

श्री रऊफ बलीउल्लाह (गुजरात) :  
कालिग अटेंशन अगर वे मूव नहीं करते तो  
हम मूव करेंगे।

...(व्यवधान) ....

श्री हरवेद्र सिंह हंसपाल (पंजाब) :  
गरीबों के लिये चावल के वितरण के बारे  
में ये बात नहीं करना चाहते।

...(व्यवधान) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Nothing will go on record. (*Inter-  
ruptions*) You have had enough.  
You please go back to your seats.  
(*Interruptions*) You don't want your  
people to have rice ? Please go  
back to your seats. (*Interruptions*)  
Please sit down. If the Opposition  
is not interested in the Calling  
Attention, we will go ahead with  
the next Business. (*Interruptions*)  
We have had enough. If you do  
not want the Calling Attention  
Motion to be taken up, we shall  
take up the next Business. (*Inter-  
ruptions*) If the Labour Minister  
is ready, we can go ahead with  
this Bill. (*Interruptions*) If you  
have all finished your shouting,  
I would request all of you to go  
back to your seats. (*Interruptions*)

Now the House will adjourn  
for lunch till 2.30 P.M.

The House then adjourned  
for lunch at thirty-one minu-  
tes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after  
lunch at thirty minutes past two  
of the clock, The Deputy Chairman  
in the Chair.

#### RE. C.A.G.'s REPORT ON BOFORS GUN-DEAL—contd.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
Madam, have you to say anything  
about the resignation of the Prime  
Minister ? (*Interruptions*) Are  
you going to announce the resi-  
gnation of the Prime Minister,  
Madam ?

THE DEPUTY CHARMAN  
That is not my job. I said this  
in the morning. My job is to run  
the House.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
But, have you been informed of it ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
I have been informed that the  
Government is willing to discuss  
the matter if the House so agrees.  
This morning the leader of the  
House very categorically said if  
the House so agrees to discuss...  
(*Interruptions*)... the Report.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil  
Nadu): Once the resignation is  
submitted, we can discuss it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
The Report which has been laid  
on the Table of the House....  
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
What would be discussed ?

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI  
(Maharashtra) : Madam, please  
give me one minute. I would  
request you and through you every-  
body that... (*Interruptions*) Just  
a moment. For heaven's sake  
don't talk,

Madam, I want to request, they  
are responsible Opposition. The  
Leader of the House has already  
given an offer. I would request  
Mr. Gopalsamy to please sit down.  
This type of what you call a demo-  
cratic talk....

वे करो, वो करो

This is a foolish talk. Demo-  
cracy starts with debate. Let us  
debate.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :  
What is the debate ?

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI :  
Madam, I would request you that  
the debate should take place. If the  
Opposition is responsible enough  
they will respond to it.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** Where is the point of debate on the CAG Report ?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Advani wants to say something.

**SHRI LAL K. ADVANI :** This morning, if the Opposition was so much agitated over this Report, it is because over a period of last nearly two years this matter has been debated in this House. You would recall that on very many occasions on the basis of what was published in the Press, of course, we, from this side, had moved privilege motions against the Prime Minister and the Defence Minister saying what they were saying was wrong, was palpably false and they were misleading the House. What we had in our hands were the reports in the papers; nothing more. But now all of a sudden we find that virtually everything that was mentioned in the papers is endorsed by a Constitutional body like the Comptroller and Auditor General. *(Interruptions)* This only proves that the House was misled all these two years deliberately. *(Interruptions)* Madam, my submission is in a parliamentary democracy the biggest crime that can be committed is to mislead the House.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Advani, if you are so willing, the Leader of the House in the morning, and the Parliamentary Affairs Minister also, said that we can discuss it in the House if the House so wishes. Whatever you want to say, it can be said... *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** Madam, I want your guidance.

**SHRI LAL K. ADVANI :** Let me complete. Madam, I have not completed. *(Interruptions)* Let

me complete. My point is not discussion. I would say that after this instead of we from the Opposition start speaking about it, the Chair itself should take cognizance of this and refer the whole matter to the Privileges Committee. The Prime Minister has been guilty of misleading the House. Therefore the demand was made.

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** If Advaniji really thinks that it is a matter of privilege, there is a procedure prescribed. But, Madam, I submit with my experience in Parliament over two decades that it was a most extraordinary gesture on the part of the Leader of the House to offer for discussion. ... *(Interruptions)*...

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA :** What is there for discussion? ... *(Interruptions)*...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** When Mr. Advani was speaking nobody disturbed him. Please allow him to speak. This is not proper. It is his view. You cannot make. ... *(Interruptions)*... That is his view. It is up to him... *(Interruptions)*...

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** Madam, in the preceding 25 years show me an instance where the CAG report has been discussed.

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA :** Nobody is doing any favour to us... *(interruptions)*...

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** Madam, the Leader of the House...

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** Has there been a report like this earlier?

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** The Leader of the house has made an offer for discussion.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** What are you going to discuss? What are you going to reject or accept?

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** Shall I tell you now across?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let me understand...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA: If you have got any sense  
of shame, you resign. That is all.  
...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Please sit down.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam,  
if they think that the report is so  
sacrosanct, why are they scared to  
discuss the report on the floor of  
the House? If the report is so  
much in their favour, why are they  
shouting?...*(Interruptions)*... Dipen,  
let me complete. Madam, if they  
feel the report is so conclusive and  
going to damn us we are the ones  
who have. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You  
want CAG to...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Ghosh, when we are discussing  
these things, then, you can read  
from the report whatever you like  
but just now I would like to hear the  
views of the House whether the  
report should be discussed in the  
House or not. If the House wants  
the report to be discussed...*(Inter-  
ruptions)*...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam,  
let me complete one sentence and I  
am done. Whatever Mr. Advani may  
say or may not say but one thing has  
distressed me extremely and very  
much and it is this that a caboodle  
of utterly heterogenous motley group  
of politicians cannot rebuke and  
abuse the Prime Minister the way  
they have done. This is the most  
reprehensible thing I have heard.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA: He is not God.

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWA-  
MY: Madam, may I say...

TH DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Just 2 minute. Mr. Gurupada-  
swam will you please sit down

अभी जो सुबह से इस हाउस में डिस्क्शन  
हुआ है, जिस विषय पर बातचीत हुई उसमें  
अपोजिशन का यह कहना है कि यह रिपोर्ट  
ठीक नहीं है। लीडर आफ दि हाउस ने  
कहा है कि यह डिस्क्स हो जाये। अगर  
हाउस चाहता है तो हम लोग डिस्कस कर  
लेंगे।

This is democracy. We will go by  
democracy.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UP-  
ENDRA: Madam, it is not a ques-  
tion of discussion. It is a question  
of propriety and upholding the de-  
mocratic traditions. When a Con-  
stitutional authority indicts this Go-  
vernment, if they have got any res-  
pect for democracy and the  
Constitution, straightway they  
should resign. The first thing is:  
they have to resign.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
I think the responsibility of this  
House is to maintain democracy and  
in a very democratic spirit we are  
going to discuss this report.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Ma-  
dam, this is a very clear report.  
*(Interruption)*.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: I Would  
request the Leader of the Opposition  
to accept the challenge and say, we  
discuss the report and end up the  
matter. *(Interruption)*...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE  
(SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): We  
are interested to see that the House.  
...*(Interruption)*...

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWA-  
MY: Madam Deputy Chairman...  
*(Interruptions)*. . . Please listen to me  
for a while.

डा० रत्नाकर पांडेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
श्री राम जेठमलानी...*(व्यवधान)*..  
को लाने वालों को बोलने न दिया जाये।  
ऐसे सदस्य को यह लाये हैं। इनको बोलने  
की इजाजत न दी जाये। *(व्यवधान)*

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY : This report, Madam, ... (*Interruptions*)... from the point of view of the Opposition has spelt out clearly the moral crisis faced by this Government... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, we have taken the consent of the House to discuss the report on the floor of the House. What is the discussion? ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Is the House your personal property. We want to satisfy ourselves what will be the object of the discussion? Are you going to reject it? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : We are going to reject the inferences they have drawn. ... (*Interruptions*)... Madam, we must have an opportunity ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : We want to know what will be the fate of the discussions? ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not understand what this noise is about? We will continue with our discussion. Mr. Upendra, are you going to call your calling attention or not?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No calling attention?

Then I adjourn the House... (*Interruptions*)... Mr. Upendra, if you do not want to discuss your calling attention ... (*Interruptions*)... Just a minute.

Mr. B. Satyanarayan Reddy ... (*Interruptions*)... Mr. N.E. Balram. ... (*Interruptions*)... If you are not interested to run the House for which you have given the calling attention, okay, we adjourn the House.

The House then adjourned at forty-five minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Thursday, the 20th July, 1989.