

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 27th July, 2006/5 Sravana, 1928(Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock

Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Safeguard agreement with IAEA

*61. SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether the draft Bill on the US and India Nuclear Cooperation Promotion Act of 2006 states that the US President must first determine that India and the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) have concluded safeguard agreements requiring the application of IAEA safeguards in perpetuity; and

(b) if so, the reaction of Government on this which runs completely contrary to the assurance given by the Prime Minister in both Houses of Parliament that India would approach the IAEA for safeguards only after USA endorses the July 18, 2005 nuclear deal?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI ANAND SHARMA): (a) and (b) A Statement is placed on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) Section 4(b) (2) of the US House Bill entitled "United States and India Nuclear Cooperation Promotion Act of 2006" proposes a Presidential Determination that India and IAEA have concluded an agreement requiring the application of IAEA safeguards in perpetuity in accordance with IAEA standards, principles, and practices [including IAEA Board of Governors Document GOV/1621 (1973)] to India's civil nuclear facilities, materials,

and programmes as declared in India's Separation Plan, including material used in or produced through the use of India's civil nuclear facilities.

(b) The Prime Minister in his statement to Parliament on 29 July, 2006 had stated that "Before voluntarily placing our civilian facilities under IAEA safeguards, we will ensure that all restrictions on India have been lifted. The Government continues to abide by that commitment. Technical discussions have taken place on an India-specific Safeguards Agreement with the IAEA on 8 July, 2006. But there is no question of placing Indian civilian facilities under safeguards till we are assured that restrictions on civil nuclear energy cooperation with India have been lifted. Further, the Bill reported out by the House International Relations Committee is still under consideration, and at this stage, it would be difficult to predict the language of the final legislation, including any reference to the Safeguards Agreement.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, I have gone through the reply of the Government. It is clear that there are wide divergencies existing between the position of the Government of India's and the United States of America's law makers. In this context, Sir, I would like to further ask whether the IAEA safeguards proposed by the two versions of the Bill would be India-specific as committed earlier by the Prime Minister or they would be in accordance with the modern additional protocols, which are generally perceived as intrusive. This is my first question.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, the reply has made the position of the Government very clear. For the benefit of this august House and the hon. Member, I may mention that India has agreed to enter into civilian nuclear energy cooperation with the United States of America and with other international partners. As for the United States of America, July 18 Statement by the hon. Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singhji and President Bush outlines the roadmap. And it also contains reciprocal obligations, the steps to be taken by the United States of America and the steps which we have agreed to take. In July 18 Statement, what is important is that there is an implicit recognition of the fact that India has a military nuclear programme and, therefore, calls for a separation of civilian and the strategic facilities. That separation plan, we had agreed to, was filed in both the Houses of Parliament. It also requires that for the civilian nuclear facilities India enters into an agreement with the IAEA.

But that agreement would be India-specific. That agreement is required since we did not have any of our facilities under the safeguards. Under the same arrangement, even the nuclear weapon States have safeguards agreements with the IAEA. It will ensure, Sir, a multi-layer supply of reliable uninterrupted fuel of India. There is an interlocking mechanism when we talk about safeguards. It is not only uninterrupted fuel supply but it will also allow India to build up a strategic reserve and also to take corrective measures which we may need by approaching other fuel suppliers and other countries if the situation were to demand so. Sir, it is only placing our civilian facilities under IAEA and I repeat only the civilian facilities, since the military nuclear facilities have been kept out which include the power reactors the fast breeder reactors, the prototype fast breeder reactors and linking facilities-upstream and downstream. Having said that about the additional protocol, an additional protocol will also be signed. With IAEA again that arrangement is there also for the other nuclear States. That additional protocol which India will sign will not be the same as a non-nuclear weapon State. That I would like to assure the House that the discussions are on between India and the IAEA on this safeguards agreement and additional protocol in any case would follow after safeguards agreement have been concluded.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: ये टोटल * बोल रहे हैं(व्यवधान)....

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I strongly object to this.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: आप टोटल * बोल रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)....

श्री सभापति: *अनपार्लियामेंटरी है इसे expung कर दीजिए।

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Mr Chairman, Sir, I say with full sense of responsibility and I must remind the hon. Member that there is a dignity of this House. I am responding and I understand...(Interruptions)...Sir, I would like to submit one thing. what I am stating is with a full sense of responsibility. I am not unaware of the Parliament's rules and procedures and the Ministers' responsibilities. I entered Parliament in 1984 before you entered Parliament. So, don't try to teach me.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, what is this?(Interruptions)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister of this Government is behaving in a most*(Interruptions)*... यह नहीं चलेगा*(व्यवधान)*... ये क्या कर रहे हैं।....*(व्यवधान)*....

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Let him complete.*(Interruptions)*... Let him complete.*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, day in, day out in this House they are behaving in the most*(Interruptions)*... We cannot tolerate this*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, you have to protect the Minister when he is replying ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Let him complete.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, he should complete his reply first. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I know what your intention is. I am aware of that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put the second supplementary.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have to remind the hon. Member that I have replied to his supplementary. He has a right to put another supplementary and then the other Members will put questions*(Interruptions)*... and I will respond accordingly to the other supplementaries.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: But it is not upon the Minister to threaten the Member and impose seniority. What does he mean? मंत्री की जिम्मेदारी है कि ...*(व्यवधान)*....

श्री सभापति: क्या कहा मंत्री जी ने ...*(व्यवधान)*.... देखिए, वे जो बोल रहे हैं, उस पर कहा है ...*(व्यवधान)*....

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा: सभापति जी, आप चेयरमैन हैं, अगर श्री दिग्विजय सिंह जी ने कुछ गलत भी कहा है, तो आप उसको expunge कर सकते हैं ...*(Interruptions)*... but the Minister cannot threaten the Member and impose his seniority. What does he mean?*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The matter is over ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He is accusing the Minister *(Interruptions)*...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा: नहीं, यह नहीं चलेगा, हम इनके गुलाम नहीं हैं व्यवधान)... जो मर्जी में आए, ये बोलें, हम इनके गुलाम नहीं हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: What is wrong in it? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: I am prepared to raise a privilege ...*(Interruptions)*... He is* in the Parliament. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: आप question कर लीजिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Don't use any unparliamentary words. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: आप question कर लीजिए...*(व्यवधान)*....

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा: सर, प्रधानमंत्री उनके बाद सदन में आए, तो क्या प्रधानमंत्री उनसे जूनियर हो गए...*(व्यवधान)*....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put your second supplementary.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Let me be allowed to put my second supplementary. Sir, my second supplementary is...

श्री सभापति: आप बोल लीजिएगा, आपको मौका मिले तो आप बोल लीजिएगा, कह दीजिएगा ...*(व्यवधान)*

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: प्रिविलेज मोशन लाया जाए हम पर ...*(व्यवधान)* I am ready to face ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Please tell the Minister to be more restraint. ...*(Interruptions)*... This sort of ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He is misleading the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... India is going to nuclear protocol ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: Let the Minister reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, my (a) part of my question is: Would the Indian civilian nuclear programme come under the IAEA safeguard regime as that of a non-nuclear weapon State? My (b) part of my question is: Would the US also have the right to send its own weapons inspector? These are my two supplementary questions.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, just for the benefit of all the Members of the House and also the distinguished former Foreign Minister, Yashwant Sinha, I would like to say that we are in the process of negotiating with the IAEA an India specific safeguards agreement. Secondly, I would also like to make it clear that there is an inter-locking mechanism, when we sign the safeguards, which will ensure not only fuel stockpiling, as I said, uninterrupted supplies but there will also be trilateral agreements which the United State of America will have with India and the IAEA. Having said that, with regard to inspections, those will be only by the IAEA; the Safeguards Agreements will be with the IAEA and only for the civilian facilities. The determination is the sovereign determination of India. It is the scientific community which has decided upon the separation plan and identified those facilities which are civilian and the other facilities which are strategic so that India's strategic programme and the credible minimum deterrent is not undermined in any manner. There will not be inspection by any other country. It will be with the IAEA. That is what I wanted to say.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, the reply says in the last sentence, "Further the Bill reported out by the House International Relations Committee is still under consideration and, at this stage, it would be difficult to predict the language of the final legislation including any reference to the Safeguards Agreement." In the night while we were sleeping, the American House of Representatives were working, and they have finally passed the Bill which had been approved by the Committee. Now, Sir, we are all aware in the Committee's Bill, there were certain conditions which had been imposed in the 'operative part of the Bill' which are regarding determination by the U.S. President, which are regarding reporting by the U.S. President, and one of the conditions, for instance, which is incorporated in the Bill is that India shall not detonate a nuclear device. So, a voluntary moratorium is sought to be converted into a legally binding obligation in perpetuity. I am just mentioning it as one example because there are tens of them. Now, these are humiliating conditions

which are attached to this Bill. Sir, we also learn that when the Prime Minister visited St. Petersburg for the expanded G-8 Summit, he met President Bush, and according to reports and according to his own statements, he expressed India's concerns about the two Bills to President Bush. We were also told by the spokespersons that President Bush assured him that the goal post would not be shifted. But if the House of Representatives had adopted the Bill as it is, then the goal post has not only been shifted but, as one commentator said, it has also been taken out of the stadium. Therefore, I would like the Prime Minister to kindly inform the House what his discussions with President Bush are, what concerns he has expressed to President Bush and what the response of President Bush is, and whether these concerns are reflected in the Bill which has been passed by the U.S. House of Representatives.

THE PRIME MINISTER (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I should like to make it clear once again that whatever takes place within the framework of the U.S. legislative process I think, I cannot influence the U.S. legislature. We have entered into an agreement with the U.S. Administration. The parameters of that Agreement are the July 18 Statement. It is for the United States Government to ensure that while we perform our part of the bargain, the U.S. Administration also uses all its influence with the American Congress to ensure that what is contemplated is within the parameters of July 18 Statement. It is certainly true that in the Bills that were before the Committees of the House of Representatives and the Senate, these are elements which are of concern to us. And adequate representations have been made to the United States Government. And, I spoke to President Bush himself. Now, I have an assurance that the United States Administration will do all it can to ensure that the parameters, the goal posts of July 18 are not tampered with. Now, the US legislative process is still on. The House of Representatives may have taken up a Bill. There is the Senate Bill, and when there is a difference between the two Bills, there will be a reconciliation. I cannot say that I can predict what will be the end product of U.S. legislative process. All I can say is, if the United States legislative process leads to an end product which is not consistent with what we have committed, that would be the determining factor of what we can do with it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Amar Singh. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, the end product has come, ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the end product has come in the shape of the House of Representatives Bill, and that is why ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: This is not the end product. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: And that is why I asked specifically, what is the response of the Prime Minister to that?

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: This is not the end product. As I said, once the House of Representatives passes, there is a Bill which is to be voted in the US Senate. There are divergent elements.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: That is worse.

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: It may be worse. But, I think, we must have patience. We have not, signed anything. We have prepared a separation plan. The US commitment is to get from the U.S. Congress the waiver permission. Now, that process is still not complete. Let it be completed. Once it is completed, we will then determine whether there are elements in it which go beyond what we have committed in July 18 Statement. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अमर सिंह: माननीय अध्यक्ष जी, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद। प्रधानमंत्री जी ने अभी उत्तर देते हुए कहा कि जो अंतिम निर्णय होगा, उस निर्णय के आधार पर यदि अनुकूल होगा तो निर्णय लेंगे और प्रतिकूल होगा तो देखेंगे। मैं इस विवाद में नहीं पड़ना चाहता कि गोल पोस्ट में खंभा है या उसे उखाड़कर बाहर फेंक दिया गया है, लेकिन यह एक संवेदनशील मुद्दा है जिस पर सारा देश चिंतित है। मेरी समझ में सिवाय शासक दल के, सिवाय कांग्रेस के, चाहे वे वामपंथी दल हों, चाहे भारतीय जनता पार्टी हो, चाहे समाजवादी पार्टी हो और चाहे अन्ना द्रमुख के साथी हों चाहे तेलुगु देशम के साथी हों - ये सब लोग इस विषय पर चिंतित हैं। तो क्या माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी, मैं उनका बड़ा सम्मान करता हूँ, बहुत आदर करता हूँ और उनकी बात का पूरा एतबार करता हूँ, लेकिन इसके साथ-साथ विनम्रतापूर्वक कहना चाहता हूँ कि जब सदन के सभी दल, कांग्रेस के अलावा, इस मुद्दे पर एक स्वर से बोल रहे हैं, तो क्या इस मामले के ऊपर कोई संसद का रिजोल्यूशन करने के लिए वह तैयार हैं?

श्री सभापति: क्वैश्चन करिए।

श्री अमर सिंह: ताकि संसद की भावनाओं को प्रकट किया जा सके।

श्री सभापति: क्वैश्चन करिए।

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, that is the question.
...(Interruptions)...

श्री अमर सिंह: यही प्रश्न है कि क्या रिजोल्यूशन के लिए वह तैयार होंगे?

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया: यह क्वेश्चन नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: यह क्वेश्चन कैसे नहीं है? यही प्रश्न है भाई, जब सारे लोग तैयार हैं ...
(व्यवधान)... जवाब दीजिए आप रिजोल्यूशन करेंगे या नहीं? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: अमर सिंह जी, यह इस से रिलेटेड नहीं है।

श्री अमर सिंह: समाजवादी पार्टी, वृंदा कारत की पार्टी ...(व्यवधान)... ये सब रिजोल्यूशन चाहते हैं, आप बताइए रिजोल्यूशन करेंगे या नहीं करेंगे? आप सदन की भावनाओं का आदर करेंगे ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: This is a specific question.
...(Interruptions)... This is a specific question. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: बैठिए-बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा: उन्होंने स्पेसिफिक सवाल पूछा है।

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, even for the question-answer, they are opposing. ...(Interruptions)... This is something ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: यह इससे संबंधित नहीं है।

श्री अमर सिंह: वह कह दें, इस से संबंधित नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)... टीन्डीपी कह दे, बीजेपी कह दे कि ...(व्यवधान)... मैंने गलत बात कही है, कोई कह दे कि मैंने गलत कहा है।

श्री सभापति: आप ने गलत नहीं कहा है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: मैंने असत्य बात नहीं कही है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: मैंने आप को इज़ाजत दी थी क्वेश्चन पूछने की ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: यह प्रश्न है सर।

श्री सभापति: यह इस से संबंधित प्रश्न नहीं है।

श्री अमर सिंह: यह देश का सवाल है। यह प्रश्न है ...(व्यवधान)... यही प्रश्न है।

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Let the Minister give the reply.
...(Interruptions)...

श्री अमर सिंह: मंत्री जी, जवाब दें। ...(व्यवधान)... यह सदन की आवाज है।

श्री सभापति: येचुरी जी, बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: This involves the prestige of the House.
...(Interruptions)... Let the Government come out with a reply.
...(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: आप चाहते क्या हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: सर, यह सदन की आवाज है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह सदन की आवाज है।
...(व्यवधान)... लोकशाही का गला नहीं घोंट जा सकता। ...(व्यवधान)... लोकशाही का
गला नहीं घोंट जा सकता। ...(व्यवधान)... मैं बहुत जूनियर सदस्य हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: माननीय सदस्य, आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... बैठिए, बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...
आपका क्वेश्चन क्या था? ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: मेरा प्रश्न है कि कांग्रेस शासक दल के अलावा पूरा सदन चाहता है कि सदन
में इस मामले पर भी रेजोल्यूशन हो ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया: सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: इन्हें बोलने दें ...(व्यवधान)... मैंने रूलिंग दे दी है ...(व्यवधान)... मैं अब भी
कह रहा हूँ ...(व्यवधान)... मैं अब भी कह रहा हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: नहीं, नहीं, जबरदस्ती नहीं ...(व्यवधान)... कोई जबरदस्ती नहीं है।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: माननीय सदस्य, ...(व्यवधान)... नहीं, नहीं, इन्हें रोकने की जरूरत नहीं है।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: हम चाहते हैं। अगर आप भी चाहते हैं, तो आप भी शामिल हो जाइए। ...
(व्यवधान)... हम यह चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: एक मिनट, सुन लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट, सुन लीजिए।
...(व्यवधान)... अमर सिंह जी, एक मिनट, सुन लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... अगर आप इस

क्वैश्चन से रिलेटेड सप्लिमेंटरी क्वैश्चन करेंगे, तो मैं अलाऊ कर दूंगा। यह उससे रिलेटेड नहीं है।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, मैं सदन में कुछ कहना चाहती हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)... सभापति जी, मैं सदन में कुछ कहना चाहती हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)... सभापति जी, मैं आपको एक चीज़ याद दिलाना चाहती हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)... मैं आपको याद दिलाना चाहती हूँ कि बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग में ...(व्यवधान)... सभापति जी, ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Whether the Government will consider for a resolution ...(Interruptions)... Let the Government come out with a reply ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: इस पर गवर्नमेंट क्या जवाब देगी? ...(व्यवधान)... सब मिलकर आपको ज्ञापन दें, तो आप किसकी सुनेंगे? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: They can say that they don't have any reply on this ...(Interruptions)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, मैं बहुत विनम्रता से आपको याद दिलाना चाहती हूँ।
...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Cannot we even put questions?
...(Interruptions)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: एक मिनट रुकिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: सर हमें आपका प्रोटेक्शन चाहिए। ...(व्यवधान)... हमें आपका प्रोटेक्शन चाहिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: प्रोटेक्शन फुल मिल रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, this is the Question Hour. It is the right of the Member to elicit information from the Government. ...(Interruptions)... The Parliament expresses its inability ...(Interruptions)... We want a reply ...(Interruptions)... He has posed a specific question ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अमर सिंह: सर, यह एक स्पेसिफिक क्वैश्चन है। ...(व्यवधान)... इस पर हम रेज़ोल्यूशन चाहते हैं ...(व्यवधान)... इस मुद्दे पर हम सब रेज़ोल्यूशन चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... हम सब,

हमारे साथी भी हाऊस का रेज़ोल्यूशन चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)... हम प्रधान मंत्री जी का विश्वास करते हैं, उनकी इज्जत करते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: देखिए, यह इस क्वेश्चन से सम्बन्धित नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)... आप मिलकर बात करना चाहते हैं, तो बात कर लीजिए, मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। लेकिन क्वेश्चन के बाद वो आप नहीं कर सकते। नैक्स्ट! ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, मैं याद दिलाना चाहती हूँ कि बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग में यह रखा गया था। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: नैक्स्ट! येचुरी जी! ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: यह समर्थन किया था कि इस तरह का एक प्रस्ताव होना चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री अमर सिंह: इराक के मामले में हुआ है ... (व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat... (Interruptions)...

श्री अमर सिंह: इराक के मामले में हुआ है ... (व्यवधान)... कश्मीर के मामले में हुआ है। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, it is in the interest of the nation that he is putting this question ... (Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: हुआ है। ... (व्यवधान)... वह तो कश्मीर के मामले में और इराक के मामले में जो समझौता हुआ हो, लेकिन वह हाऊस की चर्चा के आधार पर नहीं, बल्कि हाऊस के बाहर बैठकर हुई, उसके आधार पर प्रस्ताव बना है। आप बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... बाद में मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। लेकिन हाऊस में नहीं। ... (व्यवधान)... चलिए। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, it does not matter whether it is outside or inside ... (Interruptions)... The question is specific and related to the subject... (Interruptions)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, मैं आपको याद दिलाना चाहती हूँ कि बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग में ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Let the Government give reply to this specific question ... (Interruptions)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, एक मिनट। ... (व्यवधान) ... सभापति जी, बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग में ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: It is not either SP or BJP ... (Interruptions) ... It is in the interest of the nation ... (Interruptions) ...

एक माननीय सदस्य: सर, लीडर ऑफ द अपोजिशन खड़े हुए हैं और ये बोल रही हैं। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सभापति: क्या आप बोल रहे हैं? ... (व्यवधान) ... लीडर ऑफ द अपोजिशन बोल रहे हैं, इनको तो अनुमति दीजिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: It is irony that even the Minister is not able to reply ... (Interruptions) ... They don't want the support of the Congress Members ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat ... (Interruptions) ...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: बी० ए० सी० की मीटिंग में यह तय हुआ था कि ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: You don't want even the hon. Leader of the Opposition put a question ... (Interruptions) ...

श्री सभापति: मैं वह सब समझ गया, ... (व्यवधान) ... आप बैठिए, प्लीज़। ... (व्यवधान) ... Let him speak ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, shall I speak? ... (Interruptions) ... वे खड़े हैं, तो ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सभापति: आप बोलिए।

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Prime Minister cited as one of the innovative factor, the legislative process of the United States of America. May I appeal to you, and also, indeed, to the Prime Minister that what is being voiced here is really a part of the total legislative process of India. And, therefore, what is being said here and the question is, my submission to you is, relevant that hon. Member, Shri Amar Singhji, suggests and puts a query "Whether through the Indian legislative process, the Prime Minister having cited the US legislative process, will you consider for a Resolution? I submit for your reconsideration. (Interruptions)

श्री जय प्रकाश अग्रवाल: क्या आपने ऐसा कभी पढ़ा है? ... (व्यवधान)... पहले कभी ऐसा हुआ है? ... (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: हुआ है। हमने दिया है। ... (व्यवधान)... जय प्रकाश जी, तब आप नहीं थे। ... हमने दिया है। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति : लीडर ऑफ अपोजीशन ने जो कहना था, कह दिया है। गवर्नमेंट रेस्पोंड करेगी, तो करेगी। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से चाहूंगा, माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी यहां बैठे हुए हैं, वे इस भावना की कद्र करें और यह सोचें कि यह सवाल न आपका है, न हमारा है, बल्कि देश के हित में हम उठा रहे हैं। इसके अंदर कोई व्यक्तिगत बात नहीं है, कोई पार्टी-पोलिटिक्स की बात नहीं है। इसी आधार पर मैं अपना रिलेवेंट सवाल पूछ रहा हूँ, इसकी भावना की तो आप कद्र करें, लेकिन पिछले साल 29 जुलाई को, I am quoting from your statement, Mr. Prime Minister. In your *suo motu* statement you say, I quote, "We committed ourselves to separating the civilian and strategic programme. However, this was to be conditional upon and reciprocal to the United States fulfilling its side of the understanding. Steps to be taken by India would be conditional upon and contingent on action taken by the United States." You further said, Sir, I quote, "Before voluntarily placing the civilian facilities under IAEA safeguards, we will ensure that all restrictions on India have been lifted." However, Sir, this is a question, both the versions of the Bill—one approved last night by the US Congress, and other before the Senate—stipulate that India has to negotiate its agreement with the IAEA before the final agreement for transfer of civilian technology is passed by them. So, have we not already violated the *suo motu* assurance that the Prime Minister has given?

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, we have not violated any assurance that I had given to this august House. We have made adequate representations to the US Government. Let that process be completed. I will come before this House, if there is any departure from what I have said, then, the country, as a whole, will have the full opportunity to make up its mind. Let the US process be completed.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Can I ask one more?

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; no. (*Interruptions*) Next question. (*Interruptions*) Next question. (*Interruptions*) Question No. 62, Shri Sanjay Raut. (*Interruptions*) Next question, Shri Sanjay Raut (*Interruptions*)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, just a clarification on the statement of the hon. Prime Minister. Does the hon. Prime Minister know that once the US passes a law, all the bilateral agreements are superseded by that law. So, from 18th July, 2005, the joint statement will be superseded by the American Law. That is the catch in it. Will the hon. Prime Minister clarify on it?

श्री सभापति: नहीं, नहीं। नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन। ... (व्यवधान) ... नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन। ... (व्यवधान) ... नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन - 62, श्री संजय राउत। ... (व्यवधान) ... श्री संजय राउत।

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: सर, एक सवाल पूछना चाहूंगा। चूंकि माननीय प्रधानमंत्री मनमोहन सिंह जी ने कहा है, उसी बात पर मैं उनको पूछना चाहता हूँ। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सभापति: नहीं। दूसरे क्वेश्चन पर आइए। ... (व्यवधान) ... दूसरा क्वेश्चन ... (व्यवधान) ... आधा घंटा तो हो गया इसी क्वेश्चन पर। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: सर, एक प्रश्न। प्लीज, एक प्रश्न। मैं सिर्फ यह पूछना चाहता हूँ। ... (व्यवधान) ... सर, आधा मिनट मैं खत्म कर दूंगा। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सभापति: नहीं। मैं एलाऊ नहीं कर रहा हूँ। ... (व्यवधान) ... मैं एलाऊ नहीं कर रहा हूँ। ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, I had given my name for this question.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: *

श्री सभापति: एक ही प्रश्न पर आधा घंटा हो गया है, अगला क्वेश्चन कॉल कर लिया गया है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री शाहिद सिद्दिकी: *

श्री सभापति: वह सब ठीक है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: *

*Not recorded.

श्रीमती वृंदा कारतः *

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराजः *

डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशीः*

श्री यशवंत सिन्हाः *

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराजः *

श्री सभापतिः कुछ रिकार्ड पर नहीं जा रहा है।...(व्यवधान)... पहले उनका क्वेश्चन पूरा होने दीजिए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराजः अगर प्रधानमंत्री जी का यही रवैया है तो हम सदन से वाक-आऊट करते हैं।

(तत्पश्चात् कुछ माननीय सदस्य सदन से बाहर चले गए)

श्री अमर सिंहः हम भी वाक-आऊट करते हैं।

(तत्पश्चात् कुछ माननीय सदस्य सदन से बाहर चले गए)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next Question, 63. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question No. 64. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question No. 65. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, we want that the Government should give us an assurance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That question is over. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: How can that question be over, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... It is a serious matter concerning ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It may be a serious matter, but I am sorry ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Why can't the Government give us an assurance? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Government is not under my control. ...*(Interruptions)*... I cannot dictate anything to the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... I cannot dictate anything to the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Government is here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Let them give an assurance to the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 65.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, Question Number 62 is there. He had raised a point. I presume, it is there on the Table of the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 62.

Sports infrastructure in rural areas

*62. SHRI SANJAY RAUT: Will the Minister of YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that there is acute shortage of sports infrastructure facilities in rural areas;

(b) if so, the reasons therefor and the steps taken to start an effective programme for youth of rural areas; and

(c) the details of the schemes under which financial assistance is provide for the promotion of sports in the country through NGOs and performance review of such schemes, particularly in Maharashtra State?

THE MINISTER OF PANCHAYATI RAJ AND YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR): (a) to (c) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) Yes, Sir.

(b) As 'Sports' is a State subject in the Constitution, the primary responsibility for the creation of sports infrastructure facilities throughout