

RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 17th August, 1983/26
 Sravana, 1905 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock.
 Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 321.
 The Member is not here.

*321. [The questioner (Shri B. Krishna Mohan) was absent. For answer vide col. 31 *infra*]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 322.
 Mr. Jagannath Rao Joshi.

Candidates sponsored by the Central
 Government for admission to medical
 colleges

*322. SHRI JAGANNATHRAO
 JOSHI:†

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR:

Will the Minister of HEALTH AND
 FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to
 state:

(a) the names of the students, both
 Indian and foreign, sponsored by the
 Central Government for admission to
 various medical colleges of the country
 during each of the last three years and
 the current year;

(b) the percentage of marks secured
 by each candidate in his/her qualifying
 examination; and

†The question was actually asked on
 the floor of the House by Shri Jagannath-
 rao Joshi.

(c) the total number of applications re-
 ceived under each category for nomina-
 tion during the same period?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE
 MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY
 WELFARE (MISS KUMUDBEN M.
 JOSHI): (a) to (c) Students are sponsor-
 ed for admission to various medical col-
 leges by different Agencies. Particulars
 of such students, percentage of marks se-
 cured, total number of applications, etc.
 are therefore, not available. Sponsored
 candidates are, however, given admission
 in Medical institutions only if they ful-
 fill the eligibility criteria laid down by
 the Medical Council of India.

श्री जगन्नाथ राव जोशी : सभापति
 महोदय, जवाब के रूप में अभी अभी जो
 बताया गया है उसमें से हाथ कुछ लगता
 नहीं।

श्री सभापति : किस का ?

श्री जगन्नाथराव जोशी : क्योंकि
 मेरा सवाल साफ था कि the names of
 the students, both Indian and foreign,
 sponsored by the Central Government.
 केन्द्रीय सरकार के बारे में मैंने पूछा
 था और जवाब दिया है कि देयर आर
 डिफरेंट एजेंसीज। अब यह डिफरेंट
 एजेंसीज प्राइवेट हैं या गवर्नमेंट की हैं,
 प्राविशियल गवर्नमेंट की हैं या सेंट्रल
 गवर्नमेंट की हैं यह पता नहीं। जब वह
 सवाल साफ था कि केन्द्रीय सरकार की
 तरफ से कितने विद्यार्थी स्पांसर होते हैं
 तो बताना चाहिये था। क्योंकि खुले रूप

से 15 जून के "इंडिया टु-डे" में यह बात बतायी गयी है, जिसका उल्लेख मैं यहां करना चाहता हूं :

"In 1980, it began sponsoring foreigners for various Government medical colleges after charging 40,000 dollars equivalent to four lakhs of rupees. Under this scheme, over 30 students have been admitted to various colleges. If the Government can charge money for the seats in the name of importing equipment, why can't we?"

केन्द्रीय सरकार कैपिटेशन फीस के खिलाफ है और उन्होंने खुले रूप से आरोप लगाया है कि केन्द्रीय सरकार विदेशी विद्यार्थियों को मेडिकल कालेजों में भर्ती करने के लिये सिफारिश करती है पैसा लेकर और पैसे की मात्रा भी उन्होंने दी है 40 हजार डालर इक्विवैलेंट टु 4 लाख रुपया और ऐसे 30 विद्यार्थी लिये गये। जब कि एक अखबार की जानकारी है और मैंने पूछा था कि केन्द्रीय सरकार ने ऐसे कितने विद्यार्थी लिये और इसके बाद भी यदि केन्द्रीय सरकार की तरफ से माननीय मंत्री जो बतायें कि वह जानते नहीं हैं और कहें कि इसके लिये अलग-अलग एजेंसियां हैं तो हम क्या करें। मैं आपसे प्रार्थना करता हूं कि इसका ठीक से जवाब दिलवाया जाय।

श्री सभापति : इस को मंगवा कर अगर टेबिल पर रख दिया जाय तो अच्छा होगा। आप के पास केन्द्रीय सरकार का रेकार्ड तो होगा। 40 हजार डालर आता है तो उसका रेकार्ड होगा। जैसा जोशी साहब ने कहा उसके आंकड़े आप के पास कहीं न कहीं तो होने चाहिए दफ्तर में।

श्री जगन्नाथराव जोशी : : केन्द्रीय सरकार की तरफ से हुआ या नहीं हुआ और यदि हुआ तो कितना हुआ, नाम

छोड़ दिये जायं, लेकिन आंकड़े तो बता दीजिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shankaranand, you try and find out.

स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्री

(श्री बी० शंकरानन्द) : मैं कुछ जवाब दूं इस के बारे में ?

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. You can certainly answer.

श्री बी० शंकरानन्द : सवाल क्या है आप को देखना चाहिए।

श्री सभापति : जवाब क्या है ?

श्री बी० शंकरानन्द : : सवाल देखने के बाद जवाब मिल जायगा। नेम्स आफ दि स्टूडेंट्स, यह सवाल है। आप आंकड़े मांगते हैं तो मैं एक ही सेटेंस में दे देता हूं। आप ने मांगा है विदेशी छात्रों के नाम, अंक और प्रार्थना पत्र आदि और मैंने बताया कि यह नहीं हो सकता। यह सब हम नहीं करते।

श्री जगन्नाथराव जोशी : यदि इनके अख्तियार में नहीं आता तो यह सवाल आपने स्वीकार क्यों किया, आप विदेश मंत्रालय को सौंप देते ?

श्री सभापति : इसमें आपने ज्यादा पूछ लिया है, लेकिन (सी) में आप पूछ सकते हैं।

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Mr. Chairman, Sir,...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I may be wrong.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I don't say you are wrong, Sir. You please listen to me and then say where the right is and where the wrong is. For allocating seats the Health Ministry alone does not call for applications. Applications are called for by the Secretary... (Interruptions) Ministry of Defence, New Delhi, Director-General, Border Security Force,

New Delhi, Director, SSB, Cabinet Secretariat, New Delhi, the Commandant, CRP, New Delhi, External Affairs Ministry, Ministry of Rehabilitation, New Delhi, and the Finance Ministry under the Colombo Plan... (*Interruptions*) How do I know the names of applicants and the number of applications?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have mentioned so many departments. Whom to ask now?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: If the Health Ministry should reply to everything about the other Ministries, I leave it to you, Sir. (*Interruptions*)

श्री जगन्नाथराव जोशी : सरकार एक है, अलग-अलग विभाग होने के बावजूद भी इनको बताना चाहिए ।

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: In that way, the entire questions today may be asked from the Health Ministry because "Sarkar ek hai". (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know your difficulty. There are different departments which receive these applications. But, surely, you can collect the information.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: It is very difficult. I will tell you. Chairman may kindly appreciate my problem. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGANNATHRAO JOSHI: He can collect the information and place it on the Table of the House. If he wants to evade the question . . .

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I do not want to evade the question. I would like to face the question. (*Interruptions*) Then all the questions may be put to the Health Ministry if "Sarkar ek hai". (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not think the answer is reasonable. You can collect the information.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: If I understand, the hon. Member's question

is whether the Government is charging a capitation fee of forty thousand dollars...

SHRI JAGANNATHRAO JOSHI: That was not my question. That was read out from India Today. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: We do not bring out the paper. You know it. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: They won't believe any newspaper as you do. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND): In these days it is very difficult to believe or disbelieve anything. (*Interruptions*) The applications are called for by the External Affairs Ministry, Defence Ministry and the Education Ministry. These are the Ministries which call for the applications and they process everything. They know the number of applications and...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not want the answer to it today. See if you can collect the information and put it on the Table of the House.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Sir, if I understand correctly the question says: the names, the number of applicants. There may be thousands of applications. How do I know?

MR. CHAIRMAN: If thousands were applying and paying forty thousand dollars, you will be rolling in money. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Sir, we are not charging anything, leave alone forty thousand dollars. We are opposed to the capitation fee itself.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You can take time and give an assurance, saying: if I can collect the information I will put it on the Table. I think that would be fair.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I do not want to give an assurance. I find it very difficult to do it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If I were to address a letter to all the Ministries, they would

supply the information. If you write to them, they would supply the information.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The question is about the names of students, both Indians and foreigners, sponsored by the Central Government for admission to various medical colleges of the country during each of the last 3 years and the current year.

HON. MEMBERS: What is difficult about it?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: If you want the number of applicants, I will give that. That assurance I can give.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You can give the number college-wise.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Numbers I will give.

श्री सादली मोहन निगम : नाम दे नहीं रहे और इसमें हो चपला है ।

श्री जगन्नाथराव जोशी : सभापति जी, यह जो सवाल है यह इंडियन और फारेन स्टुडेंट्स के सपोसर्ड बाई द सेन्ट्रल गवर्नमेंट, के बारे में है । यह कहते हैं हजार सपोसर्ड हुये ।

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: If the Members are interested in knowing the numbers only, perhaps the things would be very easy. I would straightaway give the numbers. The details of the M.B.B.S. seats allocated to various categories of students in 1982-83 is like this: 10 seats under the Colombo Plan scholars, 45 seats under the general cultural scholars, two seats to refugees from Tibet, 3 seats to Bhuttanese students, 66 seats to self-financing students, through the Ministry of External Affairs, 41 seats to Defence Services, 6 seats to Border Security Force, 7 seats to Indian Missions abroad, 3 seats to repatriates, one seat to S.S.P. Cabinet Secretariat and 22 seats to other deserving categories.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you collect the data....

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: You wanted the numbers and I have given the numbers.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Percentage of marks you cannot give.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Then there are States where there are no medical colleges and we allocate seats to these States and Union Territories. It is like this. Tripura-20, Manipur-16, Mizoram-11, Meghalaya-9, Chandigarh-4, Sikkim-16, Lakshadweep-4, Andaman and Nicobar Islands-10, Arunachal Pradesh-18, Nagaland-14, Dadra and Nagar Haveli-1. Total is 123 under these categories.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, Mr. Minister, it is not an unmanageable figure.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I have given the figures. I have given the number of seats allocated to various categories. It is very difficult for me to give the number of applicants because they receive the applications. I do not receive the applications.

श्री जगन्नाथराव जोशी : सभापति जी, अगर मंत्री महोदय पहले ही यह जानकारी दे देते तो अच्छा होता । मेरा दूसरा सवाल इसी आधार पर है । मेरे पास एक जानकारी है । मलेशिया की एक लड़की जो महावीर कालेज में पढ़ती थी उसको 94 अंक मिले, लेकिन उसको एडमिशन नहीं मिला । उसी कालेज में पढ़ने वाले दूसरे विद्यार्थियों को जिनको 60 या 67 अंक मिले थे उनको एडमिशन मिला । इसलिए मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या आप इसकी जानकारी कराकर जांच कराएंगे ताकि आगे चल कर इस प्रकार से भेदभाव न बरता जा सके ? क्या आपकी तरफ से इतना आश्वासन मिलेगा ?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Sir, there should not be any discrimination. I do agree with the suggestion of the hon.

Member. And if that is a case, let me find out and see for myself.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Give him the details.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, my name is in the list. You cannot help it, unfortunately.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Unfortunately.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: You cannot escape me today, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Unfortunately.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, the hon. Minister said that the eligibility laid down by the Medical Council is maintained. May I know what that eligibility is? And referring to the main question, since it asked about the candidates sponsored by the Central Government, am I right in presuming that this is kept for the purpose of providing admission to candidates from States where there are no medical college facilities available so that the best students of those areas at least should get some chance of receiving medical education? But instead of that, what is happening is that important people, VIPs, those who know how to pull the strings are making use of the facility. Here, in this very journal, there is a list of candidates given admission in Karnataka Medical Colleges. And this list contains a number of tell-tale instances. Since the hon. Chairman wanted some details we have one case of a candidate who got 56.6 per cent marks whereas my impression is that 91 per cent is the eligibility according to this report—you kindly confirm it or contradict it the candidate who got 56.6 per cent marks he has been given admission because he is the son of the Prime Minister's Security Officer. There is a second one which got 70 per cent marks. * * *

*Number three is with 56.6 per cent marks; he was the son of the then Chief Minister of Uttar Pradesh. Number four is another candidate whose candidature

was recommended by the Chief Minister of Karnataka, Shri Gundu Rao, following a request by Shri Karunakaran, Kerala Chief Minister. Another is the son of the Deputy Chief Minister of Kerala who had got 52 per cent marks. He too is admitted. Another is a girl with 54 per cent marks the daughter of the President of the Karnataka Pradesh Congress Committee. Sir, there is a whole list. I do not want to waste the time of the House. Now, this list . . . (Interruptions) raises the question whether the Health Ministry has any say in the matter of such discretionary admissions in various State colleges. If there is a say, are you sticking to the eligibility criterion which you have already mentioned? If not, people would be right in inferring that it is just a happy hunting ground for VIPs, for important politicians, for people who can pull wires in the top echelons of our Government. I would like you to clarify the position in this because ultimately the people's faith is eroded if such things come to light and they are not contradicted or the Minister takes shelter behind petty explanations.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your question is over.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Sir, perhaps, the hon. Member in his zeal to tell something to the House has mixed up things.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What are the mixed up things.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, . . .

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Please have the patience.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am also losing patience.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Sir the main question deals with the seats allocated by the Government. All these things which the hon. Members have asked, do they come under the category for which

he is demanding the information? No. The allegations in the garb of a question are totally without any foundation and are baseless because we have not made allocation of these seats.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Mr. Chairman, Sir, will you kindly bear with me for a minute? May I know if the Ministers of the Central Government have sponsored the cases of their sons or relations or other people close to them and got them admitted? May I know if the Health Ministry is in the picture and whether he will find out how they got admissions? If it is not through the Central Government then through which agency was it and whether there is any check on that also?

श्रीमती सरोज खापड़ें : नाम बतलाइये ।

डा० भाई महावीर : नाम ही बतलाइये, इसी से तो आपको तकलीफ हो रही है ।

The trouble is that I am giving the names, well not the exact names but I am giving the references. If the Chairman allows me, I will place it all on the Table of the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Which is the paper?

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, it is India Today, June 15, 1981.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: Sir, the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs' son is only nine years old. I do not know how he could have got the admission. (Interruptions). * * *

श्री लाडली मोहन निगम : सभापति महोदय, * * *

* * *

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Mr. Siddhartha Rai is the name. He is related to the Union Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs, * * * and was recommended by the Minister.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: Now he says that he is related to the Minister. This is violation of all Rules of Business. They must satisfy you first before making the allegations.

MR. CHAIRMAN: These newspapers publish anything. (Interruptions).

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Let my hon. friend file a breach of privilege against this paper, that will bring out all the facts.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: And you will have the opportunity of making any kind of baseless allegations.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: If it is baseless then you have the opportunity to take action against the paper . . . (Interruptions)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Let him clarify. Why should there be confusion?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Mr. Chairman, Sir, may I tell the House...

SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS: Sir, he said that the Karnataka Congress Committee's President's daughter got admission. He has no daughter. I do not know how he got this news.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not think that there is any question.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: No, no. I must answer this (Interruptions).

श्री सभापति : आप जरा बैठ जाइये । आप मिनिस्टर को जवाब देने का मौका ही नहीं दे रहे हैं ।

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: May I clarify that piece of information, Sir? (Interruptions) Miss K. M. Geetha got 54 per cent marks and she was admitted to the Medical College as the State Government nominee for 1981-82. * * *

She is the daughter of Mr. K. M. Mal-lana, President of the Karnataka Pradesh Congress Committee (I).

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I hope you will allow me to answer?

MR. CHAIRMAN: If our own party will allow you to go on?

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : सभापति महोदय,

श्री सभापति : आप ही की कमी थी, बाकी सब था। रामेश्वर सिंह जी आप बैठ जाइये। अभी आपका टाइम नहीं आया : (व्यवधान)...

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : सत्तारूढ़ दल के लोग उपद्रव कर रहे हैं।

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: There are 106 medical colleges in the country; they are affiliated to various universities...

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: And 100 Ministers.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Don't interject.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND.... which have got their own rules of admissions to medical colleges and there are about 12,000 admissions made every year into these various medical colleges. And out of 12,000 the number allocated by the Central Government—I have just now given—is very meagre. Allegations made in the garb of a question are totally baseless and I think the Chair should not have allowed such allegations without prior notice; because though the Chair is quite competent to allow any supplementary. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now that you have asked for my opinion and have questioned my attitude in the House . . .

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I have not questioned the authority of the Chair; let it not be interpreted that way please.

MR. CHAIRMAN: . . . Otherwise we get into a long . . .

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I have not questioned the authority of the Chair. I can say I still feel, the allegations should not have been made in the garb of a question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have not understood; they have got hold of a newspaper item; there are names mentioned in it . . .

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I have not allocated; how such a question can be replied.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There could be a short reply that they have been admitted by outside agencies; Government had no hand in it.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ: They are all private agencies and have their own admissions.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Has the Central Government no say in these State admissions? Will the Central Government be a silent spectator to all these hanky-panky things that are happening? Has the Central Government no responsibility in this matter?

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : सभापति जी, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी का ध्यान इस ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ कि जहाँ तक केन्द्रीय सरकार के द्वारा स्लैट अलॉटमेंट की बात है जिसकी सूचना सरकार की फाइल में मौजूद थी और उसके मौजूद रहते हुए भी मन्त्री जी ने करीब करीब 15 मिनट सिर्फ इस बात की इवेड करने में लगाए। मन्त्री जी ने पाँच विभागों का विश्लेषण किया है उन विभागों में कभी आपने यह चिन्ता की कि जो सीटें आप देते हैं वे सीटें सही जिन लोगों के लिए अलॉटमेंट होना चाहिये उनको मिली या नहीं एक सवाल हमारा यह है। तीन वर्ष

का इसमें हिस्सा है । इन तीन वर्षों में क्या कभी आपने इस बात को चेक-अप किया है? एक बात और मैं जानना चाहता हूँ । आपने इस डिपार्टमेंट की बात तो बकला दी लेकिन आपके विभाग से आपने स्वयं अपने काल में कुछ सीटों का अलाटमेंट किया है या नहीं ? दूसरा सवाल जो अभी उत्पन्न हुआ कि मेडिकल कॉलेजों में पैसे ले कर के एडमिशन कराए जाते हैं । जिस कैपिटेशन फीस को आप रोकना चाहते हैं, रोकने का प्रयास किया है, लेकिन आप यह कहें कि यह जो इण्डिया टुडे में निकला है वह एडमिशन वहाँ पर इसी मार्ग पर नहीं हुआ है मैं आपसे इसमें इतना हो जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह एडमिशन ठीक है या नहीं ? अगर आप ठीक कहते हैं तब तो कोई बात नहीं है और अगर ठीक नहीं कहते हैं * * * मैं इतना हो जानना चाहता हूँ ।

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Sir, I have said earlier that no candidate sponsored by the Central Government, the Health Ministry, is charged capitation fee. Now, there are medical colleges. . .

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : फिर आप सदन को गुमराह कर रहे हैं और सभापति जो को भी गुमराह करने का प्रयास कर रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: You cannot mislead the Chairman. Sir, he is making allegations that I am misleading the Chairman.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE: They simply get up and start interrupting. Let him answer.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I do not think the hon. Member is right.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shankaranand, you must ignore a few things in this House as I do myself.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : जवाब तो इनको देना चाहिए ।

श्री सभापति : उन्होंने कहा कि खाली एलोगेशन है ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैंने एलोगेशन किया ही नहीं है ।

श्री सभापति : आपने यह कहा है, सिवाय इसके और कुछ आपने नहीं कहा कि अगर स्टेट्स में ये ज्यादातियाँ हो रही हैं तो आपकी इसमें कोई जिम्मेदारी है कि नहीं । यह पूछा है आपने । उन्होंने कहा कि जितने सरकारी ढाखिले हुए हैं उसमें कैपिटेशन फीस नहीं ली जाती है और ये जो बाकी बाहर ले लेते हैं उसकी जिम्मेदारी हमपर नहीं है । इतना सिम्पल तो जवाब था, मगर आप उसको बना रहे हैं ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : जवाब सिम्पल नहीं है, भाग भाग का जवाब है । इनके मेडिकल कॉलेज की जिम्मेदारी है इस चीज को देखने की, इसी लिए उन्होंने कैपिटेशन फीस समाप्त की है । इनकी जिम्मेदारी है कि मेरीटोरियस स्टूडेंट्स को पहले नम्बर पर लें । जैसे कि माननीय जोशी जी ने कहा कि 94 फीसदो पर एक विदेशी लड़के का एडमिशन नहीं हुआ लेकिन उसी कॉलेज में एक 56 प्रतिशत वाले का हो गया इनके साथ मेडिकल काउंसिल है, इसलिए लुक इंटू करने की इनकी जिम्मेदारी है । इसीलिए मैंने पूछा है कि अगर यह गलत है.. (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति : वह मंजूर नहीं करते, क्योंकि कालेजज जो है ये सब स्टेट्स के तहत हैं ।

(Interruptions)

श्रीमती सरोज खापड़ें : श्रीमन्, आज अभी कवेश्वर आदर के, दमियान डा० महावीर जी ने जो एलीगेशन लगाया है कि जो अखबार में निकला है, मैगजीन में निकला है***

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Sir, let her ask this after question Hour. No point of order should be entertained during of question Hour.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: It arises out of this question.

(Interruptions)

श्री सभापति : मैं उनसे पूछना चाहता हूँ कि अगर अखबार में यह लिख दिया जाय कि आज सबरे कल्प नाथ राय जी ने कत्ल किया है तो उनको खड़े होकर डिनाई करने की जरूरत नहीं है। (व्यवधान) अखबार की हूर बात जो होती है, झूठ है तो उसमें कन्ट्राडिक्ट करने की जरूरत नहीं होती। (व्यवधान)

डा० रफीक जकरीया : यह जो "इंडिया टुडे" में आया है, जब डा० भाई महावीर यहाँ कहते हैं तो यह हिन्दुस्तान के हर अखबार में आ जाता है... (व्यवधान) इसलिए आपको, अगर यह झूठ है तो... (व्यवधान) निकाल देना चाहिए... (व्यवधान) क्योंकि पूरे हिन्दुस्तान में यह फैल जायेगा ।

(Interruptions)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: It is his relation, not his son.

(Interruptions)

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: What do you mean by relation? (Interruptions) First, you said, son. When this was challenged, you changed it to relation. What to you mean by relation? (Interruptions)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, may I explain? (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Bhai Mahavir, it requires a ruling from me. All the allegations which have been made about the hon. Minister will be put before me for consideration, whether they should go into the record or not; and also, if I find there has been a mistake, after consulting the hon. Minister, I shall expunge the whole lot of it.

(Interruptions)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, I submit to your ruling. What has been alleged is this. I said, there is a long list. As far as I remember, I said, on the basis of that list—I have got my notes also here—he is related to the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs.

But Sir, . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not think, Dr. Bhai Mahavir. . .

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: When they said it could not be, I read that from the magazine, the paragraph as it was.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Bhai Mahavir, I do not think that anything that you read from the newspaper can be taken as the gospel truth.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Certainly not, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will look into this very carefully. The whole of the script should be placed before me. This sort of a thing will not be allowed.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: May I know if you will verify whether that I said was correct or not?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have already ruled that I will look into it and then get the explanation. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: That side need not make the noise.

श्रीमती सरोज खापडे : सभापति जी, डा० भाई महावीर ने इतने सवाल पूछे हैं, इनको बिठाइये । . . . (व्यवधान) दूसरे सदस्यों को भी सवाल पूछने दीजिए । केवल यही बोल रहे हैं ।

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Because my name was there in the list. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Why are you worried?

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Let the other Members ask the question.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: You are all interested in this. That is why you are making all this noise. The question was very simple. If there are any mistakes in the report, they should be contradicted, that is what I asked the hon. Minister to do.

श्री सभापति : डा० जकरीया जरा खामोशी इधर से कराइये जिससे कि काम चले ।

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: They should keep quiet so that I do not have to shout. I am asking my question and I would like to be replied by the Minister and not by 'to-be Ministers'. (*Interruptions*).

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: He must take back his words. This is a reflection on our side, on our party. (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has not blamed anybody.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: This type of hitting below the belt you must stop.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: It is the Question Hour. You take objection at 12 O'clock.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why are you writing down? Nothing would go into the record. (*Interruptions*) The moment I stand, please put down your pen. There is to be no further record except what comes from my mouth.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: That is why I was requesting . . . (*Interruptions*).

My question was, I can understand if somebody . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Again you have started.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: That sentence will be deleted. (*Interruptions*) I will not allow any irrelevant things to go on the record now.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: I am asking a question regarding the admission of both Indian and foreign students. The hon. Minister has said that there are 1200 admissions given all over the country in 106 medical colleges every year. The first question that was asked is, how much you have spent or whether you charge Rs. 40,000 (in terms of dollars) from foreign students? The Minister denied the charge. Now I would like to know how much you spend over every student when he completes his medical course and he becomes a doctor, whether there is any condition attached that after completion of the medical course the students will serve the people of India and will not go out of the country, by which the question of brain-train is always a matter for discussion. Is there any such condition, any bond and how much do you spend after every student?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Though the question is not at all related to the main question . . .

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Let the Chair decide whether it is relevant or not.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you are giving the answer, do not talk of 'irrelevance'. If you want to talk of irrelevance, don't give the answer.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Mr. Chairman, if that is the ruling, then there is no answer for the question that has been asked.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I also rule that this question does not arise.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: I am very sorry for the ignorance of the hon. Minister. He does not know how the department, over which he presides, runs. I am sorry for his ignorance.

(Interruptions)

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: The Chair has ruled. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think the position has become so surcharged that I think Question No. 323 might soothe the Members.

Catering Facilities on Golconda and Krishna Express Trains

*323. SHRI K.V.R.S. BALA SUBBA RAO: Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the South Central Railway have decided to withdraw catering facilities on the Golconda express and Krishna express trains;

(b) whether Government are aware of the hardship, which passengers will be subjected to; and

(c) what are the reasons for not introducing A.C. Chair Car on Brindawan express of Southern Railway?

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI A.B.A. GHANI KHAN CHAUDHURI): (a) No, Sir.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) It is already provided on Brindawan Express.

SHRI K.V.R.S. BALA SUBBA RAO: In part (c) of the question, I had asked "what are the reasons for not introducing A.C. Chair Car in Golconda Express like Brindawan Express on the Southern Railway?". It has not been properly put here.

SHRI A.B.A. GHANI KHAN CHAUDHURI: Normally, on long distance trains we introduce AC Chair Cars. But because of shortage of coaches and all that, we do not provide these in all the trains. With regard to this particular train, I will see that AC Chair Car is joined to it.

SHRI K.V.R.S. BALA SUBBA RAO: Thank you. Is there any extension proposal for Golconda Express?

(No reply).

SHRI K. C. PANT: Sir, a highly productive question. A very fruitful question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you please repeat your question?

SHRI K.V.R.S. BALA SUBBA RAO: My second question is, is there an extension proposal for Golconda Express towards....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, he wants extension from Golconda to somewhere which I could not hear.

SHRI A.B.A. GHANI KHAN CHAUDHURI: Well, I do not have any such proposal. I do not know; I will look into it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Reddy. First the Golconda people.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: Sir, this question is in connection with the railway of Andhra Pradesh. In this connection, I would like to know from the Minister that there are trains from Secunderabad to New Delhi and vice versa. There are two fast trains—the AP Express and Karnataka Express which go via Secunderabad. The AP Express starts from here at 2.10. I think there is a regular train in the night—i.e. Dakshin Express in which there is no AC. If AC