

[11 December, 2001]

RAJYA SABHA

RAJYA SABHA

Tuesday, the 11 th December, 2001/20 Agrahayana, 1923 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock.

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

RE. DEMAND FOR DISCUSSION ON CAG REPORT ON DEFENCE PURCHASES

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Arjun Singh.

SHRI ARJUN SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): Hon. Chairman. Sir. I have given a notice under Rule 267 for suspension of the Question Hour: and, with your permission, to raise a matter, which I am sure, must have touched the conscience of every Indian citizen.

We have a press report today, though we have been seeing the whole trend of reports in the last one week having to do with the Kargil battle, what preceded it and what followed it. I am not standing here. hon. Chairman, to score a point; I am standing here. Sir. because, as an Indian citizen. I feel that a voice must be raised today, not for or against anyone, but a voice which must call upon the nation to reflect and see and judge for itself on what has happened.

Sir. we have seen in the past week or so and also in the course of debates on issues, that a lackadaisical attitude was adopted by this Government on grave issues of defence. Many of them were treated as political issues. But now. the time has come when this nation cannot treat it as a political issue, because we are dealing with an issue in which the coffins of our martyrs were utilised to make money.

डा. वाई. जक्ष्मी प्रसाद (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : सर, आज क्वेश्चन आवर नहीं है क्या ?
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश) : क्या आप इस बात से भी सहमत है कि काफिन में भी पैसा खाया जाए ? ... (व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please hear me. I have allowed him to raise the issue. The Leader of the House will respond. And if the response and everything continues, the Question Hour will begin.

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर क्वेश्चन आवर स्थगित नहीं होना चाहिए, यह सब बातें क्वेश्चन आवर के बाद ली जाएं । ... (व्यवधान)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR (Andhra Pradesh) : Sir, kindly don't create a new precedent. The question is about the fate of lakhs of tobacco farmers in Andhra Pradesh... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will take it up after his response.... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Sir, they can raise the issue during zero hour. Why are you creating a new precedent ? Let the Question Hour be over first. Nobody will object. It is one of the important questions relating to the tobacco farmers in Andhra Pradesh.... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR (Gujarat) : The Chairman has allowed him.
... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Arjun Singhji. my point is यह क्वेश्चन आवर के बाद हो सकता है । ... (व्यवधान) ... अर्जुन सिंह जी, आप यह क्वेश्चन आवर के बाद पूछ सकते हैं । बड़ा इम्पोर्टेंट है तम्बाकू के निर्यात के बारे में Lakhs of farmers are being deprived by it. Please don't suspend the Question Hour. This is my humble request. ... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : I got a notice. It is on a serious issue. Mr. Arjun Singh will raise it and the Leader of the House will respond. If the response is there and the House continues, the Question Hour will begin.

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Sir, the Question Hour is also a serious issue.

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : सभापति महोदय, आपका तो निर्णय है कि क्वेश्चन आवर स्थगित नहीं होगा, उस निर्णय को आप वापस ... (व्यवधान) ...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Mr. Chairman. Sir, let the Question Hour be over. We are not against the matter which they are raising, but let the Question Hour be over. ... *(Interruptions)*... Why are they creating a new precedent ? ... *(Interruptions)* ... Why are you Creating a new precedent?... *(Interruptions)* ... It is a bad precedent. ... *(Interruptions)* ... My question regarding export of tobacco to Algeria is very important. It pertains to the tobacco farmers from Andhra Pradesh.

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति जी, आपने एक बार जो व्यवस्था दे दी, क्या उस व्यवस्था को चुनौती दी जा रही है ?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete. ... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : कारगिल के शहीदों पर भी कमीशन खाय़ा जा रहा है ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Sir, let us continue with the Question Hour.

हम ना नहीं बोल रहे हैं, बात करो लेकिन पहले क्वेश्चन आवर तो होने दो ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Mr. Chairman. Sir.... (*Interruptions*)...

डा. अलादी पी. कुमार : तुमने कम नहीं खाय़ा जी, बोफोर्स का रिपोर्ट आने से सब पता चलेगा ...(*व्यवधान*)... You have no right to talk about corrmption. It has started from your party. Now, don't talk about Kargil. Don't tell us about corrmption... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : आप तम्बाकू के मामले में सीरियस है और हम कारगिल के शहीदों के लिए जो काफ़िन खरीदे गए और उसमें कमीशन खाय़ा गया, हम उसके लिए सीरियस हैं। यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Mr. Chairman. Sir.... (*Interruptions*)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Pachouriji, you have no moral right to talk about corruption. ... (*Interruptions*)... You have no moral right to talk about corruption.... (*Interruptions*)... Don't talk about corrmption.

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : हमें नहीं मालूम था कि आप कारगिल के शहीदों के काफ़िन खरीदने में कमीशन खोरो का साथ दोगे ...(*व्यवधान*)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Mr. Chairman. Sir, I want an assurance from you that the House will continue with the Question Hour. ... (*Interruptions*)...

MR CHAIRMAN: Let him complete.... (*Interruptions*)... Let him complete. I have told them that he will speak. The Leader of the House will respond to it. Then, we will continue with the Question Hour.

DR. ALLADIR RAJKUMAR : Mr. Chairman. Sir this is a very important question. .. (*Interruptions*)... This is a very important question. ... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, यह सदन की परंपरा रही है कि माननीय सभापति जी ने एक बार कोई रूलिंग दे दी तो उसे चुनौती नहीं दी जा सकती है। सदन की परंपरा का निर्वहन किया जाना आवश्यक है।

DR. Y. LAKSHMIPRASAD : This is the Question Hour ... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH : Honourable Chairman. Sir. I am grateful to you ... (*interruptions*)...

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : सभापति जी, आपने क्वेश्चन आवर सस्पेंड नहीं किया है, इसलिए क्वेश्चन आवर होना चाहिए। क्वेश्चन आवर आपने सस्पेंड नहीं किया है।

श्री सभापति : मैंने उनको इजाजत दी है बात करने की।

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Mr. Chairman. Sir. with your kind permission. I want to say that I cannot shout over others, due to various limitations. But I want to raise my voice in a very humble manner.... (*Interruptions*)..

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : सारा क्वेश्चन आवर इसमें चला जाएगा ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him speak. ... (*Interruptions*)... Let him speak ... (*Interruptions*)... Let him speak.... (*Interruptions*)...

डा. वाई. लक्ष्मी प्रसाद : सभापति महोदय, आप प्रश्न काल को 12 बजे के बाद 10 मिनट के लिए बढ़ा दीजिए, हमें कोई एतराज नहीं है ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : He will speak, and the Leader of the House will respond. Then, we will continue with the Question Hour.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH : Honourable Chairman. Sir. you were kind enough to admit this matter because of its importance. That is why you gave me permission to raise it under a certain rule. Therefore. I am speaking under that rule. I am making a request. I am giving the background for my request. There are issues in this country which transcend, totally, partisan matters, any politics, any kind of opinions that we may have one against the other. I think I would request my friends, who are trying to stop me. to reflect on what I am saying. ... (*Interruptions*)...

DR. Y. LAKSHMI PRASAD : We are not stopping you. हम तो तम्बाकू के बारे में कंसर्न्ड हैं ।...(व्यवधान) ...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु (पश्चिम बंगाल) : तम्बाकू भी होगा, हमारा भी इंटरेस्ट है ।
...(व्यवधान) ...

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT (Madhya Pradesh): Mr. Chairman. Sir. if the Question Hour is going to be converted into the Zero Hour, is it right? ...
(Interruptions)...

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम (उत्तरांचल) : आपके लिए तम्बाकू भी जरूरी है । रोज खाते हो, रोज पीते हो । ... (व्यवधान)... आपके लिए भी बड़ा जरूरी है तम्बाकू, जिसकी रोज खाते हो, पीते हो ।

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : आदरणीय गौतम जी से मेरी प्रार्थना है कि किसी वक्त पर तो कृपा करिए ।

SHRI KM. SAIFULLAH (Andhra Pradesh): Kindly be brief.

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: There is nothing brief about it. my friend. If I were to say it in brief, it will be much more unpalatable.

SHRI K.M. SAIFULLAH : Why do you make an elaborate speech, taking the time of the House now ? Members want the Question Hour now. You cannot make an elaborate speech now.... (Interruptions)...

डा. वाई. लक्ष्मी प्रसाद : सर समय तो निर्धारित कर दीजिए इसका ।

श्री सभापति : अगर क्वेश्चन आवर चाहते हो तो पहले वज बोल लें, वह रेस्पांड कर लें, फिर क्वेश्चन आवर हो जाएगा ।

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : क्वेश्चन आवर होगा ही नहीं ।

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : जरूर होगा, जरा धीरज से सुनिए ।

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Hon. Mr. Chairman. Sir. I have already explained the background. None of us questioned. Without any exception, every person, to whichever party he or she might belong, stood in silent salute to the great martyrs of Kargil because of whom the country was saved from a great peril. We did not say that we were not in Government and. therefore, we were opposed to it. We stood by everyone. That great patriotic spirit, which swept across the country, brought about tremendous unity in the country. The only force that a nation has is the unity of its citizens. But now. when the facts are coming out. we

are feeling cheated, [if that is the case, we have a right to stand up and register it. ... (*Interruptions*)... You forget about that. If that is the example they are following, let them say so. Sir, it is now apparent that at various stages, while this grim battle was on, for the honour and prestige of this country, people were at work silently to devise and prepare attitudes, opportunities, to make money. That is something which has come out. I am not saying anything on my information. It is a report by an independent constitutional authority of this country. If the report of an independent constitutional authority of this country is to be rubbished, just because it does not suit us, let the House decide that; I will keep quiet. But I do not think that it can happen. The Opposition has a duty to see that it does not happen. Now, here, the fact has been brought out that the cost of a single casket or coffin was previously 172 dollars a piece and that same item, from that same company, has now been purchased at 2500 dollars.

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : जिम्मेदार कौन है, यह तो बाद में तय होगा । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH : Sir, I have used the terminology of dollar because that seems to be more understandable today in India than the value in rupee. ... (*interruptions*)...

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: Kindly make the point.... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : गौतम जी की आज्ञा को मैं मानता हूँ, शिरोधार्य करता हूँ । मैं बहुत साधारण हिन्दी में इस बात को कहना चाहता हूँ । ...(**व्यवधान**) ...

डा. अलादी पी. राजकुमार : आपकी जुबान से शोभा नहीं देता । ...(**व्यवधान**) ...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : मुझे क्या शोभा नहीं देता, वह तो आप जाने । मेरा जो कर्तव्य है मैं अपना ...(**व्यवधान**) ...

डा. अलादी पी. राजकुमार : आपके जीवन में तो बोफोर्स की हिस्टरी है । कोई और कहता, सी.पी.एम. वाले कहते तो कुछ होता । आपकी जुबान से बोलना ठीक नहीं होगा । ...(**व्यवधान**) ...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH : I have serious objection to this... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी (पश्चिम बंगाल) : हमारी तो सुनिये । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

डा. अलादी पी. राजकुमार : आप भूलिए मत । ...(**व्यवधान**)... वह यहां पर ला रहे हैं । ...(**व्यवधान**) ... मैं आपकी पूरी इज्जत करते हुए बोल रहा हूँ । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI DIPANKARMUKHERJEE : You join us.... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : मैं आपको चैलेंज करता हूँ लेकिन मैं इस वक्त जो हमारा उद्देश्य है, उससे हटना नहीं चाहता हूँ। आप जो कुछ भी कहना चाहें, कह दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete.... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : ये लोग क्या करेंगे ? कुछ नहीं करेंगे। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

जीवन राय : (पश्चिम बंगाल) : कभी नहीं उठ पाओगे। ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : सर, वह समझते हैं कि व्यापक रूप से व्यक्तिगत लांछन लगाकर मेरा मुंह बंद कर देंगे लेकिन मेरा मुंह बंद होने वाला नहीं है, मैं अपने कर्तव्य का निर्वहन कर रहा हूँ, उसमें किसी को अच्छा लगे या बुरा, मुझे कोई मतलब नहीं है। मैं यह कह रहा हूँ कि जो तथ्य सामने आए हैं, वह स्वयं एक कहानी कहते हैं। ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN : The Leader of the House will respond. ...

(*Interruptions*) ...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : कुछ साल पहले जिस कॉफिन की कीमत लगभग 6 से 7 हजार के करीब थी, उसी कॉफिन को, उसी कम्पनी से सरकार ने एक लाख से ऊपर में खरीदा है। ... (*व्यवधान*) ... अब यह कीमत भी पूरी दे दी गयी ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री जीवन राय : हो गया सब खत्म ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

SHRI GHULAM NAB1 AZAD (Jammu and Kashmir) : This is what is mentioned in the CAG report. ... (*Interruptions*)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : We are not denying it. The Lok Sabha Members are sitting in the gallery. They represent their constituencies ... (*Interruptions*)... I am worried about this question. You can raise it after the Question Hour. ... (*Interruptions*)... We are not against that (*Interruptions*)... The Lok Sabha Members have come all the way to know the views of the Government with regard to this question. ... (*Interruptions*)... So. I request the Chairman to give a direction that he will allow this matter to be taken up after the Question Hour. ... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH : How can I speak. Sir ? I cannot complete in this *hullo gulla*. That must be very clear. I have your permission. So. I should be allowed to speak.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Yes. I have given the permission.... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह 'ललन' (बिहार) : क्या यह डिबेट हो रही है ? ...(*व्यवधान*)

...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : इस तरह की जो घटनाएं एक के बाद एक सामने आ रही हैं, यह स्पष्ट है कि ऐसे महत्वपूर्ण ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

श्री सभापति : अर्जुन सिंह जी, आप अपनी बात कहिए । ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : मेरे बात करने की जरूरत इसलिए है कि आप इसकी अहमियत को समझें ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

श्री ब्रतीन सेनगुप्त (पश्चिम बंगाल) : इसका मतलब क्या है ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete. ... (*Interruptions*)... Let him complete.

SHRI ARJUN SINGH : I am saying so... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete.... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह 'ललन' : महोदय, समय बांध दीजिए ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

श्री सभापति : जल्दी ही खत्म कर देंगे । ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : आदरणीय सभापति महोदय, किछ लोगों की चले तो मुझे सदन से बाहर ही कर दें लेकिन यह चलने वाला नहीं है । ...(*व्यवधान*)... आप अपने मन जो भी बन पड़े करें । सदन के सदस्य के नाते जो भी मेरा कर्तव्य है, उसे मैं पूरा करूंगा । जल्दी का सवाल नहीं है । जो उपयुक्त होगा, मैं वह कहूंगा । ...(*व्यवधान*) ... आदरणीय सभापति महोदय, इस संदर्भ में यह निहायत जरूरी है कि शासन सदन के सामने यह स्पष्ट करे कि कॉफिनों की हेराफेरी में किसी भी प्रकार की नजर अंदाजी नहीं हो सकती । यह हमारी भारतीयता, हमारे स्वयं के पैट्रियोटिज्म पर एक सीधा आक्रमण है । आज शासन जो मूक होकर यह सब देख रहा है, मेरे मत और देश के मत में, आप समझ लीजिए । इसका बने रहना न तो न्यायिक है, न सर्वमान्य है और न किसी भी प्रकार से हम इसको स्वीकार करना चाहते हैं । शासन से हम लोगों को बहुत उपदेश दिया है, समय-समय पर प्रधान मंत्री जी के भाषण हम लोगों ने सुने हैं ...(*व्यवधान*) ...

SHRI K.M. SAIFULLAH : Sir, he has made some allegations. We are supporting him. Let him answer.... (*Interruptions*)... We are worried about that.

Let him answer. ... (*Interruptions*)... He has brought to his notice what happened.
... (*Interruptions*)

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : आप कहते हैं तो मैं बैठ जाता हूँ लेकिन मैं इनके मन की बात कहूँ, यह संभव नहीं है। ...(**व्यवधान**) ...

श्री सभापति : आप अपनी बात पूरी कर लीजिए। ...(**व्यवधान**) ...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : माननीय सभापति महोदय, यह नितांत आवश्यक है कि समाधान कारक और पूर्णतया देश को मान्य हो, ऐसा स्पष्टीकरण सरकार की ओर से आना चाहिए। यदि ऐसा नहीं होता है तो किसी भी हालत में हम इसे स्वीकार करने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**) ... मैं आपसे निवेदन करूँगा कि जिस आसन पर आप बैठे हैं, आपने उसके महत्व और उसके गौरव को ध्यान में रखकर एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय को यहां उठाने की अनुमति दी है। इसके पूर्व उदाहरण भी इस सदन में देखने को मिले हैं। आज ऐसा ही प्रश्न आपने इस सदन में उठाने की अनुमति दी है। इसके महत्व को देखते हुए, हम शासन की प्रक्रिया सुनना चाहते हैं इसके बाद हम जो भी समझेंगे, करने की कोशिश करेंगे।

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI JASWANT SINGH): Sir. I don't think why the hon. Member should have taken 25 minutes to say what he has done, because we, the Government, entirely share his concern. It is not as if we are unconcerned about what the CAG's Report has said. We are equally concerned about it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU : You have reinducted Mr. George Femandes before the Commission of Inquiry could submit its report. That is your concern ! You make the point very clear.... (*Interruptions*)... You have specifically expressed your concern by reinducting Mr. George Femandes before the Venkataswami Commission could submit its report. That is your concern. ...(*Interruptions*).....

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति जी, सदन की यह परंपरा रही है कि जो 'कैग' रिपोर्ट आज टेबल पर होनी चाहिए उसका जिक्र करते हुए माननीय सदन के नेता ने यह कहा कि वे उससे संबद्ध करते हैं तो आपसे यह प्रार्थना करना चाहूँगा कि उस 'कैग' रिपोर्ट को, जिसके हवाले ये सारी बातें आ रही हैं उसे अभी सदन में प्रस्तुत किया जाए। क्योंकि माननीय नेता ने भी उससे प्रतिबद्धता जाहिर कर दी है इसलिए जो बातें कही गई हैं उन बातों पर प्रमाणिक स्तर पर डिसकशन किया जा सके। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : रिपोर्ट पेश नहीं हुई तो लीक कैसे हो गई ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : माननीय सदन के नेता ने ...**(व्यवधान)**... सभापति जी, मेरा प्रश्न यही है कि ...**(व्यवधान)** ... माननीय सदन के नेता ने उस रिपोर्ट से अपनी सहमति जाहिर कर दी है इसलिए आवश्यक है कि उस रिपोर्ट को सदन के पटल पर अविलंब प्रस्तुत किया जाए । सदन के नेता की उससे सहमति प्रकट करना और यह कहना कि हम भी उससे प्रतिबद्धता जाहिर करते हैं इससे इस मैटर की गंभीरता और बढ़ गई है ...**(व्यवधान)** ...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him complete. *(Interruptions)*... Let him complete. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him complete. *(Interruptions)*...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : इससे पहले कि और कोई विषय लिए जाएं उस रिपोर्ट को सदन के पटल पर प्रस्तुत कर चर्चा की जाए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete. *(Interruptions)*... Let him complete.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : I expressed unequivocally that we share the concern that the hon. member had expressed. As far as discussing this issue and the Government's obligation to provide a satisfactory explanation to the observations that the Comptroller and Auditor General has made are concerned, of course, it is our obligation. Of course, we are obliged to provide it to you. In a couple of hours we are going to discuss precisely this issue and related issues. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL (Bihar): No, no.... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री मूलचन्द मीणा (राजस्थान) : आप तो जिम्मेदार हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL B ASU : We have seen how you are killing the inquiry.... *(Interruptions)*... चर्चा क्या होगी इस पर ? आपको रक्षा मंत्री को हटाना चाहिए जिनके समय में यह सब हुआ है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : It is not the way. Sir.... *(Interruptions)*... It is not possible for me... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete, Please.... *(Interruptions)*... Let him complete. Please ...*(Interruptions)*... Let the Leader of the House complete.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, in any event, you have directed me to respond. You have suspended, in effect, the Question Hour by permitting an

hon. Member to raise his concerns and, thereafter, you have directed that I should respond to what he has stated. I should, in ordinary circumstances, expect that I have the courtesy of the House to listen to what I say. We share the concern. We are ready to discuss this issue and any other issue. ... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, let him complete.

SHRI J ASWANT SINGH: We are ready to discuss this issue or any other issue connected with the defence procurement. We are, indeed, going to have a discussions, in tuTKind-a-half hours or three hours from now. on this very issue. *(Interruptions)*.... It is related to defence procurement. ... *(Interruptions)*... In addition to that if the hon. Members say, if everybody says, that we want a separate discussion on the CAG Report I shall take it up with the Cabinet and, certainly, we can have a discussion on that. Why not Sir ? The Government is not shy of discussing any issue in this regard. It is a matter of sufficient concern to the Government also. Therefore, to pass judgements on what we are doing and not doing, to attribute motives and to suspend half-an-hour of the Question Hour, which is the right one for the Opposition to do. I don't understand. All that was required to do was this. There was the CAG Report: part of that Report had appeared in certain section of the Press. "Is the Government ready to discuss it?" Yes, the Government is ready to discuss it. A discussion is going to take place.... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: If you don't feel guilty, we feel guilty. *(Interruptions)*... The whole Parliament should feel guilty. *(Interruptions)*....This is what happened to the coffins of the martyrs. ... *(Interruptions)*...Should n't you feel guilty? ...*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I don't see this. ...*(Interruptions)*.... I don't think*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: If the Leader of the House feels shy.....*(Interruptions)*... I say, as a Parliamentarian, we feel guilty before those martyrs. ... *(Interruptions)*... Dont 's you have the courage to say that?... *(Interruptions)*... Do you have the courage to say this? *(Interruptions)*... Shouldn't you apologise to these martyrs? What are we going to discuss? ... *(Interruptions)*. What has happened to you after going there? What would you have done if you had been here?...*(Interruptions)*... What-are you going to say to the martyrs? *(Interruptions)*.... आप ऐसा करेंगे और हम चुपचाप बैठे रहेंगे ? ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम तैयार हैं। गौतम साहब पूछ रहे थे कि कैसे लीक हुई। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the House must be allowed to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the House must be allowed to complete his speech.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I have responded to them. Sir, what is it that you want from me because you have directed me to respond? ...*(Interruptions)*...
MR. CHAIRMAN: They have given a notice. I wanted the Government to respond to that so that some method can be found out as to how to go about it ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I have responded. I am ready for a discussion. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: This response is nothing. ...*(Interruptions)*...
Who is accountable? What is the Government going to do? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Are we going to have a full discussion?
... *(Interruptions)*. ...Sir, are we going to have a full discussion on this issue?
Sir, are you permitting a full discussion on this issue ? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, are you permitting a full discussion on this issue? This is what I want to know. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I got a notice. He has mentioned something to which you have responded. Now, both the ruling party and the Opposition should decide how to discuss it. I have nothing to do in that.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, you directed me to *(Interruptions)*...
SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: Sir, until and unless the report is placed on the Table of the House, we cannot discuss this issue. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : छुट्टी करो ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री जीवन राय : नहीं तो हटो, छुट्टी करो, सरकार अपनी छुट्टी करे ।
...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: The Government is ready to discuss it.
(Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the Leader of the House speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: The Government is ready to discuss this issue, the connected issue and as to when the C&AG report was presented to

The Government. If the House wants that the report be placed on the Table of the House, that too. as an exception. I can appeal to my Cabinet colleague to be done. The Government is not shy of discussing any issue. There is a discussion on Defence procurement that is going to take place in this House. Sir. what is it that you want me to do? I have responded to every aspect that they wanted. The hon. Members have to put certain questions. We can proceed with Question Hour. Thereafter, in two-and-a-half hours or so. there is a discussion on this issue. These issues can be raised. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: Sir. in the light of the report of the C & AG ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: What is this? Sir. are **you** permitting a discussion? *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: ...Now that the C&AG has held this Government responsible for making money on coffins, there can be no discussion on the subject. ...*(Interruptions)*. ..This is the finding of the C & AG. There cannot be any discussion on it. Either you debunk the C&AG and say. "We do not accept what the C&AG has said" or having accepted it. take the moral responsibility and ask your Minister to resign. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir. we know as to what is the outcome of discussions in this House ...*(Interruptions)*... We want to make this point very clear. We know as to what has been the fate of discussions in this House. *(Interruptions)*.

श्री विक्रम वर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश) : जब रिपोर्ट ली होगी तब ही तो डिसकसन होगा ।
...*(व्यवधान)*... सभापति महोदय, लीडर ऑफ हाऊस खड़े हैं । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : Sir. you had called me to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is prepared for a discussion. Do you want a discussion? ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the Opposition wants to say something....*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH):
Mr. Chairman. Sir. in the last couple of days, day after day. disturbing news have been appearing in a responsible newspaper about gross irregularities in defence purchases. But this morning's news. where money was made even in the purchase

of coffins meant for the Kargil martyrs, is something which has shocked : the nation and this. I think. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MAHESH CHANDRA SHARMA (Rajsthan): He is just repeating ...*(Interruptions)*...

सर आपने इस मुद्दे पर रेसपांस देने के लिए कहा ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : आप उस पर डिसकशन ले लीजिएगा । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

डा. महेश चन्द्र शर्मा : इस मुद्दे पर आपने रेसपांस देने के लिए कहा है । ...*(व्यवधान)*...सर, हम कभी खड़े नहीं होते हैं । ...*(व्यवधान)*... क्वेश्चन ऑवर होना चाहिए । ...*(व्यवधान)*... आपने कहा मुद्दा होगा, रेसपांस होगा । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I can't refuse the Leader of the Opposition ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजीशन आपकी परमीशन से बोल रहे हैं । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री अनन्तराय देवशंकर दवे (गुजरात) : लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजीशन जो बोलेंगे, उसको हम सुनेंगे । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAIVIRUMBI (Tamil Nadu): They interrupted the Leader of the House when he was responding. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री राजू परमार : लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजीशन चेयरमैन साहब की अनुमति से बोल रहे हैं । ...*(व्यवधान)*... उन्हें चेयरमैन साहब ने अलाऊ किया है । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, लीडर आफ दि अपोजीशन आपकी अनुमति से बोल रहे हैं, फिर भी व्यवधान किया जा रहा है । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री विक्रम वर्मा : नेता सदन ने फुल फ्लेस डिसकसन के लिए कह तो दिया है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let the Leader of the Opposition say something ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : सर, 40 मिनट का समय गुजर चुका है । हम भी कुछ कहना चाहते हैं । ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बहस चाहते हैं तो नोटिस दीजिए तभी तो इस पर बहस हो सकती है । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

डा. महेश चन्द्र शर्मा : सभापति जी, सदस्यों ने सवाल पूछे हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**... सदस्यों ने सवाल पूछे हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**... सदस्यों के सवाल पूछने के अवसर को रोका नहीं जाना चाहिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: When the Leader of the House was speaking, they interrupted**(Interruptions)**. He was also allowed by the Chairnan.... **(Interruptions)**...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, मैं आपका ध्यान ध्यान 23 जुलाई, 1985 की प्रोसीडिंग की तरफ आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition **(Interruptions)**...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: They are challenging your ruling**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : महोदय, 23 जुलाई, 1985 को तत्कालीन सभापति महोदय ने **(व्यवधान)** ... आज्ञा प्रदान की थी । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : कुछ नहीं, कुछ नहीं । **(व्यवधान)** ... ठीक है । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री राजू परमार : सर, ये आपकी बात को भी नहीं मान रहे हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, लीडर आफ दि अपोजीशन आपकी परमीशन से बोल रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री संजय निरुपम (महाराष्ट्र) : सभापति महोदय, हमें बताया जाए कि क्या प्रश्न-काल स्थगित हो चुका है ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: After the Leader of the Opposition speaks, we will have Question No. 301 ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: We want to make one point clear...**(Interruptions)**... Just now the Leader of the House responded ...**(Interruptions)** Sir. he had asked for a discussion earlier. ...**(Interruptions)**... We refused to have a discussion. ...**(Interruptions)**... We had adjournments ... **(Interruptions)**... and the Government had instituted an inquiry under a judge.

...(Interruptions)... Now, that commission had come to a conclusion, but the Minister had been re-inducted. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री राजनाथ सिंह 'सूर्य' : माननीय अर्जुन सिंह जी ने प्रश्न उठाया था ...(व्यवधान)... नेता सदन को आपने बुलाया ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, yes. But the Leader of the Opposition
... (Interruptions)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Sir, you had promised to take up the Question Hour. Why are you not allowing that? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN. Let us understand that. We have to respect the Leader of the Opposition...(Interruptions) And then, Question No. 301. ...(Interruptions)... After the Leader of the Opposition, Question No. 301. ... (Interruptions)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR : Sir, there was no question after the Leader of the House had spoken. ...(Interruptions)... He can discuss it and he can raise the matter later, but. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : I have told you.... (Interruptions)... In the meanwhile ... (Interruptions)... He had not risen; after him, he had risen. The Leader of the Opposition has certain respectability and position. So, I am allowing him. After that, Question No. 301. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI S ATISH PRADH AN (Maharashtra): Sir, your original order was different.... (Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति : आप अपनी बात कहिये ।

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH : Mr. Chairman, Sir, the issue is of such importance that it is a fit subject in which all Members of the House, who want to speak, should be given a chance to speak. But it is not enough to end this subject by expression of views. I think it is important that the Government must own its responsibility for having presided over this sordid state of affairs, that having played with the lives of our soldiers, even in death, we do not show them dignity. I think this is a fit subject in which the Minister concerned should own up this responsibility and resign..... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 301.

SHRIMATI JAYAPRADA NAHATA (Andhra Pradesh): Question No. 301.... (Interruptions)...