

effect from November 5, 1988... (*Interruptions*) .. Please take your seat's.

TRIBUTES TO SHRIMATI PRATIBHA DEVISINGH PATIL FOR HER PERFORMANCE AS DEPUTY CHAIRMAN

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, just now I announced in the House the resignation of Shrimati Pratibha Devisingh Patil, from the office of Deputy Chairman. Pratibhaji occupied this august office for nearly two years. She shared the burden and may I say the brunt of office patiently and ungrudgingly. The House witnessed many stormy and difficult situations during the last two years. She handled them astutely and ably. Her vast parliamentary experience stood her in good stead to deal with them fairly and firmly. We will miss Pratibhaji in this Chair but she will be with us on the benches and I have no doubt that she will contribute significantly to the proceedings of the House.

I thank her for the services rendered and wish her good luck and godspeed in whatever work she undertakes.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY ("Karnataka"): Mr. Chairman, I associate myself with the sentiments you have expressed about Shrimati Pratibha Devisingh Patil. Parting is always sad, particularly for me I had a very charming companion on my right side. Pratibha Patil was, if I may say so, my good neighbour-in-law. I miss her. You have rightly said, as the Deputy Chairman of the House, she ably conducted the deliberations, the proceedings of this House.

[The Vice Chairman (Shri Jagesh Desai) in the Chair.]

She was not only astute but charming sometimes. There were occasions when the Opposition had to enter into skirmishes with her, but all these Parliamentary skirmishes ended in good humour. There was no ill-will, bad motive or any kind of animus against Shrimati Pratibha (Devi-

Devisingh Patil

singh Patil. We had three women occupying the Chair as Deputy Chairperson, Shrimati Violet Alva, (Dr. (Shrimati) Najma Heptulh *uni* till now, Shrimati Pratibha Devisingh Patil. One thing I always observed in Shrimati Pratibha Devisingh Patil in the Chair. Sometimes when she lost temper, she used to say that nothing goes on record. Sir, we in the Opposition, felt bad whenever she uttered those sentences. I feel that everything should go on record so that the future generation may read what really happened on the floor of the House. I am not making an adverse comment. I am only making an observation so that the successor of Shrimati Pratibha Devisingh Patil may not resort to this kind of tactics. Everything should go on record, sense and nonsense said on the floor of the House. It is for the future generations who will have to study the proceedings of the House to know what really happened and transpired on various occasions. Sir, once again, I say; we remember her as the Deputy Chairman. We never forget her record and contribution and I personally wish her godspeed, all good luck in future in whatever positions she finds herself in and I again say that we carry very good memories of her as the Deputy Chairman of the House. Thank you.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, as Shrimati Devisingh Patil Ji leaves us—I do not know whether she will resign the Membership of the House—I am not sure but she should not and that is my wish and I convey our greetings and gratitude. She has conducted the proceedings of the House with great efficiency and dignity. Maybe, some of her rulings were controversial and were not palatable to us but we should also remember that the period during which she held the office of Deputy Chairman was the most tumultuous period in the annals of the Rajya Sabha and therefore, decisions are bound to be controversial and rulings questioned. There were occasions when we had brushes with her. But there are no bruises. Particularly, I can assure

[Shri /Parvathaneni Upendra]

her that we have no personal rancour or in regard to whatever she did. We took it all in good grace and we will continue to cherish our association with her.

T *whh* her well in her personal life. I cannot wish her well in her new assignment because I know that if I wish her well in her new assignment as President of the Maharashtra Pradesh Congress Committee', that would mean cutting our own throats. I would rather wish that she retain the Membership of the House and we will definitely be ready to accept her as Deputy Chairman again when she comes back but not as a successful President of the Wanasrastra Pradesh Congress Committee.

T wish her well in ber personal life and T convey our regards and greetings to her on my behalf and on behalf of my party.

DR. R. K PODDAR (West Bengal): Sir, I, on behalf of my prrty; associate myself with the nice feelings expressed on the resignation of Shrimati Pratibha Patil from the Deputy Chairmanship of the House. We wish her well. We also appreciate the manner in which she conducted the proceedings of the House during thf] last two years except for some rare occasions when we had som; complaints. We wish her good luck and success ' in her next assignment but not against us.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदय, एक बार फिर यह सदन अपने उपसभापति को बिदाई देने के लिए प्रस्तुत हुआ है। पिछले कुछ सालों में अनेक बार उपसभापति बदले हैं। डा० (श्रीमती) नाजमा हेपतुल्ला, उपसभापति पद को मुशोभित करती थीं, उसके बाद श्री एम० एम० जैकब आए और अब श्रीमती प्रतिभा देवी सिंह पाटिल जा रहीं हैं।

किसी उपसभापति के संबंध में इतने थोड़े से काल में कोई राय बनाना एक कठिन काम है। वैसे भी उपसभापति की जिम्मेदारी गम्भीर है। प्रश्नकाल तक

तो सभापति रहते हैं, बाद का सारा भार उपसभापति को या उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आप जैसे सदस्यों का निभाना पड़ता है।

अच्छी बात है कि राज्य सभा में जीरो आवर नहीं है। इस समय नहीं है पहले हुआ करता था और तब मैं देखा करता था कि बारह की घंटी बजी और जो भी सभापति थे; उन्होंने कागज-पत्र संभाले और प्रस्थान किया। जो उपसभापति था उसके ऊपर सारा सदन अपना निशाना बनाकर तरकस के तीर निकालता था। अब यह सदन अपेक्षाकृत शांतिपूर्ण तरीके से चलता है क्योंकि जीरो आवर नहीं है और सदन में एक आम सहमति बने गई है कि जो भी मामले उठाने जायेंगे, सभापति की राय से उठाए जायेंगे लेकिन फिर भी कभी-कभी ऐसे प्रश्न आते हैं जिन्हें उसी दिन, उसी समय उठाना आवश्यक होता है। तब क्या किया जाए ?

श्रीमती प्रतिभा देवी सिंह पाटिल : चतुर हैं और कठारे भी हैं। मराठी में कहावत है—

मूर्ति लहाण पण कृति मोठी ।

मैं इसमें थोड़ा संशोधन कर रहा हूँ—
मूर्ति लहाण पण कृती कठोर ।

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे (महाराष्ट्र) : लहान नहीं कठोर कहा है इसमें।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : कधी-कधी अस असत ।

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : मूर्ति कठोर पण कृती कठोर—

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी (मध्य प्रदेश) : यह तो कवि की भाषा हो गई।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आप साल्वे साहब को कहने का मौका जरूर दीजिए ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश वेसाई) :
विलम्ब देंगे ।

श्री अदल बिहारी भाजपेयी : अब मैं सहीद्वयक चर्चा नहीं करना चाहता, लेकिन मुझे एक बात इस अवसर पर और कहनी है कि राज्य सभा तो घाटे में रहेगी है कि वह हमारी उपसभापति नहीं रहेगी, लेकिन महाराष्ट्र का कांग्रेस कितने फायदे में रहेगी इस के बारे में मुझे पूरा शक है । लेकिन वह मेरा मामला नहीं है, वह आपका घरेलू प्रश्न है जिसमें मैं देखना नहीं देना चाहता, लेकिन इस बात पर मैं जरूर टिप्पणी करना चाहूंगा कि राज्य सभा की उप सभापति का प्रदेश कांग्रेस का अध्यक्ष बनना बिना आपका काम नहीं चल सकता, यह प्रदेश के संगठन की स्थिति के बारे में कोई बहुत अच्छी टिप्पणी नहीं है ।

मैं एक और बात कह रहा हूँ । इस सदन में परंपरा थी कि उप सभापति विरोधी बल का हुआ करता था । श्री खोबरागडे थे, उसके बाद श्री गोडे मुगाहरि रहे, फिर श्री राम निवास मिर्धा को उप सभापति निर्वाचन किया गया था जबकि वह सत्ता पक्ष से अलग थे । बीच में इस परंपरा में व्याघात पड़ गया । मैं देख रहा हूँ कि सत्ता पक्ष अच्छी परंपरायें निर्माण करने में अब थोड़ी सी रुचि दिखा रहा है । मुझे यूनाइटेड नेशनल के डेलीगेशन में भेजा गया है । मैं प्रतिपक्ष का हूँ और 1977-78 में तो प्रतिपक्ष के सदस्य को यूनाइटेड नेशनल में भेजा जाता था क्योंकि विदेशी मामलों में हमारे कोई बुनियादी मतभेद नहीं है । थोड़े-बहुत अन्तर हैं जिन्हें हम घर में प्रकट कर सकते हैं । लेकिन कम से कम राज्य सभा में अब इस पुरानी परंपरा जो अच्छी परंपरा थी उसको पुनर्जीवित किया जा सकता है और प्रतिपक्ष के किसी सदस्य को उप सभापति के रूप में सारा सदन उचित कर सकता है तब सदन की गरिमा और भी बढ़ेगी तथा लोकतंत्र अधिक सार्थक बनेगा ।

Devisingh Patil

मैं श्रीमती प्रतिभा देवी सिंह पाटिल को बधाई देना चाहता हूँ और उनका भविष्य उज्ज्वल हो यह कामना भी करना चाहता हूँ ।

श्री ईश दत्त यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय उप सभाध्यक्ष जी, विपक्ष के माननीय सदस्यों ने इस सदन के तिनूतमान उप सभापति माननीया श्रीमती प्रतिभा देवीसिंह पाटिल के संबंध में जो भावनायें प्रकट की हैं, जो विचार प्रकट किए हैं मैं भी उनसे अपने को और अपने लोक दल को सम्बद्ध कर रहा हूँ । मान्यवर, इस सदन में तो मैं थोड़े समय में हूँ लेकिन जितने समय में हूँ मैंने देखा कि माननीया प्रतिभा देवीसिंह पाटिल का कार्य व्यवहार और संसदीय ज्ञान अत्यंत ही सराहनीय है । इनका इस सदन में व्यवहार और सदन का निर्वाह करने की जो योग्यता रही है उससे मैं अत्यंत प्रभावित हूँ । मैंने अभी 4-5 दिन पहले जब मैं अपने गृह जनपद आजमगढ़ में था वहाँ समाचार-पत्र में पढ़ा कि इन्होंने त्याग-पत्र दे दिया है और उसमें यह भी छपा था कि इनको महाराष्ट्र प्रदेश कांग्रेस का अध्यक्ष बनाया गया है । यह दोनों समाचार पढ़ करके मुझे आश्चर्य हुआ और थोड़ा कष्ट हुआ । कष्ट इसलिए हुआ कि हम सब लोग इनकी प्रतिभा से, इनका नाम भी प्रतिभा है इनमें जो प्रतिभा थी, इनमें जो गुण हैं, उनसे हम सब लोग वंचित रह जायेंगे । मैंने तो बहुत थोड़े समय में इनसे सीखा भी है जब इन्होंने सीट पर बैठ करके अध्यक्षता की है । दूसरा कष्ट इस प्रकार का है कि मैं चाहता था कि यह इसी सदन में रहती और इस सदन की अध्यक्षता करती रहती । मेरी राय मैं इनकी सही जगह पर नहीं रखा गया है, इनकी प्रतिभा की आवश्यकता इस सदन को थी जिसे पूरे देश को लाभ होता ।

इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ, मैं कामना करता हूँ कि इनका भविष्य उज्ज्वलभय हो जो कि देश के लिए एक अच्छी परंपरा कायम कर सके ।

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Vice-Chairman, I associate myself with the sentiments expressed by

[Shri Aladi Aruna *alias* V. Arunaehalam]

the honourable Chairman and I thank Shrimati Pratibha Patil for her wonderful services during the tenure of her office. She was very kind, polite, impartial and well balanced. She was very firm when discipline was needed, when discipline of the House had to be maintained, and she was very kind towards the Members when the rights of the Members had to be established in this House. That is why we enjoyed our full right and freedom within the precincts of this House.

Sir, our discomfort now is that we are losing the good services of Mrs. Pratibha Patil. I think the Pradesh Congress (I) Committee is fortunate to get the services of our Madam. At least hereafter the Pradesh Congress (I) Committee of Maharashtra will be streamlined on right lines. Once again I thank her for her good services.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Vice-Chairman. Sir, it was from July 1986 that I became a Member of this House and it was, I think, at the same time that she also became a Member of this House. I had another good fortune in that being the Vice-Chairman of the House, most of the time, she was the Deputy Chairman and I had an opportunity to attend her lunches arranged for us and also attend the informal meetings when we had to talk about the House, discipline, and the rules and conduct of business in the House.

Sir, about a few days ago, as was mentioned by a Member, when I read in the newspapers that she had resigned the post of Deputy Chairman and that she had been appointed as the President of the Maharashtra Pradesh Congress (I) Committee, I tell you frankly. I could not decipher whether it was a promotion or a demotion. I am sorry to tell you this because that was my feeling and

can candidly tell that. I had a feeling that she herself having conducted her office in an exemplary and dignified manner, she would continue for another 3-1/2 years now and complete her full term. But, suddenly, on her being taken away and appointed as the President of the Pradesh Congress (I) Committee, I was not very clear and I do not know why this had to be done at this point of time. It has also been mentioned by the honourable Member, Vajpayeeji, that it is advisable that either the Chairman or the Deputy Chairman continue in the post for a longer term because, the Deputy Chairman has to shoulder onerous responsibilities, sometimes more than that of the Chairman. The Chairman being the authority of the House has got all the powers and even though it is said that as long as the Deputy Chairman occupies the Chair, he or she has the same powers as the Chairman, whatever is said or done is first as Chairman and then as Deputy Chairman and she has to see that there is no turbulence in the House so that she might not be criticised. It takes time for the Deputy Chairman to adjust her to this position because her office is unique in one way. The Chairman has got only one place and that is the Chair. But in the case of the Deputy Chairman, he or she has to sit in the Chair as the presiding officer and he or she has a place, has a seat, as a member of the party. So, she has to function in a dual capacity, that is, in the capacity of Presiding Officer and then in the capacity of a party member. Sometimes something conflicting also happened when she occupied that seat. I only wish to say, as has been mentioned by some others, that she was very kind and she was also hard in her rulings. It used to be said about the Simhasana of King Vikramaditya that once he went and occupied it he became a different person. So, as long as she was outside the Chair or inside the Chamber, she was very

kind all the tirae, but once she occupied the Chair, we always found her to be a different person altogether, as Presiding Officer. So, I only wish to dwell on her firmness with which she had to conduct the affairs of the House. But I would like also to mention that I have found that during the last two lot of turbulence has come into this House. During the, initial period when I was here, the Question Hour was very smooth and all the proceedings, were smooth. But, during the last one year. I have found even the Question Hour could not be conducted continuously for one hour. Even today, Sir, we found that there were a lot of interruptions during the Question Hour itself. I personally

feel, ag has been mentioned by Shri Upendra, that it was a tumultuous period during her term. I do not know whether that was the utmost seen in the Rajya Sabha or there are some more to be seen in the course of one or two more years. But whatever is said and done, I Shrimati Pratibha Patil all the best in her life ar. I am sure that she ' will make her position as president of the Congress Maharashtra Congress Com-mittee as successful as she has been conducting the affairs of this House, even though some doubts have been expressed by some Members whether she could do it. But history will prove that she will be as successful and she will also have many more elevations in her life—much more than that of the Deputy Chairman of the Rajya Sabha, even though that is a very dignified position.

श्री खनुरानन मिश्र (निपाग): सभापति महोदय, प्रतिभा जी के उत्तमभावनि पद से अवकाश लेने पर दूसरे अन्य माननीय सदस्यों ने जो उद्गार व्यक्त किए हैं, मैं भी उनके साथ हूँ। प्रतिभा जी अपने नाम के मताधिक ही अपनी प्रतिभा से हम लोगों को प्रभावित करती रहीं। अब वे जिस नए पद पर जा रही हैं, वह तो उनकी इच्छा के मताधिक है, लेकिन

वहाँ प्रतिभा की कहां तक गुंजाइश है, यह मुझे नहीं मालूम है। अगर वे गोटी बैठाने के काम में एक्सपर्ट हों तो अच्छा था। खैर, वह तो उनकी पसंदगी की बात है।

हम उनके लिए शुभाकामनाएं प्रकट करते हैं, वह जहां भी जायें हमारे सदन में तो रहेंगे ही। और इसलिए वे बीच-बीच में आकर कहेंगी कि क्या-क्या खुराफत होता है। कोई क्लिंग में बैठ नहीं जाता है, इसे भी आकर बताएंगी। धन्यवाद।

SHRI CHITTA BASU (West Bengal): Sir, I join all other colleagues, esteemed Colleague, of mine in expressing our gratitude for Mrs. Pratibha Patil who was here to guide the of this august. House in the capacity of Deputy Chairman of this House.

Sir, as you know, the Opposition in a House is an important part of any democratic institution. She, as far as we know, also functioned as an Opposition leader in one of the State legislatures of our country. The way she conducted the House, the way she tried to accommodate the Opposition in this House, naturally leads me to think that her experience as an Opposition leader in the legislature must have guided her. Therefore, Sir, we are deeply indebted to her—particularly this side of the House—for her efficient handling of the business of this House and providing opportunities, legitimate opportunities, for us to express our views. It is the consideration of the ruling party to place its members in any capacity where the party feels. I am really glad that she will be charged with greater responsibility, and I wish her all success in that. But so far as this House is concerned, she will be remembered for her politeness efficient conduct of the House, and more so, for her democratic approach to the Opposition in this House. And that

[Shri Chitta Basu

should be *thi* guiding principle in her future career also.

f once again expiess my gratitude to he..

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, associating myself with the esteemed colleagues of mine, I would extend my heartiest congratulations to Madam Shrimati Pratibha Patil. She has been so courteous and liberal towards Members like me.

j In every discussion, we Members belonging to small parties will be called to speak at the fag end of the discussion. But she has been very courteou_s and liberal in giving time to us. Whenever the House witnessed a tumultuous or a tem-F'-st-like situation, she tried to pose very tough. That is only superficially so. She has been very kind and very accommodating towa_ds u_s and so. she cannot be tough at ^aH. Superficial[^] she tried to pose \very tough.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, Madam Pati] has got a very distinguished and brilliant career throughout. She volunteered herself to serve in the border aieas when the Chinese attacked India. She was continuously elected to the Maharashtra Assembly. Now, she has been given a challenging task, a difficult assignment, to enter the Maratha battle despite a definite possibility of losing that battle. She will be remembered for her performance in the Rajya Sabha. From the core of my heart, I wish her a long life and all health and happiness for her.

DR. NAGEN SAIKIA (Assam): Mr Chairman, Sir, we shall miss Patibhaji in the Chair. A most aq ol Smaas s[^]BMie aus 'Xpt>[intelligent, respected, learned and fair

PUB 'SUIBIS

कुसुमादपि कोमलनी ब्रह्मदपि
कठोरानी

She was aiway_s very c;ea_r in he views, quick in her decisions, oold i_n implen.vsn_i-ing those decisions and fair to the opposition also. But sometimes she was hard while dealing with some problematic matters. However, she is a lady capable of giving leadership and commanding respect. During tli_e last two years, she conducted tho proceedings of the House moat effici-ciently and with all her ability. To my mind, it would have been much better if such a personality could be g.ven some status above party polities to serve the people and the country.

However, o_n my behalf and on behalf of m_v party, A.G.P. I wish her a long and happy life and hope that she would be able to serve nation for many many years to come.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO (Jammu and Kashmir): Mr. Chairman, Sir, on my own behalf and on behalf of the Jammu and Kishmir National Conference, I extend to Mrs, Pratibha Patil our best wishes for her ne_v assignment. Shrimati Pratibha Patil has dominated th_e scene in this House for abou_t two years. To my mind, she is an amalgam of a Rajput and Marath_a which, in real life, she> is. She was firm where firmness was needed. But she was leally polite and tactful while dealing with tha opposition. I think her responsibility was great when sh_e sat j_n the Chair in your absence. But I must say without any fear of contradiction that she performed her job very efficiently nd very ably. I wish her best of luck.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, as my friend Mi\ Gopalsamy said, outwardly she may have looked like a firm lady. But when you talked t_o her in her chamber or when you talked to her freely, you always found her as an embodiment of nobility. Not only that, I had the honour of having her in m_v house, in Srinagar. Kashmir. Though she was good enough to ac[^]cept my small invitation to come, and sa_w to it that she would not leave

Uj? house without seeing the bride, % brother's daughter. Or. thai ocasion. she happened to be there She sat up to 12 in. the mid-night to wi:h the Bride happiness. This is her personal character. Mr. chairman. Sir, having had good career in the Rajya Sabha, r w?i?h her best of Stick in her new assignment in Maharashtra and I hope that she will keep the tenner of her Party alive over there.

PROF SOITRENDRA BHATTACHARJEE (West Bengal)-, j cannot claim to have her acquaintance during the entire period of her office. I found her in action otiiy during the last few months. During that period what I saw of her impressed me. Sir both the Houses of Parliament are essentially political forums. And here those who are elected either to the Chair or to the Benches are political being?. But vvithin that constraint, Mrs. Patil was 4n fair as fair could be. I wish hsr nil success in her futur, life, including the current assignment which took - >way her from one chair to another. I wish her success even in that if there was any possibility of there being any good in that. Thank you. Sir.

SHRI KL K. P. SALVE; Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is my privilege and the privilege of my Party to associate itself with the very rich apt tributes paid by you and my colleagues on the right to Smt. Patil for the extremely meritorious and distinguished service she has rendered to this House during her tenure. She conducted herself, Sir, with consummate efficiency and ability.

Sir, having been in Lok Sabha, I agree with Atal Bihariji that the ^{task} f>f the Deputy Chairman here in this House is far more delicate far mor? cumbersome than the task of th? Deputy Speaker in the ot'ner House. In fact, she carries a major part of the brunt and, in fact, that brunt arises, Sir, as soon as y°u leave and the Opposition is at it, if I may use the word, best though I mean the

>ther way round, at that juncture. Sir, what has happened is that Atal Bihariji as just now said that this Deputy Chairman's Chair used to be that of the Opposition and why not it bt' eiven to i Opposition. Sir, hi? speeches in Hindi get imprinted in my head for their literary value and for their content, j remember, one of his seeches in Lok Sabha. Both of us were there in Lok Sabha. And either it was the Deputy Speake_r, or the Speaker who wa_s being replaced. And Atal Bihariji did not make a demand like this. In, fact, what he said is something which I still remember An, j if he challenges. I shall show it to him after doing proper research What he said was, "Sir, we in this House are excelling each other in disorderly behaviour and flaunt reckless arjd irresponsible allegations against each other. and this makes the task of the Chair more difficult and more onerous." I wish he had repeated that here today . . .

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: It is a solemn occasion.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: It is a solemn occasion and, therefore, I wish he naa repeated it so that we maZ:e your task easy here. Sir, we are here. This House has tremendous reputation and tremendous dignity. Sir, if I am wrong and if I do not get the speech out and show it to Atalji, II shall apologise to the House... (Interruptions;

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I am not denying it

SHRI M. K. P. SALVE; I wish I ... (Interruptions) I do not want to raise a controversy. Sir, everyone has paid tributes to Smt. Patil. Some people raised some controversies. I wish controversies had not been raised.

AN HON. MEMBER: Not contra, versies but' some facts.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Someone said that something should not have

[Shri N. K. P. Salve]

gone on record and that that is not fair. I for one wani that everything that happens in, this House should go on record. But that can ne_ver mean, Sir, that it i_s free for all for a31 the time to come. And whenever she was indignant. I submit, sir, that she was indignant only in th_e interests of ensuring that we do not go haywire and maintain the dignity of the House. And she has done that task remarkably well. We wish her all the luck.

Sir, someone has said, where has she ^one an_j why is she going. Sir, sh_e is °-ⁿ-e Wⁿo^{nas} sacrificed g<-"ory and power of the high office that she had here and responded to the call of duty at the behest of ou_r high command. I congratulate her and wish he_r all the best in th_e new assignment she has taken. Sh_e will bring the same consummate skill ;_n the new assignment she has on her head which is dedicate and difficult and ^{we} wish her well otherwise in her life. Thank you.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra) ;
Mr. Chairman, sir, with you_r permission I am going to speak in Marathi . . .

AN HON. MEMBESR: Translation is not there, sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kulkarni, you know that th_e normal practice is that if you are speaking in Marathi, you should have cautioned the House. Now you come back to English.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA (Maharashtra); Sir, he is going to pay tributes to Pratibhaji and she understands Marathi.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But it is not a dialogue

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Has the
Marathi Interpreter come? „ ...^,

MR. CHAIRMAN: If the Marathi interpreter i_s not there, I can give time to someone eC_{se} no_w and you can speak later.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Sir, I am ready to interpret. I am prepared to Sit in th_e booth and translate.

SHRI DHARANIDHAR BASUMATARI: (Assam): While associating with the sentiments expressed by you. Sir, I want to tell you only one thing. I had the privilege of meeting her as a Mmist_r, there in Bombay when I was th_e Chairman of the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Parliament a ry Committee. When v/e discussed the matters with her she impressed m- and the Committee very much. After discussing w_{ith} her, I ta_{ne} and met Prime Minister, Indi-rE'ii, and tol_{cj} her all the details, the ways she suggested we will develop the rfight of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Prime Minister, Indiraji, appreciated this very much She said. Basumatari, I hav_e an eye on her, so she i_s very race, not only nice, but I have a special liking for her. This is what Prime Minister Indiraji told me. Since ther, I know he_r very well.

When she came here as Deputy Chairman, I was very happy. I wel come all that sentiments that have been expressed here by the Members, especially the opposition Members like Mr. Gopalsamy. As an old man. I wish her long life and at the same tim_e prosperous life. And when our Prime Minister, shri Raji_v, Gandhi selected her to be the President of the Maharashtra Congress Committee, there is a meaning in it. So she will succeed. I pray to God so that her prosperity goes up and up; Thank you.

श्री (श्रीमती) नाजमा हेपतुल्ला :
महोदय, आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद,
आपने मुझे बोलने की इजाजत दी।
प्रतिभा जी हमारे हाउस की दो साल तक

डिप्टी चैयरमैन रहीं इसलिए एक महिला होने के नाते मेरा फर्ज है कि कुछ न कुछ इस बारे में बोलूँ ।

मिर्फ दो चीजों के बारे में मैं पहले कह दूँ । अटल बिहारी जी ने उन्हें कठोर कहा । मुझे पता नहीं अटल बिहारी जी का एकसपीरिएन्स महिलाओं के बारे में कितना है ?

श्री समापति : अभी अभी न्यूयार्क से आ रहे हैं, ताजा एकसपीरिएन्स है ।

डा० (अभिमत) राजमा हेपतुल्ला : क्योंकि प्रतिभा जी से ज्यादा सॉफ्ट स्पोकन शायद इस हाउस में कोई दूसरी महिला नहीं है । इसलिए किस तरह से उन्हें उन्होंने कठोर जाना, यह मुझे नहीं मालूम । मुझे हिन्दी का इंग्लिश में तर्जुमा कठोर का पता नहीं है, मगर उनको ... (व्यवधान)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मैंने प्रतिभा जी को कठोर नहीं कहा, उनकी कृति को कठोर कहा, दोनों में अन्तर

डा० (अभिमत) राजमा हेपतुल्ला : यह बारीक अन्तर तो मेरी जैसी मोटी अकल में जलने वाला नहीं है । इसलिए मैं यह अहंती कि प्रतिभा जी के लिए अगर यह कहा जाय कि वे डिसिप्लिनाड डिप्टी चैयरमैन थीं तो मैं मानूंगी । हमारे जैसे टरब्युलेन्ट हाउस में जहाँ पर शोर-शरावा राज हो, इतनी अच्छी तरह से चुप करा लेना, मुझे लगता है कि बड़ा मुश्किल काम है जिसको उन्होंने बहुत अच्छी तरह से निभाया है इस हाउस में मेरा दूसरा टर्म है और बहुत से लोगों का मैंने काम करते हुए देखा है । जिस तरीके से ये दो साल उन्होंने निकाले है वो बहुत मुश्किल थे । हमारी राज्य सभा की डिप्टी चैयरमैन की सीट पर तो लॉस है, लेकिन जरूर प्रतिभा जी हमारे साथ हाउस में रहेंगी । लेकिन यहाँ जो हमारा लॉस है, मुझे यकीन है, हमारे

महाराष्ट्र के लिए, मैं महाराष्ट्र से आती हूँ, हमारे लिए एक बड़ा ग़म है ।

दूसरा मुझे लगता है कि थोड़ा अन्दाजा हमारे गुरुदास्वामी जी की तकरीर से लगता है कि वे नहीं चाहते कि वे वहाँ भी मक्सिमफुल रहे, उन्हें इस बात का ख़दशा है । मैं उन्हें यकीन दिलाती हूँ कि जैसे वे यहाँ पर मक्सिमफुल रही हैं, उतनी ही और उससे भी ज्यादा वे वहाँ मक्सिमफुल रहेंगी क्योंकि प्रतिभा जी ने काफी समय महाराष्ट्र में गुजारा है । वे वहाँ पर हर पोजीशन पर रही हैं । मिनिस्ट्रियल पोस्ट पर भी और सीडर आफ दी अपोजीशन के पद पर भी । मुझे यकीन है कि गुरुदास्वामी जी की ख़्वाहिश पूरी नहीं होगी और हमारी जरूर पूरी होगी ।

﴿تاکت (دیوبندی) نچمه هیبت اللہ﴾

(مہاراشٹری) : مہودے - آپ کا بہت

بہت دہلیزبان - آپ نے مجھے بولنے

کی اجازت دی - پرتمہا جی ہمارے

ہاؤس کے دو سال تک قیامی

چیرمین رہیں - امانتے ایک مہینہ

ہونے کے ناطے مہرا فرض ہے کہ کچھ

اس بارے میں بولوں -

صرف دو چیزوں کے بارے میں

میں پہلے کہوں - اٹل بھاری جی

نے انہیں کتھور کہا - مجھے یہ

نہیں - اٹل بھاری جی کا ایک-چیرمین

مہینوں کے بارے میں کہتا ہے -

شہری - چھایتی : ابھی ابھی

دیوبارک سے آ رہے ہیں - تازہ

ایکسچینجس ہے -

डाकटो (शुभेती) नज्मे हेमित الله :

कौनके पुत्रेमा जी - नमाने सफत
 असुवन शायद अस हस मीन कौनी
 दुसरी महेला नहीन हे - अल्ले
 कसप्रच से अनौन अनौन २ कठोर
 जाना - मजे मलूम नहीन - मजे
 हलदी का नकल मीन त्रजे कठोर
 का पत्ते हे - मगर नको ... (मखलत)

श्री अल्ल भवान् बाजीकुनी :

ने पुत्रेमा जी को कठोर नहीन कहा -
 अन्की कौनी को कठोर कहा दुनौन मीन
 अन्तर हे -

डाकटो (शुभेती) नज्मे हेमित الله :

ये मारिक अन्तर तो मदी जेसी
 - वती अल्ल मीन जाने वां नहीन हे -
 अस ल्ले मीन ये कौनी अ पदमा
 जी कौले अर ये कहा अन्ने के वे
 तसुअन्त कौनी जी - मीन तौन तो
 मीन - मारुवा - हमारे जेसे त्रप्रावत
 हास मीन जेहा दर शूर शूरुमा रोज
 हो - अन्नी अचीन प्रच से जे
 करा लीना - मजे लकटा से के हो
 مشکل काम हे जसो अनौन ने भेत
 अचीन प्रच से नदमा हे - अस
 हास मीन मीन दर-दर-दर-दर हे अर
 भेत से लौकौन को मीन ने काम कौने
 होले नकमा हे - जस प्रचित से ये
 दो साल अनौन ने नकाले मीन ये भेत
 مشکل ते - हमारी रज्जे महेनी

दिल्ली जीव मीन की सित पर लस
 हे लिकन मरु पुत्रेमा जीन हमारे
 साने हस मीन देवेर की - लिकन
 येहा जी मारा लस हे मजे भेतिन
 हे हमारे महेराशत्रु कौले - मीन
 महे राशत्रु से अन्नी हौन हमारे ल्ले
 एक हो कौन हे -

दुसरा मजे लकटा हे के नहोरा
 अन्ना हे मारे कौदा सारी जी की
 त्रदर से लकटा हे के वे नहीन चाहते
 के वे येहा भी ससुमर फल रहेन-
 अनौन अस बात का खुशे हे - मीन
 भेतिन दली हौन के जेसे वे येहा
 पर ससुमर फल रहेन मीन - अन्नी
 ही अर अस से नमाने वे येहा
 ससुमर फल रहेन की - कौनके
 त्रप्रेमा जी ने कासी से महेराशत्रु
 मीन कौदा हे - वे येहा पर हो
 पुत्रेतिन मीन रहेन मीन - मन्सुमर
 पुत्रेतिन ये भी अर लिकर अ दी
 अन्नी मीन के पद पर ये - मजे
 भेतिन हे के कौदा सारी जी की
 खल्ल मीन येहा होकी अर हमारी
 मरु येवी होकी -

*SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra); Sir I want to speak in Marathi. We are listening to farewell speeches by Hon'ble Members in honour of Smt. Pratibha Patil, who resigned the office of Deputy Chair man recently. All the Hon'ble Members expressed words of goodwill for

"English translation of the original Speech delivered in Marathi."

her and also expressed their confidence in her. As a Maharashtrian I feel very proud of her. I saw her occupying the post of Deputy Chair, man. As *j* was not a member of Maharashtra Legislative Assembly] MS o% Xjranjioddo oip 9Auq jou pip her as the leader of the opposition For many years she was a Minister in Maharashtra Government. Si wee I do not approach Ministers, I never had the occasion to meet her as a Minister. But i have been a member of this House for last two years and during this period I came in contact with her. This is my fourth term in Rajya Sabha and I am glad to mention that I was impressed by the style of functioning of Smt. Pratibha Patil.

Marathi is a very rich language and the word Pratibha is used in more than one sense. Only a Marathi knowing person will appreciate many dimensions of this word.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE:
This word is there in Hindi too.

! SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: But I do not know whether it has the same dimensions of meaning as it is there in Marathi. The "THENCE" lustre of the word 'Pratibha' was really befitting her when she occupied the Chair.

I feel that some members of opposition misunderstood her. Many interpret her going to Maharashtra as the Pradesh Congress Committee President a promotion and some others feel that it is a demotion. When one works as soldier of a party one has to accept the instructions of one's leader in all humbleness. And Smt. Patil worked here in that spirit. While resigning now she also gave up the power that she enjoyed here. She is having Delhi because she has to obey the command of the party of which she is a member.

Another point was raised that last two years were very turbulent for Government and for this House also.

When the country is progressing it is natural that there will be confrontation of old and new values. You also may be having the same experience. Chairman Sir, in your absence should I lead to preside in the House. This has happened because of the clash of values and charged political atmosphere. Once need not be an July worried about it. But I would proud that Smt. Pratibha Patil held her office with dignity in spite of this atmosphere. I would congratulate her for her success. And Maharashtrian people are very glad about this development. After her going there, many problems, the party will be solved. Maharashtrian people have accepted her new assignment very gladly. They were happy that the Maharashtra Pradesh Congress Committee President will give them opportunity to serve the society. On this occasion I express my best wishes for her success. Many of you may not know, that her husband is a Member of Maharashtra Legislative Assembly. Her family has a political background. She herself was a Minister for about ten to fifteen years and she was very efficient as a Minister. Here also she very successfully held the office of Deputy Chairman.

I wish her great success in this new assignment and hope that the whole House will bless her.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER). Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, it is said that parting is often sad but we have a great consolation in the present situation. Though Shrimati Pratibha Patil has laid down her office as the Deputy Chairman of this House the consolation is that she will continue with us as a Member. The time of laying down office or time to bid farewell, well is also an occasion for judging the person. The speakers of different hues have paid rich tributes to her. I was closely watching their expressions whether there was any extravagance or hyperbole in their expressions. I

[Shri P. Shiv Shanker]

I am glad to say that all the Members have spoken the reality of the situation. They did not indulge in platitudes and this is a measure of confidence that the House has in her capacity, in her ability and in the multifaceted personality that she possesses. Though a diminutive figure, the exterior being soft her interior had been very strong. She has handled this House, as one of my friends on the other side has said, in the most tumultuous and tempestuous times that handling was so adept that it undoubtedly infused a confidence in one and all. That she had been able to carry the House without any problems in your absence, Sir, is itself a matter of not only a great satisfaction to us but it is a great satisfaction to the democratic process in this country. Sir, permit me to say that in successfully running the proceedings of this House she had her own share. *Applause* if it is no reflection on you, may I just submit, as it has often been said by way of adage, behind every successful man there is a woman. Her contribution had a share in the success of the working of the House and, I must say, in the success that you have achieved in the conduct of this House her contribution is also there. J

Sir, her life had been varied, as some of the Members have referred to. She was the commandant of the Home Guard at Lalgaon during the period of the Chinese war with us and that she offered to go on the borders to serve the cause of the country speaks volumes of her fortitude and courage that she possesses. She had been in the public service as Mr. Kulkarni has observed, for a long time. It is for more than two decades that she had been a Member of the Legislative Assembly. She has had varied experience in her career. She had been in the position she had been on the treasury benches. Perhaps, it is going through these rigorous that has en-

abled her to have a great advantage in conducting the proceedings of this House.

I wish her well in the new assignment that has been conferred on her. I have no manner of doubt that she would succeed in any position which she comes to occupy.

With these words, while bidding farewell to her, I wish her all success.

SHRIMATI PRATIBHA DEVISINGH PATIL (Maharashtra); Sir, I am grateful to you and my other colleagues who have just now spoken for the very kind and nice words about me. Rich compliments and tributes have been paid. I do not know how far I deserve those but, for the generosity of the Members who spoke, I must thank them extremely well.

I was elected as the Deputy Chairman of this House on 18th November, 1975; I thank my leader, Shri Rajiv Gandhi, for giving me this opportunity and I thank the House for electing me as the Deputy Chairman

During these two years in my office I had the privilege of presiding over the deliberations of this House and receiving the cooperation and help from all the sections of the House. Rashtrapati Shri Venkatarama Reddy was the Chairman when I first took over the charge of Deputy Chairmanship. I learnt a lot from him and I must thank him for the guidance and cooperation extended towards me by him.

I am beholden to you also, Sir, for your guidance and support extended to me from time to time. I consider it my proud privilege that I had the opportunity of working with the President and Vice-President of India and

to closely associate myself with them and offer my services.

The last two years had been momentous and of great significance to our country. Important matters concerning the different States were discussed, important Bills were discussed. Important decisions were taken. The House discussed about drought and floods. Sometime there was a drought of the presence of Members in the House and sometime a flood of emotions when sensitive matters were discussed. On many such occasions, tumultuous scenes and a turbulent House were witnessed. Disorder took place and those were the trying and testing times for the Chair. I do not know whether I fully succeeded in my duty as the Deputy Chairman. But so far, as I am concerned, I can say that I did my duty discharging my functions with the sole object of preserving our parliamentary system and the rights of the Members, though it appeared 'kathore' to some of our friends. In the process I have made any mistakes or errors, or hurt the feelings of any Member. I beg pardon and forgiveness. It was not intentional and it was only momentary.

I started my life as a legislator in 1982 in the Maharashtra Assembly. At that time I was overwhelmed with the thought that this was the temple of democracy where I had the honour to enter and I must preserve and protect the high traditions and the dignity of the House. Because only by preserving those high traditions and the dignity of the House would it be possible for us to look after the welfare of the poor and welfare of the people at large and integrate our country, make it strong and take it on the greater path of prosperity and progress.

Sir, history has cast responsibility on our shoulders. It is the duty of each and every Member of the House to put his or her shoulder to the wheel.

Once again, I would like to thank you, Sir very sincerely and like to thank the Prime Minister and the Leader of the House, Shri Shiv Shan-Kerji. I would like to thank the Parliamentary Affairs Minister Shri Bha-iJatji, and also my colleague who was always running up and down—Mr. Jacob—and all the Members who have spoken here about me. I would also like to thank the Rajya Sabha Secretariat for the ever ready cooperation and willing help. I would also like to thank the Marshal and the Chamber Attendants. Before I conclude

मैं कुछ हिंदी में भी कहना चाहती हूँ। मैंने सभी का बहुत धन्यवाद किया है, जो भी आनरेबल मेम्बर और हमारी पोलिटिकल पार्टियों के ग्रुप लीडर्स हैं इन्होंने जो सम्पूर्णित्व दिये हैं इसके लिए मैंने सबका धन्यवाद किया है और मैं बार-बार धन्यवाद देती हूँ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी ने कहा कि मैं बहुत कम समय इस नेगर पर थी और इसलिए कोई अगर कम समय रहे तो राय ब्रह्मा कठिन है। मैं श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी की यह कठिनाई समझ सकती हूँ। एक तो मैं डिप्टी चेयरमैन थी और वह भी लेडी डिप्टी चेयरमैन।

तो ऐसे इसमें असम करना कठिन तो है और जिस व्यक्ति ने—मुझे पता नहीं कि वाजपेयी साहब की उम्र कितनी है—50-55 तो होगी ही।

श्री सभापति : अभी कहाँ, 35 होगी।

एक माननीय सदस्य : 45 साल है।

एक माननीय सदस्य : नहीं 35 साल होगी।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : किसी पुरुष से उसकी उम्र नहीं पूछनी चाहिए

श्रीमती प्रतिभा देवीसिंह पाटील :
नहीं, मैं उम्र नहीं पूछ रही हूँ। . . .
(व्यवधान)

श्री परवतनेनि उपेन्द्र : और वह भी
फिरसे बेवजह से। . . . (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती प्रतिभा देवीसिंह पाटील : मैं
क्या कहना चाहती हूँ, आप मुझसे की
कोशिश की। मैं यह कह रही हूँ कि
अपनी पचास या पचपन साल की उम्र में
अपने जीवन में लाने की किसी एक
महिला के बारे में वह राय नहीं बना
सके, तो कोई डिप्टी चैयरमैन जो दो
माल के लिए थी, उसके लिए वह क्या
कह सकते हैं।

तो मैं आपकी कठिनाई जरूर समझती
हूँ और वगैरह राय बनाने के भी जो
आपने अच्छे शब्द बड़े, इसके लिए मैं
आपकी बहुत आभारी हूँ।

मैं नती मदन का भी बहुत आभारी हूँ
और चैयरमैन नाहक आपकी तो
बहुत-बहुत आभारी हूँ। . . .

SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION Bofors gun deal

UR. CHAIRMAN: Short Duration
Discussion. Shri Gurupadaswamy.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA
(Andhra Pradesh): I am on a point of
order.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh): Sir,
point of order. We have also given you
certain notices for discussion on the most
baseless, malicious; and politically motivated
allegations made by Shri V. P. Singh against
Mr. Gandhi, our Prime Minister, What has
happened to our notices?

MR. CHAIRMAN: This was decided in
the meeting of the leaders of the Opposition
and your party leaders also.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: What will happen
to our notices?

MR. CHAIRMAN.- You will discuss
everything...

SHRI ALADI ARUNA ABUS V. ARU-
NACHALAM < Tamil Nadu): You ask you-
leader as to what has happened in the
meeting.. . (Interruptions).. This is the
consensus.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shri Jagesh Desai)
in the Chair.]

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY
(Karnataka): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, in the
history of Parliament, we have discussed in
the past, many scandals, many sordid events.
We have debated the Mundhra scandal, we
have debated the j-cp scandal and, like that,
we have been discussing many sordid
developments in our body politic. But never
and never had we a scandal like Bofors with
gigantic Himalayan ramifications.

When this debate began in April last year,
I never thought that the Bofors gun deal
would give rise to controversies and such
vital and irreconcilable differences between
the ruling party and the Opposition.

This scandal has shaken in my view the
very moral foundation of our political
system. I am not looking at this obviously
from a narrow angle. I am not here to score
points against the Government and the ruling
party. I am raising this issue from a broader
angle whether our political system
can effectively deal with such scandals
effectively and in conformity with domestic
values and traditions we cherish.

Various things have been debated in the
past. The report of the Joint Parliamentary
Committee on Bofors gun deal has also been
debated. It is not necessary for me to go over
once again the whole ground which has been
covered. The Government, the various
Ministers and particularly the Prime Minister
have taken varying positions irreconcilable,
utterly contradictory positions so far as the
Bofors gun deal is concerned. One thing
stands out Sir, you will agree with me, that at
no time in these 40 years of our parliamentary
life have we seen the