

RAJYA SABHA

Tuesday, the 28th July, 1987/

6 Sarvana, 1909 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock. The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

INTRODUCTION OF MINISTER BY PRIME MINISTER

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI RAJIV GANDHI): Madam Deputy Chairman, I have pleasure in introducing to you and through you to the Members of this House, Shri M. L. Fotedar, Cabinet Minister for Steel and Mines.

DEMAND FOR SUSPENSION OF QUESTION HOUR

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Question No. 21.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to make a submission before the Question Hour is taken up... (Interruptions)...

THE SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): There is no such precedent. This is Question Hour and it should be taken up first.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has to make some submission... (Interruptions). Listen, he has to make some submission and I have allowed him.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Madhya Pradesh): Madam, under the rules we have given notices. How can they prevent us from speaking? (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed him to speak. There is no question why you... (Interruptions). Please be quiet... (Interruptions).

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया, यह कांग्रेस पार्टी की मीटिंग नहीं है यह **बर्दाश्त नहीं होगी... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: These remarks will be removed from the records.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Why? (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed Mr. Dipen Ghosh to speak. Let him speak. Let it go smoothly... (Interruptions). Please sit down. Please be quiet.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: You have allowed Mr. Kalpnath Rai... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be quiet.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Can't you control them?

SHRI KALPNATH RAI (Uttar Pradesh): Control him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am controlling everybody.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Restrain the Congress Party... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be quiet. Order please.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, I along with other leaders of the Opposition parties and groups in Rajya Sabha have made a request to you in writing yesterday afternoon that since we have given a notice of breach of privilege against the Prime Minister for making deliberately a false and misleading statement...

SOME HON MEMBERS: No, No.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:...in the Rajya Sabha on 28th April about the purchase of guns from Bofors and in that matter about the existence of middlemen and payment as kickbacks, therefore, in view of the importance of that notice, we request you to suspend the Question Hour today and take up that notice of breach of privilege against the Prime Minister immediately today at 11 o'clock. We have not heard anything from you in this regard. So, I take this opportunity to draw your attention to this request and let us know your reaction.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, we have also submitted a notice for your consideration today... (*Interruptions*).

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM (SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER): Let one Member speak from our side also.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): Madam, I am on a point of order... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has got a point of order on what Mr. Dipen Ghosh has said. Let him speak.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, You have allowed him to make a submission. We agreed. As a convention of this House, we have listened to him carefully. But madam, if you see the rules, a Member is not allowed to make any speech with regard to the privilege motion in this House... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): Madam, on this, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you do not want to listen to each other, I will start the Question Hour straightway... (*Interruptions*). I do not want to listen to anybody. Please be quiet.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, I have no quarrel with the Opposition. Whatever they want to say, let them say. Whenever a Member gives notice of breach of privilege, the Chairman gives his own ruling. Upto now I have not heard that a Member who has given notice for breach of privilege has been allowed to make a submission on the merits of the case.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am going to give a ruling. Mr. Gurupadaswamy.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam,...

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Punjab): Madam, I have a submission to make before he speaks. You should not permit every Member to say this way what they really want to say on a substantive motion which has not been admitted yet. Otherwise they serve their purpose that indirect way

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Not our purpose. For country's purpose. It is for the purpose of the people... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: Madam, you gave them an opportunity to make a submission only and they cannot misuse it like that to serve their purpose of obstructing the proceedings and maligning the government. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, the only purpose is that we are serving the purpose of the country and not of anybody. Let me tell this to the hon. Member there. At this stage, Madam... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be quiet. Please listen, I will allow two or three Members from this side. But they have to be very brief. Please listen. They have given me a notice that the Question Hour should

be suspended. They will speak only about the notice and not about the matter... (Interruptions). It cannot go on like that. No, Mr. Upendra, Nobody else will be allowed.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Why not?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: You cannot function like this. We should be heard.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, notice has been given by 12 Members of this side, leaders belonging to the various political parties.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everybody cannot speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We are not speaking about the privilege motion. We want that the Question Hour should be suspended and the privilege motion should be taken up first. That is our request.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please listen to me... (Interruptions). I have received notice only from the hon. Member, Mr. Jaswant Singh and another joint notice from 13 Members, and only one Member on their behalf can speak but not each and every Member. Mr. Dipen Ghosh already spoke and one Member who is a signatory to the joint notice can represent the case... (Interruptions).

श्री रशीद मसूद (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैंने भी क्वेश्चन आवर को सस्पेंड करने के लिये सेपरेट नोटिस दिया है ।... (व्यवधान)... लेकिन आपने मेरे नोटिस का जिक्र नहीं किया ? ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, you have already given a ruling.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO): Madam, I am on a point of order. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not suspending the Question Hour. They have just give a notice only. I am giving a ruling on the notice they have given. (Interruptions).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: You start the Question Hour, Madam. (Interruptions).

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): Madam Deputy Chairman, rule 38 says, "Unless the Chairman otherwise directs, the first hour of every sitting shall be available for the asking and answering of questions." (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am exactly going to do the same thing.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: (Interruption).

श्री रशीद मसूद : मैंने सेपरेट नोटिस दिया है क्वेश्चन आवर को सस्पेंड करने के लिए, आपने मेरे नोटिस का जिक्र क्यों नहीं किया ?

उपसभापति : वह आज डिस्कस हो रहा है ।... (व्यवधान)।

We have a calling attention about that You please sit down.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, Mr. Dipen Ghosh has already spoken on behalf of the Opposition.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, some of the Members are right...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now don't say about what they have said. (Interruptions).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I have not even made a submission. I may say one thing that Mr. Kalmadi has to learn many things. I have not made any submission at all.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF EXPENDITURE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI B. K. GADHVI): Madam, on a point of order.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What is the point of order? I have not even made my submission. My colleague, Mr. Dipen Ghosh has requested you on behalf of the Opposition that in view of the extraordinary situation arising out of Bofors Gun Deal, we requested you to suspend the Question Hour and allow a debate on the Privilege Motion against the Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*. Under rule 38, you have got the power to suspend any business of the House. We have only sought the suspension of the Question Hour under this rule. The Privilege Motion is against the Prime Minister.

(Interruptions)

We would not have sought your permission to suspend the Questions Hour if this question had not been important and crucial. The whole nation is looking at us.

(Interruptions)

Please suspend the Question Hour.
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing.

(Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You said you would allow three. Why are you going back?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, I said. But you have said...

(Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You said you would allow three, Shri Gurupadaswamy, Upendra and Sri Dipen Ghosh. You yourself that they would speak.

(Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Please let me go on.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You go on, please.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Madam, I want to make one submission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House has a point of order. I will allow that to be taken up first. Mr. N. D. Tiwari.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI NARAYAN DATT TIWARI): I rise with the utmost respect. The motion moved by the hon. Officiating Leader of the Opposition ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have not moved the motion. I have drawn the attention of the Deputy Chairman to our notice and requested her to suspend the Question Hour and to take up the notice of breach of privilege. It is a simple thing. But the Question Hour has to be suspended and notice of breach of privilege should be taken up.

SHRI NARAYAN DATT TIWARI: I have listened with utmost respect to the hon. the Officiating Leader of the Opposition and the submission made by my good friend Mr. Gurupadaswamy. Madam, the question of privilege is only permissible.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not allowed the motion of breach of privilege.

SHRI NARAYAN DATT TIWARI: Under rule 190, after the questions, Madam, the Question Hour is reflecting the privilege of the hon. Members.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please listen.

(Interruptions)

I am going to give the ruling and everything will be set right. You please listen to what I have to say.

(Interruptions)

I will allow. Listen. Mr. Upendra only for two minutes and then Mr. N. K. P. Salve only for two minutes and nobody else.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You said you will allow three opposition members.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. Please listen.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया, आप भेदभाव नहीं कर सकती हैं।

उपसभापति : नहीं कर रही हूँ। तेरह लोगों ने जो मेरे पास नोटिस जाइंटली दिया है उसमें सब से पहले दीपेन घोष का नाम है और उसके बाद एम०एस० गुरुपदस्वामी का नाम था।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : श्री एम०एस० गुरुपदस्वामी के बाद श्री उपेन्द्र का नाम है और उनके बाद मेरा नाम है।

उपसभापति : उनके बाद आपका नाम नहीं है।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी जी का है।

उपसभापति : आप सब लोगों का कहना है इसलिए.... (व्यवधान)

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : इसूज समझ भी नहीं पा रहे हैं.... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you don't allow me to speak, then I will give my ruling. If you don't go in an orderly way, then I am going to give my ruling.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: You read out your ruling.

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : वह सदन की बात समझ नहीं पाए हैं जो भी उन्होंने कहा है वह इरलेबेट है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Upendra, you speak now. (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: How can I speak when they are shouting us down like this?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आप क्वेश्चन आवर एलौ करिए। पहले आपने क्वेश्चन आवर शुरू किया। फिर उसके बाद इस पर बहस हो रही है... (व्यवधान) क्वेश्चन आवर का बीस मिनट बीत चुका है आप क्वेश्चन आवर शुरू करिए.... (व्यवधान)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, you called me all right, but I am not responsible for the disturbance. You are not restraining them. Please restrain them first.

उपसभापति : क्वेश्चन आवर का ज्यादा समय बीत रहा है। मैं आपसे निवेदन करूंगी कि... (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेश कलमाडी : मैडम, बीस मिनट बर्बाद हो चुके हैं।

श्री पर्वतनेनि उपेन्द्र : देश को बर्बाद करते हो तुम लोग और यहां कहते हो कि 20 मिनट बर्बाद हो गये हैं।

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : आपको हमें सुनना होगा।

उपसभापति : अगर मैं सब को टाईम दे दूँ; तो क्वेश्चन आवर पूरा चला जायेगा। Mr. Upendra, please speak now.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam Deputy Chairman,

while giving notice for suspension of the Question Hour, we have taken into consideration the extraordinary situation in the country today. (*Interruptions*) While making a statement in this House on April 28, the Prime Minister told deliberately * to this House... (*Interruptions*) You can shut down the people here but you cannot shut the voice of the people in the country. Go and see what the people of the country are talking about you. (*Interruptions*) Go and see outside what the country is talking about you and your Prime Minister.

Madam, it is a very serious situation. Therefore, I had given a motion of breach of privilege in the last Session also. The Chairman, while giving a ruling on May 11 dealt with only one part of the privilege motion to which I was one of the signatories... (*Interruption*) At that time... (*Interruptions*)... on the basis of available information, he said that there was no breach of privilege against the Prime Minister. But subsequent events have proved that the Prime Minister had said deliberately * to this House and committed a breach of privilege in this House. (*Interruptions*). Therefore, you have to consider this motion because there is great agitation in this country on this issue. What the people are thinking in the country is more relevant than these people's shouting here. Therefore, that motion has to be taken up today. In view of this, you please suspend the Question Hour and consider the privilege motion. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I am entirely on the tenability of his request. (*Interruptions*). Madam, his request is this: "Kindly suspend the Question Hour and take into consideration the motion we have moved of breach of privilege against the Prime Minister". My submission, Madam, is... (*Interruptions*)... that

if it is tenable within the rules, you may consider it. But this is, on the threshold itself, untenable. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Yes. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: It is untenable apart from the fact that under rule 38 you do not have any such authority... (*Interruptions*)... and under rule 187 only a motion on a breach of privilege can be entertained subject to the approval of the Chairman. Assuming for a moment... (*Interruptions*)... Assuming for a moment that you have to consider his request and suspend the Question Hour and then if you reject his privilege motion, what happens to the Question Hour?... (*Interruptions*). My second submission in this: Suppose you have to rule it out after giving due consideration and you give such a ruling. What happens to the Question Hour if it is suspended in advance?... (*Interruptions*)... My submission is that in view of the rules, this is entirely untenable on the threshold itself and should be rejected. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, yesterday, he said that you have got the powers. (*Interruptions*). Madam, yesterday, in your room, Mr. Salve said that you have got the powers to suspend the Question Hour and now he says you cannot. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): How is it that they are talking about rules? (*Interruptions*). How can they talk about rules? ... (*Interruptions*)... There are many questions which are to be answered and they are talking about rules... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam, ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, you give your ruling now; you

have heard everybody. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam, on rule 58... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down now... (*Interruptions*)... Everybody should sit down now. Now, there are thirteen people who have given the notice and their names are... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam, an argument is being given now. (*Interruptions*). Madam, an argument is being given by Mr. Salve and I have to reply to it... (*Interruptions*)... and I would like to address myself to that argument (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down... (*Interruptions*). A notice has been given... (*Interruptions*)... A notice has been given by thirteen people and out of those thirteen people, two or three have already spoken and the others are Shri Balaram, Shri Murasoli Maran, Shri S. P. Malaviya, Shri Aurora, Shri Chitta Basu, Shri Advani, Shri Virendra Verma, Shri Nirmal Chatterjee, Prof. Lakshmananna and Shri Satyanarayan Reddy. Another separate notice was given by Shri Jaswant Singh. So, anybody, if he wants to say anything... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Include me and Mr. Vajpayee. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No... (*Interruptions*)... Even in that case, all the three people belong to one party. So, you should decide as to who should speak. One of you only can speak. (*Interruptions*). I will give change only to one... (*Interruptions*)... Only one of you can speak. Mr. Vajpayee, you may speak or Mr. Advani.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Advani may speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then Mr. Jaswant Singh... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: You have already allowed two people... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: They have given separate notices... (*Interruptions*)... Please listen. They have given separate notices... (*Interruptions*). I am going to give the ruling after this is finished... (*Interruptions*).

श्री रशीद मसूद : मेरा सेपरेट नोटिस है . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please go back to your seat. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Advani. For two minutes only. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: You will have to restrain them. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jacob has a point of order. Mr. Jacob.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, may I say one sentence? The subject moved by the same group of parties is the same. It is not a separate thing. You have already allowed time for the distinguished Members to express their views and submit their motion before you. And after giving your thought to them you have absolute right to give us your ruling. We are ready to listen to your ruling. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After Mr. Advani speaks for two minutes I am going to give my ruling. (*Interruptions*) I request you to please sit down. (*Interruptions*) I say you please sit down. (*Interruptions*) I am not going to... (*Interruptions*) I have already made it very clear. Please listen.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE

(SHRI P. R. DAS MUNSHI): If tomorrow 60 Members come up, are you going to allow all the 60 Members to speak? Let there be a day fixed for this. This is the Question House. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaswant Singh has given a separate notice. If you speak, Mr. Advani, he will not get a chance. Either you speak or let him speak. (Interruptions). Then you won't get the chance. Mr. Jaswant Singh gets the chance. (Interruptions)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: मैडम, दो अलग-अलग चीजें, हैं एक है—सस्पेंशन (अवधान)

उपसभापति: नहीं-नहीं। एक ही पार्टी से दो मيم्वर नहीं बोल सकते हैं। आप डिमांड कीजिए, किसको बोलना है।

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): On a point of order. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request you to please sit down. I knew what is your point of order. I know the rules. I am going to give a ruling on that only after he finishes. Yes, Mr. Advani. (Interruptions) Mr. Advani, you may please speak. I am listening to you.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I have to speak to the House.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am giving my ruling now.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: You cannot give your ruling unless you have heard me.

(Interruptions)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Please allow the Leader of the House. You have allowed them.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Advani, please speak.

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी: मैं इतने शोर में नहीं बोल सकता (अवधान)

उपसभापति: मैं आप सब को रिक्वेस्ट करती हूँ। मैं रुकिया दे रही हूँ। आप दो मिनट के लिए रुक जाएँ। उनका बोला है कि मैं दो मिनट का टाइम दे रही हूँ आप सुनिए। (अवधान)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Please allow me to speak for two minutes only. I want to raise a point of order on what he has said.

(Interruptions).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, there is a conspiracy. Their attempt is not to allow the opposition to work.

(Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Chairman, rule 38 says, "Unless the Chairman otherwise directs, the first hour of every sitting shall be available for the asking and answering of questions." This rule itself contemplates that there could be situations where the Chairman would direct otherwise. Subsequently, rule 267 empowers us, any Member of the House, to move for suspension of the rules. We have formally given notice... (Interruptions)...for suspension of rules (Interruptions) Why are we asking for the suspension of rules? Today my friends on the other side were questioning. But there is no doubt that an extra-ordinary crisis has arisen.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Advani, instead of making a submission, you are trying to make an allegation. That is not allowed. (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am not making any allegation. (Interruptions) I have merely tried to highlight that today... (Interruptions) Madam, in the last session so many statements were made. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now I am giving the ruling. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Advani has not been allowed to speak. He should continue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am on my legs.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Advani has not been allowed to continue. He must be allowed to complete.

(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH): Madam, before you give the ruling, kindly give me just one minute to make a submission.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He did not say anything unparliamentary. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In your submission... (*Interruptions*) Whatever you have said, I have heard.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He is only saying why the Question Hour is to be suspended.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no question before the House.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He said, 'an extra-ordinary situation'. What is wrong in that?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He cannot go on any other subject. Now, please sit down. (*Interruptions*) I have given you the opportunity. Now I am giving my ruling.

SHRI K. MOHANAN (Kerala): Madam, I am on a point of order. You hear his submission first. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please sit down.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What did he say? He did not say anything unparliamentary. He said "an extraordinary situation"... There is nothing wrong in it. Why don't you hear him first?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, one minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, please cooperate with me. (*Interruptions*). Will you not allow me to give the ruling?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Advani should be allowed to complete first.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I gave you two minutes, Mr. Advani.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You must hear him first. Let him complete. But they are disturbing. (*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : असाधारण परिस्थिति क्यों है यह तो बता देने दीजिए । (ब्यवधान)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: It is a crisis of unprecedented dimensions. In these 40 years since Independence, the Prime Minister has never come under a cloud in this manner. Madam, in the last session of Parliament, several statements were made by the Prime Minister which have turned out to be untrue... (*Interruptions*). In these 40 years since Independence, it has never happened. This Government has lost the confidence of the people and so the situation warrants that the statements made by the Prime Minister be taken into consideration before anything else. The Privilege Motion deals with that ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. You have completed now.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: May I point out how extraordinary the situation in Haryana is represented in Parliament by 15 Members all belonging to Congress. But in the Haryana Assembly the Congress has been wiped out almost completely... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri H. K. L. Bhagat.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Shri Advani has not completed. He must be allowed to complete. This is my point of order. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everything in the name of point of order cannot be allowed.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Mr. Advani has spoken for ten minutes already.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT): I am opposing the motion for suspension of Question Hour. I request you to give your ruling. I oppose the motion.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: But let me complete.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: We cannot listen to him. He has taken already ten minutes.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Let me complete. Madam, you ask him to sit down.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am giving my ruling now... (Interruptions).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Please suspend the Question Hour.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down... (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You have already allowed so many people to raise points of order... (Interruptions). Madam, Mr. Nirmal Chatterjee is on a point of order. Please listen to him. (Interruptions).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Please give your ruling. Madam. (Interruptions)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। आप इसको रोक नहीं सकती हैं। क्या इस सदन में पोस्टर दिखाना नियमों के अनुकूल है? ... (व्यवधान) मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है.. (व्यवधान)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPEN-DRA: Madam, is the display of posters in the House in order? From tomorrow, we will also bring all the posters and cartoons and display them here.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : आप इसके बारे में अपनी व्यवस्था कीजिए। यह मेरे पास है।

SHRI K. MOHANAN: Now, you are aware of the CIA? CIA agents are in your kitchen. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody will display newspapers or anything of that kind from either side. (Interruptions).

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everybody is raising a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPEN-DRA: Madam, Mr. Chatterjee is on his legs for the last one hour... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Chatterjee. I am not allowing you. You cannot speak when I am on my legs.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You can overrule his point of order. But you must listen to his point of order first.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: Before you were on your legs, I rose on a point of order. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, I am giving my ruling. My ruling is that the Question Hour cannot be suspended. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, what is your ruling? I could not hear because of the shouting. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We have not heard your ruling. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we will take up the Question Hour. Shrimati Sudha Vijay Joshi.

SHRIMATI SUDHA VIJAY JOSHI: Question No. 21.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Wildlife sanctuaries

*21. SHRIMATI SUDHA VIJAY JOSHI: Will the Minister of ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS be pleased to state:

(a) what are the names of the places in the country where wildlife sanctuaries are located;

(b) what steps are being taken to protect rare species of animals in those sanctuaries; and

(c) what are the proposals for setting up more wildlife sanctuaries in the countries?

THE MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI BHAJAN LAL): (a) A statement is placed on the Table of the House [See Appendix CXLII, Annure No. 1]

(b) The steps being taken to protect rare animal species in Wildlife sanctuaries include:

(1) minimizing fire damage by preventing spread of fires and quickly controlling them.

(2) Improving habitat so that wild animals do not have to venture outside the sanctuary area to meet their food and water requirement.

(3) Restricting grazing by domestic cattle & fencing vulnerable point along a sanctuary's boundary.

(4) Increased deployment of protection staff in and around wildlife sanctuaries.

(5) Strengthening of communications by providing telephones wireless systems and vehicles in wildlife sanctuaries.

(6) Providing arms to staff engaged in protection of areas threatened by organised poaching.

(7) Involvement of local people, especially of tribal people in protection.

(8) Offering rewards to people helping in detection of poaching and other wildlife offences.

(c) the establishment of new wildlife sanctuaries is carried out by the State Governments.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, you have to allow the privilege motion now. (Interruptions)