

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 3rd November, 1988/
12th Kartika, 1910 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock, Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Issue of Multi-purpose Identity Cards to Persons residing along Western Border

*21. SHRI SHANKER SINH VAGHELA:†

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN:

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) what is the number of persons to whom multi-purpose Identity Cards have been issued so far in the various Tehsils of the Districts along the Western Border under the Pilot Scheme for the issuance of such Cards and also the target fixed in this regard and with what results;

(b) what is the expenditure incurred thereon so far;

(c) by when the Scheme would be implemented in respect of the areas sensitive to smuggling activities in arms and other contraband goods and also in respect of the areas wherefrom terrorists cross the border; and

(d) whether Assam and West Bengal Governments have also requested for the introduction of such a Scheme in their border areas to check infiltration and other activities; if so, what is Central Government's response thereto?

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Shaanker Singh Vaghela.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV): (a) The State Governments of Rajasthan and Gujarat have so far issued 1,52,291 and 11,382 identity cards respectively under the pilot scheme for issue of identity cards taken up for implementation in 4 selected border tehsils of Rajasthan and one selected taluka of Gujarat. The target was to issue these cards to all eligible persons in these selected Tehsils.

(b) According to information supplied by the State Governments, expenditure of Rs. 49.84 lakhs and Rs. 8.17 lakhs has so far been incurred in Rajasthan and Gujarat respectively.

(c) and (d) For the present, this scheme, which is in the nature of pilot project, has been drawn up for selected areas in the States on the Western border only. While no request has been received from West Bengal Government, the State Government of Assam had requested for introduction of a scheme for identity cards throughout the State of Assam. The State Government have been informed that extension of the scheme to other areas, including Assam, will be considered only after the pilot scheme has been fully implemented and a proper evaluation made.

श्री शंकर सिंह वाघेला : चेयरमैन साहब, यह राष्ट्र की सुरक्षा के लिये पहचान-पत्र जारी करने की बात कही है। हमारे राष्ट्र की सुरक्षा चाहे वह हमारी सीमा जम्मू और कश्मीर से चालू होती हो या पंजाब से या नीचे राजस्थान, गजरात से या ईस्टर्न साइड में पश्चिमी बंगाल, बिहार, असम और बाकी के छोटे राज्यों से, इधर नीचे थोड़ा सा श्रीलंका है, वहाँ भी प्रोब्लम, हमारी सुरक्षा के बारे में हमारी सरकार गंभीर नहीं है, आप हमारे साथ खल रहे हैं। माननीय मंत्री जी क्या यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि यह जो पहचान-पत्रों की आपने

बात की हेचनी हुई तहसीलों के लिये, तो चार साल से तो मैं खुद जब से राज्य सभा में आया हूँ, तब से कच्छ में पाकिस्तानी, भुसपैठ की बात कर रहा हूँ, वहाँ की काईस वहाँ की करेसी कच्छ में चल रही है, मैंने पाकिस्तान के एक नागरिक को भी कहा था कि वह सरपंच वहाँ की एक गांव-पंचायत में बन गया है और वहाँ से स्मगलिंग, पूरा नारकोटिक्स पंजाब बोर्डर सील होने से चला आ रहा है। गुजरात में जो कम्युनल-राइट चल रहे थे, वहाँ से अनसोशल एलीमेंट आ रहे थे और जिसमें पाकिस्तान गुट का बहुत बड़ा हाथ था। तो आप यह कच्छ बोर्डर सील करन से कम्युनल-राइट्स रोक सकते हैं, स्मगलिंग, नारकोटिक्स ड्रग्स या दूसरे इन्स्ट्रूमेंट शस्त्र आ रहे हैं, उसको भी आप रोक सकते हैं। लेकिन आज तक आपने उसमें कुछ नहीं किया। आपने एक तहसील पसंद की है और कहा है कि 11,382 परिचय पत्र कच्छ में तथा 1,52,291 और परिचय पत्र जारी किये हैं। साथ ही इसमें आपने कहा है--सभी पात्र व्यक्तियों, सभी यानी कितने? आपके पास कितने लोगों की फिगर है, यह सभी यानी कितने लोगों को देना है? आपने यह भी कहा है--पात्र व्यक्तियों, पात्र व्यक्ति यानी वह सभी जो बोर्डर पर रहते हैं, सभी पात्र हैं। अगर आपने 50 लोगों को नहीं दिया तो आपकी इस स्कीम का कोई मतलब नहीं रहता। तो मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि "सभी" की आपकी डेफिनेशन क्या है और "पात्र व्यक्ति" कौन है? आप यह पायलट-स्कीम न रखने हुये इन्टीटल पर बोर्डर के हिसाब से सोचकर आइडेंटिटी-कार्ड सबको जारी करने के लिये सोच रहे हैं या नहीं?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV:

Sir, sealing of the border across West Pakistan or other areas is not the thrust of this question. But I fully appreciate the feelings of the hon. Member and this particular point is being taken care of by putting Border Security Force and others there. The idea of introduction of this pilot scheme was to

take care of infiltration for anti-national activities, terrorist activities, as well as for controlling smuggling, as the hon. Member has said, as I said in answer, this is a pilot project started in certain areas only and as the hon. Member has said, we have got suggestions both from Gujarat and Rajasthan Governments to extend the area contiguous to the border and we have given our approval for including other areas also. The cards are issued to permanent residents, temporary residents and visitors separately. The reason being that the population and the issue of cards is less because according to the present policy, those who are above 16 years, they are being issued cards and below 16 years cards are not being issued. That is why in the figures...

श्री शंकर सिंह वाघला : बिलो 16 वाले ही कैरियर हैं।

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV:

This is one of the areas in which the State Government has also given some proposal. We are examining this. I fully appreciate because they are also used by the smugglers and others. So, this is also being examined by us whether it can be increased and a decision has not been taken because we are seeing and evaluating the success of this particular scheme and the feedback we are getting from the State Government is quite encouraging and further steps will be taken and more funds will be provided in the future.

श्री शंकर सिंह वाघला : महोदय, बार-बार हमारे मंत्री जी राज्यों की बात करते हैं। प्रश्न के भाग "बी" और "सी" में इन्होंने कहा है कि पश्चिम बंगाल सरकार से कोई अनुरोध प्राप्त नहीं हुआ है। महोदय, मैं समझता हूँ कि इस में किसी राज्य की सीमा नहीं होती है, सीमा राष्ट्र की होती है। देश को इस बारे में चिंता करनी चाहिये, आपको चिंता करनी चाहिये। तो क्या

असम, बिहार, पश्चिम बंगाल—इन टोटल बंगला देश के बारे में और ऊपर से अरुणाचल में, चीन के बारे में, जो भी वहां से एंट्री हो रही है—इसके बारे में आपकी क्या स्कीम है? असम का तो पूरा क्षेत्र समस्याग्रस्त है जिसके लिये आपने पूरा असम खो दिया और पोलिटिकली कांग्रेस-जन हार गये। उस इश्यू को लेकर क्या आप कोई चिन्ता करने वाले हैं कि बंगलादेश की घुसपैठ पश्चिम बंगाल और असम में रोकी जा सके? क्या स्कीम है, आपके पास जिससे कि जितनी जल्दी हो सके आई० कार्ड्स इंट्रोड्यूस किये जा सकें?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV:

Sir, in the federal pattern of our country, without the consent of the States, it is not possible for us to implement the scheme but for Assam we have got the proposal. They want for the whole State. But their proposal is linked up with the foreigners and the citizens of Assam and the process of identification of foreigners is on there. Once it is settled, then only we can decide because now between 1962 and 1971 they have got all other rights other than the voting rights, but the proposal says to have two different kinds of cards. So, it will be difficult. And if we have to implement it, we have to see that legislation is passed to support this particular proposal of the State Government. We have not said, 'no'. We have said, once we have our experience of the present system in Gujarat and Rajasthan, then only we will consider about Assam. But we have taken care for protecting the borders in the North-Eastern Region, West Bengal and other areas. The number of check-posts has been increased and the deployment of para-military forces has also been increased, and we are alert to see that such infiltration does not take place.

श्रीमती वीणा वर्मा : सभापति जी, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहती हूँ कि प्रश्न के भाग "सी" में कहा गया है कि आसाम गवर्नमेंट ने भी इसी तरह का प्रस्ताव रखा है

कि इस तरह के आई० कार्ड्स सारे राज्य में लागू किये जाएँ। मैं अभी आसाम के नजदीक मोरे हिल्स से होकर आई हूँ। यह बर्मा बार्डर से लगी हुई है। वहाँ अभी पुलिस ने 40 बर्मी विद्यार्थियों को पकड़ा है और उनसे पूछताछ की है। इस समय बर्मा में संघर्ष चल रहा है इसलिए मैं जानना चाहती हूँ कि यह मणिपुर-बर्मा बार्डर के बीच का जो ओपन बार्डर है उसको पारकर के बहुत से टेरोरिस्ट्स आ सकते हैं और हमारा देश के लिये खतरा बन सकता है, इसलिये इस समस्या में निपटने के लिये क्या सरकार के पास आई० कार्ड्स इश्यू करने की कोई योजना विचाराधीन है या मणिपुर की सरकार ने ऐसा कोई प्रस्ताव किया है?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV:

Sir, the border area is so lengthy and so vast, it will be wrong to say that we will be able to seal all the borders but in each border we have taken special care, according to our present system, and especially in the sensitive areas. As regards the Burma-Manipur border, it is a fact that recently some people have come and we have kept them in camps to see that they do not go and mix up with the general population and India being a country traditionally looking after the people coming, we have decided to keep them in the camp and look after them. But we are taking care to see that no further infiltration takes place from Burma.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: The Government has introduced identity cards system in the western border. I think the purpose is to easily identify the number of infiltrators in the border areas. That is the purpose; otherwise, it will lead to the expenditure and also harassment for the people. I would like to know from the hon. Minister, after the introduction of this identity cards system in the western border, how many infiltrators, whether smugglers or traders have been arrested and nabbed by the Government.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: I do not have the figures with me but if the hon. Member wants, I will certainly pass it on to him.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Yes, I want.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: I will definitely do it.

DR. NAGEN SAIKIA: It seems from the reply of the Minister that he is not clear about the sealing of the border. I want to know from him what alternative measures he would propose to take to stop infiltration and, after that, to issue identity cards to the citizens.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: Infiltration can be stopped with the joint co-operation of the State and the Centre, and it is the joint responsibility and whenever any State Government asked for any help, we have rendered it, including Assam. As I said, check-posts in the land borders as well as different borders have been created and patrolling has been intensified. As I said, recently the Assam Government gave a statement that infiltration has stopped to the satisfaction of the State Government of Assam. I do not dispute it nor should the hon. Member dispute it. But for future, if identity cards scheme is to be implemented in Assam, as we have said, after our experience in two States of Gujarat and Rajasthan, we shall take a decision.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I have one or two clarifications to seek. First is about the border tehsils of Rajasthan where the scheme has been introduced. What percentage of population in these tehsils—and the hon. Minister knows which tehsils I am referring to: Chohtan, Nachra, Jaicalmer etc.—has been given the Identity cards? Implicit in the investigation prior to the grant of identity cards is the establishment of

Indian citizenship. Therefore, in the process, how many non-Indians did you identify? Has it come to your notice that the process of investigation has resulted in harassment and yet another avenue of corruption? What have you done about that? Government of Rajasthan has reported these cases; I have been in correspondence with the Ministry. And my final clarification is that as the grant of identity cards is linked with citizenship, is the card itself an index or identity of citizenship? If it is identity card of citizenship, then what about those to whom for administrative reasons or on account of policy or because of absence of policy or inefficiency or maladministration, you do not grant a card? What is their status so far as citizenship is concerned? I have one request. The hon. Minister got away and you permitted him to get away when a direct question was asked about number of people and he said he does not have the figures. This would be inadmissible because if he tries to play the same tricks, perhaps he will come under your protection.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: Sir, I am not a 'trick man'. I do not want to play any tricks. Whatever information I have, I will share with the august House.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: You must have the information.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: As far as his first question is concerned, in Pugal tehsil, the population as per the 1981 Census,...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am not asking about Tripura.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: You have asked about Rajasthan and I am giving the information in regard to Rajasthan only.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: In the Tripura elections, you have proved that you are capable.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: I will prove in future in the other States also. (Interruptions) Sir, shall I answer?

(Interruptions)

As far as the four tehsils of Rajasthan are concerned, in the case of Fugal, the population as per the 1981 Census was 9,433. Persons eligible—approximately—15,000. The reason being that in these areas because of some new projects having been started some people had come from outside. Therefore, there is difference between the existing figure and the Census figure. Applications received—13,046. Applications rejected—678.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: On what grounds?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: The number of cards issued—11,000.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, with your permission. There is a very substantial point here. The population as per the Census was 9,000 odd. We are talking here about the Pugal Tehsil of Bilaner District. The eligible persons were about 15,000. He says this is because of various projects. Sir, it is a border District. It is a desert district. What are the various projects because of which there is a difference between the Census figure and the figure of number of persons eligible? The figure is nearly double. The hon. Minister must explain this. The second thing is, he says that 700 odd applications have been rejected. On what grounds?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: Rejections are mainly due to the reason that they are not either permanent residents or they have no other documents to prove that they have been residing in that particular area. It does not mean that they are not citizens of India. But we are concerned with the people who are living in that particular area, either permanent or semi-permanent, where-

as this is floating population which comes from other parts of the State. (Interruptions) Let me finish. (Interruptions) Now, in the case of Nachna, —you will get the answer when I give the information in regard to the other tehsil—population—13,901. Eligible persons—12,000. Applications filled up—13,046. Applications rejected—948 and number of cards issued—7,225. In the case of Kanakpura, the figures are: population—1,4000. Persons eligible—1,05,000. Applications—66,745. Applications rejected—1170. Number of cards issued—63,313. In the case of Chohtan, the figure are: population—2,02,000. Eligible persons—1,86,000. Applications—1,05,803—filled up. Applications rejected—360. Another reason for rejection is that the persons eligible are those above six¹⁰ teen years and because of the fear that they may be identified some people who are below the age of sixteen years have also applied.

The other question he has asked is about the number of people identified and removed from the particular area. As I said, I do not have the figure with me and whatever information I have I will share with the august House. What are the other questions? You have asked five questions.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am not satisfied with the Minister's reply. There is one particular aspect... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question or sub-question or sub-sub-question?

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am coming exactly to that. (Interruptions)

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: The Minister should have come prepared. You should give your ruling.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He may not be as prepared as you are. There are differences. (Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, if the grant of this identity card is an index, is a mark, of citizenship...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question?

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: This is my question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are giving so many explanations.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: I get your question. I remember now.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: There are two aspects of it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You cannot go on like this. You cannot go on mentioning aspects and so on. It is more than a supplementary.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: He is asking me to repeat.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: I have followed his question. He is asking whether the issue of identification cards is a proof of citizenship. That is the question he has asked.

Sir, in our country we do not issue citizenship certificate to everyone. It is given to only those who are eligible, who come from outside and if they apply for the same. It has nothing to do with citizenship. So, I beg to differ on this point with him.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question.

CBI Investigation into the Disappearance of a Press Correspondent

*22. SHRI LAL K. ADVANI:

SHRI ASHWANI KUMARI: †

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether the CBI has since completed its investigation into the

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Ashwani Kumar.

disappearance of the Press Correspondent of 'Amar Ujala' Shri Dobhal, from Pauri District of Uttar Pradesh; and

(b) if so, what are the findings thereof and what follow-up action has been taken on the basis of the findings?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV): (a) and (b) Investigation in the C.B.I. case registered on 12.9.1988 is in the initial stages.

श्री अश्विनी कुमार : माननीय सभा-पति महोदय, उत्तर प्रदेश में पौड़ी के अदर "अमर उजाला" के संवाददाता उमेश डोभाल के बारे में प्रश्न पूछा है। वह 25 मार्च को गायब हो गये और उसके बाद 12 सितम्बर को सी.बी.आई. की इन्क्वायरी की गयी। इसके बीच में वहाँ की जनता का आंदोलन चलता रहा। 12 मई को वहाँ के जनलिस्टों ने प्रोसेशन निकाला, आवेदन पत्र दिया। 3 जून को वहाँ एक अत्यन्त विनाश जुलूम निकला जो 3 किलोमीटर लम्बा था और जिसमें हजारों महिलायें थीं। जब यह स्थिति आयी तो 12-9-88 को यह इन्क्वायरी की गयी। मैं क्या मंत्री महोदय से यह जान सकता हूँ कि 6 महीने बाद सी.बी.आई. की इन्क्वायरी सतत् मांग करने के बाद क्यों की गई और कब तक इसकी रिपोर्ट की आशा करते हैं ?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: Sir, on 15th October, 1988, CBI has submitted their report before the Supreme Court. Now the case is before the Supreme Court. They have to take a decision. The delay was caused because as per the procedure CBI first made preliminary inquiry, then they went into the final inquiry. This is the first report which they have submitted on 15th October, 1988, to the Supreme Court.

श्री अश्विनी कुमार : माननीय सभापति जी, कई प्रदेशों में विशेषकर उत्तर