

*The motion was adopted.*

SHRI BRAJMOHAN MOHANTY: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we shall take up further discussion on the Motion of thanks to the President's Address

#### STATEMENT BY MINISTER

##### **II. Alleged Lathi Charge on Congress (U) workers by Police at Boat Club in Delhi on the 20th February 1981 —Contd.**

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): I have a submission to make. When a statement is made, various groups in the Opposition and from the Government side if they so desire, are allowed to ask questions and seek clarifications. Some friends were allowed, and I am very glad they were. But before we could ask questions the Minister chose to go away. He did not even take your permission to go away. When you asked us to sit down, we thought probably you wanted to call the other Minister for introducing some Bills as he might have some urgent business in the other House and in deference to that we sat down. But I am surprised that we were not only not allowed to ask questions, the Minister went away without even taking your permission. Is that proper? A new procedure is coming in. Just now Mr Sitaram Kesri came to me to ask for our cooperation so that the House could conclude the debate today. Personally I was inclined to cooperate with him. But are we to be treated in this manner? I am not blaming Mr. Kesri for that at all, nor am I blaming you. But it seems that we are moving towards a situation when the whole thing is becoming more and more of a farce in some ways. Here is a statement and there are other Members sitting on this side

who wanted to seek clarifications; I wanted to ask questions and seek clarifications. We wanted to make certain suggestions. But We were not allowed. I would not ask now. Therefore, this is what I would request you: I give a motion—the statement be taken into consideration Let it be discussed. There is a motion. There is a picture vision for it. For the last several years that provision has been given a go-bye. In the old days very often we did discuss such things. Now we are at the tender mercies of I do not know whose. If we are to be treated as charity boys, then it is better not to make such statements asking for cooperation and all that. Let them do as they think they can. I don't say Sir, you intentionally did, it took somehow or other circumstances Happened that way. My complaint is not against you. I told Mr. Makwana "Wait for a few minutes". I thought you might again continue after introduction of the Bills. But he did not even listen to us. It is a contempt towards the Members. See how they are treating us. I am not using any harsh words. We are getting used to this kind of thing. I do not know how long we will survive in this institution or the institution itself will survive....

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL (Gujarat) :  
The Chair also. ..

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I do not blame the Chair at all.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: The Chair also said he should remain present. But he left. It is an insult to the Chair.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Therefore, I am not at all blaming the Chair. I have no complaint against the Chair. In fact I was under the impression that in due course the Chair might call me. But I find, over-riding the Chair, over-riding the House and over-riding the Members, we have this Police Minister. This is not good. Will you kindly tell him? Here is the Leader of the House

[Shri Bhupesh Gupta]

sitting. We expect a little more respect from the junior Ministers. I can understand sometimes the Prime Minister showing a little disdain for us. Flu 1 we feel hurt when a junior Minister shows the same disdain and such contempt for us. It was an insult to you. But you are the better judge in your case. I have no complaint on this account against you at all.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): It is not the intention of Mr. Makwana to hurt the feelings of hon. Members. When you called the other Minister, Mr. Makwana came to a reasonable conclusion that his business was over and moreover he has to make the statement in the Lok Sabha. That as how he went. And it is not for any Member to tell him to sit here or not it for you to say .. •

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: The Chair has also told him.

श्री अब्दुल रहमान शेख (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
वह स्टेटमेंट तो वहाँ तीन वजों दे दिया है ।

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: This is the problem. I am sorry to say that the hon. Member considers that at any point of time he can rise. What I want to submit is that wherever we go to the next item, the conclusion is that the earlier item is over and the Minister in charge of that item has no point in staying here. When you called Mr. Mohanty to introduce his Bill, Mr. Makwana came to the conclusion that he has no other business here. He has no intention of hurting the feelings of anybody. He did not do it deliberately to hurt the feelings of anybody - or to commit an act of contempt towards the House.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: How many time in the course of the debate you have called others to make a statement? Mr. Mukherjee is the guardian angel and he is doing his job: If you are satisfied, it is all right.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: The request of the Chair has been recorded.

SHRI DHARMAVIR (Uttar Pradesh) : He might not have heard it.

श्री लाडली मोहन निगम (मध्य प्रदेश) : वे अंग्रेजी में बोल रहे थे, आपको समझ नहीं आया होगा ।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us take up further discussion on the Motion of Thanks to the President. Mr. Dinesh Goswami.

#### MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS—^ontd.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Assam): Mr. Deputy Chairman, the President's Address which gives a balance sheet of the performance of the ruling party in the year that has passed by and also a broad outline of the proposals that the Government intend to implement for the year that is to come, also provides opportunity to the Members of both the Houses to make an assessment of the Governments performance. Sir, the President's Address has been so listless that while I was listening to it, I found that not even one member of the ruling party, not to speak of the Opposition had any occasion to applaud this address. I have been in this House and the other House for the last eight years and, for the first time, I have found that the President's Address went unapplauded throughout.

Sir, this Government came to power with the promise that it would be a Government which will govern and the performance of the Government reminds me of the story about the fishes and the frogs in pond. The fishes and the frogs in a pond had many problems and they wanted somebody to govern them and approached God. Then God said: "I am