

mentary Affairs will take note of this.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): But what is the reaction of the Government?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Government will come. That is what I have said.

आप बोलें हिन्दी में बोल दूँ तो मुझे रिएक्शन का हिन्दी नहीं मालूम ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : (बिहार) उपसभापति महोदय, एक बात और मैं आपसे कहना चाहता हूँ । यह तिब्बतन स्टूडेंट्स कांग्रेस ने कहा है कि आर्म्स स्ट्रगल की भी बात होगी । तो हम अपने देश का इस्तेमाल इस बात के लिए नहीं करने देंगे, यह गवर्नमेंट गारण्टी करें । हमारे देश की जमीन से यही स्टेटमेंट दिया जाता है कि चीन की सरकार के खिलाफ हथियारबंद लड़ाई कर रहे हैं, तिब्बत स्टूडेंट्स कांग्रेस ने कहा है, पता नहीं आपकी कांग्रेस से क्या रिश्ता है मुझे नहीं मालूम, लेकिन ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सतपाल मित्तल (नाम निर्देशित) : अभी तो आप हमारा रिश्ता अमेरिकन कांग्रेस से भी निकालेंगे । जिसके पहले कांग्रेस का नाम लग जाएगा, उसका हमारे साथ रिश्ता जोड़ दो । ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : हम नहीं जोड़ रहे हैं । हमने कहा है कि आपको सरकार को ऐलान करना चाहिए कि हमारे देश का इस्तेमाल, हमारी जमीन का इस्तेमाल इसके लिए नहीं है ।

Refusal to record Chief Minister's independence day message by Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, I thank you for giving me

the permission to raise an important matter. I would like to bring to the notice of this august House the arbitrary and high-handed action...

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL (Gujarat): High-handed action!

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: ...of the Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad in refusing... Please I heard every one patiently. Please listen to me. The Minister is here. He will reply. Don't disturb me.

The Doordarshan Kendra, Hyderabad, refused to record the Independence Day eve message of the Chief Minister to the people of the State unless he deleted....

SHRI KAPIL VERMA (Uttar Pradesh): You are trying to incite the army.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, should I continue or should I stop? Why don't you control them? We listened to them all patiently.

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL: You are doing it all the time.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We did not disturb them... Every thing is politics. What is politics?

The Doordarshan Kendra refused to record the message unless the Chief Minister agreed to delete certain portions of his speech..... Please let me complete. I am not yielding. Madam, I would like to

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): I want to know whether he wanted the telecast as the Chief Minister or...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I said as Chief Minister. If you are confused in your mind, I cannot help it. Madam, I would like to refer to two, three portions which have been objected to. The House can decide whether they are really objectionable or not. In one portion—

—I am giving an English translation of the Chief Minister's Telugu speech —it says:

"The teeming millions had participated in the freedom struggle because of the promise given by their leaders that *Swarajya* would give them *Surajya*. What has freedom given to the poor? Food? No. Shelter? No. Clothes? No. The people are starving for these three basic necessities, and half the population remains below the poverty line. Were the sacrifices of the leaders meant for this? Were their echoed voices of 'Freedom is our birthright' and..."

...(Interruptions)...

THAKUR JAGATPAL SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): How can the Chief Minister broadcast against the nation?... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please allow him to read out what he wants to read... (Interruptions)... Let him read out, please.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TEXTILES (KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE): He cannot go on the TV like this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him read out what he wants to. How can you object to somebody reading out?... (Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): You please allow these people also to reply.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, I will permit you to reply.

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL: How can you allow him to read? No, he cannot read out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister of I and B is here. He will answer. You please wait.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT): Madam Deputy Chairman....

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let me complete, Bhagatji.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam, I would tell him, what he should read is a specific portion, one paragraph. Let him do that. He cannot read the whole speech here. Let him tell what the objection is... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why these interruptions? Let me complete. The House wants it. After I complete, you can reply.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear Bhagatji. One minute. Just let me hear what he want to say.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let me complete. How can he reply without hearing me? This is not fair. Let me complete what I want to say and then let him reply. In the case of the Home Minister you said that and you allowed him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not replying, please. Just a minute. Please sit down... (Interruptions)...

SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH (Gujarat): No, he cannot read... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): No, he cannot read out the whole speech. Madam... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't really know whether he is reading out the whole speech or not. I want to know what Bhagatji want to say.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I am referring to the objected portions only.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: He is reading out the whole speech.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Don't interrupt me. He is interrupting me, Madam.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam Deputy Chairman... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not giving a reply. He wants to say something.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He has the right to reply, but first let me complete my submission. Why is he impatient? Let him hear me... (Interruptions)...

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam, hear me, please.

उपसभापति : अगर आप लोग एक मिनट सकून से बैठेंगे तो बात समझ में आएगी । वह कह रहे हैं कि पूरी स्पीच मत पाढ़िए, जिस पोर्शन पर आब्जेक्शन है, उसी को पढ़िए ।

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: That is what I am doing.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam, I want to say, (1) I am willing to make a statement, if you direct me; in the House in the afternoon on this matter.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: That you can do later, but let me complete my submission first.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Secondly, he cannot read the whole speech here. It is wrong if he says that the Chief Minister was not allowed. The telecast was permitted... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let one person speak at a time so that I can hear.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): I request Mr. Bhagat not to indulge in filibuster Mr. Upendra is only reading the portions objected to.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: No filibuster. He can't read the whole speech here.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: No, not the whole speech. I am referring only to the objected portions—four objected portions... (Interruptions)... I continue. Madam, I am reading only the objected portions. Kindly listen.

"Were their sacrifices meant for this? Were their echoed voices of 'Freedom is our birthright' and the tilting song of Vande Mataram, meant for this? And the answer is no, no, no."

He also says:

"This situation prevails because all the fruits of development and progress in the past years had been grabbed by politicians, middlemen, brokers and the like, while the common man remains..." (Interruptions)

The Prime Minister himself referred to "power-brokers." There is nothing new in that.

".....while the common man remains with torn clothes and half a square meal."

Another portion:

"Even after 42 years of freedom, the country has to depend upon foreign suppliers for its military hardware."

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Doordarshan has rightly objected to it. You cannot say that. (Interruptions) The statement of the Chief Minister

* Not recorded.

cannot be broadcast by Doordarshan. You cannot do that. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH: That should be expunged.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: This portion pinches them the most, I know that. Then,

"There was a time when the entire science and technology was made available by India to the outside world. But today we have become dependent on them. We have to depend on other countries for all our requirements."
 (Interruptions)

I am concluding, Madam. The last portion I am reading.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : मैं एक क्लेरिफिकेशन चाहता हूँ...

उपसभापित : क्या क्लेरिफिकेशन चाहते हैं आप। (व्यवधान)

Just a minute. One persons at a time.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): His speech against the army cannot go on record, Madam.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : मैं यह चाहता हूँ कि स्पेशल सेशन में क्या हम ऐसी चीज पढ़ सकते हैं जो कि एन्टी नेशनल हो या हमारी मिलिटरी को डिमारेलाइज करने वाली हो ? इसकी मैं क्लेरिफिकेशन चाहता हूँ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Let me give the ruling. He is reading a portion which his Chief Minister wanted to say. I feel, as a citizen of this country that we should not say anything which will demoralise our army and our jawans.

We have great respect and honour for them. Therefore, that will not go on record.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, you expunge it.

SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH: Madam, this thing should not go on record.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, I think you should know that once I give my ruling, it means it is expunged. Of course, we cannot say anything, we cannot demoralise our jawans who have laid down their lives for our country.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, demoralisation comes from the corrupt practices of this Government, not from the Chief Minister's speech (Interruptions)

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : हजारों एकड़ जमीन नाजायज रूप से हड़पने वाला, हजारों एकड़ जमीन ग्रैब करने वाला, बड़ा अवस्था में, 70 साल की अवस्था में मेनका के साथ नंगा नाच करने वाला इस प्रकार की अराष्ट्रीय बातें करता है उसे शर्म आनी चाहिए... (व्यवधान)... ऐसी चीजों को जो राष्ट्र विरुद्धी हों, देश की मेना का मनोबल तोड़ने वाली हों, जो स्वयं भ्रष्टाचारी हो और भ्रष्टाचार को रोकने की बात करता हो, इस तरह की बातें 15 अगस्त यानी स्वतंत्रता दिवस पर ऐसी बातें कहें यह देश के लिए शर्मनाक बात है और सरकार को कड़ाई के साथ इसको रोकना चाहिए। (व्यवधान)

1.00 P.M.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, I am concluding. (Interruptions) The last portion objected to is:

"Only when this situation is reversed and freedom made meaningful to the poor and the down-trodden, leaders like Bal Gangadhar Tilak, Feroz Shah Mehta, Netaji

[Shri Parvathaneni Upendra]

Subhash Chandra Bose, Ranade, Gokhale, Chitaranjan Das, Lajpatrai, Mahatma Gandhi and Jawaharlal Nehru, who sacrificed for freedom, would have some peace in their graves. It was for this change that the Telugu Desam Government is striving day in and day out."

They wanted to delete the mention of Telugu Desam Government also. This is not the first instance. The Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu has boycotted Doordarshan. The Chief Minister of West Bengal has also boycotted Doordarshan because he made an appeal to the people to subscribe to the National Savings Certificates to help in the Bakreshwar Thermal Power Plan and Doordarshan refused to telecast that appeal of the Chief Minister. They refused even to telecast an advertisement of the State Government on Doordarshan. I would like to ask: is India the Jagirdari of Rajiv Gandhi and is Doordarshan the private property of this Government which can use and misuse this medium as it likes? This point has to be answered. There is a limit to the misuse of this media also. It is not their Jagirdari. We will not tolerate this kind of an insult to the elected Chief Ministers. It is an insult to the people who elected the Chief Ministers. It is not only an insult to the Chief Minister, but is also an insult to the people who elected the Government and gave it a mandate. We cannot tolerate this type of a situation. (Interruptions) Madam, I want to conclude by saying that the Minister for Information and Broadcasting instead of pulling up the Doordarshan Director, justified his action and he is saying that he will not allow the Chief Minister to misuse Doordarshan. This shows the arrogance of the Information and Broadcasting Minister. He should have pulled up the Doordarshan Director and sorted

out the matter. Instead he justified it without knowing full facts. I take strong exception to this. (Interruptions)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Mr. Rama Rao is staging a drama in this country and is dancing with the film-star, Meenakshi Sheshadri in the form of Vishwamitra. His remarks mentioned in the Special Mention should be expunged. He is making Andhra Pradesh his Jagir. He is playing drama there. He is charging our Government. It is the most unfair and undemocratic remark against Rajiv Gandhi. (Interruptions).

श्री धर्मपाल (जम्मू और कश्मीर)
 मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे इफारमेशन एण्ड ब्राडकास्टिंग मिनिस्टर ने बिल्कुल दुरुस्त काम किया है यह जो हमारे जवानों को डिमोरेलाइज करने की बात करते हैं, यह ठीक नहीं है...
 (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY:
 It is not the first time that we are...
 (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): What happened?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY:
 Madam Deputy Chairman, these are..

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Madam, I am on a point of order. Mr. Upendra has made a special mention. If we start a debate on each and every aspect, as we are debating now, then, we will be wasting the time of the House. I would like to have your ruling on this matter... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY:
 Madam Deputy Chairman,... (Interruptions)... Please listen to me. Why don't you keep quiet for some time at least? Madam, radio and television are the property of the nation. They do not belong to any particular party. They belong to the entire country and

the entire people... (Interruptions)... I think, Mr. Bhagat is more competent than you are... (Interruptions)... Mr. H. K. L. Bhagat is more competent than you. He will reply to me. Please be patient. Radio and television are very important instruments in the hands of the Government now. Just now, Mr. Upendra has raised the issue of Rama Rao's speech, a portion of his speech which was objected to by All India Radio and Doordarshan at Hyderabad. This is not the first time, Madam, we have come across stifling of the speeches of the Opposition leaders, Opposition Chief Ministers. It was done in the past. Mr. Bhagat is aware of those instances when such objections were taken by the radio and television at the local level. Madam, the Opposition and the people of this country are subjected, day in and day out, to hear Rajiv Gandhi in the beginning and in the end... (Interruptions)...

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam, I just want to know whether a debate has been started... (Interruptions)... Radio and television are doing their duty to the country. If they want to denigrate the Army and demoralise them, it cannot be allowed... (Interruptions)... The Opposition Chief Ministers are getting justice. They are being covered... (Interruptions)... You yourself made these observations. Are you allowing this debate?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The Prime Minister is attacking the Opposition and the Opposition leaders on the radio and television. I hope Radio and Doordarshan are not your personal property, Mr. Bhagat.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: We are doing our job for the nation. You are denigrating and weakening the Armed Forces. You are doing a dis-service to the nation.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is not the property of the Prime Minister also, let me tell you that.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Don't you feel ashamed of the paragraphs? I never expected this from Mr. Gurupadaswamy. From Upendra I can understand.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The Prime Minister is attacking the Opposition leaders day in and day out and using all abuses.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: The people of India will decide who is their leader. They will teach you a lesson at appropriate time as they have done in the past. You don't worry. In the coming elections, we will see. You are now on Panipat. You are now on Kurukshetra. You are on the verge of defeat. Don't worry.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let me tell you... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Please sit down.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What wrong I have committed here?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have not done anything right or wrong. I am not saying that.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What wrong I have committed?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am saying something else which you do not know. The Chairman only allowed Mr. Parvathaneni Upendra to speak on it. (Interruptions)... No, no. There is no point. Your Member is a witness to it. He did not give permission to everybody. Mr. B. Satyanarayan Reddy, you are a witness to it. Just a minute. You withdrew your name and said, let Mr. Upendra speak. Correct? That is over now.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, I will just finish... (Interruption)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, previously on three occasions, there was a special mention on Babri Masjid-Ram Janambhoomi, a special mention on 'Sati'. Today, there is a special mention on Bodo. One from each side was allowed to speak... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, you cannot equate the killing of 200 people... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Even on Babri Masjid issue... (Interruption)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Is misuse of radio and television not an important issue? (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Chair decide. Please sit down. He is asking me and not you. Please take your seat.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If you consider that Mr. N. T. Rama Rao having uttered certain words or having... (Interruptions)... has sought to demoralise the army... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The Members opposite take objection when I mention the name of Rajiv Gandhi. Can they insult Mr. N. T. Rama Rao, the Chief Minister of a State? It is not correct. It is not proper.

डाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : राजीव गांधी से
एन.टी. रामाराव का क्या मुकदमा ...
(व्यवधान)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I only say that radio and television are the instruments of the nation. They are not the property of any party or the property of the Government (Interruptions)...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Don't give irresponsible statement there.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Don't equate the Prime Minister with the nation. The Prime Minister is not the nation. He is only a representative of the nation. We are all representatives. ... (Interruptions)...

Madam, we have demanded a discussion on radio and television. (Interruption)... and it was conceded. We have given a notice. It is in my name. We are prepared for a full discussion on this. Let there be a thorough discussion. (Interruptions)... I only say that the attitude of the Government in respect of radio and television... (Interruptions)... The speech of Mr. N. T. Rama Rao... (Interruption)... The attitude of the Government is highly objectionable, one-sided and partisan. It is a democratic country. It is not a dictatorship. You cannot impose your will on us. It is a democratic State. We are a free country and radio and television belong to the entire nation and not to you. Therefore, I say, what you have been doing in respect of radio and television is simply objectionable and partisan and you have misused radio and television for partisan purposes. It should stop.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. The Chairman did not allow everybody. (Interruptions). I won't allow everybody.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, there is a confusion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have Constitution Amendments. Three Bills are there to pass. There is no chance. (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to make a clarification. There has been a breach of the Constitution. There was one special mention paper submitted by Mr. Upendra.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: No.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: No. Sorry. There was one special mention paper submitted by Mr. Satyanarayan Reddy alone. And then there was a joint special mention paper signed by the leaders of all parliamentary parties and groups. (Interruptions). Ma-

dam, just listen for a second. Bear with me for a second. As I could understand from Mr. Bhagat's statement and our statement, the issue is very important. The issue is very important to the extent that in a part of the speech of a Chief Minister, there has been an attempt to demoralise the army, as I could understand from Mr. Bhagat's statement. So it was sought to be censored or cut. Otherwise, he was not allowed to speak. But it is a very serious matter. It is the right of this House, the Council of States. This is the Council of States as you had argued in connection with certain other special mentions. If there is really an attempt to demoralise the army, then where else can it be raised except in the Council of States? Madam, from that point of view, we also wanted to raise this issue. We wanted to take part in this discussion or make a mention. Earlier also you had allowed. You had allowed on such important cases, important issues, that there should be a mention. And the Minister is himself present here. He can reply. The Minister need not intervene at every sentence. Like a spring, he should not spring up and intervene. He will have the right to reply. He has already given a reply through the television, through the radio and through newspapers today.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is it that you want to say? You are making a speech.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have sought your permission. You have allowed me to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I did not give you permission to speak on the subject.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have submitted in writing to make a special mention. (Interruptions) Madam, it is a very important issue. Madam, I will rather agree with you that there should not be any attempt to

demoralise the jawans of our country who are defending the freedom of our country. But at the same time, I have a right to debate, as a citizen, whether a remark really intends to demoralise the army or not. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. Mr. Ramachandran, you are a new Member. You do not know. Please take your seat. First learn how to behave in the House.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, therefore, ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dipen Ghosh, I have heard you. Please sit down. I will give my ruling. You please sit down.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, let me complete.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let him complete.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can read your mind. You have said long enough. I have followed what you mean.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to know whether you are going to allow me also to make a mention.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. I want to say one thing. There is no provision in a special mention form to sign like that. So it was technically wrong. That was a wrong special mention which you had given. (Interruptions). Just a minute. Please have patience. I have been listening to you for two and a half hours. That is why, when Mr. Reddy gave his special mention, the Chairman allowed him only, not everybody. But the matter is serious. Some people from the Congress might also like to speak. I do not know. I will allow them too.

—discussion not concl'd.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let them speak. I do not mind. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Madam, give me half a minute. I am entitled to half a minute. You have allowed them. Allow me half a minute. Madam, you have allowed them. Please allow me half a minute. Madam, as one who has headed the Information and Broadcasting Ministry, I want to make one thing absolutely clear. There are certain norms laid down as to what should be spoken on the television and the radio. I want to put it to them: If politicians are going to wash their dirty linen on the television...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What is the Prime Minister doing everyday on the TV?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE... Under the garb of giving an Independence Day message, politicians are not allowed to do that. This is not the medium for that. This is electronic media. How would they like if we were to give an Independence Day statement that there are certain very opportunistic and unscrupulous and unprincipled leaders who have emerged in the country who are misleading the State and how would they like if that happened to be about N. T. Rama Rao?...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): It is a monopoly of the Prime Minister.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: This kind of a statement is total subversion of our Constitution, our national interests and Doordarshan would lose all its...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What are the norms? Let us first know that norms.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: If you do not know the norms, here are the norms. Nobody will be allowed under the garb of making a political speech to make a malicious statement which is subversion of the Constitution, which is subversion of the national interests, and, therefore, Mr. Bhagat is absolutely right if his Ministry and the Doordarshan have just thrown this kind of a statement into the waste paper basket. (*Interruptions*)

The DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, I have already identified Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan to speak. Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam,...

श्री शंकर सिंह बाघेला (गुजरात):
मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।...
(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: आपका किस पर प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है?

श्री शंकर सिंह बाघेला: दिनांक 14 16 और 18 तीन दिन के लिए हाउस बंद है मेरा मुझे पत्र मिला और आप मेरे पास लिस्ट ऑफ बिजनेस की सूची है। मैं अपना बहुत कीमती समय खराब करके यहां हाउस ब्रेक करने आया हूं। तीन हफ्तों में मैं आप चेयरमैन के नीचे यह हाउस ब्रेकिंग से चल रहा है लोक सभा का खीरो आवर और राज्य सभा हाउस ऑफ फ्लोर का यह व्यवहार कोई फर्क नहीं है और आपके चेयरमैन के नीचे इस हाउस में व्यवस्था नहीं बन पा रही है यह बहुत खेद की बात है।... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not challenging the Chair.

श्री शंकर सिंह वाघेला : जिस ठग से मंत्री को स्पेशल मेशन... (व्यवधान) आप स्पेशल रेज करत है तो मिनिस्टर जवाब देता है लेकिन हमारे स्पेशल मेशन के 6-6 महीने तक जवाब नहीं मिलते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : अब आप बैठ जाइये, मैं जवाब देती हूँ। ... (व्यवधान) प्लीज सिट डाउन, मैं आपको जवाब देती हूँ।

श्री शंकर सिंह वाघेला : ओन्ली वन मिनट... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आपका प्वायंट आफ आर्डर हो गया। आप बैठ जाइये। I will give you my version. I think two days ago you were not in the House.

आप हाउस में नहीं थे। मैंने मना किया था कि मिनिस्टर साहब जवाब नहीं देंगे, इस तरफ से सवाल आया कि मिनिस्टर साहब जवाब दें। आपने कहा जब इधर से सवाल आता है तो मिनिस्टर साहब जवाब देते हैं, यह आप चेयर के ऊपर आरोप लगा रहे हैं। आप लोग कंसा बिहेव करते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SHANKER SINGH VAGHELA: I am the sufferer on account of this.

"THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing the Minister to say a word on this issue.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I just want to ask the Minister of Information and Broadcasting about two parts of what Mr. Upendra mentioned just now. I want to ask whether that part is correct where he says "obsolete...." — I do not want to repeat what he said in his statement— "...that was calculated to completely demoralise the armed forces", which was made without any basis because there was a senior Member, Mr. Jaswant Singh,

who is a colleague in this House, who said that these are good guns..... (Interruptions) The other part about which I want a clarification from the honourable Minister of Information and Broadcasting is in an Independence Day message when a Chief Minister allegedly makes an address to the nation as Chief Minister, whether he is allowed to say 'Jai Telugu Desam'. Does that Chief Minister have in mind a separate Telugu State? Does he want a 'Jai Telugu Desam'? What does he mean by it? Is this kind of a thing allowed?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: This is not the first time. Even in the Chief Ministers' Conference he said it and your Prime Minister was present.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: How can he say "Jai Telugu Desam"? ... (Interruptions)... How can he say that? ... (Interruptions)... The Minister has done the right thing and he must be congratulated ... (Interruptions)... The Minister must be congratulated for that ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: For the last several years he has been saying that, in official conferences and in other formal meetings. There was no objection raised then... (Interruptions)...

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: This is nothing but separatism ... (Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH) Madam Deputy Chairman, under the Constitution of India ... (Interruptions)... Madam Deputy Chairman, under the Constitution of India, the name of the province is Andhra Pradesh. Therefore, it is Andhra Pradesh and if it is Telugu Desam, it is a political party and it is not the State ... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I have not yet finished ... (Interruptions) ...

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA (Andhra Pradesh): This has been done several times and then they did not raise any objection, Madam ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam: I have not yet finished and I have got two sentences more ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, India also has got two names, that is, India, that is, Bharat. So, Telugu Desam also has got two names, Andhra Pradesh and Telugu Desam ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I have not yet finished. I want to ask my clarifications. ... (Interruptions) ...

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : महोदया मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है कि अभी उधर से प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर उठाया गया था । अब देखिए शोर कौन मचा रह है कौन नहीं बोलने दे रहा है ? ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I want to seek a clarification. ... (Interruptions) ... Madam, Mr. Upendra was saying that AIR and Doordarshan are not the personal property of anyone. I want to remind them of one thing and I want to take them back to the year 1977 Shri Shrikant Verma made a speech in Parliament, wherein he had said that sixty-two lakh words had been used to defame Mrs. Gandhi ... (Interruptions) ... and everybody knows how the Shah Commission matter was telecast on the TV. What have they got to say about the TV and AIR of that time? ... (Interruption) ... Madam, I have not yet finished. I have only two sentences more

... (Interruptions) ... When the Janata Government brought forward a Bill that was supposed to give autonomy to AIR and Doordarshan, they did not get it passed and they dropped it. Even Advaniji could not reply when Mr. Shrikant Verma made that speech in Parliament. He could not say anything ... (Interruptions) ... In fact, he is on record to say that there was no move ... (Interruptions) ... They are talking about the misuse of Government official media. In Tamil Nadu, the DMK Government has issued an order wherein it is said that "The Hundred Days of the DMK Rule" ... (Interruptions) ... Why are you frightened ... (Interruptions) ... Why are you so much frightened ... (Interruptions) ... Madam, in Tamil Nadu, they have an allergy if a woman speaks either in Parliament or in the Legislature ... (Interruptions) ... Madam, the DMK issued a Government order saying that "The Hundred Days of the DMK Rule" has to be shown in every cinema theatre; otherwise they cannot screen films. Is not this misuse of official media? ... (Interruptions) ... Then, what about the official organ, "The Tamil Arasu"? On every page the Chief Minister's picture is grossly printed and nothing else is published there. ... (Interruptions) ... What about the magazine "Telugu Samacharam" wherein nothing else appears and in which case the Andhra Pradesh Government is using reams and reams of paper yards and yards of paper, to boost the image of the Chief Minister only which is then thrown away as Wastepaper? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: How many hundreds of crores are spent to boost the image of Rajiv Gandhi? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, these are the people who talk here of autonomy and about the misuse of the official media. I want to know what the norms are for telecasting anything. Can you allow an Independence Day Message

to be used to demoralise the armed forces, our jawans?... (Interruptions) ...Can you allow an Independence Day speech to demoralise the armed forces? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We can expose your corruption and your pay-offs and your kickbacks ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Can you allow an Independence Day message to be misused by using words that glorify one political party? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, I have a submission to make. (Interruptions) In the List of Business we have listed Constitutional (Amendment) Bills, Sixty-third, Sixty-fourth and Sixty-fifth... (Interruptions) My submission is this. Instead of putting the Sixty-third first and then Sixty-fourth and Sixty-fifth, please start with the Sixty-fourth and Sixty-fifth after lunch. That is my only submission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That we will take up only after lunch. Now, we have had enough discussion on this. So I adjourn the House for lunch for one hour.

The House then adjourned for lunch at thirty-one minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-one minutes past two of the clock. The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

CONSTITUTION (SIXTY-FOURTH AMENDMENT) BILL, 1989

&

CONSTITUTION (SIXTY-FIFTH AMENDMENT) BILL, 1989

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we take up the Constitution (Sixty-Fourth Amendment) Bill, 1989, and the Constitution (Sixty-fifth Amendment) Bill, 1989.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI RAJIV GANDHI): Madam Deputy Chairman, with your kind permission, I rise to move:

That the Bill further to amend the Constitution of India—the Constitu-

tion (Sixty-fourth Amendment) Bill, 1989—as passed by the Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.

I further move:

That the Bill further to amend the Constitution of India—the Constitution (Sixty-fifth Amendment) Bill, 1989—as passed by the Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.

My colleagues, Shri Bhajan Lal, the Minister of Agriculture, and Smt. Mohsina Kidwai, the Minister of Urban Development, who are Ministers in charge of the subject matter in the Bills will explain the provisions of the Bills. I will reply to the debate.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhajan Lal.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): When is the TV debate?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You talk of the Rajya Sabha debate first.

कृषि मंत्री (श्री भजन लाल) : उपसभापति महोदया, हमारे देश के प्रधान मंत्री जी ने अभी आपके सामने पंचायती राज बिल प्रस्तुत किया है। यह बिल एक क्रांतिकारी और ऐतिहासिक बिल है।

आप जानती हैं कि राष्ट्रपिता महात्मा गांधी जी ने यह कहा था कि सही मायनों में प्रजातंत्र, सही मायनों में स्वराज तभी होगा जब गांवों में बसने वाले भाइयों को हम शक्ति देंगे और इसी बात को लेकर पण्डित जवाहर लाल जी ने उस स्वप्न को साकार करने की कोशिश की और पण्डित जी ने पंचायती राज की स्थापना की। पण्डित जवाहर लाल जी चाहते थे कि देश में पंचायतों को पूरा अधिकार दिया जाए और उनके द्वारा लोगों की हालत को बेहतर बनाया जाए। लोगों की समस्याओं का समाधान किया जाए और आर्थिक और सामाजिक दोनों ही न्याय उनको दिए जाएं।