

One Hundred and Twentieth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture on Demands for Grants (2007-08) of the Ministry of Culture.

Status of Implementation of Recommendations Contained in the Eight Report of Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Information Technology on Demands for grants (2010-11) of the Department of Telecommunications, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology

संचार और सूचना प्रौद्योगिकी मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सचिन पायलट) : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं दूरसंचार विभाग, संचार और सूचना प्रौद्योगिकी मंत्रालय की अनुदान मांगों (2010-11) के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित सूचना प्रौद्योगिकी संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के आठवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में एक वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Reported remarks of Railway Minister of Maoist

Activities and Lalgarh incident

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, I am little disappointed that the hon. Prime Minister has just walked out of the House. Sir, through you, I would have made the request that he should stay back in the House and listen to this three minutes of my submission, because he, actually, belongs to this House. The reason why I am saying this is, the hon. Prime Minister is on record, at least on three occasions, to say that the gravest danger to India's internal security is Maoist violence. We would like to know from the hon. Prime Minister, very pointedly, how can a Member of the Union Cabinet, holding the rank of a Cabinet Minister, openly collaborating with the Maoists and protecting and patronizing them, also going to the media and saying that what has been said about a Maoist leader who was killed in an encounter, as saying, was an open murder according to media reports and the next day continues to justify this by saying that she stands by what she had said. Can you have a situation in the Government that you have one Union Cabinet Minister saying that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has been permitted by the Chairman. ...*(Interruptions)*... It has been permitted by the Chairman. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: When the Chairman has permitted, who are they to interrupt? ...*(Interruptions)*... Who are they? ...*(Interruptions)*... This is an issue of serious concern. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All of you sit down please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yechuryji, the Chairman has permitted you. So, you please speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... आप बैठिए प्लीज ...*(व्यवधान)*... I have allowed Mr. Yechury. आप बैठिए प्लीज ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (West Bengal): Sir, protect the Member. ...*(Interruptions)*... They are Ministers, but not Members of this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... They do not belong to this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, ये डिस्टर्बेन्स कर रहे हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*... सदन से बाहर भेजिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has been permitted by the Chairman. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please listen to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Zero Hour notice has been admitted by the Chairman, you cannot disrupt like this. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are all member of the Council of Ministers. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please adhere to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please adhere to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: (Jharkhand): Sir, he is a Member of the other House. ...*(Interruptions)*... How can he be allowed to interrupt? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please adhere to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... The hon. Chairman has admitted this notice for the Zero Hour; and, I have to permit him to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, please ask him to sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, ask him to go to his own House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, can a Member of other House disrupt this House? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no, you please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* I am again requesting you to. *...(Interruptions)...* You are members of the Council of Ministers. You should help the Chairman in conducting the business of the House. *...(Interruptions)...* When the Chairman has admitted it to Zero Hour you cannot interfere. *...(Interruptions)...* He has not yet started. *...(Interruptions)...* This subject has been discussed. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: सर, ये क्यों बोल रहे हैं *...(व्यवधान)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is this, Sir? *...(Interruptions)...* A Member of the other House is interrupting this House. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SHIPPING (SHRI MUKUL ROY): But, Sir, I am a Member of this House. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are a Member of this House, but you are a Minister also. Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* This Zero Hour Notice has been permitted by the Chair. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the point I am raising is, I think, a point of very important Constitutional propriety. The Leader of the House says that Maoism is the gravest threat to the internal security of the country. Can you have, in the collective decision making process of the Union Cabinet, a Cabinet Minister who is openly patronizing and defending the Maoists? *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yechury, you please go ahead. *...(Interruptions)...* You please go ahead. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: How are you allowing them to disrupt, Sir? *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you replying on behalf of the Government? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am, therefore, saying that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Here is an authentic report that I am submitting. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, on this issue, I am giving you an authenticated report. ...*(Interruptions)*... I authenticated this report. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am saying that she has justified what she has said about the killing of a Maoist leader in an encounter. She has said that it was an open murder. ...*(Interruptions)*... She has defied the Government agencies, and has openly said that the Government has indulged in a murder. ...*(Interruptions)*... And, she very proudly says that she associates herself with that. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is an absolute negation of authority, bestowed upon her as a Cabinet Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, can a Minister who is a Member of the other House intervene and interfere in the affairs of Rajya Sabha? ...*(Interruptions)*... Give a ruling, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is a matter of Rajya Sabha. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MUKUL ROY: I also have a ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I also have a point of order. The Members of the Union Council of Ministers can take part in the proceedings of the House but the Members of the Union Cabinet who are not Members of this House cannot disrupt the Zero Hour proceedings in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: How can he do this, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... Give a ruling, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have asked my ruling ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, please.

SHRI MUKUL ROY: Sir, I am a Member of this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Mr. Mukul Roy, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Yechury, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MUKUL ROY: Sir, first I am a Member of this House, then, I am a Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... See, Zero Hour is admitted by the Chairman after considering the admissibility. The Chairman has admitted a Zero House Notice and in that Members who have given the notice alone can speak. There should be no interruptions or interference because three minutes are given to the Members and no Member – it is not only in this case, but even otherwise – can disturb the hon. Members who have given a notice. Once the Chairman has gone through the process of admissibility, then, disturbance, particularly, by a Council of Minister, I feel, is not a good practice. It is not a good practice. It is not a good practice. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MUKUL ROY: He should not mislead, taking advantage of the permission. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. You may have your ...*(Interruptions)*... There are other ways. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have given the ruling Mr. Mukul Roy that no Member can disturb once the Chair has gone through the process of admissibility.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Can I continue, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI): His three minutes are over, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: My three minutes begin now.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Mukul Roy. You are in the Council of Ministers. Please respect the ruling.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the point that I am raising is, I consider, a matter of grave Constitutional propriety. You have a collective decision making process in the Union Cabinet and the Cabinet is a collective body. A collective body is headed by the Prime Minister of India and that Prime

Minister is on record in both the Houses of Parliament and outside that, "Maoists violence constitutes the gravest threat to India's internal security." ...*(Interruptions)*... This is, Sir, the Statement of the hon. Prime Minister. I would like to know, Sir, : Does the Constitution and the Constitutional scheme of things permit a Member of the Union Cabinet holding the rank of a Cabinet Minister, under oath of this very Constitution, to protect the Constitution, to protect the unity and integrity of our country openly to support the Maoists, to patronize the Maoists and, actually, permit them? ...*(Interruptions)*... Is it permissible in this, particular, system now? I think it is not. That is why, I wish that the Prime Minister were here. We had requested him to stay back, but he is not here. Not only I authenticate this, I am also giving it. But it is also an open justification and defence that the Minister has made of her, I repeat, Sir, "The defence of the fact that a person, a Maoists leader killed in an encounter was murdered." This is the term that she has used that he was murdered and not killed in an encounter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MUKUL ROY: This is not correct, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Let me complete. In the speeches, if the media reports are to be believed, she has said that the person who has been killed in the encounter is a shahid. That means, he is a martyr. A person who is involved in the violence of the Maoist variety, is a martyr! Okay, you may charge me by saying that I am talking about my Party-255 cadre of my Party have been killed by them. They all are shahid ...*(Interruptions)*... They are all shahid ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not the issue.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Okay; Sir. That is not the issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... But the point, Sir, is that when that issue was raised here by the hon. Leader of the Opposition, we have heard in the media that a Motion of Privilege has been moved against him. *(Time-bell rings)* We would like to know what is the position on that. We want to know whether a Motion of Privilege has been moved against the Leader of the Opposition on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That has nothing to do with this. ...*(Interruptions)*... That has nothing to do with this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: We would like your opinion. That's all. ...*(Interruptions)*... We only like to know what happened. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is over. Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad to associate. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Prithviraj ji, do you want to say something on this? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad is also on the same subject. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, please. Wait. Okay. Yes, Mr. Prithviraj Chavan.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY; THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI PRITHVIRAJ CHAVAN): Sir, when this issue was raised first by the hon. Leader of the Opposition, I stood up and said that we will find out from the hon. Minister when we had a chance to personally talk about it and come back to the House because, these are all media reports and my friends tell me that nothing of this sort happened. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing of this sort happened. So, are we going to depend on media reports? ...*(Interruptions)*... So, let us, Sir, find out what happened. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no; please. ...*(Interruptions)*... When a responsible Minister is saying that it is only media report, I think, you should believe it.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the manner in which the Minister has replied, I am satisfied that he is also not convinced. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is also not convinced about his reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; it is not open for discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not open for discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad, please confine to these points only.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, I associate myself with the points made, and I also want to inform the House that yesterday I saw myself on television the hon. Minister stating publicly that 'as my party Chief, I have got the right to make that statement which I have made and which I will continue to justify.' ...*(Interruptions)*... That is a serious breach of collective responsibility. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Chavan, I have seen this with my own eyes.

But, Sir, there is one thing which is very important. ...*(Interruptions)*... Kindly appreciate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, please.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: The Leader of the Opposition is a very distinguished constitutional expert. He raises it and if a threat of privilege is being given, then that is a patent violation of Article 105 of the Constitution. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, there is no valid privilege notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no valid privilege notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, there should be no intimidation. Kindly allow me, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... and, therefore, if privilege is involved ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have not taken cognizance of the privilege notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no valid privilege notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no valid privilege notice before the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is over. Yes, next, Mr. Ashwani Kumar.

China's Military build-up against the Country

SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR (Punjab): Sir, I am grateful to you for permitting me to raise an issue of great national importance which concerns our national security. Sir, we are informed on the authority of the Pentagon Report that China is undertaking a massive military build up on the Indian border. It has deployed CSS-5 missiles which has 2700 kilometer range on our borders.