

Manihari Ghat—Sakri Gali Section under the North-Eastern Railway.

**DEMAND FOR A VOLUNTARY STATEMENT BY THE MINISTER OF ENERGY IN REGARD TO S.Q. 142
REPLIED ON 19-7-82—Contd**

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : श्रीमन, अभी जो बात चल रही थी उसका क्या हुआ क्योंकि इस मामले में मैं समझता हूँ कि यह चैंबर का दायित्व है कि वह इस बात की व्यवस्था करें कि अगर ऐश्वोरेस दिया गया है हाउस को तो उसको पूरा किया जाए। इस मामले में उनका वक्तव्य क्या था ?

श्री उपसभापति : आपने सुना नहीं चेंबरमैन साहब ने क्या कहा ?

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : उन्होंने अपनी सज्जनता में स्वयं ही ऐश्वोरेस दे दिया। उनकी सज्जनता इस कारण थी कि हाउस में... (व्यवधान)

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: If the Minister is a gentleman, what are we? We are also gentlemen. It was his assurance that he will apologise.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Chairman has already said that . . .

SHRI B. D. KHOBRAGADE: Leader of the House is here; let him give an assurance.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Chairman gave a half-hearted certificate to that side and condemnation to this side . . .

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, no condemnation.

SHRI KALYAN ROY: Mr. Ghani Khan Chaudhuri replied that he did not surrender any money to the Finance Ministry. When Shri Dinesh Goswami and Mr. Bagaitkar and Mr. Kulkarni read out extensively from

the *Hindu* saying that more than Rs. 200 crores had been returned on account of national thermal power station regarding installation of power houses then he flabbergasted said that he will enquire and if what he said was wrong, would come to the House and apologise. That was on account of the 15 minutes' barrage from this side. I have been told by the Secretary-General that they wrote a letter about the assurance.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are repeating the same thing.

SHRI KALYAN ROY: What can I do? What about his obligation. (Interruptions)

SHRI B. D. KHOBRAGADE: Sir, we want a statement from the hon. Minister, today. (Interruptions).

SHRI KRISHNA CHANDRA PANT (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, the Chairman said that the Minister would come forward to make a statement. While he was going, he said 'I shall tell him'. That will end the controversy; if this has been recorded. That is all. I have heard him saying 'I shall tell him'. If he has said so, then, the matter ends.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: We are also gentlemen.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): If the hon. Minister has said that this information is correct, he will come to the House and correct himself.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: And apologise.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: He had not said, at what point of time, he will come. A question of privilege or a question of contempt of the House, therefore, does not arise. It will depend upon him, what time he will take to collect the information. It will not depend upon you. It will depend upon him, what time he will take to rectify, to collect. (Interruptions).

[Shri Pranab Mukherjee]

There is a set procedure in the House. There is an Assurances Committee, the Committee on Government Assurances of this House. It will be clearly treated as an assurance and this Committee is competent enough to ask the Ministry 'An assurance has been made on the floor of the House by the hon. Minister and this assurance has not yet been fulfilled'. I do not know what is the discussion we are having here. If it is a question of an assurance, the Assurances Committee is there to take care of it. The House is not to take care of it. Neither can you direct me. So many assurances are given day in and day out on the floor of the House. They are being treated in a set manner. There is a set practice. And there is nothing unusual and nothing abnormal about it. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, on a point of order. In regard to what the Leader of the House has said, to the first part of it, I have no objection. If it had been a simple assurance, what he said would have been quite correct. But there is also the other part of the statement that he will apologise to the House. We are only drawing the attention of the Chairman, as to what happened to that part. Nothing has happened.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: That is also an assurance. If he has said it, it will be done.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: That is all right. Say it will be done. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KALYAN ROY: Sir, it involves my fundamental right and I am not going to barter it away. Mr. Mukherjee may be the Leader of the House today. Tomorrow, he may be sitting on this side. I do not know. The question is, Mr. Ghani Khan Chaudhuri has been found wrong and your Department, your Secretariat...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Assurances will remain. Ministers may change.

SHRI KALYAN ROY: It is not a question of right and wrong. Your Secretary-General had written to him to come and make a statement. He has been avoiding this. (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, the point has been completely answered by the Leader of the House. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KALYAN ROY: He has made the confusion worse confounded. Sir, Mr. Ghani Khan Chaudhuri should be directed to make a statement. Otherwise, I tell you, we will not allow him to reply to any questions. If he does not come forward and makes a statement at least in the next Session, we will not allow him to reply to any question; we will not allow him till he unconditionally apologises. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. SOURENDRA BHATTACHARJEE (West Bengal): Sir, it is not a question of an assurance of that kind, mentioned by the Leader of the House. It is a question of a wrong answer, a wrong statement made by the hon. Minister. (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you go on treating everything as an assurance, then, I am afraid, no assurances can be given by Ministers nor can they be fulfilled. You have to bear with that. Now, we go to the next item. I would request hon. Members... (*Interruptions*).

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, I am on a different point.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have a very busy schedule today. We have two Calling-Attention Motions. Then, there is Private Members' Business. There is no Government Business.

ness today. I would request hon. Members. Let us proceed with the Business. Otherwise, we will have to sit very late. That will be a problem. I have allowed a large number of Special Mentions. Therefore, I would like to say, at this stage, that I will not allow any other matter to be raised here, apart from the Special Mentions. Otherwise, there will be two types of Mentions; one, with my permission and the other, without my permission.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, it is not any type of Special Mention I am making.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point?

डा० भाई महावीर : मैंने एक पत्र सभापति महोदय को लिखा है। जैसा सवाल अभी आपके सामने आया, इसी से मिलता जुलता सवाल में उठाना चाहता हूँ। श्रीमन्, मैं एक मिनट का समय लूंगा।

21 जुलाई 1982 को पी० जी० आई० चण्डीगढ़ के बारे में सवालों का जवाब देते हुए यहां पर स्वास्थ्य मंत्री ने एक बयान दिया। उस बयान पर मैंने आपत्ति की कि शायद यह तथ्यों के अनुरूप नहीं है। इस पर चेयरमैन साहब ने जो रिमार्क दिया महोदय, वह मैं पढ़कर सुनाना चाहता हूँ :

“Dr. Mahavir, will you sit down? He has cleared these points. One, there are uniform rules. Second, there has been no ad hoc appointments and appointments have been made according to the rules. Then he said that you are wrong, that there was no post of Deputy Director. There was one which was in abeyance and not filled. He has advertised and got it filled under the rules. I think it is a very clear reply.”

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your letter has been received in our office at 11.20 this morning. So, we cannot take any action now. (Interruptions). That is all right.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: In a subsequent answer on the 11th....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, please sit down. That is over now. (Interruptions). No, no.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: In a subsequent answer on the 11th of August, he has concealed that. (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. (Interruptions). Don't record it.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: *

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है।

श्रीमन्, आप रूल 17 और रूल 101 दोनों को निकालिये। इसमें है कि यदि कोई विधेयक सदन में आता है तो मम्बर को यह अधिार है कि उसमें संशोधन दे कि इसको सलेक्ट कमेटी में भेजा जाय। यह रूल 17 कहता है। रूल 101 कहता है कि उस पर डिस्कशन की बात जब अमेंडमेंट पर आती है जैसा आर्डर है उस रूप में होगा। तो मैंने 10-12 दिन पहले सभापति जी को लिखकर दिया लेकिन अभी तक इस बारे में कोई उत्तर उनकी तरफ से नहीं आया है। आज आखिरी दिन है। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह जो अमेंडमेंट दिया जाता है डिबेट के पहले यह अमेंडमेंट मूव होता है। तो उस पर बोलने की बात कब आती है। क्योंकि क्लोज बाई क्लोज अमेंडमेंट पर जो संकेड स्टेज आती है तो उस समय इस पर बोलने की बात आती है। लेकिन सलेक्ट कमेटी के लिए डिबेट में पहले यह मूव किया जाता है। इसलिए तरीका जो है, इस अमेंडमेंट पर, मनि-

*Not recorded.

स्टर के पहले, जवाब देने से पहले, मूवर उस पर बोले कि इसे सलेक्ट कमेटी में क्यों भेजा जाय और वह पहले इसको मूव करता है जैसा परसों इंडस्ट्रियल डिस्प्यूट एक्ट में था। स्टेट्यूटरी रेजोल्यूशन में ऐसी बात है। तो मैं इस पर सफाई चाहता हूँ कि यह जो तरीका है इसकी सफाई न होने से हम सदस्यों के अधिकारों का खात्मा होता है और सदन की गरिमा बढ़ने के बजाय घटती है। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि अग्रेडमेंट सलेक्ट कमेटी में भेजने के बारे में जो देता है उसका बोलने का समय कब आता है, यह इसमें नहीं लिखा हुआ है।

श्री उपसभापति : ठीक है आपको जवाब मिल जायेगा।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : इसको रिवाज्ड करके लिख दिया जाय। इसके बिना सदन अधिकार में....

श्री उपसभापति : बता दिया जायेगा।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : 12 बजे वह भाग जाते हैं।

श्री उपसभापति : आप अपनी बात कहिए ऐसा

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : आप इस पर....

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए, आपको जवाब मिल जायेगा।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : आप इस पर निर्णय करिए।

श्री उपसभापति : निर्णय हो जायेगा। आपको जवाब मिल जायेगा।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव (बिहार) : श्रीमन, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार की तरफ से सदन में कोई जवाब आये और मेम्बर चैलेंज करे उस जवाब के बारे में और कहे कि यह जवाब सही नहीं है तो इस सदन में कौन सी ऐसी प्रक्रिया है जिससे सत्य का पता लगाया जाये। सरकार कहे कि हम ठीक है और मेम्बर कहे कि मैं ठीक हूँ ..

श्री उपसभापति : प्रक्रिया है इसके लिए।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : तो ऐसी हालत में....

श्री उपसभापति : ठीक है, रज करिए। इसी जो प्रक्रिया है उसके आधार पर इसको देखा जायेगा।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि...

श्री उपसभापति : जानने के लिए चेम्बर में आइये। आपको बता दिया जायेगा। यहां समय नहीं है।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : चेम्बर में बता देंगे और यहां क्यों नहीं बता देंगे।

श्री उपसभापति : आप वहां आइये इसका जवाब आपको मिल जायेगा।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : वहां पर ...

श्री उपसभापति : आप लिखकर भेज दीजिए आपको जवाब मिल जायेगा।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : चेम्बर में ऐसी कौन सी नियम की बात है जो वहां पर इसका जवाब दिया जा सकता है और यहां पर इसका जवाब नहीं दिया जा सकता।

श्री उपसभापति : सदन में इतना समय नहीं है (व्यवधान)

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : सदन में यह उठाया... (व्यवधान) कोई रास्ता निकालें।

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये। आप लिख कर भेज दीजिए (व्यवधान) कालिंग अटेशन, श्री जसवंत सिंह। (व्यवधान)

श्री भा० दे० खोबरागडे : मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है।

श्री उपसभापति : कब तक प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर चलेगा। (व्यवधान)

श्री भा० दे० खोबरागडे : मेरा कहना यह है कि प्रधान मंत्री अमरीका की यात्रा पर....

श्री उपसभापति : वह अब कैसे आएगा, यह मामला जब आएगा तब आप चलाइये : इस पर बहुत बहस हो चुकी है (व्यवधान) Don't record him.

This is an unnecessary point of order.

श्री भा० दे० खोबरागडे : *

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये,

श्री भा० दे० खोबरागडे *

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवानी : सदन के नेता यहां पर हैं। मैं खाली एक स्पष्टीकरण चाहूंगा। किसी अखबार में यह रिपोर्ट है कि काश्मीर के जो मंत्री हैं वे 15 अगस्त के सलामी कार्यक्रमों में भाग नहीं लेंगे, वायकाट करेंगे। अगर यह बात सही है तो बहुत गम्भीर है। दूसरा यह है कि अखबार में आया है कि वहां के मुख्य मंत्री बीमार हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति : मैं आपसे कहूंगा यह अखबार की बात है इसलिए आप अनावश्यक रूप से इसे मत उठाइये इसका इजाजत मैं नहीं देता हूं।

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवानी : सरकार को इसकी जानकारी होगी, अगर ऐसा उनका निर्णय है तो बहुत गम्भीर बात है।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, I do not allow this. This is all news-paper-based.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Perhaps Government would be having the correct information.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaswant Singh.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Has the Government any information? He can enlighten the House. Why allow some confusion?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Perhaps take your seat. You have done your business. You have raised the point. Let us not go on rumours. Yes, Mr. Jaswant Singh.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: If the Government has any information... (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't record anybody. Only Mr. Jaswant Singh will go on record. Mr. Jaswant Singh, please read the notice.

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा *

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये, आप सुनते हैं नहीं। (व्यवधान) बैठ जाइये। नहीं लिखा जाएगा। आ जी, मुझे अफसोस है कि आप सुनते नहीं, मैंने यह कहा कि जो बात हो वह लिख कर भेजे तो उसका जवाब आपके पास चला जाएगा। आप रिकार्ड देख लीजिए लेकिन आपने सुना नहीं (व्यवधान) आप सदन का टाइम इतना ले रहे हैं। अब बैठ जाइये आप। (व्यवधान)

*Not recorded.

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव :*

श्री उपसभापति : आप दूर चले जाइये, वोट क्लब पर। (व्यवधान)

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव :*

श्री उपसभापति : श्री जसवंत सिंह जी।

**CALLING ATTENTION TO A
MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC
IMPORTANCE—LATEST SITUATION
IN WEST ASIA WITH PARTICULAR
REFERENCE TO ISRAELI ACTION
IN LEBANON.**

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Rajasthan): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I call the attention of the Minister of External Affairs to the latest situation in West Asia with particular reference to the Israeli action in Lebanon.

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the grave anxiety of Hon'ble Members regarding the continuing serious situation in Lebanon is now almost universally shared. Several Resolutions unanimously adopted by the Security Council, vigorous efforts by the Non-aligned Movement, the Arab Foreign Ministers, statements by several world leaders, have all fallen on deaf ears. Israel's unabashed and brutal aggression continues. Air, land and sea forces keep on shelling West Beirut killing innocent civilians and destroying property—all in callous disregard of basic humanitarian principles, forgetting what the Jewish people themselves suffered not more than a few decades ago.

Hon'ble Members have no doubt been seeing daily reports about negotiations and possible solutions. Recently a Six Point Plan was drawn up by an Arab League Committee consisting of Syria, Lebanon, PLO, Kuwait, Algeria and Saudi Arabia. The Six Points are:

*Not recorded.

(i) To exert continued and sustained efforts to abide by the ceasefire;

(ii) The Palestine Liberation Organisation announces its decision to move its armed forces from Beirut. The safeguards and guarantees for this move as well as the safety of the refugee camps will be determined in an agreement between the Lebanese Government and the PLO in Beirut;

(iii) To work towards lifting the siege of the city of Beirut and its suburbs by securing the withdrawal of Israeli forces;

(iv) The Lebanese Government is to take all effective measures to ensure the security and safety of the inhabitants of the city of Beirut and its suburbs, including the Palestinian refugee camps;

(v) The participation of the international forces in the task of establishing security and safety of Beirut and its suburbs; and

(vi) The Arab States are to undertake the necessary political action to assist Lebanon in order to attain the full implementation of Security Council Resolution 508 (1982) and 509 (1982).

The attitude of the United States would be crucial in determining the success of the Jeddah Six-Point Plan. As Hon'ble Members know, Ambassador Habib of the United States has been carrying on negotiations on somewhat parallel lines. The centre-point of his efforts would seem to be the initial withdrawal of the PLO from Lebanon to other Arab countries and thereafter the withdrawal of Israeli forces from Lebanese territory. As far as disposition of PLO forces is concerned it is not for Israel to impose its wishes. This must be through agreement between the PLO and Lebanon and concerned Arab countries.