

Surgery, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, has intimated his intention to resign from service. Dr. Venugopal, Associate Professor in the same Department, has submitted his resignation.

The main allegation relates to the functioning of the Cardiac Surgery Department, *Inter.alia*, doubts have been raised about the physical fitness of the two Senior-most Surgeons.

I have looked into the facts relating to the allegations. The charges made are without foundation.

I have held discussions with the Director and the representatives of the Faculty and assured them of my continued support. I have also talked to Prof. Gopinath, expressed my concern at the situation and have tried to persuade him to reconsider his decision to resign and to prevail upon his colleague, Dr. Venugopal to do likewise.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to place on record my deep appreciation of the excellent and dedicated work done by Doctors Gopinath and Venugopal and other eminent members of the faculty who, with their exemplary devotion to duty, outstanding competence and strenuous efforts have contributed to building up the reputation of the Institute in the country and abroad. It is, therefore, but natural that Prof. Gopinath and his colleagues have felt agitated and disturbed by the allegations.

The Institute is a centre of excellence and of National Importance. It attracts patients from all over the country as well as from neighbouring countries. The pressure on various departments is ever-growing, specially in the super-speciality ones which are amongst a few of their kind in the region. The doctors, specially those serving in the super-speciality departments, thus work

under continued heavy pressure, providing services to the largest possible numbers within obtaining facilities.

Sir, I would appeal to the hon'ble Members of this august House to appreciate the circumstances under which our eminent experts have to function. It is, therefore, necessary that we do nothing to demoralise and denigrate them. Sir, please permit me to add, I also wish to express my profound regrets at the sad demise of the Harijan youth who was to undergo cardiac surgery at the institute, and offer my sincere condolences and sympathies to the bereaved family.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माधुर : श्रीमान्, यह बहुत प्रसन्नता की बात है कि देर से ही सही लेकिन मंत्री महोदय ने अपनी सद्भावना इंस्टीट्यूट के प्रति और वहां के डाक्टरों के प्रति प्रकट की है और अब मैं समझता हूँ कि कोई भी इस बात से पीछे नहीं रहेगा कि जो हमारे देश के उत्तम डाक्टर हैं, जो कि हमारे देश की प्रतिष्ठा बढ़ाने वाले हैं, जिनमें डाक्टर गोपीनाथ और दूसरा नाम मैं आंखों वाले डाक्टर मदन मोहन का लेना चाहता हूँ, इनके जैसे सभी डाक्टर हमारे देश की प्रतिष्ठा हैं और हमारे लिये ये गौरव का विषय हैं। लेकिन आज जब हम लोग यह बहस कर रहे हैं एक बड़ा संकट है, एक तरफ हमारे किसी साथी ने जाने अनजाने में कह दिया—(व्यवधान)

RE. SLOGANS RAISED IN VISITORS' GALLERY

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माधुर : यह बड़े दुख का विषय है कि ऊपर गैलरी में कुछ हो गया है—(व्यवधान)

SHRI NARSINGH NARAIN PANDEY (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Deputy Chairman...(Interruptions) I am on a point of order...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One by cms.

SHRI NARSINGH NARAIN PANDEY: It is most unfortunate that in this august House a member of a Party who is canvassing in this House for poll in Delhi has stood up on the same point and some people in the gallery... (*Interruptions*) shouted slogans... (*Interruptions*). This has never happened in this august House. This is the House of Elders... (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The whole matter will be enquired into. I shall look into the whole thing and proper action will be taken according to the rules and regulations. Do not worry.

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA (Himachal Pradesh): I am on a point of order. An enquiry should be instituted to find out what has happened and who are the persons... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be looked into. I will inform you then. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, this is not going to be the last time. (*Interruptions*) Today, they might have brought 20 and they will bring twenty or a hundred persons later and this is not going to and anywhere here. Therefore, it must be inquired into and it must be ensured that it does not occur in future. (*In. terruptions*) All those persons who are party to this should be taken to task.

SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS (Karnataka): It should be inquired into. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA: It should be inquired into immediately. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One by one, please. Yes. Mr. Gurudev Gupta.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM (Tamil Nadu): Sir, you call us one by one.

श्री गुरुदेव गुप्त (मध्य प्रदेश) : दर्शक-दीर्घा में जो हंगामा हुआ है इससे सदन की मर्यादा भंग हुई है। अतएव मैं आपसे यह निवेदन करूंगा कि यह मामला प्रिविलेज कमेटी को सौंप दिया जाए और इस की छान-बीन की जाये। यह जो पार्सेज हैं दर्शक-दीर्घा के इन व्यक्तियों को किन माननीय सदस्यों के द्वार जारी किये गये थे ताकि यह मालूम हो सके कि उनके साथ ऐसे तत्व हैं जो कि सदन की मर्यादा को भंग करते हैं और सदन की गरिमा को समाप्त करना चाहते हैं और सदन को चलने नहीं देते हैं।

श्री पी० एन० सुकुल : मैं इसका समर्थन करता हूँ। (व्यवधान)

श्री नरेन्द्र सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैं भी इसका समर्थन करता हूँ। (व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute,

जो श्री गुप्ता जी ने

please.

Let us see. You have to wait for some time. Allow me some time to get the information and then the matter will come up before the House. The rules are obvious in such matters. When a breach is committed in the very presence of the House, there is no question of referring to anybody or the Privileges Committee. Let me receive the report and then I will tell you what is to be done. (*Interruptions*)

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA (Maharashtra): Sir, Mr. J. K. Jain has made a serious allegation that Mr. Mathur has instigated this... (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA: Yes, yes. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS; Yes.
(Interruptions)

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA; I do not know, Sir. It is a serious matter because if an honourable Member of this House has been a party to this kind of breach of privilege or unseemly behaviour, then this is something which you have got to seriously consider. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA:
This should be inquired into. (Interruptions)

श्री जे० के० जैन : (मध्य प्रदेश) :
माथुर साहब ने असाधारण घटना घट रही थी उसके बावजूद मुझे बड़े अफसोस के साथ कहना पड़ता है माथुर साहब ने किस ढंग से यह कहा कि क्या हो रहा है, कुछ बात नहीं है... (व्यवधान)

श्री जादोश प्रसाद माथुर : नहीं कहा...
(व्यवधान)

श्री जे० के० जैन : मिस्टर माथुर,*
(व्यवधान) तुम को यह शब्द नहीं कहने चाहिये थे, तुम को बिल्कुल ऐसे शब्द नहीं कहने चाहिये थे। *
* * इसलिये मेरा यह निवेदन है कि सारे सदन को *
* * । मेरा आपसे निवेदन है कि आप प्रिविलेज कमेटी वाद में चाहे टेक-अप करे लेकिन माथुर साहब को *
* मेरा आपसे निवेदन है कि * (व्यवधान) *
(व्यवधान) * (व्यवधान) *

(Interruptions) He has no business to remain in this House, Sir, * I charge that *

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Goswami. (Interruptions) Please

•Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

allow him to speak. Yes, Mr. Goswami. (Interruptions)

श्री जे० के० जैन : मिस्टर माथुर,*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Assam). Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. I don't think that there is anybody here who will support what has happened in the gallery today. I also don't think that this House and democracy will be able to function properly if such a slogan-shouting act is permitted in the gallery. But we know the procedure. The procedure is that the Watch and Ward staff must be entrusted with it and the matter will come up before the House and a formal motion is perhaps placed by the Leader of the House. I will, therefore, request the Leader of the House to get the report and to move a formal motion. And, Sir, at the time the formal motion is moved, I think we can discuss the various aspects. Let us not react in the same way. (Interruptions) Undoubtedly, this has exercised the Members. (Interruptions) But let us not give the impression that we have become excited over it. Undoubtedly, this is a serious matter.

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA:
What is this that you are saying? (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS: What is this, Sir? (Interruptions)

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI; Kindly let me have my say. (Interruptions) This is a serious matter, no doubt. (Interruptions) But let us not...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: What is this, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order, please. Please let him speak. (Interruptions). Order, please,

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI; I do not think that we should... (Interruptions) Will you permit me to speak?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You will have to wait for the report.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: I do not think that a serious matter does require any excited approach. (*Interruptions*) I hope that the Leader of the House will bring forward a formal motion. I will request the Leader of the House to bring forward a formal motion.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That will be done. I have already said that.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Yes, you have said that. But we also express our strong disapproval of what has happened in the gallery of this House today.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When the matter is brought up before this House, that will be the proper occasion to make observations and, as I have informed you, the persons who were involved have already been apprehended by the Watch and Ward staff and they will make a report. I think the matter will be placed before the House this afternoon and this can be taken up immediately thereafter.

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA: On a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: What happened in the Visitors' Gallery will be condemned by all sections of the House. Sir, you have been a witness. The precious time has been unnecessarily taken away by this type of agitation. Whatever may be the justification for this, this is not the method. It is not only the ruling party which can destroy democracy but even the Opposition can also... (*Interruptions*) This is not the method. I won't blame these young men. What is the use of proceeding against these young men? We must find out who instigated them and how it is organised, and whether

a discussion in the House is necessary. I would request you. Mr. Deputy Chairman—you have been witnessing it—to allow this House to discuss the whole matter. The prestige of this House cannot be preserved by punishing these young men, but going into the truth of the matter is necessary. At the same time, I want to register my party's view that we do not support the delay in holding the election in Delhi. But that is a different matter. This is not the method of agitating. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order, please. I will call you one by one.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : श्रीमान,
मेरा नाम लिया गया है, मुझे इजाजत
दीजिये।

श्री उपसभापति : नाम का वक्त नहीं
है... एक-एक को चलने दीजिये, नहीं
तो इसी में रह जायगा। आप बोलिये।

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA:
On a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kulkarni.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI (Maharashtra): It is a very serious matter. During my period in the Rajya Sabha, I have not witnessed such hooliganism in the Rajya Sabha, Gallery. As has been rightly pointed out, my party is committed to democracy, and I fully agree with my friend here that democracy is not only destroyed by the ruling party, but also by the misdeeds of the Opposition parties. Sir, at the same time I will request you to bear in mind that there is a procedure laid down. As my friend Mr. Goswami has stated, that procedure should be followed. But at the same time perhaps because of emotions and excitement certain words have been passed against an hon. Member. Three days back I stood here. Somebody attributed motives to a Member of this House.

SHRI SHRIDHAR WASUDEO
DHABE (Maharashtra): (Inter-
ruptions)

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: You go through the proceedings. We owe a responsibility. It is for the Leader of the House to move a motion. We are here to take an objective view in preserving democratic and the highest traditions of the House. We will not be found wanting in that. This is not a political matter. This is a matter of upholding the democratic principles.

श्री नरसिंह नारायण पाण्डेय : श्रीमन
मैं एक मिनट आपका समय लूंगा (व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति : रुकिये, मैं एक एक
करके बुला रहा हूँ।

डा० भाई महावीर (मध्य प्रदेश) :
कितना समय लेंगे आप, और किसी को भी
बोलने देंगे, तीन बार तो आप खड़े हो
चुके हैं।

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Rajasthan):
The scenes that have been witnessed in the
Visitors' Gallery are not scenes which any
Member of this House can either encourage
or possibly condone. These do not
contribute to the dignity or the functioning
of this House. Certainly, I personally and
nobody in my party supports what has
happened in the 'Darshak Deerga' today or
may happen in future. Sir, I would like to
submit, I through, you, Sir that if we who
have the privilege and honour of sitting in
this House reduce our behaviour to the level
of what has happened in the Visitors'
Gallery, we are no different and no better
than them. It is a matter of the deepest
concern for me,

♦Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

because I happen to have the privilege of
belonging to this august House. If some
individuals, guided or misguided, have
brought the dignity of this House down,
and if the Members of this august House
also reduce themselves to the level of
their behaviour, we are no different and
no better. I think this is a matter of
greater concern to me. I would submit to
you, Sir, that you please go through the
records of what transpired in that half-an-
hour or 15 minutes. Please see to it that
baseless allegations that have been made
against any Member of this House in the
heat of the moment, out of excitement
because we have reduced ourselves to
that senseless level, are deleted.

श्री नरसिंह नारायण पाण्डेय : श्रीमन,
एक मिनट मेरी बात सुन लें... (व्यव-
धान)

श्री उपसभापति : सुन रहे हैं।
बैठिये... (व्यवधान) सुन लेंगे...
(व्यवधान) दो बार बोल चुके हैं...
(व्यवधान)

डा० भाई महावीर : एक ही माननीय
सदस्य तीसरी बार बोलना चाहते हैं।
हमारे ऊपर आरोप लगाये गये हैं, मेरी
भी एक मिनट सुन लें।

श्रीमन मेरे माननीय मित्र ने जो कहा,
उसके बाद शायद जरूरत नहीं है, पर फिर भी
मैं अपना कर्तव्य समझता हूँ कि मैं अपने पक्ष की
और आपके सामने यह निवेदन करूँ कि इस
सदन की गरिमा की रक्षा के लिये हम किसी
से भी पीछे नहीं हैं और ऐसा कोई भी
कार्य अगर होता है जो इसकी मर्यादा या
गरिमा का उल्लंघन करता है, तो हम में
से कोई भी उसको उचित नहीं ठहरायेगा।

परन्तु, महोदय, जैसे उन्होंने कहा है,
एक तरफ तो दर्शक दीर्घा में कोई नौजवान
आकर के नारे लगाने लगे और दूसरी

[डा० भाई महावीर]

तरफ इससे उकसाये जा कर इसी सदन में कुछ सदस्य उठ करके कुछ बोलने लगे और जो बोला गया वह भी कोई इस सदन की मर्यादा के अनुकूल नहीं था। उसके बाद में हमारे माननीय सदस्य ने उधर से* तक अपने इस सदन के एक माननीय सदस्य के बारे में शब्द कहे हैं। ये भी कोई हमारी गरिमा को बढ़ाने वाली चीजें नहीं हैं। यह बात सत्य है कि जिस विषय के ऊपर नारे लगाये गये उस विषय पर हमारा सत्तासुद्ध दल के साथ बड़ा मतभेद है, उस मतभेद को प्रकट भी किया गया है। आज भी कहा गया कि अगर दिल्ली के चुनाव की बात होती है, तो सरकार उसके बारे में लोगों की भावना का समादर करे और अगर नहीं करेगी तो आंदोलन होंगे। लेकिन आंदोलन अगर होते हैं या अगर हमारा दिल आंदोलन करने को करता है, तो उसके करने का प्रकार है और हम संविधान की मर्यादाओं की रक्षा करते हुए और इस सदन तथा दूसरे सदन की गरिमा की रक्षा करते हुए, सारा कुछ करना चाहते हैं।

इस वास्ते कुछ भी विधि हो, जो अब विधि है, उस विधि के अनुसार इस तरह की घटना की पुनरावृत्ति न हो और जो हुआ है, उसके बारे में जो कार्यवाही करनी है, वह कीजिये। पर कोई भी माननीय सदस्य उधर से इधर उंगली न उठाये क्योंकि हम कभी भी अनुशासन के मामले में पीछे नहीं रहेंगे और उसके पालन में हम आगे भी सहयोगी रहेंगे।

इस तरह का विश्वास मैं माननीय नेता सदन को और दूसरे मित्रों को दिलाना चाहता हूँ।... (व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति एक-एक आदमी जाए।... (व्यवधान)

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आप उन्हीं लोगों को पहले बोलने दीजिये उधर से।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा (बिहार) : जो फिजां दर्शक दीर्घा की बातों को लेकर हुई, उसका तकाजा हो जाता है कि हम सदस्य पहले अपने पर संयम रखें।

श्रीमन, असम और केरल को लेकर हम लोग बहुत उत्तेजित थे। वह सिर्फ हमी लोगों के मतलब की बात थी, सरकार की और सदस्यों की और वह बहुत हद तक ठीक है। लेकिन बाहर जो दर्शक हैं, उससे हम उत्तेजित हो जाएं और उस पर हम यहां पर कुछ ऐसे वक्तव्य कह दें, जो हमारे सदन की गरिमा के अनुकूल नहीं है, तो जो नियम और कायदा होता है और जो दीर्घा में कोई इस तरह का काम होता है, तो उसके लिये सजा का भी नियम है।

लेकिन एक बात मैं आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ कि जिसके लिखने से कोई दर्शक आता है, उससे वह साफ नहीं होता है कि उसके इन्स्टीगेशन से वह घटना ऐसी हुई है। मैं बिल्कुल अपने तर्जुमे पर कहता हूँ कि... (व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति : शा जी, आप यह प्रश्न बाद में उठाइयेगा।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : चौथी लोक सभा में ऐसी स्थिति हुई थी... (व्यवधान)

श्री उपसभापति : विस्तार में मत जाइये। जब बाद में जिक्र आएगा, तो कहिये।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : मैं चाहता हूँ कि तमाम बातों को सामने से कर के जो उचित कार्यवाही हो आप करे। हम

लोग इस घटना को कंडेम करते हैं। हम उत्तेजित हो गये... (व्यवधान) यह मेरे कहने का मतलब था... (व्यवधान)

श्री सदाशिव बागईतकर : मान्यवर, अभी सदन की दर्शक-दीर्घा से जो खेदजनक घटना हुई है उस के बारे में सभी को दुःख और खेद हुआ है। लेकिन मैं आपके माध्यम से यहाँ सदन के सदस्यों से प्रार्थना करना चाहूँगा कि ऐसी घटनाओं से हम लोग भी उत्तेजित हो उठें तो वह बात ठीक नहीं है। मेरी आप से यह प्रार्थना है कि सदन की प्रतिष्ठा और मर्यादा के संरक्षण के लिये जो भी विधिवत प्रक्रिया है उसके अनुसार आप कार्यवाही करेंगे और उस में हम आपको सहयोग करेंगे। उस में कोई दो राय नहीं हो सकती है। लेकिन असल में बात यह है कि हम एक दूसरे के प्रति इल्जाम गलत ढंग से लगाते हैं। कुछ अनुवालियामेंदरी अल्फाब यह इस्तेमाल किये गये हैं, यहाँ तक कि किसी को* कहाँ गया है। यह कहाँ तक प्रक्रिया में ठीक शब्द है, आप देखें। मेरी राय में अगर कोई गलत काम करे तो उसके लिये अपशब्द कहना नैतिकता की दृष्टि से ठीक नहीं होगा। अगर सदन की कार्यवाही की प्रक्रिया में कहीं कोई गलत शब्दों का इस्तेमाल हुआ है तो उसको आप कृपया देखेंगे।

SHRI ARBINDA GHOSH (West Bengal); Sir, the incidence which took place a little while ago in the House is undoubtedly unfortunate and it should not be repeated once again.

SHRI GULAM MOHI-UD-DIN SHAWL (Jammu and Kashmir); Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. I wholeheartedly condemn what has taken place in the Galleries. As far as this august House is concerned, it stands for democratic principles and norms. As

far as this aspect of the case is concerned, passes have been issued, and I in whose name they have been issued, in favour of one or others, that may be looked into. I wholeheartedly condemn it. Of course, in the heat and excitement, something has been said and that is a separate matter and we should not mix up the issues. As far as their condemnable action is concerned, we condemn it. And we support Mr. Goswami and prompt and immediate and stern action be taken against the culprits.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE (nominated): Sir, I have been in this House for the last 26 years in one capacity or the other and I have never seen a disturbance like this in the Gallery. Sir, as you know, any unruly conduct obstructing the proceedings of the House—and it was one such case—is at once taken notice of by the House. I have heard every hon. Member from this side condemning unequivocally a conduct like this. Sir, there are other ways of ventilating a grievance. But, if we the Members of this House tolerate incidents like this and just try to forget these incidents or forgive the persons concerned on the ground that they were for a good cause or for this cause or for that cause or because of some political affiliations, I think that will be a very wrong attitude to take. Sir, in matters like this what happens is that there is a responsibility for the Members who issue passes to these persons. I will tell you an instance. (Interruptions) Once a particular person was caught in the Gallery carrying a knife and his pass was recommended casually by a Minister. The Minister had to apologise to the Chairman when it was brought to his notice. He said that he issued the pass in good faith. And so, Sir, it is not simply signing a pass without knowing a person. But Sir, many times this is done. And today's incident shows that the Members have to be a little careful about that matter. And I am not suggesting that any particular Member did this. But,

♦Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[Shri B. N. Banerjee]

Sir, you cannot altogether forget the point which my friend here, Mr. Go-swami and others said that the Members should sign passes for persons who are responsible. Otherwise, such incidents may take place creating difficulties like this on the floor of the House and wasting the time of the House. We are talking for that particular purpose. So, Sir, the action must be a deterrent action. That is my recommendation. Please see the report. The incidents are known. We have seen the report. Take action so that things like this are not repeated on the floor of the House. On this point, everybody here has agreed that this is not the right way. I am not imputing any motives to anybody. This is my suggestion. But, there is one thing. At the time when the hon. Leader of the House moves a Motion, Sir, I have a very humble submission to make. Please let him discuss with the leaders of the Opposition parties what the Motion should be and that Motion should be simply passed immediately after it is moved. We do not want to discuss "The Motion at that stage. It is much better that the Opposition parties and the Leader of the House may meet and he may tell them that this is what has happened and that this is the course of action that we should take and move the Motion and the Motion should be adopted. I beseech the Members that it is not necessary at that stage to make speeches.

श्री नरसिंह नारायण पाण्डेय :

श्रीमान, मैं आपसे यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि जिस समय इस सदन में गैलरी से पर्चा फेंका गया, उसी समय उस सदन में भी गैलरी से पर्चा फेंका गया और करीब-करीब जो विचारधारा थी कहने की वह करीब करीब एक ही थी। यह इस बात का सबूत है कि दोनों सदनों में एक प्लान्ड तरीके से, जान-बूझकर सदन की मर्यादा को भंग करने के लिये और सदन की कार्यवाही व्यवस्थित

ढंग से, नियमों के अनुकूल न चलने पावे, इसके लिये एक सांज्ञिका की गई।

श्रीमान, हम माननीय सदन के हर सदस्य के विचारों से अपने को सम्बद्ध करते हैं चाहे वे उधर बैठने वाले हों या उधर बैठने वाले और यहाँ किसी भी माननीय सदस्य के प्रति कोई अनादर-पूर्वक शब्द कहने का भी किसी का कोई इरादा नहीं है। एक ऐसी घटना, हमारे भूतपूर्व सेक्रेटरी जनरल जो अब नामिनेटड मੈम्बर है, श्री बनर्जी उन्होंने बताई लेकिन हमारे जीवन में इस सदन में जो कि हाउस आफ लार्ड्स कहा जाता है, जिसमें मैम्बोर लोग आकर बैठते हैं, जिसमें शिक्षाविद बैठते हैं और तमाम रिप्रेजेंटेटिव स्टेट्स के आकर बैठते हैं, उसमें श्रीमान, यह मर्यादित नहीं होता कि सदन में गैलरी में बुलाकर इस तरह से प्रदर्शन कराया जाए। हो सकता है हमारी राजनीतिक विचारधाराओं में मतभेद हो, किसी बात को लेकर आप बाहर प्रदर्शन कर सकते हैं, आप अपनी विचारधारा को, अपने घोषणापत्र को रख सकते हैं। चुनाव के लिये सरकार पर दबाव डाल सकते हैं। लेकिन यह तरीका नहीं है कि सदन के माननीय सदस्य, जिस समय दोनों सदनों में एक ही पार्टी के सदस्य बोलते हों, गैलरी से इस तरह से प्रदर्शन किया जाये, यह इस बात का सबूत है कि यह जान-बूझकर किया गया।

श्रीमान मैं माननीय सदस्यों से यह भी कहना चाहता हूँ कि उन्होंने प्रैस गैलरी की तरफ इशारा किया और यह सदन के सामने, आपके सामने, सदस्यों के सामने की घटना है जिन्होंने इशारा किया है और ऐसा लगा जैसे मालूम होता था कि सभी चीजें सुनियोजित करके यहाँ पर रखी गई। श्रीमान, चाहे इस तरफ के माननीय सदस्य हों चाहे उस तरफ के हों, वह इस सदन की मर्यादा को रखना चाहते हैं, ट्रेजरी

बेंच का हर सदस्य इस सदन की मर्यादा को रखना चाहता है। मैं चाहता हूँ कि इस मामले की गम्भीरता पूर्वक जांच हो और नियमानुसार कार्यवाही हो।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the Leader of the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MA-
THUR; Sir, on a point of order...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right, you can say later on. You will have some time to speak.

श्री जगदीश प्रताप माथुर : श्रीमन् यह जो मेरा नाम लिया गया है यह जो इंसिडेंट हुआ है उसके बारे में मैं कहना चाहता हूँ।... (व्यवधान)

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE): What are you going to say about it? You are not going to comment on that incident. You have denied that you have done anything. That you will deny at the personal explanation stage. (*Interruptions*)

Sir, the incident is really unfortunate and disturbing. In fact, I was in my room along with Mr. Goswami. When I heard the slogans from my room, both of us rushed here. I am not here for many years, but this is my thirteenth year. In the Rajya Sabha I have never seen an incident like this, and I do not feel that there is anybody who will not condemn it, except those who have organised it.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: Even they will not own it.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE: They may not own it, but the fact remains that it has been organised.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE: Otherwise, this type of incident

will not take place. Therefore, it is¹ not merely the question that those who have been arrested should be taken action against as per the set procedures. But I do feel that this is an area where further investigation is necessary and the persons responsible for organising this type of incident should be identified and necessary action should be taken. Therefore, this is a matter on which I do feel—and we all feel—concerned. It is not a question of the parties; it is a question of the dignity of the House, and it may happen that somebody may start throwing bones, may start throwing stones, may start throwing all sorts of things. Where are we going? Day in and day out we are accused of being authoritarian, eroding the process of democracy and those gentlemen who are indulging in this type of activity, are strengthening the forces of democracy. Therefore, this is a matter where I do feel concerned. After all, Sir, passes have been issued. The gentlemen simply could not step into Visitors' Gallery, and they have been identified by some persons, and they are Members of this House itself. It may happen sometimes we issue passes inadvertently, but that does not mean that we can shirk our responsibility. The minimum we should do, and we are expected to do is that if anybody recommended by an hon. Member misbehaves in the gallery, he should voluntarily come forward before the House. It is not a question of telling something to the Chairman in camera, because he is accountable to the House, and the misbehaviour which has taken place has degraded the prestige and honour of the House itself. Why should there be an investigation? Those Members should come forward and tender unconditional apology to the House saying that he did not know it or it was his mistake that because of certain inadvertence he recommended wrong persons. At least this courtesy this House can expect from those Members. Therefore,

[Shri Vranab Kumar Mukherjee]
this is a matter on which I am really rather
scared...

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR; There are no
two opinions on this.

SHRI SANKAR PRASAD MITRA
(West Bengal); You may consider
revision of procedure for admission to the
Visitors' Gallery.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHER.
LEE: As far as the procedure is con-
cerned, it is a set procedure and I think
during the lunch-break, let the leaders of
various groups kindly come to my room
and we can discuss and then decide what
course of action we should take. I agree
with what Mr. Banerjee said that there
should be no debate on this issue. Let the
House rise to the occasion and speak in
one voice only. It is my appeal and sug-
gestion to the Members, and I join the
hon. Members who have expressed their
views and concern on it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think
the whole House has...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : श्रीमन,
मेरे साथ अन्याय होगा...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:... ex-
pressed its concern. This incident is the
most unfortunate and unprecedented, and
I hope the suggestions made by the Leader
of the House will be welcomed, and the
matter will be taken into consideration;
leaders of various parties will meet him
and decide the modalities as to what
should be done. I think we shall be having
a report from the Watch and Ward
immediately available and then we shall
consider it after lunch

सदन की कार्यवाही...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : श्रीमन,
देखिए आप अन्याय कर रहे हैं...

श्री उपसभापति : ... दोपहर 2 बजे
तक के लिये स्थगित की जाती है।

The House then adjourned for
lunch at three minutes past one
of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at
one minute past two of the clock,

Mr. Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

MOTION RE. PUNISHMENT TO PERSONS WHO RAISED SLOGANS IN THE VISITORS' GALLERY

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Now the
Leader of the House to move the Motion

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : (उत्तर
प्रदेश) : श्रीमन, मेरा एक प्वाइंट है।
इस से पहले कि मंत्री जी प्रस्ताव रखें मुझे
आप मौका दीजिये।

श्री उपसभापति : आप छुट्टी बात
कर रहे हैं।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : आप
उचित बात नहीं कहने देते। जब वह
रेजोल्यूशन लायेंगे उस के पहले मेरा
अधिकार है कि मैं अपनी बात कहूं।

श्री उपसभापति : उस का जिक्र नहीं
होना चाहिये।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मेरा
कहना यह है कि...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will
allow you. Nothing is lost. Let us
proceed with the business.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : उस के
बाद मेरा प्रश्न और कार्रवाई अटेंशन एक
साथ जुड़ जायेगा।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That
will not be together, I assure you.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : तो मैं
आप की बात मानता हूँ।