

## MESSAGES FROM THE LOK SABHA

- (I) Motion recommending the Rajya Sabha for Nomination of three Members on the Committee on Public Accounts.
- (II) Motion recommending the Rajya Sabha for nomination of three Members on the Committee on Public Undertakings.

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Madam, I beg to report to the House the following messages received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:—

### (I)

"I am directed to inform you that Lok Sabha, at its sitting held on Wednesday, the 26th July, 1989, adopted the following motion:—

"That this House do recommend to Rajya Sabha that Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate three members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Accounts of this House for the unexpired portion of the term of the Committee vice Sarvashri Parvathaneni Upendra, Virendra Verma and Jaswant Singh resigned from the Committee and to communicate to this House the names of the members so nominated by Rajya Sabha."

2. I am to request that the concurrence of Rajya Sabha in the said motion, and also the names of the

members of Rajya Sabha so nominated, may be communicated to this House."

### (II)

"I am directed to inform you that Lok Sabha, at its sitting held on Wednesday, the 26th July, 1989, adopted the following motion:—

"That this House do recommend to Rajya Sabha that Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate three members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Undertakings of this House for the unexpired portion of the term of the Committee vice Sarvashri T. R. Balu, Dipen Ghosh and Kamal Morarka resigned from the Committee and do communicate to this House the names of the members so nominated by Rajya Sabha."

2. I am to request that the concurrence of Rajya Sabha in the said motion, and also the names of the members of Rajya Sabha so nominated, may be communicated to this House."

## RE. MANHANDLING OF A MEMBER BY ANOTHER MEMBER IN THE HOUSE

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam, the day before yesterday, a Member wanted to physically assault another Member.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Wanted to assault? Assaulted.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** He assaulted. Actually, he was asked to express his regret on the floor of the House by the Chairman and by you also. But it is observed that he is eluding and yesterday, he was present for a short while and then he left. (*Interruptions*).

**THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB):** Madam, I object to his using the word 'eluding'. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** Mr. D. P. Ray assaulted another Member in the presence of the Prime Minister himself. You summon him. (*Interruptions*). My point is that the Deputy Chairman, as the Presiding Officer of the House, you are entitled to summon him so that he expresses his regret on the floor of the House. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI SURESH PACHOURI (Madhya Pradesh):** Was he present at that time? (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Upendra, an opinion is expressed by one Member. Yesterday, Mr. D. P. Ray came. But in the furore and noise, nobody could listen to him. He went away because, he told me, he had an urgent meeting. Today I talked to him. He said he is coming. He will come and express his regret. Please do not use such words. In anger, you say something, they say something, I might have said something. We are all sorry. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** It is not saying something. It is assault, physical assault in the House. (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please have patience. I can understand your feelings. I understand everybody. He said he is going to come and apologise. (*Interruptions*).

**ठाकुर जगत पाल सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) :**

अगर कोई इस तरह की बात करेगा तो उसे भी माफी मांगनी पड़ेगी हाऊस में . . .  
(उत्तरा.) . . .

**SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka):** I only say that this is not a matter of this party or that party. How the House is conducted concerns the whole House. Therefore, we are not taking any partisan view. I think that if the hon. Member has committed anything wrong by mistake or in his emotion or whatever it is, he should come before the House and express his regret. If he does not do it, then you call him here.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I told you that he said he would be coming. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Gopalsamy, may I remind you one thing? What the Member did is regrettable and he is going to regret. But the way you people speak to me, have you ever realised that?

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** Speaking is different. Did we assault anybody?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I am giving you an assurance. (*Interruptions*) I am giving you an assurance and you are not satisfied with that. He said he would be coming. What else do you want me to do?

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** We have not assaulted anybody.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Verbal assault is even more. (*Interruptions*) I am sure that if I equate somebody with Mr. D. P. Ray, he is going to take it as an offence.

**SHRI M. M. JACOB:** Madam, I am very glad that the opposition Members stood up today one after another and expressed concern at the behaviour of one Member of this House. I expect this House to follow all the decorum and norms. But may I point out that there are instances of verbal assault, on the Chair, by throwing a

[Shri M. M. Jacob]

paper from that side? Was that not an assault?

*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The particular Chair and the Chairperson is not bothered because I know that tempers are high. It is O.K.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The opposition has always shown good grace to apologise when they exceeded certain limits. But they are not showing the same grace.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: It is Mr. Upendra who threw the paper at the Chair. I did not use Mr. Upendra's name.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, the Chair directs and the Parliamentary Affairs Minister directs. Even then the Member does not come. In these circumstances, what is the way? You have to tell us.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no way. He will come. He is not running away. He will come. He has promised that he will come. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down. He has said that he is coming.

Now we take up further discussion on the Short Duration Discussion.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: May I make a submission?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't write anybody who speaks without my permission.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I am making a submission to the Chair and to the House through her. *(Interruptions)* Madam Deputy Chairman, we, the opposition parties, have taken a unanimous decision...

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Madam, just half a minute. I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has taken my permission, Mr. Jadhav. I want to know what he has to say. Perhaps he is participating in the debate. I do not know.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: My point of order is different. Madam, my point of order is different.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I am not yielding.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jadhav, I am not allowing your point of order. Please sit down. I am not allowing you. Please sit down. Let us first settle Mr. D. P. Ray's matter. Mr. Jadhav, please sit down. I am talking to the one sitting behind you. You are not Mr. Ray... *(Interruptions)*...

Mr. Ray, two days ago, there was something in the House about which the members are unhappy. I hope you satisfy the Members by saying whatever you have to say... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He should apologise... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): He should apologise... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ray, the Members will be satisfied if you say what you have to say for keeping up the decorum of the House... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, Mr. Upendra was saying that he should apologise... *(Interruptions)*... What right has he got to say that?... *(Interruptions)*... On what authority can he say that?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY (West Bengal): Madam, I believe I stand qualified to explain what happened on that day. It really happened when they evaded the House and at that

point of time the incident took place. Mr. Chimanbhai Mehta, when he stood up, he was supposed to put a question. But, instead of putting the question he started abusing the Government. He is still a Congress (I) Member and he sits amidst us. I tried to make him sit down and nothing wrong I have done. The Members also witnessed the whole incident... (Interruptions)... You come... (Interruptions)... You come... (Interruptions)

DR. BAPU KALDATE (Maharashtra): He is gesticulating... (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He is making gestures... (Interruptions)

SHRI B. SATYANARAYANA REDDY: (Andhra Pradesh): He is making gestures... (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He is compounding his crime... (Interruptions)... He is compounding his crime... (Interruptions)... Again another crime? What is this? ... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. D. P. Ray... (Interruptions) Please... (Interruptions)... Please keep quiet, everybody. If you want me to handle, then I will handle. But please keep silent... (Interruptions)... Mr. Ray, ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: Madam, I was asked to make my submission, but I have been interrupted... (Interruptions)... Madam, I just seek one minute from you... (Interruptions)... It seems my gesture was not appreciated by Mr. Chimanbhai Mehta who went to the Chamber of the Chairman and I had also gone to the Chairman's room and in the presence of the Chairman, the issue was resolved. I do not believe... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All of you, sit down... (Interruptions)... Mr. Ray has a right to speak... (Interruptions)... Please sit down... (Interruptions)... He has a right to

speak; I have given him the permission... (Interruptions)

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: Madam. I do not believe I can be made to express regret twice for this one incident and I question the bona fides of those who are raising this issue who assaulted the MLAs in West Bengal, and... (Interruptions)... Miss Jayalalitha in the Tamil Nadu Assembly... (Interruptions)... I question their moral right to raise this issue. (Interruptions)... I do not think... (Interruptions).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Miss Jayalalitha enacted a drama in the Tamil Nadu Assembly... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down... (Interruptions)... All of you please sit down... (Interruptions)... Order, please... (Interruptions)... Order, please... (Interruptions)... Mr. Ray, don't quote all those things. We are concerned with the dignity of this House. We are not concerned with those things now... (Interruptions)... All of you, please sit down... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, this is no apology... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You do not want the Chair to handle it?... (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Ray has questioned our moral right to raise this issue... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, in all fairness, may I draw your attention to one thing?... (Interruptions)... He has questioned our bona fides... (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, he has questioned our moral right to raise this issue... (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He is calling the Members for a fight... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Miss Jayalalitha enacted a drama in the Tamil Nadu Assembly... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, he has taken this opportunity and insulted the House. He is insulting the Chair... (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, kindly permit me to say what I have to say... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: May I say one thing?... (Interruptions)... We are concerned with the dignity of this House. What happened in the other House I am not concerned with here. So, I would request you, Mr. Ray, to express your regret... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He should withdraw that remark... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: In the Chairman's room I have regretted; I would not regret again... (Interruptions)...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. no. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is not a question of regret in a private affair. It is not a private affair. (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: It is a disrespect to the Chair. (Interruptions)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: He has stated that he has already regretted. Where is the question of again... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't take the side of a wrong thing. I told Mr. D. P. Ray—I am requesting him—as the Chair, that if he has misbehaved he should say sorry. I

think the Members feel, the entire House feels, it. If he does not want to regret, he should not sit in this House. (Interruptions)

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: If you feel that I have affected the dignity of the House, if you want me to leave the House, I am leaving the House but I won't regret.

[At this stage the hon. Member left the Chamber]

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: This is the stuff. He defied not only the Chair but... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No more discussion on it, please. No more discussion on it. (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What are you going to do? You reprimand him or suspend him.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: May I make a submission, Madam? Either you reprimand him or...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow any discussion on this matter now. It is closed. The Member has left the House. It is over.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He defied your orders. Either you reprimand him or suspend him. Or you suspend him for the day. You declared that you are suspending him. (Interruptions) A mere walk out will not do. You suspend him for the day. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman... (Interruptions)... I move that Mr. D. P. Ray be suspended for the day.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said: if he does not regret he should leave the House. (Interruptions) Please sit down.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I move for the suspension of Mr. D. P. Ray for the day.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: By defying the Chair he has incurred... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record on this matter. It is over.

(Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: \*\*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: \*\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I told him to regret or leave the House. He left the House. It is all right. You should be happy.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Madam... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jagesh Desai wants to say something. Let me listen to him.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Yesterday when I was presiding one incident took place in the House. Mr. Ram Awadhesh Singh ran from his seat in a menacing manner twice and nobody objected to it.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why did you keep quiet then?

DR. BAPU KALDATE: How can you say that? I immediately went to him and asked him to come back which he did. I saw to it that nothing happened.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We ourselves dragged him backwards and you know that. Why do you report it today? We pulled him back.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: My motion was, suspend him for the day.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Under Rule 255 he has withdrawn for the whole day... (अवधान) आप मेहरबानी करके बैठ जाइये। अब चेयर खड़ी हुई, आपने ध्यान नहीं होना मैं खड़ी हूँ और मैं बोल रहे हैं। (Interruptions) Don't argue with the Chair. आप चेयर से बात करिये। हाउस को कोई डेकोरम है, मैं हमारी

\*Not recorded.

यदि है हमारी परम्परा है, उसको हम बिना कुछ दोगे क्या? It is for everybody. Under Rule 253 he has withdrawn for the day. Now let us go ahead with the discussion.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: May I make a submission? (Interruptions) Not on this. You had allowed me to make a submission.

डा. राजाकर गण्डय (उत्तर प्रदेश): (अवधान) विरोधी दल के नेता ने सी. आर्. ई. ए. कि एजेंट को अपने दल में रखे हुका है। इस प्रकार उन्होंने सदन में विरोधी दल का नेता होने का राइट को दिया है।... (अवधान)

अवधान: मेरी कृपया इस पर कोई नहीं है। आपने चेयरमैन सहज को निर्दिष्ट की है अब जवाब देंगे तब हमारा। अभी द्वारा काम हो रहा है।... (अवधान)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: This is a different matter, not the old thing.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, what is it?

#### SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION

Paragraphs 11 and 12 of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended the 31st March 1988 (No. 2 of 1989) — Union Government—Defence Services (Army and Ordnance Factories—Contd.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam, I want to make it clear, I want to go on record, on behalf of the entire Opposition that we are not a party to the clumsy operation cover-up on the part of the Government in respect of Bofors deal and we are not a party to the attack, vile and vicious and obscene, on CAG for his report on Bofors gun deal, and we have taken this decision, we have held this view that what is required today is action and nothing but action on the part of the Government. And the only action is, after the report has been submitted by the CAG on Bofors gun deal Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi