

Prime Minister is here. I understand the concern of the Members of Parliament. *(Interruptions)* Please. When I am speaking, will you please keep quiet? When the Prime Minister is here, I can understand the concern of the Members about any Member of any House. We have discussed about the *upharan* of the Members of the Assembly in Andhra Pradesh. I had allowed it. I understand the anguish of the Members of Parliament. The Government will take action on it.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): But we want to be informed.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): The Home Minister will make a statement in the House and share with the House whatever information he has.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: At what time?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: The time will be fixed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Prime Minister, you are replying to the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address.

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS— *Contd.*

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Madam Deputy Chairman, first I thank the hon. Members for the valuable contribution they have made in this debate on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. I would try my best to answer the substantial points raised by them.

[Mr. Chairman in the Chair]

Shri S.B. Chavan, the hon. Member, had occupied most important offices. He said that this is indeed a mandate for change but not a mandate for this Government. Certainly, it is not a mandate for the Congress. It may not be a mandate for the Opposition and that mandate of the people in the process of formation of the Government has got

fully reflected in the sense that by a wide spectrum of cooperation the Government is here on their support. But let me make it clear and that is one thing very significant, the support is based on issues. I think this is a very healthy tradition that is developing in the country. It is significant and its import should be understood. From personalised politics to issue-based politics is a process of the maturity of our political democracy.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): What about your value-based politics? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Hold on. The issues include-values but if you have some other values in mind, then, Government does not stand for them.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Punjab): We have the treatment of Mr. Jethmalani by your partymen in mind.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ (Madhya Pradesh): Mr. Prime Minister, did you read the speech by one of your Ministers delivered here. If we also start speaking in the same tone, then, none of your Minister, will be able to sit in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... What did Arif speak here? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir, is he holding a threat?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, I want a ruling from the Chair. Am I to proceed in this debate like in a Question Hour, Answering every supplementary? I can proceed that way, or, after every sentence, if a question is put, I respond to that. Or broadly I would seek the indulgence of the House.

श्री० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय सभापति जी, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने राष्ट्रपति भवन में अंग्रेजी का शपथ-पत्र लौटा कर हिन्दी में शपथ ली थी। शपथ इन्होंने किसी ने भी नहीं की। आज अंग्रेजी में दे रहे हैं। प्रधान मंत्री जी अपना भाषण हिन्दी में दें तो ज्यादा अच्छा होगा।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil)

Nadu): You ask the Members of your party from Tamil Nadu, whether they would make the same demand. This is the double standard.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: अंग्रेजी का लौटा दिया, हिन्दी में भाषण कीजिये (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The, Prime Minister is speaking, why are you...

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: मान्यवर, मुझे हिन्दी में बोलने में कोई एतएज नहीं है और न कोई हिचक है। अगर आप चाहेंगे तो मैं पूरा भाषण हिन्दी में भी कर सकता हूँ। लेकिन सुनना तो शुरू कीजिये (व्यवधान) जरूरत होगी तो तमिल का भी सहारा लिया जा सकता है।

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे (महाराष्ट्र): आप जिस भाषा में चाहें बोलें।

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, I will seek the indulgence of the Members from that side. One element of democracy is also the willingness to listen to others. If it has taken some-time for a change, that is different. But it is a necessary change... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI HARVENDRA SINGH HANS-PAL (Punjab): But Mr. Prime Minister, we will like you not to mislead the House as you did in Lok Sabha yesterday.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: This is the state of misconception. I have not even started leading and he says 'misleading'. First let me lead the arguments. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI HARVENDRA SINGH HANS-PAL: Sir, instead of 20 per cent agricultural growth, you said 2 per cent agricultural growth rate in Lok Sabha.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Hon'ble Shri N.K.P. Salve, when he addressed me as one of his friends, I totally endorse it. We have our friendship apart from the places that we may occupy. He said that very gracefully they did not form the Government or his leader did not form the Government. Salveji knows it very well. If the element of grace he was talking about was there, perhaps the positions would not have

changed. Precisely that is what he must be feeling in the heart, must be missing where he is and not far distant from you also if you look around. But if that had been there, what would have been the fate of the Government on the first day on the floor of the House? Do you think you would have got support and carried the day? It was this compulsion. It is this compulsion that makes you talk of grace. Only one thing was there, I think, what is really hurting is their expectancy was there and that has been the general (rend because I also used to share that psyche when I was on that side. Well, let things come to the decision-making stage and the Opposition will not hold. First, they have said, the National Front is a "national affront" but the National Front held. Then they said, let the tickets come, the Janata Dal will fall apart. Very smoothly we distributed the tickets and went to the polls. Then there was the expectancy, well, give them the chance, they will not be able to decide on their leader.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: What happened?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: What happened is standing before you. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: Standing on two crutches. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Yes, precisely the next stage of their psychology. All right, even if the leader is elected, these crutches about which they are saying, the contradictions of the Left and the BJP will not allow the formation of the Government. That was the calculation. (*Interruptions*). It will be very difficult to proceed and to give adequate answers to all the issues. Let us have some seriousness about it. And then on a principled basis, on issues, on the basis of even critical support—issues-based support—I am thankful to the BJP and the Left parties and other parties also who lent support to the Government and it was possible to form the Govern-

[Shri Vishwananath Pratap Singh] ment and effectively run it also. (*Interruptions*). And it is here I think there is a great occasion for the Indian democracy that based on issues, based on implementation of programmes and policies, on principles and our coming together. It is not based on the spelling of any one person. I know it is not based on, the spelling of Vishwanath Pratap Singh. (*Interruptions*).

कुमारी सईदा खातून (मध्य प्रदेश): महिलाओं के बारे में आपका क्या कहना है? ... (*व्यवधान*)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I think this is the first time that this occasion is there. And in this, we did not confine ourselves only to the parties who have lent support to this Government. But, on national issues, issues that concern the country, we have gone out to seek the cooperation of all the parties. The process of national reconciliation, I think, is an essential process. On certain issues, we must come together to agree because they are not party issues and that will be our first step in the management of the affairs of the country.

It has been said that not much was contained in the President's Address. Well, we, at the first step, spelt out our goal and unless we spell out our goal, we cannot even spell out our first step. Ours is not the case of a party which goes to the polls, files its nominations and does not even spell out its manifesto. The leader of the party, the ex-Prime Minister, goes to Amethi, files his nomination, without a manifesto. He goes even on election campaign. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P.N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh): What is your manifesto? What is the manifesto of your party? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: We came out With our manifesto ... (*Interruptions*)... as soon as the elections were announced. Within three days? we came out ... (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please keep quiet. Do not interrupt. (*Interruptions*). You all had your say. Let the Prime Minister also

have his say now. (*Interruptions*). What is this? Everybody is shouting! Kindly remember, if you do that, I will have to enforce the rule that anybody speaking without my permission will not go on record. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Noise cannot be a manifesto. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL... all your people have been doing for the last three years ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: The result of the last three years is obvious. It is the people who have given the verdict for what we have done for the last three years. (*Interruptions*). Yes. The reward for what we have done for the last three years is given by the people. (*Interruptions*). Now we know what their manifesto in this House is. Now we know. Their manifesto has come out. (*Interruptions*).

However, Sir, not only have we spelt out our goals (*Interruptions*) Sir, I am not yielding ... (*Interruptions*; ... Sir, we have not only spelt out our goals, but we have also gone into action.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार): मंडल आयोग की रिपोर्ट के बारे में राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण में यह नहीं कहा गया कि इसकी रिपोर्ट कब लागू होगी। ... (*व्यवधान*) और 52 फीसदी जनता से किए गए वचन का अन्याय जितना प्रधान मंत्री ने किया और राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण में किया गया, उतना कोई नहीं किया गया। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि इसमें कोई पैसा नहीं लगेगा इसके लागू करने में ... (*व्यवधान*) लागू होगा उसकी बात अलग है ... (*व्यवधान*)... कब लागू करेंगे, यह तो आपने कहा नहीं।

श्री सभापति: जब आप भाषण दे चुके हैं तो फिर क्या कह रहे हैं। ... (*व्यवधान*)

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह: आपका चुनाव घोषणा-पत्र है, लेकिन लागू नहीं हो रहा है। ... (*व्यवधान*)... आप अपने वचन से ... (*व्यवधान*)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: मान्यवर, राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण में राम अवधेश जी के वाक-आउट को टेलीविज़न पर नहीं दिखाया गया और आप टेलीविज़न

की स्वायत्ता की बात करते हैं। यह शर्म की बात है आपकी सरकार के लिए कि स्वायत्ता की बात टेलीविज़न पर करें और इस सदस्य ने मंडल कमीशन की रिपोर्ट पर सदन में बहिष्कार किया राष्ट्रपति ने सीच में और उस को आपने कस्टेल् किया है, टेलीविज़न पर नहीं आने दिया। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह: राष्ट्रपति के 'अभिभाषण' में क्या लिखा हुआ है ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति: अब आप तशरीफ रखिए। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: आप हमारे साथ ही रहेंगे ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सैयद सिद्दी रज़ी (उत्तर प्रदेश): जो आपके साथी हैं ... (व्यवधान) यह सारा डिस्टर्बैस उन्होंने किया है। सारा डिस्टर्बैस तो वह कर रहे हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, not only have we spelt our goals, but also, even before the debate is concluded, we have gone into action on the items that have been mentioned there.

Regarding autonomy for TV and the All India Radio that was mentioned, we have committed ourselves and now it is there as a Bill here for being passed by both the Houses and when Dipen Ghoshji said about the democratic institutions being restored, I think this is the first step in the process of right to information which has come. We had to fight for it and we went to jail. There was an agitation in the process of that struggle by all the parties and the implementation of it has been our first step ... (Interruptions)...

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह (हरियाणा): मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी के नोटिस में केवल एक बात लाऊंगा। क्या यही आपके टेलीविज़न और रेडियो की स्वायत्ता है कि आपके उप प्रधान मंत्री पुरानी सरकार को क्रिमिनल की सरकार कहें। अगर आपने परसें टेलीविज़न पर सुन आप अपने मंत्रिगण को, आप अपने उप प्रधान मंत्री को पिछली सरकार जिसमें आप भी मंत्री थे, वह उसे क्रिमिनल की सरकार कहें ... (व्यवधान)

श्री ईसराज भारद्वाज: कितने क्रिमिनल आपने ले लिए हैं वह हम नहीं बताना चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: **Only one thing I want to say,** Sir, in this process of autonomy to the electronic media, which are very powerful media—and we are aware how they were used—I know this Government will get the first taste of the freedom of the electronic media; it will be affected. But we are ready to spend one Government to establish one democratic tradition rather than destroy all democratic traditions. (Interruptions) Sir, I am not allowed to complete one sentence. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to draw your kind attention to the statement made by the Prime Minister that he was inclined ... (Interruptions) He was inclined to invite supplementaries from them and he was there to reply but they did not ... (Interruptions) Sir, they had more than 7 hours' time to make their points, and now the Prime Minister is replying. I would appeal to the Leader of the Opposition to keep his Members silent. (Interruptions)

I pity the state of affairs of that party. I pity that party. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

SHRI SAYED SIBTEY RAZI: Ask Dipen Ghosh to take his seat. (Interruptions) You have allotted one seat to each Member. Why is Dipen Ghosh not in his seat?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am allowed by the Chairman. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I may request the whole House that we have to maintain certain decorum. There have been certain traditions of this House. (Interruptions) They may have been violated once or twice. That is different. (In-

[Mr. Chairman]

terruptions) But the normal tradition is that when the Prime Minister speaks, he is heard. Another tradition is that unless the speaker yields, the other thing does not come. Now the question of Mr. Dipen Ghosh sitting on this seat or that seat is not so vital that we disturb the proceedings. (*Interruptions*) So, let us not waste the time of the House on this. (*Interruptions*) He will sit in his seat at the right time. That is all right. Sit down please. Don't you all move. He is consulting Atal Bihari Vajpayeeji about his future plans for marriage. What is wrong in it? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Whose marriage? Dipen Ghosh is already married- (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, I was saying that in the process of establishing democratic institutions, we are ready to spend one government and establish one democratic norm, one precedent rather than destroying all democratic norms to establish one government. That is the difference. We have come with the Lokpal Bill even while we are debating it in the President's Address. We have not waited. We have started implementation rightway. And for three years the hon. Members on the benches opposite conceived of the Lokpal Bill but could not deliver. And finally they have aborted. The only thing, perhaps the only hitch, was to include the Prime Minister in the purview of the Lokpal or not. (*Interruptions*)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: आग अपनी जांच कराएंगे। मैं आपके पत्र लिखा था जिस दिन आप प्राइम मिनिस्टर बने थे ... (व्यवधान) ... की रिपोर्ट पर आप संसदीय दल की जांच बिठाने को तैयार हैं आज तक आपने प्रधानमंत्री जी जवाब नहीं दिया। मैं आपके आफिस को भी फोन किया। यह एक संसद सदस्य की अवमानना है कि आप जवाब न दें ... (व्यवधान) ... आप पहले अपने से शुरू कीजिए।

Charity begins

at home.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: बैठिए। माननीय रत्नाकर जी, जब लोकपाल बन जाएगा, वह प्रधानमंत्री के इशारे पर नहीं चलेगा। आप जाइए और दाखिल कर दीजिएगा। वही फर्क है आप में और हम में। आपके दिमाग में (व्यवधान) ...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: मैंने आप पर आरोप लगाए। माननीय अध्यक्ष (व्यवधान) ... वह पत्र इस सदन ... (व्यवधान) ... आपने उत्तर नहीं दिया है। जिस दिन आपने ओथ ली थी, उस दिन मैंने लिखा था ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY): Mr. Chairman, it is not done. Let the Prime Minister reply. These are obstructionist tactics. It is unfortunate,

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: We are getting a taste of constructive cooperation. I think critical support and issue-based support is far better.

मान्यवर, मैं यह अर्ज करना चाहता हूँ कि यही अंतर है मानसिकता में। अब भी मानसिकता बनी है कि लोकपाल के लिए भी प्रधानमंत्री की इजाजत चाहिए। वह इजाजत हमने तोड़ दी है। प्रधानमंत्री नहीं रोक सकता दरवाजा लोकपाल का। एक साधारण से साधारण आदमी, नागरिक जो है 80 करोड़, उनमें से एक भी भारत का जो है लोकपाल के दरवाजे पर जाकर दरखास्त दे सकता है, प्रधानमंत्री को जवाब देना होगा। उसमें रत्नाकर जी आपके लिए भी दरवाजा खुला रहेगा, यहाँ फरियाद करने की जरूरत नहीं पड़ेगी। ... (व्यवधान) ...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: मैं फरियाद नहीं कर रहा हूँ। मैं इसी चीज का जवाब चाहता था कि मैंने जो आरोप लगाए हैं, संयुक्त संसदीय दल उसकी जांच करे। लोकपाल का बिल आप लाएंगे, 4 महीने लगेंगे, मैंने उस पर बात की थी। आपने जो किया है, उसकी कोई मानसिकता नहीं होती है आप * * * ठहर बैठे है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, is unparliamentary. You cannot use unparliamentary words. You have disturbed so much.

श्री बीरेन्द्र वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश): ये शब्द एक्सपेंच हो जाने चाहिए।

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: मान्यवर, यह तम्रम रिपीट करने की प्रक्रिया चल रही है। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): If it is unparliamentary, then it should not go on record.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is what-, I have said.

मतलब यही होता है न, आप तो पुनः आदमी है।

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, Chaturanan Mishraji stood up and he and all the parties on the Opposition rightly pressed for the repeal of the Fifty-Ninth Amendment...

AN HON. MEMBER: It is expiring.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Yes, and that is what Pawan Kumarji said that it is expiring on the 30th—he must be knowing the date; it is expiring on the 30th March—so, what is the sense of repeal?

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: I did not say that. I said that you are just wanting to play gimmicks when you say you are wanting to repeal this. And that is manifested from the Bill that you have brought out today. You have not given the date with effect from which you want this to be repealed. Again you are playing gimmicks with the people. If you have a look at the Bill which your Minister for Law has prepared for you, regarding the date of enforcement, again you have prevaricated on that. That is the point we were stressing. And this is the point where we want to give you constructive co-operation. Please bring it about with immediate effect. We will support you on that. Don't play with the sentiments of the people. I had said that those provisions were never invoked.

(Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: ...and what gimmick did you play with the people, to take the right of their life? The right of life can be taken only in a slaughter house. It can be the

mind of a butcher only to bring such a statute on the statute book. (Interruptions)

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): Mr. Prime Minister, may I ... (Interruptions) Mr. Prime Minister, if you kindly yield, I thought that I should say something.

AN HON. MEMBER: Why don't you control your Members?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: You have laid down bad precedents. I have always been deploring what has been happening. (Interruptions)

Mr. Prime Minister, I just wanted to make only one thing that that part of the amendment in the Fifty-Ninth Amendment to the Constitution which refers to the right to life, though it was enacted, at no point of time it was enforced. And I am just saying this ... (Interruptions) I have a right. The Prime Minister has yielded. I am saying it. Of course, I have not interrupted so far. I do not interrupt ... (Interruptions) मुझे बोलने के दीजिए (Interruptions)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Jageshbhai, control your - (Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, Mr. Kamal Morarka has used the word. *Are the Members of Parliament, I want to know.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The word* is unparliamentary, and it is expunged. And I expect a veteran like him not to use such words again.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: It is neither complimentary to your side nor complimentary to my side that unnecessary interruptions should be made.

Where it is necessary, I accept. Of course, either you or me, or my friends on either side, have a right to make an interruption. I have sought the permission of the Prime Minister. He has yielded and I am just saying why it has been made. I will explain it Since you have allowed me to explain, I will cer-

Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[Shri P. Shiv Shanker] tainly do it.
Now the position is ...(*Interruptions*)

The Chairman had been very kind to speak about precedents. Who violated the precedents? You people who used to be on this side, how did you behave? **Yon** never allowed ...(*Interruptions*). Just listen. I would like to say this. If the institution of Prime Minister has been brought down in this House it is you people who are responsible. (*Interruptions*). The way you used to behave. It is unfortunate. Whether it is you or me, I am concerned.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Is this the way to go on? (*Interruptions*). What does he mean by saying this?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I deplore...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We have never disturbed Mr. Rajiv Gandhi whenever he spoke in this House. None of us have disturbed him.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Sinha, do not be deceptive. Let us at least... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If this is a bad precedent, a bad precedent should not be followed by a good man like Shri P. Shiv Shanker.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I have not said a single word against the Prime Minister nor have I interrupted. Unfortunately, you are the one person who would like to brow-beat everyone.

And the convention in this House is, Mr. Chairman, may I just make a submission ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Do not provoke me.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: The convention in this House is that if you want to speak, you must speak from your own seat. You cannot speak from any other place. This is the convention that our friends must maintain.

श्री रामचन्द्र विकल (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय

दीपेन घोष जी की सलाह अटल बिहारी जी से हुई कि नहीं ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, for my personal explanation would you allow me a second? (*Interruptions*).

I have a personal explanation to make.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: After I speak, let him speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have a personal explanation.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Because he was interrupting me, let him speak after I have finished.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, I have a personal explanation to make.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: He referred to me, therefore I referred to him. Let me complete.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You raised a question about his seat. He wants to give a personal explanation on that.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, I never raised any objection on his sitting. I raised objection against the convention.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, I have a personal explanation to make.

श्री रामचन्द्र विकल: सभापति जी, हम भी आपका संरक्षण चाहते हैं हाउस में, यह क्या है कि दीपेन भाई हर बार बोलते हैं। सरकारी पक्ष में होकर भी हर बार सदन का समय खराब करते हैं। सरकार में रहने की इनकी आदत नहीं है। क्यों ये हाउस का टाइम खराब कर रहे हैं ... (व्यवधान)

1.00 P.M.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, I want to make a personal explanation. I want to point out because this has been raised by the Leader of the Opposition. I did not mind ...(*Interruptions*) when it was raised by my learned colleague, Mr. Sibtey Razi, and other Members from the other side. But this point has been raised by the Leader of the Opposition, by no less a person than Mr. Shiv

Shanker, who was the Leader of the House till the other day. I would like to point out that it was an arrangement, with the understanding of the Chairman and also the Deputy Chairman ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jacob also knows. The Leader of my group, the C.P.I.(M), Mr. Samar Mukherjee, normally, attends the Session. But sometimes, he does not attend the Session because of his illness. Therefore, it was arranged that the seat ... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI K.V. THANGKABALU (Tamil Nadu): This is not the convention. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: When they were on the treasury benches—Sir, you know it—they did not raise any objection. Many times in the past, I have spoken from the seat of my Leader. Mr. Salve knows. Mr. Shiv Shanker knows. Sir, you know. All the Members know. But today, only to score a point, Mr. Shiv Shanker is raising this question. It is most unfortunate that this has gone on record. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have never believed in scoring a point. I have said... *(Interruptions)*. The uninterrupted way in which he goes on interrupting and the way he browbeats the other Members is very unfair. That is why, I objected to it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: How fair are you? *(Interruptions)* I know how you functioned when you were the Leader of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: The other point is, speaking for myself, so far as I am concerned, I am not aware of any such arrangement. *(Interruptions)*

Now, Sir, I am only trying to bring to the notice of the House the position in regard to the Fifty-ninth Amendment. Before I refer to it, I would like to say just one thing here. The Prime Minister is an institution. The Prime Minister is a respectable authority. We should listen to him with rapt attention. I can only pray

to the Prime Minister—I cannot do anything beyond—that he may be pleased not to provoke. He can speak straightaway. I would also request hon. Members from my side that they should not unduly interrupt the Prime Minister. At least, let us establish better conventions from here. This is all I would like to say.

Now, Sir, I was saying that in regard to the Fifty-ninth Amendment, sub-clause(1) of clause 3 was never enforced, which takes away the right to life. It will last only up to the 30th March, 1990, because, by virtue of sub-clause(2) of clause 3, it will automatically expire after two years.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Madhya Pradesh): If not extended.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: It will not. It will automatically lapse.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: If you had been in Government, you would have brought another amendment.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: If you are to get married, whether you will get a child or not, one does not know. What is it that you are talking about? Why are you unnecessarily speculating about the future?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: For getting a child, you don't need to get married.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, I am making a prayer, not even a submission. I am making a prayer to the Prime Minister. I am one with him and I am glad that he has said that he is repealing the constitution (59th Amendment) Act, but I would make a request to him because he is the Prime Minister of the country and he is not only the Prime Minister of that party, he is Prime Minister of all parties also. Once you are the Prime Minister, you are the Prime Minister of the nation, of the country. And my only submission is that you repeal 59th Amendment immediately. What you are doing is, in clause 1, sub-clause (2),

which has been circulated in the other House, you say that it will come into force on such date as the Central Government may by notification in the Official Gazette appoint. That means, if you do it on 29th March, it will be unfair. Therefore, my only request is that it must be immediately repealed. That is all I am saying. Beyond that I have nothing more to say.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: That happens always in case of Constitutional amendments.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am quite in favour of repealing it immediately, but I would plead with you one thing. I have been in this House, I have also been a Member of this House and I have always felt a difference. What I had experienced in this House earlier is that in spite of very sharp views being expressed, we never got provoked in this House. If I am meeting the points in the debate, it is no provocation. I have to meet the point on the ground on which it has been made and it is no dishonour to any Member. But some points, as have been made, have to be met. The point is the immediacy and I quite endorse it because the very thought that we have on the statute book a law by which the right to life can be taken away, it is something which troubles us inside, it troubles us outside. The very thought that we have passed in our Parliament and it is the law of this land today that the right to life can be taken away, that very thought itself should be killed at the first moment, there is no question of the expiry date.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): Sir, will he yield for a second?

MR. CHAIRMAN: The basic concept is, so long as the person who is speaking is not yielding, I want to tell you that nothing will go on record.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Without your permission I am not speaking anything.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP

SINGH: I am not yielding. I have been very courteous to the hon. Members. I also have a right of expression, if not as Prime Minister, as Member of this House, member of the Cabinet. (*Interruptions*). Anyway I do not forget my older associations with you, that shows how strongly I am attached to you.

There is one point hon. Shiv Shankerji, if you do not take it otherwise. Sometimes, similes and metaphors also bring out an argument. You said that it was there but you have not used it. The mercy is that there were fangs of poison but you have not bitten. It is a great mercy. So, at the first occasion with your cooperation I will be grateful and I think it is a great victory of this occasion that yesterday in the Lok Sabha...

SHRI KAPIL VERMA (Uttar Pradesh): Do not refer to Lok Sabha.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Okay.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: He can say, 'in the other House.'

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: It was agreed by your party to withdraw the constitution (59th Amendment) Act. Today Shiv Shankerji is willing and he has himself suggested to withdraw it immediately.

I think it is a great moment. We feel a sense of victory. We are thankful for the change of heart on this issue at least. I would plead one thing more. Also on the withdrawal of the Postal Bill, what have you to say, Mr. Shiv Shanker?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Speaking for myself, I have no objection, absolutely no objection.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am grateful to you.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: In fact, Mr. Prime Minister, in 1980-81, I had specifically referred, as a Law Minister, that whatever colonial laws were there, every one of them and their provisions had to be gone through and they should be repealed if found obsolete. May I

request you to refer to whatever Commission you would like to have all the colonial laws which were meant for the purposes of making their rule more firm in this country so that such types of laws are repealed as early as possible.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Thank you.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO (Jammu and Kashmir): This is constructive cooperation.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: The atmosphere has changed. I feel encouraged. The process of national reconciliation has started.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ: Sir, there is a vital issue... some of your Ministers were defectors. What is your attitude to the Anti-Defection Law...No, Sir, it is very important.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, I am not yielding.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): Now you should sit down. The Prime Minister has not yielded.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ: Okay, but I have a right...

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Sir, why are you permitting him?

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ: The Prime Minister has been so kind. Mr. Prime Minister has said about the atmosphere and we welcome it. The question is, the whole of this House passed the Anti-Defection Law unanimously and some of their Ministers are defectors. What is the attitude of the Prime Minister to that?

Secondly, one of their Ministers, Mr. Madhu Dandavate, has challenged it in the Supreme Court and the High Court in Bombay. It is still pending there. What is the attitude of the Prime Minister to the Anti-Defection Law?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: There is need for a review of

the Anti-Defection Law. and the changes to be made, I think we have to go into it.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: You want to make it easier?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I hope when we bring it, you do not back out.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ: I am always for Anti-Defection Law.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Okay, let us preserve this spirit that we have started. The Bill on reservations was unanimously supported. That was another expression of reconciliation... On labour participation in management ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, this should not be permitted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, let him speak. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, I will not go on like that. I am proceeding with my thoughts and sharing them with you, with utmost patience. I will show immense patience that-I have. Extreme patience, I will show.

On labour participation in management, we have started again. We are not waiting for the Budget Session. On this also, on 8th of January, we have invited all the trade unions—and I would request the hon. Members to participate in it—to evolve a consensus on labour participation, not merely as a union demand, but as an ethos in industrial relations—for labour participation in management through secret ballot.

Here also I would really seek response from hon. Shiv Shankerji, his endorsement on labour participation in management. I want to hear from Shiv Shankerji. *(Interruptions)* Shiv Shankerji, you go by your conscience. Don't listen to Mr. Fotedar.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I am sorry. I was talking to the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. I did not hear you. That is why I was trying to ask what exactly

[Shri P. Shiv Shankar], the matter is where I have to answer you. I have heard it now. Participation of labour in management is the question. That is what you asked. I will tell you.

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Mr. Prime Minister, your Information Minister has defected. Don't worry. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: In fact, Mr. Prime Minister, I would like to bring to your notice that at the shop-floor level in certain cases we had decided during our time to include labour in management itself. But so far as our party is concerned, our party is not averse to participation of labour in management at all levels.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Thank you. With this support, in the next Budget Session, I give a commitment on the floor of the House, we will bring a Bill on labour participation in management, and by the year end it will be a reality in action.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Will you include the "INDIAN EXPRESS"?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: It will include everything. First it will start with public sector and in private sector—that is our ethos. We will extend it in phases taking the ground reality into consideration.

Sir, here, I want to say—it is not our demand, but I want to share with you the thinking behind it, and I know you will not be different—the question is of the productive forces—the labour, the farmer, the youth, the women, I mean, the creative forces of society should not only be given benefits, but they should also be given a share in the management and shaping and fashioning the destiny of the country. That is the, thought behind it, and this is one expression of it.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): That is also our policy.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: That is why I am so confident of your support, Desaiji.

Also many industrial Bills have been passed. Now the feedback you must also have got that the labour has been very much agitated about it. I think, there is need to review, in consultation with unions, the provisions of those laws. I think the consultation process we will start.

Another area of common perception—I will say again that we should not be allergic to the words "national reconciliation" is of electoral reform. I think, it is a national issue. I mean it concerns all of us, how the money power through the process of election, in the funding of politics gains a stranglehold in various fora of our political system and social order.

My point is that at least those who want to be above it, they should be given a chance at least. I think electoral reforms is another area where we can commonly agree. On 9th of January—I am giving the time schedule of action because it is not a platitude as you have been saying. On 9th...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Mr. Prime Minister, kindly yield for half a minute. We are glad that electoral reforms will be brought about. They are very essential, very necessary. If anything that these elections have revealed it is that our election laws are extremely deficient in certain matters. There was a point I had made in my speech, Mr. Prime Minister because I don't see that you are inclined to reply to that point or perhaps as one of the minor points you may not have included it. Sir, there is a very famous decision of the Bombay High Court which has laid down that the votes sought on the basis of appeal to the religion—especially they referred to the religion. The word *Hindutva* is a corrupt practice in terms of the provisions of Section 123(3)A. The appeal is pending in the Supreme Court. May I

know from the Prime Minister: To make what is implicit in law express, does he accept in principle that this kind of invoking of religious sentiments for purposes of elections is deleterious and pernicious for election system and that the law would be amended to ensure that people are not allowed to get away by invoking religious sentiments of the people?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: सभापति महोदय, मेरे एक मित्र श्री साल्वे जी ने...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): The question is to the Prime Minister.

Let the Prime Minister reply.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I am not replying to the question.

मैं चाहता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी, साल्वे जी ने जो मुद्दा उठाया है उसका जवाब देने के पहले आधा मिनट मुझको भी सुन लें।

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: जरूर... (व्यवधान) आप सुन लें।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: महोदय, मैं साल्वे जी को धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि उन्होंने यह मुद्दा उठाया लेकिन उस पर अपनी प्रतिक्रिया प्रकट करते समय प्रधान मंत्री जी यह भी बतायें कि मिजोरम में चुनाव के समय कांग्रेस पार्टी ने एक क्रिश्चियन गवर्नमेंट का नश्र लगाकर वादा करके चुनाव जीते थे।

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: I spoke about the principle and whoever violates that principle and whoever invokes communal or religious sentiments must have his election annulled. This is the question of principle I am asking the Prime Minister.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: सभापति जी, असली मामला है इस तरह के प्रश्नों में अदालत का फैसला देर से आने का।

श्री माखन लाल फोतेदार (उत्तर प्रदेश): इसलिफ़ पेंडिंग नहीं होना चाहिए।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: महोदय, हाइकोर्ट ने फैसला दे दिया विले पार्ले के मामले में, लेकिन अभी तक मिजोरम के बारे में कोई फैसला नहीं

आया है क्योंकि अदालत देर लगा रही है उसका एक तरीका है। मैं चाहूंगा कि ऐसे मामले जल्दी तय हों।

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA (Karnataka): We have filed an election petition on that. That is already pending.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: The law already exists. For election purposes religious feelings should not be exploited.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Will you support the judgement in the Supreme Court?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Salve Ji, let us go by the spirit of the debate. We can also raise hundred and one questions. That is not fair.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Mr. Prime Minister, I do not want to interrupt.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Let me answer you. For asking one question if a whole lecture is done.... I have the patience of going uptil night or even morning. I can go on in this way.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: We have to go on to Bofors too.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Yes, Bofors we are discussing. You have to.

Sir, we have to respect the law. (*Interruptions*) I am answering. Sir, even before I start a sentence, they interrupt. I have not got any electronic media to say all my words and sentences in the first sentence. Let me come to the end of the sentence at least. Then get up. On the first word you get up.

The law is there and the court has to be respected. Both have to be respected; That is the position.

Yes, the court has to be respected. Law has to be respected. It is clear ...(*Interruptions*)... I have answered that the court has to be respected.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Will you support the judgement in the Supreme Court?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: On this quarter it is clear that religious feelings should not be exploited. There is a consensus. There is no difference of opinion.

Honourable Shri Shiv Shankerji, on electoral reforms I don't say we have common views but we can come together for having a consensus on changing the electoral procedures so that money power and also muscle power can be curbed.

One more thing is our working class in the rural areas, particularly the labour force constituted of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. It has been our experience that many of the land reforms do not get implemented because of legal procedures. As Chief Minister of Uttar Pradesh I experienced it and this has been our common experience. It is one of our commitments as to how a poor man can get speedy remedy, the right which the Government gives that he really gets it. Our proposal is that land reforms be brought in the Ninth Schedule. I think that will be another area of common agreement. I have confidence I have the support.

In the same way judicial reforms also. I don't want to rush up and give a time-bound thing. I think sufficient thought should go, sufficient inter-action should go and sufficient debate should go before we tamper with the existing system of judiciary. But there is an urgent need of it. There is a sense of urgency also.

I also want to assure the House that National Integration Council will be re-constituted and in about a month or so, we will be having its first meeting and that will create the forum for the processes of national reconciliation on which there is so many problems before us.

There is another important area and just as on every sentence there has been

some debate or question, on this also I would elicit your reaction and that is the Inter State Council. We propose, as per the Constitution, to go ahead with the formation of the Inter-State Council and have a Chief Ministers' meeting in regard to this. Honourable Shri Shiv Shankerji, I would request your response to the formation of the Inter-State Council.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: But, Sir, this is not fair. After all, he has to ask his leader. How can he make it?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Vajpayee-ji, it is my privilege I shall not have to ask you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You may have to ask Fotedar.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I would only like to say this much. You put it in the proper form. Let it take a concretised shape, we will certainly consider it.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI (Bihar): Not in a dramatic way.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I think the distinction is being removed. There is a positive response on all this.

The Panchayati Raj Bill will also be brought in the Budget Session.

The right to know, we want to make it a fundamental right. I would seek your cooperation in this because political battles are not fought in villages or geographical areas, they are fought in the minds of the people, that is the Kuruk-shetra of politics and the mind is affected by information.

And if information has to be fair, it has to be open. That is the essence of democracy and it should.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: But your Home Minister did not answer any questions.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Well, if you have any grouse, your hands will be strengthened if you put fundamental right to know in the Constitution.

SHRI VISHWA BANDHU GUPTA (Delhi): I do not think that our party has been against the right to information whether outside or inside. It is a part of the Constitution. Under article 19, everything is available.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am enlightened and delighted.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, can I ask one clarification? Is the right to information being made fundamental going to be watered down subsequently the way you have done with the right to work? The Attorney General has come out on T.V. and explained that it is not going to be this and this. Is it really going to be fundamental or it is just going to be a cover?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: It will be as fundamental as you agree to and this House agrees to.

SHRI PAWAN KIIMAR BANSAL: Sir, if you kindly permit me half a minute...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I am not yielding, Sir. Then about strengthening the Planning Commission, I think the Planning Commission has to be strengthened and it should have greater clout than just being an appendix of the Government. I think now, may not be earlier, the support would be forthcoming. So I think I have covered quite an area of agreement. May I most humbly come to some areas of disagreement.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Provoking?

SHRI VISHWANTAH PRATAP SINGH: No, not provoking, I am not provoked but provocation has two sides. Hon'ble Shri S.B. Chavan, for whom I have the highest regards personally and also in his competence ... (Interruptions)... I think care has to be taken more on that side on his competence.

श्री मीर्जा इश्रादबेग (गुजरात): एक आपको निवेदन है आज फ्राइडे है और यह डेढ़ बजे का समय हो चुका है ... (व्यवधान) जरा सुनिए तो सही कि मैं

क्या कह रहा हूँ, एक रिकवैस्ट भिजवाया था ... (व्यवधान) ...

Sir, we want to know from the Chair that today is Friday. ... (Interruptions)... what is the decision, Sir? It has been the convention of the House that on Friday...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: If you want to go out for 'namaz', I am willing to yield. (Interruptions).

श्री सभापति: दो बजे एडजर्न करेंगे।

श्री सैयद सिद्दीक रज़ी: साहब, यह हमारा नमाज़ का वक्त है।

श्री सभापति: इस नमाज़ का वक्त तीन बजे तक रहता है, मुझे मालूम है।

श्री मीर्जा इश्रादबेग: सर, जौहर का रहता है, जुमआ का नहीं रहता और आज जुमआ है।

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा: आप नमाज़ पढ़कर दो बजे आ जाइएगा।

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO: Sir, please listen to me.

SHRI MIRZA IRSHADBAIG: At 2.30 p.m. we can reassemble here.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO: Sir, I want to clarify the actual position. The actual position is, in the Jama Mas-jid, New Delhi, outside the Parliament House, 'namaz' is performed at 1.25 p.m.

So that is finished here. Now, there is another mass at Curzon Road where 'namaz' is at 2 O'clock. So, you cannot reconvene the House at 2 O'clock. You have to reconvene at 2.30 p.m. Then there will be Private Members' business which will have to be continued up to 5 O'clock. There is no other way out. (Interruptions).

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want a clarification. If you adjourn the House for 'namaz', is it compulsory for me also to go and do 'namaz'? I would like to be cleared on this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, we may, if the

[Mr. Chairman]

House agrees, adjourn now and meet at 2.30 p.m. today and the Prime Minister may commence his reply at 4 O'clock.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Thank you very much.

SHRI MIRZA IRSHADBAIG: I am personally thankful to the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the House adjourns to "meet again at 2.30 P.M. today.

The House then adjourned for lunch at forty-one minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-four minutes past two of the clock, The Vice-Chairman (Shri Jagesh Desai) in the Chair.

RESOLUTION RE: CONSTITUTING A COMMITTEE TO EXAMINE THE QUESTION OF TELECAST OF PARLIAMENT PROCEEDINGS

डा० बापू कालदाते (महाराष्ट्र): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आपकी अनुमति से मैं निम्नलिखित संकल्प उपस्थित करता हूँ:

"कि संसद की कार्यवाही को टेलीविजन पर दिखाने की मांग बढ़ रही है, यह आवश्यक है कि टेलीविजन के लोकप्रिय माध्यम के द्वारा जनता में जनमत तैयार करने के लिए संसद की कार्यवाही को उन तक पहुंचाया जाये,....

देश में संसदीय लोकतंत्र के हित में यह आवश्यक है कि जनता संसद की रोजमर्रा की कार्यवाही तथा उनके निर्वाचित प्रतिनिधियों की संसद में निभाई गई भूमिका और उनके कार्यकरण के बारे में अवगत हो जिससे देश में संसदीय संस्था के प्रति आदर तथा सम्मान की भावना उत्पन्न होगी। ब्रिटिश हाउस आफ कॉमन्स सहित विश्व के अनेक प्रमुख देशों की संसदों ने अपनी अपनी कार्यवाही को टेलीविजन पर दिखलाना प्रारंभ कर दिया है, और संसद के केन्द्रीय कक्ष से राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण को सीधे टेलीविजन पर दिखला कर एक स्वागत योग्य और अभिनंदनीय शुरुआत की गई है, इस सभा की समिति है कि सरकार को संसद की कार्यवाही को टेलीविजन पर दिखलाने के संबंध में सभी पक्षों की, गहन जांच करने के लिए एक समिति का गठन

करना चाहिए जिसमें संसद की दोनों सभाओं का प्रतिनिधित्व करने वाले सदस्य, प्रेस तथा इलेक्ट्रॉनिक मीडियम के प्रतिनिधि तथा अन्य विशेषज्ञ शामिल किए जाएं और जो संसद के विचारार्थ उसे अपना प्रतिवेदन प्रस्तुत करें।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): This will go up to 4.00 O'clock. If you are all interested that the Minister should intervene, then I think the discussion should finish at 3.45. It can be done if the House so wishes.

DR. BAPU KALDATE: No problem.

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, जो भावना मेरे परम मित्र आदरणीय हनुमन्तप्पा जी और स्वामी जी ने दिखाई है उससे मैं बहुत सहमत हूँ। मैं बहुत ही संक्षेप में कहूंगा। इस बात में मैं भी आपके साथ हूँ कि मैं जानता हूँ कि अगर आज यह हाउस में नहीं होगा तो लोप हो जाएगा। इसलिए मैं चाहूंगा कि बहुत ही संक्षेप में कहूँ ताकि जो सम्मानीय सदस्य यहां पर बैठे हुए हैं इस पर थोड़ा थोड़ा कह सकें और मेरी महोदय भी अपना रिएक्शन और उनकी जो भावना है, वह सदन के सामने प्रस्तुत कर सकें।

महोदय, एक बात साफ है कि जब हम खुले समाज की कल्पना करते हैं तो जनता को यह अधिकार होना चाहिए कि उसको जानकारी मिले। जनता का यह अधिकार निहित है कि जनता के सामने खुले तौर पर राज्य का जो कार्यभार है या देश का कोई भी कार्यभार हो उसकी उसको जानकारी मिलनी चाहिए। इस सरकार की नीति भी यही है और यह बहुत अच्छी बात है। उसने पहली बार संसद के सामने राष्ट्रपति जी का जो अभिभाषण हुआ उसको लाइव टेलीकास्ट टेलीविजन पर दिखाया। इसी को आगे ले जाने के लिए मैं सरकार से प्रार्थना कर रहा हूँ। मुझे लगता है कि यह सरकार इसके लिए अभिनंदन की पात्र है। जैसा मैंने अपने प्रस्ताव में कहा है, यह काम सरकार ने पहली बार किया है। जहां तक मेरी जानकारी है और मेरे पास 80 देशों की जानकारी है जिन्होंने यह काम शुरू किया है। आज दुनिया के बहुत से देशों में कुछ हद तक या पूरे तौर पर यह टेलीकास्ट हो रहा है। जहां तक ग्लेनरी सेशन का सवाल है, यह 25 देशों में टेलीकास्ट हो रहा है। सेलेक्टड एक्स्ट्रेक्ट एण्ड समरीज 19 देशों में होती है। इम्पारटेन्ट सिटिंग्स आनली, 14 देशों में होते हैं। यह 80