

what is all this happening in Parliament? She said that whatever we say in Parliament has no relevance in the market. I asked her, what had happened? She said that when she went to the INA market to buy onions, because she had read the speech of Rao Birendra Singh that onions were available in the market at Rs. 1.50 a kg. and Rs. 1,000 was given to him or not given. God alone knows, but it was in your very presence, the traders said that onions were available only at Rs. 3 a kg. then she quoted to the traders what the Minister or the Chairman had said. (Interruptions). Sir, please listen. The trader said that the Members of Parliament and the Minister

बहुत बकवास करते हैं। डेढ़ रुपये मैं तो यहाँ मिट्टी भी नहीं मिलती है। लेना हो तो तीन रुपये में लो नहीं तो घर जाओ। What is your experience? Would you, Sir, direct the Minister to make onions available at the gate here?

श्री सभापति : मैं समझता हूँ कि प्याज का कच्चा मरता काफी बन चुका है, अब अगर इनका कच्चा मर घर में बने तो It is his lookout.

[Mr. Deputy Chairman in the Chair]

श्री सुन्दर सिंह भंडारी : यह ज. संघत बयानां करते हैं हाउस में इसका तो कोटि इन्वजाम होना चाहिए. . (व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We will now take up the Calling Attention Motion. Yes, Mr. G. C. Bhattacharya.

श्री सुन्दर सिंह भंडारी : अब अंतःप्राज दिलवाने की व्यवस्था कर दीजिये।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not a seller.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: You are not a seller, but you are a consumer. सेलर का क्या काम है, कच्चा मर का काम है।

abroad

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Reported decision of the Government to issue fresh special bearer bonds both in India and abroad from 1st December, 1981, and its effect on the country's economy

SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Finance to the reported decision of the Government to issue fresh special bearer bonds both in India and abroad from 1st December, 1981 and its effect on the country's economy.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN): Sir, the Special Bearer Bonds (Immunities and Exemptions) Ordinance, 1981 was promulgated by the President on 12th January, 1981 and Special Bearer Bonds were placed on sale from 2nd February, 1981 in India and from 9th February, 1981 abroad. The Ordinance was later replaced by the Special Bearer Bonds (Immunities and Exemptions) Act, 1981, after it was duly passed by both the Houses and received the assent of the President on the 27th March, 1981. However, writ petitions were filed in the Supreme Court challenging the Constitutional validity of the Ordinance and the Act. The Government therefore, decided to suspend the sales after 30th April, 1981.

As the House is aware, Supreme Court up-held the Constitutional validity of the said Act on 2nd September, 1981. The Government have, therefore, decided to place the Bonds again on sale with effect from 1st December, 1981 for a period of one month.

The current year's Budget assumes a receipt of Rs 800 crores from the sale of these Bonds against which only Rs. 296.91 crores were collected in April, 1981. The Government hope to realise the Budget estimate on this account; any further realisation will go to reduce the deficit and augment the resources for the Plan.

SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA: Sir, India was the only country in the Third World which was trying somewhat to prevent neo-colonial assaults so far. But after the present Government came to power in 1980, the fight was given up and the country is now fully open to neo-colonial exploitation after the Government passed the new Industrial Policy Resolution in July, 1980, contracted IMF loan worth more than 5 billion dollars, and decided to issue fresh Special Bearer Bonds both in India and abroad, which according to the Finance Minister, Mr. Venkataraman, will bring about Rs. 1000 crores out of Rs. 25,000 crores of black money or half of the G.N.P.

If I may say so, these Bearer Bonds have no parallel in any other country of the world. These Bonds will help subversion of economic and political Independence of India because it will not only lead to phenomenal increase in political and administrative corruption but will also greatly increase smuggling, espionage and other subversive activities by hostile foreign powers. These forces will be able to buy a completely anonymous asset, fully transferable in India that guarantees its holders that he shall be asked no questions and the only limit to how much they buy is to be what they think is needed to buy influence among our purchasable rulers.

These Bonds are rewards given by the present rulers to the big black marketeers for their huge contributions to the ruling clique and their political funds.

The Government is justifying these Bonds on two grounds. Firstly, to control black money and secondly to meet the budgetary gap. But these Bonds will have just the opposite effect. The Bonds will generate more black money as they will create a second currency for the parallel economy. These Bonds are superior to both cash and bill of exchange, which these Bonds combine in one, and will be highly valued assets with high

velocity of circulation. Since the velocity will increase, it will generate more black money. Already 30 per cent or more premium is being paid on these Bonds. People are paying a part of cost of flats in Bonds in lieu of cash and also for purchase of stocks of various commodities including cement, sugar, steel, coal and chemicals. These Bonds are also better than hundis because the payment is guaranteed by the Government itself. Moreover, dowry can be paid in Bonds to dodge the anti-dowry laws.

These Bonds will also increase inflation which entails greater deficit financing. Therefore, it will not reduce budgetary deficit. Instead of printing more bank notes, the Government will print more Bearer Bonds. The result will be more fiscal indiscipline which will be prelude to anarchy endangering our political and economic independence.

Moreover, this Government has no right to forestall the option of the future Government for demonetisation which is more effective weapon for fighting the menace of black money because these Bonds will be substitutes for unaccountable demonetised currency facilitating conversion into newly issued currency.

So far as moral aspect is concerned, Justice A. C. Gupta of Supreme Court has said that "these Bonds put a premium on dishonesty without even a justification of necessity... that the situation in the country left no other option" Thus not only the legitimacy of the present Government is undermined but it reflects the crisis of morality currently afflicting the ruling elite. Even the Wanchoo Committee had opposed the Voluntary Disclosure Scheme on similar grounds. Therefore, Sir, I demand that these bonds should not be issued afresh. Government should stop the generation of black money by taking over the speculative trade in real estate in commodities and so on and by demonetising the hundred, the fifty and the twenty-rupee currency notes.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the propriety, the morality and all the aspects of the issue of these special bearer bonds has been debated both in the Lok Sabha and in the Rajya Sabha and this has been approved. The only question which remained was whether it was constitutionally valid and its constitutional validity has been upheld by the Supreme Court. In a democracy, you cannot carry conviction with hundred per cent of the people. We have been able to carry conviction with the majority, both in this House and in the other House. If there are some conscientious objectors, I am sorry. I cannot satisfy them. So far as the bond is concerned, even at the time when I presented the Budget, I said, this is to fill the gap in the budgetary resources. This gap still persists. Hence, it is necessary for me to reissue the bonds. If the hon. Member has some objections, he has mentioned them and very vigorously. But the House has not accepted his version. It has accepted my Motion. Therefore, there is nothing more to be done and I have nothing more to say. (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhattacharya, please sit down. You have had your say.

SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA: Sir, he has not touched on the moral and the economic aspects. He has mentioned only about the legal aspect.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have said whatever you wanted to say. Now, Mr. Kalyanasundaram please. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM (Tamil Nadu): Sir, when the scheme was introduced, it was claimed that this was an action intended to mop up the black money which has assumed serious and menacing proportions and which is functioning as a parallel economy. Now, the Finance Minister says that the Government has only the limited objective of filling the deficit in the Budget. Let it be as it is. But Sir as you know, especially, during

the past two decades, the generation, circulation and operation of black money has been on the increase and it has assumed serious proportions. I would like to ask him, what are the steps he is going to take, what steps the Government is contemplating to take, to check the generation of black money and its dangerous circulation. Black money, black-marketing, smuggling, corruption and politics go hand in hand. This has assumed scandalous proportions of late. This is not only in regard to our currency, but in regard to foreign currencies as well. This is not a matter of credit for the Finance Ministry, or, for the Government of India, to allow such a thing to continue indefinitely as if they are helpless. This scheme should be examined in that context. It looks as if the Government has no other powers, has no other means and has no other measures to take to tackle this menace which is responsible for corruption, which is responsible for the very high prices and which is also undermining the economy and the morals of the country as a whole.

Now, Sir, the hon. Finance Minister says that the constitutional validity of this scheme has been upheld by the Supreme Court. Yes. But what prevailed, we do not know. I do not want to cast aspersions on anybody. But earlier, while admitting the writ petition, the judges were very hesitant. They took some time. Perhaps, they pondered over it very deeply. Then, five judges came to the conclusion that this scheme is constitutionally valid. You should remember that they have upheld the constitutional validity alone. Even here, they have been very hesitant. Go through their arguments. Go through their judgement. In regard to morality, they have not said anything. They have clearly said that they are not called upon to express their views on the morality or otherwise of this scheme. One of the Judges has categorically said that it is highly immoral. Even the press which usually supports the Government and its policies, has held. Even if Mr. Venkataraman succeeds

[Shri M. Kalyanasundaram.]

in getting a fistful of money, he has succeeded in undermining the legitimacy of this Government. This is how even the press is reacting. Even the Prime Minister is not so confident. She has never come in support of the scheme. She herself is reported to have said that some experts have misled the Government. Such is the fate of the scheme. Now the Finance Minister comes with all enthusiasm and wants to keep it open for one more month. I have one or two questions to ask. Will it be open for one more month, or if the gap is still unfilled, will it be extended? The other question is, what about the approach of the Government to the problem of black money as a whole?

Now, Sir, there is a news item published today in the Economic Times. Very brave words in military language are used that the Government is contemplating a new strategy of search and seizure.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a different matter.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: That is about black money.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Speak about the bearer bonds only. Do not go to the wider questions.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: It may be a slip of tongue. The bearer bond is intended to attack black money only. So, the black money is also involved in it. When we call the attention of the Government, I should say how to attack black money, how to get rid of black money. They have taken some decision on one day and immediately the next day it comes in the paper. How is this Department functioning, Was this a seminar open to the press? How can such details come in the press? Kindly go through it step by step, every action or every decision taken in that meeting of the tax gathering officers is reported in detail in the paper. This is how the Government is functioning. (Time bell rings.) Kindly allow me a

few more minutes. This is an important item. There are not many speakers on this.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are many speakers.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: If I am irrelevant, you pull me up. I want to know how did it happen? This is the machinery with which they are going to tackle the problem of black money. If he is satisfied with this, it will go down in history that Mr. Venkataraman's period or the scheme was the most vicious and most black, blacker than even the black money. That is how the scheme will go down in the history. So, I want to know what radical steps the Government is contemplating to tackle the problem of black money and save the nation from corruption, from high prices and from other vices.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: Sir, I do not say that the issue of bearer bonds has only one limited objective of filling up the gap. In my Budget Speech I said that I will get Rs. 800 crores. There is a gap and now this is for the balance. Tackling the problem of black money through the bonds is also one of the objectives. So far as the moral and propriety aspects of this are concerned, I have only to repeat that these have been fully and fairly discussed here and there is nothing more to be said. If some people do not agree with it....

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: The majority may be convinced, but the country is not convinced. Look at the reaction of the people, the press and even the judiciary.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: I am a democrat. I fail to understand how the majority agrees and the country does not agree. This is a distinction without a difference.

The other question which was raised is very valid: what are you going to do about black money? We are

conducting a series of raids. If the hon. Member puts a question on the number of raids conducted, I will give full details. We have initiated a number of anti-smuggling measures and a large number of people have been arrested under the Prevention of Smuggling Activities Act.

SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA: And let off.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: That is not in my hands.

SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA: Haji Mastan has been let off. (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't reply to him. You only reply to Mr. Kalyanasundaram. This is not proper.

SHRI G. C. BHATTACHARYA: How are you saying that?

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: Can the Minister say in how many cases NSA was applied?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You put a question.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: If you put a question, I will give all the details, statistics etc.

The third point he made was, the Prime Minister has herself said that she has been misled.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: No, the experts have misled the Government.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: I suppose, Mr. Kalyanasundaram knows the elementary principles of parliamentary democracy. In fact, a Bill has been brought before the House and passed. And no Bill can be brought before the House without a Cabinet consent. And if the Cabinet has sanctioned it, I wonder wherefrom he got this information. In fact, it appears that the information which the Opposition gets must be from outside the normal channels.

1348 RS—8.

The only other question which has been raised is, whether it will be continued beyond that one month. I cannot say at the moment. It will depend on a number of factors. If I get a lot of money why should I do not take more?

SHRI NARASINGHA PRASAD NANDA (Orissa): The question is, are you getting a lot of money?

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: This will go only to reduce the budgetary gap, to finance the Plans and to help uplift the condition of the people. That is all I have to say.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shiva Chandra Jha.

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा (बिहार) : उप-सभापति जी, मंत्री जी का तो वक्तव्य है वह आप अपने सामने रखें। इन्होंने कहा कि 27 मार्च को राष्ट्रपति की मोहर लगी और अप्रैल में चूँकि रिट हुई तो उस एक महीने में 296 करोड़ रुपये इनको मिले। अब फिर एक महीने के लिए यह जारी करेंगे। इसी रफ्तार से हम मान लेते हैं इनको मिलेंगे तो एक महीने में 296 करोड़ और आयेंगे तो कुल 600 करोड़ रुपया हुआ। 800 करोड़ का आपका टारगेट था, उसमें कुछ आय 600 करोड़। वह भी जो टारगेट था वह भी हासिल नहीं हो सका। अब दूसरी बात, बियरर बॉन्ड की है। इस के खिलाफ पिछले सेशन में मैं रैजलूशन मूव करने वाला था। आप इल्लोगल मनी को लीगल बना रहे हैं, ब्लैक मनी को वाइट बना रहे हैं और वाइट को ब्लैक बना रहे हैं। ये अनकंस्टीट्यूशनल बात, इल्लोगल बात आप कर रहे हैं। ये सारी बातें देश में घुमंगी और गांधी जी के देश में होंगी। पहले तो अगर कोई 10 हजार रुपया जेब में ले जाता था तो पुलिस वाले शक करते थे कि इतना रुपया कहाँ से लाया। अब

[श्री शिव चन्द्र झा]

10 लाख लेकर, बियरर बांड लेकर आप घूम सकते हैं। तो स्पष्ट है कि ब्लैक मनी को जेब में रखकर आप चल सकते हैं पार्टियामेंट स्ट्रीट में। जो काला धन था वह बिलकुल करेंसी के समान घूम रहा है। जिस तरह संपेपर करेंसी है, वैसा ही हो गया है। अब सवाल यह आ जाता है कि आपने एक बड़ा और खजाना ले लिया है, इंटरनेशनल मानिटरी फंड से ले लिया है।

मोनिटरी फंड से लोन आपको मिल गया। भले ही जेतुफ्लेक्ट कर गये हैं, आप नतमस्तक हो गये हैं कि जितनी आपकी सारी इकोनॉमिक नीति थी उस पर बड़ा प्रहार किया है। आने वाले दिनों में it would be demonstrated and corroborated.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is a different question. Leave it.

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : थोड़ी देर के लिये जो इल्लिगल को लीगल करने का गलत काम कर रहे थे, ब्लैक मनी को रोकने का इसके लिये आप दूसरे तरीके भी इस्तेमाल कर सकते थे। पर आपको तो खजाना मिल गया है। अब मैं सवाल पर आता हूँ टु द प्वाइंट। जो आपके 296.91 करोड़ रुपये के बीयरर बांड बिके हैं उसमें से कितनी परचेज हिन्दुस्तान में हुई और कितनी परचेज हिन्दुस्तान के बाहर हुई? हिन्दुस्तान में जो खरीदा गया उसका सबसे ज्यादा परचेजर यानी सबसे ज्यादा खरीदने वाला कौन है?

श्री जी० सी० भट्टाचार्य : नाम दिया जाए।

श्री उपसभापति : नाम कहां से आया। ऐसा सवाल मत पूछिए जिसको कोई नहीं जानता। (व्यवधान)

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : जो टाप-मास्ट है जिसने 100 करोड़ के, 125 करोड़ रुपये के बांड खरीदे हैं उनका नाम बताया जाए। दूसरे क्या यह बात सही है कि बीयरर बांड जो अभी तक जारी किये जा चुके हैं वे सरकुलेट कर रहे हैं करेंसी के समान, जिस तरह से नोट घूमते हैं। मनी का मतलब क्या होता है? करेंसी का क्या मतलब होता है, यानी विलोसिटी आफ द करेंसी।

That is velocity of the currency and that gives an impetus. You understand economics, (Interruptions).... I am putting the question. Velocity of money will go up by more quantity of money where prices are going to go up. That is the point. So, that is circulating like legal currency, paper notes. Is that not true? Is that not adding impetus to the rise of prices in the market? चौथा

सवाल मेरा यह है कि क्या यह बात सही है जैसे काउन्टरफिट नोट आप के छपते हैं वैसे ही बीयरर बांड के भी काउन्टरफिट इशु होने लगे हैं? यह भी एक धंधा हो जाता है। यदि यह बात सही है तो यह कितने के हैं? पांचवीं और अन्तिम बात यह है कि आप ब्लैक मनी को मोप-अप कर रहे हैं। मैं कहता हूँ कि आप इसके लिये एक महीने के लिये इन्सेंटिव दीजिए—जैसे, ट्रांजिस्टर है, रेडियो है। इसके लिये आप एलान कर दीजिए कि हाइएस्ट विडर को पदमन्त्रिभूषण दिया जाएगा। आप जरा यह करके देखिये कि इस इन्सेंटिव से कोई मगरमच्छ आता है या नहीं। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस तरह का कोई इन्सेंटिव आप देने पर रहे हैं या नहीं?

(Interruptions)

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: Sir, I do not propose to have a second debate on the Bearer Bonds which has already been debated fully here. I

will only answer the points. "How much has been subscribed abroad?" Sir, two crores twenty lakhs has been subscribed in London and 0.60 lakhs in Bahrain up to April 1981. "Who is the highest bidder?" I have no information. "Will it add to rise in prices?" Well, this has been debated and it is my view, it will not. "Whether counterfeit bonds are being issued?" Not to our knowledge; there is no such thing. That is all I have to say.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Kulkarni.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI (Maharashtra): Sir, the Finance Minister is taking too legalistic a view of the Calling Attention. Actually a very limited and a technical view has been taken. A Calling Attention is usually to call the attention of the Government on a very urgent public matter. It is not that a Bill is to be passed. Nobody disputes it now and it has constitutional validity as per the Supreme Court's verdict. But we are mostly concerned with the atmosphere created along with these bearer bonds; and on that aspect the Finance Minister has to throw light and not protect himself under the technicality of the matter. Mr. Kalyanasundaram was saying about the strategy which has appeared in the Economic Times for taking out the black money. I do not dispute about the strategy that the Government should adopt whereby more black money comes out.

SHRI M. KALYANASUNDARAM: But it should be done secretly. Why should it be public?

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: You do not know. It is like anaesthesia. The effect will be there. It may be there or it will be there later. This is a fine operation performed by his Ministry.

If I rightly understood the Finance Minister, it seems that the money from abroad is roughly not more than Rs. 3 crores. (Interruptions). Let me be on my own track. Sir, it is not

more than three crores. I have only lead the news and I have tried to understand the implications of that news. The news seems to have appeared for two or three days in the newspapers. Somewhere there was an interesting article on the bearer bonds and the black money operations, taking out of black money, under-invoicing, over-invoicing, smuggling, and what not. They say that black money can be made white. There I want to draw his attention to one thing and I want a clarification from the Finance Minister. So far as the question of bringing out the black money is concerned, I have not got any dispute with him. But if it is taken as a rule to bring in money from abroad, which is unaccounted money—may be black money, may be money deposited abroad by politicians, the money acquired by corrupt means—through these bearer bonds and made white, what is the effect of that money? This is apart from the moral aspect, etc. Now we have in fact lost morality. We should not take any stand on morality because once the bearer bonds are there morality has gone. We know that corruption is a global phenomenon. Corruption here or corruption there has got no meaning. A very distinguished parliamentarian has said that political abuse of power and corruption are two different things. I am prepared to accept that also. But my point is, Mr. Finance Minister, is there any possibility of this type of thing whereby the nefarious activities, either of the trader or of the industrialist or of the politician or of the smuggler, will be protected under this?

Then there is another thing. Now this is my information. I know you will ask me to give a specific case, but I have not got the CBI or even the Revenue Intelligence with me. This is what I have heard in the public, particularly while talking with responsible persons. It is said that permission has been given by the Reserve Bank to the Gulf countries to open their banks. The banks of Oman and Kuwait have been opened in

[Shri Arvind Ganesh Kulkarni]

Bombay. Whether this thing has invaded Delhi or some other provincial capital, I do not know. I have informed the Finance Minister. He may enquire about it. He should not ask me to give proof. I have known only in this week when I was coming to Delhi that these banks are transgressing the limit of the banking operations, that particularly they are accepting the deposits at 10 per cent but paying money at 20 per cent, 25 per cent, in black or through the bearer bonds. Will the Government take adequate care? (Time bell rings).

आज तो शुक्रवार है, आज जुम्मे का दिन है। एक बजे जाने वाले हैं।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You put the questions.

श्री अरविंद गणेश कुलकर्णी : कवेशन ही कर रहा हूँ। आपके मार्फत और मैं कैसे कवेशन पुटअप कर सकता हूँ ?

Mr. Finance Minister, you cannot give me the information immediately, I know. This is my honest effort to give you the information. This is what I heard. Particularly in Bombay the Gulf money is coming on a very large scale.

Sir, the third point is this. I want to know in this connection also . . .

SHRI NARASINGHA PRASAD NANDA: They got money with the help of the State Government. That is the allegation.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: But ultimately it is the Reserve Bank which has permitted them. So, I think whether it is this State Government or that State Government...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a different matter. The opening of a bank branch is a different matter.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: The opening of the branches is to pass on the bearer bonds and foreign currency. Perhaps, Sir, you are an honest person.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not come from Bombay. That is the whole difficulty.

श्री अरविंद गणेश कुलकर्णी : आप वकील हैं, आनरेबल वकील हैं। पर ऐसा समझता हूँ कि टोटल प्रैक्टिस दो हजार भी नहीं हो सकती। यहाँ ऐसा चलता है। Perhaps—I do not know—you might be earning more also.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not been in the business of foreign exchange that you are dealing in Bombay. You know better because you are dealing in foreign exchange.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Sir, the third point is this. It is more or less a psychological point. The bearer bonds are for mopping up the black money. That, I understand. That, you should do. It is better than demonetising 100-rupee notes and creating panic in the country. This method might suit the Government to meet the deficit. What I am thinking is that thereby we are perpetuating the corruption. Mr. Finance Minister, I want to know this from you. Technically you may say that this is a general difficulty, a global phenomenon. This reply, I do not want. I want to say that one corruption is being put under the carpet by another. Many scandals have come up in the House—I do not want to name—right from one Chief Minister to another.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All those points have been covered.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: There is Arun Shourie.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please do not go into it.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: There is an illuminating article. He says that one scandal is being superimposed on another and that the Government is trying to bank upon the people's forgetfulness of all the scandals so that the atmosphere will subside. This is important. This is a very dangerous thing.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI SITA RAM KESRI): You are better qualified than Arun Shourie. You say what you want to say, your own views.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: Mr. Sita Ram. that is in English.

SHRI SITA RAM KESRI: instead of referring to English, you refer to Hindi.

श्री अरविंद गणेश कुलकर्णी : यह हिन्दी में नहीं है, इंग्लिश में है। आप इंग्लिश जानते ही नहीं हैं, पढ़ते ही नहीं हैं तो फिर क्या हो। हम लोग पढ़ते हैं, गिरिराज को पढ़ते हैं, श्यामलाल को पढ़ते हैं, सीताराम केसरी को भी पढ़ेंगे आप भी निम्न। The bearer bonds are meant for mopping up the black money, I can understand. But do not bank upon the patience of the people or the forgetfulness of the people. The policy rightly needed is to upgrade the people's moral attitude and to inculcate in them the Gandhian principles, of which you yourself are a champion. I know, Mr. Vankataraman is a real Gandhian. What are you going to do with this?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. Mr. Minister. There is hardly any question

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: I do not want your certificate.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Only you can issue all certificate; to all persons I know. (Interruptions).

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: The subscription for bearer bonds outside India is Rs. 2,20,00,000 in London and Rs. 0.6 lakh that is, Rs. 60,000 in Bahrain. He was saying something. Therefore, I wanted this correction to be put on record. So this is the position. He asked whether unaccounted money abroad can be subscribed for these bearer bonds. There is nothing like unaccounted money abroad because if there is a person who is living abroad with his money which is not here. I take into account his money which is here which is liable to tax and all that. If he keeps any money outside India, until I get to know about it, I do not know whether it is unaccounted or not.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: You are going to pay him.... (Interruptions).

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: He is entitled. therefore, to subscribe to these bonds and if he subscribes to these bonds, he will not be paid back in foreign exchange; he will be paid back only in Indian rupees. This is the position. He is entitled to subscribe whether he lives abroad or not. The other question he asked me was about certain banks. I have no information. If you are really interested, you should have written to me privately and you should not have mentioned these things publicly. You cannot get this information in that way. If you still write to me on this matter. I will look into it.

श्री कलराज मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश) :

उपसभापति महोदय, पिछली बार भी यह कहा गया था जब इस संबंध में चर्चा चली थी विशेष धारक बांड की खरीदने में केवल मात्र वेडमानों को अवसर प्राप्त होगा। एक तरह से यह हम कह सकते हैं कि इन में काला-बाजारियों, काला धन इकट्ठा करने वाले परिष्कृत हो रहे हैं।

[श्री कलराज मिश्र]

अभावधारियों को प्रश्रय मिलेगा और जिस प्रकार की इसकी शर्तें हैं उन शर्तों में यह नहीं कहा गया है कि कहां से पैसा ला रहे है, कहां से इकट्ठा कर रहे है, न उन्हें सम्पत्ति कर लगेगा, न आय कर लगेगा और कर्माश्रयल बैंक की जमात से वे कर्ज ले सकेंगे : ये सारी चीज उनको अवसर प्रदान कर रही है जिसके आधार पर यह लगता है कि हिन्दुस्तान के अन्दर इस प्रकार की छूट देने के बाद या कह लीजिये सरकार द्वारा घुटने टेक नीति अख्तियार करने के पश्चात् पेरलल इकोनोमी प्रारम्भ हो जाएगी जिसके कारण बड़ा नुकसान होगा। पिछली बार वित्त मंत्री महोदय ने कहा था कि एक हजार करोड़ रुपये इकट्ठा करने की दृष्टि से यह योजना लाई गई है लेकिन 30 अप्रैल तक 385 करोड़ रुपये इकट्ठे हुए हैं। इतना फर्क रहा। उसमें यह भी कहा गया था कि मुद्रास्फीति में कमी आएगी, प्राइस इंडेक्स को हम रोक सकेंगे लेकिन ऐसा नहीं हुआ। जब से घोषणा की गई तब से ले कर आज तक प्राइस इंडेक्स 290 प्वाइंट तक पहुच गया है और इन्फ्लेशन भी बड़ा तेजी के साथ बढ़ना चला जा रहा है। इसलिये वह आश्वासन उचित नहीं लगता है जिसके आधार पर कहा जा सके कि करणन रुकेगी, ब्लैक मनी रुकेगी, इस धारक बांड खरीदने के पश्चात् इकोनोमी में सुदृढता का निर्माण कर सकेंगे। अभी जो सुप्रीम कोर्ट का निर्णय हुआ उसके पश्चात्, जो फिर से बांड खरीदने की घोषणा सरकार द्वारा की गई है मैं समझता हूँ कि इसके कारण करणन को ही बल मिलेगा। मैं मंत्री जो से जानना चाहता हूँ कि जब से विशेष धारक बांड की योजना की घोषणा सरकार द्वारा की गई है और जितने रुपये के बांड खरीद गये उसके आधार

पर क्या अर्थ-व्यवस्था में इनप्लेशन में या प्राइस इंडेक्स में किसी भी प्रकार की कमी हुई, ब्लैक मनी में किसी भी प्रकार की कमी हुई?

दूसरी बात में यह कहना चाहता हूँ। श्रीमन्, इकोनामिक टाइम्स में एक एडिटीरियल छपा है इसमें कुछ बड़े अच्छे सवाल उन्होंने किए हैं वे मैं पढ़ कर मंत्री जी के सामने रखना चाहता हूँ।

श्री उपसभापति : आप सवाल कीजिए पढ़ने की जरूरत नहीं है।

श्री कलराज मिश्र : उन्होंने यह पढ़े नहीं होंगे, इसलिए मैं कोट करता हूँ :-

"Although the scheme has been held to be valid and a further issue of bonds, from which a substantial amount has already been raised, cannot really be objected to, it is worth emphasising that the scheme is basically harmful to the economy because it legitimises and even encourages black money. It is discriminatory in nature against the honest tax-payer by providing the tax-evador and hoarder of illegally acquired funds with a legitimate avenue for their open employment. The bond also makes black money transactions easier and thus assist in the growth of black money in the country. If the Government had simultaneously planned measures to ensure that tax evasion could be dealt with severely and black money would find it difficult to exist, the issue of the bearer bonds as a last opportunity for holders of black money to legitimise their holdings official would perhaps have been excusable. In the absence of such measures it is quite obvious that only a portion of the existing black money in the country will be garnered and black money oppression will continue merrily and feel secure in the knowledge that the Government of the country does not hesitate to acknowledge that it is incapable of dealing with the basic problem of black money and corruption . . ."

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You put your question now.

श्री कलराज मिश्र : श्रीमन् दो
सवाल है . .

श्री उपसभापति : आपने बहुत सारे
सवाल पूछ लिये ।

श्री कलराज मिश्र . इसके कारण श्रीमन्,
मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि जितने भी एक्ट, कानून
बने हैं चाहे कोफेपोसा, चाहे कस्टम एक्ट होगा,
सबका यहां उल्लंघन होगा और खुल करके
स्मॉलिंग को प्रचार मिलेगा । चाहे फारेन
एक्सचेंज के माध्यम से खाड खरीदने की कोशिश
हो उसमें भी प्रचार मिलेगा और देश के अंदर
भी स्मगलर्स बड़ी तेजी के साथ बढ़ेंगे । नताजा
यह होगा कि देश की आर्थिक व्यवस्था इस
प्रकार से नर्जर हो जायेगी कि जिसको आप चाहे
आई एम एफ सं लोन ले लें, चाहे जिस भी
तरिके सं लें, वह सुधरेगा नहीं । मैं मंत्री
महोदय सं इस संबंध में जवाब चाहूंगा ।

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: All
these points have been debated over
and over again. There may be some
people who think they are wiser than
the majority. They are entitled to have
that view and they can go on publicising
and writing and expressing
themselves, but you cannot expect that
everytime somebody raises an issue it
must be debated again. Therefore, I
am not prepared to debate the matter
which has been concluded by Parli-
ament.

As far as the second point is con-
cerned, whether black money has been
controlled or not, whether it can be
controlled or not, nobody can say
black money can be controlled. I
cannot say that it can be controlled
by issue of bonds. We have been tak-
ing a number of steps like income-tax
raids, action under COFEPOSA, anti-
smuggling activities, and so on. It is
a continuous process and we are tak-
ing various steps.

SHRI ARABINDA GHOSH (West
Bengal): Mr. Deputy Chairman, the
issue of special bearer bonds has been
discussed in the Lok Sabha and in
this House in detail. Still there are
some major points left. The Govern-

ment has not taken any lesson from
its earlier failure in regard to the
special bearer bonds scheme. This
failure has amply proved that it is
very difficult for the Government to
curb black money and it will only en-
courage black money holders and in-
crease inflation. This has been discussed
many times. My humble question is
this: What steps has the Government
taken to realise the income-tax dues
running into hundred of crores of ru-
pees? What positive steps are being
taken? This bearer bond is practically
a black bond. It will not serve the
purpose. The monopoly houses, the
Tatas and Birlas on whom the Gov-
ernment is practically surviving,
though they say sometimes they are
under the dictates of the Government,
the real picture is not that, the real
picture is different. There are other
methods of how to increase their black
money. They know the methods
and the Government is fully
aware of those methods. And yet
nothing has been done, no step has
been taken till today to curb black
money.

Another submission of mine is this
that confiscation of their capital, of
the monopoly houses and foreign
houses, alone is a solution to curb the
black money, to curb the parallel
economy of the country. That is the
only solution. I know the Government
will not go to that extent. The issue
of fresh bearer bonds again will be a
total failure. Only some positive steps
on the lines I suggested can yield
results. One suggestion is to recover
all the income tax dues. I would like
to know what steps the Government
is going to take in that direction. The
second suggestion is to confiscate all
capitals of the monopoly houses as
well as big foreign business magnates
without compensation. I make these
suggestions because our society is
fully based on profit and exploitation.
In this society any good gesture shown
to these exploiters will not serve any
useful purpose.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: In
reply to an earlier question I have

[Shri R. Venkataraman.]

narrated the steps that we are taking to collect income tax arrears, etc. So far as curbing black money is concerned I have mentioned the steps taken to stop smuggling, tax evasion, and so on. The hon. Member said that only confiscation of monopoly houses without compensation will solve the problem. We are elected on an election manifesto and we have to carry out our manifesto. I cannot carry out his manifesto.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Mr. Deputy Chairman, at the outset let me take this opportunity of congratulating the hon. Finance Minister on getting a very successful verdict from the Supreme Court of India on the Constitutional validity of this legislative measure. This is also an occasion I think to draw the attention of the Supreme Court of India and tell them that in the first instance they should not interfere with the fiscal policies of the Government. In any way they were extremely slow. These are matters which concern the budget and if so much time is lost the very purpose of framing the Budget is lost....

SHRI SUNDER SINGH BHANDARI (Uttar Pradesh): You mean to say that they have no right of judicial review?

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE: That is my view and I am expressing my view.

These are executive powers which are meant to achieve a certain objective, a certain purpose which the executive, with the sanction of the legislature, implement and I think these should not be lightly interfered either by the Supreme Court or the High Court. I must also say on this occasion that there has been nothing new which has come from the other side. The matter has been threadbare discussed when the Bill was before the House before it was passed into Act. The point I am making is that the Government, particularly this Finance Minister, is conscious that he is not

going to make this to be used as an excuse or escalator by blackmarketeers or traders or tax dodgers. I think the Government is well conscious that this is an essential and unavoidable step not liked by all of us to bring in money from black sources into the regular stream of our economy. Today the Frankenstein goes in the name of parallel economy. Whatever we do, only very little of it is curbed. Therefore, to the extent that this will control the money supply and bring black money into the main stream, the black money will be purified and brought into the main stream. To that extent it will reduce the money supply to profiteers, hoarders, tax dodgers and smugglers. I also want an assurance from the hon. Finance Minister—it has appeared in today's paper—that he will take very comprehensive steps to see that tax dodging is also brought under control. I want the Minister to give this assurance so that the people do not get the feeling that they can go on multiplying their black money, but they get the feeling that at some stage the Government will come forward with some sort of a measure by which they will not be able to get away from the clutches of the fiscal laws. Therefore, the question that I want to ask the honourable Finance Minister is whether, if the Government's hope of mopping up several hundred crores of rupees through this channel is realised, the Government will think of giving some benefit to the honest tax-payers of this country.

SHRI R. VENKATARAMAN: Sir, I am grateful to the honourable Member of correcting the impression that the House is against it. In fact, the majority does not express itself and the minority is always saying and it creates an impression that the minority opinion is the opinion of the House. The point which he has raised is a matter relating to the Budget. Even my very good friend cannot, by cajoling me, get the information from me. Therefore, whether I will give budgetary concessions if the Bonds are successful is a question which I will not now answer.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. We shall take up Special Mentions now. Yes, Mr. Khobragade.

REFERENCE TO THE REPORTED REMARKS OF THE SHANKARACHARYA OF BADRIKASHRAM ON UNTOUCHABILITY

श्री भा० ब० खोबरागडे (महाराष्ट्र) : उपसभापति महोदय, इस देश की एकता और अखंडता को खतरा पहुंचाने वाले एक महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न की ओर इस सदन का ध्यान मैं आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। बद्रीकाश्रम के शंकराचार्य स्वामी स्वरूपानन्द सरस्वती ने कुछ दिन पहले भोपाल में एक पत्रकार वार्ता की थी और उस पत्रकार वार्ता में उन्होंने जो कहा है मैं पढ़ रहा हूँ :

“छुआछूत हिन्दू जीवन प्रणाली का हिस्सा है, यह एक पुरानी परम्परा है जो पहले भी थी, अब भी है और आगे भी रहेगी।”

उसके बाद मैं उन्होंने उसी वार्ता परिषद् में कहा है कि :

“एक हरिजन आदमी मंदिर में पुजारी नहीं हो सकता। पूजा केवल वही आदमी कर सकता है जो जन्म से या कर्म से ब्राह्मण हो। इस के बारे में कोई समझौता नहीं हो सकता।”

शंकराचार्य जी ने ये जो अपने विचार एक पत्रकार वार्ता में बताये हैं उसका मतलब है, वह इस देश में छुआछूत का प्रचार करना चाहते हैं। एक तो कांस्टीट्यूशन ने छुआछूत अबालिश कर दी है दूसरे, सिविल राइट्स प्रोटेक्शन एक्ट में जो भी छुआछूत का प्रचार करता है उस के खिलाफ कार्यवाही हो सकती है। तो मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि जब खुले आम इस तरह से छुआछूत का अनटचेबिलिटी का अगर कोई शंकराचार्य प्रचार और प्रसार करते घुमे और यह देश की अखंडता और एकता में बाधा

निर्माण करे तो उसके खिलाफ सरकार क्या कार्यवाही कर रही है। हम ने देखा है, अनुभव किया है कि इस देश में अनटचेबिलिटी के नाम पर क्या हो रहा है क्या नहीं हो रहा है, किस तरह के काण्ड हो रहे हैं? दो दिन पहले हमने यहां चर्चा की है कि जैसे देवली में 22-24 आदिमियों का निर्दयता से खून किया गया है, उसके क्या कारण थे? हम हमेशा कहते आये हैं कि जब तक इस देश में चातुर्वर्ण्य हैं, जब तक जाति व्यवस्था है, जब तक वर्ण व्यवस्था है तब तक छुआछूत दूर नहीं हो सकती है और इसलिये जब आपके (समय की घंटी बजी) मैं ज्यादा समय नहीं लूंगा।

श्री उपसभापति : समाप्त करिये।

श्री भा० ब० खोबरागडे : इसलिये जब इस तरह से चातुर्वर्ण्य का प्रसार और प्रचार किया जाता है तो इस देश की स्वतंत्रता, इस देश की अखंडता और इस देश की एकता को कैसे कायम रखा जा सकता है ?

एक दूसरी दुख की बात यह है कि शंकराचार्य की पत्रकार वार्ता कहां हुई? भोपाल में। किस के यहां हुई? कांग्रेस मंत्री मध्य प्रदेश की, श्रीमती विमला वर्मा, उन के यहां शंकराचार्य की यह वार्ता परिपद होती है और छुआछूत को पुरस्कार दिया जाता है। आप शंकराचार्य जी के खिलाफ क्या कार्यवाही करते हैं नहीं करते है, यह मुझे मालूम नहीं, लेकिन ऐसे काम के लिये मंत्री के मकान में इस तरह की वार्ता प्रसारित की जाती है और वहां पर छुआछूत का प्रचार किया जाता है, मैं माननीय सीताराम केसरी जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ, क्या आप उस विमला वर्मा को मन्त्री पद से हटा रहे हों या नहीं हटा रहे हो? पहली बात, छुआछूत का प्रचार-प्रसार करने वाले शंकराचार्य को विमला वर्मा ने अपने घर में काहे का