

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you hear me for one minute, you will not require it. (Interruptions) Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, under the rules, as I view them, and under the practice which obtains in this House, I am not a mere post office between Mr. Malik and the Privileges Committee. I have some duty to perform—because a Minister may be charged wrongly, a false document may be brought, a false newspaper report may appear, all types of things may happen. Already the word “probably” disappeared from the last document which has been put before me. There was this “Probably” even according to the Chief Minister there. I think we will stop at that.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: What you have said is completely borne out by what May says in this connection in May's Parliamentary Practice. I would like to tell Mr. Bhupesh Gupta that as far as these kinds of privileges are concerned where the Ministers are accused of having made a wrong statement, this is the practice. After all, the Ministers give their replies on the basis of the information that is supplied to them, they have no personal knowledge. Therefore, May says that unless deliberately a Minister...

MR. CHAIRMAN: But I have already given a ruling on that.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: That is why you have to satisfy yourself that *prima facie* there is a case of breach of privilege. Therefore, what Mr. Bhupesh Gupta has said is not what...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are quite right. I have laid it down. I think the matter may rest here till tomorrow because I have got everything now in my hand. Mr. Malik and everybody else may feel assured that I will go through them and come back. Now, will you come and take the Chair?

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : श्रीमन्....

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : एक बात की सफाई नहीं हुई ।....

श्री समापति : आप थोड़ा बंद करें तो अच्छा होगा । आप बोलना शुरू करेंगे तो मैं ज्यादा जल्दी भाग जाऊंगा ।

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : श्रीमन्....

PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY SHRI C. M. STEPHEN, MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS

[Mr. Deputy Chairman in the Chair]

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS (SHRI C. M. STEPHEN): Sir, with your permission, I rise to discharge an unpleasant duty by way of a personal explanation—unpleasant because it seems out of certain observations which a parliamentarian for whom I have the highest respect, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, made yesterday. I would not like to enter into a controversy with him because he is one of the parliamentarians whom I hold in high esteem. Now yesterday he said that I went to Calcutta and gave a call for the overthrow of the Government of West Bengal and made that charge, as is usual with him, with a hammer and tong against me in language which could have been a little modest. That is all I could say.

There are two questions. One whether I gave a call like that. Second, because I am a Minister, I am barred from making such a call. My humble submission is that I never made a call for the overthrow of that Government. In today's *Patriot* the correspondent from Calcutta reports like this:

“But Mr. Stephen, perhaps uncertain of Prime Minister Indira Gandhi's mind, refused in Calcutta to endorse Mr. Panja's battle-cry. Instead he modified it with a general exhortation to “wipe out Marxism from Bengal and Kerala”

[Shri C. M. Stephen]

Now in the *Statesman* the report is like this:

"The Congress(I) leader, Mr. C. M. Stephen, said here on Sunday that he did not want to make any comment on the State Congress (I) slogan, "CPI(M), quit Bengal" because the CPI(M) would immediately allege that a Union Minister was providing inspiration to the movement. But he said that the "reactionary, authoritarian and foreign inspired philosophy of the Marxists should be wiped out" I take the slogan in this sense. I do not want Mr. Jyoti Basu himself to be thrown into the Bay of Bengal....He said that it did not matter if the Left Front Government remained in office. He was sure it would collapse on its own. But he told the meeting that the Communists had betrayed the country."

Now from this it is clear. . . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): I quoted from the *Times of India*.

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: Now there are three things; (i) philosophy of the party; (ii) the party; and (iii) what the party is doing in the Government. In West Bengal the party being a constituent of the Government the United Front Government is a party to what it is doing. The Marxist Party is a constituent of the United Front Government. Apart from the Government, there is the party and there is the philosophy of the party. I attack the philosophy of the party and its performance from 1921 onwards saying that at crucial stages in the history of the country the Marxist and the Communist Party have betrayed us. I told this to my workers; it was not a public meeting. And I said that this philosophy of violence and murder must be wiped out from India because that stands as a hinde-

rance for the socialist revolution of the nation. You may differ. The question is whether an attack on a philosophy is an attack on the Government. Mr. Gupta says that if I attack a philosophy, then I attack the party and if I attack the party, I attack the Government of which that party is a constituent. That means, when I attack any party, not the Government, then I am asking for the overthrow of the Government. I made it very clear that I do not mind the Government remaining.

As far as I am concerned, every Minister has got two personalities. He is a Minister and he is a political being. And as a political being I have got certain functions to perform, which I will continue to perform, Whether any party is in the Government or not is absolutely irrelevant as long as the party exists, and contests between that party and other parties continue. It makes no difference whether my party is in Government or outside. It makes no difference whether their party is in Government or outside. The contest between the two parties will have to continue. It can never abate at all, and let us not become nervous when that is stated and when I attack the philosophy. If they can call our party as authoritarian, if they can call our party as reactionary, if they can call our party as bourgeois-oriented party, if they can call our party as an American-inspired party, please give me the freedom as a political being, in spite of myself being a Minister, to call you authoritarian, reactionary, anti-socialist or inspired.

I must add, the controversy will have to continue. Certainly, my party is in Opposition there. Every Opposition party would like the Government to go and itself to come in. The question is: What is the method? If a Constitutional provision at the Centre is misused, you can attack. If an extra-Constitutional method is used, you can attack. If I carry a campaign to corrode the base of the

party there, and to pull down their Government, which is possible, then you cannot attack me. The failure of the Janata Government was because the base was lost. The attack was going on. This freedom is a privilege, a right and a duty of an Opposition party. I did nothing more than that. And I made it very clear that I did not mind the Government going on because, according to me, we are not interested in pulling down anybody because we believe leaving the Government to stew in their own juice. They are stewing already. This is very clear from the results of the Panchayat elections. It is very clear from the Chatra Parishad elections there. (*Interruptions*) One minute. Let me complete. Out of 280 members elected in the Chatra Parishad elections, 250 members were elected from the colleges. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. KALAYANSUNDARAM
(Tamil Nadu): On a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please hear him.

SHRI M. KALAYANSUNDARAM
Is it a personal explanation?

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: Yes, it is. Another important thing is this. When Mr. Bhupesh Gupta complains against us, may I mention another matter also? Here is a news report coming today of the West Bengal Government going to Punjab and giving a call to pull down that Government. Here is a report. Have they got the right? He says that he went there to open, to inaugurate, a Left Front exhibition there. Whether it is in his jurisdiction to go to Punjab and inaugurate a West Bengal exhibition there, I do not know. He has said:

"...the Left Front Government in West Bengal was 'apprehensive' of Mrs. Indira Gandhi's moves be-

cause she was known for toppling non-Congress-I Government . . .

"He added that in Punjab there was a 'weak' Government and the Congress-I people themselves might topple it. In Andhra Pradesh Chief Minister Dr. Chenna Reddy was 'listed to go', and the next turn might be of the Karnataka Chief Minister."

Therefore, the West Bengal Minister can go to Punjab and attack the Punjab Government, he can attack the Andhra Pradesh Government, he can attack the Karnataka Government, he can attack Mrs. Indira Gandhi as a toppler of non-Congress (I) Government, and we should hear it, keep our mouths shut and do nothing at all! This is his privilege. He says. This is what he was saying.

The second point which Mr. Bhupesh Gupta raised was very painful. He emphasised on the money that was spent on my travel to Calcutta. I went on official duty. Even otherwise, is it that a Minister who goes anywhere, should not open his mouth? Is it that he should not meet party members, and if he meets his party members, then immediately that money that is used for the purpose of official tour must be refunded? If that is the case, then if I devote five minutes' time for meeting Congress workers, on that basis you will ask me to make a proportionate refund from the salary that I am getting. That is what will happen. Is it the position that we must take? Let us not be small in the approach of these things. We are political beings going around. If Mr. Bhupesh Gupta goes out with a Select Committee, he may have to meet members of his party, he may have to talk to them, even while collecting money from the Rajya Sabha. Even so, when I go, I may

[Shri C. M. Stephen]

have to meet my party members. We will have to take up this position because we are political beings.

One more explanation I wanted to give. He spoke about the statement that I made on telephones. I clarified my stand in the Lok Sabha. I said: the telephone may be surrendered. This was misquoted. I said it here itself, because Mr. Dhabe raised the question of rebate. I told him that this is not part of the contract. Then he insisted on the rebate. I said, you surrender your telephone if you want a rebate on the money that is given, not on the basis of unsatisfactory service. (*Interruptions*). That is on record. I said it here. I said nothing more than that there. Although it was misquoted, I clarified it. I called a press conference the next day and I clarified it. Only if a subscriber insists that he must have the money back, then only he may surrender the telephone. If it is unsatisfactory service, we own up that it is unsatisfactory to a certain extent. We own up the responsibility to correct it. There are certain constraints. In spite of these constraints, things can be improved. All efforts will be made to improve it. There my stand is apologetic. But when there is the demand for rebate, then my stand is, "Please surrender the telephone back; I cannot agree to that"

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY (West Bengal): Why?

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: That is a different matter.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: Why should it be surrendered?

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: I am only making a personal explanation. It is only with respect to the rebate that I said it, not with respect to the other thing. It was not in a challenging

mood. This is all the personal explanation that I wanted to make.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we go to Calling Attention....

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, I was mentioned....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No...

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I was mentioned again and again.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I do not allow it.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: You have to hear me.... (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not allow it. It is against the rules.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: This is a serious matter....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You seek a personal explanation. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Kindly hear me.

SHRI P. RAMAMURTI (Tamil Nadu): You allowed him to give more than a personal explanation—a lecture.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was a personal explanation.... (*Interruptions*). I would like to read rule 241.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I would like to put the record straight.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not allow it. Mr. Bhupesh Gupta will not go on record. (*Interruptions*) This is the rule. Please take your seat. Rule 241 says:

"A member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is

no question before the Council, but in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward, and no debate shall arise."

Therefore, there is no question of a debate.

(Shri Bhupesh Gupta continued to speak.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not allow it.

(Shri Bhupesh Gupta continued to speak.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not debatable. I do not allow it.

(Shri Bhupesh Gupta continued to speak.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not going on record.

(Shri Bhupesh Gupta continued to speak.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We now go to the Calling Attention. Please take your seat. Mr. A. G. Kulkarni.

(Shri Bhupesh Gupta continued to speak.)

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : श्रीमन्, आप अपने वचन पर रहिये । आपने कहा था कि स्टीफन साहब को बोलने दीजिए फिर आपकी बात मैं सुनूंगा

श्री उपसभापति : यह विषय सदन के सामने नहीं है तो किस विषय पर आपकी बात सुनें । कालिग-अटेंशन होने दीजिये ।

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : आप एक मिनट मेरी बात सुनिये ।

श्री उपसभापति : कोई ऐसा विषय नहीं है सदन के सामने । पहले कुलकर्णी जी को (Interruptions) मैं सारी बात सुनने नहीं बैठा हूँ । मैं आपकी बात नहीं सुनूंगा ।

(Interruptions) This is not a matter for debate. Mr. A. G. Kulkarni.

SHRI S. W. DHABE (Maharashtra): My name also has been mentioned...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He was replying to the point raised by you. Please take your seat.

SHRI S. W. DHABE: Telephone has nothing to do with that controversy...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us not have a debate on this. Shri A. G. Kulkarni.

SHRI S. W. DHABE: If you do not allow me to speak I will have to walk out.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat.

SHRI JAHARLAL BANERJEE (West Bengal): Why don't you allow him?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow. We will take up Calling Attention. Please do not disturb...

(Interruptions).

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : आपने कहा था कि स्टीफन साहब को बोलने दीजिये फिर मैं आपकी बात सुनूंगा ।

श्री उपसभापति : इस तरह का कोई प्रश्न सदन के सामने नहीं है ।

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : : श्रीमन्, आपने कहा था

श्री उपसभापति : ऐसा कोई विषय है नहीं ।

SHRI S. W. DHABE: I only want to say...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I won't allow you. Please take your seat.

SHRI S. W. DHABE: If you do not allow me to break, I walk out.

(At this stage the hon. Member left the Chamber.)

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : श्रीमन्, आज के अखबार में है कि सरकार क्या कर रही है । सरकार ने ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This will not go on record. You cannot refer to a matter which is not permitted by me or by the Chairman. I won't allow you. Mr. A. G. Kulkarni.

(Shri Rameshwar Singh continued to speak.)

श्री उपसभापति : मैं इसको उठाने की परमीशन नहीं देता हूँ ।

SHRI JAHARLAL BANERJEE: On a point of order. Is it not proper that when in the course his personal explanation some reference is made to some hon. Member who is present here, he should be given an opportunity to clarify his statement?

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: No reference was made.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Certain matters were raised earlier by the hon. Member and the Minister was only replying to that. Again, the hon. Member should not reply.

SHRI JAHARLAL BANERJEE: You should be impartial. The Member who is referred to must get some opportunity to give his personal explanation. I think this is proper.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. Mr. A. G. Kulkarni.

SHRI JAHARLAL BANERJEE: As a protest against the partial attitude of the Chair, I walk out.

(At this stage the hon. Member left the Chamber.)

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : हमें आपका आदेश शिरोधार्य होगा...

श्री उपसभापति : कालिग-अटेंशन पर पहले प्रश्न पूछने दीजिये । आप इस बारे में अलग से प्रश्न पूछिये...

(Interruptions)

श्री कल्पनाथ राय : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आप.... (Interruptions).

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : इस तरह ... (Interruptions).

श्री उपसभापति : आप मुझ से बात करिये । आप उनसे बात मत करिये । (Interruptions)

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव (बिहार) : हम लोगों को उंगली दिखाने ... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये... (Interruptions) Order, please. (Interruptions) Order, please. Mr. Kulkarni. (Interruptions) Order, please. Order please.

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव : यह कैसे कह रहे हैं.... (Interruptions)

श्री कल्पनाथ राय : उपसभापति जी, (Interruptions).

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : ऐसे नहीं चलेगा.... (Interruptions).

श्री उपसभापति : मैं सब को मना कर रहा हूँ । सब लोग स्थान ग्रहण करें... (Interruptions)

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : उपसभापति
महोदय... (Interruptions)

श्री कल्पनाथ राय : उपसभापति
महोदय, उनको आपने नहीं रोका तो मैं
आपको... (Interruptions) यह उनके बोलने
का ढंग है.... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : कुछ भी सुनाई नहीं
देता है । आप स्थान ग्रहण करें ।
(Interruptions) कुछ भी रिकार्ड में नहीं
जाएगा । (Interruptions)

[Shri Kalp Nath Rai continued
to Speak] (Interruptions)

(Shri Rameshwar Singh continued to
speak.) (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : पहले विषय तो
आने दीजिए (Interruptions) बिना किसी
प्रश्न के प्वाइंट आफ ऑर्डर कैसे हो
सकता है । (Interruptions) कोई सवाल
नहीं है.... (Interruptions)

(Shri Rameshwar Singh continued to
speak.) (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए . . .
(Interruptions) कुछ सुनाई नहीं दे रहा मैं
सब से कह रहा हूँ बैठ जाइये (Interruptions)
कृपया बैठ जाइये, एक एक करके बात कहिये
(Interruptions). Unless you co-
operate, how do you expect the House
to go on? (Interruptions).

(Shri Sultan Singh continued to
speak.) (Interruptions)

श्री सत्यपाल मलिक (उत्तर प्रदेश) :
उपसभापति महोदय... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठेंगे तभी
तो सुनेंगे... (Interruptions) I cannot
hear anything now. . (Interruptions)

श्री प्यार लाल कुरील उर्फ प्यारे लाल
तालिब उन्नी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभापति
जी (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : बैठ जाइये, लीड
आफ दी हाउस को सुनिये (Interruptions)

(Shri Rameshwar Singh continued
speak.) (Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE
AND STEEL AND MINES (SHRI
PRANAB MUKHERJEE): It is no u
accusing each other and wasting o
time. Sometimes it happens that ho
Members want to raise their poin
And they can do it. It is for you
take care of it and take note of th
fact. But my point.. (Interruptions)

Mr. Jha, you cannot make the
comment in this way. I am sorry you
cannot make any comment in this
way. If you behave in this way,
shall have to take note of it. I have
interfere when others are speaking.
But if some Members like Mr. J
behave in this manner, I am sorry
shall have to take notice of it. I want
to seek your cooperation.... (Interruptions).

AN HON. MEMBER: Is it a threat
(Interruptions).

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE:
is not a threat. But I am sorry that
if things go on like this every day
we are not going to accept this position.
You can make out your position.
Nobody is going to put any obstruction.
But when I rise on my feet
even Mr. Shiva Chandra Jha does
allow me... (Interruptions). W

[Shri Pranab Mukherjee]

I was going to seek your permission for was to impress upon the leaders and Members of the Opposition parties that they can make their points. Normally, after the Question Hour is over, we are allowing certain time to make various points. But let us have some understanding by having certain time-limit even for raising points. It is already nearly forty minutes. Let us decide that it will be for 15 or 20 or 30 minutes and let the points be made out. We must put an end to it. After all, we have to transact some business. But I am not permitted to speak. I will see to my Members. I can control them. I can tell them not to disturb. But, at the same time, I would like to state that you must put an end to this. If you say, 'All right, for half-an-hour this business will go on', we can accept it. But if for thirty or forty minutes... (Interruptions). The normal business should go on. This is my submission. (Interruptions)

SHRI NARENDRA SINGH (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, on a point of order ... (Interruptions).

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: He has made a very reasonable statement—Mr. Pranab Mukherjee. I think we should respond to it. (Interruptions).

SHRI NARENDRA SINGH: On a point of order. (Interruptions).

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: If we get up, you allow us. If you allow Members to speak, then all this would not have happened and the time would not have been spent like this.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no end to anything. (Interruptions).

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I think that cooperation will come that way. (Interruptions)

श्री नरेन्द्र सिंह : प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है सर ।

श्री उपसभापति : क्या है ? ...

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: You might have noticed that when the Leader of the House got up to intervene, to appeal, we all kept quiet. Only one Member said something—even that sitting in his place. I never expected that the Leader of the House will just put up a threat. (Interruptions).

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: It is not a threat. (Interruptions).

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: Please... (Interruptions) He also said.... (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You address the Chair, Madam.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: You being the custodian of this House or the Chairman being the custodian of this House, we expect that when an issue is raised in this House there will be some decency, some decorum. And we are here to cooperate—not only to oppose. We oppose the policies of the Government. We are not having any individual grudge against anybody.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is all right.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: Nobody should take it at personal level. What happens is... (Interruptions) I will take one second. Mr. Dhabe's name was mentioned by ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Here you are not correct.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: Mr. Dhabe made a certain point to which he replied... (Interruptions) Mr. Dhabe wanted to say as

to what the question was and what his reply was. If he had not mentioned Mr. Dhabe's name, Mr. Dhabe would certainly not have got up. It was going on between Mr. Dhabe and Mr. Stephen's thing... (Interruptions) We all kept quiet. Now, if you just steamroller everything and say, 'Nothing will go on record', then, why are we here?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please tell me how the proceedings can go on.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: You use your discretion. Mr. Pranab Mukherjee is the Leader of the House. I do not know if any other Leader of the House got this much cooperation in the past as Shri Mukherjee gets from all the parties of the Opposition. It is correct that we should not waste time. You use your discretion. But you should not steamroller us.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narendra Singh is standing. You decide amongst yourselves as to who wants to speak. I cannot allow all of them.

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर (महाराष्ट्र) :
उपसभापति जी, मैं दो चीजें आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। कल से इस सदन में... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आज के विषय पर बोलिए, कल को छोड़िये।

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर : उपसभापति जी, हम तो चाहते हैं कि सदन की कार्यवाही सब ठीक से चले, कोई मतभेद की बात नहीं है... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : ऐसी बात कहाँ है ?

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर : मेरी बात सुनिये। कल जब शोरोगुल हो रहा था, मैंने अपनी आंखों से देखा कि केसरी जी वहाँ से आकर के लोगों को उकसा रहे

थे। यह शोभा नहीं देता। अगर मैं गलतवयानी कर रहा हूँ तो आप मुझे सजा दे सकते हैं। श्री केसरी जी लोगों को उकसा रहे हैं। यह ठीक नहीं है।

दूसरी बात...

श्री उपसभापति : आप छोड़िये इसको।

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर : दूसरी बात, कोई मेंबर किसी दूसरे मेम्बर को इस तरह से धमकाए...

श्री उपसभापति : वह धमकाने की बात नहीं है...

(Interruptions)

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर : दूसरी बात मैं आपसे यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि कोई सदन का सदस्य दूसरे मेंबर को धमकाए कि आप बाहर आ जाएं, हम देख लेंगे—यह ठीक नहीं है। इस तरह की धमकियाँ इस सदन में कल से हो रही हैं।

श्री उपसभापति : : सब आदमी बोलेंगे... (Interruptions) कहाँ तक ठीक है... (Interruptions).

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर : तीसरी बात आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : अब समाप्त करिए आप।

श्री सदाशिव बागाईतकर : तीसरी बात जो मैं कह रहा हूँ कि सदन के नेता ने बात कही, मैं उनकी सब बातों से सहमत हूँ। एक बात कहूंगा उन्होंने कहा कि अगर शोरोगुल होगा We shall have to take note of it. have strong objection to this. Even the Leader of the House cannot take note of it. It is for you to take note

[श्री सदाशिव बगाईतकर]

I can understand Mr. Chairman saying it. But Mr. Pranab Mukherjee said that "We will have to take note of it."

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: This shows their attitude.

श्री सदाशिव बगाईतकर : उपसभापति जी...

श्री उपसभापति : आप अपनी बात समाप्त करिए ।

SHRI SADASHIV BAGAITKAR: The Leader of the House has said, "We shall take note of the obstructions". My submission is that it is not for him or for anybody else to take note of anything. It is for the Chair to take note. I hope that the Leader of the House will make amends and accept that even in matter which he considers disorderly, it is the Chairman which can take a decision and not he. That is all, Sir.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I would only like to tell him that it is the duty of the Leader of the House to help the Chair to conduct the Business of the House.

SHRI JAHARLAL BANERJEE: I am on a point of order. (Interruptions).

संसदीय कार्य विभाग में राज्यमंत्री (श्री सीताराम केशरी): उपसभापति जी, जैसा हमारे माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि मैंने किसी तरह का संकेत किया . . . (Interruptions) देखिये, मैं आपसे कह रहा था कि कोई हल्ला मत कीजिए, आपने उलटी

बात लेकर शुरू कर दी । आज तक मैंने क्या कभी कहा है कि आपके खिलाफ बोलिए . . . (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : एक बात मैं कहना चाहता हूँ... (Interruptions) पहले आप आसन ग्रहण करिए.. (Interruptions) बैठ जाइये ।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा (बिहार) : मेरी बात एक मिनट के लिए सुनिये.... (Interruptions) सदन की कार्यवाही... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिये... (Interruptions) नहीं आप फिर कह सकते हैं. . (Interruptions)

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : उपसभापति महोदय, . . . (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइए ।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : आप मुझ को सुन लीजिए ।

श्री उपसभापति : मैं फिर सुनूंगा । पहल आप बैठ जाइए ।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : गृह मंत्री और लीडर आफ द हाउस ने जो कहा है... (Interruptions) मेरा कहना है कि उन्होंने...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This cannot go on like this. Mr. Jha, you have to hear me first. Then I will hear you. Now, you please take your seat.

एक बात मैं माननीय सदस्यों से कहना चाहता हूँ... (Interruptions)... आप बैठिए, कि जो प्रश्न सदन के सामने ऐसे वैधानिक आते हैं, मैं यह निवेदन करूंगा एक ही दल के सब सदस्य हाथ उठाएंगे तो मैं सब सदस्यों को आज्ञा नहीं दे सकता। मैं उनसे अनुरोध करूंगा, बारी बारी से—कोई महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है तो—पार्टी की तरफ से एक एक आदमी बोल तो सुना भी जा सकता है और उस पर कुछ बात भी हो सकती है। अब लोक दल में सब लोग हाथ उठाते जा रहे हैं। उनके विह्व बागाईतकर साहब को सुना है। अब हर प्रश्न पर हर मेंबर बोलेगा एक पार्टी का तो सदन की कार्यवाही नहीं चल सकेगी। एक घंटा हो गया, कालिंग अटेंशन नहीं हुआ। मैं सदस्यों से कहूंगा और खास कर हर एक दल के नेताओं से कहूंगा, वे इस बात पर विचार करें कि क्या कालिंग अटेंशन का पूरा समय इस तरह की बातों में समाप्त किया जाए? अगर कालिंग अटेंशन को लिया जाए तो फिर कितना समय उसके लिए दिया जाएगा? यह विचार करना पड़ेगा।

अच्छा कहिए मिस्टर झा अपनी बात।

श्री रामेश्वर सिंह : उपसभापति महोदय, कल जो...

श्री उपसभापति : मैंने आपको परमिशन नहीं दिया है। मैं मिस्टर झा को सुन रहा हूँ।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : उपसभापति जी, सदन की कार्यवाही ठीक से चले, कोई होहल्ला नहीं मचे, यह हम लोगों की कामना है, जितना नेता-सदन की है उस से कई गुना ज्यादा है...

श्री उपसभापति : बहुत धन्यवाद है।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : मुझे वह दिन याद है... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : अपना प्वाइंट कहिए।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : अभी सुनिश्चया। मुझे वह दिन याद आता है जब इस बेन्च से, यहां से, उन्होंने अखबार वालों को सी आई ए एजेंट कहा था...

श्री उपसभापति : वह प्रश्न नहीं है...

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : ... बड़ा हंगामा हुआ। लेकिन फिर भी उसको संभाल लिया। कम से कम एक मिनट सुन लीजिए। अभी जब अपने नेता सदन साहब बोल रहे थे तो बोले जा रहे थे। मैंने यह कहा कि यह काम तो अध्यक्ष का है...

श्री उपसभापति : वह आप कह चुके हैं।

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : उस पर वह आगे-बबूला हो गए। कहा, आई विल टेक नोट आफ इट। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ, दो बातें हैं। पहली बात तो यह है कि जिस समय से ये लोग पावर में आए हैं तभी से हम लोगों ने भी नोट ले लिया है और इसकी हमें कोई चिन्ता नहीं है... (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : अब सदन की आगे की कार्यवाही को चलने दीजिए। बैठ जाइये।

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Rise in prices of Essential Commodities

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI (Maharashtra): Sir, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Civil Supplies to the rise in prices of