

। श्री चतुरानी मिश्र : अभी उस मेक्शन 9 का इम्प्लीमेंटेशन नहीं हुआ . . .
(व्यवधान) यह तो गलियार्ड का इम्प्लीमेंटेशन हुआ कि चेक्चन किया तब उन्होंने किया ।

श्री समापति : वह कह रहे हैं कि आपके सबल करने के पहले बुलाई गयी । . .

श्री चतुरानी मिश्र : कब चेक्चन टेबल किया गया और कब उन्होंने बुलाई गइयता है ।

श्री समापति : कैटेगोरिकली स्टेटमेंट है कि इन सबल के पहले जाने के पहले वह मोशन बुलाई गयी ।

श्री राम अग्रवेश सिंह : डेट बता दीजिए ।

श्री समापति : डेट आप देख लीजिएगा ।

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, can you club question No. 2 and 3? (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: No clubbing.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I am not asking you to club me. I am asking you to club the question.

Pre-flight examination of pilots for alcohol consumption

*2. SHRI BHAGATRAM MANHAR†

SHRI BIR BHADRA PRATAP SINGH;

Will the Minister of CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that it is compulsory to conduct pre-flight alcohol medical examination on Indian Airlines pilots before taking off;

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Bhagatram Manhar.

(b) if so, what is the number of cases detected during the last three years where the tests have shown the pilots to be under the influence of alcohol and the action taken against them; and

(c) whether Government are aware that in a number of such cases reports are signed by the doctors without proper medical check-ups; if so, what is the number of such cases noticed so far during the last three years and the action taken against the erring doctors?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM (SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL):

(a) Yes, Sir. Pilots of Indian Airlines are subjected to pre-flight medical examination before operating flights from the originating stations and from outstations where they night-stop.

(b) During the last three years, only one case was detected and the pilot involved was placed under suspension.

(c) No, Sir. No such case has come to notice.

SHRI BHAGATRAM MANHAR: Sir, according to the practice prevalent throughout the world, pre-flight alcohol medical examination is carried out by the Airlines doctor on pilots to know whether the pilots have consumed alcohol. Sir, the Indian Airlines have a number of doctors on their panel who are paid for such pre-flight alcohol tests on pilots before they take off. This practice has been in vogue only on paper and no tests are carried out by doctors as far as my information is concerned. Sir, I would like to know from the Minister whether it is true that the pilot of the ill-fated Boeing at Ahmedabad was in the habit of getting blank test reports from the doctors, and if so, whether he obtained a blank test report on the date of accident. If not, what were the contents of the report issued on that date?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, the practice is that before the pilot goes to the cockpit, he is examined by the doctor and if the doctor finds that the pilot is not steady, if his pupils are dilated, if he is smelling alcohol, then there are other tests to be carried out. The breath analyser test is one such test. Then the pulse is also measured and the blood is also taken. But if he is steady and if he does not smell alcohol and is in a normal condition, the doctor examines him and issues the certificate and with that certificate, he goes to the cockpit. In this case, I have no information to say that he was under influence of alcohol or not. (*Interruption*)... The information given to me is that he was normal.

SHRI BHAGATRAM MANHAR: Sir, with regard to the appointment of doctors or medical tests on pilots, I would like to know the criteria selected for the appointment of these doctors and what facilities are provided to them at the airports for pre-flight medical tests and whether the pilots are examined at the airports or at the clinics of these doctors before taking off.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, we have doctors who are on contracts and at the time of the flight, they are available at the airport and at certain places, they are sitting there. They do have the instruments, the breath analyser and other instruments which are used by them to test the pilots and after testing the pilots, they give certificates.

SHRI BIR BHADRA PRATAP SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am somewhat surprised by the Minister's reply. Even in today's 'Hindustan Times' there is a box news. It is definitely after the question is put up here that the case has been detected. But in part (c) of the reply the Minister says that no such case has come to his notice. Even after the Government is put on alerts by the question, the Government is sleeping and cases are detected. The sum and substance of my question is this. According to him the practice is, doctors examine before the take-off. But the actual practice is, doctors sign blank certificates sitting at home. I would like to know from the hon. Mi-

nister whether he will make a thorough enquiry into such irresponsible acts by subordinate officers and see that doctors do not sign certificates sitting at home and do not play with the lives of innocent citizens.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I do appreciate the concern expressed by the hon. Member. We have to take all the steps to see that those who fly are not under the influence of liquor. There is a procedure laid down for this purpose and we are following that procedure. We are asking the Indian Airlines and Air India and other organizations to go into the procedures and find out if there are any modifications necessary. If modifications are necessary, certainly we can take action. But we will go by the advice given by experts in these cases. The hon. Member said that some newspaper reports had appeared. We shall have to realise that this question relates to the Indian Airlines and not to other organisations. I am answering questions about the Indian Airlines. Some certificates, some printed material, also have appeared in which these signatures are there. But a procedure is laid down that if it is found that he is under the influence of alcohol and other tests are required, that is done.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Minister has said that there are procedures laid down and they are following the procedures. The procedure is that they have to fill certain things. I am referring to a particular blank. There is one item which says that it has not been followed properly. That item is, 'B.P. not routine'. That particular blank does not contain this. If this could be an instance where the doctor did not record the B.P. because he has not entered it—is specifically said that it is not to be routine—if that is the case, I would like to know from the Minister whether, with regard to the various accidents or near accidents, the doctors' reports had been routine signatures or whether they had gone into the details as required under the procedure which the Minister himself points out.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I think the hon. Member is referring to a certain thing which has appeared in a magazine. I would like to inform this august House that this had happened in 1983. That is point No. 1. This was done by a doctor and he is not in the service now; he is removed. This is point No. 2 Thirdly,.....

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Was he removed because of this or because the contract ended?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: There are many things. If you sit down, I will explain. This doctor is no more in the service. We have found that he is deficient in his attention to these things. So he is removed. What has appeared in the magazine relates to 1983, long back. And today, this is not the form we are following. After that some steps have been taken. And a different kind of form is being followed. This was the form followed in 1983. This is the form we are following since 1984. And in this form all the formalities that have to be followed, I am told, are being followed. And yet I appreciate the anxiety of the honourable Members. I have told them, if this has come to our notice, we should go deep into the matter and we should find out what is actually being done. They have been telling me that proper attention is paid to all those things. Yet I am asking them to examine and whatever is necessary in this respect shall be done.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: If *India Today* is misleading the public they should take them to the Press Council. Why are they not doing that?

डा. (श्रीमती) नाजमा हेपतुल्ला : सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री महोदय के सामने यह बात कहूँगी, क्योंकि ये दो हादसे इंडियन एयर लाइंस के एक ही दिन हुए जिससे पूरे देश में एक तरह की हलचल बढ़ी और लोग काफी परेशान हुए। जिस मैगज़ीन का इन्होंने जिक्र किया है उस मैगज़ीन में खबर इस हादसे से पहले आई थी और सभी

जानते हैं कि इंडियन एयर लाइंस में इतने कम जहाज हैं कि उसमें फेटिक होना जरूरी है। जहाज तक टैस्टिंग का सवाल है, अल्कोहल के, इसके बारे में भी मेरी जो इत्तिला है, उसके संबंध में मैंने एक चिट्ठी भी मंत्री जी के पहले जो इस विभाग के मंत्री जी थे उनको भेजी थी। इंडियन एयर लाइंस के स्टाफ में डिसिप्लिन की बहुत कमी है और यह टैस्टिंग भी डिसिप्लिन में आता है। जो नार्म्स हैं उनको पालाट किया जाता है और न सिर्फ पाइलेट, जो लोग कैबिन में काम करते हैं वे भी डिसिप्लिन से काम नहीं करते हैं। अगर हमारे एयर लाइंस में डिसिप्लिन नहीं रहेगा तो उसके अंदर इस तरह के हादसे आइदा भी हो सकते हैं। मैं मंत्री महोदय...

श्री सभापति : यह सवाल अल्कोहल पर है।

(Interruption)

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA: I thought this is a very serious question we are asking concerning the Indian Airlines. If there is indiscipline at every stage, definitely it is going to...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: There should be discipline in asking question also.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA: Yes, yes; I know. I would like to ask the honourable Minister, when they are taking out all these norms, whether they are showing more concern about discipline in the entire working of the Indian Airlines and Air India.

श्री शिवराज पाटिल : श्रीमन, प्रश्न पहले हिन्दी में शुरू हुआ था इसलिये मैं हिन्दी में ही जवाब देने की कोशिश करूँगा। सम्माननीय सदस्या ने जो कहा है उसको ध्यान में रखना बहुत जरूरी है और हम उसको जरूर ध्यान में रखेंगे। एक पब्लिक सैक्टर अंडरटेकिंग के तहत यह काम चलता है। जहाँ तक मेरी समझ की बात है, एक जगह, दो जगह, तीन जगह कहीं अजवाब के रूप में कहीं किसी ने गलत बिहेवियर, हो सकता है, किया होगा लेकिन उसकी वजह से सारे

लोगों को दोष देने के पहले थोड़ा सा हमें इस पर केयरफुली सोचना होगा और उसके अनुसार हम काम करना चाहेंगे। जहां तक डिसिप्लिन की बात है, इसमें दो रायें नहीं हो सकती कि कहीं भी, किसी भी काम के बारे में हो, अनुशासन होना जरूरी है और अनुशासन है ऐसा हम समझते हैं। अगर आप सब लोगों की राय अनुशासन को और बढ़ाने की है तो इसके बारे में भी जरूर सोचेंगे।

श्री शंकर सिंह बाघेला : चेयरमैन सर, जहां यह घटना हुई वहां मैं 8.30 बजे पहुंच गया था और पाइलट की गलती...

श्री सभापति : मि. बाघेला...

श्री शंकर सिंह बाघेला : मैं अल्कोहल पर आता हूँ... (व्यवधान)... यह पाइलट का जो

MR. CHAIRMAN: What you are talking about is.....

श्री शंकर सिंह बाघेला :
I am asking the question. The pilot was under a heavy effect of alcohol.

क्या कैप्टन दलैया इसके पहले कभी अल्कोहल एफेक्ट के नीचे पकड़े गये थे ? क्या सुबह जब वो एयर क्राफ्ट पर काफ़ीपेट में इंटर हुए थे तो क्या उससे पहले पिये हुए थे ? कैप्टन दलैया ने शराब पी थी ? क्या उनका मेडिकल चेकअप हुआ था और अगर हुआ था और उसका प्रूफ है तो उसको यहां प्रोड्यूस करिये। दो वफा पहले कैप्टन दलैया का रिजक्शन भी हुआ था। आज भी रिपोर्ट है कि 15 में से 7 लोगों को जो और अल्कोहल एफेक्ट में थे, उनको आपने नौकरी जाने से रोका। 15 में से 7, नियरली 50 परसेंट यह आपने चेक किया, 50 प्रतिशत अल्कोहलिक असर के नीचे पाये गये। तो यह पीए हुए लोग सब का सत्यानाश करने जा रहे थे। तो क्या कैप्टन दलैया सुबह से पीए हुए थे या नहीं थे, अगर नहीं

थे तो आपके पास इसका क्या सबूत है ? क्या वह पहले भी कभी पकड़ा गया था या नहीं ?

श्री शिवराज पाटिल : दलाया का स्वर्गवास हुआ है, दलाया स्वयं इस हादसे में चले गये हैं।

श्री सभापति : मरे हुए के बारे में नहीं बोलना चाहिए।

श्री शिवराज पाटिल : मैं इस बारे में यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि मेरे पास जो इन्फार्मेशन है उसके आधार पर मैं यह कह सकता हूँ कि उनके खिलाफ कोई शराब पीने या बुरा बर्ताव करने की रिपोर्ट नहीं है। दूसरी बात यह है कि मैंने उनके साथियों से पूछा है, मैं उनको कभी नहीं मिला था और मैंने उनको कभी देखा भी नहीं था। जो हमारे अधिकारी इण्डियन एयरलाइंस में काम करने वाले हैं उनके साथी हैं उनसे उनके बर्ताव के बारे में पूछा था तो उन्होंने कहा कि वे निहायत मजिदा किस्म के आदमी थे सावर किस्म के आदमी थे और ऐसी चीज उनके खिलाफ हमारे सामने कभी नहीं आई और जो यह रिपोर्ट है कि वे पीए हुए थे मेरे दयाल में गलत है।

श्री सभापति : अभी जांच हो रही उसकी। श्री कलमाडी।

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Sir, I agree that there is some sort of pre-flight check done on the pilots. But there is no doubt in my mind that it needs to be strictly enforced and much, greater care and attention have to be paid to that part, in that sector. I would like to know whether in the case of the pre-flight check especially in the last flight which landed—these days flights are late quite often—you noticed some flight crew entering the cockpit with glasses at frequent intervals of twenty minutes or so and I would also like to know whether in the last flight post-flight check also has been carried out by the Indian Airlines.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In the cockpit? Do they drink in the cockpit?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, Mr. Kalmadi was a pilot.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Sir, I was not in the Indian Airlines, but I was in the Indian Air Force.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You were in the Indian Air Force?

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Yes, Sir.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I am trying to explain that on board the IA aircraft we do not carry any liquor. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: But what about the passengers? Passengers regularly carry... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Is it banned or not? That is the question... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Is it banned?... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I have not completed yet. Sir, we do not carry any liquor on board the IA aircraft. It is only the Air-India which carries liquor. Whether any private person is carrying any liquor and whether any crew member is consuming it—these are all things which have to be examined and up to this time we have not come across any instance in which this has happened; at least I do not know. I have to find out.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I hope you will see that it does not happen.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I think it does not happen. As far as the specific question asked by Mr. Kalmadi is concerned, we test before the flight, we do the pre-flight test, but after the aircraft lands, we do not carry out any test. Now, this point which he has made will also be kept in mind to find out whether it is necessary and should be done.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sukomal Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Sir, with regard to the pre-flight check, and about the

doctors who conduct the pre-flight check, as far as I have been able to understand the Minister, doctors are on contract and they are available on time to check the pilots before they enter the cockpit. I would like to know whether the doctors are regularly appointed doctors in the Indian Airlines or they are hired on contract.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He said that they are on contract.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Then, Sir, if the doctors were on contract, what is the responsibility? They can sign a blank form and give it to the pilot. I would like to know whether after this accident Government would consider appointing regular doctors as employees of Indian Airlines so that they have some responsibility, they have some onus, for what they do. It is necessary.

Then, Sir, another point, about serving liquor: they do not serve liquor. But I have seen air hostesses serving ice to passengers who want to drink. Why do they carry ice? That can be served to pilots also if they drink.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, Air India has doctors in their service who check them. Indian Airlines have doctors on contract. There is a suggestion given by the hon. Member. We will keep it in mind and try to see what has to be done.

SHRI SATISH KUMAR SHARMA: Sir, we have a pre-flight medical system in Indian Airlines and Air India. I would like to know if the Vayudoot also has a similar system because we had on that fateful day two crashes, one involving Vayudoot Fokker Friendship. If they do not have that system, will the Minister give an assurance that a similar system, pre-flight medical system, will be introduced immediately for Vayudoot also?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Generally, Vayudoot is following in the footsteps of Indian Airlines.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Even in crashes also, *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: The procedures and rules generally are identical. But they do have their different procedures and rules. Now, Sir, if it is not there we will certainly like to introduce it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question. Question No. 3.

Crashes of Indian Airlines and Vayudoot aircraft

*3. SHRI SURESH KALMADI:†

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN
SWAMY:

Will the Minister of CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM be pleased to state:

(a) what were the reasons for the crashes in Indian Airlines and Vayudoot aircraft on the 19th October, 1988;

(b) whether Government are aware of the press reports regarding overuse and metal fatigue of the aircraft of these two airlines being the reasons for the crashes; if so, what is Government's reaction thereto;

(c) what is the accident record of these two airlines in International comparisons; and

(d) what steps Government propose to

take so that such incidents do not occur in future?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM (SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL): (a) The Central Government has ordered formal investigation under Rule 75 of the Aircraft Rules appointing Courts of Inquiry for accidents involving Indian Airlines aircraft at Ahmedabad and Vayudoot aircraft at Guwahati reasons for the crashes can be known only after the enquiries into these accidents are completed.

(b) Yes, Sir. The Government is aware of these press reports. Aircraft are being used to the extent possible without compromising on safety. Indian Airlines and Vayudoot are not overusing their aircraft. Maintenance of their fleet is done according to the prescribed schedule duly approved by the regulatory authorities.

(c) A comparison of record of fatal accidents of Indian Airlines aircraft with international record obtained from ICAO from 1981 to 1987 is attached as statement (see below).

(d) Administratively, review of safety maintenance and training aspects has been initiated. Based on the findings and causes of accidents established during the formal investigation by the Courts of Inquiry, further appropriate action will be taken.

Statement

Year	Fatal accidents to I.A. aircraft excluding third party fatalities	Rate of fatal accidents per 100 thousand take offs for Indian Airlines	Rate of Fatal accidents per 100 thousand take offs for all scheduled services (airlines) of ICAO contracting States.
1981.	Nil	0.000	0.20
1982.	Nil	0.000	0.25
1983.	Nil	0.000	0.19
1984.	Nil	0.000	0.14
1985.	Nil	0.000	0.19
1986.	Nil	0.000	0.13
1987.	Nil	0.000	Not available

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Suresh Kalmadi.