

statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Third Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment on Demands for Grants (2009-10) of the Ministry of Minority Affairs.

**Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Second Report of Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Coal and Steel**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILISERS (SHRI SRIKANT JENA): Sir, on behalf of Shri B.K. Handique, I make a statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Second Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Coal and Steel.

**Status of implementation of Thirty-fifth Report of Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Coal and Steel**

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COAL THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF STATISTICS AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (SHRI SHRIPRAKASH JAISWAL): Sir, I make a statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Thirty-fifth Report on "Rehabilitation and Resettlement Policy by Coal India Limited" of the Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Coal and Steel.

**Implementation of recommendation contained in the Sixty-seventh Report of Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Information Technology**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI CHOUDHURY MOHAN JATUA): Sir, I make a statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Sixty-seventh Report on "Television Audience Measurement in India" of the Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Information Technology.

---

**MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION**

**Reported purchase of illegal arms by Member of Council of Ministers from Bangladesh**

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (West Bengal): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, with your permission, I would like to raise a very serious issue. One Central Minister gave money to buy illegal arms and ammunition to a Bangladeshi arms dealer. In a Press Conference, the Minister has said this himself. He also said that he had a good rapport with the Bangladeshi arms dealer. It was reported that according to the version of the Minister, he paid Rs. 1.20 lakh through his party man. This is the way this Minister and his other colleagues are trying to destabilize the law and order situation of West Bengal. The Central Minister belongs to West Bengal.

Sir, I would like to tell this august House my apprehension that these arms have been used in bank dacoits in the Howrah District. These arms are also being used by the Maoists. Day before yesterday, Mr. Dayal Mahato was killed by Maoists in the Jamberia area. I would like to inform this august House that the Minister himself has said that he had a conversation with the Bangladeshi arms dealer. I would insist upon the Government that this taped conversation between the Minister and the Bangladeshi arms dealer should be inquired into. It is a very serious matter, as it concerns the national security; it concerns the law and order of the State. Such types of things are going on in all parts of West Bengal. I would request the Government to come out with a complete inquiry so far as this issue pertaining to arms dealing is concerned. It is a very serious matter. Every day our party men are being targeted by other people. People are smuggling arms into India. ... *(Interruptions)*... They purchase arms from across the border. These people should be punished. ... *(Interruptions)*... I would like the Government to come out with a statement on this.

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): This is a very serious issue. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, ... *(Interruptions)*...

**श्री विजय कुमार रूपाणी** (गुजरात) : सर, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Nothing will go on record ... *(Interruptions)*... Now, Shri Mohammed Adeeb ... *(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record ... *(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat ... *(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record ... *(Interruptions)*... Why do you want to create problems? Please sit down ... *(Interruptions)*... The Minister wants to say something ... *(Interruptions)*... Let us hear the Minister ... *(Interruptions)*... Please sit down ... *(Interruptions)*... Please hear the Minister.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Sir, I do not want to mention what transpired in the hon. Chairman's Chamber. My submission to the House is that when an issue relates to a Minister, we should go by the rules. Under rule 238A, a hon. Member has to bring a motion. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, please. ... *(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. ... *(Interruptions)*... आप बैठिए ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप बैठिए ...**(व्यवधान)**... Let him have his say. ... *(Interruptions)*... Let him have his say ... *(Interruptions)*... Brindaji, Please, ... *(Interruptions)*... Moinulji, I allowed you. Then, what is this? ... *(Interruptions)*... Let him have his say ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: It is very unfortunate that newspaper reports. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Shri Mohammad Adeeb. ... *(Interruptions)*... That is over. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Under what rule?

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Under rule 238. Sir, rule 238 A states that any charge or allegation against a Minister, when he is named, will have to be done by giving a prior notice to the Minister and to the Chairman. But, without naming the Minister, any matter of national importance and a matter of grave threat to our country's internal security can be raised. In this House, the issue can be raised. ... *(Interruptions)*... What is the rule.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): What rule? You have raised ... *(Interruptions)*... What is the problem? You have already raised it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: The Minister is objecting to it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes. That is the Minister's view. ... *(Interruptions)*... Now, please. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (West Bengal): We want the Government to respond.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): All right. That is okay.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, since the matter has been raised, we only want the Government to respond to it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): They will respond to it at their time. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Rajasthan): Sir, you give your ruling.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No ruling is required because it is already raised. ... *(Interruptions)*... Please.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Kindly ask the Government to respond to it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen to me. ... *(Interruptions)*... वृंदा जी, आप बैठिए। ... *(व्यवधान)*... Brinjda ji, Najma ji is on her legs. Why don't you allow her? Najma ji is very senior and experienced. She knows the rules better than I know.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, what I want to say is this. If a Member has taken the name of a particular person, or, a Minister especially, then, what Mr. Narayanasamy read was correct. But, as he has not named anybody and the House wants to know the name of the Minister, the Government should come forward and disclose the name of the Minister. Then, the law – moving of a motion etc. – will take its own course. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Sit down please. ... (Interruptions)... What do you want, Brinjajaji?

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, give a direction to the Government to respond to this very, very serious charge. ... (Interruptions)... A Central Minister is involved in arms dealing and he has paid Rs.1.20 lakhs for this. ... (Interruptions)... How can this be permitted, Sir?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The Chair cannot give a direction, ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I have one small submission to make. I agree with Najmajji. She says that when a Member has brought up an issue related to a Central Minister, the House has every right to know who that Minister is. What is the response of the Government?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): All right. You have said what you wanted to say. ... (Interruptions)... Now, nothing else will go on record. Mr. Mohammad Adeeb. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जनाबे आली, 10 साल पहले ... (व्यवधान)...

{ جناب محمد ادیب (اتر پردیش) : جناب عالی، 10 سال پہلے ... (مداخلت) ... }

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): That will not go on record. Take your seat, Brindajaji. ... (Interruptions)... Please. ... (Interruptions)... Mayajji, no. ... (Interruptions)... Yechury, please. ... (Interruptions)... Please allow the House to function. ... (Interruptions)... Brindajaji, please sit down. ... (Interruptions)... That is over. ... (Interruptions)... That topic is over. No more mention about that subject. Sit down. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : सर, 10 साल पहले ... (व्यवधान) ... हमें बोलने तो दीजिए ... (व्यवधान) ... सर, हाउस में यह क्या हो रहा है? ... (व्यवधान)...

---

† [Transliteration in Urdu Script]



† [جناب محمد ادیب: آپ تو کہہ رہے ہیں بولنے، لیکن یہ لوگ مجھے بولنے نہیں دے رہے ہیں۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ ایسے میں کوئی بول ہی نہیں سکتا۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I request all of you to resume your seats. ... (Interruptions)... Ahluwaliaji, why do you want to create problems?

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Jharkhand): Sir, they have a right and they have exercised their right and informed the House that there is a Minister involved. Is it a story, or, is it a reality? If it is a reality, we have the right to know who that Minister is. ... (Interruptions)... Sir, this guessing game cannot go on. The Government should come clean on who is involved. We want to know the truth if, at all, there is a Minister involved or not. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, will you take your seat. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, they should come clean. Otherwise, right from the Prime Minister, everybody is under a question-mark.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, you take your seat. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, the House has got the full right. ... (Interruptions)... How can you take it like this? ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seat. ... (Interruptions)... No, please. ... (Interruptions)... The issue raised by Shri Ahluwaliaji, the Deputy Leader of the Opposition. The question is, he is asking, since an hon. Member raised a matter in the Zero Hour and mentioned one Minister. That is the thing. But, Ahluwaliaji and all Members know this also emanates from a. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: I don't know, Sir. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Let me complete. I have to stand, at least, then I will be heard. ... (Interruptions)... See, everybody knows that this issue emanates from a newspaper, and the Chairman in his wisdom has allowed it. To ask the Government to immediately respond on a surprise matter, it is not proper. ... (Interruptions)... It is for the Government to decide to respond or not. ... (Interruptions)... Let me say. You have made your point. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, give a direction to the Government.

---

† [Transliteration in Urdu Script]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have made your point. ... (*Interruptions*)... Take your seat Dr. Maitreyan, take your seat. ... (*Interruptions*)... No, Dr. Maitreyan, I am on my legs. It is for the Government to decide whether to respond or not. The Chair cannot give a direction in this regard because it is the Zero Hour. In the Zero Hour matter, I cannot give a direction. But, if the Government wants, the Government can react. I have no objection. ... (*Interruptions*)... Enough. ... (*Interruptions*)...

**श्री वृजभूषण तिवारी** (उत्तर प्रदेश) : यह बड़ा गंभीर मामला है। ... (**व्यवधान**)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He is getting the arms through an arms dealer. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I don't want to give ... (*Interruptions*)... I won't give it. I said that. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, you give the direction to the Government. ... (*Interruptions*)... Sir, the Chair should ... (*Interruptions*)...

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी** (बिहार) : सरकार refute करें कि ऐसा नहीं है। ... (**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): What is this? Yechuryji, you know the rules. You know the rules of the House. ... (*Interruptions*)... You know the rules of the House. ... (*Interruptions*)... All of you know the rules of the House. ... (*Interruptions*)... Why do you compel me? ... (*Interruptions*)... Why do you compel me for something which I cannot do? ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: We are compelling the Government through you, Sir. We are asking them to respond.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I told that I have no objection, if the Government wants. But, don't compel me. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You are the ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please help me. ... (*Interruptions*)... You are very senior Members. You can speak so. How can I ? I cannot be compelled like this. ... (*Interruptions*)... Ahluwaliaji, please cooperate. ... (*Interruptions*)... Ahluwaliaji, please cooperate. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: The Home Minister can respond. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I gave my ruling. ... *(Interruptions)*... I cannot ask the Government. ... *(Interruptions)*... I gave my ruling. ... *(Interruptions)*... I gave my ruling. ... *(Interruptions)*... I cannot ask the Government ... *(Interruptions)*... I also said, I have no objection, if the Government wants. ... *(Interruptions)*... Nothing more. ... *(Interruptions)*... Nothing more. Brinjaji, please sit down.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: The Home Minister can respond. सर, सरकार को इसका जवाब देने दीजिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no, no. ... *(Interruptions)*... He does not know. ... *(Interruptions)*... How can he give a statement? ... *(Interruptions)*... This is unfair. ... *(Interruptions)*... The Home Minister does not know what happened. How can he give a statement? ... *(Interruptions)*... He only just now came.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, he knows it. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, authorize me or authorize the ... *(Interruptions)*... He is aware of it. What is this? ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, Mr. Chidambaram is talking about increased Maoist violence. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Don't compel me to adjourn the House. Your Zero hour will be lost. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we don't want the House to be adjourned. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No, Sir, please ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I cannot. ... *(Interruptions)*...

**डा. वी. मैत्रेयन :** गृह मंत्री क्यों भागे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... गृह मंत्री का यहां आने के बाद हाउस छोड़कर जाना बहुत गलत बात है ...**(व्यवधान)**... गृह मंत्री जी क्यों "रणभेड़माला" बन गए ...**(व्यवधान)**... Please give a direction to the Government to give reply. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, please. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Brinjaji, you know it. ... *(Interruptions)*... Why are you doing this? No, please. ... *(Interruptions)*... Nothing more. I gave my ruling. I cannot ask the Government. ... *(Interruptions)*... I gave my ruling. I cannot ask the Government. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, how can we do it? ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Look, you can bring it to their notice, if you want. There are other ways of doing it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: We will do that. ... *(Interruptions)*...



THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yechury Saheb, there are other ways of doing it. ... *(Interruptions)*... Ahluwaliaji, there are other ways of doing it. You know it.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we want you to direct the Minister. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You know it. You know it. You know the rules. ... *(Interruptions)*... Ahluwaliaji, you know the rules better. ... *(Interruptions)*... There are other ways of doing it, not by disrupting the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The Chair cannot compel the Minister to speak this way or that way. I am telling you. ... *(Interruptions)*... Everybody is standing. Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, you ask your friends to sit down. ... *(Interruptions)*... I have given a ruling.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, there is a simple solution to this. My point is you have to run the House and we also cooperate. The point is, a serious issue has been raised. The simple response would be the Government's simple saying that they would examine and come back to the House tomorrow. ... *(Interruptions)*... Because, there would be 70 Ministers who would be under cloud tomorrow. There would be a question mark in the media against the Ministers for 24 hours. The best thing is ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanasamy or Mr. Veerappa Moily, or somebody can say this. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given my ruling. That is his suggestion. ... *(Interruptions)*...

**डा. वी. मैत्रेयन :** यह बोल दें कि हाउस में जो हैं, उनमें से तो कोई नहीं है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, there are seven Ministers sitting here. They can say something. ... *(Interruptions)*...

**श्री परबोत्तम खोड़ाभाई रुपाला (गुजरात) :** सर, मेरा एक सुझाव है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will have to adjourn the House then. I cannot compel the Minister. The rule is very clear. ... *(Interruptions)*...

**श्रीमती वृंदा कारत :** यह कुछ जवाब तो दें ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD (Karnataka): Whatever is raised is very important. It is being noted. Why insisting on a particular answer? ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITRYEAN: Sir, he is not a Minister. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the Government cannot respond to all the issues. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please ... *(Interruptions)*... कृपया आप लोग बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... कृपया आप लोग बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... Hon. Members, everybody knows that we are governed by rules and the Chair cannot violate the rules. The question is, if some matter is raised during Zero Hour to ask the Government to immediately respond...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Not immediately, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen. Let me say. ... *(Interruptions)*... Let me complete.

**श्री परुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाळा :** सर, जो नहीं हैं, वे बोल दें कि मैं नहीं हूँ ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन) :** कृपया आप लोग बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, they can do it tomorrow or the day after. They can say that they would look into the matter. We are requesting you, we are not compelling you. You are our referee. Through you, we are asking the Government to assure that they will look into the matter and come back to the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Yechury, I have already made it clear that it is up to the Government and if the Government wants, they can do that. I only say that. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: How can you leave it up to the Government, Sir? The Ministers are here. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we will be forced to take the name of the Ministers in the House if the Government does not respond. If the Government does not respond, we will be forced to take the name of the Minister. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Then, I will have to adjourn the House. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, the Chair has rightly said that we are governed by the rules. If we see the crux of the allegation, and it is being made with some authority, we are also governed by the Constitution that every Minister shows allegiance to the sovereignty of

India. Now, if there is an allegation of this magnitude against a Minister being made, surely the Government must consider it; if it is false, come out and categorically say that it is incorrect; if it is true, the Government should take corrective steps. It cannot just go as a mere allegation and there is a needle of suspicion against a dozen Ministers as to which one it is. The Government surely knows the fact that here is a Minister against whom serious allegations of compromises of sovereignty are being made. Therefore, the Government must look into the matter and come out with a response and if they find that it is incorrect, they must categorically say so. If it is correct, then we expect a more positive response from the Government. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, this is exactly what we were asking. ... *(Interruptions)*... This is what we are asking the Government. It should say that it would look into the matter and come back to the House. All that we are asking is that you look into the matter and come back to the House. ... *(Interruptions)*... All that is being asked is only that you look into the matter. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, because you understand. ... *(Interruptions)*... You are right, Sir, we are guided by the rules. But these rules are framed under the Constitution. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I agree. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Illegal buying of arms from across the border. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Why do you repeat this? ... *(Interruptions)*... Yechuryji, please ... *(Interruptions)*... That is on record. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: The Leader of the Opposition has said something. ... *(Interruptions)*... What is the use of it if the Government does not respond? ... *(Interruptions)*... I cannot suspect Gill Sahib, I cannot suspect Sharad Pawarji, I cannot suspect Amibika Soniji, Anand Sharmaji and Moilyji who are all sitting here. ... *(Interruptions)*... Everybody is under suspicion. ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam Ramesh is also sitting here. ... *(Interruptions)*... You have to disclose the name. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENAKAIAH NAIDU: Why this helplessness? ... *(Interruptions)*... Let the Government respond. ... *(Interruptions)*... He is not a Member, Sir. ... *(Interruptions)*... He is a Minister, Sir. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He is the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. ... *(Interruptions)*... Let him say something. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES, THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE, THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC

GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI PRITVHIRAJ CHAVAN): My esteemed colleagues have raised this issue. The Government takes everything that is raised during Zero Hour very seriously. I do not want to distinguish one issue raised and the other issue raised. I cannot immediately respond to an issue which comes in a newspaper. This will be looked into. I mean, every issue that is raised in the House is looked into by the Government. ... (Interruptions)... If there is anything very substantive, then let them give a substantive motion. ... (Interruptions)... There are certain rules to run the House. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): That is all. ... (Interruptions)... Now Mr. Mohammed Aadeeb. ... (Interruptions)... That is over. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : अरे साहब, मुझे बोलने दीजिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

جناب محمد ادیب : ارے صاحب، مجھے بولنے دیجئے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We want a categorical answer from the Government. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no, he has reacted. ... (Interruptions)... I cannot ask the Government to react in a particular way. ... (Interruptions)... This is very unfair. ... (Interruptions)... The Chair cannot force the Minister to respond in a particular way. ... (Interruptions)... That is the rule. ... (Interruptions)... That is on record. ... (Interruptions)... The response has come. ... (Interruptions)... If you do not want to run the House, then I will have to adjourn the House. That is all. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We want the response of the Government. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House is adjourned for ten minutes.

The House then adjourned at twenty-eight minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at thirty-seven minutes past twelve of the clock,

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, the Minister has trivialized an important issue of illegally buying all arms across the border from Bangladesh.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please sit down. We are not taking that issue any more.

---

† [Transliteration in Urdu Script]

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: It is a very serious matter which cannot be trivialized in this fashion. Sir, it cannot be trivialized in this way and this is totally. ... (*Interruptions*)... Sir, you cannot allow it to be trivialized. सर, यह क्या सही है कि यह गैरकानूनी हथियारों का इस प्रकार से डील करें? ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह देखने वाली बात है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: It is not a single issue. I would like to ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, who has the adhikaar to do such things? That is the point. It is a totally illegal thing and possibly the Minister has trivialized it by acquitting such an important issue.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I am on a point of order. Under Rule 238 (a).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): That is there. I know that.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You know that.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): But, what is the point?

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, under Rule 238 (a), Sir, I am just reading out the rules. It says, "As per rule, no allegation of a defamatory or incriminatory nature can be made by a Member against any other Member or a Member of the other House unless the Member making the allegation has given previous intimation to the Chairman and also to the Minister concerned so that the Minister may be able to make an investigation into the matter for the purpose of a reply." This is concerning any other allegation that falls in the domain of that particular Ministry.

Now, the allegation has been raised against the Minister in particular, about what he has done. Now, therefore, under this rule, Sir, we will move a Substantive Motion because under the Constitution of India – we all exist under this – the oath that a Minister takes allegiance and a complete responsibility of abiding by the Constitution and upholding the sovereignty of the country. Now, according to this allegation, that is violated. So, we will give a substantive notice on this issue naming the Minister and we would want a reply from him under this rule to be laid before the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Yechury, to move a Substantive Motion it is always within your rights under the rules of the Rule Book. I have no problem. But, if such a Motion is there, according to the rules, action will be taken. ... (*Interruptions*)... Mrs. Maya Singh ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, what about the issue? ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, what is this? ... (Interruptions)... What is this? ... (Interruptions)... Smt. Maya Singh ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, what is the final ruling? ... (Interruptions)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन) : श्रीमती माया सिंह। ... (व्यवधान)... Please...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given my ruling. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री साविर अली (बिहार) : सर, यह क्या बात है? ये जब चाहते हैं, हाउस को बंद करा देते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I gave my ruling ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : सर, ... (व्यवधान)...

﴿ جناب محمد ادیب : سر، --- (مداخلت) --- ﴾†

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: But, Sir, let the Minister reply now. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जनाबे आली, तीन साल पहले ... (व्यवधान)...

﴿ جناب محمد ادیب : جناب عالی، تین سال پہلے --- (مداخلت) --- ﴾†

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, what about the issue raised by us? ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I gave my ruling. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : सर, हमें बोलने दीजिए, यह हमारा प्रिविलेज है। ... (व्यवधान)... क्या यह हमें रोकने की इंटेशन है? ... (व्यवधान)... क्या कोई सदस्य हाउस में बोल नहीं सकता है? ... (व्यवधान)...

﴿ جناب محمد ادیب : سر، ہمیں بولنے دیجئے، یہ ہمارا پریویلیج ہے --- (مداخلت) --- کیا

یہ ہمیں روکنے کی انٹینشن ہے؟ --- (مداخلت) --- کیا کوئی سڈسے ہاؤس میں بول

نہیں سکتا ہے --- (مداخلت) --- ﴾

† [Transliteration in Urdu Script]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The Minister need not reply. ... (Interruptions)... You can bring a substantive motion according to the rules. ... (Interruptions)... I have already given the ruling that the hon. Chairman will look into it as per the rules. ... (Interruptions)... I have already said it. ... (Interruptions)...

SHIV RAJIV PRATAP RUDY (Bihar): sir, he has raised an important point. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I am forced to adjourn the House. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, please, you make the Minister to reply. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : सर, मुझे बोलने दिया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)...

† جناب محمد ادیب : جناب عالی، تین سال پہلے --- (مداخلت) ---

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, the Minister wants to trivialize it. ... (Interruptions)... What is the approach of the Central Government to such an important issue? ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): It has already been done. ... (Interruptions)... Why do you raise it again? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, what is this? ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mohd. Adeeb, you start making your Zero Hour mention. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : सर, आज से तीन साल पहले अजमेर में बम ब्लास्ट हुआ था। दो दिन पहले यह साफ हुआ कि आरएसएस के वर्कर्स ने वहां पर बम ब्लास्ट किया है। ... (व्यवधान)...

† جناب محمد ادیب (اثر پردیش) : سر، آج سے تین سال پہلے اجمیر میں بم بلاسٹ ہوا تھا۔ دو دن پہلے یہ صاف ہوا کہ آر۔ایس۔ایس۔ کے ورکرمن نے وہاں پر بم بلاسٹ کیا تھا۔ --- (مداخلت) ---

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Nothing else will go on record, except Shri Adeeb's mention. ... (Interruptions)... Nothing will go on record. ... (Interruptions)... Mohd. Adeeb. ... (Interruptions)...

---

† [Transliteration in Urdu Script]

श्री मोहम्मद अदीब : और उससे पहले मालेगांव में भी बम ब्लास्ट किया। ... (व्यवधान) ... ये आरएसएस के लोग ब्लास्ट कर रहे हैं और इसीलिए बोलने नहीं दे रहे हैं। ... (व्यवधान) ... इनको मालूम है कि ... (व्यवधान) ...

† جناب محمد ادیب : اور اس سے پہلے مائیگاؤں میں بھی بم بلاسٹ کیا۔  
... (مداخلت) ... یہ آر.ایس.ایس. کے لوگ بم بلاسٹ کر رہے ہیں اور اسی لئے بولنے  
نہیں دے رہے ہیں۔ ... (مداخلت) ... ان کو معلوم ہے۔ ... (مداخلت) ...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: \*

DR. V. MAITREYAN: \*

SHRI VINAY KATIYAR: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given the ruling. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: \*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House is adjourned for one hour to meet after lunch.

The House then adjourned for lunch at forty-two minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House re-assembled after lunch at forty Minutes past one of the clock,

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

#### Discussion on the Working of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, the Minister to reply to the discussion on the working of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution.

कृषि मंत्री तथा उपभोक्ता मामले, खाद्य और सार्वजनिक वितरण मंत्री (श्री शरद पवार): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं सदन के माननीय सदस्यों का आभारी हूँ कि जिन्होंने अनाज की कीमतों के बारे में, अनाज की उपलब्धि तथा अनाज के बंटवारे के बारे में, आम जनता के सामने जो महत्वपूर्ण समस्या है, उस पर इस सदन में बड़ी गहराई से

---

\* Not recorded.

† [Transliteration in Urdu Script]