

चाहती हूँ कि क्वेश्चन अवर की बात यहाँ पर न उठाये मेरी यह रूलिंग है। रेजोलुशन

No,-no, I am not permitting you. That matter is closed. Please sit down.

**RESOLUTION RE. NOMINATION OF
RAJYA SABHA MEMBERS TO THE
PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE TO
REVIEW THE RATE OF DIVIDEND
PAYABLE BY RAILWAYS TO GENERAL
REVENUES.**

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES): Madam, I beg to move:

"That this House concurs in the recommendation of the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha do agree to the nomination by the Chairman of six members from the Rajya Sabha to the Parliamentary Committee to review the rate of dividend which is at present payable by the Railway undertaking to General Revenues as well as other ancillary matters in connection with Railway Finance vis-a-vis the General Finance and make recommendations thereon".

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I asked for permission of the Chairman. I have a very important matter of breach of privilege against the hon. Home Minister, Mr. Mufti Mohammad Sayeed. I asked for permission from the Chairman, and he has given me permission. I have moved a very important matter of breach of privilege.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): There are so many motions' of breach of privilege. How is she getting precedence over others?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What I have to say let me say. We have the reply of the Prime Minister. Let me handle it properly. I will request you to be patient, please.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I will not make a long speech provided they do not interrupt me. If they interrupt, I cannot sit down till I make my point. I am raising an important matter of breach of privilege. (*Interruptions*) I am raising it in the House today before the hon. Prime Minister begins his reply on the Motion of Thanks. The breach of privilege relates to non-disclosure and suppression of facts before this House regarding kidnapping of Dr. Rubaiya, by the Home Minister. (*Interruptions*)

Madam, let me finish.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman will examine it and allow. Until and unless Chairman gives permission, I cannot say anything on it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): You should abide by the reply of the Chairman to it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: A breach of privilege cannot be discussed.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: This is a totally new procedure that is being adopted.

उपसभापति: यह हमारी प्रथा नहीं है कि हाउस में इस बारे में कुछ बोला जाय।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: The Chairman has allowed me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman did not allow you to speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): The Chairman never asked you speak here.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, let me set the record straight.

उप-सभापति: आप शांत रहिये। आपको मैं जवाब दे चुकी हूँ। आपने प्रिविलेज मोशन दिया है, और भी बहुत से प्रिविलेज मोशन होते हैं, चेयरमैन साहब उन पर जैसा निर्णय लेंगे वैसा किया जाएगा। अब आप कृपया बैठ जाइये, यही मेरी आप से विनती है।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, permit me to set the record straight. I had gone to the Chairman this morning. (*Interruptions*) Am I not allowed to set the record straight? (*Interruptions*) Let me put the facts, Madam. I had been to the Chairman. I told him that this was a very important issue.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have told you, and I will repeat again if you like in Hindi or in English or any other language I know, that when the Chairman gives permission, I will allow you.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Let me set the record straight?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the record?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: There is no record to be set straight. Where is the record?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: The record is straight.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): May I make a submission?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: What is it that they are so scared about?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman, we are well aware of the conventions and rules of the House that when a notice of any breach of privilege is given, it is given to the Chairman. He has got to exercise his judgement in regard to that. But that motion of privilege is not at all mentioned in the House nor is the matter about which a motion is sent to the Chairman for approval, mentioned in the House.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I want to set the record straight. They do not want us to set the record straight. I said the Home Minister

is misleading the House. Now, I sit down, Madam.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया (बिहार): उपसभापति महोदया, मेरी गुजारिश है कि एक मंत्री आफ पार्लियामेंट ... (व्यवधान) शांत रहिये। क्या आपको मंत्री आफ पार्लियामेंट के साथ हमदर्दी नहीं है?

महोदया, श्री जगदेव सिंह खुडैयां जो फरीदकोट के मंत्री आफ पार्लियामेंट हैं, कल सुबह से गायब हैं उनके परिवार वाले चिंतित हैं। बड़ी ही संदिग्ध अवस्था में उनकी पगड़ी और जूते राजस्थान केनाल के पास पाये गये हैं। महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से गुजारिश करना चाहता हूँ और कहना चाहता हूँ कि फरीदकोट एक ऐसा जिला है जो कि आतंकवादियों से ग्रसित है। लोगों का 'अप्रहेंसन' है कि कहीं उनका अपहरण तो नहीं कर लिया गया है। महोदया, अभी तक जो सिमरजीत सिंह मान है, जो कि मान ग्रुप के अध्यक्ष हैं उन्हें अभी तक शपथ नहीं ली है...

उपसभापति: दूसरे हाउस की बात यहां पर न उठाये।

Mr. Ahluwalia, please sit down. We cannot discuss anything about the other House. I cannot permit. (*Interruptions*) I am very sorry. You have nothing to do with it. (*Interruptions*) I will not allow anything about the Member of the other House and what they are doing. (*Interruptions*) I have already said. You don't hear it. I said that when a Member of this House... (*Interruptions*) I asked the Secretariat to find out. It is for the Lok Sabha Secretariat and the Government to find. We only can feel concerned about it. That is all.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया: ... (व्यवधान) ... जो उनका अपहरण हुआ है मैं सरकार से चाहता हूँ कि सरकार उनका पता लगाये।

SHRI DARBARA SINGH (Punjab): I only want to say this much that the hon. Prime Minister is here. He represents both the Houses. He has come here to reply. It is all right. But I would like to know what has happened to that man, who is a Member of Parliament. Has he been abducted? Where is he? He should give information.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The

Prime Minister is here. I understand the concern of the Members of Parliament. *(Interruptions)* Please. When I am speaking, will you please keep quiet? When the Prime Minister is here, I can understand the concern of the Members about any Member of any House. We have discussed about the *upharan* of the Members of the Assembly in Andhra Pradesh. I had allowed it. I understand the anguish of the Members of Parliament. The Government will take action on it.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): But we want to be informed.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): The Home Minister will make a statement in the House and share with the House whatever information he has.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: At what time?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: The time will be fixed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Prime Minister, you are replying to the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address.

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS— *Contd.*

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Madam Deputy Chairman, first I thank the hon. Members for the valuable contribution they have made in this debate on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. I would try my best to answer the substantial points raised by them.

[Mr. Chairman in the Chair]

Shri S.B. Chavan, the hon. Member, had occupied most important offices. He said that this is indeed a mandate for change but not a mandate for this Government. Certainly, it is not a mandate for the Congress. It may not be a mandate for the Opposition and that mandate of the people in the process of formation of the Government has got

fully reflected in the sense that by a wide spectrum of cooperation the Government is here on their support. But let me make it clear and that is one thing very significant, the support is based on issues. I think this is a very healthy tradition that is developing in the country. It is significant and its import should be understood. From personalised politics to issue-based politics is a process of the maturity of our political democracy.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): What about your value-based politics? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Hold on. The issues include-values but if you have some other values in mind, then, Government does not stand for them.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Punjab): We have the treatment of Mr. Jethmalani by your partymen in mind.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ (Madhya Pradesh): Mr. Prime Minister, did you read the speech by one of your Ministers delivered here. If we also start speaking in the same tone, then, none of your Minister, will be able to sit in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... What did Arif speak here? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir, is he holding a threat?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, I want a ruling from the Chair. Am I to proceed in this debate like in a Question Hour, Answering every supplementary? I can proceed that way, or, after every sentence, if a question is put, I respond to that. Or broadly I would seek the indulgence of the House.

श्री रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय सभापति जी, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने राष्ट्रपति भवन में अंग्रेजी का शपथ-पत्र लौटा कर हिन्दी में शपथ ली थी। शपथ इन्होंने किसी ने भी नहीं की। आज अंग्रेजी में ही प्रधान मंत्री जी अपना भाषण हिन्दी में दें तो ज्यादा अच्छा होगा।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil)