

[Shri Vishwa Bandhu Gupta]

clear weapons by destroying some of their nuclear weapons. But that is only a very small beginning. I would like that greater efforts should be made towards disarmament and destruction of all the nuclear weapons which are in the arsenals of all the nations including the super powers.

Thank you.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): We should also compliment Mr. Sunil Dutt for launching the peace march.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The entire House expresses its sympathy for those who were affected by this massive tragedy of mankind. We hope and pray that there will be no repetition of such an event in the future, that there will be no nuclear menace and that mankind will be free from all such menace in the future.

We also pay our compliments to Mr. Sunil Dutt for his peace march. Mr. Buta Singh.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam, we have to adjourn for lunch now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, you speak after lunch.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: As you like.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Members will also be a little cool.

The House now stands adjourned for lunch and will meet again at 2.30.

The House then adjourned for lunch at thirty-one minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-two minutes past two of the clock.

The Vice-Chairman (Shri Jagesh Desai) in the Chair.

STATUTORY RESOLUTION APPROVING PRESIDENT'S PROCLAMATION UNDER ARTICLE 356 OF THE CONSTITUTION IN RELATION TO THE STATE OF NAGALAND—Contd.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Buta Singh will now reply.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH): As mentioned by me at the time of laying the Proclamation on the Table of the Sabha, briefly, the background under which President's Rule had to be imposed in Nagaland, let me at the outset make it very clear that it was not at all a happy one. Whenever such a situation arises in any State, it is the duty cast upon the Government of India under the Constitution that we have to provide protection to the State under the Constitution through President's Rule. It is a Constitutional obligation.

Hon. Members have tried to read political game out of it. Absolutely baseless, malicious politically motivated charges by some of the leader of the Opposition were made. We are ourselves not happy in having a State to be placed in the hands of the Governor under President's rule. This is the last resort under our Constitution that we have to take. Otherwise we are wedded to the parliamentary democracy.

I think, in this country nobody can dispute the role of the Congress Government in bringing about parliamentary democracy in our country. If there is a party which is wedded to the parliamentary democracy, it is the Congress and the country has seen it in the last forty years. (Interruptions)

You were also for some time with us. Why are you unnecessarily bothered?

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): This is how you claim.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I claim and my claim is borne out by every citizen of

the country that if the Parliamentary democracy is thriving in India it is because of the role played by the Congress Government. Mr. Gopalsamy, let me remind you what you did in 1978? I have to go on record when the Janata Party came into being...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Given in my speech I condemned the action taken by the Janata Government.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I am not going to say you dismissed the Government. I am going to say something which is very fundamental. That is to prove what I have said just now that the Congress Party is the party which has brought about Parliamentary democracy. In 1978 you remember in this very Central Hall, the then Prime Minister, Mr. Morarji Desai had invited the Prime Minister of U.K., Mr. Callaghan. I think your memories are too short. You should remember this.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: You carry on.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: He made a very tall claim addressing the visiting Prime Minister. "Mr. Prime Minister, the democracy in India has been saved by the conglomeration of the Janata Party. You know what the reply was? You can contradict me but how dare you contradict a visiting Prime Minister of U. K. which is supposed to be mother of all Parliaments. He said "Mr. Prime Minister"—he was replying to Mr. Morarji Desai—I am sorry I am not quoting, I am just giving you a gist, "Yes, I am happy the parliamentary democracy is alive in India. If somebody has to get credit that credit must go to Mrs Gandhi and her party."

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: You had to get certificate from U.K., from our colonial masters. That is your point. Are you proud of it?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I am sorry, now you don't listen. Even the adversaries

had to admit that parliamentary democracy in India is safe with the ideology of the Congress party and with the policies and principles of the Congress party. You may stray into any other party but there if you go against the principles and the ideology of the Congress, the people of this country will throw you out.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Astrologers gave the impression that the Congress will win. How Madam Gandhi conducted the elections?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: In the brief spell of Janata Party, what they did? They threw away the basic principles enshrined in our Constitution, ideology of Mahatma Gandhi, ideology of Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, ideology of Shrimati Indira Gandhi.

They threw all these ideologies to the wind. That is why people kicked them out of power. They were not allowed to remain for the full term because they had given the go-by to the policies and programmes of the Congress party. The only cementing force for the national unity, for the national integration and the parliamentary democracy in this country is the ideology of the Congress party.

... (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Gopalsamy, if you don't agree, please don't interrupt.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: We will see in the next elections. We have patience. We will bear with you... (Interruptions)... But the hon. leaders of the Opposition yesterday were trying to prove that the Congress party has murdered democracy. Only 8 months back, the people of Nagaland brought back the Congress party with a thumping majority... (Interruptions)... in the Assembly elections.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No running commentary from that side.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: The Congress party was brought to power... (व्यवधान)

ठाकुर जगत पाल सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) :
हर सप्टेन्स के ऊपर अगर आप बोलते
रहेंगे तो मंत्री का जवाब कैसे देंगे।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) :
अब नहीं बोलेंगे।

SHRI BUTA SINGH: For the first time in Nagaland, the brave people of Nagaland gave a clear verdict in favour of the Congress party... (Interruptions) ... Why don't you listen?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: You have insulted the pride of Nagaland.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAG-ESH DESAI): Mr. Gopalsamy, may I know whether something is there under your seat? You are just getting up and interrupting.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, Shri Upendra and his Sanyasi guru... (Interruptions)...

SHRI MOHD. KHALEELUR RAHMAN (Andhra Pradesh): That is unparliamentary and it should be removed.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: What is this? What nonsense?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no. It is unparliamentary.

DR. YALAMANCHILI SIVAJI (Andhra Pradesh): Take away that word.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAG-ESH DESAI): He has not named.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): One minute.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: We demand your resignation. You are unfit to be the Home Minister.
... (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAG-ESH DESAI): Please sit down
... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: How can you control this country?
... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I have used this expression very deliberately. I will tell the hon. Members, why. You must listen to me. ... (Interruptions) ... I want to tell you, I want to explain it... (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAG-ESH DESAI): All of you were heard very patiently. Now please hear him. You also have to hear. You cannot have one way traffic. (Interruptions) ... Please sit down.... (Interruption) Please go ahead.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, I have used ship, expression... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: They don't belong to the play boy group that is congress. (Interruptions).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: No, no, I have used this expression yesterday ... (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAG-ESH DESAI): What is this? Do you think you can speak whatever you want? Nothing will go on record.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): His Guru is Sanyasi and your Guru is a Penthouse boy. (Interruption).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I am happy that you have risen. Let me now tell... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: Why has he gone to Nagaland?... (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAG-ESH DESAI): Nothing will go on record. It is very unfair... (Interruptions) ... Is it fair on your part? You please listen to him first. (Interruptions)

PROF. C. LAKSHAMANNA (Andhra Pradesh): Can he use such expression?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Yesterday, while speaking on the motion... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: May I make a submission? He is yielding.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I am not yielding. Let me explain.

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AURORA (Punjab): May I make a submission please? ... (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): After I hear him, if I feel that way, then I will... (Interruptions) ...

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AURORA: May I please make a submission?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: After I say this, you can say this. ... (Interruption) ... Where were you yesterday? Everybody was sitting yesterday. Where were you when Mr. Upendra said these things to me. You must listen now.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Aurora, please sit down, (Interruptions) ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): NTR is not a 'sanyasi'? (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please, sit down, all of you. (Interruptions).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, yesterday, in this august House... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: NTR himself has admitted. "I am a 'sanyasi'." (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Now everybody is quiet. Please sit down, Mr. Gopalsamy. (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: For the past one week, you are angry with me.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, No, I am very quiet and patient... (Interruptions).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Yesterday, after Shri Gurupadaswamy and Shri Dipen Ghosh, Shri Upendra rose to speak on the subject. Do you know the words he used about me and my leader? He said he is my master and I am his servant. If I am ... (Interruptions) ... I am proud that I am the follower of the great leader, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi. I am proud of it. (Interruptions).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Mr. Zail Singh also once stated like this. (Interruptions).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: He is not only my leader. He is the leader of this country, of millions and millions of Indians. (Interruptions). Mr. Dipen Ghosh must stay back and hear me now. He said that he is my master and I am his 'chela'. (Interruptions). Similarly, I have not used any unparliamentary word. (Interruptions). The leader of Shri Upendra called himself 'sanyasi'. I have not given this name. He says, "I am a 'sanyasi'". What is wrong in that? (Interruptions). There is nothing unparliamentary about it. If somebody follows... (Interruptions). You must also know that if somebody follows a 'sanyasi', he is a 'chela'. I have not used any unparliamentary language. (Interruptions). Sir, Shri Upendra, along with his leader, went to Nagaland during the elections. The elections were fair. The people of Nagaland returned the Congress party to the Assembly. That was for the first time that a one-party Government, on the verdict of people, speaking verdict of people, came to power in Nagaland. That was only eight months back. And there have been forces in Nagaland who are out to destabilise the political system in that State. Whenever we talk of Nagaland, specially the North-Eastern sector of our country, we must bear in mind that that part of our country is a little different from the rest of the country for two reasons. One is, their cultural background is quite different. Our tribal people have a very rich

[Shri Buta Singh]

culture, more ancient culture than, perhaps, some of the plains people. We are proud of that. Our founding-fathers of the Constitution have taken a special note of this. (*Interruptions*). I still remember 1963 when Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru was speaking in Parliament. He was full of praise for the people of Nagaland, for the people of Manipur, for the people of Mizoram and the people of the whole North-Eastern region. (*Interruptions*).

DR. YALAMANCHILI SIVAJI: In which party were you then?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Why are you worried about it? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I was a Member of Parliament and we are inheriting that heritage. Those people are not only rich in culture, in habits, in education, but they are a very very sensitive people. They are a very proud people. You cannot hurt their sensitivity. You cannot hurt their ego. They are so simple. They do not go to the court. They settle things then and there. They believe in that. Therefore, we should always be conscious when we pass remarks about those proud people of our country. Some hon. Members, yesterday, made certain remarks about which I am really very hurt. I have been visiting the North-East since 1963. I have been going frequently, as a Member, now as a Minister also. The people of Nagaland are in no way backward in culture, in parliamentary democracy. Those people are very honest. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Why are you interrupting like this? He can speak whatever he wants. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Are you disagreeing with this?

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala): We are not disagreeing: the Governor is disagreeing with that.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: You will find a reflection of these sentiments in the report

of the Governor. The Governor has paid rich tributes to the people of Nagaland. What the Governor has said is not about the people of Nagaland; but it is about the handful of politicians...

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: They are all Nagas. They cannot be purchased.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: You have had your say. Now let me give my reply.

The Governor has valid reasons. In the past twelve times they changed the Government, one particular MLA changing one party in one season, another party in another season. This happens not only in Nagaland but everywhere. You often quote Haryana. So if the Governor has quoted defections and re-defections, what is wrong in it? He has quoted a fact of life. This has become a fact of life unfortunately because some of the politicians have exploited the tribals...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: 'Aya Rams and Gaya Rams' is the Congress culture.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Everybody tried; you tried in Tripura and you failed...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We did not introduce the defections. It was you who introduced defections.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Let me now complete. Dipen Babu, I did not interrupt you although you were rude and unparliamentary. I never interrupted you because I am used to your vituperations...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: People know, the country knows, to which party Bhajan Lal belongs, to which party these legislators belong.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I know that your performance is not from your heart. You are doing it only for the sake of the press here.

That is why I am saying that it is this kind of politicians who have exploited a few representatives of Nagas, who have brought about this situation. Now, my colleague, Mr. Madan Bhatia, made a very pertinent point yesterday. If you look at the letter which they had addressed to the Chief Minister, it makes fun of everything. This letter was supposed to have been writ-

ten sixty days back; nobody knew. Some of the people who had signed that letter, expressed to me that their desire was not to come out of the party; they only wanted a change of leadership. But they were taken in a bunch and they were made to sign a register. There also I am sorry to comment, it is a matter of fact, the Speaker said that all of them signed in his presence whereas his own deputy who was supposed to have signed was in Calcutta and he came with Mr. S. C. Jamir from Calcutta on the next day, whereas the Speaker has gone on record saying that he also signed. When such things happen, can the Governor not take notice of them? If he is not to take notice of such things, then what is he meant for there? The Governor is there to see, to judge, for himself. And the duty of the Speaker is to talk to the members to ascertain the majority. But if this kind of gross tampering with the record by no less an authority than the Speaker takes place, then where do the MLAs go? The Governor is there and he mentioned this thing in his report. that...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): But where was the Governor? He should have been there to verify. Why was he in Imphal? The crisis was in Nagaland, not in Imphal.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: He is a Governor of three States. You are not still very mature...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: But the crisis was in Nagaland, not in Imphal. Was it in Manipur?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: He has done his duty according to the Constitution.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Where was the crisis? Where was his presence required?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Mr. Alexander is the Governor of both Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu. He can pass an order from Hyderabad for Madras under the Constitution. He can take a decision sitting in Hyderabad about Tamil Nadu... (Interruption)... While he is sitting in Hyderabad,

he can take a decision about Tamil Nadu and there is no bar on that... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: You have got any remote control system?... (Interruptions)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: You forget about it. Now, the point is...

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AURORA: When did he go to Kohima?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: The next day. He went the next day to Kohima... (Interruptions)... Sir, as I was mentioning, Shri Bhatiaji made a very pertinent point and the House must give its thought to that point. How can it be termed as a split? For a split, there is a proforma, for a split there is a procedure. Has that procedure... (Interruptions)... been followed? Has that procedure been followed? No; it has not been followed... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Who is to decide it? Whether it was followed or not followed, who will decide? The Governor or the Speaker? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Inside the House, the Speaker has to decide and outside the House, it is the Governor's duty to decide... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: No. It is the Speaker who is to decide. (Interruptions)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I can tell you; it is the Speaker... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The Speaker has to decide it... (Interruptions)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: The Speaker cannot decide the majority. The Governor has to decide the majority. You better read the Constitution... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is very clear. Nowhere Governor has been mentioned... (Interruptions)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, on the issue of majority...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The Governor has no role to play...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: The issue of majority is to be decided by the Governor...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): It is the perversion of parliamentary democracy...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Who will decide, the Speaker or the Governor?...*(Interruptions)*... Whether the resignation was written in the proper form or not, who will decide?...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Ghosh, you know all this.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: There are two ways of deciding it: either on the floor of the House or outside, and if it is on the floor of the House, by the Speaker, and if it is outside the House, then the Governor...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: That is different. Whether my resignation letter was written in the proper form or not, who will decide? It is not the Governor, but the presiding officer of the Legislature...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Outside the House, the authority to decide is the Governor...*(Interruptions)*... Outside the House, according to the Constitution, it is the Governor who is to decide and inside the House the Speaker decides...*(Interruptions)*... In this case, Sir, what would have been the option before the Governor? The Governor asked these leaders when they met him jointly why these thirteen MLAs had been kept in custody, kept in confinement, forcible confinement, and they accepted and they all also promised...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Who?...*(Interruptions)*... Who accepted...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Who are they?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Mr. Vamuzo, Mr. Chisi and Mr. Vizol...*(Interruptions)*... They accepted...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is untrue; it is untrue...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please sit down. If he has made a wrong statement, you have got other ways and you can make use of them. Please sit down...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, may I read out?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You cannot mislead the House...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): You can raise it at some other time, not now...*(Interruptions)*... There are other weapons available to you and you can make use of them...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let him tell the truth...*(Interruptions)*... Why should he tell something which is not true?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, it is in the report that these leaders assured the Governor that these MLAs would be allowed to come out...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Where is it written?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: It is in the report...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is the Governor who has written that...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: They made the assurance to the Governor and not to me ... (Interruptions)... Sir, how can they sit in judgment on the Governor's report? ... (Interruptions)... I cannot pass any judgment on the Governor's report ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is in a partisan manner that he has tried to do that... (Interruptions)... In a partisan manner the Governor has done it ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): The Government has to go according to the Governor's report and that is what he is quoting ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: The Governor's report and...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Is it a fact? Is it correct? ... (Interruptions)... You are the leader of a party. Is it proper on your part to make a remark like this? That will not go on record... (Interruptions)....

3.00 P.M.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: May I read the assurance given by the leaders to the Governor? In his report, he has said:

"However, till the time of this report, they have only not honoured their assurances but have continued to confine the Members of the Legislative Assembly, thereby obstructing normal political activity and leading to serious escalation of tension."

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It was to escape from your intimidation. Can't they stay together?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Has any of the Members complained that they had been confined?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Yes.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Even after the President's rule, did any M.L.A. complain?

*Not recorded.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): After he has made his speech, I will permit one or two Members.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: This was the assurance. Therefore, there were only two options left to the Governor. Sir, when I started my observations, I said that the situation in Nagaland is not ordinary. In parts, the State is still suffering from insurgency. There are well-organised violent groups indulging in all kinds of insurgency. You have to view the situation in that background. Will you allow this kind of game going on in the capital when the State is full of insurgency? The hon. Governor has also mentioned in his report that efforts were afoot. There were certain attempts to find a way in which the insurgents could be brought to the main-stream of life. There was a process of integration going on. In the midst of all this, what happened? The Chief Minister is abroad and suddenly some letter which is purported to have been written 60 days before, is all of a sudden presented before, the Speaker saying that these 13 Members have left the party. That newly formed party which is called 'Congress Regional Nagaland' is no party. There is no formal party. There is no convention. There is no party at all. Only 13 Members have declared that this is a party. According to the hon. Members of the opposition, it is all complete. May be. But where is the 14th member? A party has to have some kind of a shape. There is no constitution. (Interruptions) Not a single person has become a member of this party.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is one-third of the legislature party. Thirty-one was the strength of the Congress Legislature Party.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: There is no membership of this party. Even in the streets of Kohima....

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Are you all members of the Congress Party? Have you all filled the form? When did you fill the form?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The legislature party comprised 31 members and one-third of the membership is required to form a party.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: In the streets of Kohima nobody knows that there is such a party. No Naga knows about it.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Have you got membership of the Congress Party. Show me your membership. When did you become a member of the Congress Party?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Not a single Naga knows that there is such a party. Is this not a fraud on the people of Nagaland who returned the Congress Party back to the Assembly? They gave a massive majority to the Congress Party. I was in Kohima. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please let me complete. Don't make irrelevant interruptions. Please don't make irrelevant interruptions.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: With the help of these 13 legislators, you had massive majority. Minus these 13 legislators you have no majority.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): It is his opinion. He feels that it is massive. You may have a different opinion.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: While in Kohima... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You kindly control them, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Narayanasamy, they are all good Members. Don't worry about that.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: They know, they have no case. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: In the debate, we will ask questions.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): But it should be a useful debate. I will allow you later on. *(Interruptions)* Doubts are created in mind deli-

berately. They are not doubts. Please understand. *(Interruptions)*. If it is not with that intention. I will allow you. Maybe, I feel wrongly... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, you are a very wise Vice-Chairman. Did G. M. Shah and Nadendla Bhaskarrao get the membership of a party? What is he speaking?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: What do you know about parties? The parties have to be on the ground, Sir, while in Kohima... *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please sit down.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: How can he question... *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please sit down. CPI Members never lose this kind of temper.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Sir, those days have gone with the emergency.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, while I was in Kohima, I received a telephone call that Shri K. L. Chishi wanted to see me. I told that if Shri K. L. Chishi is willing to come as one of our Congress members, yes, he is welcome, I will meet him, but I am not going to see any opposition members or anybody else for that matter.

SHRI RAM AWADHESH SINGH (Bihar): Why? Can you deny that to an Opposition member?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Because I was on my official duty. There was a situation in Nagaland where horse-trading was going on. I thought I would avoid meeting the MLAs....

SHRI RAM AWADHESH SINGH: If somebody wants to meet you, you must meet him.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): It is for him to decide whom to meet and whom not to meet.

SHRI BUTA SINGH : Then I told him that... (*Interruptions*). Then I told him that if he wants to come as a dissident Congressman and if he wants to convey something to the High Command, yes, he can come. Sir, he came to the Raj Bhavan. He met me. He explained his position. And he told me that this is what his colleague, say that they do not want it and they have given in writing to the Speaker. I said, "Look the party was sent by the people into the Assembly. The people are competent to take all these decisions. How can I pass judgment on such an issue?" He said that I have threatened somebody. Where is the threat? Is it not the people of our country and our State supreme? They have sent us to this House. If we are not able to discharge the mandate, who should decide? Not this House, but the people should decide. That is what I said. I told Mr. Chihri not as a threat. I told him that if this is the issue, then we are not competent, neither you nor am I competent, the people of Nagaland will decide. This is all I have said. My friend, Shri M. S. Gurupadaswamy, who was in the good old days my guide also, went on pouring his eloquence on my personality. I am a very humble soldier of the Congress Party, nothing more than that. I do not claim that I am a big leader. No. But one thing I can tell you that so long as this House, the people of this country want us to discharge our duties, we will do it without fear and favour. We will not mind. And in this case, it is the Congress Party which has suffered. The Congress Party has suffered, not the Telugu Desam, not the DMK or any other party.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Fear is all right. Don't say, without favour.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: In this, who has suffered? It is the Congress Party which has suffered...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Can you do it without the fear of your leader?

SHRI BUTA SINGH : ... nor the CPM, it is the Congress which has suffered. And, Sir, in this case the Governor was left with no option; I want to remind Shri Gurupadaswamy of his own State, what happened in 1978. The Assembly was

called to meet on the 3rd January. This mighty Janata Government, the then Government decides sitting here in Delhi on the 31st of December, only two days were left for the Assembly to meet, there was a House invited, the House was going to meet, and these people decided here to dismiss the Government, and the then Governor, also used the same language, I find in the report of the Governor Shri Govind Narayan, one of our distinguished administrator... (*Interruptions*). That is why you have not referred to it. The Governor is faced with a situation. I do not blame either Shri Govind Narayan, nor do I blame General Krishna Rao, they are faced with a situation as a head of a State, he is faced with a situation, in which he cannot allow the things to go out of hand, especially in a State where there is insurgency, and I am sure we are proud of General Krishna Rao for his services to this country. As a soldier, he was the most eminent soldier of this country. As a statesman he has shown rare qualities of head and heart... (*Interruptions*). And Shri Upendra must know better that there is no parallel so far as his personal qualities are concerned. Therefore, I must say, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, that the Governor in this case has acted fully in consonance with the constitutional propriety and his discretion and judgment and the matter should not be questioned. The step he has taken is the right step. He has given power back to the people of Nagaland and we are waiting for the day when the people of Nagaland will deliver the judgment and till then, as my colleague, Shri S. C. Jamiir has said, this even that has come before use will be utilised for the service of the people of Nagaland. We will provide them the administration of which they will be proud and also I am sure during this interregnum the Governor and his colleague will see to it that the process which was set in motion for bringing the people into the mainstream of life, national life, is stepped up, is completed, and we would like to see the day when Nagaland also marches along with the rest of our country on the path of progress and development.

With these words, Sir, I commend this august House to pass this Proclamation unanimously. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Not all, I have said one or two. Yes, Shri Virendra Verma. (Interruptions). I have made it very clear. I will call one or two.

SHRI RAM AWADHESH SINGH : I spoke on the motion and I was not replied on the points I raised. So I must get some reply and I must put some questions.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Yes, Shri Virendra Verma.

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश) :
उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आपके द्वारा माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से जानना चाहूंगा कि जो उन्होंने कहा कि विधायकों को बन्द किया हुआ था तो क्या माननीय गृह मंत्री जी के पास उन 13 विधायकों में से किसी एक से भी इस बात की शिकायत की है कि उनको बन्द किया हुआ था ? अगर उनके पास इस प्रकार की कोई शिकायत नहीं है, तो इस प्रकार की चीफ मिनिस्टर के जरिये गवर्नर महोदय ने अगर रिपोर्ट की है तो वह कहां तक जस्टीफाइड है ? यह मेरा पहला प्रश्न है । मेरा दूसरा प्रश्न है कि गवर्नर महोदय एज मिलिटरी जनरल अनपेरल रहते हैं, उनकी सेवायें प्रशंसनीय रही हैं, उसमें किसी को कोई शिकायत नहीं है, लेकिन एज गवर्नर जब नागालैण्ड में भयंकर किस्म की काइसेज पैदा हुई तो वह इम्फाल में क्यों रहे ? तत्काल क्यों नहीं आये ? और जब देश के गृह मंत्री कोहिमा में पहुंचे, क्या उस समय... (व्यवधान) और सरफेस मिनिस्टर वहां पर थे और वे तो गृह मंत्री जी आपके नामिनी हैं ही, जब आप पहुंचे तो आपके नामिनी क्या आपके सामने उस समय आ गये थे और नहीं, तो जिस प्रकार का पार्टीजन पार्शियल उनका एटीट्यूड रहा क्या उन्हें नान डिजर्विंग मानकर बर्खास्त करने पर विचार करेंगे ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Prof. Lakshman.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : मैंने जो बातें पूछी हैं, उनका जवाब नहीं दिया है.... (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) :
कई पाइंट्स का जवाब नहीं दिया होगा ।

Mr. Ram Awadhesh Singh, please sit down. I cannot allow everybody. (Interruptions) I have allowed Mr. Virendra Verma and now Prof. Lakshmanno. Nobody else will be allowed. (Interruptions)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: I would like to ask the Home Minister, what is that which prevented the Governor to fix a date other than the 23rd August, 1988, for the meeting of the Legislature? If the urgency was there, as he felt subsequently, what prevented him from convening the Legislative Assembly earlier than the 23rd August? What is the basis for changing his stance and then coming to the conclusion which he did later on? I have two more points.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : No. Only two.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: All right. I will put them as 2(a) and 2(b). I would like to ask the Home Minister, what are those reliable sources which the Governor has mentioned in his letter to the Government of India which made him come to the conclusion that conditions in Nagaland warranted only President's Rule and not a rule by an alternative Government? What are those reliable sources?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: This is given in the report.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: How did the Governor take upon himself the function of the Speaker? When once the Speaker was convinced that more than one-third of the Members of the Congress Legislature Party did not find favour with the existing party, if they wanted to have a separate ex-

istence and if the Speaker was satisfied, what is the additional information which the Governor had to overrule the decision of the Speaker, to take upon himself the function which, legitimately, was that of the Speaker?

* SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Sir, just one minute.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No. Hon. Minister please.

श्री बूटा सिंह : श्री वर्मा जी ने पूछा कि क्या सबूत है कि वे 13 मैम्बर फोर्सीबुल कन्फाइनमेंट में रखे गये थे एक तो मैं खुद सबूत हूँ ? मैंने खुद देखा (व्यवधान) ।

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : किसी ने शिकायत की ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please sit down. Let him reply. He is replying to the questions which have been asked. You are not allowing him to reply. If you do not allow him to reply, he will not reply.

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : रिकार्ड की बात बता दें । एक तो आप कहेंगे, हम यकीन कर लेंगे । मगर शिकायत किसी ने की ?

श्री बूटा सिंह : वर्मा जी को मेरे से कही ज्यादा कागजों पर भरोसा है । मैं कहता हूँ कि मैंने खुद देखा, वहां प्राइवेट या वालंटियर्स बंदूकें लेकर खड़े थे, मस्बुर एक नश्वर दो... (व्यवधान) आप बैठ जाइये, मैं बता रहा हूँ । दूसरा जब हमने चीफ मिनिस्टर और दूसरे मंत्री जी से कान्फेंस की... । उस बात मीटिंग में प्रश्न हुआ कि वह बहुत से लोग मैसेज भेज रहे हैं और मिलना चाहते हैं । तो मैंने कहा कि उनको बुला लो । उन्होंने कहा कि उनको बुलाया नहीं जा सकता । कोई भी वहां से निकलेगा तो उसको मार देंगे ।

The Governor himself took up the subject with the leaders—Mr. Vamu-

zo, Mr. Vizol, Mr. Chishi and others and they conceded that. The Governor has given it in his report and they assured him that they would free the members.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Where is that? Where is it that they conceded it?

वर्मा जी को पदकारो पर बहुत विश्वास है । (व्यवधान)
आप तो मुन लीजिये (व्यवधान)

उपनिध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) : राम अवधेश सिंह जी आपको इतना मौका देते हैं, फिर भी आप ऐसा क्यों करते हैं । आपके बारे में फिर हमको भी कुछ सोचना पड़ेगा ।

श्री बूटा सिंह : श्रीमन्, 30 तारीख से लेकर 7 तारीख तक आप इंडियन एक्सप्रेस ही पढ़ लीजिये, वह रोज लिखता है कि मैम्बर्ज को एक जगह रखा हुआ है । अब इससे ज्यादा मैं क्या आपको विश्वास दिला सकता हूँ ।

SHRI BUTA SINGH: It is there in the report. You read it.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What about the observations of Mr. Jamir?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: If they stay in the complex, what is wrong in that?

श्री बूटा सिंह : मान्यवर, यह प्रश्न कोई ऐसा नहीं है । इसके अतिरिक्त चीफ सेक्रेटरी ने उस लाज वाले को आर्डर किये टूरिस्ट लाज के जो मैनेजर थे उनको कहा गया कि यहां से जो अन-डिजायरेबल एलीमेंट आया हुआ है उसको बाहर निकालिये । यदि पुलिस की सहायता चाहिये तो हम पुलिस की सहायता देने के लिये तैयार हैं । इससे और ज्यादा सबूत आपको वर्मा जी क्या चाहिये ।

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You are the Home Minister. You could have gone with your force. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, I will not allow anybody.

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AUORA: You are not permitting me. I have a few points to make.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): You are a disciplined soldier.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I can only state facts before this august House. I cannot convert inconvertible Upen-draji by any arguments.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What is your reaction to the observations of Mr. Jamir? You have not replied to that.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I shall now put....
(Interruptions)

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber)

The question is:

That this House approves the Proclamation issued by the President on the 7th August, 1988, under article 356 of the Constitution, in relation to the State of Nagaland. The motion was adopted.

THE DELHI UNIVERSITY (AMENDMENT) BILL, 1988—Contd.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Now we shall take up the Delhi University (Amendment) Bill, 1988.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Sir, I rise to oppose the Delhi University (Amendment) Bill, 1988. The Statement of Objects and Reasons of the Bill states that the Bill is based on the National Policy on Education, 1986. Sir, I wish to point out that the concept of autonomous colleges which is being sought to be implemented through this Bill is a very

modern concept, but it is very premature inasmuch as the existing educational system leaves much to be desired.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shri Satya Prakash Malaviya) in the Chair]

Before I go into the working of the universities, I would like to point out that the National Educational Policy, 1986, as announced by the Government, is elitist in nature. The concept of Navodaya Vidyalayas, which has been enunciated with great fanfare, itself provides for selective education up to the district level. Sir, in a country where illiteracy is rampant, where what is required is basic education for the masses when the three R's are required to be taught, I am really sorry that we should try to implement an education policy which seeks to talk in very big terms about modernization of education, of computers and of other modern technology or techniques of education. The Prime Minister himself has talked of pursuit of excellence. But I am sorry that in the existing system we are steeping into mediocrity and worse.

This Bill itself talks of granting autonomy to colleges and the Minister, in his opening remarks, has said that 54 colleges would be given autonomy after this Bill is passed. Now I want to bring it to the attention of the House that there are various colleges functioning in an autonomous manner in States other than Delhi. We were told by the Minister that this provision is there in all the other places. Delhi is one of the universities where the provision is being put now. Before this autonomy is granted to these colleges, we must examine how the colleges are functioning today.

My friend, Dr. Ratnakar Pandey from the other side, while supporting the Bill, has made very good points, pointing out the lacunae in the existing system of education. Malpractices are rampant, examination papers are being leaked, the examination