

from the Union Carbide factory at Bhopal; and

(b) if so, what steps are being taken by Government to prevent recurrence of such incidents elsewhere in the country?

THE MINISTER OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL): (a) and (b) A statement is laid on the Table of the Sabha.

#### Statement

(a) The Government of Madhya Pradesh have, so far, ascertained that 1408 persons died in the accident. Further verification is being done by the State Government. The State Government have engaged the Tata Institute of Social Sciences and a few other similar institutions to do a detailed 'house to house' survey for assessing, *inter alia*, the casualties resulting from the accident.

(b) The Union Carbide factory at Bhopal has since been closed and the factory inspectorate of the State Government has not renewed the licence of the factory, under the Factories Act.

The Central Government have advised all State Governments to undertake a thorough review of various regulations, control and preventive measures contained in the Rules and Regulations relating to hazardous chemicals' manufacturing processes and evaluate the existing arrangements with reference to the special need for enforcement of safety.

Besides, Central Government have also decided to set-up a special cell to make a detailed study of the practices in vogue, in developed countries for dealing with hazardous substances and to identify gaps in the prevailing legislative and institutional arrangements in the country and suggest suitable steps for strengthening such arrangements.

Technical enquiry into the leakage of Methyl-Isocyanate gas from Union Carbide factory at Bhopal

\*24. SHRI BHAGATRAM MANHAR:†  
SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA:

Will the Minister of CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have caused any technical enquiry into the causes of the disastrous leakage of Methyl-Isocyanate gas from the Union Carbide factory in Bhopal in the first week of December;

(b) if so, what is the outcome of the enquiry;

(c) whether any lapse on the part of the Union Carbide management has been detected which has resulted in the leakage of the deadly gas; and

(d) if so, what action Government have initiated against the management of the company?

THE MINISTER OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL): (a) Government of Madhya Pradesh have set-up a Commission of Inquiry headed by a Judge of the Madhya Pradesh High Court and its terms of reference, *inter alia*, cover investigation into the events and circumstances of the accident, the adequacy of steps taken by the factory authorities and adequacy of safety measures and their implementation.

Apart from this, the CBI is investigating into the criminal case registered under Indian Penal Code against the plant authorities in this connection.

(b) Investigations are in progress.

(c) and (d) Production activities in the factory have since been stopped

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Bhagatram Manhar.

and the question of taking further action against the Union Carbide management will be decided after the investigations are completed.

**SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE:** Sir, Question No. 33A is also similar. It may also be taken up together.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** It does not appear in the list.

**SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is the greatest man-made human tragedy and it raises several questions, particularly whether science should be the servant of mankind or whether man's life should be endangered by the advances of science and technology. What pains me is the fact that the multinationals earn the maximum profit out of the developing and under-developed countries; but as regards the safety practices which are used and installed in the developing and under-developed, the minimal is introduced leading to the occurrence of such tragedies. There are many dimensions to the question. But I will restrict myself only to what has been asked by me. I feel that the answer which has been given by the hon. Minister does not really meet the requirements. I would like to ask the hon. Minister whether in regard to these sophisticated plants the Government will, as a matter of policy, insist that the same safety standards, the same safety measures which are prevalent in a plant in their own country, in the developed country, will also be taken in the plants which are erected in our country.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, so far as safety measures are concerned, the Government of Madhya Pradesh has already constituted the Commission of Inquiry. They are going into this matter. So, it is *sub judice*. As regards the safety measures that have been adopted in this plant in Bhopal were adequate or not, one of the terms of reference is: Recommendations in regard to measures for preventing similar accidents

in industries of this nature. In all, there are seven terms of reference. The events and circumstances leading to the accident which occurred on the intervening night of 2nd and 3rd December in the insecticide plant of the Union Carbide is one of the terms of reference. The entire matter is under investigation. It is *sub judice*. The Government of India have already decided to set up a special cell to make a detailed study of the practices in vogue in the developed countries for dealing in hazardous substances and the prevailing controls in force to ensure safety for man and environment. The Government of India is also considering setting up a National Scientific and Medical Committee to study all the aspects arising out of the accident and to give an authoritative opinion about the likely after-effects and appropriate steps that need to be taken at the medical and scientific level. In addition to this, the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilisers, the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry of Environment have already taken sufficient steps. They have constituted cells. They are going into this matter. I agree with the hon. Member that this is the worst tragedy not only in our country but in the entire world. It has opened the eyes of the State Government and the Central Government. So, we are very seriously considering what steps are necessary to be taken in order to prevent recurrence of such accidents in future.

**SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE:** Sir, it is heart-engaging to note that there is at last a coordination of the Ministry of Fertilisers and Chemicals, the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry of Environment because the environmental aspect of the matter is completely lost sight of. I am worried about my home city of Bombay when I have this question in mind.

Sir, the matter is strictly not *sub judice* though the hon. Minister may feel so. My second supplementary is

that instead of waiting for a final report of the Commission of Inquiry, would a preliminary and quick assessment of the dangers be made and immediate steps taken to see that these tragedies do not recur in our country.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** That is what I said. So far as the report of this Judicial Inquiry which is appointed under the Commissions of Inquiry Act is concerned, in the order itself it is made clear that the Commission shall complete the inquiry and submit its report by the 15th of March, 1985. And the State Government has already appointed two technical assessors to assist the Commission and on their own the Commission can also appoint the assessors and expert scientists in this matter. And we hope to get a report within the time that is stipulated. After getting the report, whatever further action is necessary, that will be taken. And I have already mentioned that the Environment Department and the other Departments have already initiated action to see that such accidents do not occur hereafter in our country.

**SHRI H. L. KAPUR:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, we are grateful to the hon. Minister for having given assurances that everything possible will be done to ensure that accidents of this magnitude do not recur in the future. But, Sir, we would like to request the hon. Minister to spell out as to what monitoring system the hon. Minister is trying to introduce. As far as my information goes, the Director of Industrial Safety has only two Deputy Directors, one based at Indore and the other at Bhopal. And he has only 12 Inspectors for the entire Madhya Pradesh to look after the entire inspection. And before this tragedy took place in Bhopal on the night of 2nd/3rd December, there were three other accidents which took place in the same factory in October and December, 1982 and in February, 1983

where a man died due to an exposure to the gas. What action was taken by the Madhya Pradesh Government to go into these incidents? And if at all any inquiry was held, what was the recommendation of the inquiry and what steps were taken by the Madhya Pradesh Government to strengthen the Inspectorate to make sure that the basic requirements of safety in such a production centre which produces such highly toxic material and potentially dangerous material were being introduced? Sir, my information is that no inspection of this Factory was ever carried out, and if at all an inspection was carried out it was only a routine inspection where a man went and signed a form and came away...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Put a question, please.

**SHRI H. L. KAPUR:** I would like to know as to what monitoring system has the Minister in mind to ensure that what is being introduced will be fully implemented.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** I have already made it clear. It is not a question of only this unit which is located in Bhopal. This is the greatest tragedy on the earth which has opened our eyes. And it is not in Bhopal only that we have got such an industry. We have got chemical industries all over the country. So, this is a major question. What we have to see is as to what further steps will have to be taken in order to see that in these health hazardous industries, sufficient safety measures are taken. That is why the Central Pollution Control Board is going into this matter; the Labour Ministry is going into the matter to see whether any amendments are necessary in the Factories Act. And I have said just now that the Central Government is actively considering the setting up of a National Scientific and Medical Committee to study all aspects arising out of the accident. So, after

these studies are made and the reports are received—they are going to suggest what steps have to be taken—the Government will certainly take necessary steps in the light of that.

SHRI H. L. KAPUR: Sir,...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kapur, I congratulate you on your maiden question. But please take your seat. You have already asked the question.

SHRI BHAGATRAM MANHAR: Sir, since the question relates to a grave tragedy involving thousands of lives including women and children, killed or disabled for life arising out of the grave negligence on the part of the management of the Union Carbide and others, I think, there will be a full fledged discussion on this. But however, I would like to ask a few questions.

My first question is whether the Union Carbide plant represents the installation of an old, outdated technology, rejected especially in the U.S.A. and how far this tragedy was attributable to the use of such a technology without adequate safeguards and secondly, under what circumstances, this out-dated, obsolete and hazardous technology was imported and who were responsible for this?

SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL: Sir, so far as this undertaking is concerned, the parent company is in the U.S.A. They formed a company in India in which their present equity is 50.9 per cent. The company commenced their activities in the field of pesticides in the year 1967 with a pilot plant for development of formulations, set up in Trombay. This was later shifted to Bhopal in 1968. In 1972, they were granted a letter of intent for the manufacture of 5,000 tonnes per annum of MIC-based pesticides at Bhopal by the Government of India. After consulting all the concerned agencies including the State Government for location clearance for the plant, this was converted

into industrial licence in 1975, with a condition, *inter alia* that they would take adequate steps for the control of air, water and soil pollution. This unit is functioning in Bhopal since 1975. At this distance of time, it is difficult to say whether they imported out-moded technology or the latest technology. All these matters are being looked into by the Commission of Inquiry.

SHRI BHAGATRAM MANHAR: Sir, I would like to know whether it is a fact that the safety valve and the spare tank provided for venting out the excess gas in case of increase of pressure beyond the prescribed limit was not used and, if so, whether the Government have any reasons to believe that the tragedy occurred only due to the failure of the human element and that it could well be a planned act of sabotage?

SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL: Sir, as you know, the matter is under investigation and it is *sub judice*. Without getting the report from the Commission of Inquiry, at this stage, it is not possible for me to say anything.

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: Sir, if the Bhopal tragedy is the biggest in such a plant, in the whole world, the hon. Minister's reply is the biggest exercise in white-washing and cover-up of such a big tragedy. Sir, as a lawyer, you can very well understand that the matter is not *sub-judice*. A Commission of Inquiry appointed under the Commissions of Inquiry Act does not make the matter *sub judice* and I am sorry that the hon. Minister has taken such an excuse behind this plea which is untenable. Since I have only one supplementary, I will put it in four parts (a) Is it a fact that from the persons or from the dead bodies of the persons, who were affected by this deadly gas, traces of Phosgene and cyanide have been found. Cyanide has been found at least in one report of post mortem

examination which was performed at the All India Institute of Medical Sciences. Perhaps, the reports of other post mortems done at Bhopal have been suppressed or changed or adulterated. This is one. Along with this, I want to mention that a number of scientists who visited Bhopal on behalf of the Delhi Scientists Forum including Dr. N. K. Gupta, who is a former Director of the Indian Council of Medical Research, whether their Chairman, our well known friend Shri P. N. Haksar, who had held very responsible positions earlier, has come out with a statement that probably this plant was carrying on dangerous experiments and the results of these experiments were being transmitted to the parent organisation in the USA. This plant had a 300,000 dollar contract with the parent organisation with the provision that the results of its so-called research and development work will be handed over to the parent organisation in the USA. Whether this too is a fact? (b) Whether Shri Varadarajan...

AN HON. MEMBER: What is the question?

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: This is the question. The hon. Minister will understand it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will take care of it. (*Interruptions*). Everybody can't understand everything.

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: (b) Whether Dr. Varadarajan, the present Director of the Indian Council of Scientific Research, has pointed out in an interview published in the Business Standard of December 24 the lapses in safety measures. The type of safety measures that were installed in the Carbide plant in USA have not been installed here. The automatic warning system does not exist. The valves are not automatically operated, they are operated manually. And according to Dr. Varadarajan the cause of the tragedy was the leakage of water into the tank and that leakage took place be-

cause the valve was not strong enough and there was no automatic control. There was no automatic system of neutralising the gas by injecting nitrogen or by showering water from above. So, I would like to know whether the Government have gone into these facts and whether they have found this company being guilty of criminal negligence with regard to safety measures, and due to this incidents have been taking place during the last few years to which my hon. friend made a reference.

(c) Whether it is a fact that not thousands but lakhs of people are even today suffering in Bhopal with swollen eyes, with damaged liver, with swollen bodies, having lost vitality? Virtually no coolies are available at Bhopal station. In today's papers we have the story of a 34 year old woman, Sushila Jha, belonging to the family of a railway worker. She was expecting a baby. The baby was born blue, died after six days, and even today her body is swollen, her eyes are affected, no medicine is working. Even in this railway colony...

SHRI J. K. JAIN: Protection does not mean encouragement to the hon. Member.

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: I am putting specific questions.

SHRI J. K. JAIN: He is reading. I am sorry...

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: You should be sorry. Sir, the hon. Member should be sorry. (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please address the Chair. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: Till the Commission which has been appointed comes out with the findings and the report, I would like to know what measures the Government proposes to take to give immediate relief to lakhs of people who have been affected by this tragedy. (d) We are told and it has come out in the press that a legal luminary has been sent to the USA...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is anticipating future discussion.

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: ...for consultation with American lawyers. What is the point in doing that? The Chairman of this company Mr. Warren Anderson, has already declared that American courts are going to dismiss all the petitions for compensation that have been filed there. Therefore I would like to know whether Government will consider the desirability of enacting a special law and setting up a special court here for determining all the claims and the compensation that this company will be called upon to pay?

SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL: Sir, the hon. Member has put so many questions. Sir, I want to make it very clear on behalf of the Government of India and also the State Government that so far as Union Carbide is concerned, the Government of India or the State Government have absolutely no sympathy for them. He should not be under the impression that the State Government or the Government of India are holding a brief for that company.

Sir, the hon. Member has suggested that the causes of this gas leakage and for the tragedy are not *sub-judice*. If the hon. Member wants, I can place the Government order appointing the Commission of Inquiry and its terms of reference. It is stated here in the terms of reference "the events and circumstances leading to the accident which occurred on the intervening night of 2nd and 3rd December in the pesticides plant, Union Carbide, Bhopal, including the causes leading to the leakage of poisonous toxic gases and the large number of deaths... etc." Another term of reference says: "adequacy or otherwise of safety measures and their proper implementation, including the issue of negligence and/or culpability of the authorities of the factory and/or of the inspecting agencies, whether sta-

tutory or otherwise". Another term of reference is about recommendations in regard to measures for prevention of similar accidents in industries of this nature.

That means, Sir, that the terms of reference cover all the points that have been raised. (*Interruptions*)

Now the hon. Member wants to know whether *post mortem* was done and what the report of the medical officer was who did the *post mortem*. I do not know the details. But all these reports must have gone to the Commission of Inquiry and the Commission is going to take into consideration all these reports at the time of finalising their report to the Government.

Sir, the hon. Member mentioned about the opinion expressed by Dr. Vardarajan and some other scientists. As I have made it very clear while making the statement, the main problem after the tragedy was how to neutralise and how to dispose of the residual MIC which was there in the tank. Therefore a Committee of Scientists was appointed and Dr. Vardarajan was asked to go to Bhopal to supervise the activities and under his supervision the neutralisation and disposal of the MIC was done. After coming back he made a report. While making a report, he discussed the possibilities of leakage. That does not mean that it is a finding, or the Government of India had appointed any scientist to go into this question. There is no need to appoint any scientist or team of scientists to go into the causes when the Commission of Inquiry is already doing that job. Therefore whatever Dr. Vardarajan or other scientists have told the press or made a report to the Government of India can at best be said to be a hypothesis or their perceptions. They cannot be their findings. And Dr. Vardarajan has made it very clear in his report that whatever he has said is only hypothesis and it should be further analysed.

Sir, people are suffering, there is no doubt about that. So the Government of Madhya Pradesh has already taken action. I have already said but I have to repeat it for the information of the hon. Member that immediately after the accident *ex-gratia* cash relief up to Rs. 10,000 for those dead, Rs. 2000 for those seriously injured and Rs. 1000 for minor injuries have been given. The total number of beneficiaries is 14,497 persons. At present relief is being given in kind—wheat at the rate of 9 kg. per unit per month.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He did not ask anything about relief.

SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL: He wanted to know what relief is being given. This is the relief in addition to medical relief because there are so many hospitals where these people who are affected by this tragedy are being treated.

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: Sir, on one question I need your protection.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are going to have clarifications when you can raise all these.

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: How was cyanide found in the body? The plant is not producing cyanide, it is not supposed to use cyanide. Then how was cyanide found?

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no.

(Interruptions)

श्री जे. के. जैन: सभापति महोदय, एक पुरानी कहावत है कि दूध का जला छाछ को फूँक-फूँक कर पीता है। जो मध्य प्रदेश में इतना बड़ा आप्ठद्वारा, वैसा इतिहास में शायद देखने को नहीं मिलता। जहाँ एक ओर मैं मध्य प्रदेश शासन को बधाई देता हूँ, भारत सरकार को बधाई देता हूँ कि उन्होंने इतना शीघ्र इंतजाम किया, वहाँ पर रिलीफ वगैरह का, वहाँ मैं इसी दिल्ली के अन्दर

नजफगढ़ रोड के अन्दर जहाँ 10 लाख की आबाद है, वहाँ पर कैमिकल लाइट की गैस बराबर निकलत रहत है, चिमियाँ घुश्राँ निकालत रहत हैं, मैं जानना चाहता हूँ मंत्री महोदय से...

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: It does not arise.

श्री जे. के. जैन: मैं जानना चाहता हूँ मंत्री महोदय से कि नजफगढ़ रोड के ऊपर इतनी घनी आबाद जहाँ पर 10 लाख की आबाद है, उसके लिये मंत्री महोदय ने आदेश दिये हैं कि इन सभी फैक्टियों को घनी आबाद से हटा कर कहीं दूर स्थानों पर भेजा जाए? इसका उत्तर दें।

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: That doesn't arise.

SHRI J. K. JAIN: I do not know, Sir. These people are senior and elderly people but do not know how to sit in the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You go on with your question.

श्री जे. के. जैन: इसके अन्दर यह प्रश्न आता है, हवा का बाव ब है।

SHRI INDRADEEP SINHA: That does not arise.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is about Bhopal. He wants similar protection; he wants to know whether protective measures are being taken or not.

SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL: Sir, I have already made it clear that such a tragedy had happened for the first time in our country and also in the entire world and, therefore, all possible steps are being taken. Export committees have been appointed not by one Ministry only but by different Ministries, and the Central Pollution Control Board has also appointed a committee. They are go-

ing into this question. It is not a question of only how to safeguard the interests of the workers in Bhopal but it is a question of all the workers working in this hazardous chemical industry. Therefore, a larger question is already engaging the attention of the Government of India and, certainly, after getting the report, necessary action will be taken.

**SHRI SUKOMAL SEN:** Sir, the hon. Minister is unable to reply to many questions because he says there is an inquiry proceeding. But I would like to know whether the Government is aware of the fact that there is also a plant of the Union Carbide in West Virginia and that there is a lot of difference between the design of the plant in West Virginia and the design of the plant in Bhopal. What I mean to say is that in West Virginia the plant is highly modern, sophisticated, automatic with a computerised warning system and regulated by very strict and very vigilant laws and regulations of the US Government whereas the plant in Bhopal is under-designed and without any warning system like the one in West Virginia. I want to know whether the Government is aware of the fact that the plant in Bhopal is under-designed. Secondly, not only now, but even two years back, as far back as 1982, some people in Madhya Pradesh and also some newspapers had raised the question of lack of safety system in this plant. A question was raised in the Madhya Pradesh Assembly for shifting the Bhopal plant from the populous place to a lesser populous place, and at that time the Labour Minister of the Madhya Pradesh Government refused to accept this demand. And also there were several accidents inside the Bhopal plant, leading to death of several workers. At that time cautions were raised, alarms were raised, and a demand was raised to shift the plant and to redesign the plant. Is the Government aware of this fact which has led to this disaster, Sir.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, the hon. Member wants to know about the design of a similar Union Carbide plant in West Virginia. I am not a technical person. I have not visited West Virginia. I do not know what the design of the plant is and how that plant is working. But so far as this plant at Bhopal is concerned, it is an old one. It was set up in 1975. Whether the design was properly done or not, whether the safety measures were properly taken or not, all these matters are being enquired into.

So far as the incidents which occurred in the past are concerned, some minor incidents had occurred in the past, and the State Government has taken already action. I have got the details, but I have no time to read out all the details. But certain cases are still pending in the court. They are *sub judice*.

**SHRI JAGESH DESAI:** Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether some dangerous experiments were conducted in the Bhopal factory, and if it is so, whether it will be referred to the enquiry commission or whether enquiry will be made independently by the Government if it cannot be referred to the enquiry commission.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, a proposal was issued from the Union Carbide (India) Ltd. for entering into an agreement with the Union Carbide Agricultural Products Co., U.S.A., for rendering certain technical services relating to agricultural pesticides. A final decision in respect of this proposal is still to be taken. However, according to the available information, the Union Carbide (India) Ltd. have been carrying out tests of pesticide compounds developed or supplied by the Union Carbide Agricultural Products Co., U.S.A., on the tropical insects and pests.

**PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Minister, while making the statement, stated that



about 1,70,000 persons, of whom 10,700 persons were seriously affected, were treated in the Bhopal hospital and elsewhere. In the light of this and also in view of the fact that there is no antidote developed so far for MIC and what can be an antidote namely thiosulphate has not been received favourably, what monitoring systems have been evolved by the Government to see that these 10,700 persons were seriously affected, and who are having likelihood of deleterious effects being there in their bodies, are cured presently and what steps will be taken by the Government to see that these 1,70,000 persons, out of whom 10,700 were seriously affected, could be monitored and treated properly in days and months to come? Therefore, I would like to ask the Minister to state the monitoring steps taken by them.

Secondly, the Minister also stated that Rs. 2,000 for seriously affected persons have been given. Sir, I had visited Bhopal recently. I was told that small children whose parents have been completely destroyed by this accident, have been left in lurch because the Government has stopped payment of Rs. 2,000 to them for they are not able to identify exactly who these are, with the result, many such orphan children are in difficulty. I would like to ask the Minister what steps are being taken by the Government to see that these orphans who have been left without anybody as a result of the deadly incident which took place in Bhopal, are looked after.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, so far as the treatment to the victims who have been affected is concerned, there are hospitals in Bhopal where this arrangement has been done, and according to the latest information as on the 19th of January, 1985, every day nearly 2,514 persons are getting treatment and they will continue to get treatment till they are completely cured. And the hon. Member wanted to know about the

orphans and what step has been taken by the State Government for destitute children? Sir, a temporary home was started immediately after the tragedy where at present eight orphan children are being looked after. The State Government have already appointed M/s. Tata Institute of Social Services and other organisations who are helping the State Government in collecting the information. They are going from house to house to survey as to how many people were affected; how many people have died and what was their problem? I think that the Tata Institute are going to submit the report very shortly to the State Government. The State Government would take further action as soon as they receive the report from them.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** सभापति महोदय, सन् 1975 में यह कारखाना बना। उसी वर्ष सन् 1975 में ही पर्यावरण विभाग ने चेतावनी दिया था कि इस कारखाने को शहर से बचुर ले जाया जाय और इसको बार-बार अपने चेतावनी दी। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस चेतावनी को क्यों नहीं सुना गया? इसके साथ-साथ मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि कौन-कौन सी और कौन-कौन सी सीमा से अधिक बनाने के लिये विभिन्न अनुमति भी और क्यों की? क्या कभी कम्पनी ने इस कारखाने को स्वयं बन्द कर देने की इच्छा प्रकट की थी जिसको मध्य प्रदेश सरकार ने नहीं माना? इसके अलावा मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि मंत्री जी ने स्टेटमेंट दिया है कि सिर्फ 1408 लोग मरे हैं जब कि अखबारों में तीन हजार से भी ज्यादा लोगों के मरने की बात कही गई है और जो एफेक्टेड हैं उनको संख्या भी बहुत अधिक है, इस सम्बन्ध में तथ्य क्या है स्पष्ट बताया जाय। एफेक्टेड लोगों का जो वर्णन किया गया है वह इतना भयावह है कि आज भी लोग मरने से रुके नहीं हैं। इनकी मरने वालों की संख्या कुछ ऐसी है कि जो परिवार सहित नष्ट हो गये हैं, उनकी रिपोर्ट करने वाला भी कोई नहीं है। मैं यह कहना

चाहता हूँ कि जो सर्वेक्षण आप करा रहे हैं उसमें वास्तव में मरने वालों की संख्या कितनी है और घायलों की संख्या कितनी है, यह सूचना निश्चित रूप से मिलनी चाहिये जिससे आपको और देश को सही जानकारी हो ?

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, so far as licensing to this undertaking is concerned, as I have already shared in the year 1975 licence was issued and 'letter of intent' was converted into a licence. At that time, the State Government and all the concerned were consulted and only then the licence was issued.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** पर्यावरण विभाग ने जो नोटिस दिया था और जो चेतावनी दी थी, उसका आपने क्या किया ?

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, about the number of deaths, I have already said the number of deaths was 1,408. This is according to the information that was collected by the State Government from the hospital, mortuaries, cremation ground and burial grounds. This is the report the State Government have received. The list has been notified in all police stations; and municipality wards. Further the State Government has been asking the people to help them in collecting more information. If the hon. Member feels that more people have died because of this gas leakage he can go to the Government and furnish the information. But this is the information that the Government have collected from hospitals, mortuaries, cremation ground and burial grounds. Those who have been buried or cremated even those pictures also in order to identify as to who are those people were not taken. In the absence of this it becomes very difficult. Therefore, the Government of Madhya Pradesh have appointed M/s. Tata Consultancy Services who are going from house to house and they are enquiring into the matter and collecting the information. If different political organisations or social organisations

have got any information about the persons who are dead, they are at liberty to supply that information to the State Government. The State Government has got an open mind. They don't say only so many people have died. But they are still collecting information and these organisations will be helping the State Government in collecting accurate information.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** कारखाने को बन्द करने का जो बात कहा गई थी, उसके बारे में आपने क्या किया है और कारखाना बन्द क्यों नहीं किया ?

**SHRI VISHVAJIT PRITHVIJIT SINGH:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Minister has made mention of a commission of inquiry and has made mention of the terms of reference of this commission of inquiry. I would like to know from the hon. Minister how broad are the terms of this commission of inquiry, in view of the supplementary raised by my hon. friend from the other side who said that phosgene and cyanide have been found in the post mortems. This raises a dimension which is completely different. The whole situation changes. We have to know from the hon. Minister whether within the terms of reference of the commission of inquiry, all these things can be gone into and whether these various ramifications, dimensions will become clear or not.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir, it is not necessary for me to give a detailed reply to the hon. Member. If he wants, I am prepared to place a copy of the Government Order appointing the commission of inquiry. It consists of all the terms of reference. If he wants, either I can supply that information to the hon. Member or I can place it on the Table of the House.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Virendra Verma.

**श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा :** क्या माननीय मंत्री जी यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि क्या यह सही है कि अमेरिका, इंग्लैंड

और वेस्ट जर्मनी के कमिटी वर के एक्सपर्ट्स वहाँ पहुँचे थे ? मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या केन्द्रीय सरकार ने उनको बुलाया था अथवा वे अपने आप आये थे और केन्द्रीय सरकार ने उनसे वहाँ विजिट करने का आदेश दिया था ?

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** Sir it is difficult for me to answer. The suggestion that has been made by the hon. Member that some foreign parties had come here to examine the chemical warfare and all that, may not be correct. I do not think it is correct. The Government of India will not permit it. Anyhow if you want details, then I have to get details and supply to the hon. Member.

**SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, according to the WPC Chairman's version, the leakage of MIC gas in Bhopal was part of the CIA conspiracy to destroy our country unity and integrity. If that is so, I would like to ask the hon. Minister whether they are going to form certain committees to find out the truth and give punishment. And what punishment are they going to give for the purpose?

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** For that very purpose, the commission of inquiry has been appointed. And in order to avoid such tragedies in future, several committees of experts are being appointed there. They are looking into it.

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, this multinational Union Carbide celebrated its golden jubilee in 1984 in such a manner that the city of Bhopal was converted into a gas chamber. Is it a fact—I would like to know from the hon. Minister—that the Union Carbide Research Centre in Bhopal has been engaged in a controversial study of synthesising and field-testing new chemicals for the last six years right under the nose of the Department of Science and Technology, in the garb of agricultural research. If that is so, I would like

to know whether the conduct of field-testing using new chemical agents has been cleared by the high-level screening committee, of which Defence scientists also are members? Sir, in this context, I would like to quote what the scientists have said, while expressing their shock:

"We are concerned about reports that the centre's studies covered grey area between agricultural research and anti-crop warfare. We are also worried that the centre is using Bhopal as guinea pig for testing chemical agents on crops."

Such field testing has not been allowed in the Western countries or in the United States. So, why this testing was allowed by the Government? Has it been cleared by the projects committee or not?

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** I have already replied to that question. According to available information, the industry's R & D section was carrying out tests of pesticide compounds developed or supplied by the Union Carbide Agricultural Products, U.S., on the tropical insects and pests. They were not carrying out any other research or any other activity.

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** Has it been cleared by the screening committee? That was my question.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Dipen Ghosh.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** This is not simply pesticides, this is politics. Pesticides for homicide is part of the politics and economics of Western multinational companies. So I want to put a specific question. The Union Carbide is a FERA company. It means that 51 per cent of the equity shares were to be obtained by the Indians. Naturally, this Union Carbide sought a licence for establishing this factory with a particular formula for manufacturing pesticides in Bhopal. This was cleared by the Cabinet Sub-Committee and other concerned Ministries. I want to know whether the difference in design between their factory in

West Virginia and the one to be installed in India was taken into consideration when the licence was cleared by the Central Government. I also want to know whether the formula for manufacturing this kind of pesticide with the consequential danger of the gas leaking out and killing the persons as happened in Bhopal was also taken into consideration by the Government. I would also like to know whether while dealing with licences to be given to the multi-national companies producing such drugs, pesticides and certain kinds of fertilisers, the concerned departments and the Ministries of the Central Government have been advised not to give further licences to such multi-national companies.

**SHRI VEERENDRA PATIL:** So far as this undertaking or industry for producing pesticides out of MIC is concerned, the technology for production of MIC and MIC based pesticides was not available in the country. So, the technical collaboration agreement as submitted by UCIL was examined by the Technical Evaluation Committee of the Ministry of Industrial Development and was duly approved at the time of converting the letter of intent into a licence. I may also add for the information of the hon. Member that at that time, i.e. 1975, there was no specific policy of the Central Government in regard to the location of industrial units. The stipulation banning location of industrial units within the standard urban area limits of large metropolitan cities was enforced only from February, 1978 in pursuance of the industrial policy formulated in December, 1977. So, at that time, there was no such policy. In 1975, whatever procedure was there, the Government followed that and converted that letter of intent after consultations with regard to location with the State Government.

#### Requirement of newsprint in the country

\*23. **SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR BIRLA:** Will the Minister of INFOR-

MATION AND BROADCASTING be pleased to state:

(a) the total present requirement of newsprint in the country;

(b) how much of it is produced indigenously and how much is imported;

(c) whether Government propose to increase the import of newsprint to meet the domestic demand; and

(d) whether the quality of indigenous newsprint is as good as that of the imported varieties and if not, what steps Government are taking to improve its quality?

**THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI V. N. GADGIL):** (a) to (c) The newsprints requirement for the year 1984-85 was initially estimated to be of the order of 3.85 lakh metric tonnes, out of which 2.00 lakhs metric tonnes was anticipated to be met from domestic production and the remaining quantity by imports. It, however, appears that the actual requirement may exceed the anticipated demand by about 30,000 metric tonnes. The additional demand is proposed to be met by imports.

(d) Whereas the quality of the newsprint produced by the Kerala Mills and Mysore Paper Mills is generally considered to be at par with that of imported varieties, the newsprint produced by Nepa Mills in Madhya Pradesh has not as yet attained the desired level of quality. There has, however, been progressively distinct improvement in its quality over the years.

**SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR BIRLA:** Sir, there are two supplementaries which I want to put to the hon. Minister. I am grateful to him for telling us that the gap between the supply and allocation is going to be met by additional imports. Every year we find that the gap between the projected consumption and allocation has been increasing so much so that according to the information of the industry, the gap, excluding the year