

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot say that. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Now, the point is, I will ask the hon. Minister of Agriculture to lay his reply if you are not interested in this. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Because the reply has to go. ...*(Interruptions)*.. What is that I can do? Please tell me what can I do. *(Interruptions)*.. Please tell me what can I do...*(Interruptions)*..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 2.00 p.m.

-----

The House then adjourned at twenty-one minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at two of the clock,  
THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

### SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION

#### **Situation arising out of continued rise in prices of essential commodities in the country**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, the hon. Minister will reply to the Short Duration Discussion on Price Rise.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE AND THE MINISTER OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, as the House is aware ... ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, before he begins his reply, I would like to say just one thing.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sure, sure.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the day-before-yesterday, the hon. Minister made a reply in the Lok Sabha. Thereafter, two supervening factors have taken place, the Budget speech by Pranab Babu and the PM justifying the imposition of rise in diesel and petrol prices. This will impact cascading effect on the price which he is going to reply. Would the hon. Agriculture Minister also respond to that? This is my very respectful question which I would like to ask.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, this is not the subject with which I am dealing. That is why don't expect any reply on this particular subject which you have raised here from my side. But, certainly, I will try to reply to some of the most important points which have been raised by many hon. Members during the discussion which had taken place that day in the House on the price rise.

Sir, the Members are aware that the same discussion was there on the same day in both the Houses. So, it was not possible for me to attend the full debate in both the Houses. I did try

to spend some time in both the Houses, sat here also, heard some of the hon. Members' speeches, but, ultimately, I have collected the detailed debate, the proceedings of the discussion of the House on 25th February and tried to understand the exact points which have been raised by many hon. Members.

Sir, the Members of this august House have expressed concern over the escalation of the food prices which we have witnessed for the last few months and the Government is fully seized of the seriousness of this issue that impact the livelihood of the masses. I would, therefore, like to assure the House that whatever steps are required to be taken have been taken and will be taken by the Government on this issue.

Under the federal system, this is definitely the responsibility of the Government of India but the hon. Members will agree with me that there is need of a coordinated effort by all stakeholders and the State Government is also an important stakeholder. We are trying our level best to keep an excellent rapport with the State Governments. On certain occasions, we also give them advices to handle these important issues. There was a discussion once in the same House and one of the hon. Members made a suggestion that we should also call the Chief Ministers' meeting. I think, on 6th of February, under the chairmanship of the hon. Prime Minister, a meeting of all the Chief Ministers was called in Delhi and we discussed all these important issues there. We decided to set up a core group of the State Chief Ministers and some of the Central Ministers to deal these important subjects.

The rising trend seen in prices over the last few months, as I have said earlier, is a matter of serious concern. I am sure that the hon. Members of this House will agree with me when I say that the prices of some essential commodities — I am not saying all, but some essential commodities — have shown a decline in the recent few months. Over the last three months, the prices of *atta*, *gram dal*, *tur dal*, *urad dal*, *moong dal*, *masoor dal*, potato and onion have shown a declining trend while the prices of rice, wheat and salt have remained constant. Apart from this, over the last one month, prices of wheat, sugar, mustard oil and tea have also started showing a declining trend. In fact, just a few days back, a delegation led by hon. Members of the Lok Sabha from West Bengal, Shri Basudeb Acharia and Shri Shyamal Chakraborty, who is an hon. Member of this House, met me along with some ex-MPs and requested that Government of India must take some initiatives to support potato farmers because the prices of potato in West Bengal have dropped down somewhere from eight to two rupees a kilo. I received a similar request from some hon. Members from Uttar Pradesh also.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Jharkhand): That is because there is no cold storage facility available for potato. Also, enough power supply is not available. Potato is a perishable good and you cannot store it; that is the problem. (*Interruptions*) Potato is a perishable crop and there is no cold storage facility. That is the reason.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: That is true, but. *(Interruptions)*

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार):** वह रुपया व्यापारियों को खरीदने के लिए है..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR (Tripura): This means that the farmers are not being protected. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I hope, at least, the Hon. Members would agree that the prices of potato have substantially dropped, which ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No, that is not the reason. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: That is the factual position. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We should not take that excuse to say that the prices of potato are falling. The prices are falling due to lack of storage facilities. There is no cold storage facility available.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, allow him to reply. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: There might have been more production but there was no storage facility available.

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: They doubled the prices... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, may I raise a point? ...*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No. Let the hon. Minister reply; you may ask questions later. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, this problem is there in Karnataka and some parts of Andhra Pradesh also. The problem is that of cold storage. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: On the National Bandh day, the price of tomato was five rupees...*(Interruptions)*. That does not mean that the prices are falling. It was because there were no facilities available for transportation of vegetables. That was the reason. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, let him reply. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Sir, these are perishable items. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, allow him to reply. Take your seats. You may seek clarifications after his reply, if you so wish. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him reply. Please, do not interrupt. Let him reply. You may seek clarifications later.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: For the sake of hon. Member, Shri Ahluwalia's information...*(Interruptions)*... आप क्या कह रहे हैं कि आलू का दाम कम हुआ है..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** तीन-चार दिन पहले दिल्ली में आलू बारह रुपए किलो बिक रहा था.. ..(व्यवधान)..टाइम्स ऑफ इंडिया में मुख्य मंत्री ने कंसीड किया है..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I shall just provide some information...*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. *(Interruptions)* No running commentary, please.

**श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत** (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : सर, यह किसानों की पीड़ा की आवाज है..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री शरद पवार** : यह सच है, यह किसानों की पीड़ा है..(व्यवधान)..पोटेटो के प्राइसेस के नीचे हो गया है..(व्यवधान)..यह किसानों की पीड़ा है..(व्यवधान)..यह शिकायत मेरे पास ऑनरेबल चीफ मिनिस्टर ऑफ वेस्ट बंगाल ने लिखी है..(व्यवधान)..उन्होंने मेरे पास लिखकर भेजा है..(व्यवधान)..उनका लैटर अभी भी मेरे पास है, जो मैं आपको दिखा सकता हूँ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. *(Interruptions)* Let him complete. I would allow you. Let him complete...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (West Bengal): Sir, what has he done for ...*(Interruptions)*..

**श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत** : किसानों की पीड़ा को सरकार की तरफ से ..(व्यवधान)..उसका दाम गिर रहा है..(व्यवधान)..यह कौन सी दलील है..(व्यवधान)..सर, आप देखिए..(व्यवधान)..किसान रो रहा है..(व्यवधान)..सरकार दावा कर रही है..(व्यवधान)..दाम गिर रहा है..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have made your point. Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have made your point. Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: It was not the market price; it was distress sale. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Sir, these are perishable goods. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, farmers were forced to sell them at. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: They were forced...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: This is a wrong approach of the...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What the hon. Minister says...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, the Minister...*(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): This is not permitted...*(Interruptions)*. Listen to the Minister. After that, if you want, I will allow you to ask clarifications...*(Interruptions)*. Please take your seat...*(Interruptions)*.

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद** : सर, वे घाव पर नमक रगड़ रहे हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन)** : रवि शंकर जी, आप बैठिए प्लीज़ ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत** : सरकार इसका दावा करती है कि देखो हमने दाम कितना गिरा दिया। शरद जी, आपसे ऐसी उम्मीद बिल्कुल नहीं थी। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Brindaji, you are a senior Member. Please resume your seat.

**श्री शरद पवार :** मैं आपसे बिल्कुल सहमत हूँ कि यह किसान की पीड़ा है, क्योंकि दाम नीचे आ गए। इसलिए इसका कोई रास्ता निकालने की आवश्यकता है। इस तरह के सुझाव कुछ सरकारों की तरफ से मेरे पास आए हैं। खास तौर पर वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट के पास से मुझे सुझाव आए हैं। वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट ने मुझे बतलाया है कि इसके लिए एक रास्ता हो सकता है कि हम साउथ ईस्ट एशिया में एक्सपोर्ट करें, तो शायद यहाँ के किसानों को राहत मिलेगी। वह एक्सपोर्ट करने के लिए कुछ सुविधाएँ देने की आवश्यकता है, भारत सरकार की तरफ से कुछ मदद देने की आवश्यकता है। यह सुझाव वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से मेरे पास आया है। इससे यह बात साबित होती है कि दाम नीचे आए हैं, मगर इस परिस्थिति में किसानों की मदद करने के लिए कुछ कदम उठाने की आवश्यकता है और हम कदम उठाएंगे।

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, I am grateful that the hon. Minister has yielded. I only urge the Government to depend on authentic sources of information. Now, in the case the Government is unaware of what the ground situation is with regard to the prices of commodities, on the 25th of February, an authentic document, which is the Economic Survey of this Government, was presented before both the Houses of Parliament. Page 65 of your Economic Survey says, "During this year, high inflation was reported in the case of onions and potatoes among vegetables, pulses, rice and wheat." Page 69 says, "Potatoes, onions, tapioca, tomatoes, peas green and brinjal were the highest contributors to the inflation in vegetables." And, the hon. Minister is telling us that potato prices in the country are falling. The Economic Survey says that the potatoes are the contributor to inflation.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I entirely agree with that. That is about the whole year. According to the statement which I have made, there is a trend, the prices are going down and I can substantiate with two things...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): The Minister is misleading. ...*(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You may disagree...*(Interruptions)*. No, nobody is permitted.

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Not permitted. It will not go on record.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, it will not go on record. Don't waste your time...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I said, "Nothing will go on record except what the hon. Minister speaks."

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: \*

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: \*

---

\*Not recorded.

SHRI N.K. SINGH: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): This is against the rule. This kind of interruption is not permitted...*(Interruptions)*. I will allow you after the reply.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): This is not going on record. Why are you wasting your time? I said I will allow clarifications....*(Interruptions)*. It is not going on record. You please listen.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I would like to assure the hon. Members from West Bengal who have raised this issue to me that if there is a definite proposal from the Government of West Bengal for market intervention, there is a scheme with the Government of India where the Government of India can take financial responsibility just to protect the interest of the farmers who produce potato in West Bengal, or, Uttar Pradesh or any other State. I would like to tell the House in brief what steps we have taken mainly to augment supply, and, to monitor demand to cool the market sentiments which saw the rise in prices. While I will go into some specific details of the individual commodities later, I would like to bring out the broad thrust of the measures taken by the Government. To improve availability, a policy decision was taken to encourage imports while discouraging exports. In certain cases, subsidy has been given to the public sector units for the imports and distribution through the PDS in respect of some of the commodities, which I will elaborate upon.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, may I seek a clarification? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: There has been a complete ban on export of some commodities. *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: It is very important. I just want to ask why is it that the imported sugar.....*(Interruptions)*.. Sir, the STC and NAFED.....*(Interruptions)*..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You cannot ask now. *(Interruptions)* Brinda ji, you are not permitted to ask any question now. *(Interruptions)*

**श्रीमती ब्रिन्दा कारत:** अगर साथ-साथ पूछ लेंगे तो सवाल का जवाब भी साथ ही साथ मिल जाएगा।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Brinda ji, no, no. Please don't do this. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will allow you after the reply is over. Please have patience to listen. ...*(Interruptions)* You may not agree. So what? Take your seat. No, no. This is not correct. Allow the Minister to reply. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Just one issue. ...*(Interruptions)* Please, Sir, ..*(Interruptions)*.. Sharad ji, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, no. I am not yielding. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Are you yielding, Mr. Minister? *(Interruptions)*

---

\*Not recorded.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, Sir. I am not yielding. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He is not yielding. Please take your seat. *..(Interruptions)..*

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, it is very unfortunate. *..(Interruptions)..* The Standing Committee on Finance has specifically said that the State agencies played a very dubious role by not importing sugar and leaving it to the private trade. *...(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no. Take your seat. *..(Interruptions)..*

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: What is this, Sir?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have said it. *..(Interruptions)..* He is not yielding. Don't you know the Rules of the House? If he is not yielding, then, why do you go on speaking? *..(Interruptions)..* Please don't do that. You are a senior Member. Please don't do like this. If he is not yielding, then, what is the purpose in speaking? *..(Interruptions)..*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, to ensure that the vulnerable sections of the society are protected, the Government of India has given considerable support to the public distribution system. An extremely important step in this direction has been to keep the central issue price constant at the year 2002 level. The issue prices of wheat and rice, which were fixed in the year 2002, till today, have not changed for the AAY, BPL and APL categories, which we have taken huge financial burden thereof.

**श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत:** एपीएल को तो इन्होंने सिस्टम से बिल्कुल निकाल ही दिया है।

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: In fact, I recollect that about six years back when I took the responsibility of this particular department, the total subsidy Bill was somewhat Rs. 19,000 crores, which has now reached to somewhat Rs. 60,000 crores. That type of financial burden has been taken upon by the Government of India just to protect the interests of the weaker sections of the society, and, this conscious decision has been taken by the Government of India. Despite the adverse monsoon, the procurement of rice has also been good. As on 24th February, 2010, 22.78 million tonnes of rice has been procured in the *kharif* marketing season of the year 2009-10. As a result of which, the stocks of the foodgrains in the central pool continue to be comfortable with 206.23 lakh tonnes of wheat and 226.52 lakh tonne of rice. This is as on 1st February, 2010 and it is much more than the buffer stock. A point was raised here as to why the buffer stock was not maintained. This was much more than the buffer stock norms, and, that is why, on this particular situation, the position is quite comfortable.

Modifications have been made to the orders issued under the Essential Commodities Act to provide powers to the State Governments to fix and enforce stock limits for several essential commodities. This would help to contain hoarding of these commodities. These are some of the steps which the Government of India has definitely taken.

In the current year, delayed monsoon and floods have definitely created some problems. Hon. Members are aware that in the beginning of this kharif season, there were 324 districts in 14 States where the State Government has declared drought, and there are some districts particularly in Karnataka, Maharashtra and Andhra Pradesh which had been affected with floods. Kharif is a major crop on which the country always depends. But this year because of the drought situation and because of the flood situation in some of the States, in some of the districts, our production has been affected and that has sent a wrong signal to the market and we have seen some changes in the prices.

One of the important issues has been raised by some of the hon. Members about annual rate of inflation in food articles, particularly in the current year, of about 17.58 per cent. Of course, this is a matter of concern. Thus, although the annual rate of inflation based on the monthly WPI stood at 8.56 per cent for the month of January 2010, the high inflation in food articles is certainly disturbing.

Hon. Leader of the Opposition, Shri Arun Jaitley, has mentioned about the divergence between the Wholesale Price Index and the Consumer Price Index. While the Finance Ministry works on this issue and works towards their convergence, at this point we have to base our arguments on two indices. However, Sir, it must be seen that if we see the food inflation in the WPI, we find it much more than the WPI all commodities index and somewhat comparable to the Consumer Price Index.

Shri Jaitley and other hon. Members also referred to the higher inflation in India as compared to other countries. I have collected the information and I have also collected the Report of the FAO. The Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations has said the inflation rate in India is more or less the same. In fact, it is slightly lower. The FAO index shows an inflation of 19.44 per cent for December 2009 as compared to January 2009. In the same period, WPI-based index for the food inflation in India was 18.25 per cent. This is the Report of the FAO. Outside India also situation is practically same. *(Interruptions)* There are some countries where the situation might be different. *(Interruptions)* But we have seen the situation is same. *(Interruptions)* Though there was an increase in the total production of foodgrains in 2008-09, production of some of the items, some of the varieties of pulses and sugar had been definitely lower. In the year 2009-10, the second advance estimates of production of the major agricultural crop shows that the production of foodgrains for the year 2009-10 will be 216.85 million tonnes despite the major drought. As I said earlier, the kharif season was not good. But luckily for us, Rabi prospects seem to be very bright and as per the information which I got about sowing operation whether it is oilseeds, whether it is pulses, whether it is rice or whether it is wheat. I am absolutely confident that in this rabi season, the overall production will be much improved and the overall situation in respect of prices...*(Interruptions)*...



SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN (Kerala): Sir, only statistics are given....*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)* Allow him to reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, let him reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, rather than giving some statistics, he should come out with proposals. ...*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, don't be impatience. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Same figures were given in the month of October also.

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन):** आप बैठिए। आप तो इतने सीनियर मैम्बर हैं, आप बैठिए।..**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: As I said, the rabi position seems to be quite encouraging. This has not just happened. To boost production, the Minimum Support Price of wheat has been increased from Rs.640 per quintal *(Interruptions)* to Rs.1100 per quintal. In 2004, the price of wheat in this country which was fixed by the Government of India was Rs.640 per quintal. Today, this Government has taken a decision to fix the price at Rs.1100 per quintal for the farmers who produce wheat. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIKRAM VERMA (Madhya Pradesh): What is price of fertilisers, diesel, petrol, etc.? किसान को जो पेट्रोल लगता है, उसका आप रेट तो बताइए।..**(व्यवधान)**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please don't disturb. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, in case of paddy common variety, the Minimum Support Price has been increased from Rs.560 per quintal to Rs.1000 per quintal. ...*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Brindaji, please listen. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Despite the huge cost to the Government, the MSP for wheat has been enhanced by 72 per cent and the MSP for paddy has been enhanced by 79 per cent. So, this type of pro-farmer decision has been taken. ...*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no. Please, no running commentaries. *(Interruptions)* No, Mr. Sarkar, take your seat. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Then, you can easily universalise the PDS! *(Interruptions)* What is the harm? *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Sarkar, please take your seat. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Minister, one second please. I have already announced that after the Minister's reply is over, I will allow clarifications. *(Interruptions)* No, no. Please. *(Interruptions)* So, there is no justification for this kind of running commentary. *(Interruptions)* Please don't do that. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAJNITI PRASAD: We are not making running commentary. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You take your seat. *(Interruptions)* I will allow you. आप बैठिए! ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, the increase of Minimum Support Price has definitely helped the farmers and the rural economy of this country. The increase in MSP has definitely seen increase in production throughout the year and it is only on the strength of the increased production that increased demand on account of rising population and rising income level has been met. In fact, we took the decision of Rs.1000 per quintal for paddy or Rs.1100 per quintal for wheat. This ultimately shows a sort of benchmark in open market. So, prices will not go below Rs.1100 or Rs.1000 because the Government itself is purchasing and providing Rs.1000 per quintal for paddy. You should not forget when we provided Rs.1000 per 100 kilogram of paddy after processing....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, the Minister is justifying what he is doing. ...*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Only what the Minister says will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): It is not going on record.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): It is not going on record. Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: \*

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Only what the Minister says is going on record. Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Madhu, 'madhu' means honey! You sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (Maharashtra): I am giving you the facts.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: He is answering your queries. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Madhu, please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are such a good man. Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, please ask him to yield for a minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: The Minister is not yielding, Sir. ...*(Interruption)*...

---

\*Not recorded.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You can ask it after the reply is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... After the reply, I am allowing you. Please listen to him.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: It is a simple thing. You see.....*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen to him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: \*

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: ...when I said we have given some Rs. 640/- — Rs. 1100/- price for wheat, but we have not changed the price, the Central Issue Price, for the PDS. That shows.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: \*

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: That shows.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: \*

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: What has your Government done during the last three years? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD: \*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: From the year 2000.....*(Interruptions)*... They are not listening to it, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Take your seats. ...*(Interruption)*... Take your seat. ...*(Interruption)*... Please hear him. ...*(Interruptions)*... All of you, please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... All of you take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. ...*(Interruption)*.. Please take your seat. Only what the hon. Minister says will go on record. Nothing else will go on record except the hon. Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Why do you do this? ...*(Interruptions)*... I will give you time. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, I will give you time after the reply

---

\*Not recorded.

is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is indiscipline. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is indiscipline. ...*(Interruptions)*... After the reply is over, I will give you time. Why do you interrupt?

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Vijayaraghavan, see, ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, see, the Minister or any Member will speak according to that Member's desire, not according to your desire. You take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seat.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: \*

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Madhu, I told you.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, please ask him to yield for a minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Minister, are you yielding for Brinda Karatji?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He is not yielding. What can I do?

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Then, you should protect me, Sir, because it concerns the people.....*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will allow you immediately after the reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... Immediately after the reply, I will allow you. That is the way. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is the way. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, I seek answers for my queries. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Vijayaraghavan, listen to him. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, why do you want that? ...*(Interruptions)*... You are a disciplined Member; so disciplined. ...*(Interruptions)*... Show some discipline. ...*(Interruptions)*... Show some discipline.

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Sir, we are here for the people.

---

\*Not recorded.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, increasing MSP was a conscious decision of this Government. In fact, when the Government came in power, we had announced the Common Minimum Programme, and in the Common Minimum Programme, there is a commitment from the Government that the terms of trade will be in favour of the farming community. If the terms of the trade should be in favour of the farming community there has to be some good prices *(Interruptions)*....

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir,... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): What is this Mr. Raja? *(Interruptions)*.... You would not write his reply. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Some good prices have been provided and when.... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI D. RAJA: That is what I am saying. *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): After he finishes. *(Interruptions)*... I will give you time after he finishes. *(Interruptions)*... I promise you all that I will give you time. *(Interruptions)*... But you don't trust me. *(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. *(Interruptions)*... I will give you time. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, Mr. Mysura Reddy. That is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is not going on record. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Increased production is a must for the food security of the nation and the correct price signal to the farmer through enhanced MSP is a step in the right direction. The step has been taken just to support the farming community and just to improve the production. When you enhance the Minimum Support Price there is some impact on the market which you can't deny. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्रीमती वृंदा कारत :** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, यहां किसानों के नाम पर price rise का justification हो रहा है।

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, as I had mentioned earlier, steps have been taken to insulate the vulnerable sections of the society from this rise to the extent possible. I don't want to take more time on this particular subject because I have already explained it. There are certain other items which are raised here and, I think, I should try to give more information about some of those items. Take the case of rice and wheat. The Government has had record procurement last year and the trend is expected to continue in the current year. What I said about the overall prospects of the rabi season is that the stocks of wheat and rice are, therefore, sufficient to meet the demand of the public distribution system and all other welfare schemes and to ensure availability and check prices, apart from the requirement of the public distribution system, the Government has been releasing stocks through open market scheme. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Twenty lakh tonnes of wheat and ten lakh tonnes of rice were allocated during October, 2009—March, 2010 to the State Governments for distribution to retail consumers. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: At what price? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: The State Governments are to ensure adequate lifting so that the open market price is kept under check. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen to him. (*Interruptions*)... Please listen to him. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: In addition 20.8 lakh tonnes of wheat has been allocated for bulk users. (*Interruptions*)... This is being sold by tenders. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: At what price? (*Interruptions*)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद** : कितनी कीमत पर freight charge किया? गेहूं की कीमत 15 रुपए किलो हो गई ...(**व्यवधान**)

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया** : कॉमन मैन के लिए क्या है?

**श्री तारिक अनवर** : PDS किसको मिलता है? क्या आप लेते हैं PDS से ... (**व्यवधान**)

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक** (उत्तर प्रदेश) : अगर सारी जिम्मेदारी राज्यों की है, तो केन्द्र सरकार की जिम्मेदारी क्या है?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: An additional allocation of wheat and rice of 10 kilograms per head for the month of January and February have also been given to the accepted numbers of AAY, BPL and APL.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: At what cost? (*Interruptions*)... That is only for AAY and BPL cardholders. What about those who don't have the card? (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. (*Interruptions*)... Please.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: This is in addition to the existing allocation. ...(*Interruptions*)... The States would definitely use ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. (*Interruptions*)... No, please. (*Interruptions*)... You listen to him. (*Interruptions*)... You listen to his full speech. (*Interruptions*)... No. Listen to the full speech. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, whatever he says is a repetition of his earlier reply. (*Interruptions*)... What is the new proposal? That is important. (*Interruptions*)... Whatever he is telling us is what he has said in his earlier replies. There is no new proposal. (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes, you wait. (*Interruptions*)... You sit down. (*Interruptions*)... You have to listen to him. That is what I am saying. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: I am raising a question. What is the normal rate for APL, BPL and AAY? (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No. You are a senior Member. *(Interruptions)*... You have to listen to the Minister. (CONTD. by 1Q/RG) Ahluwaliaji, I will allow you. You can seek your clarifications later on... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: People are expecting some assurances from the hon. Minister. That is lacking in the reply... *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please sit down... *(Interruptions)* This is indiscipline... *(Interruptions)* Do not cross the Lakshman Rekha. Nobody should cross the Lakshman Rekha... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, the issues which have been raised, again and again, are about the APL price, BPL price and the AAY price. I said in my statement that since the year 2002, we have not changed the prices. The prices, which have been finalised in the year 2002, have remained the same... *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): All of you kindly take your seats... *(Interruptions)* Please take your seat... *(Interruptions)* Mr. Tariq Anwar, please take your seat... *(Interruptions)* Mr. Vijayaraghavan, please take your seat... *(Interruptions)* I am on my legs. Please take your seat... *(Interruptions)* Don't you know the rules? You should, at least, have some respect for the rules of the House... *(Interruptions)*

**श्री कमाल अख्तर** (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, हम लोगों को आपका संरक्षण चाहिए ..**(व्यवधान)**..

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन)** : कृपया आप बैठिए! *(Interruptions)* Mr. Madhu, I am on my legs... *(Interruptions)* I am aware that the Members are agitated about price rise. I am also equally concerned about it... *(Interruptions)* But, let me tell you; the other day, the discussion, that went on, was in perfect order, and whatever was spoken in the House was listened to carefully... *(Interruptions)* Don't you know the rules? I am on my legs. Don't break the rules... *(Interruptions)* Don't cross the Lakshman Rekha. I am on my legs. Now, listen to me. Therefore, it is the responsibility of this august House to listen to the Minister. After I have assured you from the Chair that after the reply is over, I will give time to those who want to seek clarifications, wait till that time. Maybe, in a few minutes, he will finish... *(Interruptions)* No; sit down. If it proceeds this way, then, I will have to adjourn the House... *(Interruptions)* Mr. Madhu, just a minute... *(Interruptions)* Please take your seat. I am on my legs.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: We are here to honour your words. We are here to listen to the hon. Minister. We never want to disturb the proceedings...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Then, what do you want?

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: We do not want to disrupt the proceedings....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Then, please sit down.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: But our only request is, we have raised certain issues...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have said that I will allow you to seek further clarifications... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No; no; nothing will go on record...*(Interruptions)* Please sit down...*(Interruptions)* Please take your seat...*(Interruptions)* What is this? *(Interruptions)* In this way, I will adjourn the House.

Show that seriousness. You say it is very serious and you are not showing that seriousness now. *(Interruptions)* Please. If you are serious, you will listen to the reply. And after that.... *(Interruptions)* No, Brindaji, don't do this. *(Interruptions)* I will adjourn the House. *(Interruptions)* Don't force me to adjourn the House. *(Interruptions)* No, no. After the reply. *(Interruptions)* After the reply. *(Interruptions)* I will give you the time after the reply. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, questions raised by hon. Members in the course of the discussion should be answered.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): : If he does not reply, I will give you the opportunity. *(Interruptions)* He will not violate. *(Interruptions)* If he doesn't reply, I will give you the time. *(Interruptions)* Please. I am helpless. *(Interruptions)* No, no. Please. What can I do if all of you stand up like this? *(Interruptions)* Mr. Raja, what is this? If all of you stand up, what can I do? *(Interruptions)* You make them sit. *(Interruptions)* You ask your people to sit. *(Interruptions)* If you want to say something, first ask them to sit. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we want specific response. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, please. *(Interruptions)* Nobody is hearing anything. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, we agree that the whole House is agitated on the issue of price rise.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): What do you want now?

SHRI D. RAJA: Our simple submission is this. What action is the Government taking to control the prices?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): But you allow him to say that. *(Interruptions)* Take your seat. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Sarkar! Please take your seat. *(Interruptions)* Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, tell us what action has the Government taken. *(Interruptions)* The Government is only trying to justify the price rise. But we want to know the action that it has taken.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, so far, he has only tried to justify the price rise.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): : Mr. Vijayaraghavan, you say... *(Interruptions)* No, no. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Brijesh, I am on my legs.

---

\*Not recorded.



**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** मैं एक विशेष बात बताना चाहता हूँ।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no. You see my plight. *(Interruptions)* I will tell you... *(Interruptions)*

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** मैं एक विशेष बात बताना चाहता हूँ। वह विशेष बात यह है कि माननीय मंत्री जी ..(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. *(Interruptions)* Please. आप लोग बैठिए.... प्लीज़... (व्यवधान)... No. sit down. *(Interruptions)* Take your seat.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** सर, आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)... सर, आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You sit down.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** मैं समझ रहा हूँ कि आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Take your seat. आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)... Ask him to sit. बैठिए। *(Interruptions)* I am on my legs. आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** सर, आप भी...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You sit down.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं। आप इनकी तरफ मत जाइए।...(व्यवधान)... अपने परिवार का ख्याल रखिए हुजूर।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री राजीव शुक्ल :** वे तो चैन से बैठे हैं, आपका परिवार बहुत बड़ा है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I am on my legs. *(Interruptions)* Ask him to sit.

**श्री बृजभूषण तिवारी (महाराष्ट्र) :** नहीं, एक क्लैरिफिकेशन...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen. All of you are hon. Members of the House. You know the rule. When a Minister is speaking or, for that matter, any hon. Member is speaking, if you want to put a question, first the one who is speaking should yield. That is number one. Here, the Minister said he was not yielding. All of you stand up for seeking clarifications. You tell me what the Chair should do. Do you want the Chair to break the rules? ...*(Interruptions)* You sit down.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** माननीय मंत्री जी से ही...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Sit down. I am on my legs. What is this?

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** माननीय मंत्री जी से कहिए कि सही जवाब दें।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will name you. You sit down. *(Interruptions)* I will be forced to name you. *(Interruptions)* Take your seat.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** ये सही जवाब देंगे तो कोई दिक्कत नहीं होगी।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will be forced to name you. Take your seat.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** बिल्कुल कीजिए। मुझे क्या दिक्कत है? मुझे देश की जनता ने भेजा है, मैं अपनी बात रखूंगा। माननीय मंत्री जी अगर सही बोलेंगे ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Do you want me to name you? Sit down.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** देश की जनता के हित में बोलेंगे तो हम चुपचाप सुनेंगे..**(व्यवधान)**.. इस तरीके से चुपचाप सुनने वाले नहीं हैं।..**(व्यवधान)**..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Do you want me to name you? ...**(Interruptions)**... Sit down. ...**(Interruptions)**... What is this? ...**(Interruptions)**... Sit down. ...**(Interruptions)**... I will ask him whether he is yielding. ...**(Interruptions)**... Mr. Minister, are you yielding to Brindaji because she wants to ask a question?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, Sir. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, he is not yielding. He is just...**(Interruptions)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Pardon! ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Having replied all the queries, last when I finish my reply...**(Interruptions)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He is not yielding, Brindaji. You wait. Have patience. No, Brindaji, please. No, no; I cannot help. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: All right, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I don't want to break the rules. Sit down. ...**(Interruptions)**... I am helpless. Now, sit down. ...**(Interruptions)**... What are you doing? He is not yielding. Sit down. It is up to him. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, as I said, whatever the normal...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, during the debate, we have raised very specific questions. ...**(Interruptions)**... He has not replied a single question. Because there is no clarification now...**(Interruptions)**... We have asked clarifications in our interventions at the time of the debate, Sir. But, he is not answering a single question, we have asked. For example, why is APL allocation being cut when you have got the stock? But, he is not answering that question. ...**(Interruptions)**... Sir, in your State 90 per cent of the allocation is cut. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया :** सर, मैं शुद्ध हिन्दी में बोलता हूं।..**(व्यवधान)**..

**श्री तारिक अनवर :** आप मत बोलिए।..**(व्यवधान)**.. आप डिस्टर्ब मत करिए।..**(व्यवधान)**..

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :** मैं शुद्ध हिन्दी में बोलता हूं। महंगाई पर जब चर्चा हुई तो यह बजट के पहले की घटना है। महंगाई पर चर्चा सिर्फ इसीलिए की गयी थी ताकि इस पर अंकुश लगे, चीजों की कीमत कम हो। हम उम्मीद करते थे कि मंत्री महोदय जब तक जवाब देंगे, चीजें सस्ती हो जाएंगी। इसी बीच बजट आ गया, तेल की कीमत बढ़ गयी, पेट्रोल और डीजल की कीमत बढ़ गयी और महंगाई और ऊपर चली गयी।..**(व्यवधान)**.. क्या मंत्री महोदय बताएंगे कि महंगाई कम कैसे होगी और क्या डीजल और पेट्रोल का दाम वापस होगा या नहीं होगा?..**(व्यवधान)**..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Only what the Minister says will go on record, nothing else. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: As I said, whatever the requirements of the States, according to the APL, BPL and AAY quota, Government has decided to supply it to all the States.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: At what price?

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is the price? Again, he is misleading the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has replied that. ...*(Interruptions)*... He has replied that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: He is misleading the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: As I said...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is the price?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He said that but you did not hear. He has said 'the old price 2002'. ...*(Interruptions)*... He said that.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: He is misleading the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The problem is, you are not listening...*(Interruptions)*...He replied to that query.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, when I said, as per the quota, we do supply to BPL, AAY and APL, I also said the prices which were fixed in the year 2002, till today, we have not changed the issue prices. We are charging the same prices which were fixed in the year 2002. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, the question comes about as to what exactly we have done. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्रीमती बृन्दा कारत :** एपीएल की बात कीजिए। ..**(व्यवधान)**..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, he has answered that query. Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: See the additional thing. ...*(Interruptions)*... When I said that we have given additional quota to the States to sell it in the open market. When we sell it in the open market, our desire is that it should be available. Firstly, availability should be improved in the State. ...*(Interruptions)*... Number two, the flour mills and others should get sufficient wheat in the open market. At what rate we have charged it, Sir?. We have fixed the rate for them is somewhat at the MSP we have paid to the farmers. We have not earned any money; we have not earned any profit. In fact, we have lost. Even for that section also, the price which we have fixed is somewhat at the MSP price. Beyond that, we have not charged any money. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** चीनी का दाम प्रति के0जी0 कितना है और किसान को कितना मिलता है, यह मैंने पूछा था? ...**(व्यवधान)**

**श्री शरद पवार :** आपका जो कहना है, इसको स्वीकार करना मुझे मुश्किल है, क्योंकि बी०पी०एल० का जो रेट है उस पर हम फ्लोर मिल को नहीं देंगे। फ्लोर मिल के लिए अलग रेट होगा।.....(व्यवधान)

**श्री भगत सिंह कोश्यारी (उत्तराखंड) :** पहले क्या प्राइस था.....(व्यवधान) बिल्कुल यह मिस-लीडिंग कर रहे हैं ये।...(व्यवधान) He is misleading the House. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): After he finishes you can say that. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Whatever rates have been finalised; additional stocks have been allocated to the States. (Interruptions) As I said, at the MSP price. This is the additional quota for flour mills and others. (Interruptions)

**श्रीमती वृंदा कारत :** सर, बी०पी०एल० क्या है आज?... (व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has already said about the prices, they are at 2002 prices. You know that, please sit down. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: The second important issue... (Interruptions) When the question comes to improve the availability in the open market, nobody expects that the Government of India should sell to the open market at the BPL rates. That is a different situation. BPL is only for those people who come from below the povertyline. But, if anybody wants can buy wheat at the flour mill price; the flour mill owner should not expect the we should supply him at the BPL rate.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, about below poverty-line, there are five definitions. One is of the Central Government, one is of Planning Commission, one is of Consumer Affairs, one is of the Finance Ministry, the other is of the State. There are five different definitions. At least, right from Lakrawala to... (Interruptions) Who will ensure?

**श्री तारिक अनवर :** आपने एन०डी०ए० के टाइम में क्यों ठीक नहीं किया?... (व्यवधान) तभी सूची को ठीक कर देते।.....(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Tariq, you do not worry. Please sit down. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, another important issue that has been raised in the House is about the edible oil. In fact, India annually imports about 40 per cent. ... (Interruptions)

**श्रीमती वृंदा कारत :** बी०पी०एल० के नाम पर इन लोगों को विभाजित करके उनको वंचित किया जा रहा है खाद्य सुरक्षा से।...(व्यवधान)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, we have taken many steps. Firstly, whatever shortfall is on import of crude oil and retained only 7.5% duty on import of refined oil there, it will be imported. We have removed all taxes and duties of the imports. We have banned export of all types of edible oils to make the availability. In order to relieve the consumer, the Government of India told some of the Public Sector Units to import edible oil and we had provided up to Rs. 15 per litre subsidy and that edible oil has been available in the public distribution system. Many States have taken the benefit.

3.00 P.M.

Another important issue which has been raised here is about sugar.

**श्रीमती वृंदा कारत :** सर, दाल में काला है, चीनी में घोटाला है।...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: In fact, as regards sugar availability this year. As I said, this year, the production will be nearer to 160 lakh tonnes. The estimated demand will be 230 lakh tonnes. There is a shortfall. ...**(Interruptions)**... There is a shortfall between demand and supply. ..**(Interruptions)**.. We have taken many steps. Firstly, we have allowed import of raw sugar and other sugars without Duty. ..**(Interruptions)**.. We have banned export. ..**(Interruptions)**.. Therefore, the availability of sugar has definitely improved. The prices which had gone up to Rs.48 in retail have come down between Rs.38 and Rs.41 as on today. One of the reasons, (a) production is definitely improving and import has definitely eased the situation..**(Interruptions)** I am sure that will definitely improve the situation. ..**(Interruptions)**..

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have a point of order. ...**(Interruptions)**.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Minister, there is a point of order. ..**(Interruptions)**.. Dr. Maitreyan, please sit down. ..**(Interruptions)**.. Under what Rule?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, Rule 169. When we discuss matters of urgent public interest, the Rule 169.1 says, it shall raise substantially one definite issue. Then in 170, you decide the admissibility and there is reply. When we raised a question of importance, the hon. Minister is obliged to reply to the issues raised by us. And all of us have raised the issue of great scam in sugar. I have given statistics. He is not replying to that and he is saying that everything is fine in sugar. ..**(Interruptions)**.. Is it right, Sir? ..**(Interruptions)**.. He is evading the issue. ..**(Interruptions)**.. He must reply to the issues raised. ..**(Interruptions)**..

**श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा** (मध्य प्रदेश): चीनी में बहुत बड़ा घोटाला किया है।..**(व्यवधान)**..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seat. I will give my ruling. Please take your seats.

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** मंत्री जी, मैंने सवाल किया था। आप बताइए कि पिछले साल चीनी की कितनी पैदावार हुई थी और चीनी के दाम क्या थे ? ..**(व्यवधान)**..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The hon. Member who raised the point of order is a very senior Member and he is well-versed with the proceedings and rules of the House. He knows that the Chair cannot direct a Member and for that matter a Minister to reply in a particular way. ..**(Interruptions)**..

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** आप बैठ जाइए। आप बैठ जाइए। ..**(व्यवधान)**.. उसका जवाब दीजिए। ..**(व्यवधान)**.. The Minister is flouting the rules.

**श्री तारिक अनवर :** जवाब देने नहीं देंगे और कहेंगे कि जवाब दीजिए।..**(व्यवधान)**..

**श्री वृजभूषण तिवारी** (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जो मुद्दे, जो सवाल उठाए गए हैं, उनका जवाब नहीं होगा, तो बहस करने का मतलब क्या रह जाएगा ? ..**(व्यवधान)**..

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: He is misleading the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will tell you. *..(Interruptions)..* I will come to that

**श्री कमाल अख्तर** : सर, रूल्स का पालन करवाइये। *..(व्यवधान)..*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The hon. Deputy Leader of the Opposition is saying that the Minister is misleading the House. If the Minister is misleading the House, *..(Interruptions)..* Please, sit down. I am nobody to judge here whether he is misleading or not. If you think, he is misleading the House, there are rules in this Rule Book by which you can take it up. *..(Interruptions)* That is up to you.

**श्री नारायण सिंह केसरी** (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, आपके सामने मिसलीड कर रहे हैं। *..(व्यवधान)..*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): That is up to you. *(Interruptions)* Please.. *(Interruptions)*...From the chair, I am not directed to do this way or that way but there are rules for everything and hon. Deputy Leader of the Opposition can go through the rules and take proper action. *(Interruptions)* Please...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: When I say...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please... *(Interruptions)*...Why Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad....

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Before I spoke, Shrimati Brinda Karat spoke on this. Both of us talked about sugar scam. Why is he not replying to that? That is the question I am asking. That is the issue. We have raised a definite issue of public importance. Has he replied to that? He is evading that. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: He is replying to your queries. *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: In the course of the debate, we have raised very specific issues. Now, the Minister has not answered a single question which we have raised now. Sir, we are seeking clarifications. What is the point? We have asked so many times. He has not replied. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): He is replying to that. Now listen to the reply. *(Interruptions)* Nothing will go on record. Only the Minister's reply will go on record.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, as I said, the total production of sugar in this country will be 160 lakh tonnes. We have a carry-over of about 25 lakh tonnes. So, we have got about 185 lakh tonnes. So, there is a shortfall of about 50-63 lakh tonnes. So, the question was how to resolve this issue.... *(Interruptions)*... We took a conscious decision just to see that the availability is improved. We have taken a decision to remove all restrictions on import, whether it is raw sugar or whether it is a processed sugar. In fact, in the information which we have got, more than 50 lakh tonnes of sugar has already been imported and it has come to India.

In such a situation when some hon. Members say that there is some scam or anything, I would like to tell one thing to the House that not a single kilo has been imported by the Government of India and not a single kilo has been sold by the Government of India. *(Interruptions)* Whatever statements they are making here have no meaning and that is how we try our level best to improve the supply position *(Interruptions)* Then, Government of India took a decision to enhance the price of the sugar cane. We have decided...*(Interruptions)*... So, whether it is cheeni, whether it is pulses, whether it is edible oil, in all the areas, Government of India has taken a decision to resolve this issue and we have seen that the prices of pulses and major pulses are coming down. The situation will be improved in the coming days. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House is adjourned to meet at 4.00 P.M.

-----

The House then adjourned at nine minutes past three of the clock.

The House re-assembled at four of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

#### **MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, let us take up the Motion of Thank on President's Address. Prof. P.J. Kurien to move the Motion.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (Kerala): Sir, I move...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS (Karnataka): Sir, before my friend moves the Motion, I wish to make a submission. My submission is, we should not criticise the Address of the hon. President. The Address is that of the Government. That is what Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru said and I quote, "The President's Address is a statement of policy of the Government. It should be remembered; it is the Government that is responsible for it and it is not right or proper for our respected President's name to be brought in debates like this." But, unfortunately, this is going on. Sir, 614 amendments expressing regrets have been moved. So, my humble submission is, we should thank the hon. President unanimously and go on debate about the policies and programmes of the Government. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jois, your point is well taken. It needs discussion. There has to be a wider discussion on this point.

Now, Shri P.J. Kurien to move the Motion.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (KERALA): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I beg to move:

That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:

"That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which she has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on February 22, 2010."