

[Prof. C. Lakshmanna]

der of 40 billion dollars which came to 55000 crores of rupees. This is what was stated by the then Finance Minister. The debt servicing charges on that, as claimed by him, were of the order of Rs. 3800 crores, in foreign exchange of course. There is an Institute of International Finance, Washington DC. This institute has been set up by foreign bankers including World Bank and so on. These are the people who have been giving loans to all the developing countries including India. Their figure was 57.6 billion dollars whereas the Government of India's figure was 40 billion dollars for the same period.

REG. DEMAND FOR COPIES OF REPORT OF JUSTICE THAKKAR COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी (मध्य प्रदेश): उपसमाध्यक्ष जी, मैं अनुमति लेकर बीच में व्यवधान कर रहा हूँ। यहाँ पर थोड़ी देर पहले ठक्कर आयोग की रिपोर्ट पेश की गयी है। अब सदन में जब कोई रिपोर्ट पेश की जाती है तो उसका अर्थ है कि कोई सदस्य अगर उस रिपोर्ट को देखना चाहे तो देख सकता है। दुर्भाग्य की स्थिति ऐसी है कि मैं सब जगह गया, मुझे रिपोर्ट की क़ापी उपलब्ध नहीं हुई। शायद तो नियम कहते हैं कि जब कोई रिपोर्ट पेश की जाती है तो बीच प्रतियाँ सेक्रेटेरियेट को पहले भेज दी जाती हैं और चेयरमैन को दो दिन पहले भेजी जाती हैं। आवश्यक स्थितियों में भी 20 प्रतियाँ तो होनी चाहिए। मैं फिर लाइब्रेरी में घूमना बुरा मान रहा, टेबुल आफिस में गया, काउन्टर पर गया, सब जगह गया, कहीं नहीं मिला। लाइब्रेरी में गया तो वहाँ पर कहते हैं कि हमको दो तीन प्रतियाँ लोक भा सेक्रेटेरियेट से मिली हैं तो लोक भा के मेम्बर देख रहे हैं लेकिन राज्यसभा सेक्रेटेरियेट से कुछ नहीं आया है लाइब्रेरी में। इसलिए मैं निर्वेदन कर रहा हूँ कि अगर कोई चीज़ सभापटल पर रखी जाये तो मेम्बरों को तुरंत उपलब्ध होनी चाहिए, नहीं तो उसका कोई अर्थ नहीं है। यह केवल एक

रिचुअल नहीं होना चाहिए कि भाई हमन टेबुल पर रख दिया। यह मेरा आपसे निर्वेदन है। इस मामले में सभी हमसे प्रतिक्रिया जानना चाहते हैं। आप उसकी व्यवस्था करावें। सदन के नेता भी बैठे हैं।

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): I do not know anything about it. I presume that when it is laid on the Table of the House, it should be made available.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I have been going around. The report was placed at 4.15 P.M. I have been going around for the last 45 minutes.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Normally it is only when it has been made available, the Minister comes and says that I lay it on the Table of the House. I am rather surprised. I cannot vouchsafe what exactly the position is.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): We got the information that the report was laid on the Table of the House. But the normal practice, as my colleague Advaniji has stated, is that 20 copies are made available. But if the copies are not made available, I think, it is a serious lapse. The Leader of the House also does not know about it. He is concurring. I do not know where the lapse occurred. Will you kindly pull up the concerned? It is a very serious thing. And it should not happen. And please get the Reports now itself so that we can have a look at them, and let them be circulated to us. I thought they will be available in the counter. My colleague Advaniji says not even a few copies are available in the Library. They should be made available in the counter.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA (Andhra Pradesh): What is the position?

उपसमाध्यक्ष (श्री सत्य प्रकाश मानवीर): देखिये, अभी आडवाणी जी ने जो प्रश्न उठाया है, यह बात की महत्वपूर्ण और समीचीन है। मैंने जानकारी भी की है। तो तुरंत तीन-चार प्रतियाँ तो लोक सभा का जो पुस्तकालय है

या वाचनालय है, वहाँ पर उपलब्ध करा दी जायेगी, और बाकी स्थिति की जानकारी करके कल बता दी जाएगी।

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : यह तो धीरे धीरे तो बता दिया कि मैं लाइब्रेरी में गया था। मैंने वहाँ के लाइब्ररियन से पूछा, तो उन्होंने कहा कि लोक सभा सचिवालय में हमारे पास तीन-चार प्रतियाँ आई हैं।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय) : नहीं, तीन या चार प्रतिलिपियाँ... (व्यवधान)

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : उन्होंने कहा कि हमारे पास राज्य सभा से आई होतीं, तो मैं पहले दे देता।

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे (महाराष्ट्र) : राज्य सभा में आई है कि नहीं? यहाँ सभा-मटल पर रखी है कि नहीं?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय) : राज्य सभा में आई है।

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I also discussed with the Secretary-General. I asked him, why is it that the copies have not been made available. The Minister seems to have informed him that if they were to be sent for the printing earlier, the documents would have been exposed. Therefore, further documents have been sent for printing today. And whatever copies were available, they have been placed in the Library itself. The ones that were available have been placed because it was felt that if they were to be printed, the whole thing would have been exposed. So, today they have sent it. (Interruptions) This is what the Minister seems to have told him. I have asked him. This is what he is explaining.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, may I point out that in these situations when the Paper is laid on the Table of both the Houses, the Librarian there should not be under

the impression that "these are the copies which we have received from the Lok Sabha Secretariat which are, intended for the Lok Sabha Members." And he said that "if there were copies sent to me by the Rajya Sabha Secretariat, I would have certainly given to you."

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: If it is in the Library, it is not as though that it will be made available only to the Members of Lok Sabha...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: This is the Librarian's version that "Rajya Sabha sends it separately; they have not sent us." Anyway, we want the Papers. We want to have access to the Reports. That is all. (Interruptions)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय) : उसकी तीन प्रतियाँ तो राज्य सभा की ओर से तुरन्त जो वाचनालय है, वहाँ पर भेजी जा रही हैं। वह रास्ते में होगी यहाँ से तो भेजी गई है। अब क्या पता पहुँचने की खबर तो नहीं आई है।... (व्यवधान) यह तो पता नहीं था।

श्री पी० शिवशंकर : यह बात आप पहले कह देते कि हम भेज रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान) The confusion is deliberately created.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Are they being sent to us? I want to know whether the copies are being sent today.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA): They have already been sent from the Rajya Sabha office to the Library.

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : यह क्यों नहीं बताया कि भेज दी गई है।

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let there not be compartmentalisation in the Library. Library is the Library for Parliament.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: It is never done.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Somebody said like this to Advaniji. I take serious objection.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: There was a huge crowd and he pointed out that the Lok Sabha Secretariat has sent...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Now the position seems to be clear that even the Rajya Sabha Secretariat seems to have been supplied with the copies. And it is from here they are sending it. This the Secretariat must have clarified much earlier. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA): Prof. Lakshman, you continue.

THE BUDGET (GENERAL), 1989-90 —Contd.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I think, this state of affairs which confuses prevails in the country also with regard to the Budget. About a year back, the position with regard to the Government of India was that 40 billion dollars, approximately Rs. 55,000 crore, was the external debt; but for the same period, the Institute of International Finance states that the loan was of the order of 57.6 billion dollars, which comes to Rs. 75,000 crores, and by the end of this year, according to this Institute's estimate, it will be 66.3 billion dollars, which will come to about Rs. one lakh crore. Sir, earlier the Vice-Chairman was making a small enquiry from the other Member whether these were the Government of India figures or some other figures. I would like to state that there is a difference because of two particular reasons. The Government of India's figures include medium and long-term debt but exclude short-term debt, whereas the figures of the Institute of International Finance include short-term debt also. Then, interest on short-term debts alone comes to 4.74 million dollars, in 1989-90.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): It is the total foreign indebtedness.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: The figure of Institute for International Finance includes short-term loans also but the Government of India figure does not include short-term loan. But so far as our country is concerned, whether it is a short-term loan or a long-term loan or a medium-term loan, it is a loan, and debt servicing has to take place. Therefore, it is a debt burden, and as I was mentioning, in 1989-90, the interest on short-term loan alone is to the tune of 4.74 billion dollars, and by the year 1989-90, that is, current year, this will be 6.7 billion dollars.

The second factor which has been responsible for the difference in the estimated amount of foreign debt or external debt is the non-inclusion of non-resident Indians' income. But, Sir, non-resident Indians' deposits are always repaid in foreign exchange. Therefore, for all purposes, as far as this country is concerned, whether it has come from a foreign institution or it has come from a non-resident Indian, so long as repayment is in terms of foreign exchange, it is the same foreign debt. Therefore, the figures which I have quoted from the Institute of International Finance appear to be more accurate than the figures of the Government of India because the Government of India figures exclude these two categories. This is, therefore, the order of the external debt.

Last year, when I was speaking on the Budget, I had stated that the external debt amounted to Rs. 186 thousand crores, and the debt servicing was to the tune of Rs. 14,100 crores, and this year, the Minister for Finance has stated that debt servicing on internal loans comes to Rs. 17,000 crores, which means the internal debt must have crossed Rs. two lakh mark. It will definitely be much more because