

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Accident at Delhi Metro site on 12th July, 2009

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT (SHRI SAUGATA RAY): Sir, as reported by the DMRC, a launching girder, along with a portion of Metro viaduct (under construction), collapsed at Zamrudpur near East of Kailash in South Delhi at about 5.00 a.m. on 12-07-2009. A total number of 6 workers, including one Junior Engineer of M/s Gammon India Ltd., who are the contractors for this portion of Central Secretariat-Badarpur Corridor, died in the accident. Out of those dead, three were trapped in the debris. Another 15 workers are injured out of whom two are seriously injured.

A compensation of Rs. 5 lakh is being paid to the kin of all the deceased in addition to the compensation under the Workman Compensation Act. Those who are grievously injured will be paid a compensation of Rs. 2 lakh and those injured - a compensation of Rs. 50,000.

The traffic on the road has been closed at Kailash Colony T-Point, LSR College-Bluebell School T-Point and Amar Colony police station. Rescue operations are in full swing, involving six cranes of capacity 250 tonnes and one crane of capacity 400 tonnes, gas cutters, over 100 engineers drawn from all Metro sites apart from police and civil defence personnel.

The restoration of partial traffic was delayed on 12th July, 2009 (night) due to rain. While removing the launching girder with the help of 4 cranes, at around 11.40 a.m., on 13th July, 2009, one of the cranes failed, leading to toppling of one crane and breaking of boom of two cranes, thus further delaying the restoration work. Six workers suffered minor injuries and were taken to AIIMS trauma centre. All of them were discharged, in the evening, from the hospital. Partial traffic has been restored at 06.00 a.m. on date. A help line, No. 23414461, has been started to inform the public about the developments.

Estimated direct loss, due to the accident, is Rs. 6 crores. The accident is likely to cause delay to this portion of the project by about 3 months. However, the overall target of commissioning of the Central Secretariat-Badarpur corridor, that is, September, 2010 would remain unchanged.

A high-level four-member committee has been constituted to investigate into the incident. The members are: Prof. A.K. Nagpal of the Civil Engineering Department, IIT, Delhi; Prof. (Mrs.) P.R. Bose, Professor of Structural Engineering, Delhi College of Engineering; Mr. Steve Lowry, Project Director, General Consultants, DMRC; and Mr. Rajan Kataria, Chief Engineer (Design), DMRC as coordinator.

The Committee is to submit its report within ten days, that is, by 22.07.2009.

The Committee will go into the causes leading to the accident, including checking design, workmanship, quality of material used, method of construction and precautionary measures to be taken at other work sites.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, those who want to seek clarifications are requested to please put pointed questions because of paucity of time.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, just a few lines as a background. Mr. Minister, I just wish to draw your kind attention to the fact that in the last eleven years, since the DMRC is in operation, construction and execution both, 69 workers have lost their lives and 52 have been injured. These workers, who put in nearly twelve hours a day, from poor States, including my State, Bihar, have got no union rights at all. What we hear is — this is the most important clarification I would like to seek from you — that in the mad rush for completion before the Commonwealth Games of 2010 the hurried pace of the work is creating a lot of problems. And, there is a reason as to why we have got ground to suspect this. It is because phase-I consisted of 65 kilometres and it took eight years to complete. While, phase-II consists of 128 kilometres and you have given a target of only four years. Things should be expedited; one cannot have any trouble with that, but not at the cost of safety, at the cost of the whole durability of the structure. We have got highest regard for Mr. Sridharan. He has done good wonders in the past. But what we suspect is, in the mad rush for all this, safety norms are being violated, structural safety is being violated. All the safety training required to be given, I am sorry to say this, is being completely ignored. Fatigue is not there only among the personnel. Fatigue is also in the instruments, whether it is a crane or other things. Why I am saying so because day-before-yesterday six people lost their lives. You have considered that. Now, yesterday, what happened, you sent three cranes, in a busy part of Delhi, to lift that without understanding the capacity of those cranes to lift that heavy girder. This only shows that *ad hocism* is prevalent safety norms are being completely ignored. Now, kindly see a situation, which is very important. Fortunately, the accident took place in the morning. If it had been in the peak traffic time, the loss would have been 50 times more. Therefore, these are issues. Today, I heard that some pillar has also fallen in Mumbai. Now, Mr. Minister, I would like to have one more clarification of far-reaching importance. Earlier, the design was being given by the DMRC itself. Now, the design has also been outsourced to the contractors to save money or time or whatever the case may be. Now, they sub-lease the work. I don't wish to give the honour of taking the name of any contractor on the floor of this House. But there are contractors and contractors. Some contractors have very poor record. In Hyderabad, a particular fly over collapsed there as well. The same contractor has been given contracts here as well. Again, the collapse which we noticed day-before-yesterday was handled by that contractor. Certainly, the people of the country, the people of Delhi, particularly, would like to be assured that safety norms are not violated. The Government has to

ensure that safety norms will not be violated. There is a mad rush for Commonwealth Games. We are all for success of Commonwealth Games, Mr. Minister, but please don't make safety the casualty in that process.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please put your questions.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Therefore, I repeat my questions one by one. What are the safety norms being followed? Are the workers being given some safety drill? What are the rights being given to workers? They have no union, but, apart from compensation, is there any other shelter that is being provided to them? Who is finalising the design of all these structures? What is the level of safety monitoring being done, in what manner? Are your instruments over-used/fatigued because of time constraints? What is the safety audit being done by the Department? If there is any document, please produce it on the floor of the House. Lastly and it is very important: Is the mad rush for the Commonwealth Games creating problems? Be honest in this House, because if 65 kilometres takes eight years, how come 121 kilometres will take four years? Thank you, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Shri Rajniti Prasad. Please ask pointed questions.

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार): सर, हमारा तो इसमें ज़ीरो ऑवर भी था, लेकिन यह ज़ीरो ऑवर में नहीं हुआ, तो इसी में मैं क्लैरिफिकेशंस पूछ लेता हूँ। रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी ने सही कहा कि जिस चीज़ को 8 सालों में कम्प्लीट होना चाहिए-- सर, यह एक प्रोसेस है, यह जो ढलाई का मामला होता है, रखने का मामला होता है, उसको आप जल्दी-जल्दी करेंगे-- हमारे अहलुवालिया जी कह रहे थे कि पानी को सक करते हैं, वह एक कम्प्लीट चैनल होता है, उस चैनल में वह पत्थर जमता है। अगर उसको आप पहले ही स्टार्ट कर देंगे, तब तो वह गिरेगा ही। इसमें मेरा एक क्वेश्चन यह है कि हम लोग अभी जो मेट्रो की सवारी कर रहे हैं, वह तो ठीक-ठाक है या क्या उसमें भी कोई झंझट है? क्या उसमें भी लोगों का चढ़ना बंद करेंगे? उसमें हजारों लोग रोज चढ़ते हैं। अगर इस तरह से मेट्रो का परिचालन होगा तब तो फिर हम लोगों को डर लगेगा। हमारे पास तो मेट्रो से चलने का कार्ड भी है। आप हमें बताइए कि जो घटनाएँ घट रही हैं-- जैसे एक तो हमने सुना और देखा भी, कि एक आदमी जो काम कर रहा था उसके शरीर के अन्दर पूरा लोहा ही घुस गया। अब पता नहीं कि वह बचा या मर गया। आपके मेट्रो स्टेशन पर या कारखाना में, जहाँ पर काम हो रहा है, क्या इतना जगलरी हो गया है कि आप सेफ्टी का कोई इंतजाम नहीं कर सकते हैं? इसलिए मेरा कहना यह है कि जहाँ भी जो वर्क चल रहा है, वह स्थायी वर्क होना चाहिए। कहने का मतलब कि वह स्थिर वाला काम होना चाहिए, हड़बड़ी वाला काम नहीं होना चाहिए।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): आप प्रश्न पूछिए।

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद: सर, मैंने प्रश्न में यही कहा कि क्या आप स्थिर वाला काम करवाएँगे या आप कॉमनवैल्थ गेम्स के लिए लोगों की जान ले लेंगे? इसमें जिन लोगों की जान जाएगी, उनका तो खेल ही समाप्त हो जाएगा। कॉमनवैल्थ के खेल तो बाद में होंगे, लेकिन इसमें जितने लोगों की जान गई, उसमें तो सिर्फ 2-4 लोग ही मरे, वरना अगर वहाँ पर ट्रैफिक जाम रहता या ट्रैफिक रहता, तब तो उसमें और भी कई लोग मरते। इसलिए क्या आप उसके बारे में सेफ्टी का कोई अच्छा इंतजाम कराएँगे?

इसमें मेरा एक सवाल और है। गैमन इंडिया, जिसको इसका कंट्रेक्ट दिया जाता है, क्या वह किसी दूसरे को कंट्रेक्ट दे सकता है? यानी उसको अनुभव नहीं है कि कैसे क्रेन से उठाया जाए, कैसे रखा जाए, कितना भार लगे। इस सम्बन्ध में ये मेरे क्लैरिफिकेशंस हैं। आप इनके जवाब दीजिए। यही बातें मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ। धन्यवाद।

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have a point of order. राज्य मंत्री जी के प्रति मेरा बड़ा आदर है, किन्तु इतने महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर कैबिनेट मिनिस्टर साहब कहाँ हैं, सर? हम आपसे यह आग्रह जरूर करेंगे। ज़रा इसको देखा जाए। We respect the Minister of State, Sir, but a critical issue requires presence of the Cabinet Minister.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay. You know that there is no point of order.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: But we want some .. *(Interruptions)*..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): There is no point of order in that because there is no violation of rules. What can I do? Ravi Shankar Prasadji, you are a senior Member. There is no violation of rule. .. *(Interruptions)*..

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: But something for propriety, Sir? ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad, now I have got this message. In fact, hon. Mr. Jaipal Reddy had written a letter in advance informing that he is not available today. He is not in town. So, he will not be able to attend. So, he has deputed his MoS. But even otherwise, your point of order does not stand because there is no rule violation. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: But, Sir, there is the question of propriety as well. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes; I accept that. I accept the question of propriety. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Jharkhand): Sir, I am on a point of order. There is a violation. There is a violation because. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Under what rule? ... *(Interruptions)*... There is no time.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: I am just showing you, Sir, the supplementary agenda. When was it circulated? What was the supplementary agenda circulated?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Oh, that is over now. You could have raised it at that time. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: You have circulated that at 2.15 p.m. At 2.16 p.m., the Minister comes with a *suo motu* statement and you expect that Members will come and speak. That is not fair, Sir. ... *(Interruptions)*... No; no; Sir, there is a violation. ... *(Interruptions)*... Don't say it is not a violation. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Ahluwaliaji, you have a valid point. But you did not raise it at that time. You have a valid point. I concede that you have a valid point.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I mentioned it because you said there is no violation.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay; now; Shri R.C. Singh.

श्री आर०सी० सिंह (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : सर, मैं मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस में Principal Employer कौन है? अगर गवर्नमेंट ऑफ इंडिया Principal Employer है तो इन के under काम करने वाले कितने workers हैं? उस बारे में गवर्नमेंट ऑफ इंडिया के पास उनका कोई identification है? इस की जानकारी मंत्री जी हम लोगों को दें कि ठेका में काम करने वाले कितने वर्कर्स हैं? दूसरा सवाल, आजकल compensation की रकम बढ़कर 10 लाख हो गयी है तो इन्होंने 5 लाख किस basis पर calculate किया है? तीसरा सवाल वहाँ safety rules का पालन हो रहा है या नहीं? वहाँ पर safety devices applied हैं या नहीं? इन तीन सवालों के बारे में जानकारी दें।

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, regarding the incident of 13th July, I want to know — the incident happened in the morning at 11.40 — whether any Metro Engineer was present at the site at that time. Why I am asking this is because it has been stated that one of the cranes failed. How can the crane fail? I want to know whether it was lifting more weight than its designed capacity. It is very surprising because two serious types of incidents have happened subsequently on two days. So, my first question is, whether any Metro Engineer was present there and how the crane failed. What was the weight that the crane was lifting? There is some design capacity. Now, regarding the incident of 12th July, we understand that the pillar had developed a crack earlier, but it got its clearance. It was repaired, attended, got its clearance and then the work started again. But, thereafter, that incident happened. What is the actual reason of the 12th July incident and if the pillar-crack was developed, then why they cleared it to start the work again? Actually, I want the Minister to let us know what is the actual reason and whether the Metro Engineers cleared the project to start the work again. This is relating to the 12th July incident. So, I have these two specific questions.

SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (Maharashtra): Sir, I have very high regard for Mr. Sreedharan because he is the person who really accomplished the impossible task of Konkan Railway. It is really one of the miracles. I am told and I have read that he had raised doubt about this particular pillar some time back and had even asked the Engineers to demolish it. But some Engineers advised him not to do it and said that repairs would be possible. Then Sreedharan had resigned. But now since he has withdrawn his resignation, where does the buck stop? Who is really guilty of this? The nation should know this. Therefore, an inquiry should be conducted and we should know who is guilty, whether it is a person, a group of persons or the technology. We should know this. Secondly, now that this accident has happened, we must ensure that all pillars and other structures that are built should be re-examined before the work resumes because, as Mr. Prasad

said, undue haste has been shown due to the Commonwealth Games. Commonwealth Games would come and go, Sir, but the metro railways would run for the next hundred years. We are playing with the lives of millions of innocent people and we have no business to do that. We may not be able to keep up to the schedules, but that is fine. You must stop, take stock and then resume work.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I have a small question. Was there any complaint about the design of this bridge? There were not one but several complaints. And when there were these complaints about the design of this bridge, did anyone address that complaint? Secondly, although the names of very reputed organisations were mentioned on the cranes, the way cranes buckled down, it looked like it was a child's play. Was there anything wrong in calculating the weight of the girder? Did they want to remove it? Did they falter somewhere while calculating the load of the girder, the angle of the girder or the height of the girder? If it is not assessed yet, kindly refer these points to the inquiry commission.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please ask only pointed questions.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I have a two-point question. How the accident took place will be found out by the four-member investigating committee. Surely all the points would be taken care of. My question is that the whole incident has shown that it is basically a safety lapse and the safety operation has got another aspect, which is preventive safety; and, to ensure preventive safety, not only safety in a particular operation that is taking place but also the operation worthiness of the instruments that are being in a work place. For that, a regular system of inspection is in place as per our laws of the land. I would like to know whether the DMRC is being regularly subjected to that statutory safety and preventive safety inspections because, as you know, in the DMRC there was no forum of workers; one was formed and its president was thrown out of the job. The question is, if somebody has the right to take somebody's head, he should also have the power and the authority to save others' heads.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Shrimati Prabha Thakur. एक ही pointed question.

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर (राजस्थान): मैं एक ही प्रश्न करूंगी। महोदय, यह मामला स्पष्ट रूप से लापरवाही और भ्रष्टाचार का अधिक दिखाई देता है। दो दिन में दो हादसे होते हैं। जब पिलर में दरार है--श्री श्रीधरन जी के नाम से पूरा हिन्दुस्तान परिचित है। वह एक मेट्रो मैन के नाम से जाने जाते हैं। इसलिए मैं कहती हूँ कि उनका इस्तीफा तो वाजिब नहीं था और जिसे उन्होंने वापिस ले भी लिया। इस मामले में चोर की मां को नहीं बल्कि चोर को सजा होनी चाहिए। कौन लोग वाकई में जिम्मेदार हैं? जो वहाँ थे, जिनकी देखरेख में वह पिलर बना और जिन्होंने यह वकालत की कि इस पिलर को दोबारा बनाने की नहीं, इसे रिपेयर करने की जरूरत है, यह उनकी जिम्मेदारी है। क्या सरकार उन जिम्मेदार लोगों के लिए कठोर कार्यवाही करने का विचार रखती है?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay. Now, Mr. Minister.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL : Sir,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Enough, enough. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (Punjab): I will take just a minute, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): All right.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL : Sir, the technology for the construction of Metros was developed in the West and even after decades of experience, in the West, they do not make more than 17 or 18 kilometres per annum. There must be a reason for that. And we are rushing to 30 kilometres and 32 kilometres! So, obviously, safety norms are being thrown to the winds. Will the Minister kindly examine what the other countries are doing and if they are making only 17 or 18 kms. per annum, why is it that we are making 30 or 32 kms.?

श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह (झारखंड): महोदय, हम Shri E. Sreedharan पर कुछ सवाल नहीं करना चाहते, लेकिन Gammon India पर बात करना चाहते हैं जो, Gammon India, इस पुल का निर्माण कर रही है। बहुत बड़ी कम्पनी है, लेकिन वह कम्पनी काम लेकर दूसरी कम्पनी को sublet कर देती है और यह उसका तीसरा एक्सिडेंट है। आप देखिए गंगा पुल बिहार में बना है, अभी उसे बने 30 साल नहीं हुए, लेकिन वह पुल धराशायी होने वाला है। वहां की सरकार और वहां की जनता को इसकी चिंता लगी हुई है। बुद्ध की मूर्ति स्थापित करनी थी, वह समुद्र में गिर गई, डूब गई। इसलिए इस कम्पनी को यहां से हटाना चाहिए और नहीं तो इस कम्पनी को प्रैस करना चाहिए कि काम लेते हो तो तुम करो, इसको sublet नहीं कर सकते।

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Mr. Minister, would you kindly enlighten as to what is the proportion in western countries of metro underground and metro over-ground? Here in Delhi, most of the accidents have taken place in regard to construction over-ground. Should we infer that the proportion is a little mismatch?

SHRI SAUGATA RAY : Sir, I am thankful to the hon. Members for the interest that they have shown in the matter. Delhi Metro is the pride of the nation and anything happening here concerns all of us.

Hon. Member, Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad, spoke about the deaths. His death figure is little wrong. Actual number of people died in the first phase are 55 and 45 have died in the second phase.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : It is higher.

SHRI SAUGATA RAY : I just want to correct you that your figure is not right. Now, this includes traffic accidents. क्योंकि कुछ लोग traffic से भी, बस से भी मर गए। I cannot really comment on the matter of trade union rights because the actual employer is DMRC. DMRC is a corporation owned by the Delhi Government and the Union Government together. But it is an independent corporation and DMRC gives its jobs on contract basis. It is also known that big contractors always give sub-contract to other people and they, in turn, sub-contract to other people. This is

the rule of all construction activity in the country, not in DMRC only. If the hon. Member, Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad, wants to open a union there, he is free to do so, and if he wants to apply for the abolition of Contract Labour Act, he can do so. There are laws in the country for contract workers. There are laws in the country for workmen compensation in case of people getting injured. This is one. Secondly, he said that there is a mad rush. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: He is saying that sub-letting is allowed. It is not allowed. Sub-letting is not allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAUGATA RAY: He is using the wrong word. I said, 'subcontracting'. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sub-contracting is not allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Even sub-contracting is not allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI SAUGATA RAY: Of course, it is allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: He is misguiding the House. ...*(Interruptions)*..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You made your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAUGATA RAY: I am not misleading. ...*(Interruptions)*..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): If the Minister is misguiding, there is a different rule. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: He must understand the sanctity of the issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... He must understand the sanctity of the issue....*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): If the Minister is misleading the House, there are rules for taking it up. ...*(Interruptions)*..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You can take note of it...*(Interruptions)*. First, know the rules. I am on my legs...*(Interruptions)*. Please, take your seat...*(Interruptions)*. Please, don't do this. This is wrong.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What are the norms of the bid?

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं अच्छी तरह जानता हूँ कि मिनिस्टर के खिलाफ कभी प्रिविलेज का मूवमेंट सफल नहीं होगा ... **(व्यवधान)** आप सभी जानते हैं कि technical matter में कांटेक्ट sub-let नहीं किया जा सकता। मंत्री जी इस हाउस को mislead कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): First, obey the rules. When I am on my legs, you have to sit down...*(Interruptions)*. At least, obey the rules...*(Interruptions)*. Ahluwaliaji, you are the Deputy Leader...*(Interruptions)*. Please, obey the rules. I am on my legs. You have to take your seat...*(Interruptions)*. Please, take your seat.

If the Minister is giving any wrong information, or deliberately misleading the House, or even otherwise misleading the House, there are rules under which you can take up the matter.

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : जयपाल रेड्डी जवाब दें ...**(व्यवधान)**... Let the hon. Minister reply to this. It is a very serious issue...*(Interruptions)*.

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल (राजस्थान) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मेरा एक प्वाइंट है ... (व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, hon. Minister can continue ...*(Interruptions)*. Ravi Shankarji, please, allow the Minister to reply. Let us hear him...*(Interruptions)*. He is a new Minister...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: I have only one pointed question. The Government of Delhi gave order to DMRC to give contract to somebody. They selected few reputed organisations. Now, one is Gamon India. Now, Gamon India got this order. Gamon India, without the knowledge of DMRC, without the knowledge of the Government, and without the knowledge of the Technical Committee who approved the first contractor, gave the sub-contract to some Kallu Ram. Now, Kallu Ram is building the DMRC. So, should I believe that? And, that is the answer.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, you have made your point ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is this? Metro is built by Kallu Ram...*(Interruptions)*. वह तो बाहर यह बात चलती है कि सब चलता है। कानून के तहत चलता है या नहीं, यह बताइए। मंत्री जी, कानून के तहत जवाब दीजिए... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Ahluwaliaji, please, allow him to reply.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI E. AHAMMED): Sir, hon. Minister is not misleading the House. He only refers to what he is...*(Interruptions)*. He is also ready to correct if there is any mistake...*(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Let him complete the reply...*(Interruptions)*. Ahluwaliaji, you allow him to reply...*(Interruptions)*. First, allow the Minister to reply.

SHRI RAMDAS AGARWAL: Sir, I am raising a very serious question. Sir, the Minister's words, 'contract, sub-contract, sub-contract', should be removed from the record and then let him speak. He cannot legalise it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Okay, I will look into it. Now, please, allow the Minister to speak.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: If this whole work is done by sub-contractor and petty contractor, how can we accept it?...*(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Ahluwaliaji, you made your point. It is there on record....*(Interruptions)*. अहलुवालिया जी, बैठिए ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI SAUGATA RAY: Sir, I don't want to go into hair-splitting and semantics and interpretation of words at this stage. I know how to use the words...*(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, Mr. Rudy, this is not correct ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SAUGATA RAY: Sir, may I say with all the force at my command that the Government is in no mad rush and safety norms are not being compromised and will not be compromised in our efforts to complete the Metro before the Commonwealth Games. Safety is primary and that will be given the maximum importance. Only thing I want to point out is that the record of Delhi Metro with regard to safety is very good. Last time, in DMRC Phase-II, the injury frequency rate, which is a way of calculating the accident rate, was 0.4, as compared to Singapore's 1.1. Only London underground is little better with 0.32.

Sir, as far as safety is concerned, the record of DMRC is very good. We are not only concerned about the safety at the construction stage but we are also concerned about its safety when it will run. So far as running of Metros is concerned, the record of DMRC has been very good. It is a proud project of the country, and, I would request the hon. Members to see that the morale of those who are working for DMRC is not anyway damaged. We will take all possible precautions with regard to safety, and, all I want to say is that whatever questions the hon. Members have raised, will be answered when the Inquiry Report comes out on the 22nd July, 2009. Only after that, the report will be placed before the Parliament, and, further action regarding this matter will be taken. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, further discussion on the Budget (General), 2009-10. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, what we want to know ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, this is not... *(Interruptions)*

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, हमने पूछा था कि फर्स्ट फेज में 65 किलोमीटर आठ साल में पूरा हुआ, दूसरे फेज में 121 किलोमीटर चार वर्ष में क्यों हो रहा है? इसका जवाब नहीं दिया उन्होंने ! ...*(व्यवधान)*... These are important things. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, the questions are whether any engineer was present there; what was the capacity; whether that was supervised or not; how the crane failed etc. These are the easy things. We did not want a certificate for the Metro. We know the Metro. These are only few questions. It does not depend on the inquiry report to come.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Minister, do you want to say anything more? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAUGATA RAY: Sir, all I want to point out is our experience of Calcutta Metro. Mr. Prasad knows that as technology advances and as we gain experience, the speed of work increases. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I am from Calcutta. Calcutta Metro took 24 years to be built. There is no doubt that with the experience gained in the first phase, we are doing the work faster in the second phase. It is only natural progress of technology.
