa and the point was raised that we have toppled the Government... (Interruptions)... All right. All right. "trying to topple".

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया (बिहार): यह शुक्रवार को आप ने ही धुल्लूआत की थी।

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, the process now has been adopted to make an amendment to each sentence I say. Anyway, I am ready to bear with it... (Interruptions)...

आपके प्वाइंट पर भी आऊंगा। कोई बात नहीं। तसल्ली रखिए।

The point has been raised that we have toppled or trying to topple. I received information that the Chief Minister has resigned... (Interruptions)..

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : काश्मीर के प्रभारी मंत्री दल बदल करवा रहे हैं और आप मुत्कुरा रहे हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : आप बैठिए, तसल्ली तो रखिए।

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :... (व्यवधान)... लोगों को सरकार बदलने के लिए विवश को रहा है और काश्मीर में आपके गृह मंत्री की बेटी को बचाने वाले विधायक को मारकर नेड़ पर लटका दिया जाता है और आप सरकार बदलवा कर बड़े खुश हो रहे हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You don't repeat it again and again. If it has gone on the record, it will be on the record. You can see it tomorrow.

But please allow him to reply to what you have asked him to reply.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : मैडम वे सीरियस तो हों।

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: The point I was just making, most earnestly and seriously—you made it several times—was that how can a weakling like us go and topple a strong Government like that... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): This is very unfair. (Interruptions). Are they not ashamed of indulging in such activities? (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): This is not a joke. (Interruptions).

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Madam, my colleagues have raised certain serious issues. When there was a lot of shouting, the Leader of the House got up and made a statement which was not audible in the din. The issues raised are serious enough. I would like to point out, Madam, that this is a Council of States and be it the matter pertaining to Kashmir or Goa or Meghalaya or Pondicherry, in the past, this House has discussed such developments. This is a serious issue. (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): What you tried to do in Pondicherry, you have received in Goa. (Interruptions)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam, there have been precedents that seeing to the urgency of certain developments, the House has discussed these developments. We would like to know, because the Prime Minister is replying to the debate, whether, there will be a separate discussion to discuss these developments. I would like to know whether there will be a separate discussion or not. (Interruptions)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): On what? (Interruptions)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: On the issues which have been raised.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What are the issues? (*Interruptions*). You tried to topple in Pondicherry. You were toppled in Goa. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: What was the assurance given by the Leader of the House? We were given to understand that there will be a separate discussion today. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Andhra Pradesh, Kashmir, etc. Everywhere, you toppled. (*Interruptions*)

LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): Madam, I would like to put the record straight. I did not agree for discussion today. I only said 'If you want discussion on Pondicherry or Goa or Meghalaya or Kashmir...(*Interruptions*) we, in the Government, do not shy away from any discussion'. The only point is that time has got to be found for these discussions. (*Interruptions*) We have to pass...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: This is a very serious development.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I do share your concern. But we have to finish the Government Business first. Then, we are prepared to discuss anything. If you want that we should sit till midnight, we are prepared to sit till midnight. We are prepared to sit through the whole night. We are prepared to discuss. Let the Government Business be over first. We are prepared to discuss any issue. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Satisfied? (*Interruptions*) The Leader of the House says that he is prepared to discuss any matter if it is serious and that we can sit through the whole night. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): Madam, we were prepared to discuss any issue and when we were sitting

here, we found that the ruling party Members walked out. We found them going away in the night. (*Interruptions*) We were prepared. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: The Government walked out. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. M. JACOB: We were prepared to sit and complete the Business. But the Members from that side walked out. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The matter is over. The Government is prepared to discuss. We can decide about the time and discuss. (*Interruptions*)

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY:\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have said already. Whatever you speak now will not go on record.

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY:\*

उपसभापति: विल्कुल रिकार्ड में नहीं जाएगा। मैंने "न" बोल दिया है। आपकी मैं सुन चुकी हूँ। आप बैठ जाइए। . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

I know, Mir Mustaffa more than you knew him I am very sorry for him. I am anguished. I have my anguish for him. Please sit down.

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY:\*

उपसभापति: आप रिकार्ड की तरह क्यों बोलते रहते हैं। आप बैठ जाइए। (व्यवधान) आप कैसे प्रोफ़ेसर हैं, जो इस तरह की अनहली हरकतें करते रहते हैं। आप बैठ जाइए।

Please sit down, I am very sorry. Nothing is going on record.

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY:\*

उपसभापति: रत्नाकर जी, आप पांचवीं, छठी दफा यही बात कह चुके हैं, आप रिकार्ड की तरह क्यों बोलते रहते हैं?

[Dr. Ratnakar Pande]

It is not fair your part. Sit down.

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :**\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ratnakarji, I will again remind you in Hindi.

मैं हिन्दी में बोलूँ तो ज्यादा अच्छा है। मैं आपका ध्यान किताब की तरफ़ दिलाऊँगी कि जो कायदे इस राज्य सभा में होते हैं, हम हाउस उन्हीं कायदों पर चला सकते हैं। जहाँ तक आपके दुःख का सवाल है, मैं आपके दुःख को समझती हूँ... (व्यवधान) ...

I understand your anguish when you disturb my speech. Don't do like that. (Interruption) I say sit down. Take your seat. (Interruption) Nothing of what he says will go on record.

**श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :**\*

उपसभापति : इनका कुछ भी रिकार्ड में नहीं जाएगा।

I say you sit down. Take your seat. (Interruptions) Nothing will go on record.

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :**\*

उपसभापति : खाली कोई एम० एम० ए० और एम० पी० की जिन्दगी कीमती नहीं होती है, हर उस इंसान की जिन्दगी कीमती है जिसको आतंकवाद ने मारा है, चाहे काश्मीर में हो या पंजाब में और पूरी कंट्री उनके लिए महानुभूति रखती है।

**श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :**\*

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :**\*

**श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :**\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't understand what you are saying. We

\*Not recorded.

cannot pass a resolution only for one person. The whole House is worried about all those who died in the hands of aatankwadis. (Interruptions)

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA (Uttar Pradesh): A leaderless party.

(Interruptions)

**श्रीमती सया बहिन (उत्तर प्रदेश) :**  
आपने यहाँ तो कुछ भी नहीं है, हमारे यहाँ लीडर भी है, पार्टी वर्कर भी है। आपके यहाँ तो कुछ भी नहीं है। आप अपनी जान बहिए।

**कुमारी सईदा खातून (मध्य प्रदेश) :**  
जिसको हमने लीडर बनाया था, हमारी पार्टी के लीडर को आप लोगों ने लीडर बनाया है... (व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, Deputy Chairman... (Interruptions)

I think this is a very well earned silence, and I am grateful to...

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :** आधी स्पीच आपने हिन्दी में दी है। अब मैं आग्रह करूँगा कि आप हिन्दी में ही भाषण दें।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Will the Members from Tamil Nadu support you? (Interruptions) This is double standard... (Interruptions)

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): I support Mr. Pande. (Interruptions)

In Pondicherry you have killed democracy... (Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I think, Madam, through you I will appeal that while all this is legitimate in a lively democracy some chance should also be given to the other side to be heard, and I will bear with the hon. Members with due respect.

I think the issue of Kashmir is something for all of us to address and about what has come as news today in the morning we are all grieved by the killing of Shri Mir Mustaffa. It is a challenge to the whole democratic set-up. Now violence is becoming the language of politics. And on this issue, I think, we all, whether sitting on this side or that, are concerned. If this becomes the language of politics, the House itself would one day become irrelevant, because it is from the election process that we come here to debate. If there is a grave situation in Kashmir, this is the cumulative result of inadequate political and administrative response over a period of time. The political process and administrative process failed to carry conviction and deliver the goods. And it was reflected, very strongly, indicated, when there was a total boycott of the recent elections. Recently, encouraged by forces across the border, as rightly mentioned by the hon. Members, from Pakistan...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:\*

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: So, it is the threat from across the border, across the Indo-Pak international border and the people are provoked to cross it. Now there are declarations of open funding of secessionist and terrorist elements. So, this is a very serious threat and we all have to come together. I want to thank all the parties here that on this issue they have come forward and we have formed a committee also in regard to it.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Not all parties. Some parties.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, Mr Subramanian Swamy is making interjections.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I won't allow you. Sit down.

\*Not recorded.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am ready to listen to the whole debate all over again and then reply to it. Let everyone be given a chance to debate. I am ready to listen.

(Interruptions)

श्री शमीम हाशमी (बिहार): एक सवाल का उत्तर दीजिए कि इंडो-पाक का इंटरनेशनल बार्डर काश्मीर में आप किसको मानते हैं? (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: आप पहले भाषण सुनिए, फिर सवाल करिए। आप दूसरों के उकसाने पर मत खड़े होइए।

श्री शमीम हाशमी: काश्मीर में इंडो पाक बार्डर किसको मानते हैं (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: आपका सवाल रिकार्ड पर नहीं आया, आप बैठ जाइए। (व्यवधान)

Please sit down.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I just could not follow the question.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is asking about the international border between Pakistan and India. (Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He said: "Threats across the Indo-Pakistan international border."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. He will reply.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I will plead with the hon. Member to allow me some kind of common sense. If you allow the question to be heard, I will cooperate with you and reply to it. Here the question itself is very difficult. I thank hon. Subramanian Swamy for explaining the question to me. One incident did take place at the Indo-Pak international border. One was on the L.A.C. and one was on the

[Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh]  
international border. That is precisely what I said. So, I am right on my facts. It is serious and that is why we had to repulse it. No country can accept it and we made our intentions very clear that we are going to be very firm on it. There is no question of any compromise on the integrity and freedom of our country. Nobody can tread on our land without our consent. If somebody thinks that he can walk through India, he is sadly mistaken. What I would plead with the House is that these are the things which we want in Kashmir, what we intend to do. One is, of course, certainly the administrative machinery has to be established, the authority of the State has to be established. Without that, there cannot be any framework or even political activity. But, simultaneously, we have to win back the confidence of the people of Kashmir. It is with the trust and confidence of the people of Kashmir that a solution can be found. And that is the effort of the Committee that was formed, that some mechanism of political activity we formed...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHABBIR AHMAD SALARIA (Jammu and Kashmir): How can you win back the confidence of the people when the Governor was appointed against the wishes of the entire Legislature and the Government? So, the Government had to resign. So, the little process that was there, you throttled it.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am ready to listen to all the advice, and precisely that is the mechanism by major parties and also the National Conference which have been involved in it, that we respond to the position on the ground.  
*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: It should have been before the dissolution. Why afterwards? That is too late.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Even those who have joined the Committee have finally after all these considerations joined it. So, please allow them also to consider it. Allow them also something...*(Interruptions)*. Your own party allowed something. You leaders have thought over it. Let us not take it in this way that Kashmir was so serious and is so serious that we have all come together. So, at the same time those who have left the Valley and are in Jammu—some have come to Delhi—we have to restore their confidence and create an atmosphere that they go back and live there. About threats from Pakistan, the recent pronouncements and actions are clearly unfriendly acts. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): The Prime Minister of Pakistan...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I think, I covered Pakistan...  
*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He said 'himself'. It should be corrected.

\*\*

\*\*

\*\*

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): How dare you say that?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: It is very serious...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That will not go on record.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Will the Leader of Opposition agree with this?

*(Interruptions)*

\*Not recorded.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request the hon. Members not to make undignified remarks in the House. (Interruptions) Just a minute. Mr. Subramanian Swamy, withdraw your words. May be you said in a huff. Say sorry. Withdraw your words.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, according to the Hindu Dharma, Shakit is woman. So, he should be pleased with this

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't justify remarks which were made by mistake. Say sorry. (Interruptions) It is not going on record. Please do not excited.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, Mr. N. T. Rama Rao... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not a Member of our House. You cannot talk about that.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, I will not take offence\*\*

(Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, did you hear what he said about me?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I did not hear anything. I cannot... (Interruptions)

1.00 P.M.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Are you now to put both the remarks off the record?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through the record and see. I did not hear anything. (Interruptions).

I hereby give my instruction that when Mr. Ratnakar Pandey gets up without my permission, nothing will go on record. (Interruptions).

Mr. Kesri, you are a senior Member, you see how they are behaving. (Inter-

\*\*Not recorded.

ruptions). Please bear with me. I did not say anything. He has been repeating and repeating the same thing. (Interruptions). No, you cannot argue like this. Without my permission nobody should speak and nothing will go on record. (Interruptions). I have requested humbly everybody, please sit down. Let Kesriji say something. He is a very senior Member. (Interruptions).

आप बैठ जाइये। केसरी जी को बोलने दीजिए। उनकी कुछ इज्जत तो करिये वह इतने सीनियर मंत्री हैं हाउस के। केसरी जी जो कहेंगे मैं उसको मान लूंगी

श्री सीता राम केसरी (बिहार) : चेयर के प्रति हम सभी को सम्मान रखना चाहिए। उनसे मेरी प्रार्थना है कि इन लोगों को आप थोड़ा सा कंसेशन दीजिए यह मेरा एक निवेदन है।

जहाँ तक काश्मीर का प्रश्न है उस पर आप बड़ा प्रधान मंत्री से क्वेश्चन करने के मेरा आपसे निवेदन है कि कुछ समय निकाल कर उस पर बहस करने का मौका दीजिए। प्रधान मंत्री से भी निवेदन है कि वह अपना प्रवचन प्रारम्भ करें।

उपसभापति : केसरी जी, जब यह प्रस्ताव चला था। आप शायद उस वक़्त नहीं थे बात हुई थी। प्रधान मंत्री को मैंने खुद कहा कि आप इन सवालियों का जवाब अपने जवाब में दे दीजिए। अगर नहीं होता है तो हाऊस का टाइम निकाल कर राह रात भर बैटना पड़े, डिस्कस करें। लेकिन इस प्रकार में जो एक ही बात को बार-बार दोहराने लगते हैं। It is very irritating. After Mr. Kesri's words nothing will go on record. (Interruptions). No, I won't allow. (Interruptions). No, I won't take back my remarks. I won't allow. I am sorry, you have behaved like this for one hour. Listen. Please sit down. (Interruptions). I am not

[उप सभापति]

allowing. Please sit down.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: You should withdraw your words.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not, what I have said. It will not be withdrawn. It will be on the record *(Interruptions)*. I am not hearing you Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*. When your Member insults the Chair, where is your dignity? Please sit down. When the Member disrespects the Chair, where are you? *(Interruptions)*. I said once I am not going to withdraw. You do whatever you like. *(Interruptions)*. The way Mr. Ratnakar Pandey continuously is saying one word, again and again, it looks as if he is going to stall. I will not allow anything, and I am not going to withdraw anything. Do whatever you like. The Leader of the Opposition wants to say something... *(Interruptions)*... Please listen to him in order... *(Interruptions)*... Please listen to him... *(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): Madam, may I take the opportunity to say, "Let us all hear the Prime Minister with rapt attention."

Madam, it is true that when some of our Members said something, you made certain observations and the Members wanted the words to be withdrawn. But you refused. The matter must be left there. Let us leave it there. I am sure that the Deputy Chairman would reconsider her ruling. This is a matter which we should leave to herself. Let us leave it to herself, to her own good sense. Let us now hear the Prime Minister with attention.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Shiv Shanker, I asked Mr. Kesri to intervene because he is a very senior Member of the House... *(Interruptions)*... I asked him to speak... *(Interruptions)*... I am explaining it to you... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I am not entitled to any explanation from you. I only said, I am leaving it to your good sense.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But I have to keep the record straight and I am keeping the record straight... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Kindly go through the record... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through the record... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: After you consider, you may kindly withdraw it... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You see, I asked Mr. Kesri to speak. He said something and requested the Prime Minister to speak. Well, when the Prime Minister started to speak and to reply to the questions that you all have put, one Member interrupted—and since morning he has been interrupting and I am going to see the record to see how many times has been interrupting which is part of the record also—and you know what happened. There is a limit to the interruptions. I requested humbly and some of the Members told me not to be humble. I do not know what I should be. I made a request to the Members. If you are serious about Kashmir I told the Members, let the Prime Minister speak and then you could make your own opinion and get ready for a discussion. But, without hearing him, how can you decide what you are going to do? you must get the exact picture... *(Interruptions)*... Please put your hands down. I am not going to allow you. I am not in the habit of losing temper... *(Interruptions)*... I do not lose my temper and I do not lose my sense of balance. But a Member never asks the Chair to withdraw the words... *(Interruptions)*... But this has been going on... *(Interruptions)*... Let the Prime Minister speak now.



**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** Madam, I am thankful....

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** If the Members are unruly or make any remarks, I am going to take them off the record... (Interruptions)... Of course, when they misbehave, it does not go on record.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra):** Madam, we want the Chair to be respected... (Interruptions)... We want the Chair to be respected, to be heard with rapt attention. But if a request has come from the Leader of the Opposition, Madam, there was hardly anything in it for you to get provoked about. If you think it should be done, let it be done; if you think that it should not be done, it should not be done.

**SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER:** Madam, with all my humility, may I earnestly request you not to get worked up?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Well, Mr. Shiv Shanker, I would have requested you, if you were not the Leader of the Opposition, to come here and sit here in my place and see how it is to be here!

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** I think this finishes the matter now.

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** Madam, I am thankful to the Leader of the Opposition because he has made an effective appeal to the Members... (Interruptions)... He has a hope that he is coming to my party. He says so in the party meetings also.

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI:** For Heaven's sake do not take him. Otherwise you will drown yourself also. He is like a live bomb.

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** I want to put on record that any interference with our integrity, any attempt covert or overt in uniform or without uniform will be taken full cognizance of as a challenge to the integrity of the country and we will meet it with all the force and

all the arsenals at our command. I want to make it clear that for any misadventure by Pakistan not only they will pay a cost but they will pay a heavy cost if they tried to make any misadventure against us.

So far as territorial integrity is concerned, it has been our tradition that not only the Government but every political party and the people have stood as one; that has been our national asset. In spite of all the bickerings and whatever we hear, I have the fullest faith and confidence that it is so even today. However, our efforts to win over the people of Kashmir who have fought for independence, who have been the symbol of secularism, who contribute so much to the country, will continue and on this we will go with an open heart and an open mind. If there have been any steps which need to be corrected, the Government will not hesitate to correct them.

Regarding Punjab, about the visit hon. Ahluwaliaji said that I have made a misstatement. It is not so. The proceedings of the House finished, at least part of my address, at about 2.30 and the logistic was that it took one hour of flying and 1½ hours' reaching the last point, i.e. Khatkar Kalan. It was about 2½ hours' distance and the communication was there that if you have to reach, then you have to reach before 4.00 O'clock. There was no possibility of reaching before that time and so...

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :  
मैंने ... (व्यवधान) ... एक बात मेरी  
भी सुन लें। आप कह रहे हैं कि...

श्री बीरेन्द्र वर्मा : इजाजत भी ले  
लिया करो। इन्हें क्यों बिठा रखा  
है ?

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :  
मेरा नाम लिया है, इसलिये मैं कह रहा  
हूँ।

श्री बीरेन्द्र वर्मा : बगैर इजाजत के।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया :  
आपसे मैं नहीं सीखूंगा ।

उपसभापति : बगैर इजाजत के खड़े हो गये । इजाजत मांगने की तकलीफ कर ली जिये ।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया :  
मैंने सवाल किया था कि "23 मार्च को बी० पी० सिंह को पंजाब यात्रा रद्द" यह न्यूज "भाषा" की तरफ से रिलीज हुई थी ।  
(Interruptions). I am not asking you. I am putting the question to the Prime Minister.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: But you are speaking in the House. (Interruptions)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया :  
मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या यह "भाषा" जो एजेंसी है उसकी शरारत थी जो पंजाब की यात्रा को रद्द करने के बारे में इस तरह का प्रचार किया । आपके साथ इन्फर्मेशन और ग्राइ कास्टिंग मिनिस्टर उपेन्द्र जी बैठे हुए हैं । उस दिन के शाम के समाचार बुलेटिन में 8.40 के बुलेटिन में यह कहा गया कि वह नहीं जा सकते थे क्योंकि वह प्रिआकुपाइड थे राज्य सभा में । राज्य सभा में इतना इंटेंस हुआ कि वह अपना भाषण कम्पलीट नहीं कर सके । इसलिए नहीं जा सके और अपने श्रद्धा के सुमन शहीद भगत सिंह की बलिवेदी पर नहीं चढ़ा सके । यह इस मुद्दे की जनता को मिसगाइड करने के लिए कहा गया कि अपोजीशन ने श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह को राज्य सभा में रोक कर रखा जो कि मृत्यु नहीं है । एक दिन पहले भाषा ने न्यूज रिलीज की वह न्यूज गलत है या आप गलत हैं या आपका दूरदर्शन गलत है ? (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी : आप जो भी कर रहे हैं वह गलत है । (व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I have stated the facts before you. At this rate, I may be permitted one thing. I may be allotted one hour every day so that in one week, I can make my reply complete at least. In one hour, I will get fifteen minutes.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया :  
असत्य तो मत बोलिये, गुमराह मत करिये, सत्य बोलिये (व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am ready to reply to every point that is raised.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gopalsamy, may I request you to please listen to the speech and be quite?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: On Punjab, recently, killings have gone up and also the cases of asking for ransom. The incident of Abohar is something which is alive in our memory and it is something which is so repulsive that innocent people are killed. Government have taken many steps to see that if there is any sense of injustice, that is removed.

About the Fifty-ninth Amendment, there was provision for emergency in Punjab and suspension of the right to life. With the cooperation of the hon. Members from all sides, we could amend that.

Also, about the 1984 riot victims, the demand was for Special Courts. We have appointed Special Courts. About the widows of 1984 riot victims, we have raised the monthly allowance from Rs. 400 to Rs. 1000. But we have also provided for those who have been killed by terrorists and quite a substantial amount has been allocated.

About army deserters also, we have released almost all of them, except a few who had actually killed the officers. And those who have been recently released, they have been given employment letters. Others, we are trying to put them at a place. We have taken these steps to create an atmosphere. At the same time, if killings go on if abductions go on and violence continues, then the congenial atmosphere that was being attempted to be created, gets vitiated. That is the precise instruction being given to extremists, terrorists and secessionists

across the border and is being executed. Very selective killings are being done. May I assure that House that there is going to be no compromise on this. We will come down heavily on it. While on the one side, we will remove any sense of injustice, on the other we will also remove any sense of any community or section being suspect. Not only we will remove this, but positively we will also involve them, because it is not the people of Punjab now. The people of Punjab do want peace. They are fed up and if you look at the killings, more Sikhs have been killed than the Hindus. I was looking through the data.

So, while on the law and order side, there is deep concern, on the political activity side, I must say that meetings are being held. Vajpayeejee is here. He had gone; other leaders had gone. From the Left parties Surjitji had gone. Devi Lalji had gone from our side. So, this is one thing which was that meetings and political rallies had to be stopped. Now it is possible to hold these meetings. Not only holding them, in large numbers people are coming now. So, I think there has been positive progress on this side. But, unless there is a congenial atmosphere and if a normalization process is not there, I think the democratic process itself gets stalled. For restoring the democratic process fully, first we have to establish a congenial atmosphere, and that is our approach to the issue of Punjab.

On Ram Janma Bhoomi and Babri Masjid, some contact was made and it was suggested that after Ram Navami discussions be held on the 5th of next month. So, the date has been fixed to contact and have a dialogue on the Ram Janma Bhoomi.

The issue of Mahem was raised.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Before that, what was the contract made?

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** Don't answer this... *(Interruptions)*...

**SRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** May I assure you that we are bound by our manifesto? And what we assured anyone, all the 80 crores, in our manifesto, we will implement it. There is nothing beyond that.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** That is not the thing. Shashi Imam said that you have a written, signed agreement with him, as if he is the President... *(Interruptions)*...

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** What was the statement of Shashi Imam? ... *(Interruptions)*...

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Are you intervening on his behalf?

... *(Interruptions)*...

**SRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** That is a reiteration of the is a reiteration of our National Front manifesto.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Is there a signed contract between you and Shashi Imam? ... *(Interruptions)*...

**SRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** There is no contract. ... *(Interruptions)*... Let all these doubts be removed. Otherwise he will raise them further.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** That is right—you know me!

**SRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** That is a reiteration of the National Front manifesto.

About Mahem the point was raised...

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Madam, when I speak, Renuka interrupts. You don't stop her... *(Interruptions)*...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** He has not allowed you to interrupt. So, I am allowing you to speak so that she can interrupt and, so, both of you are interrupting!

**SRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** It was our party which made a specific request to the Election Commission for a repoll. It might be the one instance where the party itself may have made a request for a repoll

[Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh]

of the election. Violence, wherever it may be, whether it be at Amethi or at Mahem, we are totally against it. We need not support it nor do we cover it.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Whether by Central Government or State Government.

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** I have made it very clear that to uphold a democratic tradition, we are ready to forgo the Government. And to uphold a Government we are not adopting the politics of slaughtering democratic traditions.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Has the Chief Minister of Haryana said that? ... (*Interruptions*)...

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** Let me answer. Madam, I have no mechanism by which in just ideas, announce it and give all the answers. I have to proceed answering. I am coming to the point. Please have patience. Learn something from me, at least. ... (*Interruptions*)... Let me answer.

**SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN:** What is the... (*Interruptions*)...

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** You have got a very good master!

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** If I were to give up democratic traditions, I would have been continuing in the Government and now, perhaps, sitting with you... (*Interruptions*)...

**SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN:** To get power..... (*Interruptions*)...

**SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Punjab):** Madam, is he suggesting that sitting on this side is not being democratic?

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** I have seen the recording in the Newstrack and also the incident of a person being killed and beaten to death. Government is asking the

Haryana Government to take the fullest action against the guilty and inform the Central Government what action it has taken. Because it contains evidence and cases of people, it is being sent to the Haryana Government.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** When did you do that? (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** May I assure you on this that all democratic norms will be upheld.

**श्री राम नरेश यादव : (उत्तर प्रदेश) :**  
माननीय महोदया, आपकी अनुमति से, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी से, मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि मेहम में जिस तरह से...  
(व्यवधान)

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH.** Madam, I am not yielding.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** He is not yielding.

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** I have not been able to answer. (*Interruptions*)

**श्री राम नरेश यादव :** उहाँ वेल्यूज क मवाल है, आज बहुत डिढोग पीटा जा रहा है कि वेल्यूज को हम लोग रक्षा कर रहे हैं, लेकिन मेहम में जिस तरह से हुआ, क्या उसमें डमोक्रसी का गला नहीं घोंटा गया है? आज प्रधान मंत्री रहते हुए, राष्ट्रीय मोर्चे के नेता रहते हुए भी उसको अपनी आंखों से देख कर आज भी उसको बर्दाश्त कर रहे हैं। यही मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह कहाँ तक उचित है?

**श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :**  
महोदया, उस सिपाही के बारे में क्या होगा जिसके कपड़े पहन कर अभय सिंह भागा था और जिसको अभय सिंह समझ कर लोगों ने मार डाला? उसके परिवार के लिए आपने क्या किया है? यह हमें बतायें। उसकी कनपटी पर रिवाल्वर रख कर उसके कपड़े उतारे गए थे। उस बारे में जरा सोचें और हमें बतायें।  
.... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** I have asked the Haryana Government to enquire into it. (*Interruptions*) I am not going to wind up. I cannot be bullied into winding up. I will continue my answer. If it is not finished, it is not finished. I will continue in this fashion. How many days it takes, I do not know. I am not winding up. On certain matters I am very firm. I am not going to wind up like this. I am going to answer.

**SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER:** Mr. Prime Minister, I just want to say one thing. Some of the Members on the other side every time go on provoking. That is not fair. Being on the Treasury Benches, all the more you should be responsible to keep quite. Don't go on interjecting every time. Don't try to provoke. That is not fair on your part.

**SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:** Let me finish.

On foreign policy, at least on the policy . . . (*Interruptions*) Please. There is a limit. Yet I will not lose my temper, but I will certainly raise my voice. There is a limit. We are crossing the limit. I am on a topic on which there is no difference between us, the foreign policy.

I am thankful that no criticism of the policy as such has been made. It has been evolved through national consensus, and it is something which belongs to the whole country.

Just now the visit to Namibia—there important leaders came in the delegation—gave a message to the people of Africa. There are commitments against colonialism, against apartheid. It is something that crosses party boundaries. It is the commitment of the people of India and not only of the Government, and this message we could convey. We met Nelson Mandela and the President of Namibia. May I say that they are fully assured of the initiatives being taken by the Government and the people?

Recently, the Foreign Minister of China had come. May I report that

the initial talks have been very encouraging?

Mr. Shiv Shanker rightly said on this matter that it is a question, an issue of evolving consensus on this matter. On these matters also basically the Government will have an approach to take parties into confidence for a consensus. Now to say that because Pakistan is making these statements it is a sign of weakness and it is supporting terrorism because of the weakness of the present Government, let us not extend these arguments. From October, 1988 the previous Government was also making representations to Pakistan in this matter but I never said it is a sign of weakness. There are certain circumstances and we all have to face it.

Today, Mr. Arafat is with us. May I say it is an honour for all of us that Mr. Arafat is here. He is a symbol of courage and conviction and of hope of the Palestinian people. We fully endorse the right of the Palestinian people, the inalienable right of self-determination and we are totally with the cause of Mr. Arafat.

The Government's stand on the Simla Accord has had a wide acceptance even in Windhoek in Namibia where I went. I had dialogues with Mr. Eduard Shevardnadze, with Mr. James Baker of U.S. and other African leaders and there was a general appreciation of the stand of Government of India and I think we have a plus point there.

Regarding the return of IPKF troops, they have carried out a very difficult task under the assignment of the Central Government. They have made great sacrifices. I want to pay a tribute to the jawans who have participated in Sri Lanka. I hope that peace will come to all sections in Sri Lanka and that will be our main objective of foreign diplomatic initiatives that the people of Tamil origin like their stay and their democratic aspirations are fulfilled.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Prime Minister, hon. Member, Mr. Syed Sibtey Razi wants to speak something about IPKF.

श्री सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैं दो बातों पर प्रधान मंत्री आपका ध्यान दिलाना चाहूंगा। आपके मैनिफेस्टो में इस बात को कहा गया है कि मायनोरिटीज कमीशन...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You wanted to speak about IPKF and not about minorities.

श्री सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी : आई.पी.के.एफ. के लिए मेरा एक सजेशन यह है कि जिस तरह की कुर्बानियां, हमारे नौजवानों ने दी हैं, हमारे जवानों ने दी हैं वहां पर, तो जिन लोगों ने कुर्बानियां दी हैं उनकी याद में एक पोस्टल स्टाम्प कमेमोरेटिव आपकी सरकार की ओर से निकाला जाना चाहिये जिससे कि हमारे देश के लोगों की तरफ से उन महान व्यक्तियों और महान जवानों के लिए श्रद्धांजलि अर्पित की जा सके और जो महान सेवा उन्होंने हमारे देश के लिए और एक देश को खंडित होने से बचाने के लिए की है, उसका पूर्ण रूप से रिकग्नीशन हो सके।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chair also agrees.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: After the IPKF withdrawal, the Tamils are not safe. What is the Government of India going to do to see that they do not go through the same process again?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, the Minister of State for Defence had gone to yesterday's function to receive IPKF jawans who were returning and he was asked "The Provincial Government in the North-East have become a dead letter" just like what the hon. Member said just now—"how are you going to protect the Tamils?" Madam, the Press report says that he has said "Well, this is an internal matter of Sri Lanka and the

Government of India has no further business to interfere..."—as if we have been interfering so far with the Tamils—"We will not interfere any more in the internal affairs of another country." I want to ask the Prime Minister because I am anxious about the people of Tamil origin. Are they going to leave the Tamils to suffer like this? Is this the official position of the Government of India in Sri Lanka? (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Now the Tamils in Sri Lanka are very happy.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Prime Minister will answer... (Interruptions)... Mr. Gopalsamy, anything which is spoken about Sri Lanka or Tamils does not become your property. Let the Prime Minister answer... (Interruptions)... No clapping. You know we feel sorry for those people. That is why Members are asking questions. Let him answer. You will also be enlightened.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, I quite share the sentiments of the House that we should honour our jawans who had gone to Sri Lanka and carried out their assignment and the Government will find a way to honour them suitably. Then regarding safety of the Tamil people there, we are quite concerned with this and let us not always take the gloomy picture of the situation. The forces had gone there—let us not forget—on the invitation of the Sri Lankan Government and it has been our principled stand that we do not force our forces anywhere. They had gone on invitation. When they said, "we do not want the forces" the Government decided to withdraw them. So, the military force alone is not the method to bring pressure. There are various other ways also of trying to resolve the situation and we will exert all our pressure or tactics at our command to see that the lives of the people of Tamil origin are safe. Let us see how the situation develops and how things develop there... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, the refugees who have gone from Orissa,

the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu refused to take them for reasons best known to him because he is no more a saviour of Tamils ... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That was raised in the House. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I would like to know as to what steps the Government is taking to rehabilitate those people. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Now, coming to Nepal, I think the exchanges so far between the two countries have at least given an opening for further initiatives. The suspicions have been removed and on the one side, we have conveyed that Nepal has to be sensitive towards our security interest on the other side, we do realise that Nepal is a landlocked country and we have always had good relations and we want to promote them and also look to the special difficulties that they have. I think, there is now greater appreciation on both sides and the intransigence that was there earlier. I think that is not there and there is on both sides a will to find a solution. (*Interruptions*)... Madam either you say, this is a Question Hour and I am to answer all supplementaries on any question that can be raised ... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please do not answer if you feel it is not proper to answer. It will not go on like this. Mr. Subramanian Swamy, this is my last request to you ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is a fundamental question that there is a struggle for democracy going on in Nepal and if the Prime Minister does not want to answer, I withdraw it.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: You should advise him to go to Kachchativu and much of the problem will again be created.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: In Kachchativu, the fishermen have not been allowed to go and celebrate St. Anthony's Day since you became Prime Minister.

It is a great shame on the people of India.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Now, from live issues, let us come to some little more complacent issues of the economy and one of the important things of the agricultural sector ... (*Interruption*).

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Madam, I would like to know whether there will be lunch break or not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Well, I don't think we can have lunch break because we have still a lot of discussion on the Railway Budget. We will continue with it. (*Interruption*). Yes, you can have lunch. I cannot ask the Members not to have lunch. They are most welcome to have lunch after voting.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Prof. C. P. Thakur had raised a point about investment in rural sector and of prices of agricultural produce. On this, we have already made statements that we will take cognizance of the managerial input by the farmer. If there is inflation between the date of announcement of the price and when he actually gets it, the inflation component will be taken care of. The minimum wage or the real wage, whichever is higher, will be taken for calculating the minimum price. All these decisions we have taken and I need not reiterate them. We have involved those who are involved in farmers' movement like Shri Sharad Joshi in formulation of agriculture policies. But I want to bring the broader aspects of this before you. What plagues our agricultural sector now? The total investment in agriculture has increased steadily up to 1978-79. This is the graph. The gross investment went up. After that it has declined. There was a rise. But it never crossed this, in real terms. This is your total investment, public and private. It is increased steadily up to 1978-79. Thereafter it declined steadily. It rose up again in 1986-87. But the absolute level of investment is never crossed. We have not gone beyond that stagnation of investment. Private investment in agriculture has also sharply

[Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh]

declined. That is very serious. Public investment has stagnated through the 80s. So it is not a political decision that we put more money in the agriculture sector. It is a purely economic decision which is now absolutely needed to inject money into it. Expenditure has risen but investment has not risen. One of the reasons why the private sector investment is not going on increasing is, perhaps, in the north-western region, saturation has reached. Increase of profitability is not there. Terms of trade are continuously deteriorating. This hinders further investment. Let us not look at populist measures, as it's many times described. Let us look to this malaise which is going to hit us very hard. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: I will give you some figures.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am never able to complete it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jagesh Desai, you can ask the Minister for Finance. Let us finish this. You all have to go for lunch.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: This is about the figures in the Central Plan.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: We will discuss the Plan. There will be a discussion of the Plan. All right, you blame us but see the real situation. That is what I am trying to do.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: This is your Budget paper. *(Interruptions)*. The total Central Plan has gone up by 10 per cent, but agriculture has gone up only by six per cent. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I can debate on that also. We have gone up from 44 per cent to 49 per cent in the rural sector.

Now, public investment also has decreased. That is also one reason why private investment cannot take place. Certain things like irrigation projects cannot be taken care of by the private sector. So

all this has a cumulative effect and where there is need, there is no local resource. Poverty is there. And therefore, we have to now include the States in this task of revival of agriculture. Unless there is the full package of the States and the Centre, it will not be possible for us to tackle the situation. I think the Inter-State Council that has been formed can play a very important role.

On the industrial side, may I say that industry and agriculture go together? I want to make it clear that by emphasising agriculture, we do not want to underrate industry. They reinforce each other. And we need heavy industries also. Let there be no indication or signal that heavy industries are not needed. But agro-based industry is something to which we want to give a further boost. It will fit in our socio-economic pattern and will also give more employment, employment apart from agriculture, in the rural sector. Small scale sector and agro-based industries will fulfil this and emphasis on employment has increased. We have to increase the competitiveness in exports. Seeing our balance of payments situation, I think, we cannot close our eyes to the external market. And our export thrust will be there and the Government will give positive support to exports and also increase the competitiveness of our exporters. The question is, how much net foreign exchange earning is there. There can be one dollar earned from a lot of exports and one dollar earned from very low exports.

Agriculture is another sector like other labour-intensive areas where the net foreign earning is high. On controls, seeing our balance of payments situation, we have to be judicious on it, but at the same time we will have to see that supply of raw-materials is there. I did hint to you last time, the POL situation is such that we may have to think seriously in those terms. And we have to shift in our internal market from discretionary controls which is the file going to every desk and decision being made—it takes time, also leads to corruption and also not to action



in resource allocation—to non-discretionary controls where you have to priorities your items where you want investments because we are short of resources and we cannot follow *laissez faire*. *Laissez faire* is not that we can do. We will have to give direction to the economy. But the system of licences, quotas and controls takes so much of your time that we have to use the more elegant method of financial control by which we direct our investments. This will be broadly our pattern and I think, this will also get the support. Shivshankerji made a very important point of inclusion of land reform laws in the Ninth Schedule. May I assure you that there are 55 pending land reform laws which have not been put in the Ninth Schedule. Some are withdrawn, but whatever are there we are bringing in legislation for putting them in the Ninth Schedule. I think, that is a very important decision because the poor get this small piece of paper the *patta*, but they never get the piece of land, and on what the Government gives on that they have to spend money to get the land and unless we address ourselves to those people, we will not be able to give equity in the system, socio-economic system. On land reforms, we also have to involve in some way, those people who are the beneficiaries because a lot of *benami* and all that is there. And that cannot be corrected unless we involve those who are potent and I think, the tolling masses will have to be brought forward in the enactment and implementation of many of these schemes. Only then, it will be ensured that all that is done. Regarding labour participation in management, we are bringing legislation based on secret ballot and within this year we want to see that in the public sector, labour participation in management is implemented, and I hope that even that private sector will adopt this mode and that becomes the ethos of industrial relations. We have already notified the law on atrocities against SC/ST people and from 30th January that has been now notified and now it is an effective law. About right to work, many hon. Members of Parliament made this point. I think we must have interaction across the board—and we will be interact-

ing with all the parties and within ourselves—and we will be bringing forward the proposals here for your approval on the right to work.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: This provision. There is no value.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार) : प्रधान मंत्री जी, जरा डघर भी हथान देंगे ? जो अभी आपने कहा...

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : मंडल कमीशन पर मैं आ रहा हूँ । पहले हमारी बात सुन लीजिए । मेरी बात सुन लिए होते तो सवाल ही न करते । 45 मिनट बले गए उसमें ।... (व्यवधान)

With regard to the right to work, if you see our socio-economic system, you will find that there is one section of society which has no right except to work and this has been the most down-trodden section of the society for thousands and thousands of years. But our society has been so structured that there is no right except to work. But even those whom society has condemned saying "You shall not have any right except to work", even they are not getting work. I think we have to adjust ourselves in any legislation to be adopted first and the right to work cannot be brought about unless the concepts and the social values of work are also changed. We cannot devalue work itself, labour itself, and then say that we shall have the right to work. Who will work? Those who are nearer work are the last in the rung and those who are further away from work are the highest. A social transformation must take place and if this is not backed by legislation it will never have any meaning. So, right to work is something which is not only legislation or law, but it is also restructuring the whole socio-economic order. Only then it can have any meaning. We may legislate, but we may not do anything else. The right to work will have meaning only when transformation of the socio-economic order takes place.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : एक सफाई में चाहता हूँ।...

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : : आपके प्वाइंट पर आ रहा हूँ, तब पूछिए।

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह :। इसी प्वाइंट पर पूछना है... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति महोदया, जो राइट टू वर्क है उसको फ्रंटमेंटल राइट्स में जोड़ना चाहिए, यह अच्छा स्लोगन है, अच्छा लफ्ज़ है...

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : आप क्वेश्चन पूछिए सीधे... (व्यवधान)

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : सवाल ही पूछ रहा हूँ। मान लीजिए, आपने राइट टू वर्क को ले लिया और फ्रंटमेंटल राइट्स में शामिल कर लिया और संविधान में संशोधन कर दिया, लेकिन जब हम कोर्ट में केस करेंगे कि हमको काम दिया जाए और कोर्ट में जाएंगे तो मान लीजिए कोर्ट ने कह दिया कि रोज़ मजदूरी के लिए 10 रुपया इनको दे दो तो आपके देश में 10 करोड़ लोग बरोजगार हैं। इनको अगर 300 रुपया महीना भी आप देंगे तो 3000 करोड़ रुपया साल में आपको देना पड़ेगा। तो 3000 करोड़ रुपये की व्यवस्था आपके बजट में है?

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : ये सारी चीजें आपसे सलाह करके ही की जाएंगी... (व्यवधान)

Also, Central legislation for agricultural labour is under consideration by the Government. This is one demand. In the unorganised sector, there has been no Central legislation. That is also under consideration and, maybe, hopefully, we may bring forward that after all consultations.

Then, Mr. Shabbir Ahmad Salaria addressed himself to the point of implementation within a time-frame of the Gujral Committee's recommendations. May I assure him that we are fully committed to this and already a Committee has been formed to look into this and make its recommendations?

Many a time, Madam, on such Committees, comments are made and it is said that this Government is appointing committees only. I want to defend it. But even the statutory committees are listed as new committees. The National Integration Council is also termed a new committee. Anyway our style is of consultation and taking all views into consideration. We do not have a permanent coterie. Therefore, we have committees. That is the point. When you have a permanent coterie, then you don't need committees. If there are no consultations, there is no interaction...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Without committees and commissions you will not survive.

श्री पवन कुमार बांसल: आप और कुछ कर नहीं सकते इसलिए... (व्यवधान)

श्री जमशेद बेसाई : क्योंकि आपको लेफ्टिस्ट और राईटिस्ट दोनों सपोर्ट कर रहे हैं इसलिए आप बना रहे हैं।

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : जो मैं कह रहा हूँ सब करके दिखाऊंगा। यह मत कहिए (व्यवधान)...

श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम स्वामी : अभी तक बोफोर्स वाले नाम नहीं बताये। क्या भूल गये ? (व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Committees alone don't solve the problem. But we want to take all shades of opinion into consideration. It is our style of functioning. Now I want to make an important point. Regarding the 15-point programme we are every month monitoring its implementation, we have to take care of the interests of the minorities. I want to make it clear. So far as minorities are concerned, Government's view is clear. It relates to any minority in the world, anywhere. There are two aspects to it. One is common with everyone. (Interruption) Please listen to me. Let me say something. Even before I complete my sentence you start asking question...

डा० एम० हाशिम किदवाई (उत्तर प्रदेश)  
भाइचोरिटी कमीशन के बारे में . . .  
(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: वह बोल रहे हैं आप  
सुन लीजिए। बाद में पूछ लीजिएगा।  
(व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: At every sentence if you go on like this, then I should be given an hour more.

So far as minorities are concerned, so far as their security is concerned, it is not only their physical security, they should also feel mentally secure, they should feel secure of their ways of life and their convictions. We have to ensure that also. We have also to see what the reason is that they are unable to reap the benefit of development as much as everyone else does. Lack of education in them is one of the factors. So on all these counts, on their security, physical and mental, on their sharing the fruits of development, Government is fully committed and on a regular basis we will be monitoring the implementation.

On Nizamuddin already an inquiry has been ordered and if there is any lapse on the part of anyone, action would be taken.

As regards one-rank-one-pension which was made by Lt. Gen. Aurora . . .

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI: I request the Prime Minister to yield for one moment . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, let him complete his reply first.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: On the point of one-rank-one-pension made by Lt. Gen. Aurora, we will be coming with a proposal to the House.

Shri Shabbir Ahmad Salaria made a point regarding setting up a commission for appointments and transfers of Supreme Court and High Court judges. We are looking into this, the Cabinet is look-

ing into this matter, and we will be coming with our proposal so that the judiciary retains its dignity and position. Shri Kapil Verma made the point that the Prasar Bharati Bill was a shame. Now May I state what is proposed? There will be eleven persons on the Board. There will be only one representative from the Ministry of I. & B.

2.00 P.M.

The governors are to be appointed by a committee consisting of the Vice-President of India, Chairman of the Press Council and a nominee of the President of India. And the procedure for removal of Governors is the same as that for the Chairman of the UPSC. This is a very strong body. And I think that with these provisions there can be no doubt that the autonomy is genuine and real.

Shrimati Asima Chatterjee made a point that Government should take immediate action for development of wasteland. The resources with the Central and State Governments, including funds received through external assistance, will be of the order of Rs. 550 crores. There is a substantial allotment in 1990-91.

Shri Jadhav made a point about power generation facilities in Maharashtra. He may be pleased to know that the plant at Uran has been cleared at an estimated cost of Rs. 85.86 crores. (Interruptions)

Shrimati Margaret Alva made a point regarding security arrangements for Shri Rajiv Gandhi. The provisions are that there are four bullet-proof cars. Six more cars have been provided. Two hundred and eighty-four people, which include 20 of NSG, National Security Guard, have been provided. And the estimated cost is Rs. 1 crore. For his recent visit outside the country, to Namibia, and his return via London we gave instructions that full security should be given—ring security or whatever is there. So we are taking the fullest action on this, and there is no let-up. (Interruptions) If need be, we are ready to provide more funds. I do not want anyone to feel... (Interruptions)

श्री राम कल्याण मंत्री (श्री राम विलास पासवान) : हम खूब जानते हैं। केबिनेट मिनिस्टर के बराबर हैं। केबिनेट मिनिस्टर ने पचास गुना ज्यादा ले लीजिये। देश की जनता का भी ध्यान रखना होगा। मिर्फ बी०आई०पी० पर खर्च नहीं होगा। देश की गरीब जनता भी है जिसकी रक्षा करना हमारी सरकार का कर्तव्य है।

श्री पवन कुमार बांसल : आप हम रहे हैं? आपको शर्म आनी चाहिए। ऐसी बात कह रहे हैं। (व्यवधान)

श्री राम विलास पासवान : एक करोड़ रुपया क्या कम होता है?

श्री पवन कुमार बांसल : हमें मालूम है आप क्या कह रहे हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री राम विलास पासवान : रोज रोज मैक्योरिटी मैक्योरिटी कहते हैं। क्या मैक्योरिटी है?

श्री पवन कुमार बांसल : काश्मीर में भीर मुस्तफा का क्या हुआ है... (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : आपने जलें आनी चाहिये।

(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: You are making finance the sole criterion...

(interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir, a tragedy had occurred. A Prime Minister of our country was assassinated—a great tragedy had occurred—in the face of fuller security provided by the Congress, (1) Government. (Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINHA: I want to assure that apart from four bullet-proof cars and other six cars, 244 people, including 20 of NSG, costing Rs. 1 crore, if more is needed we will do more. (Interruptions) In fact, I have sanctioned Rs. 25 lakhs more. Madam Deputy Chairman, even when the Government does what they say, they are upset. (Interruptions) May I thank the hon. Members for their suggestions on the Motion of Thanks to the President? Thank you, Madam.

(Interruptions)

श्री राम नरेश यादव : महोदया, मैं एक सवाल करना चाहता हूँ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री मीर्जा इशदिबेग (गुजरात) : प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर पर कह रहे हैं।

श्री मीर्जा इशदिबेग : उपसभापति महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि आपने चेयर से हमें आश्वासित किया था कि जो कुछ भी प्रश्न खड़े होंगे उनको बाद में पूछ सकेंगे और प्रधानमंत्री इसका जवाब देंगे। कम से कम हमारे बिल में कुछ संशोधन भी थे और हम कुछ प्रश्नों के उत्तर भी चाहते थे। यह हमें आपने भी आश्वासित किया था। अगर प्रधानमंत्री यहां पर होते तो हम उनसे दो-तीन बातें पूछना चाहते थे।

Madam, the Chair had assured us that if there is any question to be put to the Prime Minister, we could do so afterwards and the Prime Minister would reply. But he has already left. What is your ruling? To whom have we to put questions? Who will reply to our queries?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let everybody speak and then I will give my ruling.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, we have given amendments to the Motion of Thanks. While moving the amendments, we have a right to speak. When we speak the Prime Minister should be free to reply. Where is the Prime Minister? He has to reply to the points raised by the Members. Who is going to reply now? Madam, the Leader of the House is sitting here. Let him answer. Who will be able to reply when the Members speak on their amendments?

(Interruptions)

श्री मीर्जा इशदिबेग : हम छात्रों की बात को मानकर चुप बैठे रहे। लेकिन हमारी बात का जवाब तो मिला नहीं।

श्री राम नरेश यादव : महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।... (व्यवधान)

प्लान्ट आफ आर्डर । मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :** मैंने भी कुछ मन्त्र उठाये थे ।

**श्री राम नरेश यादव :** मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है महोदया कि कुछ प्रश्न ऐसे हैं जैसे माइनारिटीज कमीशन को स्टेच्यूटरी स्टेटस देने की घोषणा की गई थी, गैड्यूल्ड वास्ट और गैड्यूल्ड ट्राइव्स कमीशन को भी स्टेच्यूटरी स्टेटस देने की घोषणा की गई थी । साथ ही साथ कश्मीर में जो दो लाख शरणार्थी इस देश में आये हैं उनके संबंध में भी स्पष्टीकरण मांगना था ।

**उपसभापति :** अपने देश में आये हैं ।

**श्री राम नरेश यादव :** इसमें सरकार का क्या दृष्टिकोण है इसके बारे में कौन उत्तर देगा ?

**उपसभापति :** अपने देश में कहिये ।

**श्री राम नरेश यादव :** प्रधानमंत्री जी बाहर चले गये हैं (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति :** डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, मैं आज हूँ आपसे मैंने आदेश लिया । आपने मुझे बोलने के लिए प्रोत्साहित किया है... (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति :** आप आदेश लेकर बोले तो मैं आपकी बोलने दे रहा था किता मन्त्र के लिये ही जाने हैं (व्यवधान) को लगे मैंने इसका जो है ।

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :** आपकी मुस्कान बहुत सारी प्या दृष्टि मेरे अपर होनी चाहिये (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति :** सारी मुस्कान आपने लिये है, बोलिये । (व्यवधान)

**श्री राम नरेश यादव :** हम लोग क्या करने ? (व्यवधान)

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :** माननीया उपसभापति महोदया, प्रधानमंत्री जी राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण पर जो चर्चा की गई है, उसका जवाब दे रहे थे, बहुत सी चीजें ऐसी रह गई हैं जिसे हम लोगों ने सदन में उठाया है जो अनुस्तरित रह गई हैं । एक घटना

पहले हुई थी जब उप प्रधानमंत्री श्री देवी लाल ने सरकार से इस्तीफा दिया । हम सदस्य जानना चाहते हैं कि क्यों इस्तीफा दिया । उस समय मिजिल एवियेशन मिनिस्टर, सारी सरकार बाक आउट कर गई । आज हम सभी बैठे हैं अपनी जिजाना को शान्त करने के लिए लेकिन प्रधानमंत्री जी बहुत सी चीजें छोड़ कर चले गये हैं । यह रवैया अच्छा नहीं है । जन-तान्त्रिक परम्परा के लिए जबकि बार-बार उन्होंने कहा कि अगर एक सप्ताह तक डिबेट चलेगी तब भी मैं हर प्रश्न का उत्तर दूंगा । यह पलायन इस बात का द्योतक है कि वर्तमान सरकार पलायनवाद में विश्वास करती है और राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण पर पलायन करना, मैं राष्ट्रपति का अपमान मानता हूँ । महोदया, मैंने अपने संशोधन भी प्रस्तुत किये हैं । जब तक प्रधानमंत्री जी यहां उपस्थित नहीं होंगे तब तक हम संशोधनों को किम के सामने रखें, कौन उनका उत्तर देगा । यह व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है, इस पर गम्भीरता से विचार करें और ऐसी जनतन्त्रीय परम्परा राजन सभा में स्थापित रखें कि हमारे सदस्यों की प्रतिष्ठा सुरक्षित रहे । प्रधानमंत्री जी यहां पर उपस्थित नहीं हैं भी संशोधनों पर बोलने के लिए हमें मौका दिया जाए ।

**श्री विठ्ठलराव महादेवराम जाधव :**

(महाराष्ट्र) : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न आप सुन लें । मैं इस सदन में आया था मेरा मत है । आज तक मैंने ऐसा नहीं किया है कि जब भी प्रेसीडेंट के अभिभाषण पर प्रधानमंत्री का नाम उठाने की बात आयेगी प्रधानमंत्री जी कह रहे थे कि मैंने अपने देश के लिए आपके आदेश को ध्यान में रखा है, मैंने तैयार हो । अभी मैंने आदेश नहीं दिया, जो अभिभाषण दिये गये हैं उन पर सदस्यों के विचार नहीं आये हैं और प्रधानमंत्री जी सदन में उठ के भाग गये । मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह सदन का अपमान है, सदस्यों का अपमान है । यह पलायनवादी सरकार आज भाग रही है देश को छोड़ कर । मैं यह मांग करता हूँ कि प्रधानमंत्री जी को इसका जवाब देना

[श्री विठ्ठलराव माधवराव जाधव]

चाहिए अमेंडमेंट और मोशन के अडाप्ट करने तक, यहां बैठना चाहिये।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: Madam, it is a convention of the House... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Rajiv Gandhi never used to sit here.

श्री सैयद तिव्वे जी : उपसभापति महोदया, अभी प्रधानमंत्री जी ने अपने आपण में अल्पसंख्यकों के प्रति अपनी चिन्ता व्यक्त की है। हमें बड़ी खुशी है कि वह बड़े कंसर्ब हैं लेकिन उत्तर प्रदेश में जो अंग्रेजी माध्यम से शिक्षा देने वाले तथात स्कूल हैं वहां के जो इनकी पार्टी के मुख्यमंत्री हैं उनके कहने पर बंद किए जा रहे हैं। माइनाट्रीज के मिशनरीज के जो स्कूल चल रहे हैं जो अंग्रेजी माध्यम से शिक्षा देना चाहते हैं उनके लिए बहुत बड़ी समस्या आ कर खड़ी हो गई है। इस तरह से माइनाट्रीज के लिए बहुत बड़ा खतरा है। प्रधानमंत्री जी तो यहां पर कह कर चले गये कि हम माइनाट्रीज की सुरक्षा करेंगे मगर हमें कौन आश्वासन देगा कि उत्तर प्रदेश में माइनाट्रीज के इंस्टीट्यूशंस जो चल रहे हैं उनको अपनी मातृभाषा में शिक्षा देने का अधिकार मिला रहेगा। यह हमारी माइनाट्रीज, अल्पसंख्यकों को अधिकार है चाहे अंग्रेजी मीडियम में पढ़ाने की बात हो, चाहे उर्दू पढ़ाने की बात हो। यह बहुत बड़ी आन समस्या आ गई है। मैं समझता हूं लीडर आन दो हाऊस यहां पर हैं वे आश्वस्त करेंगे कि इस प्रकार ने जो माइनाट्रीज के इंस्टीट्यूशंस की जो समस्या है, अल्पसंख्यकों की समस्या है, उनको रोका नहीं जाएगा। इंस्टीट्यूशंस बन्द करने की बात बार-बार वहां के मुख्य मंत्री कह रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

श्री बंरिन्द्र वर्मा : उर्दू माइनाट्रीज की जवान नहीं है, यह सब की जवान है, यह आपकी जवान नहीं है, यह करेक्ट कर लीजियेगा।

श्री सैयद तिव्वे रज़ी : मैं उर्दू की बात नहीं कर रहा हूं। अंग्रेजी मीडियम के जितने स्कूल वहां चल रहे हैं उनको बन्द किये जाने की घोषणा आपकी पार्टी

के मुख्य मंत्री ने उत्तर प्रदेश में कर दी है। यह मौलिक अधिकार हमारे क्रिश्चियन भाइयों का भी बनता है कि वह अपनी मिशनरी के स्कूल किसी भी भाषा में चला सकते हैं। इस प्रकार यह फ़्रैमेंटल राइट है। एजुकेशन का विषय ममवर्ती सूची में है। इस प्रकार से किसी प्रदेश का मुख्य मंत्री यह घोषणा कर दे कि हम किसी विशेष भाषा में शिक्षा प्रधान करने की इजाजत नहीं देंगे। और उन सारे स्कूलों को डीरिकनाइज कर देंगे। यह बहुत बड़ी समस्या है। मैं समझता हूं क्रिश्चियन माइनाट्रीज को। ... (व्यवधान) माइनाट्रीज में सिर्फ मुसलमान नहीं आते, काश्मीर में रहने वाले हिंदू माइनाट्रीज में हैं, नागालैंड में रहने वाले दूसरी जाति के लोग माइनाट्रीज में हैं। इसलिए मेजोरिटी माइनाट्रीज को हिंदू मुसलमान में क्यों बांटते हैं। आज काश्मीर की समस्या जो हमारे सामने है वह इसलिए है कि वहां माइनाट्रीज खतरे में है... (व्यवधान) इसलिए मैं चाहूंगा कि यह बात आपके माध्यम से प्रधान मंत्री जी तक पहुंचे कि किसी भी अल्पसंख्यक को अपनी मातृभाषा में शिक्षा देने का मौलिक अधिकार मिलना चाहिए और किसी मुख्य मंत्री को यह अधिकार नहीं है कि वह हमारे जो मौलिक अधिकार हैं उनको चुनौती दे सके और अल्पसंख्यकों के लिए कोई समस्या खड़ी कर सके।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: Madam, I have a point of order. I want to bring a point to your notice. Madam, all the Hon. Members speaking before me have brought it to your notice that it is the convention of the House—surely there can be differences of opinion when you are emotional and maybe he says something which we do not agree with—that when you are going to have amendments on the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address, which has to be sent to the President, at that time the Prime Minister should be in the House. Madam, it is unfortunate that the Members of the House feel that the Prime Minister has walked out. It

amounts to an insult to the President and also an insult to this House. (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now we have discussed this debate. विकल जी, मुझे जवाब देने दीजिए। एक मिनट, मैं आपको सुन लूंगा आप जरा एक मिनट मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। दो मिनट बैठिए। मैं बता रहा हूँ। आप लोगों ने जो कहा, लीडर आफ द हाउस सुन रहे हैं। वे प्रधान मंत्री जी को ज़रूर बताएंगे इस बारे में और जो डिस्कशन हुआ मुझे लगता है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने 3, 1/2 घंटे से ज्यादा रिप्लाइ किया। अभी भी अगर मेम्बर को कोई सैटिस्फैक्शन नहीं है तो मुझे लगता है कि लीडर आफ द हाउस यह बात उन तक पहुंचा देंगे। वे उनका जवाब देंगे। ... (*व्यवधान*)

**श्री पवन कुमार बांसल :** वो भूल गये हैं लगता है। उनको याद नहीं रहा कि बाद में मोशन को पारित करना होता है।

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Madam, he should have taken your permission before leaving.

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** What was Rajiv Gandhi doing? (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** The Prime Minister should come back to the House.

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** Don't worry, we will sanction Rs. 10 crores more for the safety of Rajiv Gandhi.

**श्री मोर्ज़ा इशबिंग :** महोदया, यह कोई हमारे ग्रुप का सवाल नहीं है। यह परम्परा का सवाल है।

**एक माननीय सदस्य :** यह प्रतिष्ठा का सवाल है।

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** The Prime Minister ran away. (*Interruptions*)

**श्री राम नरेश यादव :** उपसभापति जी, मैं आपसे निवेदन करूंगा कि लीडर

आफ दी हाउस से कहें कि वह प्रधान मंत्रों को यहाँ बुलायें, ताकि... (*व्यवधान*) और जब तक वह नहीं आते हैं, महोदया तब तक... (*व्यवधान*)

**उपसभापति :** अभी मैं लीडर आफ दी हाउस से कहा और वह कह रहे हैं कि इसका ऊपर काफी लम्बा वक्त हो चुका है और प्रधान मंत्री जी का रिप्लाय भी मुझे लगता है कि राज्य सभा की हिस्ट्री में सब से लम्बा रिप्लाय था। साढ़े तीन घंटे... (*व्यवधान*) पहले मेरी बात तो सुनो। साढ़े तीन घंटे रिप्लाय रहा।

आपके दिल में यदि अभी भी कोई शक रह गया है या आपके किसी सवाल का जवाब नहीं आया है और आप चाहते हैं कि सरकार उसके बारे में स्पष्टीकरण करे, तो लीडर आफ दी हाउस यहाँ बैठे हैं, वह आपकी भावनाएं ज़रूर उनको बता सकते हैं।

We have the Railway Budget to be discussed. I would request the hon. Members. Let us go ahead with the amendments. You can raise your points and these will be conveyed. I shall now put the amendments to vote. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Kindly see to it that the Prime Minister comes here. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The Prime Minister is not in the House. We have to complete this. The amendments have already been moved. I am going to put them to vote. (*Interruptions*) हाउस की कार्यवाही किसी की प्रेजेंस या एब्सेंस नहीं होगी। मैं तो रजिस्ट्रार नज़र कर रही हूँ।

**SHRI M. M. JACOB:** Madam, the convention of the House is that whenever the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address is discussed, the Prime Minister used to be here throughout. It is a question of propriety and convention... (*Interruption*) unless you take a decision as you like.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not my decision. (*Interruptions*) We have to complete the other Business of the House.

(Interruptions)

श्री राम चन्द्र विकल (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
माननीय महोदय, मेरा व्यवस्था का  
प्रश्न है । . . . (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सत्या बहिन : माननीया, मैं  
सदन का ध्यान इस ओर आकृष्ट करना  
चाहती हूँ कि... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : : आप बैठ जाइये, विकल  
जो बोल रहे हैं :

**श्री राम चन्द्र विकल :** मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि जैसा श्रीमती आपने कहा कि नेता सदन से आपने वातनीत की और नेता सदन की तरफ से आपने यहां कुछ घोषणा भी की। तो यह घोषणा नेता सदन की नहीं मानी जाएगी, वह स्वयं यंग नौजुद है। उन्हें कुछ कहना चाहिए।

दूसरा, नुझे यह कहना है कि मैं आपकी आज्ञा के मुताबिक ही चलता हूँ। मैं कदा आपकी आज्ञा के बिना नहीं चलता हूँ और न ही मैं कभी अवधान करता हूँ :

मैं भी कुछ मकल किसानों के तथा  
नदियों के किनारे के लकड़ प्रवाल सबों  
का एक पुराने के लिए बैठ था । . . .  
(अन्तर्गत)

SHRI V GOPALSAMY: Many times. Ravi Gandhi was not at all present. (Interjections)

१. राजा चन्द्र गजपति : मैं यह कह रहा हूँ  
 आपका हँसना ही है। राजा ने कहा कि  
 मैं आपका हँसना ही चाहता हूँ। आप ही कहें।  
 राजा ने कहा कि मैं ही हूँ। राजा ने कहा कि  
 प्रजापति नन्द को राजा ने राजा के  
 हँसना ही प्रजापति नन्द को राजा ने

प्रत्यक्षपति : जिस गृहों तक स्थल  
से इस सदन के सदन के अनुभव  
में, गृहों में गृहों की रिहाई हो गई  
है।

अब दूसरा काम हमें करना है और  
इस पर हाऊस का टाईम नहीं लेंगे ।  
... (व्यवधान)

I shall now put the amendments, which have been moved, to vote. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, give me half-a-minute. I have no intention to add to your troubles. But there are certain basic questions of propriety and convention involved. To that is the added factor... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I did not laugh. Please do not look at me. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** Madam, added to this, consider the factor that you were a party to telling the House that should there be any points arising out of the debate, the Prime Minister would reply to the points raised. So far as myself and my party are concerned, we are not happy that it had to go on for three-and-a-half hours. Partly we are to be blamed and partly they are to be blamed. But one thing is clear absolutely. You were a party to saying that the Prime Minister would reply to the points raised.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He has replied.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: You said that we should wait for his speech to be over and then, **thereafter**, we should address our questions to him. Madam, since you have said and since you have promised to the House, it is imperative that the Prime Minister considers it as a part of his obligation and duty to abide by it on both the scores. Not only the convention is flouted, this amounts to very severe disrespect to the House. I am afraid, on this point if the convention of the House is not followed, if the disrespect shown by the Prime Minister is to be condoned we will have no other option but to walk out.

(At this stage some hon. Members left the Chamber.)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Let me reply to Mr. Salve. I want to keep the record straight. I had given the assurance to the House that if the Members



did not interrupt the speech of the Prime Minister, I will see that he replied to the points, but I cannot ask anybody to speak for 3-1/2 hours and then to sit again to reply to the points. We have got other business of the House to continue.

Now I am putting all the Amendments to vote—Amendment Nos. 1 to 10, 14 to 62 and 75 to 83.

*Amendment Nos. 1 to 10, 14 to 62 and 75 to 83 were negated.*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the motion to vote.

The question is:

That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:—

"That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on the 12th March, 1990."

*The motion was adopted.*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we take up discussion on Railway Budget. *(Interruptions)*. The House wants to have lunch. The House is adjourned till 3.00 O'clock.

The House then adjourned for lunch at twenty-eight minutes past two on the clock.

The House re-assembled, after lunch, at eight minutes past three of the clock.

The Vice-Chairman (Dr G. Vinya Mohan Reddy) took the Chair.

# I. THE BUDGET (RAILWAYS) 1990-91 GENERAL DISCUSSION

## II. RESOLUTION APPROVING RECOMMENDATIONS OF RAILWAY CONVENTION : COMMITTEE—

Contd.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Mr Vice-Chairman, Sir, I rise to give my comments on the Railway budget. This budget, which is not for the poor people, does not contribute either to the Indian economy or to the efficient functioning of the railways.

But, Sir, there is one thing which I do appreciate. In the beginning of his speech, the Railway Minister has said that financial performance in 1989-90 was extraordinary. As you know, our former Railway Minister, Mr. Madhavrao Scindia, was one of the best Railway Ministers... *(Interruptions)*... Our former Finance Minister has become your Prime Minister. Our former Railway Minister, Mr. Madhavrao Scindia managed the Railway Ministry in such a nice way that, as Mr. Fernandes has stated in his speech, the actual surplus achieved is Rs. 21.67 crores after the payment of full dividend of Rs. 715.66 crores. In the revised estimates also he has said that the total revenue-earning loading in the current financial year is now placed at 311 million tonnes. Though it is short of the target by 9 million tonnes, the performance of the Railways in the freight increase is also considerably good.

Sir, you know that the Indian Railway is one of the largest railway in Asia. Its total length is 62,000 kilometres. The operating locomotive fleet is 8,813; coach vehicles 37,870; total wagons, 5,58,602; total trains running, 17,619; passenger trains, 7,250; and daily passengers booked are about 1 crore; 9.59 million passenger are carried in total; the total tonnage is 329 million tonnes.

Sir, it is indicative that under our Government, our former Government under the leadership of Shri Rajiv Gandhi and our former Railway Minister the Railways have made a lot of progress. It was previously in loss actually. But in the last four, five years it has started earning profit. Of course, the credit goes to our hon. Railway Minister, the former Railway Minister, Mr. Madhavrao Scindia.