#### RAJYA SABHA

1

Tuesday, the 1st September, 1981/10th Bhadra, 1903 (SaJca)

The House met at eleven of the clock.

[Mr. Deputy Chairman In the Chair]

BE. CALLING ATTENTION MOTION REGARDING THE REPORTED IRRIGULARITIES IN THE MATTER OF GANTING INCOME-TAX EXEMPTIONS TO CERTAIN TRUSTS IN MAHARASHTRA AND MALDISTRD3UTION OF ESSENTIAL COMMODITIES LIKE CEMENT IN THAT STATE (Interruptions)

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Deputy Chairman, we are pained to see your conduct....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We shall go to the questions. (Interruptions).

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Shameless action. No sitting, no sitting. What a shameless action it is. You made a certain announcement in the House that today we will discuss it. But you have changed that decision. How can you change that decision? You have lowered the dignity of this House. Mr. Deputy Chairman, you have lowered the dignity of the House; you have lowered the dignity of the House. From the Chair you made the annoucement that the Antulay matter would be discussed here today. What are you here for? You vacate the Chair... (Interruptions) You vacate the Chair... (Interruptions)

*MR*. DEPUTY CHAUiMAN: I am ready to hea<sub>r</sub> all of you.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: We do not want to hear you.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Gujarat): Sir, give notice of a motion for the suspension of the Question Hour.

Wl R6—1.

to certain Trusts

*in Maharashtra* MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You hear me, Mr. Advani. I will hear all of you one by one.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: At the moment it is Question Hour. I have moved for the suspension of the Question Hour. I have given formal notice... (Interruptions)

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: MR. Hon. Members are aware that after the Ouestion Hour yesterday when seve ral Members wanted to discuss the matter of alleged malpractices in the distribution of cement in Maharash tra. I had announced that this matter could be discussed through a Calling Attention Notice on September, 1, 1981, that is, today. When I went through the papers later on, I dis covered that the hon. Chairman had already admitted a Calling Attention Notice tabled by Shri Kalpnath Rai and others regarding the power crisis for 1st September, 1981

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No, no ...

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: This is a very lame excuse. We do not want to hear. This is a lame excuse. We do not want to hear.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will hear all of you; I will give time for you. Just have patience for one minute.

I was also informed by the Leader of the House that at short notice Government may not be able to res pond adequately to the said Calling Attention Notice... *(Interruptions)* regarding cement distribution in Maharashtra. In view of the above factors,-----

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL (Guja rat): You have agreed -----

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:.. .1 decided to fix the Calling Attention re-

#### 3 Calling Attention re. [RAJYA SABHA] essential commodities Income-tax exemptions to certain & Maldistribution of in Maha

#### [Mr. Deputy Chairman]

garding cement distribution in Maharashtra for 2 September, 1981. There is therefore no question of any breach of faith as alleged by Shri Advani in his letter received by me this morning.

SHRINAGESHWARPRASADSHAHI:YoumadetheannouncementafterconsultingtheLeaderoftheHouse(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will hear you

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: You made the announce ment after consulting the Leader of House and Shri Sita Ram Kesri. How can you

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Advani.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Sir... (*Interruptions*) I have been called. I do not yield. Sir, you have called me.

SHRI RAMANAND YADAV (Bihar): This is Question Hour. You must take up questions.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: This will be corruption ftour. We shall discuss the corruption of Mr. Antulay. This is not Question Hour.

SHRI RAMANAND YADAV: Because you come from my... (Interruptions)

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: No Question Hour. This is corruption hour.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am hearing Mr. Advani.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, under rule 267 which »mys that "any Member may, with tin consent of the Chairman, move....." (Interruption\*)

## to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

SHRI RAMANAND YADAV: Why have you allowed him? (Interruptions). Under what rule have you allowed him? (Interruptions) Question Hour cannot be suspended. (In. terruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir .....

SHRI RAMANAND YADAV: After the Question Hour anybody can raise this ... (Interruptions) Under what rule have you allowed Mr. Advani? *(Interruptions)* 

MR. DEPUTY CBAIRMAN: Let me hear him. He wants my permission to move a motion for the suspension of a certain rule. (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Under rule 267, any Member may \_\_\_\_\_ (Inter ruptions)

SHRI M. R. KRISHNA (Andhra Pradesh): This is very wrong . . . (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Under rule 267 he is seeking my consent to move a motion for the suspension of a rule \_\_\_\_(Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: He does not know the rules. Why are you replying to him? *(Interruptions)* 

SHRI PATTIAM R/V JAN (Kerala): Sit down. (Interruptions)

श्री रामानन्द यादव : यह मेरा राईट है क्व चन पछने का। मेरा नाम लिस्ट में है (व्यवधान) श्री नागेश्वर प्रसाद शाही : हम एसे नहीं चलने देंगे (व्यवधान)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Anjr Member may with the; consent of the Chairman move that any rule may be suspended.... (Interruptions)

#### 5 *Calling Attention* re. [1 SEP. 1981] Income-tax exemptions & **Maldistribution** o/

. SHRI J. K. JAIN (Madhya Pradesh) : That shows that the consent of the Chair should be there. Then only he can move. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not moving\*. He is seeking my consent to move.

<sup>1</sup> SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am seeking his consent and why I am seeking his consent, I would like to explain. I entirely agree that rule 267 is an extraordinary rule. Ordinarily I would be the last person to seek suspension of Question Hour.

SHRI J. K. JAIN: You are the first man tod v. Why do you say you are the ) t nan? *(Interruptions)* 

MR. Di:; CHAIRMAN: Order, please.

SHRI LA' k. ADVANI: Yesterday in this House many Members expressed concern at the corruption that was going on in Maharashtra in the matter of distribution of essential commodities like cement, industrial alcohol and all these tilings, and the manner in which the Income-tax Department—I am very happy that Mr. "Venkataraman, the Finance Minister, is here; I am sure he must be aware of the fact . . . (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Yester day after all of us had expressed our concern about it, Mr. Kesri .....

SHRI J. K. JAIN: Have you permitted him to make a statement?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

SHRI J. K. JAIN: Have-you given him permission? You have not given him permission. Ask him to sit down\* (Interruptions) Ask him to sit down. He is making a speech. (Interruptions) essential commodities to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Sita Ram Kesri crossed over to this side... (Interruptions)

SHRI J. K. JAIN: Why is he speaking? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:

I am hearing him on this limited point \_\_\_\_(Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Otherwise there will be no business in the House. (Interruptions)

SHRI J. K. JAIN: Sir ..... (Inter ruptions)

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Don't be a bull in a china shop. *(Interruptions)* 

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Sita Ram Kesri, Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs, walked over to this side (Interruptions)

## भी महेन्द्र लोहन सिंध (बिहार) : क्वेश्चन ग्रावर इतना कीमती ग्रावर है इसको क्यों बरबाद कर रहे हैं।(क्यबधान)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am hearing him. Yes, go on. (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I cannot go on. This must stop. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. R. KRISHNA: Sir, you are setting up a wrong precedent. There won't be any end to it. *(Interruptions)* 

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whether consent can be given or not, that is the only limited point. (Interruptions)

#### Calling Attention re. [RAJYA SABHA] essential conmoditita 7 Income-tar exemptions & Maldistribution of

SHRI M. R. KRISHNA: After the Question Hour, you can allow Mr. Advani.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am hearing Mr. Advani on this limited point whether consent should be granted to suspend the rule or not. That is the limited point. Mr. Advani, please confine your observations to this limited point. Don't go to other matters. (Interruptions) Let us hear him.

SHRI M. R. KRISHNA: This is a wrong' precedent which is being set up. This has never happened in the past.

# श्वी महेन्द्र मोहन मिश्र : उपसभापति जी, क्वेश्चन ग्रावर को सस्पेंड मत कीजिये इसको क्यों बरबाद कर रहे हैं (व्यवधान) देखिये आप एक नयी परिपाटी बना रहे हैं। (व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us hear him first.

SHRI M. R. KRISHNA: This is a very extraordinary step you are taking ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. This is a limited point, whether consent can be grant ed or not. (Interruptions) May I appeal to the honourable Members to have patience? A procedural matter lias been raised by Shri Advani. He wants to seek my consent

SHRI J. K. JAIN: But no speech.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a moment. He is seeking my permission to move a motion. He is not moving a motion as yet. He is just seeking my consent and he is stating the grounds why I should give my consent. So let me hear him. That is the point.

# S}8tU£ mvpao oj in Maharashtra

SHRI RAMANAND YADAV: On what subject is he seeking your permission? There is no motion before the House. A motion must be there before the House:.

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: MR Please read the rule, rule 267. You can raise your point after listening to him.

Yes Mr Advani.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Now. Sir. I am not going to yield to anyone unless I have made the point ....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You limit yourself to the grounds under which you seek my consent.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI; I confine myself only to the fact why this kind of an extraordinary suspension \3 called for ....

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Under which rule?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am referring to rule 267. I may read it out for the benefit of Mr. Salve:

"Any Member may, with the consent of the Chairman, move that any rule may be suspended in its application to a particular motion before the Council and if the motion is carried the rule in question shall be suspended for the time being,"

Yesterday what happened in the House is today known to the world. This House wanted to discuss the question of Mr. Antulay's corruption immediately ... (Interruption)

श्रीमती सरीव आपडें (महाराष्ट्र) : सदन की कार्यवाही क्या झांपेजीशन की विहम्स के ऊपर चलने वाली है ....

थी मनुमाई पटेल : . . . कोई स्प्रिंग लगा है क्योंकि जसे ही यहां खडे होते है बसे ही ये बड़े होते हैं . . . (व्यवसल) झाप सनिये तो सही ।

9 Calling Attention re. [1 SEP. 1981] essential commoditie Income-tax exemptions to certa & Maldistribution of in Ma

भोमती सराज चापडें: कौन सारूल गरपेंड करना बाहते हो ... (व्यवधान) यह तरीका नहीं है ग्रापका?

श्री मनुमाई पटेसः उन्होने कोट किया है ग्रव वह भी समझ में न ग्राये... (व्यवधान)

# भ्वीमती सरोव खापडें: हम तो भ्रापसे पूछना चाहते हैं कि कौन से कल को सर्पेंड करना चाहते हो . . . ।

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Because we wanted to discuss it immediately, Kesri, the Minister of State for Mr. Parliamentary Affairs, walks over to the Opposition, comes to me and says are willing, the Government has we no objection in considering this "We do not want to issue. He said: hide anything". I greatly appreciat After all he must have heard ed it. what Mrs. Gandhi said the other day while addressing officers of the Cen Bureau of Investigation tral and anti-corruption agencies. She said that 'if there is any unanimity on anything, it is in regard to inflation and corruption. Both are increasing and both are eating into the vitals af our society. There is no doubt that (Interruptions). at various levels

AN HON. MEMBER: He goes on quoting without coming to the subject.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am not going to quote. After that....

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI (Maharashtra): She is against corruption among opposition parties. She has already permitted her own party people to practise corruption.

# to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: After what Shri Kesri suggested to me, I consulted my opposition colleagues... (Interruption). I consulted my op position colleagues and we all agreed that if a calling attention notice is admitted on this particular issue, we can-----(Interruptions).

भीमती सरोभ सापर्डः उपसभापति जी, इनको नवेम्यन प्रावर के बाट में प्रलाठ करियेग(,,, (भावधान) व्यव्यन प्रावर पूरा होने दीजिये ... (म्यस्राम)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Mr. Deputy Chairman\_\_\_\_

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I have not completed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You come to the point.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I will confine myself only to the point. Suddenly what happened is that in the evening Mr. Antulay is reported to have met Mr. Pranab Mukherjee\_\_\_\_

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: He should speak only on the rule.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: He is speaking in support of his point... (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I have not completed. Let Mr. Salve sit down... (Interruptions) I am not yielding to Mr. Salve... (Interruptions).

AN HON. MEMBER: Mr. Salve should sit down. What about Mr. Salve's corruption?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Salve, you should be a crusader against corruption ... *(Interruptions).* For the first time in the history of Rajya Sabha, an agreement between the Government and the opposition, a

#### 11 Calling Attention re. [RAJYA SABHA] essential commodities Income-tax exemptions to certai & Maldistribution of in Mah

[Shri Lai K. Advani] solemn agreement between them that the calling attention will be taken la-day and which was solemnly announced by the Chair, has been given a go by. Befoind our back, between Shri Pranab Mukherjee and Mr. Antulay it has been scuttled. If Shri Antulay has anything to do with it, he is guilty of contempt of the House. Therefore, it was because of this unprecedented situation that I would like to ask that no matter be taken up in this House unless it. is agreed that we discuss the Calling Attention on Mr. Antulay's corruption.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE) : While seeking suspension of rule 267 . . .

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is seeking consent of the Chair under that rule.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE: On that I am not going to say because it is for you to give consent and it is for the House to decide whether any particular rule should be suspended or not Regarding the factual part of the matter I would like to clarify what Mr. Advani has said. I am not denying that Mr. Sitaram Kesri, Minister of State in the Department of Parliamentary Affairs discussed with Mr. Advani and they readily agreed I would say that it will be taken up in the form of a Calling Attention which will be admitted and it was mentioned by yourself that it will be taken up today. It is a matter of record. I am not denying that . . .

AN HON. MEMBER: Did you meet Mr. Antulay.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE: Yes, I met Mr. Antulay. If I am to reply and to clarify the position, I mean, the Government, the Government has to know from the Chief Minister of the State concerned the facts about it.

## to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

#### SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE: "... and we found that it was just not possible from our side to respond to the Calling-Attention Motion because certain facts had to be ascertained from the State Therefore, Sir, we sough\* Government. extension of time, one day's time, for this. (Interruptions). There is no use disturbing Please have the patience to hear me. me Now, Sir, Mr. Chairman, in his wisdom has allowed this. It is not for the first time this has happened that whenever a Calling-Attention Motion is allowed to which the Government has to react, if the Government can react instantaneously, they do so and if they require some time, the Chair has always given the time and it is nobody's case that we are not going to discuss this matter. Only I wanted to have extension of the time and the Chair has kindly agreed to that. The Deputy found that the Chairman has Chairman already admitted one Calling-Attention. But I am not going into the technicalities of the thing. What I am thinking now and what I appeal to the Chair is that it is just not possible for the Government to react to the Calling-Attention notice today for want of certain facts which have to be ascertained and information has to be collected from the State Government and, for that, I require time and this is our case. In regard to the suspension. . k (Interruptions) .. .and other matters, I have mentioned that it is for you to give the consent, it is for you to decide. But, Sir, for the first time in my twelve years' life in the Rajya Sabha, I am finding that the Private Members are opposing the Question Hour. This really is a pity. (Interruptions).

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I must have my time now. (Interruptions).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Sir, he has made a statement . . .

#### 13 Calling Attention re. [1 SEP. 1981] Income-tax exemptions & Maldistribution of

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has made certain clarifications. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: ... and you have given another explanation and now, Sir, I think there is a contradiction. (Interruptions)

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Mr. Deputy Chairman. Sir, I want to remind you of one thing. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just wait. Yes, Mr. Salve.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, now you have to give me the time. (Interruptions)

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Sir, I want to remind you of one thing.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE; Sir, I am on a limited question; i am on the limited question of procedure. *(Interruptions)*. Sir, Mr. Advani seems to  $b_e$  so anxious about this matter. The Leader of the Hous<sub>e</sub> ha<sub>s</sub> already dealt with it. I think what he ha<sub>3</sub> asked for is going to be in terms of Rule 267.

SHRI JAGANNATHRAO JOSHI (Delhi): You can move a resolution or a motion.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE; I have heard you and you should have the decency  $t_0$  hear me. *(Interruptions).* 

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL; You can move a Motion. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh); You can move a Motion. (Interruptions).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE; Sir, what I want to submit is a matter of procedure. Sir, a very grave impropriety-has been committed so far  $a_s$  Rule 267 is concerned. But it is with your consent only that a Rule  $ha_s$  to be waived and the relevant Rule is, Rule 38, which says:

#### essential commoamea 8}8JU£ utvpao 0% in Maharashtra

"Unless the Chairman otherwise directs, the first hour of every sitting shall be available for the asking and answering of questions."

Therefore, unless the Chairman otherwise directs . . . (Interruptions)

SOME HON. MEMBERS; No, no.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: A very grave impropriety has been committed. It is a complete and blatant violation of the procedure and it is a complete disrespect shown to this House. *(Interruptions)* I would like to submit to you that it is only for seeking your consent or direction that thi<sub>s</sub> Rule 38 has been made. So far, Sir, 25 minutes have gone by and we have not been able to put the questions at all (Interruptions). My respectful submission to you is that unles<sub>s</sub> you direct otherwise in terms of Rule 38, we should immediately proceed with the Question Hour, *(lit' terruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Shahi.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI; Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir,

जिस तरह से यह घटना हई है... 1 (व्यवधान) में इसी पर बोल रहा हूं।

SHRI J. K. JAIN: It is very clear now. You should not allow him. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am giving a chance to everybody.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Sir, I am speaking on this particular point.

#### MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAI SHAHI: I am drawing your attentioi to one thing, and I am reminding you

#### 15 Calling Attention re. [RAJYA SABHA] essential commodities Income-tax exemptions to certain & Maldistribution of in Maha

[Shri Nageshwar Prasad Shahi] of one thing, that ray friend, the Leader of the House, has said that the Government has found certain difficulties in collecting the facts with regard to this Calling-Attention Motion.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, is it germane to the issue?

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Sir, this is what he has said. Yoi: were here at 4 p.m. yesterday. I was on my legs to make the special mention. Even at that time the Government was not ready with facts. and therefore, the Government should have sought cooperation of the Opposition . . .

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: If it wanted more time.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI; ... and your permission to change the announcement made by you. But till 4 p.m. yesterday this plea was not made that the Government was not ready and no request was made to you to postpone that item Therefore, the only inference that we can draw is that this is a deliberate move or the part of the Government at the instance of Mr. Antulay to debar the House from discussing that issue today. This is *H* breach of trust and I think that the dignity of the House has been lowered by this action of the Government. Therefore, we feel that the Question Hour should be suspended and this unprecedented event should he discussed first.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Ramanand Yadav.

भी रामानन्त थावव : उपनमाध्यक्ष जी, पहली बात तो मरो यह कहनी है कि साप ने प्राड्याको जीको यह इजाजत दे जार कि वह नोगन मुव करें

भी उपसपापति : यह मैंने कहां कहा।

to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

## भी रामानन्द धादवः नहीं कहा गलत है?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Motion has not been moved by him...

SHRI RAMANAND YADAV: He has moved it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. How can you say that?

श्री रामानन्द वादवः वड़ा भ्रच्छा किया जो ग्राप ने परमीणन नहीं दी। मैं बताना चाहता हूं कि कभी भी संसद के इतिहास में ऐसा नहीं हुआ है कि यह सबेष्ट्रजन आवर सस्पेंड हुआ हो। स्वेष्ट्रजन छावर इतना इंगार्टेट है....

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh) : The Question Hour is already being suspended.

श्री रामानन्द यादवः क्वेण्चन झावर इतना इंपार्टेंट है कि इस में सरकार का भी पैसालगाह और हम खोगों ने भी इस को लिगे लेवर की है। इस में हमारा क्वेण्चन भी आपने वाला है और उस में में इटरेस्टइं । बाडवानी जी जैसे शादमी श्रीर ऐते बन्भवी संसद सदस्य इस क्वेश्चन झायर को सम्पेंड करने की दान करते है नामले लगना है कि आप पालिया बैटरी फार्य ग्राफ गवनेप्रेंट में विषयाग नहीं रखते व्योंकि क्वेण्चन जावर ही ऐसा मोक। है कि जिसमें हर आदमी कुछ न कुछ पूछता है बार ऐसा कर के जनता की सेवा कर लेता है जनता की भावनायें हाउस के सामने रख देता है और सरकार का उनका जवाब देने का मौका मिलताहे और रारकार से कुछ इंफार्थे इन मिल जाती है । उपनभापति जी, इस क्वेभ्चन आवर के सस्पेंगन की इजाजत आप को नहीं देनी चाहिये।

17 Calling Attention re. [1 SEP. 1981] Income-tax exemptions & Maldistribution of

दूसरा बात मुझ यह कहना हाक झाडवाजी जी ने कोई लिखित मोशन हाउस के सामने नहीं रखा हे....

जी लाल कुष्ण साडवानीः जव कॅसट होगी तब देंगे। कंसट मिलगी तो फार्मसी मूब करेंगे।

भी रामलब यादवः ठीक है, मोमन प्राने पर प्राप विचार करेंगे। ग्राप देंगे तो सोवेंगे तत्कास ऐसा मोमन नहीं है कि ग्राप विचार करें मौर निर्णय दें दे ग्राप के मन मुताबिक इस हाउस में फांगन करने वाले हम सब लोग है, सब का जैयर है इस में, हम लोगों का भी ग्रार प्राप लोगों काभी ग्रीर प्रयरभाप चाहें कि सारी बात आप के मन के मुताबिक हो जाये तो ऐसा नहीं होगा कभी भी। इस हाउस में बहुमत के याधार पर सारी वाते तय होंगी ग्रीर हाउस के मूड को भी देखना चाहिये कि हाउस इस में जन को स्वीकार करने के मूड में है या नहीं। इस काभी आप ध्यान रखिये।

मौर में साप से कहता हूं कि यह स्टेट सञ्चेक्ट है ! साडवाणी जी ने को बात उठावी है कि वह नात स्टेट से सम्बंधित है। श्राप कालिम सटेंगन के गाय्यम में किसी स्टेट की खास घटना के संबंध में डिस्क्सान नहीं उठा सकते है। एक दो घटनायें ऐसी हो सकती है कि सो बहुत इम्पॉटेंट हो, वहो पतां या सकती है। इम वि में भाग में प्रार्थना करूंगा कि साडवाणी जी के मांगन का किसी भी होलत में मूब करने की डान हजायेन में रें।

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KUL-KARNI: Sir, I did not follow you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please start.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, i draw your attention ... (Interruptions) essential commodities to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Pleast: go on.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KUL KARNI: Sir, I draw your atten tion\_\_\_\_ (Interruptions) Sir, you please ask my friend, Madam Saroj Khaparde to please be quiet for five minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am hearing you. You please continue.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI; Sir, I draw your attention to.... (Interruptions)

श्री महेन्द्र मोहन मिश्र : श्रीमन, प्वायंट ग्राफ आर्डर है। यह प्रश्न हमारे हाउस के सामने उप्राया गया है, समय पास हो रहा है। साल्वे जी ने जो प्रश्न उठाया है उस पर ग्राप ग्रपनी व्यवस्था दीजिये। (व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभ.पति : ग्रच्छा ठीक है, उनको सुन लै,फिर हम देते है... (व्यवधान)

i

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, what I want to submit to you and through you, to the House, particularly ladies and gentlemen on that side ... (Interruptions) Sir, my point of view is that Mr. Advani has given a notice about the suspension of the Question Hour. I have also drawn your attention to the solemn breach of promise given by the Deputy Chairman, in this House. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please go on. (*Interruptions*) Let him say as he likes. . Please go on.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, whenever I hear a lady's voice I get disturbed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot help you.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, we have bachelors here...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Oh. That is the difficulty.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: What can we do?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please continue.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, what I want to submit is that Mr. Advani made a point and he has sought your permission to suspend the Question Hour. I draw your attention Sir, to the very same procedure adopted by my friends who are now sitting on the Treasury Benches, particularly, the Deputy Leader and my dear friend, Mr. N. K. P. Salve.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI; Without any notice.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, Mr. Salve quoted here some 'Blitz' report. My good friend, Mr. A. P. Sharma, who was here sitting next ^Q him shouted very loudly because Ms voice is of a labour leader. Then, Sir, we also supported them. Mr. Bhupesh Gupta also supported.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You make your point.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, my paint is . .

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA (Himachal Pradesh): What are you trying to say?

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: I am driving at the same point where you want. Sir, my point is, at that time, the reactionary Janata Government was ruling.

MR. .DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a different matter.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Please listen to me. I have got a point to say. The reactionary Janata Government was ruling. But it was a democratic Government.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; What is your point?

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KUL KARNI: Sir, the point is that at that time, under Rule 67, a Resolution was moved by me. And again his party supported Resolution regarding my the rejection of the Proclamation issued by the President, etc., etc. Sir, B'hushan, Mr. Shanti who then. was Parliamentary the Minister for Affairs

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: The Minister 'or Law.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Mr. Shanti Bhushan, the Minister for Law, moved another Resolution that this House do suspend rule so and so. So, there is, Sir, here y a precedent in this House that the Rules are suspended particularly looking to the feelings of the Members. Sir, what Mr. Advani says is that Madam Gandhi's advice is to the opposition not to be corrupt, and not to her party. To her party she has given the permission, go ahead (.Interruptions).

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, Sir. (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard him I have heard several other Members. I am not going to hear all ; of you. (Interruptions), There is this rule. (Interruptions).

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, Sir ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, please. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will request the hon. Members to resume their seats. Unless you resume your seats, I cannot hear all of you. (Inter ruptions). I will only request you to resume your seats. If you do not re sume your seats \_\_\_\_ Please resume your seats because ....

SOME HON. MEMBERS Sir, Sir,...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. May I request the hon. Members to resume their seats? (Interruptions).

#### Income-tax exemption & Maldistribution of

# to certain Trusts

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Assam): Sir, may I make a submission. (Interruptions). Sir, I have a submission to make. I think it will be agreed by everybody that no House can run without the active co-operative between the ruling party and the opposition, and you have seen the feelings of the opposition. I feel that in the interest of smooth running cf he House you adjourn the House for 15 minutes . . . (Interruptions).

SOME HON. MEMBERS; No, no.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Then we would not allow the House to run . . . (Interruptions). We will not allow the House to run if this is the situation. We are not going to allow it. Are we not even to be permitted to have our say? (Interruptions).

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI Antulay first; Antulay first.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Now I am making a members rushed to the rostrum; practically submission . . . (Interruptions). It will be for you to they captured the Chair; I did not do thatconsider it, I know; it will be fox the House to (Inter-ruptions). accept it or reject it; but at nb point of time I will allow that we do not have an opportunity to have our say in this House ... (Interruptions). You cannot make me stop. And if that is so, we will not allow the House to run; you will not be allowed to continue the House. In the interest of democracy, let arg agard a wind the ... (area, ) the parties meet and after that we decide ... (Interruptions).

# भी सीताराम केसरी : उपसभापति

महोदय, माडवाणी साहब ने जो बाते कहीं और हमारे नेता महोदय ने उनकी उत्तर दिया कल की घटना के बारे में सौर आपने भी रूलिंग दी है कि स्वेश्चन अवर में... (व्यवधान) जरा सुनिये... (व्यव-धल) प्रश्न चले । मेरा निवेदन ई झौर जैसा कि मैंने पहले भी कहा कि सब साप ही बतलाइये कि यह जो घटना घट रही है क्या यह मर्यादित है ... (म्यवधानः) मेरी बात सुनिये ...

in Maharashtra

(a?ofap[) I was just requesting hhn for a chance to speak, which he had promised. I did not go and rush to the rostrum your

# भी सीताराम केसरी । मनुभाई

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE Member that side is shouting t-t-t, DEPARTMENT OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS What is this? A member is speaking and (SHRI SITA RAM KESRI): Sir, . . .

SHRI AMARPROSAD CHAKRABORTY (West आप गुजरात से झात है ... (व्यवधान) Bengal): Sir, we will not . . . (Interruptions).

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After Mr Dinesh Goswami, let us see what Mr. Kesri has to say.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Sir, a he feels agitated and if another

वी सीताराम केसरी : मनुझाई जी,

भी मनमाई पटेल : इसलिये समजाना राहते हैं कि गुजरात से होते हुए भी इस सवाल पर क्यों एजीटेटिड हैं। (व्यवसान)

#### 23 Calling Attention re, Income-tax ex mptions A Maldistribution of

थो सीतारामः केंतरोः मेरी बात सनिये। आप नये नहीं हैं? पराने कार्यकर्ता है ग्राप भो देनभक्त हैं और हम भी देन भक्त है। जब कभी इस तरह का प्रश्न ग्राता है हम सभी लोगों को सोचना समझना चाहिये। सरकार कभी भी पीछे नहीं हट रही है। प्रत्न यह वा कि जो मसला प्रापने उडाबा वह गंभीर मसला था। मैंने भी उसी को ध्यान में रखते हुए आपसे निवेदन किया कि डा पर कार्तिग झटेंलन क बारा ग्रापको वातों को ग्रभिव्यक्ति हो मगर हाव ही साव मह भोग्रावण्यक था कि सरकार के पान समी बोजों को सामग्री झापको संतष्ट करने के लिये सदन को संतष्ट करने के जिरे इन्छ तो डोना हो चाहियेथा। जो घटना सभी घटा है वह इस एल्डरमेन हाउस के लिये मर्यादापूर्ण है? (व्यवधान) जव हमारे लोग गये तब मैने फोरन कहा वापिस धाइये । (व्यवसन)

SHRI K. K. MADHAVAN (Kerala): Sir, the Government had enough time. Yesterday this matter was raised and it has been agreed to that this issue will be discussed today. Government had enough time. This only shows delaying tactics on their part to protect corrupt persons. This is shameful. This is nothing but shameful. ( Interruptions). Beneficiaries of corruption sitting there shouting all the while and demanding more time. We object to this. (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI; Sir, even at this late stage, I would plead with the Government to honour its commitment made yesterday. Even if it is discussed at 3 P.M. it does not matter. We can have a discussion at 3 P.M. Let us have a discussion on Mr. Antulay's corruption and everything will be all right. The Opposition is keen that the commitment made yesterday should not be breach. ed and we should have a discussion today. (Interruptitma)

## [ RAJYA SABHA J essential commodities to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Sir, on this issue, I wanted to make a point. Apart from technicalities, this involves the credibility of the House, the credibility of the Leader of the House, thhe credibility of the Minister and the credibility of the Chair. Yesterday, when this issue was raised, we were not prepared to discuss this issue through a Calling Attention Motion. We wanted that there should be a discussion, a full discussion, through a Resolution But, then there was a compromise, when the suggestion came from the Leader of the House through Mr. Kesri, who consulted the Leader of the House. The Leader of the House consulted the Chair. Then, Mr. Kesri consulted Mr. Advani and Mr. Kulkarni. Thereafter, we had agreed to this compromise formula and it was categorically announced by the Chair that this will he taken up today and this will be discussed today That is why, we had agreed to this. Now, today, when we see the Agenda, the List of Business. . . . (Interruptions)

SHRI M. R. KR<sup>T</sup>SHNA: The Government has already agreed. What more do you want?

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Now. Mr. Pranab Mukherjee has come up with a statement that Government could not get sufficient time to collect the data or the information. This is the only excuse. (Interruptions) So many unprecedented

श्री सीताराम केंसरी : म्राप सच्चाई पर क्राना नहीं चाहते है। अगर झाप सच्चाई पर ग्राना चाहते हैं तो सरकार को मौका देने से आगको भागना नहीं चाहिये। (स्वचधान) التجميم

incidents take place in the country. Whenever there are accidents, catastrophies, natural catastrophies and so on, the Government comes up with information within one hour. On this particular

#### Calling Attention re. [1 SEP. 1981] & Maldistribution of Income-tax exemptions

issue, why should they need more time? The Chief Minister is hers. He has met the Prime Minister twice. He has also met the Leader of the House. Everything is available with him. Still, it has been said here that Government is not in a position to have all rhe information required and so *on*. I think, . *(Interruptions)* 

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; What will be lost if this is taken up tomorrow? Nothing will be lost. (Interruptions)

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL It is not a question whether this is discussed through a Calling Attention or through a Resolution. But the main thing is, the credibility of the House, the breach of faith... *(Interruptions)* 

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has always the discretion. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL; The Chair, the ruling party and the opposition have all unanimously agreed to this. When such an agreement is flouted, what will be the credibility of the House. *(Interruptions)*.

Now you say that it is Elder's House. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; It is for their convenience that a date is fixed.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: You could have telephoned us or the Leader of the House could have telephoned us at 10.00 p.m. We would have gladly agreed to it. Neither he nor you telephoned ns. (Inferruptions).

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL; The last point in this. Shri Kulkarni pointed out something and I was shouting and praying that I should be allowed to speak. By that time the members on that side rushed and they **came** to you. I never rushed and I never came. *(Interruptions).* 

#### essential commodities 26 in Maharashtra to certain Trusts

श्री योगेन्द्र शर्मा (विहार) : मान्यवर श्राप यह कह रहे ये (व्यवधान) मेरी बात सुन लोजिये। आप यह कह एहे थे कि आँज के बजाय गदि कल बहस हो तो नुकसान होगा । यह श्रापका क्या सवाल था। इस सत्राल के संबंध में हमको यह निवेदन करना है कि सदन में यह आश्वासन दिया गया ... (व्यवधान) मेरी बात सुनिये। सदन ही नहा रेडियों के जरिये, अखबारो के जरिये से भारत की तमाम जनता को कहा गया कि पहली तारीख को प्रन्तुले के करस्वान के सवाल पर बहुप होगो । पुरे देश को जनता को कहा गया कि पहली ताराख को राज्य सभा में इस सवाल पर बहुझ होगी आपने कहा क्यानुकसान होगा। नुकसान होगा, नुक्सान होगा । यह पुरे देश की जनता के साथ श्रीर सदन के साथ विश्वासधात है ... (व्यवधान) मेरो बात सुन लोजिए ... (ब्यवधान) ।

भी उपसभाषति : यह हमेशा हुमा है... (ध्यवधान) कभी कभी मेम्बरो को सूढ नहीं करता, कभो गवर्नमेंट को सूढ नही करता ... (ध्यवधान) मिल्ला हि

श्री योगेंद्र शर्मा: यह हमेशा नहीं हुआ है, कभी नहीं हुआ है...(व्यवधान) मेरी बात सुन लाजिये (व्यवधान) प्रणन मुखर्जी साहब ने कहा कि ऐसे सव ल महाराष्ट्र सरकार के साथ इनको बासचीस करने का मौका मिलना चाहिये ताकि बें बहुव का जवाद दे सके लेकिन इम सप्रो के सभी जानते है...(व्यवधान) सुनिये तो सहो ।

श्री उपसमापति : सुन तो लिगा।

There is nothing wrong in that.

27 Calling Attention re. [ RAJYA SABHA ] essential commodities Income-tax exemptions & Maldistribution of

भी योगेना शर्माः मेरो दूसरो वात के महाराब्द के मुब्ब मंत्री कल दिल्ली रें थे, उनके साथ सरकार की मंत्रणा हुई उसके साथ प्रणव मुखर्जी को मंत्रणा हुई। रख्य मंत्रों ने यहा पर प्रेस कान्फ्रेस की प्रौर ये उक्ते वाद कहते हैं कि हमको रहाराष्ट्र सरकार से फूबट लेने है। यह जनता की आंखों में धूल झींहना है, सदन ही प्राखों में धून झॉकना है।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. (anerjee please.

# भी जनवीस प्रसाद माथुर : (उत्तर प्रदेश) राज के ग्रखबार। में लिखा है कि मुख्य रंत्री को हटा देगे ।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; I have > call and give opportunity to others Iso. (Interruptions). Mr. Advani, ley are also entitled to have equal me in the House. You cannot object i my calling one from this side and le from that side. You cannot obict to it. (Interruptions). Mr. Ma-iur, I have heard your leader. Yes, r. Banerjee. (Interruptions).

श्री जनबीश प्रसाव माथुर : मैं हीं मान्या . . (आवधान) अत्पको व्यवस्था तो है (व्यवचान) महाराष्ट्र के एक मंत्रो ) हटाया गया है भीर सरकार आज दिन बहुत सो बाते कर सकती है, ता वापस कर सकती है ... (व्यवधान) ाप मुद्धे कभी नहो बौलने बेते ...

थी उपसमावति : ग्राप बेठिवे )

थी जगवीश प्रसाद माथर : ग्रापने (ले मझो कहा बोलने के लिये।

1R. DEUPTY CHAIRMAN: You the record. I have never said it.

to certain Truiits in Maharashtra

# श्री जगवीश प्रसाद माथुर : मुझे कहने द)जिये, आपने पहले मझे कहा था में नहीं बैठूगा मुझे बात करने दोजिये, मैं नहीं यानूगा ... (व्यवधान)

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Bv MR pressurising you cannot do that. It will not go on record.

{Shri Jagdish Prasad Mathur continued to speak.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Only Mr. Banerjee will gon on record and nobody else.

(Shri Jagdish Prasad Mdjthur continued to speak.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mathur, you take your seat. Nothing is going on record.

(Shri Jagdish Prasad Mathur continued to speak.)

SHRIMATI KANAK **MUKHERJEE** 

## श्री उपसमापतिः माप गृहसे मेनाराज मत होइये । द्याप कुछ सुनिये तो ।

(West Bengal): Sir, may I sub-, mit ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN;, After Mr. Banerjee. I have already called him.

भी शिव चन्द्र सा (बिहार) : उपसभापति जो, मेरा व्याइंट ग्राफ आईर है।

श्री उपसनावति : कोई प्वाइंट शाख ग्राईर नहो चलेगा ... (म्यवधाम)

भी सिव चन्द्र झाः मेरा प्वाइंट ग्राफ माईर है (व्यवकान) यह नोटिस दिया है, देख लोजिये ।

भी उपसभापति : ग्रभ) क्वेश्चन ग्रावर है। प्वाइंट ग्राफ ग्राईर नही चलेगा... (व्यथयान)

29

श्री शिव चन्द्र झाः सारी व्यवस्था विगड़ रहे है... (व्यवधान) इस विषय पर जिन लोगों को बोलना है, उनको बूलवाइये... (व्यधधान)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why do you impute motives, Mr. Mathur? Order please. Mr. Banerjee.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE (Nominated); Sir, I wa<sub>s</sub> not in the House when it was agreed that the Calling Attention would be taken up today. When I read the early morning papers today, I sa<sub>w</sub> in the proceedings of the House that it was agreed by all concerned—maybe, as a result of the demand by the Opposition—and the Government als<sub>0</sub> agreed that this matter would be discussed on a Calling Attention Motion today. But after some time when i received the Rajya Sabha papers, I looked" into these and different subject. Naturally, it surprised me.

AN. HON. MEMBER: It surprised everybody.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: I am talking about myself. Naturally, when I came here, the first thing I asked you, Sir, in your chamber was: "What has happened? This Calling Attention  $i_s$  not there". Then you told me the same thing which you said later on that it was because of two reasons—one, the Chairman had earlier admitted a Calling Attention Motion; and two, the Leader of the House had also represented to you that the Government wanted some time to give full facts of the case.

### essential commodities to certain **Trusts** in Maharashtra

Now, it appears from what you have said, that Mr. Advani wrote a letter to you in the morning saying that there is a breach of faith, apparently because he was not informed about the circumstances under which the List of Business did not include this item. Naturally, he expressed his views in a letter to you and today he tried to move a motion for suspension of Questfon Hour and asked for your consent. You did not give him the consent, but you allowed him to ask for consent on the floor of the House, and he stated his case. That part is over. Though the Question Hour has not been suspended, in actual practice the Question Hour has disappeared today. But even if the Question Hour would have taken place today, the very same matter would have been raised immediately after 12 o'clock.

Now, Sir, it is a matter on which a decision was taken in the House that it would be taken up today, but it was not taken up today. Naturally, there would be a cause for concern and on that point, nobody is at dispute, particularly when the Opposition did not know the circumstances under which the Chair...

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: There were no circumstances.

SHRI AMARPROSAD CHAKRA-BORTY; It was a created circumstance.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: Anyway, these are the facts. We have heard the Leader of the House. Sir, I want to make a submission to the House. After all—excuse my saying this; I am not making any aspersions on anybody by some practice, or things like that whatever it may be—many times it has happened that without suspension of the Question Hour, other things have been raised during

#### 31 *Calliig* Attention re. [RAJYA SABHA J *Income-tax exemptions* & Maldistribution of

[Shri B. N. Banerjee] the Question Hour and the Questran Hour died a natural death. Today's  $^{k}i$  one such case.

#### 12 Noon

Sir, we are now here to res ^ve how to get about the things. The Opposition's demand is this No, we must have the Call Attention today because that was agreed to yesterday. The Government says, "No, it has to be tomorrow." (Interruptions) I am just telling facts. As Members of Parliament, as representatives o( the people in the country we are also responsible to see that the time of the House is well utilised, but that does not mean that Members cannot raise their grievances. Therefore, instead of saying "We will not allow the Business to continue, let the Business proceed like this till six o'clock" we have to resolve the dispute and come to a situation whereby the first objective will be that the House should continue its business. Secondly the GovernmenT should not escape the Call Attention which has been agreed to be admitted by the Chair.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: And the Government itself.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: Government does not come into the picture. They have consulted the Government. Therefore, this Call Attention has to be discussed,

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Today, today.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: Let me make my submission.

AN HON. MEMBER: Right now.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE; Their demand is for today. I am just referring to a technical point. Don't take it, Sir, that i am taking sides. I ara just telling my views. The House can proceed with the business and the House can have the Call Attention arising out of some charges against

## essential commodities to certain Trusts j,, Maharashtra

Mr. Antulay. That is the objective. If you read Rule 180 of our Rules, it is very clear. Don't say that Banerjee is just trying to interpret the things. It is the rule itself and that has happened on earlier occasions also. Supposing you admit this Call Attention or you would have admitted the Call Attention today, the Ministe' was entitled to come and the tell the House "I will make the reply tomorrow." That is very clear. Supposing, even now, under the demand from the Opposition you say. "All right, I admit this Call Attentim today", you cannot prevent the Minister from coming and telling you, "I will make the reply tomorrow. That is the rule. I will read out the rule. (Interruptions)

My submission is-excuse my saying itthat the mistake of the hon. Deputy Chairman was this. Here, if I would have been in a different capacity, I would have advised you that before issuing the List of Business you should have informed at least the leaders of the Opposition of the circumstances under which you could not admit the Call Attention today. As Mr. Shahi has very rightly pointed out, if they were informed-Mr. Shahi or Mr. Advani-even at ten o'clock yesterday night, "Well, due to the circumstances we will not take it tomorrow but we will take it up the day after tomorrow", it would have been all right. These are hard facts. I would, therefore, make an honest submission. The matter has been discussed on the floor of the House. Let us now clearly understand that the Calling Attention will be taken up tomorrow and tet the business go on. Let the Government not take shelter under the rule and say "We will make a statement on some other day." That is the way in which this dispute can be resolved. It is no good wasting the valuable time of the House just by saying "We will not allow

#### 33 Calling Attention re. Income-tax exemptions & Maldistribution of

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The net result will be the same thing. There will be no discussion today. *{Interruptions}* 

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: I am saying that there was some mistake on your part in not informing them yesterday. There is no question of breach of faith. That was a mistake and, therefore, the matter wIH come up tomorrow. Should we not do more useful busines<sub>s</sub> in the House then tomorrow. Should we not do more be discussed today itself? That is my honest submission.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE; Sir, I would like to submit, as I have already mentioned, that it is not my case that we will not answer to the Calling Attention Notice. The whole question was of the time factor and I explained to the hon. Members that because of certain difficulties and in order to be able to collect information from the State Government, I required some time. And I think we have to find some way out as to how to la^kle the situation. It is an issue where the Opposition is pressing their point and I have no hesitation to go with the Opposition because on earlier occasions also we have made compromises. It is not an issue on which we can stick to any particular false rense of prestige or vanity. We have to find out some mechanism. What I would suggest is that any Vice-Chairman may take control of the House and we can go to your chamber and rps'olve the issue and thereafter you can announce it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; If you agree to this suggestion made by the Leader of the House, . . . (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: May J submit, Sir, that this is a matter in which not only the leaders here but very many other Members are concerned. So I would make a specific -. suggestion on the lines suggested

901 RS-,2.

#### essential commodities to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

Mr. Banerjee. Let the Calling Atten-ion be taken up today, as was promised yesterday, and under that rule the Government may reply tomorrow —I have no objection to that—so that there is no breach of promise.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE; I have to get the Minister concerned  $t_0$  respond to it. So I Tequire some time *(Interruptions)* 

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: We are willing *Ui* have the answer tomorrow.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE; Let me explain. Under Rule 180, you call the attention of a particular Minister and he has to make a brief statement on the subject mentioned therein. (Interruptions) Just one minute. I thought we could have a brief discussion and the Deputy Chairman will inform the decision in the House. W/e are not going to take the decision here. As the House was informed yesterday, today also the House will be informed of the decision. But there is a technical matter. We will have to identify the Minister and the Minister will have to be present here. (Interruptions) It is not that. It is because, so far as the allocation of cement is concerned, it is under the Ministry of Industry, so far as the distribution of cement is concerned it is under the Ministry of Civil Supplies, so far as the import of cement is concerned, it is concerning the Ministry of Commerce. These are the matters on which we shall require a brief discussion. I am suggesting to you that let us have a discussion there for five minutes and then we can come back.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI; Mr. Deputy Chairman, on matters of States, it is the Home Minister  $wh_0$  always replies, not th« Civil Supplies Minister or any other Minister. Whenever there are charges of corruption against a Chief Minister, it is the Home Minister who replies, not the Civil Supplies Minister, not the. Industry Minister, nothing ql

#### 35 Calling Attention re. Income-tax exemptions & Maldistribution of

[Shri Nageshwar Prasad Shahi] that sort. It is the Home Minister who replies, and the Home Minister is here. This is a technical matter. The Government ©an decide in this wav.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There were more than 10-12 Calling Attention Notices beginning with the one by Shri Era Sezhiyan a few days ago. So we had to permit it So that the notices could be covered. That is stm not being done. I think that will be done today. So if you agree, I would request you to consider that we can proceed with the business and let the leaders of parties and the Leader of the House meet and discuss. Let us proceed with the business. Then we discuss it later on.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: We will not be able to settle it in five minutes. (Interruptions)

PROF SOURENDRA BHATTA-CHARJFI (West Bengal). You announce it.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI; We can agree as regards the principles and then we can work out the modalities. You should decide that we are going to discuss it today. Then we can work out the modalities. There is no problem about that.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has not agreed to the discussion so far, as I can see.

SHRIMATI KANAK MUKHERJEE: It is difficult to believe that the Government wants time to find out facts about the corruption of Mr. Antulay. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House and the leaders ,of the various parties can come to my room, and there we can find out the whole thing about how to do it and when to do it. All these things, we can discuss. (Interruptions)

SHRI ERA SEZHIYAN (Tamil Nadu): I want to make a submission. At 3 O'clock, let us take up the Calling Attention Whosoever is in

### essential commodities to certain Trust\* in Maharashtra

charge, let them take note. They can reply tomorrow. We shall start it at 3 O'clock. (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Let the Leader agree. (Interruptions)

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: MR. Mr. Sezhiyan, under rule 180 to which Mr. Banerjee made a reference, the Minister has the authority to say that he will not make a statement today. If a Member can call his attention, he will not reply. Then the whole thing will be adjourned "to some other date. It is not that after all of you have spoken he will say that he will reply tomorrow. That is why we can take up the Calling Attention listed for today. Then, at. some time during the lunch hour, any time you fix, we can meet and discuss about the time and everything. *Qlnterrup-tions*)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR (Madhya Pradesh): There will be two Calling Attention motions. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot suspend the Calling Attention motion which is here. (Interruptions)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR; Let us have special mentions till that time. (Interruptions)

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE: Whether at all that Calling Attention will come up today only for the purpose of satisfying the Opposition point of view or whether the whole thing will come up tomorrow, in what form it will come up tomorrow or today and who the Minister is who will reply, all these things cannot be discussed here on the floor of the House. They may be discussed there.

It has been suggested by the Opposition that the present Calling Attention should not be taken up. Sir, that is not a correct stand became there have been instances in Rajya Sabha, and the Rules of Procedure of Business do not bar two Calling

## 37 Calling Attention re. Income-tax exemptions

## & Maldistribution of

Attention motions coming up. If a consensus is arrived at in your room that to satisfy the Opposition we may have the Calling Attention at the end of the day and that the Government may make a statement tomorrow that does not prevent the other Cal ling Attention which is in the name of my good friend, Shri Kalpnath Rai, to be taken up now. Sir, we want to resolve the dispute amicably and with the best of will of the House. We must take an approach which would solve the matter, not an approach that we must have our pound of flesh. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: May I request the Leader of the House and the leaders of the various parties to come at 1.15 and discuss the whole, matter and , what modalities should be adopted? *(Interruptions)* Regard, ang the limited point' of the timing and the modalities. (Interruptions)

.SHRI . LAL K. ADVANI: You announce that the Calling Attention will be taken up today. *(Interrupt tions)* 

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI: It means that you are determined not to cooperative. (Interruptions) While the Deputy Chairman is inviting you to talk there and find out some way, still you are opposing it. It. shows that you are determined to hear no cause, no reason, but only insist upon it in spite of our request. (Interruptions) No. We are not going to do it today. I shall discuss it tomorrow. (Interruptions)

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Sir, the cat is out. *(Interruptions)* This is not for the first time *(Interruptions)* 

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI; While the Deputy Chairman is requesting us to sit there and find out the way, still you are insisting upon it. You do not want to do it. You are pretending to be democratic. But you are not democratic. (Interruptions) This is very "bad. (Interruptions)

#### essential commodities to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: This  $i_s$  not the first time that the "hair has desired to discuss a, thing in the chamber •• • (Interruptions)

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, our apologetic attitude they have rejected. They are not going to be reconciled. They are <sup>not</sup> going to maintain the decorum' of the House . . . (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI; This won't do. (Interruptions) Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, thii-i<sub>s</sub> not the first time. The Chair has many time<sub>s</sub> adjourned the House for a discussion in his; chamber. You can adjourn the House for a discussion in your chamber. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; If there is an agreed conclusion,, there  $i_s$  no difficulty. Unless you are determined that you do not want to '... (Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI; Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the essential issue is that if we are all agreed that we have the formal motion on the Calling Attention today . . .

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI: No.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: ... -and the discussion and the statement tomorrow ....

#### SHRI J. K. JAIN: Never. (Interruptions)

SHRI.LAL K. ADVANI: This was the agreement. It  $i_s$  only the modalities that we are willing to discuss. But if the basic issue we will-not have, today, then I will not b.e, agreeable. I was from the very beginning saying;' you agree to the principle, and the modalities -we will discuw. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kalpnath Rai. (Interruptions)

 $^{\wedge}$ 

Income-tax exemptions & Maldistribution of

39

थो थी॰ सत्त्ववारायण रेड्डी: हम कायवे से बोल रहे है। हमें बोलने की इजाजत यहीं देते (म्ल्मधान)। इस सरफ मापका ध्यान नहीं जाता। दूसरो तरफ ही माप इजाजत वेते हैं (म्यवधान)।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard many Members and now because his Calling Attention is here .... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI; You decide this first. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kalpnath Rai.

श्री संस्पंत्राय राध (उत्तर प्रदेश) : वेरा कालिग ग्राडेशन है गौर गपने व्य-बंस्था दी है गौर प्रादरणीय नेता ने भी दी है। में भपने साथियों से अपील करना चाहता हूं कि शांसिपूर्ण ढंग से कार्रवाई चलने दें भीर यहि शांसिपूर्ण वय से कार्रवाई नहीं चलने देवे तो भी ग्राडल विहारी वाजपेयी, चौधरी चरण सिंह, जार्ज फर्ने न्होज न जो कई करोड़ यथया इंग्ट्ठ किया है ... (याचधान)

**भी मनुमाई पटेल**ः यह धमकी धमकी दे रहे ह (स्वयधान)

जी कल्पनाथ राघः यह धमकी नहीं है। (काधवान)

भी सास हम्म प्रवयाणी: यह सर-बारी पार्टी का रवैया है।(व्यवधान)

भी मल्पनाव रावः यह घमको नहीं । यह धष्टावार का मामला है। बेस का सोना लूटने वाले माप लोग नप्दार है। सरि देस का खजाना सूटलिया (क्वियान) करोड़ों देनया प्रापने इकट्ठा किया है। मेरे पास दस्तावेज हैं। इस पर बहस होंगी (क्वियान)।

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: Sir, Mr. Sita Ram Kesri is distributing pamphlets in the Housei

#### essential commodities to certain Trusts in Maharashtra

It is breach of the rules. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Sita Ram Kesri is distributing pamphlets in the House. Thii is breach of the rules, Sir. *(Inter' ruptions)* Mr. Sita Ram Kesri is distributing pamphlets in the House. This is breach of the rule.

Mr. Sita Ram Kesri  $i_{\rm s}$  distributing pamphlets in the House ...

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI: No.

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI: You have done it.

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI: No.

(म्बनदानः)

भी चल्पनाच रायः घंटल विहारी भाजपेथी, जॉर्ज फनस्टिजि ने जिलने करोड़ देपंदे इनद्ठे किये हे... (साम्रहान)

वी मनुनाई पटेल: वीताराम केंसरी जी ने नावज सरोज खापडें को दिया ...(व्यवधान)

बी कार्यनाथ शब :... योधरी परण सिंह मा ... (अभवताले) ... में चाहता हूँ इनके प्रव्यापार के विलाफ कमीजन प्राफ इन्स्वायरी विठाई जाये ... (मावजान) ... यह नहीं हो रहा... (अवधान)... सरकार कमीधन आंक इन्स्वॉयरी विठाये ... (ज्यवदान) ... हमारी सरकार कांति दंसाइ के मध्दाचार, बौधरी बरण सिंह के भष्टाचार, घटल विद्वारी वाजप्रेयी के मच्टाचार ...(भववान)...मरे पास संब त हैं कि किंतना करोड़ क्यमा घटल बिहारी वाजपैमी ने लिमां, कितना करोड़ रुपमा चौधरी चरणसिंह ने लिया, कितना करोड़ रूपमा कांखि देसाई ने लिया, मोरार्खी बेसाई ने लिया (अवस.म) जावं प्रमेंडीय ने कितना करोड़े स्पर्धा लिया... (क्रीब-बन)...में पाहता हूं कि इनके बच्चाबार के विभाग तरफार एक कवीवन वाफ इंग्लबागरी विदाय... ( व्यवधान ]...

भी उपसभाषति : ग्रव आप बैठ जाइये ... (भ्यवधान)... भी कल्पनाथ राय : मैं बैठने वाला नहीं हं ... (व्यवधान)...

भी उपसभापतिः ग्रापने कह दिया<sub>।</sub> कृपा करके समाप्त करिये ग्राप<sub>।</sub> ... (म्यद्यधान)...

#### WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUES-TIONS

#### Joint ventures in the Electronics free Trade ZOne in Bombay

## \*221. DR. LOKESH CHANDRA: DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA:

Will the Minister of COMMERCE be pleased to state;

(a) what is the number of multinationals who have joined in the joint ventures in the electronics free trade zone in Bombay during the year 1980-81; and

(b) whether their entire production is exported?

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE AND STEEL AND MINES (SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE): (a) During the year 1980-81, one unit with foreign equity participation, was incorporated in Santa Cruz Electronics Export Processing Zone, Bombay.

(b) Yes, Sir.

#### **Tourist Buses at Port Blair**

\*222. SHRI AMARPROSAD CHA-KRABORTY: Will the Minister of TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION be pleased to state: (a) whether it is a fact that the Andaman and Nicobar Islands Administration has only one mini tourist bus for taking the tourists around Port Blair for sight-seeing;

(b) if so, whether Government pro-pose to provide more tourist buses at Port Blair; and

(c) if so, what are the details thereof and if not, what are the reasons therefor? —)

THE MINISTER OF TCfURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI A. P. SHARMA): (a) Yes, Sir. However, additional tourist buses for sightseeing are available with . private operators.

(b) and (c) The Andaman and Nicobar Administration has already purchased one 25-seater  $bu_s$  chassis. The bus is expected to be ready for ffie forthcoming tourist season.

#### Balance Sheets of M/s. Swadeshi Cotton Mills

\*223. SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA: Will the Minister of COMMERCE  $b_e$  pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a feet that the balance sheets of M/s. Swadeshi Cotton Mills at Kanpur, Naini, Raibareli-ly, Udaipur, Maunathbhajan and Pondicherry have-not been published since their take-over by Government during the last three years; if so, what are the reasons therefor;

. \_(b) what is the number of such other textile mills, which have been taken over by Government and whose balance sheets have not been prepared and published; and

(c) what are the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI