

RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 11th August, 2010/20th Shravana, 1932 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

RE: MAHARASHTRA ISSUE

MR. CHAIRMAN : Question No. 241.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI (Maharashtra) : Sir before taking up the Question Hour I would say that I have given a notice again on the Maharashtra issue. The other day we had a discussion. I had requested that this matter may be taken up by keeping aside the Question Hour and other business of the House. Sir, the matter has become serious because there is no way out...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Could you give me just one minute please?

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Your request has been considered very carefully. The Chair wishes to give a ruling on it.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Before you give your ruling, let me argue my case. If you are giving a ruling, give me few minutes to argue my case and, thereafter, you can give your ruling, Sir, my only argument is : the other day when I spoke, I had no books with me. Today, fortunately, I have brought a book called, "Practice and Procedure of Parliament" by Shri M.N. Kaul and S.L. Shaktiher.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Yes, we are all aware of it.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, this book has clearly said that if a matter is not started in the court, it can be discussed in the House. They have given a number of illustrations, I would not take them. But that is not the only thing. They have given two to three other reasons also.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Joshi, all this has been considered and in the light of it and the substantive arguments that you made in the Chairman's Chamber, this calls for a ruling and....

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, I am sorry because....

MR. CHAIRMAN : You can't prevent me from giving a ruling on a matter which has been raised.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, the people are suffering in Maharashtra.

MR. CHAIRMAN : No, but you please listen to the ruling first.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, I represent the State of Maharashtra. Why can't it be discussed?
...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please listen to the ruling.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : They have said the Right to Freedom is the most important freedom. It is...

MR. CHAIRMAN : There is a ruling which is the practice of the House...

SHRI BALVANT ALIAS BAL APTE (Maharashtra) : Fairness demands that before a ruling is given...

MR. CHAIRMAN : How are you anticipating? ...(Interruptions)... No, no, I am afraid...(Interruptions)... Please, I expect hon. Members.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Once you give a ruling, I will not be able to speak.

SHRI BALWANT ALIAS BAL APTE : It is the right of a Member. It is not a privilege granted by you. It is a right of a Member to argue before you give a ruling.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The argument has been heard. Please...(Interruptions)... This is very unfair...(Interruptions)... Everybody, please ...(Interruptions)... Joshiji ...(Interruptions)...

श्री संजय राजत (महाराष्ट्र) : सर, हमारी बात तो सुन लीजिए...(व्यवधान)...

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, entire Maharashtra is agitated for the last fifty years and injustice is done to Maharashtra...(Interruptions)... I am sorry to say ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : We are not pronouncing on that matter...(Interruptions)...

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, *sub-judice* matters were discussed in this House a number of times.

MR. CHAIRMAN : We have very great respect for you. You have been the presiding officer. I urge upon you to resume your place and listen to the ruling and please tell your colleagues to do

likewise...*(Interruptions)*...None of this is going on record....*(Interruptions)*... None of this is going on record....*(Interruptions)*... Look, if issues in this House are going to be argued on these terms, then, there is no need for a procedure. This has been argued very comprehensively. The hon. Member has been discussing this matter for sometime...*(Interruptions)*... We have gone over all that...*(Interruptions)*... If this is an effort to restrain the Chair from giving a ruling, then I am sorry it is a very sad day...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI Y.P. TRIVEDI (Maharashtra) : *

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am sorry ...*(Interruptions)*... It cannot be ...*(Interruptions)*... Please resume your seats...*(Interruptions)*...No, no...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHARATKUMAR RAUT (Maharashtra) : *

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am sorry. We have to go by procedures ...*(Interruptions)*... We have received a firm advice on this...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka) * :

MR. CHAIRMAN : You see, this is not the court of law. This matter is before a court of law the highest court in the country ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka) *

MR. CHAIRMAN : Is there a provision for converting this House into a court of law?...*(Interruptions)*... I am fully aware of the ruling given by my predecessors ...*(Interruptions)*... It is in the light of all that, a decision is being given ...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry. I regret very much, but I have to say that you are constraining the Chair from giving a ruling which is absolutely unprecedented...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM (Andhra Pradesh) * :

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am afraid, you are exercising your right in a very improper manner ...*(Interruptions)*... I cannot hear anything ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (महाराष्ट्र) * :

SHRI VILASRAO DAGADOJIRAO DESHMUKH (Maharashtra) : Sir, we are worried about the atrocities on Marathi-speaking people in the border areas of Karnataka. So, some direction from the Chair is required.

* Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I have been given to understand that this matter is under active consideration of the Supreme Court of India there is no higher court in the country...*(Interruptions)*... The argument is to be made in the court, not here ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI VILASRAO DAGADOJIRA DESHMUKH : Sir, the matter before the Supreme Court is regarding the dispute. They are talking about the atrocities issue which is not before the Supreme Court.

MR. CHAIRMAN : There is no information on the subject which has been raised...*(Interruptions)*...You give a notice. I will give you a Zero Hour submission...*(Interruptions)*...No, no. The Question Hour cannot be suspended. I am sorry...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry, Joshiji...*(Interruptions)*...We have been discussing this matter for several days.

श्रम और रोजगार मंत्री : सर, वहां पर शांति है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : There is no information on the subject which has been raised...*(Interruptions)*... You give a notice. I will give you a Zero Hour Submission ...*(Interruptions)*...No, no. The Question Hour cannot be suspended. I am sorry...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry, Joshiji ...*(Interruptions)*... We have been discussing this matter for several days.

श्रम और रोजगार मंत्री (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे) : सर, वहां पर शांति है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let us not start an unmanageable argument here ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, I plead with you. Go back to your places. Allow the Question Hour to run ...*(Interruptions)*... देखिए, हर चीज का एक तरीका होता है।...*(व्यवधान)*... The Chair is not pronouncing on that ...*(Interruptions)*... Look, that is a matter of some contention. There is another Member who is saying something different ...*(Interruptions)*... It cannot be done in the Question Hour. The Question Hour is for questions...*(Interruptions)*... I think, this has become the practice in this House that the rights of Members are trampled upon in the Question Hour*(Interruptions)*... You are entitled to your point of view...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES (SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL) : Former hon. Speaker, Shri Joshi, is also rushing to the well of the House!...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Is it the wish of the House that the Question Hour should not go?...*(Interruptions)*....

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No, No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : If every matter, arising between two States, is raised in the House and Members rush into the Well, then, it is not proper...*(Interruptions)*...It is an inter-State dispute ...*(Interruptions)*...The matter is in the court, then, why is it being raised here?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM : There is no issue...*(Interruptions)*...It cannot be discussed here...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am sorry it cannot be done...*(Interruptions)*...Question No. 241...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश चन्द्र अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय सभापति महोदय, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है कि क्या सदन को इतनी देर अव्यवस्थित रखा जा सकता है...*(व्यवधान)*... आप इस पर कोई रूलिंग दे दीजिए...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : No argument can be debated from the place other than assigned to you....*(Interruptions)*... So, there is no locus for what you are saying ...*(Interruptions)*...The House is adjourned for fifteen minutes.

The House then adjourned at fourteen minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at thirty minutes past eleven of the clock,

[MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, I am thankful to you for the solution that we have found after going to your Chamber. My request is that in some way or the other this issue has to be discussed in the House. The suggestion that was made in your Chamber was to take it as a Calling Attention for which our Party has no objection. Sir, if you take this as a Calling Attention Notice, the matter will be thoroughly discussed.

MR. CHAIRMAN : You give a notice. It will be considered...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K.B. SHANAPPA (Karnataka) : Sir, Mahajan Commission...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. PRABHAKAR KORE (Karnataka) : Sir ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please don't raise another discussion...*(Interruptions)*... Please, please ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI : That is unnecessary ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Hon. Members, please allow the Question Hour proceed ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GOVINDRAO ADIK (Maharashtra) : The Chair has given the ruling...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Thank you.

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा) : सभापति महोदय, इस आसन पर आज आपके तीन साल हो गए हैं। हम आपका अभिनंदन करते हैं।

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद (बिहार) : सर, पाणि जी ने कितनी अच्छी बात कही है।

MR. CHAIRMAN : He is good friend of mine. Thank you. Question No. 241.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Illegal funds from abroad

*241. SHRI MAHENDRA MOHAN : Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government is aware that several anti-national organizations in the country have been receiving huge amount of illegal funds from abroad through various channels and using the same for violent activities;

(b) if so, the facts and the details thereof;

(c) whether the Central Government's efforts to check the flow of funds have been inadequate; and

(d) if so, the latest strategies Government proposes to adopt to stop the flow of illegal funds in the country?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN) : (a) to (d) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) and (b) Under Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 34 terrorist organisations have been banned. Apart from this, the ban order applies also to organisations listed in the Schedule to the UN Prevention and Suppression of Terrorism (Implementation of Security Council Resolution) Order,