

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES, THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE. THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI PRITHVIRAJ CHAVAN): Sir, tomorrow, we will be taking up the Finance Bill. We will take it up any time on Wednesday or Thursday at the convenience of the Minister.

DISCUSSION ON WORKING OF MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

श्री ईश्वर सिंह (हरियाणा) : वाइस-चेयरमैन सर, मैं आपका आभारी हूँ कि आपने मुझे समय दिया। डा. अम्बेडकर जी ने कहा था कि हमने राजनीतिक आजादी तो ले ली, परन्तु सामाजिक आजादी अभी बाकी है और बगैर सामाजिक आजादी के यह सब कुछ अधूरा है।

वाइस-चेयरमैन सर, आज होम के महकमे के ऊपर मुझे बोलने का समय मिला। यह एक बहुत अहम महकमा है। इसका राजनीति में अपना स्थान है। जाति के आधार पर, धर्म के आधार पर, रंग के आधार पर, क्षेत्रवाद के आधार पर देश और भी दलदल में फँसता जा रहा है। हमें अपनी मानसिकता को बदलने की बहुत सख्त जरूरत है। समता और समानता का अधिकार केवल कहने का अधिकार है। इनको लागू करने के लिए इसी महकमे की सबसे ज्यादा जिम्मेदारी है। चाहे शिक्षा हो, चाहे चिकित्सा हो, चाहे सुरक्षा हो, इन तीनों महकमों की दशाओं के ऊपर खास कर मैं एक बात अवश्य कहूँगा कि चाहे SC class हो, चाहे ST class हो, उनके हिसाब से अभी भी सामाजिक आजादी कोसों दूर है। अपराध की घटनाओं में 2007-2008 में बलात्कार की घटनाओं में 8 फीसदी बढ़ोत्तरी हुई है। 2007 में SC समुदाय के ऊपर बलात्कार के 1,349 अपराध हुए और 2008 में 1,457 हुए। अपहरण के मामलों में 43 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि हुई। सर, आप हैरान होंगे कि डकैती के मामले में 121.7 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि हुई। ये तो सरकारी आंकड़े हैं। जिनको दर्शाया नहीं गया, जो बताते नहीं, जो बेजुबान लोग हैं, अगर उनको देखें, तो कितना अपराध है। SC/ST के अन्दर अपराध में 11.9 प्रतिशत वृद्धि हुई है, जो इनके महकमें से संबंधित है। हम राजनीतिक पार्टी हैं। पॉलिटिकल पार्टी के अन्दर हम यह कहते हैं कि reservation की class है। इसको विधायक, एमपी अपने क्षेत्र के अन्दर अनुसूचित जाति के लिए रख दिए हैं। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि टिकट का बंटवारा भी जाति के आधार पर होता है। जब तक हम अपनी इस मानसिकता को नहीं बदलेंगे, तब तक यह दशा सुधर ही नहीं सकती। हम जाति के आधार पर वोट करते हैं, जाति के आधार पर टिकट बंटती है, जाति के आधार पर दर्शाया जाता है, उससे और ज्यादा दूरियां बढ़ती चली गई हैं। हम कहते हैं कि हमें बाहर से खतरा है, लेकिन मैं यह मानता हूँ कि हमें अन्दर से ज्यादा खतरा है, चाहे वह आतंकवाद के रूप में हो, नक्सलवाद के रूप में हो, उग्रवाद के रूप में हो, माओवाद के रूप में हो या क्षेत्रवाद के रूप में हो। आज तक सभी लोगों को समता का दर्जा नहीं दिया गया।

सर, मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि आज भी कोई ऐसी यूनिवर्सिटी नहीं है, जो यह कह सके कि हमने बैकलॉग पूरा कर लिया है। ऐसे में बेरोजगारी कैसे दूर होगी? इस हिसाब से समता और समानता का अधिकार कहाँ है? आज भी सरपंच, पंचायत या स्थानीय निकायों के स्तर पर जितनी भी रिजर्वेशन हैं, वे पूरी नहीं हुई हैं। उनको स्वतंत्रता तक का अधिकार प्राप्त नहीं है। सबसे ज्यादा सरपंच सस्पेंड किए जाते हैं। कभी उन्हें गबन के झूठे केस में फंसा दिया जाता है, कभी कोई और इल्जाम लगा दिया जाता है। जब तक हमारी मानसिकता नहीं बदलेगी, तब तक यह काम नहीं रुक सकता है।

सर, एक बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि स्टेट्स के अन्दर जो जिला प्रशासन है, वहाँ एसपी, डिस्ट्रिक्ट मैजिस्ट्रेट इत्यादि के संबंध में मेटेरी ऑडर होना चाहिए और हर जिले के रेश्यो के हिसाब से प्रशासन के अन्दर उनका पूरा हक होना चाहिए। जब ऐसा होगा तभी वे गिरते हुआ और निर्बलों का सहारा बन सकेंगे।

शौक का कोई मोल नहीं होता, लेकिन आज भी गरीब आदमी का लड़का यह देखता है कि दूसरा व्यक्ति साइकिल या मोटरसाइकिल पर जा रहा है और वह पैदल जा रहा है। आपके अपने आँकड़े यह बताते हैं कि आज भी 40 करोड़ जनसंख्या ऐसी है, जिसके पास जुराब और बनियान पहनने तक के लिए पैसे नहीं हैं। क्या आजादी का यही मतलब है? हम सभी का यह धर्म बनता है, खास करके गृह मंत्रालय का यह धर्म बनता है कि वह सबकी सुध ले।

एक बात मैं और कहना चाहता हूँ। यहाँ पर बहुत बड़े-बड़े और जिम्मेदार व्यक्ति बैठे हैं। आज भी समाज की यह दशा है कि एक व्यक्ति गंदगी फैलाता है, एक दूसरा व्यक्ति आता है, वह उस गंदगी को साफ करता है, लेकिन उस गंदगी साफ करने वालों के लिए कहा जाता है कि यह छोटा आदमी है और उसको हीन भावना से देखा जाता है। जो व्यक्ति गंदगी फैलाता है, उसके लिए कहा जाता है कि यह महाजन है, बड़ा आदमी है। आज भी यदि हमारी सोच में कोई फर्क नहीं आया, तो हमारी आजादी का क्या फायदा? अम्बेडकर जी ने सही कहा था कि यह किसी के बस में नहीं है कि कौन कहाँ पर पैदा होता है। यदि जाति कि आधार पर इन्सान को इन्सान नहीं माना जाता और आज भी यदि हम अपनी मानसिकता को नहीं बदल सके, तो इस आजादी का कोई मतलब नहीं है। राजनैतिक आजादी तभी सार्थक होगी जब हम सामाजिक आजादी में समता और बराबरी का अधिकार देंगे।

सर, अंत में मैं आपसे एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ कि शिक्षा के आधार पर हम विशेष तौर पर गरीब लोगों के बच्चों के ऊपर बजट का ज्यादा हिस्सा खर्च करें। जब हम उन्हें मानसिक रूप से सुदृढ़ बनाएंगे, तभी आपका गृह विभाग कुछ कर सकेगा। आज आवश्यकता सोच को बदलने की है। हर इन्सान को हम बराबर समझें, इससे अपराधों में भी गिरावट आएगी और डकैतियों में भी गिरावट आएगी। जब ऐसा होगा तभी हम एक दूसरे को समझ पाएंगे और तभी वास्तव में सभी को समानता का अधिकार प्राप्त हो सकेगा। आपने मुझे बोलने के लिए समय दिया, इसके लिए बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Dr. T.N. Seema. It is her maiden speech.

DR. T.N. SEEMA (Kerala): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, thank you for giving me this opportunity to participate in the discussion on the working of the Ministry of Home Affairs. Sir, I take this opportunity to thank through you, wholeheartedly for the support of this august House not only for this maiden speech but also for my work in the future also. I know about the time constraint. I will confine myself to some of the important issues which are of great concern. ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): It is her maiden speech. I will not disturb her at all. Please don't disturb her.

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Thank you, Sir, I will confine myself to some of the important issues which are of concern to us. I think all of us should be concerned about what is going on in the country now. This Ministry is concerned with the human rights which are enshrined in the Constitution of India and which are guaranteed to every citizen in India. But what is the record of crime? I am not taking any data from outside. I only depend on the report of the Ministry of Home Affairs.

Sir, the Annual Report of the Ministry shows that the rate of crimes in the country rose from 455.7 per one lakh population, in 2006, to 504.5, in 2007, and further, to 515, in 2008. The crimes against women reported an increase of 5.7 percent from 2007 to 2008. Rapes, kidnappings, dowry deaths, tortures, molestation, all have shown a steady increase year after year. Sir, the rate of crimes against children is an alarming data. It has increased by 10 percent between 2007 and 2008, but if we compare the data of 2004 and 2008, it has increased by 56 percent! And the crimes against Scheduled Castes increased by 25 percent between 2004 and 2008. The crimes against Scheduled Tribes have also increased. We know that these are the reported cases only. But there are many unreported cases in different parts of the country too. From April 1, 2009 to December 31, 2009, 1,324 cases of custodial deaths have occurred. India's declining child sex –another crime against women and children – ratio, 927 girls per 1,000 boys, shows that female foeticide is on the increase.

Sir, the communal situation continues to be a matter of great concern in many places. All these data and observations are quoted from the Ministry's Report itself. It is true that the law and order

and tackling the crime is a State subject, but we should show more concern towards it and find out why these crimes have increased, especially against the women and weaker sections. Sir, we have many laws; especially, to curb violence against women or atrocities against Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes, we have many laws, but the enforcement of those laws is very slowly and very ineffectively happening. When atrocities are committed against women and weaker sections, when human rights of citizens are violated, who will protect them? We know that when the victims approach the police, normally, they do not get justice. This is the usual practice. In normal cases, more often, the police fails to register complaints, or even if complaints are registered, the law-enforcement is so much complicated and delayed that the justice is really denied to people. The victims do not get justice. It is not put into practice; we have been experiencing this in many places. Sir, this calls for urgent reforms in our police force to make it more sensitive and responsible to the common people.

Sir, the Ministry of Home Affairs gives funds for modernization, for purchase of equipment, modern weaponry, computerization etcetera. But that is not enough, Sir. What is needed is a change in the mindset of the police force. I am not blaming all of them, all the police people. Maybe, there are many good officials who uphold the law and are helping or supporting the poor people in our villages. But it is the system which is corrupt, which is biased against the poor women, which is biased against SCs/STs and which is biased against the weaker sections. We have come to know some cases in U.P. Many of our hon. Members were reporting here also about the attack of a police person; an SI beat up one Dalit woman named 'Sangeetha' in the last February. So, Sir, the hon. Supreme Court has given a clear-cut direction for implementation of reforms in the police force, but the implementation is very slow. We should strengthen the participation of people in the police through community policing. We have to experiment some innovative projects, some schemes at the local level to ensure the participation of people, poorer sections and weaker sections in the functioning of police at the local level. Sir, I would like to put forward some humble suggestions for the consideration of the Ministry of Home Affairs.

My first point is about the enforcement of the law relating to prevention of human trafficking. We know that thousands of young girls and women are bought and sold across the country and forced into prostitution. There are many cases of women recruited for jobs like domestic servant in foreign

countries, especially in the Gulf countries, ending up in brothels. These poor women have to pay thousands of rupees to the agents for getting a job visa and can't come back because their passports and travel documents are confiscated. The existing law does not have enough teeth to deal with this kind of human trafficking. Now we are using the Immoral Trafficking (Prevention) Act for handling this human trafficking. This law is not enough to tackle or handle different kinds of human trafficking that are taking place in our country. So, there must be some specific law or specific mechanism to control the human trafficking in our country, not only within the country but also outside the country. I urge upon the hon. Minister, through you, Sir, to strengthen the law and make coordinated efforts, along with the Ministry of External Affairs and the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs, to put an end to the sufferings of these poor women who are trapped in these countries, and prevent such cases in future. Now, for controlling human trafficking only the Minister of Women and Child Development coordinates with the Ministry of Home Affairs. We have to coordinate with other Ministries also.

Sir, I know that this House had also discussed the question of honour killings some time ago. I am not repeating that issue. But my request is that honour killing should be considered as a major crime like sati and the crime rate should be included separately in the Ministry's Annual Report. The crime rate is not separately shown in the Annual Report.

Sir, lastly – I am concluding – I would also like to mention an important issue relating to the ongoing National Census which is under the jurisdiction of the Home Ministry. Lakhs of Indian citizens are working in foreign countries to earn a living. It is reported that in the ongoing Census the details of the persons living outside the country will not be recorded. The National Population Register to be created after the Census is supposed to be a comprehensive identity data basis for the citizens to be needed for planning and other Government services. How can we ensure the right of Indian citizens who are temporarily residing or working in other countries to make a living? If their names are not included in the Census, how can we ensure a minimum Indian identity to lakhs of Indians who are working abroad? I would urge upon the hon. Minister, through you, Sir, to rectify this mistake. Please evolve some mechanism to include all these Indians who are working abroad in the National Census data. Thank you very much, Sir, for being so generous to me.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Congratulations Dr. Seema for your good maiden speech. Shri Pyarimohan Mohaptra. You have only five minutes. You have strictly five minutes.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (Orissa): Thank you, Sir. Since so much has been talked about terrorism and naxalism, I would start with one or two small points regarding other activities of the Home Ministry. Due to paucity of time I would just give the points.

Sir, please examine the MCOCA in Maharashtra and other Acts because goondaism is increasing everywhere. Please examine these laws, prepare a model Act and recommend to the State Legislatures for adoption.

The Foreign Contribution Regulation Act should be monitored very carefully. A lot of foreign contribution is falling into wrong hands, bad NGOs and anti-State and anti-social forces; whereas, I am sorry to say, good NGOs, good organizations are being harassed. Please activate the Narcotics Control Bureau. Ganja cultivation is increasing continuously over large tracts in the country and particularly in Naxalite and Maoist infested belts where they are encouraging people to cultivate ganja so that their activities can be funded.

Now I come to Naxalism, Maoism and terrorism, which everyone has referred to. I admire the present Home Minister for his brilliance and clarity. I am a little disappointed. Since July-August, when he indicated his resolve to take it almost as a unified command under the umbrella of the Centre, why has he been vacillating? Whose hand is restraining him? It is not a problem of each individual State. If you start Operation Green Hunt at one place, they will run to another place or State. I am a Leftist by conviction all those who are talking of—‘talk to Naxalites and have peace’, should realize one thing: 20 years back it was a different ball game; today, whether Naxalites or Maoists, 90 percent of them, are lumpen elements who have just joined together and quite a few have gone for employment. They are offering employment for Rs. 1,500 to Rs.2,500 a month, plus whatever food you can get, plus bonus, as part of the loot. These things are all known to the learned Home Minister. I don’t have to repeat all this. So by any kind of vacillation and giving statements, ‘okay, no, no, it is in the realm of the State; no, tomorrow, again the Central has to do something’, I do not know why, suddenly, Mr. Chidambaram, should be losing that clarity, which is the hallmark of his character? It is having a demoralizing effect on the police and the Paramilitary Forces. You have had this Operation Green Hunt recently. Because of the isolated nature of the Operation Green Hunt, there is no joint operation by the States with the Centre overseeing it. That is why it is failing. That is why all these massacres and the police are being massacred. They have no business to be

massacred. Naxals and Maoists, please remember, let us all remember, have now declared a war on the State. It is no longer a civil disorder. Why call it a civil disorder? It is a declared war on the State. Look at all their pamphlets; look at their circulars, look at the way how they do their formations, how they use the Tribals. They are terrorists because they are terrorizing the Tribals into submission. If a village does not submit, they go and chop off the head of someone saying that he is a police informer. That is how they terrorize.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please conclude.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, I will take two-three minutes. Casualties are increasing.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no, take only one minute.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, you gave so much time to people. Shri Malaisamy was given 12 minutes against seven minutes. I am the leader of a party. I don't want to give up my right. I will confine myself to a few suggestions. Modernisation grants have remained static. Static means that they have declined in real terms.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mohapatraji, your time is over.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: I am only going to give some suggestions.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Your time is over. What can I do?
... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: How is it that the other Members have been given five minutes and seven minutes time more, and it is denied in my case?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You are in the 'Others' category. The total time is 40 minutes, and you are entitled to get only four minutes. But you have taken six minutes.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Kindly give him two minutes more.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He is the leader of a party, and that party is ruling that State.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Then, I have no problem.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: Half of the districts of my State are Naxalite and Maoist infested. I would suggest the following measures. Full scale training should be arranged, under the

aegis of the Centre, particularly, the Army, for all the police battalions that are being raised in every State. Intelligence gathering should be done as a joint operation. It is a war; bring Army intelligence also into operation. Finally, please remember that political process has to continue. The BJP here will advise you. You will do the political thing. And, you will advise others. But nobody is sincere. We are asking our party people, down the formations, to continue the development process and political process and use the Panchayati Raj Institutions as well. We are having some success. During the last General Elections, I was the only political leader who went to South Malkangiri. Nobody dared to go there because they said that they would kill anybody who went there. The result is that voting went up by three times. People did come out to vote. So, this is an example. I would suggest sincerity in approach and clarity in approach. Thank you very much.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar. It is his maiden speech.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, while I am very grateful to the Chair for having given me this opportunity of making a maiden speech, I find myself in a very peculiar position of having been referred to by name in this House by Shri Venkaiah Naidu, who opened this debate, before I have ever opened my mouth. And his performance follows that of the hon. Leader of the Opposition, who, on the very day when I took my oath, chose to suggest that I am half a Maoist. Well; I am supposed to recall that half-a-Maoist by a full-fledged * is a compliment of some kind. But I do believe that this * by the Opposition, led by the BJP, but in a curious nexus of the Communist, with the communalists to try and divide the Treasury Benches, needs to be exposed and clarified. For now, we have had, not just once but twice over, attempts by extremely senior people on the Opposition Benches to suggest that we, on the Treasury Benches, are not united and, therefore, they are lending their support. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BALAVANT ALIAS BAL APTE (Maharashtra): Is he a Nominated Member or a Member of the Treasury Benches?

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, is he speaking on behalf of the Congress (I) or as a Nominated Member?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will tell you. He has every right to defend either this side or that side. That is up to him.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: May I offer Dr. Maitreyan the clarification? On the day I was informed that I was nominated, I declared my affiliation to the Congress (I) Party. I am waiting for the Congress (I) Party to give me a place among them. Until then, I am obliged to sit directly opposite you and that is great honour in itself.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): In any case, you have the full freedom to defend either this side or that side, according to what you want.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: At least, once, he should defend this side also.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes, he can defend this side also. It is up to him. Why should we worry?

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman. I might also inform these very senior Members of the House that according to the rules, conventions, traditions and norms of this House, a maiden speech is not interrupted. ... (*Interruptions*)... It is just not interrupted.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Do not interrupt please.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: They are under the impression that I am pretending to be a lady when I long lost my virginity. But the fact of the matter is that this is the first speech I have ever made in this House as a Member of this House. This is the first time I am speaking here as a matter of right and not as a matter of a courtesy extended to a Minister of the Government.

Now, in these circumstances, I need to clarify, especially as these allegations have been leveled against me once by name and once by implication that my position on the issues which are of highest concern to the Minister of Home Affairs, my position is exactly the same as that of the hon. Primes Minister, as described by him in his speech on National Panchayati Raj Day in Vigyan Bhawan on 24th April, 2010. I do not find a single comma, a single semi colon in that which does not reflect exactly what I had wished to say in statements that I had made to the Press before I got the opportunity of speaking in this House.

To prove my point, I seek the indulgence of the House to read, very briefly, from an answer I gave to *The Telegraph* newspaper, who asked me questions about Maoists and I said, "Rajiv Gandhi realized that it was necessary to shift the delivery system from the bureaucracy-technology to empowering people at the grassroots to secure for themselves their entitlements. Rajiv Gandhi clearly

apprehended that if such a participatory development process is not encouraged and exploitative development discouraged, the top-down development process would only increasingly alienate tribal people, thus, paving the way for their felt sense of injustice to be exploited by non-democratic elements who believe in violence and believe also in sabotaging what they see as a bogus democratic process. To forestall such a disaster", I said, "Rajivji gave the nation two instruments far stronger than the AK-47 or the unmanned drone. These were, one, the 73rd Amendment of the Constitution, that is, Panchayati Raj, and the very special provisions for the empowerment of tribal communities through PESA, that is, the Provisions of the Panchayat (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act."

I had also said in another statement after referring to Rajiv Gandhi's two instruments, on being asked what I thought the Government should do, I said, "It should fast-track participative development in conformity with PESA in areas that are not yet under Maoist control. If the Central and State Governments ensure devolution of huge quantities of functions, finances and functionaries to tribal communities for them to administer their lands through Gram Panchayats and Gram Sabhas and, if you deploy security forces on the periphery of the areas that are still with you, you can keep the Maoists out."

If that makes me half a Maoist, I would like to stress that the reason why I could be accused of being only half a Maoist is that the other half of me is Gandhian. I do not believe in violence. I do not believe in violence of the kind that we saw in Gujarat in 2002, nor do I believe in covering up that kind of violence as we have seen happening in the State Government of Gujarat* and the kind of destruction that we saw of the Babri Masjid which unleashed a flood of violence and for which they are not willing to take even the moral responsibility.

I urge upon the Home Minister to bring criminal proceedings against those who have been indicted by the Liberhan Commission. ... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री अनिल माधव दवे (मध्य प्रदेश) : यह कोई तरीका है, जो वीर सावरकर के अपमान की बात कर रहे हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : 1984 में सिखों को मारा, तो उस समय क्या हुआ? आपके नेताओं ने उसका सपोर्ट किया, उसका समर्थन किया ...(**व्यवधान**)... You have agreed if you are half Maoist, become full Maoist. ... (*Interruptions*)... How is it connected with this debate, Sir? Mani Shankar Aiyarji, how is it connected with this? What had happened in 1984 was a Sikh genocide in Delhi, where thousands of Sikhs were massacred. ... (*Interruptions*)... Why do not you say about that? You say about that. ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, come to the subject. ... (*Interruptions*)...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is a national shame. In Capital Delhi thousands of people were massacred. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: ...that maiden speeches cannot be interrupted. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, please conform to the parameters of the discussion on the subject. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Who was the Home Minister at that time? Who was the Prime Minister at that time? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I will explain to the Chair, but only after this debate. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What were you doing at that time? ... *(Interruptions)*... They were sleeping and people were weeping. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, he is abusing his nomination. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Rajasthan): Shri S.B. Chavan was the Home Minister at that time. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, we are discussing the working of the Ministry of Home Affairs. Please conform to the parameters of the subject. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, for having restored. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARYANASAMY: Why are they jumping up on Babri Masjid? ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Let us discuss Babri Masjid a number of times. ... *(Interruptions)*... Let us discuss Babri Masjid for ten days; let us discuss Babri Masjid forever. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): There is no time. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Let us discuss it. Who was the Prime Minister? Who was the Home Minister? Was he sleeping? ... *(Interruptions)*... Let us discuss Babri. Let us discuss Babri, Babri and Babri. ... *(Interruptions)*... No other work. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, let us have a debate on Babri Masjid. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seats. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes, under what rule?

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, in the morning, there was a lot of agitation though the Member did not take the name of a Minister. He only referred that one Minister has been alleged to have given money for buying the arms. There was so much anger in the House, and everybody was shouting. Now, he is making allegations, without substantiating it, without giving a prior notice and moving a motion. Mr. Minister, you were the one who asked for a motion. Why didn't you ask him for a motion? ... *(Interruptions)*... He is making an allegation. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, please. ... *(Interruptions)*... We are already running out of time. Therefore, please, Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, stick to the subject. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : और कोई काम है बावरी वगैर को छोड़कर ... **(व्यवधान)**... We are in 1992, Sir. ... *(Interruptions)*... go back to 1984. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश) : इनको सावरकर जी का अपमान करने का क्या हक है? ... **(व्यवधान)**...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, you see the record and expunge it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is an irrelevant thing. It is a wild allegation. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will do that. ... *(Interruptions)*... I will go through the record. If there is anything objectionable, I will remove it. ... *(Interruptions)*... I will do that. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा : ये देशभक्तों का अपमान करने वाले हैं। ... **(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, expunge all that. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, it not a question of un parliamentary. ... *(Interruptions)*... It has no relevance with it. ... *(Interruptions)*... Irrelevant things cannot be said in the House. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will go through the record. ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Venkaiahji, I will go through the record. If there is any un parliamentary word, I will remove it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani, you stick to the subject. Why do you go back to the old stories? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, he has made a very serious allegation against Shri Arun Jaitley, the Leader of the Opposition that *. He used these words.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): And, the Chair says, 'if it is unparliamentary I would look into it'!

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, I did not hear that.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: This is an allegation which is unprecedented. ... *(Interruptions)*... What kind of precedence do you want? He makes an allegation and the Chair says, 'if it is unparliamentary, I will look into it'! Please expunge it and allow the proceedings. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Hon. Members, please sit down. ... *(Interruptions)*... Let me understand first. ... *(Interruptions)*... Do not do like that. Let me understand. Has he made an allegation against the hon. LoP?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes, yes, Sir.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, he has made allegation against the Leader of the Opposition. How can he do that? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He should apologize to the House. There is no way.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: He should apologize to the House. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He cannot make such an irresponsible and obnoxious allegations. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): What is this? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is a very serious matter. If you do not want to run the House, then do not run it. Do you want to create trouble in the House by being in the ruling party? You may do it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will go through the record and I will get it expunged. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It has never, never happened like this. Never has any allegation been made against the Leader of the Opposition. Please go through the records. ... *(Interruptions)*...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

He made the allegation against the Leader of the Opposition personally. We only referred to his interview given in the Indian Express. We did not make any allegations against Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar. ... *(Interruptions)*... He said, * ! What is this?

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: He should apologize to the House.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, adjourn the House, go through the record and then give a ruling. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. ... *(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats.

Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, you should know that if you have to level an allegation against a Minister, or for the matter against hon. LoP, or even against a Member of this House, you should give prior intimation to that Member. That is the rule. But, unfortunately, I regret, I did not take cognizance of that. Therefore, if any such allegation is there, that is expunged. I would go through the record.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, he should apologize. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He is such a senior Member, yet he is making such an allegation.

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : ऐसा नहीं चलेगा, ऐसा नहीं चलेगा। ... *(व्यवधान)*...

श्री अनिल माधव दवे : सॉरी बोलना जरूरी है। ... *(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please sit down, I am on my legs, sit down please. ... *(Interruptions)*... I already have said that if there is any allegation against the hon. LoP, it will be expunged; it is expunged.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Number two, it is unbecoming of a Member to make such a casual remark. ... *(Interruptions)*... Please. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sit down, please. ... *(Interruptions)*... What do you want? ... *(Interruptions)*... It will be expunged. ... *(Interruptions)*... I have my observation. ... *(Interruptions)*... What more do you want? ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, we are very thankful to you. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, इस तरह से बात करना, यू सिट डाउन, अपमान है, यह शब्द वापस लेना चाहिए ... *(व्यवधान)*...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen. Number one, I will expunge it if it is there. Number two, I have made my observation. ... *(Interruptions)*... What more do you want not? ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : ऐसा मत कीजिए प्लीज़ ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, one more thing is left. If any Member abuses the other Member, he should apologize. Expunction is your right, apology is his responsibility. ... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, you did your duty. ... *(Interruptions)*... He is a senior Member. ... *(Interruptions)*... He has been in the other House. ... *(Interruptions)*... He was a Minister also. ... *(Interruptions)*... He knows the procedure of the House. ... *(Interruptions)*... He knows about the conduct of business in the House. ... *(Interruptions)*... If he does not know, please give him the rule book to read. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, none of us. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given my observation. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा : सुनने की जरूरत नहीं है ...*(व्यवधान)*... बोलने की जरूरत नहीं है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given my observation. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: None of us, neither the Leader of the Opposition nor me has made any allegation against Mani Shankar Aiyarji. ... *(Interruptions)*... We have made a criticism and he has also a right to criticize us. But, he cannot make such a serious allegation about the State and about the Leader of the Opposition. He must have the decency to express regrets. ... *(Interruptions)*... He has to. Otherwise, we cannot go on like this. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have made your point. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: He should apologize. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, please proceed. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir,
...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Let us hear him what he says. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती माया सिंह : माफी मांगे और अपने शब्दों को विदझा करें, उसके बाद हम लोग बोलने देंगे ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am bound by any direction that is given to by the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will follow any disciplinary measure imposed on me by the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... I request you to kindly go through my remarks and see whether the parody of what I actually said that is being made by the Members from the Opposition is true or. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have already said that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I will follow the instructions given by. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, you adjourn the House and see the record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given my observation. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is to be done? ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPUTLLA: Apology. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): What is the problem? ...*(Interruptions)*... I have made my observation. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Mani Shankar, what do you say? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYR: Sir, may I resume my remarks? ...*(Interruptions)*... I will leave it to the Chair to restore discipline in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... I proceed with what I have to say. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the only approach, what the Treasury Benches are urging upon the Home Minister and upon the Government of India, is what I have told the 'Rajiv Gandhi approach'. I have full faith that as the hon. Minister for Home Affairs in a junior ministerial capacity at the time when I was serving as a civil servant in the Prime Minister's office was as deeply involved in the drafting and preparation of what eventually came to be called the 73rd amendment of the Constitution. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen. Will you please listen? ... *(Interruptions)*... What is to be done? ... *(Interruptions)*... Please listen. Will you please listen? ... *(Interruptions)*... Will you please listen. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, he should apologize. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen. If the Member has made some remarks against the LoP or even any other Member I have already said it is to be expunged and I have also made my observations on that. Now, I want to ask Najmaji. ... *(Interruptions)*... Please. ... *(Interruptions)*... Najmaji was in the Chair for 17 years, I want to ask Najmaji, what more can the Chair do? ... *(Interruptions)*... One more question. ... *(Interruptions)*... Can the Chair ask any Member to apologize as soon as he takes a different position? That is what I am saying. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: I have done it many times. I have directed many, many times. Many times Members have apologized. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He can do if he wants to. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Chairman, Sir. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, he should apologize or he should withdraw. He should sit down. He does not deserve to be in this House. ... *(Interruptions)*... No, Sir, he should apologize first.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, may I be allowed to exercise my right to. ... *(Interruptions)*... Why should a Member like me. ... *(Interruptions)*... Under what rule has a Member to make an apology? Please ask them to cite the rule. ... *(Interruptions)*... I don't know why she wants me to apologize. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): One of you please speak. Mr. Venkaiahji, please speak.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we have seen that the Chair has called Shrimati Najma Heptulla, former Deputy Chairman to the Chair. So, she came there. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Once and for all you put an end to this. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani, please. ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Mani, please. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, I have a right to speak in this House. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He said it. You go through the record. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I accept that. ... *(Interruptions)*... I accept the decision of the Chair. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Mani, please. ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, the House cannot be run like this. ... *(Interruptions)*... You adjourn the House. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD (Karnataka): Sir, let him allow to speak. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I demand the Chair to look at the record. ... *(Interruptions)*... I demand that the Chair, actually, study the points that I have made. I demand that every single word be examined by the Chair and, on that basis, if you wish to expunge anything I have absolutely no objection. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MAYA SINGH: Sir, we will not allow him. ... *(Interruptions)*... He should apologize first. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, I have already accepted that whatever the direction from the Chair, I shall abide by that. ... *(Interruptions)*... I will obey any injunction from the Chair. ... *(Interruptions)*... But, I will not allow this kind of distortion in the House. ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House is adjourned to meet at eleven of the clock tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at one minute past seven of the clock
till eleven of the clock on Tuesday, the 4th May, 2010.