

श्री रऊफ बलीउल्लाह (गुजरात) :  
कालिंग अटेंशन अगर वे मूव नहीं करते तो  
हम मूव करेंगे !

... (अवधान) ....

श्री हर्षदेव सिंह हंसपाल (पंजाब) :  
सरीसों के लिये चावल के वितरण के बारे  
में ये बात नहीं करना चाहते ।

.... (अवधान) . . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Nothing will go on record. (*Inter-  
ruptions*) You have had enough. You  
please go back to your seats.  
(*Interruptions*) You don't want your  
people to have rice ? Please go back to  
your seats. (*Interruptions*) Please sit  
down. If the Opposition is not interested  
in the Calling Attention, we will go  
ahead with the next Business.  
(*Interruptions*) We have had enough. If  
you do not want the Calling Attention  
Motion to be taken up, we shall take Up  
the next Business. (*Interruptions*) If the  
Labour Minister is ready, we can go  
ahead with this Bill. (*Interruptions*) If  
you have all finished your shouting, I  
would request all of you to go back to  
your seats. (*Interruptions*)

Now the House will adjourn for  
lunch till 2.30 P.M.

The House then adjourned  
for lunch at thirty-one minutes  
past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch  
at thirty minutes past two of the clock,  
The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

#### RE. C.A.G.'s REPORT ON BOFORS GUN-DEAL—contd.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
Madam, have you to say anything about  
the resignation of the Prime Minister ?  
(*Interruptions*) Are you going to  
announce the resignation of the Prime  
Minister, Madam ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN That is  
not my job. I said this in the morning.  
My job is to run the House.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
But, have you been informed of it ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I  
have been informed that the  
Government is willing to discuss the  
matter if the House so agrees. This  
morning the leader of the House very  
categorically said if the House so agrees  
to discuss .. . (*Interruptions*)... the  
Report.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil  
Nadu): Once the resignation is  
submitted, we can discuss it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
The Report which has been laid on the  
Table of the House.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
What would be discussed ?

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI  
(Maharashtra) : Madam, please give me  
one minute. I would request you and  
through you everybody that....  
(*Interruptions*) Just a moment. For  
heaven's sake don't talk,

Madam, I want to request, they  
are responsible Opposition. The  
Leader of the House has already  
given an offer. I would request  
Mr. Gopalsamy to please sit down.  
This type of what you call a demo  
cratic talk —

This is a foolish talk. Democracy  
starts with debate. Let us debate.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
What is the debate ?

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI : Madam, I  
would request you that the debate  
should take place. If the Opposition is  
responsible enough they will respond to  
it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Where is the point of debate on the CAG Report ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Advani wants to say something.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : This morning, if the Opposition was so much agitated over this Report, it is because over a period of last nearly two years this matter has been debated in this House. You would recall that on very many occasions on the basis of what was published in the Press, of course, we, from this side, had moved privilege motions against the Prime Minister and the Defence Minister saying what they were saying was wrong, was palpably false and they were misleading the House. What we had in our hands were the reports in the papers; nothing more. But now all of a sudden we find that virtually everything that was mentioned in the papers is endorsed by a Constitutional body like the Comptroller and Auditor General. *(Interruptions)* This only proves that the House W3s misled all these two years deliberately. *(Interruptions)* Madam, my submission is in a parliamentary democracy the biggest crime that can be committed is to mislead the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Advani, if you are so willing, the Leader of the House in the morning, and the Parliamentary Affairs Minister also, said that we can discuss it in the House if the House so wishes. Whatever you want to say, it can be said... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, I want your guidance.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : Let me complete. Madam, I have not completed. *(Interruptions)* Let

me complete. My point is not discussion. I would say that after this instead of we from the Opposition start speaking about it. the Chair itself should take cognizance of this and refer the whole matter to the Privileges Committee. The Prime Minister has been guilty of misleading the House. Therefore the demand was made.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : If Advaniji really thinks that it is a matter of privilege, there is a procedure prescribed. But, Madam, I submit with my experience in Parliament over two decades that it was a most extraordinary gesture on the part of the Leader of the House to offer for discussion. .. *(Interruptions)* ..

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
END R A : What is there for discussion? .. *(Interruptions)* ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
When Mr. Advani was speaking nobody disturbed him. Please allow him to speak. This is not proper. It is his view. You cannot make. .. *(Interruptions)* .. That is his view. It is up to him... *(Interruptions)* ..

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, in the preceding 25 years show me an instance where the CAG report has been discussed.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA : Nobody is doing any favour to us.. *(interruptions)* ..

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, the Leader of the House...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Has there been a report like this earlier ?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: The Leader of the house has made an offer for discussion.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : What are you going to discuss ? What are you going to reject or accept ?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Shall I tell you now across?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let me understand... {interruptions}...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA: If you have got any sense of shame, you resign. That is all. ...  
{Interruptions}...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Please sit down.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, if they think that the report is so sacrosanct, why are they scared to discuss the report on the floor of the House? If the report is so much in their favour, why are they shouting?...  
{Interruptions}... Dipen, let me complete. Madam, if they feel the report is so conclusive and going to damn us we are the ones who have. ...  
{Interruptions}...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : You want CAG to.. {Interruptions}...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Ghosh, when we are discussing these things, then, you can read from the report whatever you like but just now I would like to hear the views of the House whether the report should be discussed in the House or not. If the House wants the report to be discussed..  
{Interruptions}. ..

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, let me complete one sentence and I am done. Whatever Mr. Advani may say or may not say but one thing has distressed me extremely and very much and it is this that a caboodle of utterly heterogenous motley group of politicians cannot rebuke and abuse the Prime Minister the way they have done. This is the most reprehensible thing I have heard.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA: He is not God.

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWA-  
MY: Madam, may I say...

TH DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just & minute. Mr. Gurupada-swam will you please sit down

अभी जो सुबह से इस हाउस में डिस्क्शन हुआ है, जिस विषय पर बातचीत हुई उसमें अपोजिशन का यह कहना है कि यह रिपोर्ट ठीक नहीं है। लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस ने कहा है कि यह डिस्कस हो जाये। अगर हाउस चाहता है तो हम लोग डिस्कस कर लेंगे।

This is democracy. We will go by democracy.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA: Madam, it is not a question of discussion. It is a question of propriety and upholding the democratic traditions. When a Constitutional authority indicts this Government, if they have got any respect for democracy and the Constitution, straightway they should resign. The first thing is: they have to resign.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think the responsibility of this House is to maintain democracy and in a very democratic spirit we are going to discuss this report.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, this is a very clear report.  
{Interruption}.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: I Would request the Leader of the Opposition to accept the challenge and say, we discuss the report and end up the matter. {Interruption}...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE  
(SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): We are interested to see that the House. ...  
{Interruption}...

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWA-  
MY: Madam Deputy Chairman...  
{Interruptions}. .. Please listen to me for a while.

डा० रत्नाकर पांडेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
श्री राम जेठमलानी... (व्यवधान)...  
को लाने वालों को बोलने न दिया जाये।  
ऐसे सदस्य को यह लाये हैं। इनको बोलने  
की इजाजत न दी जाये। (व्यवधान)

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY : This report, Madam,... *(Interruptions)*. .. from the point of view of the Opposition has spelt out clearly the moral crisis faced by this Government \_\_ *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, we have taken the consent of the House to discuss the report on the floor of the House. What is the discussion? .. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Is the House your personal property. We want to satisfy ourselves what will be the object of the discussion ? Are you going to reject it? *(Interruptions)* ..

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : We are going to reject the inferences they have drawn. . . *(Interruptions)*... Madam, we must have an opportunity . *(Interruptions)* . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We want to know what will be the fate of the discussions ? . . *(Interruptions)*. ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not understand what this noise is about ? We will continue with our discussion. Mr. Upendra, are you going to call your calling attention or not?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : NO .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No calling attention?

Then I adjourn the House... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Upendra, if you do not want to discuss your calling attention ... *(Interruptions)*... Just a minute.

Mr. B. Satyanarayan Reddy ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. N.E. Balram. . . *(Interruptions)*... If you are not intrested to run the House for which you have given the calling attention, okay, we adjourn the House.

The House then adjourned at forty-five minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Thursday, the 20th July, 1989.