

## RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 31st July, 1986|9 Srawana,  
1908 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,  
Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

### RE. SUSPENSION OF THE QUESTION HOUR

Mr. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 201.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I have a submission to make. (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN. You know the rules.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: No, Sir. No rules now. This is a very serious matter. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KALPNATH RAI (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, how can you allow it during the question Hour? (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, Sir. This is a very serious matter. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: It cannot be allowed (*Interruptions*). It cannot be allowed.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, it is a very serious matter. (*Interruptions*). Kindly listen to me, Sir. (*Interruptions*). It is a matter relating to the prestige of the Members of the House and we have given notice. (*Interruptions*). Sir, I have given notice for the suspension of the Question Hour. (*Interruptions*). You kindly listen to me, Sir. Kindly listen to what we have got to say. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: Sir, now it is the Question Hour. This cannot be allowed during the Question Hour. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, we have given notice for suspension of the Question Hour. This is a very serious matter. It relates to the prestige of

the Members of the House. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: It cannot be allowed. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir,...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing should be recorded. (*Interruptions*). Let nothing be recorded.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:\*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka):\*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:\*

SHRI KALPNATH RAI:\*

SOME HON. MEMBERS:\*

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to hear a point of order. I have given the floor to Mr. Vajpayee. Yes, Mr. Vajpayee.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Chairman, Sir, we have given notice of our intention to seek your permission to our motion that the question Hour be suspended. Sir, you listen to us and if in your wisdom you decide to reject our request, that will be perfectly in order. Under Rule 267, rules can be suspended. We are going to have questions under a particular rule...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You read Rule 38.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Sir, you allow us to make out a case.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You read Rule 38 also.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Sir, you can reject our request, but you allow us to make out a case about the suspension of the Question Hour.

\*Not recorded as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, I want to make a submission.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am going to regulate the House.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Vajpayee has pointed out that myself and certain other leaders on this side have requested you in writing that in view of certain developments taking place outside the House involving the prestige of Members of Parliament...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We are Members of Parliament. We have got prestige. (Interruptions) I have not elaborated the subject.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You cannot make a submission unless it relates to rules. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am quoting the rules. We have written a letter to you requesting you to suspend the Question Hour and to discuss certain matters. At least we expect a reply from you before the Question Hour starts. Sir, we want a reply from you. Naturally we must be given an opportunity to be heard and than you can dispose of our request.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Rule 38 is very clear.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: And Rule 238 also

MR. CHAIRMAN: Not Rule 238... (Interruptions) Will you please be seated? Rule 38 says: "Unless the Chairman otherwise directs, the first hour of every sitting shall be available..."

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: "Otherwise directs"—Sir, it is your discretion. You have a discretion. You can do that. I would like to draw the attention of the Prime Minister... It is a very serious matter.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I am referring to Rule 238.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will allow any Member who wishes to talk on rule and only the rule.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I talk about the rule itself. May I with your permission request you to refer to Rule 238. Sir, I draw your attention to Rule 238. It refers to certain things to be observed while speaking. It says:

"A member while speaking shall not—

(i) refer to any matter of fact on which a judicial decision is pending;

(ii) make a personal charge against a member;

(iii) use offensive expressions about the conduct or proceedings of the Houses or any State Legislature;..."

This Rule does not refer to the specific case which you have raised. You have got absolute discretion in the matter. Rules can be suspended and you can permit us to make a reference to the motion that we have already sent to you. Therefore, Sir, rules do not bar... (Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBERS: The Chairman has given the ruling.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He has drawn the attention... (Interruptions). Sir, the Prime Minister is here, fortunately. The other day we made a request to him when we met him that a code of conduct is necessary in regard to Ministers, (Interruptions) Sir, this has come in the wake of the recent debate. It is unfortunate. I would like to request the Prime Minister who is here to intervene and assure the House that in future at least the Ministers will conduct themselves well with the Members of Parliament and not indulge... (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, I want to speak on the rule. (Interruptions).

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA (Maharashtra): Sir, I only want to bring to your notice that first of all no point of order is raised during the Question Hour. The whole day is there to

raise any number of points of order...  
(Interruptions).

आन्तरिक सुरक्षा विभाग से राज्य मंत्री  
(श्री अरुण नेहरू): आप शांति से सुनिये

डा. (श्रीमती) नाजमा हेपतुल्ला : बैठ जाइये, आप सुन लीजिए । आपकी बात सुन ली, दूसरों की बात सुन लीजिए. . . .  
(अवधान)

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALA-  
VIYA (Uttar Pradesh): No point of  
order has been raised.

There is a motion for the suspension  
of the Question Hour. No point of order  
has been raised.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTUL-  
LA: Sir, I want to bring to the notice of  
the leaders of the Opposition parties that  
once a ruling is given from the Chair,  
there cannot be any other point of order  
raised. (Interruption)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra)  
Sir, I am on a point of order. (Interrup-  
tions) Mr. Chairman, Sir you had called  
the Question. Sir, after calling the Ques-  
tion, it means that you have rejected their  
demand.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya  
Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, Sir...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have to speak  
only on the rule.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am only  
speaking on the rule. Mr. Chairman,  
Sir, you have drawn the attention of the  
House to the rule that is most pertinent  
to the subject matter that we are discus-  
sing, viz. rule 38 which says that "unless  
the Chairman otherwise directs, the first  
hour of every sitting shall be available for  
the asking and answering of questions."  
This rule itself contemplates... (Interrup-  
tions) This rule itself contemplates that  
though it is desirable that normally every  
first hour shall be devoted to Question  
Hour, there can be circumstances where  
the Chairman can direct otherwise.  
(Interruptions) Sir, I am confining my  
self to a discussion on the rules, and what  
are those circumstances, whether they

really warrant the suspension of Question  
Hour or not is a matter for the Chairman  
to decide and... (Interruptions) It is for  
the Chairman to decide and not for them  
to decide. Mr. Chairman, Sir, so this  
rule itself contemplates certain situations.  
Today, this morning, the Opposition lea-  
ders in a large number, I believe, have  
given notice of a motion to you seeking  
suspension of the Question Hour under  
rule 267 which again empowers you,  
not the House, not that side or this side,  
but you, Sir, to suspend the Question  
Hour in spite of rule 38. And it is,  
therefore, incumbent that either you could  
have called them in the Chamber, heard  
from them and on that basis rejected or  
if there has been no time, it is entirely  
up to you to listen to those people who  
have given notice of this motion for  
suspension as to what is their case, why  
they have sought suspension, what are  
those circumstances, and then you can  
decide. Whatever you decide, it will be  
for the House to accept. (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. A. G. Kulkarni  
(Interruptions).

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharash-  
tra): Sir, I bring to your notice Rules  
267 and 238. We in the Opposition  
came to you; we submitted that the Ques-  
tion Hour should be dispensed with and  
this should be sorted out. I am not going  
into the merits of the case.

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: What is the  
new statement?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: If I  
divulge, Chairman will not allow it but  
you will listen. If you are prepared to  
listen... (Interruptions) Sir, there have  
been many occasions in the past; you can  
refer to the conventions; you can refer  
to your office, when the rule has been  
suspended by many a Chairman upon ex-  
traordinary circumstances. Now, it is  
for your judgement to decide on the treat-  
ment meted out to Members of Parliament  
by a senior Cabinet Minister. This it-  
self forms an extraordinary circumstances...  
(Interruptions). What is he talking? Sir,  
my request to you is, under this rule,  
insult to Members of Parliament by a

senior member of the Cabinet is a matter of a very serious nature. The Prime Minister, the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and leaders of Opposition have to sort it out. I would only request you to find a way out... (Interruptions).

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** Sir, you are not allowing me. I am the aggrieved party... (Interruptions).

**THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT):** With respect to all my friends on that side, I may point out that there is absolutely no rule for suspension of Question Hour. Whatever they are quoting is totally irrelevant. Now, the only rule which permits suspension of the rules is 267, which says:

"Any member may, with the consent of the Chairman, move that any rule may be suspended in its application to a particular motion before the Council and if the motion is carried the rule in question shall be suspended for the time being."

There is no other way out; you cannot suspend the Question Hour. This does not apply here at all. There is no question of suspension.

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** Sir, I am the aggrieved party. Apart from the rules which give you extraordinary discretionary power, there are also rules of civilised behaviour. And that is the rule which I want to mention... (Interruptions). It is not a question of the honour of a few Members of Parliament on this side; it may happen to that side also. I am raising a general question. This is the question of a Minister's misbehaviour with a large number... (Interruptions). Will you listen? (Interruptions). You first listen and then try to defend... (Interruptions). The Prime Minister is here; I am leaving it to his judgement. You first listen and then decide... (Interruptions). That is not the way. It is a question of the honour of Members of Parliament which you have to defend... (Interruptions).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am going to give a ruling.

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** Let me complete... (Interruptions). Please allow me to complete. You must hear me. This is a very serious matter... (Interruptions). I have brought it to the notice of the Prime Minister; he has not reacted so far. It is his duty to react. He cannot condone such misbehaviour by the Ministers; which is bringing a bad name to him. Why don't you control them? They cannot misbehave with Members of Parliament, and you are encouraging them; Mr. Prime Minister, this is not proper... (Interruptions). You must intervene... (Interruptions).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I can allow a Member only if he speaks on the rules and nothing else.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** Sir, I pleaded with you and I, along with other leaders, had submitted to you in writing this morning... (Interruptions). I think here is a Chairman on the Chair and also the Leader of the House... (Interruptions).

**AN HON. MEMBER:** You must obey the Chair.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Dipen is leader of a major group; just give him opportunity... (Interruptions). You don't want to hear me? I said he must confine himself to the rules and nothing else.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** May I know from the Chair where is rule whereby any Member, individually or collectively, can rule out the instructions or the ruling of the Chair? Is there any rule? (Interruptions). Is there any rule? Mr. Chairman, I want to know the rule from the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, the Leader of the House or even the Prime Minister of India whereby... (Interruptions)... whereby a Member belonging to any party here can overrule the directions from the Chair... (Interruptions)... because... (Interruptions). Sir, I am on my legs; I am not going to yield; I am the last person to yield to the shouting; I have got enough lung power to counter-shout; I am not going to yield to the shouting... (Interruptions). Nobody on that side can bully me down. I am on my legs under

the directions from the Chair...*(Interruptions)*. I am not going to be bullied down; I am the last person to do so, when I am on my legs under the directions of the Chair...*(Interruptions)*. I only wanted to say that it is upto the Chair to decide.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am very glad that Mr. Dipen Ghosh has said that it is for the Chair to rule. I am ready to give the ruling...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: But before that, I wanted to make a submission...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only on the rules you can speak, Mr. Gurupadaswamy.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, we want to end this controversy. This controversy should not go on. This has unfortunately come in the wake of the debate we had day before yesterday. The Prime Minister is here. He is attending the House. We are fortunate to have him here. He has been keeping quiet all the while. I would request him to say a few words and assure us that in future his colleagues will not misbehave with Members of Parliament.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, before you give your ruling, please listen to me.

*(Interruptions)*

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI RAJIV GANDHI): Mr. Chairman, Sir, as the hon. Member wants to hear a few words from me...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Assurance.

SHRI RAJIV GANDHI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, as the hon. Member wants to hear a few words from me, I am ready to hear your ruling...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, this a very serious matter. I am very sorry the Prime Minister is treating it in a casual manner. Please give me only three minutes. So much time has been wasted...*(Interruptions)* Mr. Prime Minister, you cannot control your people. See how silent you are and how your

people are behaving...*(Interruptions)*. Sir, just give me one minute, I will finish my submission.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have all spoken...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, I am the aggrieved party. Please allow me.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : मान्यवर, मैं आज के क्वश्चन आवर...*(अवधान)* चर्चा करना चाहूंगा और नियमों की ओर भी, जिसकी चर्चा आडवाणी जी कर रहे हैं, नियम 38 और 267...*(अवधान)* 11 बजे से प्रश्नोत्तर काल शुरू होता है और 11 बजे कर 25 मिनट हो गये हैं। मेरा प्रश्न संख्या 202 है।

अब आप, मान्यवर, कोई व्यवस्था दें, न दें, 25 मिनट तक क्वश्चन आवर सस्पेंड हो रहा। इसलिए मेरा निवेदन यह है कि जब 25 मिनट तक क्वश्चन आवर सस्पेंड हो रहा, तो इसको पहले सुन लें और उसके बाद अपनी व्यवस्था दें क्योंकि परसों भी इस विषय पर चर्चा हुई थी।

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, my point is about the Prime Minister. He should not have replied in this way...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, you should hear us...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am going to give my ruling...*(Interruptions)*.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: \*Continued speaking.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record...*(Interruptions)*. I am not allowing, I am going to give my ruling...*(Interruptions)*. Yes, Leader of the House.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Whatever the differences in the House, it has to run by the respect of the

\*Not recorded.

Chair. On many occasions we have had differences, but we have... (*Interruptions*). Now, the Chair, in its wisdom, after, weighing everything, has given a ruling. It is for us to abide by the ruling and I would request the Members to abide by the ruling and allow the Chair to conduct the affairs of the House. (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: \*Continued speaking.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:\*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think enough is enough. Whatever you wanted to say, you have said, though nobody understood what others said. Now I give my ruling that under Rule 38... (*Interruptions*) Under Rule 38, unless the Chairman otherwise directs, the first hour will be Question Hour. Chairman has not directed otherwise. The question Hour will continue.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We are not satisfied with your ruling. We are not satisfied with the reply of the Prime Minister also. So we are walking out.

(At this stage some hon. Members left the Chamber)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Sir, this is a very unusual phenomenon. After the Chair has given a ruling, giving all opportunity to them, that ruling of the Chair should be brought in such light by walking out. I think I am expressing the feelings of the Members of this House.

SHRI SAT PAUL MITTAL (Punjab): Sir, I request you that the entire proceedings must be expunged.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing has gone on record because the Reporters could not write anything. There was so much shouting that they could not note even a single sentence. Therefore nothing will be reported.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEP-TULLA: Sir, it is a question of breach of privilege. That should come on record, the way the Opposition has behaved.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश): अप की रूलिंग के बाद अपॉजिशन वाकआउट कर गया यह रेकार्ड में आना चाहिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You give a separate notice. Question No. 201. Shri Narayanasamy. The question has been put.

### ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

#### Setting up of Advisory Council for 20-Point Programme

201. SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Will the Minister of PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that an Advisory Council is going to be set up to advise the Ministry of Programme Implementation on the Twenty-Point Programme;

(b) whether Government are aware that in implementation of the Twenty-Point Programme, major responsibilities have been entrusted to the Municipalities and the Panchayat offices; and

(c) whether Government have reviewed the implementation of the Twenty-Point Programme; if not, whether any cell is likely to be set up for checking the progress of the Programme?

THE MINISTER OF PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (SHRI A. B. A. GHANI KHAN CHOUDHURY): (a) A proposal to this effect is under the consideration of the Government.

(b) Revised Twenty-Point Programme forms an integral part of the plan of States|Union Territories and Central Ministries. The implementation of the Programme is being done by the States and Union Territories and they have been advised to form committees at block, district and State levels for proper implementation and monitoring of 20-Point Programme.