

की गई। माननीय सदस्य भी बिहार के हैं और मैं जानता हूँ कि उन्हें इसकी चिन्ता होगी, लेकिन यह किस्सा बँसा नहीं है जैसा कि आम तौर से समझा जा रहा है, फिर भी सरकार विधिवत इसके संबंध में कोई विचार करेगी, कोई मौका देखेगी तथा इसके बारे में कुछ विचार करेगी।

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी (मध्य प्रदेश) : यह एक्सपोर्ट के लायनेस दिए गए हैं और यह बात सही है कि दस बिहार के ही इस प्रकार के एक्सपोर्ट हैं, क्योंकि उसी के पीछे ये सारी चीजें होती हैं, बसिक चीज तो यह है।

उपसभापति : सरकार इस पर ध्यान देगी।

SHRI S. W. DHABE (Maharashtra):  
You must direct the Government to make a statement.

श्री कल्पनाथ राय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदया, मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि आप इस मामले में सरकार को डायरेक्टिव दें कि वह इस संबंध में बयान दे जो कि कंसर्ड मिनिस्टर हैं वे बयान दें।

उपसभापति : यह मैटर सीरियस है और सरकार इस बारे में ध्यान देगी।

#### STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS

(i) Collision of 138 up Amritsar-Bilaspur Chhatisgarh Express with down Tughlakabad goods Train at Raja-Ki-Mandi Station of Central Railway on 13th June, 1985.

(ii) Collision of a private Bus with a goods Train at A manned level crossing between Dr. Kadhakrishnan Nagar and Monvani Stations of Western Railway on 16th June, 1985.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE  
MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI  
MADHAVRAO SCINDIA): Madam,

I deeply regret to apprise the House of two unfortunate train accidents on 13-5-1985 at Raja-Ki-Mandi near Agra and on 16-6-1985 at Dr. Radhakrishnan Nagar near Ratlam.

On 13-6-1985, 138 Up Amritsar-Bilaspur Chhatisgarh Express bound for Bilaspur collided with a goods train bound for Tughlakabad at Raja-Kj-Mandi station. The accident occurred a few minutes after Chhatisgarh Express started from Raja-Ki-Mandi station where it had a scheduled stoppage. As a result of this collision, 40 passengers lost their lives, 15 sustained grievous, 18 simple and 9 trivial injuries. The cost of damage to Railway property has been estimated at Rs. 6,30,000/- approximately.

A Medical Relief Van was immediately rushed from Agra Cantt. which arrived the site with 2 railway doctors and other para-medical staff. Simultaneously, assistance was sought from Sarojini Naidu Hospital, Dr. Sarkar's Nursing Home and the army authorities for medical aid. Civil, army and railway doctors rendered first aid and rushed the injured to local hospitals at Agra.

I alongwith Membe, Traffic, Railway Board, rushed to the site of accident for overseeing the relief arrangements. I called on the injured who were admitted in the local hospitals. Divisional Railway Manager, Central Railway, Jhansil alongwith other senior officers including the Medical Superintendent rushed to the site from Jhansi immediately on being informed about the accident. General Manager, Chief Traffic Safety Superintendent and the Commissioner of Railway Safety, Central Circle, also reached the site later from Bombay.

For relief operations, Railway Accidents Relief Train was sent from Agra Cantt. Civil authorities, with the help of the local residents also gave help in the rescue operations.

Ex-gratia relief was arranged on the spot to the next of kin of those who died and to the injured persons.

An *ad-hoc* Claims Commissioner is being appointed to decide the claims for compensation in this case.

[Shri Madhavrao Scindia]

The Commissioner of Railway Safety, Western Circle, functioning independently of Railways under the Ministry of Civil Aviation & Tourism, has conducted a statutory enquiry into this Accident. His Preliminary Report has since been received. According to his Provisional Finding, the probable cause of accident was manipulation of the point detection relay without physical verification at site. The Report is under examination. I will like to assure the House that staff responsible for the lapse would be severely taken up. Already 7 employees have been placed under suspension.

The other unfortunate accident took place at Dr. Radhakrishnan Nagar at a manned level crossing on 16-6-1985, when a private bus collided with a goods train resulting in casualties. As a result of the collision, 15 bus passengers lost their lives, 28 sustained grievous injuries and 16 minor injuries.

Immediately on receipt of the information, Railway Medical Van with doctors and paramedical staff were rushed to the site of the accident from Ratlam. Railway doctors and other senior officers also left for the site by road. Civil authorities also rushed to the site and arranged transportation of the injured to the local hospital without loss of time. General Manager, Western Railway, and the Chief Traffic Safety Superintendent rushed from Bombay.

I along with Member, Mechanical, Railway Board visited the site of accident and called on the injured persons in the Hospital.

Ex-gratia payment to the next of kin of 'he dead and to the injured persons was arranged.

This accident has been enquired into by the Commissioner of Railway Safety, North Eastern Circle. According to his findings, the collision took place due to the private bus attempting to cross the level crossing whose gates were kept open to road traffic in the face of an approaching train. The Assistant Station Master of Dr. Radhakrishnan Nagar station and

Gateman of the Level Crossing have been held responsible for the collision. They have been placed under suspension and FIR has been lodged against them. Disciplinary action against them is being initiated.

I would like to assure the House that every possible effort is being made to minimise the number of train accidents. We have recently constituted 4 High Level Safety Teams to carry out intensive inspections on all Zonal Railways, particularly of those sections which have larger incidence of accidents. These teams shall directly report to the Railway Board and the action taken on their report would be monitored at the highest level.

SHRI SULTAN SINGH (Haryana): Madam, I want to seek a clarification on this statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Those who wanted to seek clarifications, have already given their names. You also give your name and in your turn you may seek the clarification. Yes, Mr. Mostafa Bin Quasem.

SHRI MOSTAFA BIN QUASEM (West Bengal): Madam Deputy Chairman, we are once again discussing some unfortunate and sad incidents of railway accidents in our country. I take this opportunity to express my heart-felt sympathies for the bereaved families as a result of these accidents.

Madam, we are very sorry to note that railway accidents are becoming, more or less, a regular feature in our country. And we are still more sorry to point out that we are being accustomed to the practice of the hon. Railway Minister making statements in this august House and the other House, statements more or less of similar nature, namely, that after the accident the relief train was rushed, relief measure were taken, some compensation has been given to the victims and adequate steps are being taken by the Railway Administration to minimise railway accidents.

Madam, I remember and you also would perhaps remember that during the last session the Minister of State for Railways said and assured us that the Railway

Ministry is seriously thinking of taking some adequate measure to minimise railway accidents in our country. (*Time Bell rings*).

Madam, I would like to know from the hon. Railway Minister what concrete steps have actually been taken so far by the Railways to minimise railway accidents in our country. Secondly, Madam, the fact remains and it is our experience that there has been a considerable increase in the goods movement and passenger movement through the country by the railways. But the rolling stock position has not been proportionately improved. There are other shortcomings like the worn-out railway tracks which require immediate renewal and replacement, worn-out bridges which require immediate repairs are not replaced or repaired timely. There is a general tendency to attribute railway accidents to human failure. I would like to far shortcomings like non-replacement of worn-out tracks, non-repair of weak bridges etc. are responsible for the railway accidents in our country, and if the finding is that the shortcomings in this direction are mainly responsible for the railway accidents, what is the Government going to do or is actually thinking of doing in order to do away with these shortcomings. With these words, I conclude. Thank you.

**श्री कैलाश पति मिश्र (बिहार) :**  
महोदया, मैं एक उदाहरण के साथ अपना प्रश्न रखना चाहता हूँ। जमशेदपुर में स्टील फैक्ट्री है, बगल में नया डेवलप्ड एरिया आदित्यपुर है, आदित्यपुर में छः रेलवे ट्रैक हैं, आबादी दोनों तरफ बस गयी है। एक तरफ कालेज है, दूसरी तरफ बच्चों का स्कूल है, इधर दफतर है तो उधर क्वार्टर। कई हजार लोग छोटे छोटे बच्चों से लेकर बूढ़े तक इस पार से उस पार जाते हैं। अब हालत यह है कि छः ट्रैक में से चार तो केवल टाटा कम्पनी के अपने यार्ड के लिए रिजर्व्ड हैं।

**उपसभापति :** यह जो एक्सीडेंट है उसके विषय में है ? अगर हम सम्पूर्ण

रेलवे की बात करोगे कि तो बम्ब क बारे में ही सारा दिन निकल जाएगा। इसी एक्सीडेंट पर बोलों तो अच्छा है। जो स्टेटमेंट मंत्री जी ने दिया है उस पर आप कुछ सुझाव देना चाहते हैं तो दो।

**श्री कैलाश पति मिश्र:** भोवर ब्रिज जहाँ जहाँ पेंडिंग हैं शीघ्रातिशीघ्र उनको बनाया जाय। न बनने के कारण दुर्घटनाएं हो रही हैं। जो रेल की पटरियां हैं वे पुरानी पड़ चुकी हैं उनका रेनुअल नहीं हुआ है। पस्वर की गिट्टियां पुरानी हो गई हैं, उनका रिनुअल नहीं हुआ है। उनकी मरम्मत के लिए कदम उठाए जाने चाहिए।

दूसरे मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि क्रॉसिंग पर जो दुर्घटनाएं घट जाती हैं रेलवे मंत्रालय उनके लिए कोई कम्पनसेशन, कोई राहत की व्यवस्था नहीं करता है। मंत्रालय यह कह देता है कि मैंड रेलवे क्रॉसिंग नहीं है। मैं समझता हूँ कि सरकार इस ओर ध्यान दे। राज्य मंत्री बताएं कि सरकार इस के लिए क्या करने जा रही है जिस से एक्सीडेंट कम हो जायेंगे।

**श्री बी० सत्यनारायण रेड्डी (आंध्र प्रदेश) :**  
मैडम, जो स्टेटमेंट अब दिया गया है उस संबंध में मैं मंत्री महोदय से कहना चाहंगा कि आगरा के राजा की मंडी के पास जो एक्सीडेंट हुआ है चिंताजनक है उस जगह यह पहला एक्सीडेंट नहीं है, इस से पहले भी एक दो एक्सीडेंट वहाँ हुए हैं, कुछ दिन पहले आन्ध्र प्रदेश एक्सप्रेस का हुआ है। मंत्री महोदय ने अपने बयान में कहा है कि ऐसा एक्सीडेंट हुआ है, इसके बारे में यह कदम उठाए जा रहे हैं। मेरा यह कहना है कि यह सब आप एक्सीडेंट होने के बाद कर रहे हैं। मेरा सवाल यह है कि आप ऐसे एक्सीडेंट रोकने के लिए क्या इन्तजामात कर रहे हैं वह अहम है। आज एक हो सकता है, कल चार हो सकते हैं। आपने लेवल क्रॉसिंग के बारे में भी कहा है :

"As a result of the collision, 15 bus passengers lost their lives."

यह जो क्रॉस लेविलिंग है इस के बारे में कई बार इस सदन में और रेलवे बजट

[श्री श्री सत्यनारायण रेड्डी]  
की स्पीचों में सरकार को मुआव दिया गया है और कहा गया है कि ऐसी काम लेविलिंग पर ओवर ब्रिज बनाये जायें। लेकिन इस पर सरकार ने कभी तवज्जह नहीं दी। करोड़ों रुपया सरकार फिजूल चीजों पर खर्च करती है और आप इन काम लेविलिंग पर ओवर ब्रिज को नहीं बनाते। इस क्रॉसिंग पर पहले भी कभी एक्सीडेंट हुआ नहीं यह मुझे नहीं मालूम लेकिन आप ने इस के बारे में जिक्र किया और इसलिये ऐसी जो क्रॉसिंग है जहाँ बसेज बगैरह गुजरती है उनके ऊपर परमानेंट ओवर ब्रिज बनाये जाने चाहिए। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस बारे में सरकार कुछ सोच रही है या नहीं। एक्सीडेंट तो होते हैं। उन में लोग मारे जाते हैं। कितने मारे जाते हैं, कितने घायल होते हैं, अस्पताल में पड़े रहते हैं, यह बताना तो आप के लिये रोज की बात है। लेकिन मैं चाहता हूँ कि इन एक्सीडेंट को रोकने के लिये आइन्दा न होने दिने के लिये आप ने क्या पारमानेंट इंतजाम किया है, यह माननीय मंत्री जी बतायें।

SHRI SUSHIL CHAND MOHUNTA (Haryana); Madam Deputy Chairman, I was surprised to see the statement of the hon. Minister inasmuch as the figure given in this statement about the number of people who died is the original figure which was given in the first flash. There is no mention about the number of people who died subsequently, even after receiving medical aid and when the bodies were extricated from underneath the debris. It has not taken note of the number of people who died subsequently in the hospital. This has been reported in the newspapers. For example, the 'National Herald' dated the 16th June, has said that forty-two people died: it has made a specific mention that two people died subsequently. Forty was the figure originally reported and two people died subsequently in the hospital. The number of injured given in the newspapers is also more.

Secondly, the hon. Minister has candidly mentioned in his statement that a relief train was rushed immediately from Agra Cantt. which arrived at the site

with railway doctors and medical relief. When it comes to relief operations, he says that a railway accident relief train was sent from Agra Cantt. But my information is that this relief train reached the spot a number of hours late, many injured people who were injured could not be adequately helped in time; even the medical aid was not promptly given. Had this been done, some lives could have been saved. This lapse on the part of the railway authorities is understandable.

Thirdly, this statement completely backs out the role played by the citizens of Agra. The newspaper says that there was a terrific explosion, noise, which actual!} echoed in the whole of Agra. It was such a loud noise, a bang. When they heard this, the people in the adjoining areas immediately rushed to the spot and they were the first people to render relief. The hon. Minister has mentioned about his visit. He has also mentioned about the visit of the other officers. But the role of those people who rendered help immediately and who did something in the relief operations, has not been referred to. Leave alone appreciating it, it has not been referred to even. I cannot understand such an attitude on the part of the Government. They should admit their failure. They should recognise the work of those people who contributed a great deal toward, assuaging the feelings of those people who were injured.

My fourth point is; such accidents have taken place in the past also. Actually, when this accident took place, a number of reasons were advanced. One was human failure; the other was, the signalling was outmoded, ill-equipped and then there was failure of power supply immediately which prevented....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: At the same spot?

SHRI SUSHIL CHAND MOHUNTA: I am talking about this accident only. It was said, there was failure of power supply which prevented the signal-1.00 P.M. ling system from operating efficiently at the proper time. The net result is that this accident



**श्री सुल्तान सिंह :** मैडम डिप्टी चेरमन, मेरा मामूली सा क्लेरिफिकेशन है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि वह बदकिस्मत मुसाफिर जो उस रेल में ट्रेवल कर रहे थे और एक्सीडेंट की वजह से उनकी मौत हो गई या ऐसे मुसाफिर जो बस में या किसी ट्रक में सफर कर रहे थे और रेल दुर्घटना की वजह से उनकी मौत हो गई उन मुसाफिरों को जो रेल स्टाफ की लापरवाही की वजह से मौत के शिकार हुए उनके लवादीन को पूरा मुआवजा दिया जायेगा या नहीं दिया जायेगा ? यह मेरा सवाल है :

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव (बिहार) :** माननीय डिप्टी चेरमन, मैं एक पार्टी-कुलर क्वेश्चन पूछना चाहता हूँ। पहला तो यह कि 13-6-85 को एक घटना हुई वह घटना पैट मैन के चलते हुए। जो पैट की लाइन मिलती है उस पैट की लाइन मिलने के बाद सिगनल होता है तब दो गाड़ियाँ चलती हैं या एक रेल गाड़ी चलती है। यह पैट या सिगनलिंग की क्या गड़बड़ थी जिसके कारण दो गाड़ियाँ आपस में भिड़ गईं ? क्योंकि दोनों में एक न एक अटोमेटिक मशीन लगी हुई है जिसके कारण यह गड़बड़ नहीं होनी चाहिये यह अटोमेटिक मशीन लगने के बाद भी गड़बड़ कैसे हो गई, मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ। उसी तरह से अटोमेटिक सिगनलिंग और अटोमेटिक गेटबन्दी की आपने बहुत पहले से व्यवस्था डाली हुई है। क्या कारण है कि यहाँ पर जब सिगनलिंग हो गया, गाड़ी आने की सूचना हो गई तो यह गेट लगा क्यों नहीं ? यह गेट कैसे खुला रह गया ? सब जगह अटोमेटिक सिगनलिंग का नियम है। यह जो समिति बनाई है दोनों मंत्रियों ने मिल कर कि अब कोई दुर्घटना नहीं होने देंगे। रेल में सुरक्षा करेंगे तो यह जो बना हुआ है इससे क्या लाभ हुआ है ? जब गेट का प्रोसेस बना हुआ है, टाइम बंधा हुआ है गेट बन्द होने का तो जब वह टाइमिंग पर बन्द नहीं होता तो मैं यह कहूँगा कि तब तो यह बहुत ही सीरियस चार्ज है। जहाँ क्रासिंग है वहाँ पर अटोमेटिक गेट बन्द हो जाता है और जब तक सिगनल ऊपर न उठ

जाये तब तक वह गेट नहीं खुलता। यह व्यवस्था है तो यहाँ पर गेट कैसे खुला रह गया। आपने वहाँ जाकर स्पार्ट विजिट किया होगा और अगर किया है तो वहाँ आपने क्या पाया ? तीसरी बात यह है कि रेलवे ट्रैक जो आपके कमजोर हो गये हैं इन जनरल उसको सुधारने के लिये आप क्या कर रहे हैं ? अगली बात रेस्क्यू की है। रेस्क्यू जो गया है उसका टाइमिंग क्या है, वह घटना स्थल पर कितने बजे पहुँचा।

**श्री माधवराव सिंधिया :** आगरा का या रतलाम का ?

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** मैं दोनों का पूछ रहा हूँ। रेस्क्यू किस समय गया, कितना समय लगा इसका विवरण इसमें नहीं आया है।

DR. (SHRIMATI) SAROJINI MAHI-SHI (Karnataka): Madam, I thank you for giving me a few minutes to speak on these railway accidents.

It is very unfortunate that within the course of one week—between 13.6.85 and 16.6.85—two accidents have taken place. The Minister had gone to the spot, examined and tried to console the relations. He has tried to give some *ex gratia* amount also to the kith and kins. But that is not sufficient, Madam. The body which enquires into these accidents is the Railway Safety Commission. Its headquarter is in Lucknow. Of course, it is the most neglected section of the Railway Ministry. It is not a part of the Railway Ministry. It has been kept under the Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation and whatever positive suggestions and other recommendations are given by it are just neglected and not taken into consideration at all by the Railway Ministry. There are personnel who are working in the Railway Safety Commission. They cannot go back to the Railway Ministry once they enter the Railway Safety Commission. They are not even given railway passes. And those who are really unfit in the Railway Ministry are just thrown into the Railway Safety Commission. I do not want to say

anything about the quality and other things. Of course, the less said the better. But there are good people also who just want, only for the purpose of doing some good service, to come to the Railway Safety Commission. But once they enter the Railway Safety Commission, it means that the Railway Ministry has thrown them away and they are not taken into consideration. Therefore, what I would like to suggest is that every suggestion given by the Railway Safety Commission, after the inquiry into the accident, must be implemented and a report with reference to that must be kept on the Table of the House.

I know, with what concern the Railway Ministry looks at the Railway Safety Commission. That is one thing. Secondly, after the inquiry, whatever constructive suggestions are given by the Railway Safety Commission, they should be codified and they should be translated, as early as possible, into action—whether it is the railway line or whether it is the signalling. I know that even solar energy is being utilised these days for railway signalling. In spite of all these things, by the failure? Whether it is indifference, whether it is dereliction of duty, whether it is negligence on the part of the railway staff or whatever it may be, but the people who are punished are very small people and the bigger people are not considered at all and their responsibility is not there at all. In Sanskrit there is a quotation and I would like to quote it here:

द्व्यात्रं नैव गजं नैव,  
वृकं नैव च नैव च,  
अजापुत्रं बलिम् दधान,  
देवां दुर्बल घातकः ।

It is not a tiger that is sacrificed; it is not an elephant that is sacrificed; it is not a wolf that is sacrificed. It is only the goat that is sacrificed.

I hope, Madam, the Railway Ministry would look into these things and put the responsibility on proper shoulders and take proper action with reference to the suggestions given by the Railway Safety Commission.

651 RS—7

SHRI R. RAMAKRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu): Passengers are the goats.  
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, would you like to speak about the questions put to you now or...

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Madam, I would like to reply now if the House permits.

SHRI R. RAMAKRISHNAN: We are not hungry; we want to hear.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Madam, I can assure the House, through you, that my senior colleague, Mr. Bansi Lai, and I and the Railway Board fully share the anxiety that the House feels on its issue of railway accidents and the fact that railway accidents are at present seeming to be extremely difficult to control. From time to time, because of these very tragic and unfortunate incidents, the Railway Ministry, through us, has been receiving the suggestions of the hon. Members. We value these greatly and I would like to assure the House that we do our best to implement all the constructive suggestions that we receive in this very respected House.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is replying to the queries made. Better listen to him.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Thank you. Madam, Mr. Quasem talked about what steps we are taking to minimize the accidents. My senior colleague, Mr. Bansi Lai, and I have, in both the Houses, mentioned about the attempt to create a much greater awareness in the Railway Ministry for the prevention of such accidents. A 10-point action plan has been instituted. It has been implemented and, to a certain extent, in all humility, I would like to claim some success as

[Shri Madhavrao Scindia] far as this is concerned. Our figures have shown that in the past few years railway accidents which were attributable to railway staff, not just human failure but purely to railway staff, ranged at about 65 per cent. Since this 10-point action plan has been instituted, in the last six months, this figure has come down to between 53 and 55 per cent. I am sure, the House will appreciate that an immediate impact as far as the railway accidents are concerned, can only be made in this particular sector because as far as track renewals and renewals of rolling stock are concerned, they are something in which an investment made today will only reflect in the coming years when actually that work is implemented. We have also made our General Managers much more mobile, not only our General Managers but the staff which is just under them. We have also made it very clear that very strong action, would be taken against railway staff found responsible. As you can see, even in this particular case, wherever criminal negligence is suspected, PIRs are now launched by the Railway Ministry itself, and prosecution will be undertaken.

As far as the recent two railway accidents are concerned, we have immediately set up four task forces which have already started their work. We have set up four task forces for the different railways, and they make surprise inspections. Senior officers are members of these task forces, and they are conducting surprise inspections in all the railways, especially those railways which are particularly found wanting. These task forces have already borne results. A number of lapses have already been discovered, and we are doing our best to implement their suggestions also.

Mr. Quasem asked about the railway track renewal. I fully agree with him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not only he, others also.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Coming one by one.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you take up one by one we will finish by 2 O'Clock. We want to finish early. So, you put them together and reply.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: All right. Mr. Quasem talked about the railway track renewal. I fully agree with what he says. In the railway track renewal we are facing a very severe backlog. And the statistics of the railway accidents indicate, though I do agree that the railway accidents have gone up somewhat, marginally this year as compared to the last year, 80 per cent of the railway accidents are due to derailments. And the figure of the derailments has gone up. The marginal number that has gone up by about 25 or 30 accidents, of which 20 alone are because of the increase in the departments. So, I fully endorse his views and I implore upon him and other Members of the House to join us and strengthen our voice as far as the Planning Commission and the Finance Ministry are concerned so that they increase our allocations.

Of the allocations that we have received this year a record amount has been set aside for track renewal. A gross figure of Rs. 494 crores and a net figure of Rs. 415 crores out of Rs. 1,650 crores has been set aside for track renewal.

He has also talked about renewal of the rolling stock. He is absolutely correct. Again, Rs. 484 crores has been set aside for this. Almost 70 per cent of the entire allocation has been set aside for renewals.

Another Member later on said that we were spending money on most useless activities and, almost insinuating, on fun and pleasure. The fact of

the matter is, never before has 70 to 75 per cent of the total allocation been spent on renewal and rehabilitation. Because of that, we have, at the same time, ironically received a lot of criticism which is, I suppose from the Members' point of view totally justified. About the fact that our allocation to new railway lines is very poor. On the one hand we are asked to increase our allocations on renewal of the rolling stock and renewal of track, on the other we are criticised for this. All intentions are there. But we are faced with limited Budget, and I crave Members' indulgence and their support in asking for more allocations for this most crucial Ministry.

I thank Mr. Quasem for his suggestions.

मिश्रा जी ने ओवर ब्रिज के बारे में कोई बात कही। ओवर ब्रिज के बारे में, मैं फिर से यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि बजट की कमी के कारण जितने ओवर ब्रिज हम देना चाहते हैं वह हम नहीं दे पा रहे हैं। जहाँ तक ओवर ब्रिज का सवाल है इसमें 50 प्रतिशत स्टेट गवर्नमेंट देनी है और स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स से जब प्रोजेक्ट्स स्पोन्सर होता है उसके बाद फिर रेल मिनिस्ट्री और स्टेट गवर्नमेंट तय कर के संयुक्त तरीके से काम हाथ में लेते हैं। हम भी यह चाहते हैं कि ओवर ब्रिज ज्यादा हों परन्तु धन की कमी के कारण यह होना संभव नहीं है। ट्रेक रियुअल के बारे में कहा गया है, कम्पनसेशन के बारे में कहा गया है, रेलवे क्रॉसिंग पर जो एक्सीडेंट होते हैं उनके बारे में भी कहा गया है। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि जो जो यात्री ट्रेन में दुर्घटनाग्रस्त होया जिनको क्षति पहुँची है, शारीरिक क्षति पहुँची है उनको कम्पनसेशन या मुआवजा दिया जाएगा रेलवे एक्ट के अनुसार, और जो रेल यात्री न हों उनको रेलवे एक्ट के अनुसार कम्पनसेशन देने का कोई प्रावधान नहीं है। वे कोर्ट में जा सकते हैं और कोर्ट जो तय करेगा वह मुआवजा दिया जाएगा। रेड्डी साहब ने कहा कि क्या कदम उठाये जा रहे हैं। इसके बारे में मैंने यह प्रयास किया है कि कुछ प्रकाश डालूँ।

रेड्डी साहब ने यह सुझाव भी दिया है कि लेबल क्रॉसिंग और बनाए जाएं। मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे देश में टोटल लेबल क्रॉसिंग 37 हजार है जिनमें से लगभग 15 हजार मैड हैं और 22 हजार अनमैड हैं। तो उन 15 हजार मैड क्रॉसिंग में प्रोग्राम के अनुसार करीब 4900 में इंटर लाकिंग सिस्टम जिसके बारे में यादव जी ने भी चर्चा की थी प्रोवाइड कर दिया गया है। टेलीफोन 6800 और लिफ्टिंग बेरियर 3800 को प्रोग्राम में अनुसार हाथ में लिया जाएगा और हमारा यह प्रयास है कि जल्दी से जल्दी जितने सेफ्टी की दृष्टि से कदम हम उठा सकते हैं उनको उठाएं।

Shri Mohunta mentioned about the number of persons who died in the accident. I think he has probably left.

**उपसभापति :** यह तो पगने पहले कह दिया है। (व्यवधान) जो नहीं है उनको रहने दीजिए (व्यवधान)

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Madam, I would like to make the position clear for the benefit of the House.

**उपसभापति :** ठीक है (व्यवधान)

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Madam, you seem to be extremely hungry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not hungry. At 2'0 Clock we have a statement by the Minister. It is time bound.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: I will sit down.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please continue.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: As far as the Railway Ministry is concerned, I would like to put the re-co,rd straight. But Shri Mohunta mentioned that 42 persons had died. In actual fact 38 persons died and two persons died subsequently. So,

[Shri Madhavrao Scindia]

total persons who died was 40. Our figure is not incorrect. He talked about the medical relief van and the railway accident relief train reaching late at Agra. Some hon. Members also mentioned this point. I would like to clarify it because this is a very important point.

The medical relief van left immelia-tely at 7 minutes past 11 O'clock and the breakdown train from Agra Cantt. was also ordered at the same time at 10.33. But after the passage of the medical relief train, the breakdown train reached the loco exit approximately at 11.05 and the Agra Cantt. yard at about 11.15. But after that it had to be switched around. When you come near the accident site the crane has to go first- and (he engine has to push the train. So, that train was reorganised and it was ready to move, but unfortunately both the lines were blocked. One line was blocked by Chattisgarh Express where the medical van had arrived. The other line was blocked by the goods train. It was only at 10 minutes to 12 that the Commissioner of Agra and Senior Superintendent of Police gave us permission to pull the rear portion of the goods train away. Till then we did not receive permission because (a) they were involved at the accident site itself; and (b) wherever any sabotage may be suspected till the civil authorities give us the permission we cannot clear the track or touch it. So, it was only at 10 minutes to 12 that we received permission, and at 5 minutes past 12 the operation work was started by one of the engines which was sent. It started at 5 minutes past 12 and was completed by 1 O'Clock. At 1315 hours the break, down train started from Agra Cantt. and reached the site of accident at 1330 hours. These were the logistic reasons as to why the breakdown train has not reached in time but it was ready to leave at five minutes Past eleven from Agra Cantt. Citizens of Agra, he mentioned had played a very

important role and had not been mentioned. We have mentioned this on page 2 and we are grateful to them. Then, Mr. Hukam Dev Narain Yadav asked, how many claims are pending. I think, yadav Saheb has gone out.

**उपसभापति :** वे आ रहे हैं अपनी जगह पर आप कहिए ।

**श्री माधव राव सिंधिया :** जो क्लेम कमिश्नर एंवाइटेड होगा वह तय करेगा । उसने वाद मुआवजा दिया जायेगा । अभी मुआवजा नहीं दिया गया है । एक्सप्रेसिया पैमेंट जो रेलवे देती है वह दिया गया है । पूरा मुआवजा एक लाख रुपये तक क्लेमस कमिश्नर के तय करने के बाद दिया जायेगा । आफिसर्स पेनलाइज हुए हैं, कई आफिसर्स सलपेट हुए हैं इसके बारे में वर्णन हमने बकतव्य में किया है । नुलतान सिंह जी ने जो कम्पेनसेशन की बात की तो वह हमने आलरेडी कह दी है । श्री जगदश्री प्रसाद यादव जी ने उछा ।

why did the Automatic System fail? Well, there was some work going on a particular point near the Station and certain procedures possibly were not following but the Commissioner, Railways Safety will be completing this full inquiry. His provisional findings are that there was some lapse on the part of the Railway Staff and we will be taking full guidance from his report, and we are waiting for his final report. Already, some action has been taken against Railway Staff and if others are found wanting, we will, certainly, take action against them also. He talked about Ratlam as to why it was not automatically closed. Here also, there were some problems. In the report some problems had been discovered by the Commissioner, of Railway Safety as far as the procedures are concerned. These also once his final report is out will be strictly implemented.

I may mention that the Commissioner, Railways Safety while making his full report has also mentioned this. I quote 'TT MAY BE MENTIONED

THAT IN AN ACCIDENT OF SUCH GRAVITY AS ABOVE, THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE CIVIL AUTHORITIES AND THE RAILWAY OFFICIALS HAD BEEN EXTREMELY PROMPT WITH THE RESULT TIMELY RELIEF COULD BE RENDERED TO ALL THE GRIEVOUSLY INJURED PERSONS THUS BRINGING IN THE CASUALTY FIGURES WHICH COULD HAVE BEEN OTHERWISE MUCH MORE. THE DEDICATION WITH WHICH THE DOCTORS OF THE CIVIL HOSPITAL UNDER THE LEADERSHIP OF THE CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER HAD ATTENDED TO THESE CASES AND THE UNSTINTED COOPERATION GIVEN BY THE TEAM OF RAILWAY DOCTORS WERE INDEED COMMENDABLE".

Mrs. Mabishi made certain very valuable suggestions. As far as the suggestions regarding the Commissioner, Railway Safety is concerned, once a final report comes, I can assure her that it will be fully paid heed to and fully implemented. With her very detailed knowledge of the working of the Tourism and Civil Aviation and this particular office, her suggestions will be certainly paid heed to. I thank her very much for making good suggestions. Madam, I do not think, there is anything else to cover except that I would like to mention one thing. This is not by way of excuses for the lapses of the Railways. For lapses, we regret very much but what is to be kept in mind is the enormity of the operation that we are involved in. We are carrying 11 million passengers a day. We are doing a total train kilometres of 540 million kilometres a year and our incidents per million kilometres, I would like to point out, which in 1978-79 had reached as high as 1.8 and later in 1980-81 had gone to 2, has come down to 1.4 incidents per million train kilometres. So, train kilometre-

tres is also going up and it is normal that accidents may go up slightly but we are doing our best. We have very very deep regrets for what has happened.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is now adjourned till 2 O'clock.

The House then adjourned for lunch at 30 minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at two minutes past two of the clock, The Deputy Chairman in the Chair?

(iii) Report of National Institute of of Public Finance and Policy on "Aspects of Black Economy in India".

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE AND COMMERCE (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Madam Deputy Chairman, as the House is aware, the Estimates Committee of the Seventh Lok Sabha had recommended in its Ninth Report that the Government should attempt an estimate of black money for formulating appropriate policies. Accordingly, the Government entrusted a study of the estimate of extent of unaccounted income in the country to the National Institute of Public Finance and Policy, in June, 1982. Its terms of reference were as under:—

(a) to identify the important sectors of the economy in which black money is generated;

(b) to examine the causes and conditions that give rise to and/or facilitate the generation of black money;

(c) to study the methods employed to generate black money and the channels through which the concealed income is invested and spent in other ways;

(d) the methods employed to convert black money into white money.

[Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh]

(e) to attempt a broad estimate of the volume of black money generated; and

(f) to undertake any regional or sectoral surveys that may be required in connection with the above.

The Institute submitted its report in March, 1985. The report was released to the Press in June, 1985. for encouraging a public debate on the subject so that the consequential suggestions could be considered for drawing up a "Long Term Fiscal Policy". I am placing a copy (Both in Hindi and in English versions) of summary of the Report on the Table of the House. Copies of the Report (in English version and 2 typed copies in Hindi version) have been placed in the Parliament Library.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam ...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): Madam ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you remember, in the morning during the discussion with the Chairman, we thought that a full discussion on black money could take place. So do you think it necessary to ask for clarifications?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has agreed to have a full-fledged discussion.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I would like to say something else also. This is a very important document and I see no reason why it should be placed only in the Library of Parliament for reference by Members. If the difficulty is simply that the Hindi translation is not ready, I would say, we could have it after a few days. But a printed copy must be made available because this is a document which we would like to have with us.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I shall arrange that every Member gets a copy. The idea of a debate on it is welcome because I will benefit by the suggestions of honourable Members. It is a serious area in which we want to make an effort and formulate our policy. I think it will be fair enough for the honourable Members also that the date of the debate be fixed when they get a copy and have had time enough to study it.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Let us get a copy and let us also have an early debate.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): I have looked into the summary. But the summary looks to be very odd. And you have said "I am placing a copy of the summary of the report." But that summary which was circulated in the Consultative Committee is wholly inadequate. Therefore, my request to you is please supply the report itself.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: When I say the full report, not the summary but the full report, the original report. And the original report will overrule anything which is in the summary.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala) : When he says he is prepared to present the report, I would like to know whether he will present the dissent note made by Shri Arun Kumar in that report and whether it would be available for discussion.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I will present whatever is there in the report.

**(iv) Crash of Air-India Jumbo Jet "KANISHKA" on June 23, 1985.**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ASHOK GEHLOT): Sir. An Air-India Boeing 737.237E

aircraft 'Kanishka' operating a scheduled flight, AI-182 Montreal-London Delhi-Bombay with 329 persons on board including 22 crew members crashed on 23rd June, 1985 in the Atlantic Ocean about 185-nautical miles south west of Shannon (Ireland) at about 0713 hours GMT, corresponding to about 1243 hours IST. The aircraft was cruising at a height of about 31,000 feet at that time.

Search and rescue operations were initiated immediately. No survivors were found. This was the worst disaster in the history of civil aviation in India. Our hearts go out in sympathy to the bereaved families.

On receipt of the information, action was immediately initiated in accordance with the contingency plan for dealing with accidents. Emergency Cells were constituted at the booking offices at Bombay and Delhi airports. Facilities for providing information to all concerned were made available. I sincerely regret the inconvenience caused to the relatives of staff attending to enquiries.

A high level team led by Secretary, Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation, proceeded to London and Cork early in the morning of 24th June, 1985 to gather information connected with the accident, including recovery of wreckage particularly the Black Box, to supervise relief and rescue operations and to make arrangements for identification and disposal of dead bodies.

Air India provided free transportation to London/Cork and back to one relative per family. In certain cases, this facility had to be provided to more than one person. Free hotel accommodation, food and transport and also a cash allowance was provided to the next of kin who went to Cork in connection with the crash. A total of 305 persons travelled to Cork for purposes of identification.

In all, 131 bodies could be recovered from the sea. Autopsy on all the bodies was completed on the 28th June, 1985 and embalming carried out by 29th June, 1985. Facilities were provided by Air India and Indian Airlines for carriage of the dead bodies free of cost to the destinations indicated by the next of kin. 117 bodies have been identified so far, leaving 14 unidentified. The unidentified bodies have been preserved as per the advice of the Irish Coroner. These bodies will be available for visual identification till 30th July, 1985. Thereafter suitable action will be taken for their disposal.

Foreign Governments, i.e. British, American, Canadian and of course other had actively participated in the search and rescue operations. A French Cableship Leon Thevenian hired by us having a submersible Robot fitted with the latest equipment for location and salvage brought out the Cockpit Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder also known as the Black Box, from a depth of more than 6,000 feet. Recorder of these black boxes from such a great depth is an unprecedented feat in the history of salvage operations of this kind. Both Recorders have been brought to India for examination and analysis, which is underway. No conclusions can be drawn at this stage.

The Government of India have appointed a sitting Judge of Delhi High Court as a Court to investigate into the accident. He would be assisted by five assessors. The Court is expected to submit its report to the Government by 31st December, 1985. They have started their work.

The compensation, in accordance with the rules, will be paid expeditiously to the next of kin.

We have initiated a thorough review of security arrangements at our airports.

I would like to assure the House that no effort will be spared to ensure the safety of the travelling public.

[Shri Asfaok Gehlot]

I must express my sincere gratitude to the Government and people of Ireland for the humanitarian and material help which they extended so spontaneously in the tragic hour of need. I am also grateful to the authorities of all the other countries which assisted us in relief and rescue operations.

THL DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Yes, Mr. Sukomai Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Madam, apart from what has been published by the newspapers all these days, not a single piece of new information has been supplied by the Minister to the Rajya Sabha. So, I do not know why the Minister has chosen to come out with a statement with this information which is known to everybody.

Madam, the Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder have been retrieved from the deep sea and the authorities have started examining them and many things are coming out in the newspapers these days. On that, Madam, the statement is completely silent.

T

Madam, this incident, this "Kanishka" disaster, is perhaps the worst in the aviation history not only of our country, but also of the whole-world. So many persons have been killed. Now, Madam, the Cockpit Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder have been retrieved and they are under examination in Bombay. A Commission of Inquiry has been constituted, the Kirpal Commission, and they are going into it. But I would like to know from the honourable Minister whether he would like to inform the House if the Government has any *Prima facie* reason to believe that this disaster was caused by an act of sabotage, I mean, by an explosion inside the aircraft. Nowadays, Madam, there are reports in the newspapers that not only from the Voice Recorder

and the Flight Data Recorder, but also from the Shannon airport tapes, many things are revealed. According to the newspaper reports, the Shannon airport tapes are revealing more information about this disaster. According to one source, after the Shannon tapes have been decoded, it has been learnt there is conclusive evidence that an explosion took place inside the aircraft. On all these things the Minister is totally silent. I would therefore, like the honourable Minister to tell whether there is any *prime facie* reason to believe that this was due to an act of sabotage and, if so, by whom it was done, whether there is any link between the explosion that took place inside the aircraft and almost the simultaneous explosion in Narita airport when some people were unloading the cargo from a Canadian aircraft. I would like to know whether there is any link between these two explosions and, if so, whether there is any Khalistani hand in this.

Madam, there is another thing also. There is another news item in this connection. When the Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder were retrieved and were to be brought to India, America and Canada objected to their being brought to India for examination and their plea was that India has no expertise to decode them. What are the reasons actually for the USA and Canada's objection to bringing the instruments to India? I would like to know whether any American experts or Canadian experts have been associated with the decoding and examination process of these two instruments that have been brought to Bombay and, if so, whether the Government is getting their full cooperation. Already there is a news. The Americans have started saying that this disaster has not been caused due to explosion, not due to sabotage, but for other reasons. Some newspapers in America are saying that it is some insurance cover that has caused this disaster. I would like to know from the Government whether they have any facts about it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Suresh Kalmadi.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maha rashtra) : I would lend support to what Mr. Sukomal Sen has said about the Voice Recorder. Definitely we have the capacity in India to decode the Cockpit Voice Recorder. But definitely we do not have the sophisticated equipment as they have in Washington for the Flight Data Recorder. So I think that is the reason why they have kept quiet about it. If they have to send it there, I think they should send it earlier because the entire country is anxious to know what went wrong with the aircraft. I am very, very surprised at the Minister's statement which is silent about these aspects, whether it was explosion or it was sabotage. There is not one line in the statement about it. So many days have passed. I would like to know the reason whether it was a bomb explosion. I personally do not subscribe to the bomb theory because there is not one person with a burn mark. It could be structural failure. If it were a bomb explosion at 33000 ft., the pieces of the aircraft would have been spread far and wide. But we find that the wreckage of the aircraft was very much localised. If it is due to structural failure, it is a very serious matter. The Government must investigate whether the aircraft was serviced properly. If it is a structural failure, a major structural failure, I would like to ask the hon. Minister whether the Air India proposes to ground all the 747's immediately for a thorough check-up and the experts from the Company, Indian experts, go through it, rip open the aircraft and see if any part of the structure has a weak link. This is very important. So my plea to the Minister is that they may immediately be grounded and checked up in a matter of a few days, and then they should start flying.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaswant Singh.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Rajas, than): Madam Deputy Chairman, it is my unhappy task to be discussing this particular matter. It is very distressing. It is not easy for Members to discuss such an unhappy event. I am also particularly distressed, Madam, that while making his statement the hon. Minister should find it necessary to point out to one particular technological something, on account of which the Voice Recorder and the Data Recorder were recovered as if it were some kind of an achievement either of Air India or of the Government of India. It is grotesque to put it in that manner. It is a part of the Minister's statement. It is in extremely bad taste. I do not wish to go into such aspects, as are within the purview of the enquiry commission, which is going into why the accident took place, what were the causes which led to it, whether it was structural failure, whether it is some astral body which struck the aircraft. These are all matters for Justice Kirpal to decide, no doubt, once the inquiry is over, the hon. Minister will take the House into confidence and inform us about it.

I am going to seek some clarifications on the Minister's assurances about flight safety which are included in his statement. I would like to point out that on the question of flight safety, an Air India official who, is also the Vice-Chairman of Pilots' Association. Capt. Basu, has said: Why should it have to be an accident which takes the lives of 350 people to make us alert to the problems that confront Air India or the Aviation industry as such? Why ought it to be the price paid by these 350 people to make us alert to this problem? In the light of this statement and in the light of the former founder Chairman of Air India, Mr. Tata, having said that Air India has become a second-rate airline, I would like to ask the hon. Minister about it.

[Shri Jaswant Singh] Mr. Tata is on record as having said it, in fact, he said it in writing in November, 1983, to the then Chairman. He pointed out various shortcomings of safety operations, difficulties of coordination between crew and cabin attendants, etc. Despite all this, Air India officials and Air India management continue to spread the confusion on the question of flight safety. I would like to illustrate it just by one example which is about deboarding such baggage as has been checked in by a passenger and the passenger has not turned up to board the aircraft. Is it not a fact that on March 25, 1983, Air India, *vide* a circular No. Operation/HQ/Gen/83/17, said; -

"It has, therefore, been decided that in future no flight should be delayed in order to identify, locate and remove the baggage of passengers who have been prevented to travel by the authorities referred to above."

This is a circular issued by the Air India management debarring captains of the aircraft from unloading baggage of such persons as have not turned up having checked in. I have given the reference number of this circular. In fact this is not the end of the story. In the light of this particular circular which has given instructions to the Air India captains that they would not delay flights on account of baggage which has arrived in the aircraft and the passenger has not arrived, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether this circular has not become a contributory factor to the Montreal incident in which baggage had been checked in on board the aircraft and the passenger has not arrived. Therefore, Air India cannot absolve itself of the responsibility for the accident that has taken place on this sector. I would like to know from the Minister what was the advice on flight safety that he had received from IATA, from ICAO and from the India Federation of Airlines Pilots' Association. Is that advice mandatory? Did you follow that advice as far as Air India is concerned? Will you give us

one example where that advice was followed? Madam. I don't have the time. I can give numerous other instances where it has not been followed. My third question or clarification is this. What were the additional safety measures that were introduced by Air India following upon the grave deterioration in the law and order situation in the country? And certainly, as far as aviation security is concerned, from about 1981 onwards, what were the additional security measures that were introduced? Were they followed, because I have here quotations from the Airline's captains and pilots who have said that the Airlines safety precautions have a kind of periodicity, that following upon an incident, there is suddenly a spurt, and suddenly every kind of security aspect is taken as if it is a panic reaction and a week later all those measures are taken off. I would also, in the same vein, like to say that we had an incident which we discussed in this House. The late Prime Minister was to undertake an international journey and there was a question and there were fears about sabotage being committed on an Air-India plane that she was to carry her on this journey. An enquiry was instituted into that incident. What were the results of that enquiry? Has that enquiry got lost somewhere? Did you find an incident of sabotage? Or was it only a panic reaction? I would like that also to be clarified.

Finally, Madam, it is my understanding that following upon the loss of this aircraft. Lloyds of London who were the insurers have raised some difficulties and questions relating to the payment of insurance of this aircraft, claiming that a terrorist act is analogous to an act of war and, therefore, not covered under the insurance policy taken out by Air-India. Is this apprehension, is this information that I have correct? Further, because of the difficulties raised by Lloyds of London, Air-India's plans to charter, to take on lease 20 Air Buses from France have also been thrown into jeopardy

because France's Aero-Spatiale have now come forward and said that until this query by Lloyds is resolved, that a terrorist act is analogous to an act of war and, therefore, insurance cover is not available, we will not be in a position to give you 20 Air Bus aircraft on lease, which is a vital programme which Air India has for its expansion and modernisation. If Aero-Spatiale have come forward with this query, I would like the Minister to inform us about this fact also and what Air India is doing to sort out this tangle of insurance.

Madam, there is just one final concluding sentence. Because we are not going to have a discussion on this subject, we are not going to be debating on this subject in this session of Parliament which in any case, as I started by saying is an unhappy subject, we try not to discuss such an unhappy matter and, therefore, it is *sfi* the more incumbent on the Minister that whatever queries are raised now by the Members are adequately and fully answered. Thank you.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh); Madam Deputy Chairman, the statement given by the Minister is not full and incomplete. It is a very tragic incident in which many eminent scientists, innocent men, women and children lost their lives. We feel very sorry and we express our sympathies. The details "which he has given in the statement have already come in the press. In fact, the press has given more details than what the statement contains.

Madam, in the press it has been stated that some organisation has claimed responsibility for this incident. But nothing has been stated here. I would like to know from the Minister whether the Government of India have gone into it and whether they have found out as to who are those who have claimed the responsibility for this incident, and whether that is any truth in it. But nothing has been stated in the statement here. And the press has

given some details about it. Secondly, I would like to know from the Minister whether any similar accidents have taken place in any other aircraft manufactured by this very company and if so, what the causes are and whether those incidents are also of a similar nature or not. I would like to know whether the Government of India has made any enquiries about this from the company which manufactured these aircraft abroad. Sir, it is true that the Government of India has taken all the necessary steps immediately. The Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation took all the necessary steps to help the kith and kin of the deceased as soon as they got news of this tragedy. But I would like to know from the Minister whether a thorough check of the passengers and their baggage was made before the plane took off from its originating station. This fact has not been clearly mentioned in the statement. In the press conflicting reports have appeared. I would like to know from the Minister whether a thorough check of the passengers and their baggage was made before it left Toronto. That information has not yet come. The hon. Minister should clarify this thing in his reply.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) :  
उपसभापति महोदय। वैसे तो इस विषय पर एक इन्वैस्टिगटरी कमेटी बैठा दी गई है। इसलिये सारी बातें नहीं आईं लेकिन कुछ बातें जो स्पष्ट थीं उसको सरकार की तरफ से छिपाने की कोशिश की गई है। यह अत्यन्त ही दुःखद स्थिति है और इसलिये मैं सरकार से इस के बारे में सफाई चाहूंगा।

पहली तो यह है कि अमेरिका स्थित एक टेरेरिस्ट गैंग ने कहा है कि हमने इसका विस्फोट किया है, हमने सेबोटाज किया है। वह जो दावा करते हैं जब तक यह दावा असत्य नहीं हो जाता तब तक मानना पड़ेगा कि उन्होंने जो कहा है वह सही है। सरकार ने इस बारे में कुछ नहीं कहा है। फिर यह

## [श्री चतुरान्त मिश्र]

बात आई है कि अमेरिका में ऐसा केन्द्र है जहाँ ऐसे टेरेरिस्टों को ट्रेनिंग दी जाती है। अखबारों में भी यह आया कि 25 ऐसे ट्रेनिंग सेंटर्स हैं जहाँ इनको ट्रेनिंग किया गया था जिन्होंने वह विस्फोट करने का दावा किया है। उन्होंने कहा कि अलाबामा सेंटर से उन्होंने ट्रेनिंग प्राप्त की है। अगर ऐसी बात है तो सरकार क्या अमेरिका के ध्यान में इस बात को लाई है या नहीं लाई है और लाई है तो उसका क्या नतीजा हुआ? मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि जो इसके प्रशिक्षक है उनकी पत्नी ने दावा किया है कि अगर कनिष्क दुर्घटना में लोग मर गये तो मर गये, इसमें हमारा क्या है। हम को कोई दुख नहीं है इस घटना में। अखबारों में भी यह बात आई है। इसविषय क्या सरकार ने इस बारे में कोई तहकीकात की है या नहीं की है? दूसरे यह कि अमेरिका के जस्टिस डिपार्टमेंट ने कहा है कि यह ट्रेनिंग देना लीगल है और यह ट्रेनिंग होगी और हमारी इस को रोकने की कोई इन्टेंशन नहीं है। ऐसी हालत में क्या हमने कोई इस पर कार्रवाई की है जिससे यह रुक सके। अगर कोई देश ऐसा करता है तो कम से कम हमें उस एक्ट को अनफ्रेंडली एक्ट घोषित करना चाहिये क्योंकि वह ऐसा कर रहे हैं। अगली बात मैं सरकार से कहूँगा कि अभी हमारे मित्र माननीय जसवंत सिंह जी ने जिसका जिक्र किया मैं भा उनके साथ हूँ। वह सरकार बहुत ही डिफेंसिव है। आपने उसमें कहा है कि अनचेकड सामान के लिये देरी मत करो। स्पष्ट आदेश हो कि अनचेकड सामान वापस करो क्योंकि इसके चलते अनेक दुर्घटनाएँ हो सकती हैं। उन्हीं का एक प्रेस इन्टरव्यू छपा था, यहाँ के अन्वेषकों में "इंडियन एक्सप्रेस" में 14 जुलाई को, जिसमें एक गम्भीर चार्ज सरकार पर है। मैं चाहता हूँ सरकार इसकी सफाई दे। इसका उद्घाटन मैं देना चाहता हूँ। कॅप्टन आर के बभु वाइस प्रेजिडेंट, इन्टरनेशनल फेडरेशन आफ एयर साइंस पायलेट्स एसोसिएशन ने कहा है :

After the genocide which passed off uneventfully everybody thought that

the threat was over and the security checks became a mere mechanical routine. Of what use is the x-ray machine if those operating it, their attention is not concentrated on the screen.

मैं जानना चाहूँगा कि क्या एकसरे मशीन बहा इस्तेमाल की गई या नहीं इस्तेमाल की गई? और जब यह सीरियस एलीमिनेशन उसी विमान के द्वारा आता है तो सरकार को इस बारे में सफाई देनी चाहिये कि स्थिति क्या है। मैं दूसरी बात जो कहना चाहता हूँ वह यह है कि एयर इंडिया के अंदर जो मेक्योरिटी इन्तजाम है उसका पिछले वर्षों के अन्दर बहुत ही ह्रास हो गया है। जो डेटा प्रकाशित किया गया है फ्लाइट इन्टरनेशनल के जरिये से 1973 से 84 के बीच में भारत का स्थान सेक्योरिटी के मामले में 14वाँ स्थान रह जाता है। बहुत पीछे चला गया है जो अंकड़ा दिया गया है उसके मुताबिक इन वर्षों में 1.3 मिलियन इंडियन फ्लाइट्स के दौरान 424 आदमी की मृत्यु हुई। यह एक ही फ्लाइट कनिष्क के बारे में नहीं है। यह एक ट्रेन्ड हो गया है, जब कि आस्ट्रेलिया में तीन मिलियन फ्लाइट के लिए ओनली टू फेटेलिटीज हुई हैं। मैं जानना चाहूँगा कि यह जो सुरक्षा के मामले में आपकी स्थिति खराब हो गई है, क्या इसके लिए सरकार खुद जिम्मेदार नहीं है? यह बात स्पष्ट करें। एक बार तो ऐसा हुआ कि 19 मई को 447 विमान बिना पर्याप्त तेल के चला दिया गया और एयर इंडिया के इस जम्बो विमान को बाध्य हो नीचे उतरना पड़ा। बाद में पता चला कि उसमें तेल नहीं था। उसको ट्रेक्टर से खींच कर लाया गया। इस तरह की घटनाओं की खबर अखबारों में आई है। इस प्रकार की दयनीय स्थिति क्या हो गई है इसके लिए। सरकार को जिम्मेदारी अपने ऊपर लेनी चाहिए। वाकी बातें जांच में आएँगी, लेकिन जो आपकी स्पष्ट जिम्मेवारी है, उसके बारे में आप जवाब दें।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव (विहार):

माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, प्रश्न तो बहुत पूछे गये हैं और सरकार को उनका उत्तर देना है। लेकिन में इस संबंध में सरकार से यह जानना चाहूँगा कि इरादा क्या है? अभी यह जो घटना घटी है इसकी जांच बैठाई गई है। यह

विवाद का विषय बना हुआ है कि दुर्घटना बम फटने से हुई या तकनीकी गड़बड़ी से हुई। हमारे विहार में कुछ दिन पहले यह प्रचलित हो गया था कि आपसी दुश्मनी के कारण भी अगर किसी की हत्या हो जाती है तो लिख दिया जाता था कि नक्सलाइट ने इसको मारा है। पुलिस अपने ऊपर कोई जिम्मेवारी नहीं लेती थी वहीखाले में लिख दिया जाता था कि नक्सलाइट ने इसको मारा है। इसका मतलब यह था कि अगर किसी की हत्या नक्सलाइट्स कर दें तो उसकी जिम्मेवारी पुलिस की नहीं थी। उसी प्रकार से ये जो दुर्घटनाएं हो रही हैं, जैसे यह कनिष्क की दुर्घटना हुई है, कहीं ऐसा तो नहीं है कि सारे सरकारी विभाग, लड़कन विभाग के अधिकारीगण सब मिल कर इस बात में लगे हुए हैं कि यह दुर्घटना आतंकवाद के कारण हुई है और आतंकवाद के माथे पर इसको मढ़ना चाहते हैं? मैं चाहता हूँ कि इस बात की अच्छी तरह से देखा जाना चाहिए कि यह दुर्घटना तकनीकी कारणों से हुई है या अन्य कारणों से हुई है। कहीं कुछ लोग अपनी अक्षमता को छिपाने के लिए इसको आतंकवाद के माथे पर तो नहीं मढ़ रहे हैं? इसलिए इस मामले की जांच सरसरी तौर पर न करके इसकी गहराई में जाना चाहिए। आकाश में जो इस तरह की दुर्घटनाएं हो रही हैं, उनका क्या कारण है, इसकी गहराई से जांच होनी चाहिए और इस बारे में सरकार को बहुत सचेत से रहना चाहिए। अभी कुछ दिन पहले लखनऊ में एक हवाई जहाज उतरा तो उसका चक्का फट गया। संयोग से यात्रियों को कोई चोट नहीं आई। लेकिन सब चीजों की आतंकवाद के माथे पर गढ़ दिया जाय, इसको देखा जाना चाहिए और इसकी कड़ाई से जांच होनी चाहिए।

आखिरी बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि सुरक्षा की बहुत बात की जाती है। विशिष्ट से विशिष्ट व्यक्ति भी है जो हवाई जहाज से यात्रा करते हैं। उनके लिए सुरक्षा की व्यवस्था की जाती है। लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि सभी के लिए नियमों की पाबन्दी एक जैसी होनी चाहिए। कोई वी०आई०पी० है, कोई वी०वी०आई०पी० है, कोई विशिष्ट, कोई महाविशिष्ट और कोई विशिष्टतम से विशिष्टतम व्यक्ति है। सब जगह सुरक्षा में कोई कमी नहीं होनी

चाहिए। सुरक्षा की दृष्टि से कोई कमी करना ठीक नहीं है। इसके लिए कड़ी से कड़ी निगरानी रखी जानी चाहिए। एक एक चीज की जांच होनी चाहिए। अगर हम ऐसा करेंगे तो इन दुर्घटनाओं को रोका जा सकता है और सरकार की अपनी क्षमता की आतंकवाद के नाम पर इसको नहीं थोपाना चाहिए।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Madam Deputy Chairman, when the Air India Jumbo 'Kanishka' plunged into the sea, it was a bolt from the blue on hundreds of families. Families have been subjected to indescribable sorrow and tragedy. Some of the whole families have been wiped out. Nearly 80 children also were killed. Our hearts go in sympathy to those families. If this disaster is due to any sabotage or due to any act of terrorism, in that case, whoever has committed it, they do not deserve to live in a civilised society, whoever is responsible for this diabolical crime, they are not human beings in that case.

Madam, the investigation is going on. Of course, it is a spectacular achievement that the digital flight data recorder and the cockpit voice recorder have been brought to the surface from underneath the sea. Reports indicate that the aircraft broke in mid-air and the communication was totally cut off. But they are not in a position to say what actually happened. Under these circumstances, another theory has also been floated by a London newspaper, 'The Daily Mail'. It has been mentioned:

"A story by the Mail's defence correspondent today said space intelligence investigations in Britain and the U.S. point to unburnt jettisoned parts of Progress 24 entering the earth's atmosphere on the same latitude as the AI Boeing 747 at about the same time as the Jumbo, crash. This could have caused the accident. . .

[Shri V. Gopalsamy]

It has been said further:

"The 'Mail' however, said that it was confirmed that Progress 24, launched on June 20, to take fuel and supplies to two Soviet cosmonauts of the Soyuz T 13, docked with the latter at 6.54 AM, on June 23, the day the AI Jumbo crashed. Just about that time, three booster rockets and other equipment of Progress 24 were jettisoned. They started falling towards earth in a gradually spiralling east to west orbit at 51 deg. 6 min. The motors of the rockets; crossed the path of the Jumbo, 15 minutes after the crash. But some other unburnt parts of the rockets could have entered the atmosphere earlier and could have hit the Jumbo flying at 51 deg- 12 min. Since the falling rockets were on the east-west track, they could have hit the plane head on explaining the forward jerk and breaking of neck of 12 of the 131 victims whose bodies have been found."

This may not be correct. But I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the investigating team has applied its mind to this aspect also because these reports have created confusion. That is why, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether this aspect is also being looked into by the investigating team.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam, all will agree that this was an unmitigated disaster and a great tragedy in the history of civil aviation. Our sympathies go to those families who have lost their relatives.

Madam Deputy Chairman, I would like to refer to one aspect which has not been touched by others. This is about the time span in which not only this disaster took place but also other disasters. Within a short time, a TWA aircraft was hijacked and there was a great explosion in the Frankfurt airport, destroying a part of the airport.

There was also an explosion in Madrid destroying and damaging the airways offices. Apart from the crash of Ka-nishka there was also an incident in Tokyo. There was also a bomb scare in Rome. All these things happened within a period of 30 to 35 days. I do not know whether it was a coincidence because I cannot explain the sequence of these events and tragedies. I think it is for us to consider how these repeated tragedies, repeated occurrences took place within such a short time. Today international air travel has become a grave risk. It has become a nightmare even in our own country. Whenever we go to the aircraft we always think of ourselves, of our life and our security. It has come to that. There is a story which has been, circulated in the Western press, it has not been touched upon by our press and I hope my friend will enlighten us on this. The story is that the X-ray machine in Canada was not operating and, therefore, the packages were not effectively screened. I want to know whether this story has any credibility, whether there is any truth in this theory. Perhaps, Madam, you were in the United States when President Reagan reacted sharply over TWA hijacking and even threatened to cut off American air travel to Athens where the security was supposed to be very weak, lax and inadequate. All the bookings of passengers to Athens were cancelled as a result of this. He gave a call at that time that these occurrences, these tragedies are a challenge, a great challenge, to the civilized world, to the entire international community. He gave a call that there should be an emergency conference at the international level to consider all aspects of air security. Whether this is being considered by the Government of India I would like to know. Is there going to be an international conference to discuss all aspects of air security?

Now my friend Jaswant Singh raised one question. He quoted from a circular which said that the packages

which are already on the board cannot be unloaded even when the passengers are not in the aircraft. Now that has been corrected. Perhaps, he knows, now whenever you and I go to the aircraft, there is double checking. There is a security check at the airport itself before we enter the aircraft, before we enter the aircraft

passengers are requested to identify packages. If any passenger cannot identify the package, that package will be left over, it will not be taken to the aircraft. I think that care has been taken now, but I would like the Minister to look into the circular which he has referred to and see whether the circular requires changes or amendments in the future

Lastly, Madam, the security arrangements that have been made already all over the world and also here, are they adequate to meet the challenges that are there? I would like to know whether a suggestion has been made in certain quarters that a marshal, or security men should be there with arms in every aircraft. It is not enough to have double screening. It is very necessary, in addition, to have one or two people equipped with weapons to take care of the hijackers, the terrorists who enter the aircraft surreptitiously. Like that, I would like to know whether a conference will be called here at the national level—a conference of experts who know the various aspects of security and whether Government is thinking on those lines, whether they can take advantage of the various suggestions that have come forth in this regard.

Lastly, Madam. I would say—I know you are very much fixed—that various stories that have been circulated already about the jumbo aircraft are confusing us greatly and the Minister has said that an enquiry will be held and the time limit he has put is December '85. I think it is a long time and I would very much wish that this enquiry should be conducted as expeditiously as possible so that we can do away with all sorts of stories and

theories that are being spread. Thank you.

SHRI VISHWA BANDHU GUPTA (Delhi): Naturally we are all with a heavy heart when we discuss a subject like this. I would however like to seek only a few clarifications on this sad affair.

One of them is whether the analysis of the data obtained from the black box and the voice recorder that have been retrieved so ably by robot machine would be a conclusive proof of what actually happened in that aircraft. I would like to know whether we would still have to depend on circumstantial evidence or whether this voice recorder and the flight data recorder would give a conclusive story about what actually happened.

The second thing I would like to know from the hon. Minister is whether some effort has been made to study the methodology adopted by El AL of interviewing the passengers before they board the aircraft to find out if wrong passengers, passengers with ill intentions or hijackers are getting on to the aircraft. My able friend, hon'ble Mr. Gurupadaswamy, just now mentioned about identification of the baggage just before entering the aircraft. I think it is a very important factor and must be strictly adhered to and no unidentified baggage should get on to the aircraft. The Israeli Airlines, as you may have read in the press, take very specific care of interviewing all passengers to find out whether the passenger is getting on to the aircraft with any motive other than just a straight flight. They check about the hotel where they were staying; they check about the receipts; they check about how long they have been residing there, they check about with whom they have been staying whom they had come to meet etc. etc. of course, dogs have been employed to check any trace of fear in passengers. But I would like to know whether dogs ■

[Shri Vishwa Bandhu Gupta] have been in adequate numbers to make sure that a thorough check is made of all the passengers and the baggage that goes on to the aircraft.

Lastly, Madam, I would like to know whether there were some passengers who were very very heavily insured and whether insurance compensation to passengers and crew is going to be made quickly and whether there is any timescale for that. Thank you very much.

SHRI R. RAMAKRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu). Madam Deputy Chairman, most of the things have been said and I would not repeat them again. But the whole thing is so tragic that it was really befitting that the Chairman had made an obituary reference to it this morning. If, perhaps, this statement given by the hon. Minister was rather factual but not informative, it is because the justice Kripal Court of Inquiry has been ordered and the whole thing is sub-judice and at this stage the Minister did not want to give too many details on very many sensitive and embarrassing things. But here, Madam, I would like just to differ with my friend, Mr. Suresh Kal-madi, though he is a pilot and more knowledgeable than me. He says the possibility of structural failure is more than that of a bomb explosion. But this is not made out by the very many experts who are closely following this. They are subscribing to the theory that this could have only been caused by a bomb explosion. Anyway, the Court of Inquiry will go into, all this and come out with the facts. But, I think, I should differ from my friend.

I really congratulate the Government for one thing, that they have not spared any effort and gone the whole hog in trying to get the black box, which is a multi-million dollar operation, with the help of so many Governments. At least in this one aspect the Government of India has given up the usual bureaucratic ways

and gone fully. I really congratulate the Minister for this and I hope that this decoding, once it is over, in India, the same will also be sent to the expert decoding centres in Britain as well as in the United States for getting a double check because, as you know, two opinions are always better than one.

Madam, there are various things which have been advanced. My friend, Mr. Gopalsamy, said about the Russian rocket theory. There are so many other theories. But I would like to know from the Minister whether he has seen a report and whether that has been brought before the Commission, that one international emergency organization going by the name "Decostate" or something like that had received distress signals from the Air-India plane a few seconds before the crash. This is a new organization which has been set up which receives even very sensitive signals from all the aircraft.

Coming to the question of scanning and internal security, Madam, we have our intelligence agencies abroad, and Air-India also should coordinate with the various agencies in the respective countries to have a sort of feedback on the terrorist activities, particularly in countries like Canada and the United Kingdom where many persons are there who are likely to be terrorists. I think there should be some sort of intelligence information so that the checks can also be selective. Now, of course, the checks have been tightened up; I welcome this. In fact, I would also like to know from the Minister what has happened to the Special Sub-Committee of the Civil Aviation Consultative Committee which has been set up to go into the whole thing of security checks within the country—whether that report has been submitted and whether it will be implemented. But coming to security, I think this police dog sniffing and other things, while they are welcome as a random check if the same dog is

given the same work ever, day, its nose will become very insensitive and so this is not exactly feasible. Only random checking is possible. But I think the security check should be tightened and even VIPs and VVIPs should be made to undergo this special security check.

Now coming to the question of checking the baggage and identifying it and all the parade about which Mr. Gopalsamy has stated and about which Mr. Jaswant Singh referred to a circular, here I have a suggestion for the lister in this connection. A person who checks into a sterile area, once he checks in he should not be allowed to go out and he should be put inside the lounge or somewhere so that there is no question of anybody trying to check in with the baggage and go out and not turn up. This will ensure that no person goes out. So, you can have Indian Airlines or Air-India counters at the plane and as soon as he checks in he has to go into the lounge or some other sterile area and there is no possibility whereby he can go outside the airport. So, this is a suggestion which, he should consider.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shrimati Kanak Mukherjee in the Chair.)]

About the payment of insurance, it is not to be taken lightly. I do not think a responsible firm like Lloyds or anybody can say that they won't pay, coming to their own conclusions that this was a terrorist act when even the Courts of Inquiry has not completed its work. Anyway, I am sure the Minister and Air-India will be following up all these things closely and I would very much welcome if in this session itself a full scale debate on terrorism and all these things takes place so that more facts can come to light.

Thank you very much. Madam. 651  
RS—8

3 P.M.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI-MATI KANAK MUKHERJEE): Mr. Virendra Verma.

SHRI SUSHU. CHAND MOHUNTA: I would like to speak on this. My name has been given by Mr. Virendra Verma.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI-MATI KANAK MUKHERJEE): AH right.

SHRI SUSHIL CHAND MOHUNTA: Thank you, Madam.

Madam, I join all other Members of this House in expressing my deep sense of sorrow over what has happened over this most tragic incident. Many things have already been said on this subject. I would not like to repeat them.

But what I am concerned is that, apart from the Commission of Inquiry, the court of inquiry set up, which is going into the circumstance leading to this disaster, which will be giving its finding, not intending at all to encroach upon its jurisdiction. I still maintain that there is a certain area within which we can give our suggestions and can expect that the hon. Minister will clarify certain things to assure us that such incidents during this intervening period till the report comes, such ghastly incidents do not occur again.

The first question is that the crew of the aircraft whether here or in any foreign country, when they board the plane, their belongings, hand-baggage and luggage and all other items must be checked similarly as the items of other passengers are checked, not because they may be in league with the terrorists. I do not expect that at all because their own lives are at stake. But very innocently a packet can be forwarded to any member of the crew or to any VIP or any other passenger boarding the plane. And out of full sense of responsibility one may board the plane, thinking that

[Shri Sushil Chand Mohunta]  
 everything is well, and yet that packet which has not been checked may be an item which may ultimately explode and the plane and the lives of those people on the board would be put at stake. The story that we have read in the papers is that a packet was given to the pilot at the last minute when he was boarding the plane. Whether that is correct or not, I do not know. But if it is so, that a packet was delivered to him and that packet might have been the packet having an explosive device, due to which this incident occurred, the moral of the story is, we must guard against it and eliminate all chances. Whether they are crew, whether they are passengers, VIPs or any other persons, all their hand-baggage, personal and otherwise, and their luggage should be all completely checked and chances eliminated that there can be any explosive device in them. This is most essential.

Apart from that, there are instances, as he said, in which sometimes the detecting device or the X-ray machine fails or is not able to detect. So, there must be double check at that stage. The package checked at one point should be checked again before it is loaded, not only identified. Identification is one thing. But there should be double check so that any failure in the working of the machine does not result in such ghastly tragedy. After all, this tragedy has taken the toll of such precious lives, and it is so tragic that even at the cost of a little bit of overdoing we should try to eliminate all chances of disaster of this nature.

Apart from this, Madam, it has been seen that in all international flights, it is the security arrangement of that particular country which is mostly activated in detecting whether the luggage is free from, or is carrying any, contraband material. Now, my only suggestion is that if Air-India jumbo, jet is taking off from a Canada airport, our intelligence people should

be deployed at their airport so that they can identify and detect the terrorists. Our intelligence will be in a better position rather than other country's intelligence to identify the terrorists. This suggestion can be raised at IATA meeting or at the Governmental level so that a mutual agreement can be reached on checking and rechecking a shady person. Our intelligence people should be posted at their airport at our cost. That country may raise an objection for posting our security personnel. But for maintaining the safety of our jumbo jets our intelligence people should be posted in foreign countries so that such incidents do not occur.

Of course, the findings will be coming and I am sure there can be not two opinions on this point. Everyone is interested in the safety and security of human beings. It is not a political issue. It is a matter where everybody is deeply interested. We would like to extend our full support in this matter. We are prepared to give our suggestions and participate in the discussions if the Government asks for it. We are prepared to help the Government in ensuring that such incidents do not recur. Thank you.

श्री अशोक गहलोत : महोदय, अभी करीब एक घंटे भर में हमारे माननीय सदस्यों ने जो एयर-इंडिया का जेट विमान दुर्घटनाग्रस्त हुआ और उस दुर्घटना के कारण जिन परिवारों को हानि उठानी पड़ी, उसके लिए अपना दुःख प्रकट किया और अपनी संवेदना प्रकट की। मैं सोचता हूँ कि हम सब के पास ऐसे कोई शब्द नहीं हैं, जिन शब्दों के द्वारा हम अपनी संवेदनाओं को उन लोगों तक पहुंचा सकें। माननीय सदस्यों ने और जैसे हमारे अंतिम सदस्य बोले, उन्होंने कहा कि इसमें कोई राजनीतिक बात नहीं है, उससे हट कर ही सबने अपने विचार प्रकट किए। मैं सोचता हूँ कि इसमें जो सुझाव भरे पास आए हैं, वे भी और भी जो हमारे ऐसे कदम हैं, जिसके द्वारा हम चाहते हैं कि जो हवाई सुरक्षा है, जो हमारे हवाई जहाजों की सुरक्षा है, उसमें चलने वाले यात्रियों

की सुरक्षा है, उनको और ज्यादा मजबूत बनाया जाएगा।

महोदया, माननीय सदस्यों ने कई प्रकार के सुझाव अभी हमारे सामने रखे और सिक्योरिटी को लेकर भी चिन्ता प्रकट की। मैं उनकी भावनाओं को महसूस कर रहा हूँ और मैं इतना कह सकता हूँ कि हम लोगों ने, चूँकि यह जो एअर क्लेश हुआ है, उसके पहले से ही जो धमकियाँ मिल रही थीं, उसको देखते हुए कई प्रकार के सुरक्षात्मक कदम उठाए थे और यह एअर क्लेश होने के बाद भी हम लोगों ने उसको पूरा रिड्यू किया है। हमारी कोशिश है कि हम लोग इस प्रकार की सिक्योरिटी का अरेंजमेंट करें, जिससे कि कोई भी ऐसा फेल्योर न हो सके, चाहे वह किसी आतंकवादी की कार्यवाही हो, चाहे कोई अन्य प्रकार की बात हो, उसमें सुरक्षात्मक कदमों के कारण कोई कमी न रह जाये।

जैसा कि माननीय सदस्यों को मालूम है कि जो हमारे मंत्रालय की पिछली सलाहकार समिति की बैठक हुई थी, उसमें भी हम लोगों ने और प्रधान मंत्री जी ने स्थिति की गंभीरता को देखते हुए जो एक कमेटी बनाने का निर्णय लिया, जो हमारे पांच संसद-सदस्यों की कमेटी बन चुकी है। हमारी पांच संसद-सदस्यों की कमेटी बन चुकी है, वह इस काम को देख रही है और हमें आशा है कि वह अगस्त के प्रथम सप्ताह तक अपनी रिपोर्ट प्रस्तुत कर देगी जिसको सामने रख कर हम लोग अगली सलाहकार समिति के विचार-विमर्श को आधार बनाकर कुछ फैसले ले सकें, और कुछ नए निर्देश जारी कर सकें।

जहाँ तक माननीय सदस्य जसवंत सिंह ने कहा कि जो सर्कुलर निकले थे उन पर पूरी तरह से अमल नहीं हुआ। मैं यह निवेदन करना चाहूँगा...

**श्री जसवंत सिंह :** अशोक जी, मैंने यह नहीं कहा कि जो सर्कुलर पहले निकले थे उन पर अमल नहीं हुआ, मेरा कहना यह था कि जो मार्च, 25, 1983 का सर्कुलर है उस की वजह से ही यह गफलत हुई है। उस सर्कुलर में कहा गया है कि पेंसिजर नहीं आया है, फिर भी पेंसिजर का लगेज प्लेन पर रहेगा और एयरक्राफ्ट का पाइलट उसको डिले नहीं करेगा।

**श्री अशोक गहलोत :** माननीय सदस्य ने जो सर्कुलर बताया है मैं पहले उसको मंगा कर देख लूँगा। उसके बाद कई सर्कुलर निकल चुके हैं और स्पष्ट निर्देश दिए जा चुके हैं कि पेंसिजर जब तक आइडेंटिफाई नहीं करेगा तब तक वह नहीं रखा जाएगा।

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र :** आप जो बात बता रहे हैं वह भी है और जसवंत सिंह जी जो बता रहे हैं वह भी है। दो परस्पर विरोधी आदेश हैं।

**श्री जसवंत सिंह :** आप गलत न समझिए यह वहस का विषय नहीं है। आपका यह फरमान सही हो सकता है कि आजकल तो सब बेगैज की तलाशी लेते हैं। पर इस एक्सीडेंट से पहले ऐसा नहीं होता था कि बेगैज को आइडेंटिफाई कीजिए। मैं आपकी नुकताचीनी की वजह से यह नहीं कह रहा कि इस सर्कुलर की वजह से गफलत हुई है।

Not as a matter of witch-hunting but please as a matter of corrective of what has gone wrong.

**श्री अशोक गहलोत :** मैं इस सर्कुलर को देख लूँगा और अगर कोई भी कमी है तो उसकी दूर कर दूँगा। जहाँ तक मैं सोचता हूँ, हमने जो पहले निर्देश जारी किए थे उनके अन्तर्गत मॉट्रियल और टोरोंटो में एक्सरे मशीनें भी लगाई गईं, जिनका जिक्र माननीय सदस्य ने किया था और जिसके बारे में खबर आई थी कि जब चैक हो रहा था वह मशीन बीच में खराब हो गई। अब जो निर्देश हैं उनका

[श्री अशोक गहलौज]

कड़ाई के साथ पालन किया जा रहा है। जो रजिस्टर्ड वेगेज हैं वह चैक-इन कराने के बाद जब जमा कराया जाता है तो पहले एक्स-रे मशीन के द्वारा देखा जाता है, फिर उसको सील किया जाता है। उसके बाद वह डिपोजिट हो सकता है। जो नए दिश दिए गए हैं उनमें आइडेंटिफिकेशन को कम्पलसरी कर दिया गया है।

जो मशीन खराब होने की बात कही गयी है उस विषय में मुझे जानकारी दी गई है कि जब मशीन खराब हो गयी है तो जो पी-डी-4 का एक्विपमेंट है वार्किंग वेगेज को उसके द्वारा चैक किया गया और उसके बाद ही एयरक्राफ्ट में लौट किया गया था।

माननीय सदस्यों ने राय प्रकट की कि जो वी० आई० पी० विशिष्ट व्यक्ति हैं उनके वेगेज की भी साधारण पेंसिजर की तरह चेकिंग होनी चाहिए। अभी हमने सुरक्षात्मक जो कदम उठाए हैं उनमें यह निर्देश भी दिया गया है कि जिनको होम मिनिस्ट्री वी० आई० पी० ट्रीट करती है, जो विदेशी मेहमान आते हैं उनको छोड़कर — सारे मध्यमवर्तियों से इस आशय का निवेदन किया है— किसी भी वी० आई० पी० का टर्मिनल पर किसी प्रकार का रिटैर्न नहीं किया जाना चाहिए। और इसके साथ-साथ सारे वेगेज को भी चेक करने का प्रावधान किया गया है और मैं ऐसा मानता हूँ कि इस काम में किसी प्रकार की गफलत नहीं रहेगी।

जहाँ तक कंपेंसेशन देने की बात कही गयी है और उसके बारे में कुछ जानकारी की मांग की गयी है, मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि हम लोगों ने दिल्ली में, बंबई में और सभी जगहों पर, कनाडा में भी स्पेशल सेल स्थापित किये हैं और वे काम करने लगे हैं और वे नेक्सट आफ दि किन को पूरा सहयोग कर रहे हैं फार्म-लिटीज को पूरा करने के लिए और हमें उम्मीद है कि कंपेंसेशन के जो मामले हैं वे सब एयर इंडिया के सहयोग से निपट सकेंगे और उन में कोई दिक्कत आने की

संभावना नहीं है। कुछ यह आशंका प्रकट की गई है कि जो इम्पोर्ट्स कंपनी है वह किसी प्रकार के आध्वेक्षण कर रही है। हमारे पास इस प्रकार की कोई बात सामने नहीं आयी है और मैं समझता हूँ कि इस में न तो हम से कोई जानकारी मांगी गयी है और न ही इसमें कोई दिक्कत आ सकती है।

एक माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि एयर बस इंडस्ट्री ने जो बीस एयर बसें हम लेने वाले थे लीज पर वह देने से मना कर दिया है। मैं माननीय सदस्यों की जानकारी के लिये कहना चाहूँगा कि हम लोग बीस एयर बसें लेने नहीं जा रहे हैं। जो एयर इंडिया का आर्डर 6 एयर बसों के लिये है वह 6 एयर बस हम खरीदने जा रहे हैं जो हम को 1986 में, करीब 7-8 महीनों में मिल जायेगी और इस में कोई दिक्कत नहीं होगी और इस में लीज की कोई बात नहीं है।

कई आशंकाएँ, जो अखबारों में भी आयी हैं, कि इस एक्विपमेंट का कारण क्या था, इस को माननीय सदस्य जानना चाहते हैं और ऐसी इच्छा उन्होंने प्रकट की है। और जो कुछ मैं कहना चाहता हूँ वह उन्होंने स्वयं ही अपने विचारों में व्यक्त भी कर दिया है कि जब एक हार्ड कोर्ट का जज इस की इन्क्वायरी के लिये बिठा दिया गया है तो मैं ऐसा मानता हूँ कि कोई व्यं इस पर प्रकट करना मेरे लिये सम्भव नहीं होगा। अभी जो एक दल इम्मीडियेटली भेजा था उस ने भी जो रिकेज मिला उस के माध्यम से और जो शव प्राप्त हुये उन की आटोप्सी के माध्यम से कुछ बातों का पता लगाया है। उस वक्त तक काकपिट वायस रेकार्डर या डाटा रेकार्डर हम कौं नहीं मिला था। जसवंत सिंह जी ने शायद कहा कि आप ने इस को एक बहुत बड़ी उपलब्धि बताने की कोशिश की है। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि वास्तव में अगर देखा जाये तो यह अपने आप मैं एक उपलब्धि है कि इतनी गहराई से कोई चीज इस प्रकार के अपरेशन से निकली है और मेरे मंत्रालय के जो सेक्रेटरी डा० सिद्धू के नेतृत्व में वहाँ

गये थे, उन के दल में अलग अलग एयर लाइन्स के फ्लाइट सेपटी के डाइरेक्टर्स भी थे और कुछ अन्य भी थे उन्होंने जा कर जिस प्रकार से इतना बड़ा हादसा होने के बाद से रेस्क्यू ऑपरेशन के लिये तत्परता दिखाया, और जिस तरह से उस का मोवालाइज किया, जिस तरह से वहाँ की सरकारों के साथ कोऑर्डिनेट किया यह सब अपने आप में एक बहुत बड़ी बात थी और हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी के निदेश हम को बराबर मिलते रहे और हमारी उन से अपर्क था और यहाँ कारण था कि सही समय पर यह फैसला हुआ और जैसा कि मैंने अपने स्टेटमेंट में कहा है कि यह लियोन थे विनिटस फ्रांस से हाथर कर मंगाया गया और उस के कारण ही समय पर यह दिनां चीजे निकल सकी। अगर उस समय पर यह निर्णय नहीं लिया जाता तो शायद यह संभव नहीं था। हम को उसे हाथर करना पड़ा और उन को जो काम था उस से आधा काम पर वह उन्होंने हम को देना कंबूव किया और उस के कारण ही यह दो महत्वपूर्ण चीजे निकल सकी। जसवंत सिंह जी से और अन्य सदस्यों से मैं इस बात का निवेदन करूँगा कि अगर एफ० डी० आर० सी० बी० आर० नहीं निकाल पाते तो मैं सोचता हूँ कि चाहे कितनी बड़ी जांच होती, उसका वावजूद भी लोगों के मन में यह शंका बनी रहेगी कि फ्लाइट रेकार्डर या वायस रेकार्डर मिल जाते तो पता नहीं क्या बात होती। मैं समझता हूँ कि इनका निष्कालना हमारे लिये अच्छी बात है। उससे हमारे जो हाई कोर्ट के जज इन्वायरी कर रहे हैं, उनके सामने एक पहलू स्पष्ट हुआ है।

मैं भी मानता हूँ, जैसा कि सदस्यों ने कहा, कि इन्वायरी जल्दी पूरी होनी चाहिए। हमने 31 दिसम्बर तक समय दिया है, हमें आशा है कि उस वक्त तक या उससे पहले इन्वायरी पूरी हो

जायेगी ताकि जो हकीकत है, जो फैक्ट्स हैं वह हमारे सामने आ सकें।

एक माननीय सदस्य ने यह आशंका प्रकट की और अपने प्रदेश का उन्होंने उदाहरण दिया कि हम लोग खाली आतंकवाद का नाम लेकर हकीकत से दूर न हो जायें। पूरी पूरी उम्मीद है कि जो इन्वायरी होगी, उसका बाद हमारे सामने सही तथ्य आ सकेंगे और तभी जो क्या क्या थ्योरिज चल रही हैं, बम ब्लास्ट की बात हो या ऐक्सप्लोजन की बात हो, हकीकत हमारे सामने आयेगी और जो आशंकाएँ हैं उनके ऊपर खुलासा होगा और स्पष्ट रूप से रिपोर्ट हमारे सामने आ सकेगी।

जहाँ तक सुरेश कलमाडी जी ने यह बात कही कि 747 एयरक्राफ्ट जो हैं उनको ग्राउंड कर दिया जाये, मैं समझता हूँ कि आप पाइलट रह चुके हैं, इस प्रकार के 747 दुनिया भर में बड़ी संख्या में चल रहे होंगे। इतनी बड़ी जो दुर्घटना हुई है उससे पूरी दुनिया ने मुल्कों का ध्यान गया है सैक्युरिटी की दृष्टि से भी और स्ट्रक्चरल फैल्योर की अगर बात आती है तो वे लोग भी इसके बारे में बराबर विचार कर लेंगे। तो मैं नहीं मानता कि हम लोग इस बारे में कोई बात सकें कि 747 को ग्राउंड कर दिया जाये, न हमारा कोई इस प्रकार का इरादा है।

जो हमारे ब्लैक बॉक्स हैं उनके बारे में आपने कहा कि इसमें शंकाएँ लोगों में प्रकट की गई हैं कि ये हमारे देश में नहीं बल्कि अमरीका और इंग्लैंड में उनकी जांच होनी चाहिये, तो मैं समझता हूँ कि इनके विश्लेषण करने के हमारे पास पूरे साधन हैं। उसके बावजूद भी अगर हाई कोर्ट के जज जो इन्वायरी कर रहे हैं, वह उचित समझते हैं कि ऐसा करना जरूरी है तो वह निर्णय ले सकते हैं, हमें इसमें कोई आब्जेक्शन नहीं है।

[श्री अशोक गहलोत]

इसके साथ, मैं समझता हूँ कि सारी बातें करीब करीब मैंने आपको बता दी हैं। जो अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय सम्मेलन करने की बात कुछ सदस्यों ने सुझाव के तौर पर कही है, मैं ऐसा मानता हूँ कि अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय संगठन जो सिविल एंगेजेशन के हैं, अगर वे कोई सम्मेलन हिन्दूस्तान में करना चाहेंगे, इस प्रकार की कॉन्फ्रेंस का वैसे उन लोगों ने विचार किया है, मीटिंग की है, वह अपना विचार बना रहे हैं। उसके बावजूद भी हमारे देश में इस प्रकार का सम्मेलन होने की बात आएगी तो हम उस पर विचार कर सकेंगे, उसमें हमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं रहेगी और इस प्रकार का दुर्घटनाओं की जांच की बात गहराई में लोगों के ध्यान में लाई जा सकेगी।

कुछ सदस्यों ने यह कहा, कि जैसे गुरुपद स्वामी जी ने भी कहा है, कि दूसरे मुल्कों में इस प्रकार की घटनाएं बहुत कम पीरियड में हुई हैं। इसमें कोई दो राय नहीं हैं, एक महीना नहीं बल्कि 10-12 दिन के अन्दर जिस प्रकार की हाई जैकिंग की घटनाएं फ्रैंकफर्ट, जापान और टोकियो में तीन चार जगहों पर हुई हैं, वे इस बात के लिए एक संकेत हैं कि जो सिविल एंगेजेशन का सैक्टर है, उसको एक बहुत बड़ा धक्का लगा है और एक चिन्ता का वह विषय बन गया है पूरी दुनिया के अन्दर। मैंने यह बात उस वक्त भी कही थी कि इस प्रकार की घटनाएं टैरिज्म और हाई जैकिंग के कारण क्यों हो रही हैं? और मुझे उम्मीद है कि इतनी बड़ी कीमत चुकाने के बाद यानी एयर इंडिया के जम्बो जेट के दुर्घटनाग्रस्त होने से इतने अधिक परिवारों की मृत्यु हुई है जिसकी हम कल्पना भी नहीं कर सकते, इस कीमत चुकाने के बाद दुनिया, के सारे मुल्क सोचेंगे उनके बारे में जो लोग आतंकवादियों को पनाह देने के लिए, जब उनके पास सुझाव जाते थे तो वह परवाह नहीं करते थे। आज बराबर मैं ऐसा मानता हूँ कि इस घटना के बाद दुनिया के मुल्कों में जहाँ-जहाँ आतंकवादी लोग हैं, असामाजिक तत्व हैं उन पर कड़ी से कड़ी कार्रवाई करने के लिए फ़ैले हुए जायें। डराने रखेंगे कि अगर कोई टैरिज्म चाहे कोई दूसरे मुल्क का है अगर वह हमारे यहाँ गतिविधियाँ चलाता है तो कभी वह हमारी अपनी सरकार को भी

नुकसान पहुंचा सकता है। इस प्रकार मैं सोच सकता हूँ कि इतनी बड़ी कीमत चुकाने के बाद एयर इंडिया को यात्रियों की सुरक्षा के लिए और अधिक मजबूती के साथ सोचना होगा जिससे ऐसी कोई घटना भविष्य में न हो।

एक माननीय सदस्य ने यह कहा है कि जो टोकियो में बम्ब्र ब्लास्ट हुआ था उसका और इसका क्या संबंध है? मैं इतना ही निवेदन कर सकता हूँ कि जो फ्रैंकफर्ट में उसमें 53 मिनट पहले कनिष्का की दुर्घटना के वहाँ घटना घटी थी। दोनों का क्या संबंध है इसके बारे में जब हमारे सामने जांच रिपोर्ट आ जाएगी उसके बाद ही कुछ कहा जा सकेगा। इन शब्दों के साथ मैं माननीय सदस्यों को धन्यवाद दूंगा कि आपने कई नए सुझावों की ओर मेरा ध्यान आकृष्ट किया है। मैं कोशिश करूंगा कि आपके जो सुझाव हैं वह मेरे लिए, जो नए कदम उठाए जायेंगे उसमें वह काम आ सके।

श्री बी० सत्यनारायण रेड्डी : टैरिज्म आर्गनाइजेशन ने जो कहा है उसके बारे में आपने कुछ नहीं बताया।

श्री अशोक गहलोत : बात यहाँ आकर टिकती है कि हमें कोई टेलिफोन करता है तो हम किसी नतीजे पर नहीं पहुंच सकते। वह सारे इससे जड़े हुये प्रश्न हैं। जो जांच आयोग जांचकर रहा है उसकी पूरी जांच होने के बाद ही कहा जा सकेगा कि वास्तव में जो उन्होंने कहा है कि इस विस्फोट में उनका हाथ है वह सही है या नहीं। उसके बाद ही पता लग सकेगा कि यह घटना कैसे घटी है और वास्तविकता क्या है? किसी भी नतीजे पर पहुंचने के लिये बहुत जरूरी है कि जो कोर्ट बैठाया गया है, उसकी फाईंडिंग्स की, उसकी रिपोर्ट की हम इंतजार करें।

श्री धर्मचन्द्र प्रसांत (जम्मू और काश्मीर) : यहाँ एक माननीय सदस्य ने कुछ समाचार पत्रों में छपा है कि जिस वक्त कनिष्का उड़ान भरने लगा था तो एक पैकेट पायलेट को दिया गया था और उसने पहले खाना भी खाया। मैं यह जानना

चाहता हूँ कि जो तहकीकात कराने जा रहे हैं या हो रही है उसमें यह बात आई है या नहीं ?

श्री अशोक गहलोत : इसके लिये हमने वहाँ से रिपोर्ट मांगी है और मैं समझता हूँ कि जितनी भी हम लोग इन्फरमेशन मांग रहे हैं जैसा मैंने पहले कहा है हाई कोर्ट के जज साहब जाँच कर रहे हैं उनको दी जा रही है जिसमें वह किसी नतीजे पर पहुँचने में सफलता प्राप्त कर सकें। धन्यवाद।

**THE COAL MINES (CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT) AMENDMENT BILL, 1984.**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI-MATI KANAK MUKHERJEE): Now, we will continue with the discussion on the Coal Mines (Development and Regulation) Amendment Bill, 1984. The discussion on this Bill started on the 14th March 1985. Now, Mr. Sukomal Sen is to finish his speech. Yes, Mr. Sukomal Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Madam, I am rising not to oppose this particular Bill as such. But, since this is about conservation and development of coal mines, I would like to make some observations on certain relevant points relating to, this Bill.

Coal, as we all know, is an exhaustible item and, according to some experts, our coal reserves are going to be exhausted by the middle of the next century. I do not know how far it is correct. But that is the estimate made by some experts and, as such, conservation and development of coal is of the utmost importance to our country. Madam, I find that the manner in which the Coal-India and the Government are managing the coal-mines is not at all helping the conservation and development of coal mines. On the other hand, certain incidents have taken place which are greatly affecting the coal-mines and

hampering development, and instead of conserving the coal reserves it is causing colossal wastage to this precious reserve of our country. I will give examples, one by one. I will try to be very brief.

Million of tonnes of coal are lying underground in the form of pillars. I think in other countries de-pillaring is done in order to utilize the coal, that is, after extraction of coal. But in India in our coalmines de-pillaring is not being done. As a result, a huge quantity of coal is being wasted in the coalmines.

Secondly, Madam, Coal-India, after extracting a certain amount of coal from the mine, declare certain mines as abandoned, although a huge reserve of coal still remains in those mines. What happens afterwards? Afterwards illegal mining takes place and illegal mining takes place in such a way that it endangers the life of the workers who are engaged in this illegal mining by some private parties. There are numerous reports coming out in newspapers that in various coalmines workers have been killed while conducting illegal mining, and there are reports also that some officials of Coal-India and some mafia gangs are combined together in this operation of illegal mining. And there is another startling report that even in the Central Industrial Security Force which is deployed in the coalmines area certain personnel also are colluding in this operation of illegal mining. There is another report to which I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Minister. In Bihar there is very big coalfields and the Bihar Government—I do not know for what reason—are encouraging private mining in certain coalfields. I would like the Minister kindly to enquire into this allegation. Then, there is another aspect. Thousands of tonnes of coal is being wasted by underground fire. Particularly there are reports that in the Jharia-Ranigani coal belt the underground fire is destroying a huge quantity of coal. In fact, the Raniganj town is