

national life as a great language of culture and civilisation.

**श्री रामेश्वर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) :**

मेरा एक प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है। अभी चार रोज पहले हाऊस में गृह मंत्री श्री जेल सिंह ने यह बयान दिया था कि (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am afraid, there are other matters. Please sit down. As regards the two points of order which have been made...

**श्री रामेश्वर सिंह :** आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है। हम जो बात कहना चाहते हैं वह एक बहुत गंभीर मामला है और इस तरह से सदन में जबरदस्ती चलाना चाहेंगे तो सदन की कार्यवाही आज मैं नहीं चलने दूंगा और इस के लिये जो कुछ भी करना चाहेंगे आप ताकत के बल पर वह आप करें, हम आप से बाहर रास्ते पर भी निपट लेंगे। श्रीमन्, (Interruptions) सभापति महोदय, मैं... (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down. We have got other matters to go through.

**श्री रामेश्वर सिंह :** आपकी आज्ञा से मैं सदन की कार्यवाही नहीं चलने दूंगा। (Interruptions) श्री जेल सिंह जी ने (Interruptions) आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। (Interruptions)

**श्री सभापति :** बैठ जाइए। बैठ जाइए।

**श्री रामेश्वर सिंह :** आपको मेरी बात सुननी होगी (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down; please sit down.

**श्री रामेश्वर सिंह :** कृपया मेरी बात आप सुन लीजिए। (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Will you please sit down? I am standing; therefore, you must sit down. I am asking you to sit down. Will you sit down? I am giving you a last warning. Will you sit down?

**श्री रामेश्वर सिंह :** आप सुन लीजिए नहीं तो हम कार्यवाही नहीं चलने देंगे।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please calm yourself. Order, Order. This way, it will not do. If you threaten me that you will not allow proceedings of the House to go on, I shall threaten you that you shall not be here to disturb me.

**श्री योगेन्द्र शर्मा :** सर, मेरे प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर का क्या हुआ ?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I have noted it. There is no reply from me. I have noted it.

## RE. CERTAIN REMARKS MADE IN THE HOUSE

**SHRI KHUSHWANT SINGH (Nominated):** Mr. Chairman, Sir, I was very much hoping to open my account in this august assembly with the usual maiden speech of good cheer. I regret the tone of bitterness that I will use today. I would like to assure you, Sir, when I say it, I speak with pain and anguish, not with anger and recrimination. This matter concerns all of us and the honour of this House.

It is a well-laid rule that no one Member of this House has a right to be offensive and insulting about another. If there is any doubt in any one's mind, I quote rule 238:

"A member while speaking shall not...

(ii) make a personal charge against a member;

(vii) utter reasonable seditious or defamatory words;"

I have been subjected to insult and abuse. I will prove this on the quotations of the Parliamentary debate. It was on Thursday, the 3rd of July, that while commenting on a statement made by the Minister of Information and Broadcasting, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, an hon. Member of this House, singled out two Members, one by name, Mr. Kamal Nath who is not a Member of this House but of the Lok Sabha, and the other quite distinctly I by inference. The reference he made is on page 231 in the debate, and these are the words he used:

"On the other hand, there are Government agencies and a bunch of flatterers and sycophants. I hate it. A prominent journalist who has been editor of a largely circulated English weekly, illustrated and otherwise, the kind of stuff he is writing makes one sick. I hope I would never live to see such journalists being encouraged or other journalists who are newly elected to the Houses of Parliament, to this House or that House, trying to serve their personal ends."

Mr. Chairman, Sir, there is not the slightest doubt that this offensive reference is to me. There is not the slightest doubt that this is offensive and insulting to a fellow Member, and there is not the slightest doubt that it contravenes the rules of this House. I was not present then. But it pains me to notice that no Member of this House...

SHRI SULTAN SINGH (Haryana): I raised it.

SHRIMATI USHA MALHOTRA (Himachal Pradesh): I also raised it.

SHRI KHUSHWANT SINGH: I withdraw that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Silence.

SHRI KHUSHWANT SINGH: Mr. Vasant Sathe said that Mr. Khushwant Singh would be able to take care of himself. That is precisely what I am doing now.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am not sure whether "sycophant" is unparliamentary, but it is certainly offensive and insulting. The dictionary defines the word "sycophant" in the following words:

"Informer, tale-bearer, calumniator, slanderer, mean, contemptible, cringing, imposter, deceiver."

Now, is there any doubt in any one's mind that these words should not be used in Parliament by any Member. I have no doubt that what the hon. Member was referring to me as a sycophant was my loyalty to Mrs. Gandhi and her son, the late Sanjay Gandhi. I plead guilty to that. I am a supporter, I have been a supporter. But when he says that I did it for personal ends, he is not being correct. He probably refers to my record during the emergency. I was a supporter of the emergency, but obviously Mr. Bhupesh Gupta does not read "The Illustrated Weekly" or any other papers of the time. Let me correct the record. During the emergency the only one journal which fought and argued against the continued detention of political leaders was "The Illustrated Weekly", and I quote Mr. L. K. Advani, ex-Leader of the House, who has himself, in his own book, recorded the compliment that I kept up the protest against the continued detention of the leaders. Obviously Mr. Bhupesh Gupta has not read Mr. Advani's book. And let me also tell him that the only journal during the Emergency which carried articles by leaders of the Opposition—and I include Acharya Kripalani, Shriman Narayan, Mr. Palkhivala, Mr. Solee Sorabjee and Justice Sachar—all uncensored, was the *Illustrated Weekly*. And a pre-censorship

[Shri Kushwant Singh]

order was imposed on the Weekly for a little while. And when Mr. Bhupesh Gupta accuses me of doing all this for personal ends, let me tell you what I got out of those personal ends. When Mrs. Gandhi and Mr. Sanjay Gandhi were out of power, hunted, harassed, persecuted, when they had nothing to offer, there were people like me amongst a very few journalists in the country who stood by them. And what did we get? What personal ends did I get? I lost my job with the *Illustrated Weekly* and I still continued....

AN HON. MEMBER: You get another.

Sir, I will not carry this carry tale. What I would like to assure Mr. Bhupesh Gupta is simply this: what Marxism means to him, Gandhism means to me. (*Interruptions*) I supported Mrs. Gandhi because I felt she was the best and there was no alternative to her. If I was wrong, I may be wrong, but I have a right to my opinion.

Sir, I will not carry this carry tale much further because there are many more important things for the House to consider. Mr. Chairman, Sir, all I would ask and request is to delete, expunge these remarks from the records of the House and ask Mr. Bhupesh Gupta as a gentleman and a fellow colleague, to apologise for the remarks. If he does so, I shall be only too happy to step down and shake hands with him. If he does not, Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would crave the privilege of saying just a few words more to him. Thank you.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I rise also for a personal explanation. I hope, Sir, when a Member of the House says anything..... (*Interruptions*)

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): He will give an explanation on the statement?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Yes, yes. He has said so many things. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to know from you whether you are allowing a debate on this issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: On what Mr. Bhupesh Gupta says and what he says, are you allowing a debate on it? I would like to know. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL (Gujarat): He has taken his name. He has a right. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will answer the Leader. (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. Mr. Leader, ...

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I have been asked to apologise.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Leader, you have questioned me. You have probably not heard the last sentence of Mr. Khushwant Singh's statement, which will be read to you from the record. He asked the hon. Member whether he would make amends by apologising. Therefore, I must give the Member a chance. (*Interruptions*) I must say, with your parliamentary experience, you should not allow yourself to be carried away. You should have heard the speech of Mr. Khushwant Singh carefully.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I apologise.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, first of all, let there be no passion. I always pay deference to any Member in the House as a Member of the House, not as what they are elsewhere. And Mr. Khushwant Singh, so

long as he is a Member of the House and my colleague, is entitled to all my personal respect and consideration. But I have, too, a public duty. Sir, he has read out a long statement. You have allowed it, and you were good enough to inform me that you had allowed it. I congratulate you. And I congratulate Mr. Khushwant Singh for making the story known to the world, which was otherwise suppressed in the Press. Sir, on page 226, I certainly mentioned "sycophants" but in plural. And again I mentioned on page 230—the uncorrected proceedings are with me—"sycophants" in plural in connection with those people who should be consulted. I only said "editors who are sycophants..." I do not know why he brings in Indira Gandhi and Sanjay Gandhi here. I meant all sycophants. Even Bhupesh Gupta, if he is a sycophant, should not be consulted. I said sycophants should not be consulted, but editors with integrity, with independent views and courage should be consulted. Please go through the proceedings on pages 226 to 230 and 231. You will find it is all in plural and it is a general statement. Only at one place I did mention Mr. Khushwant Singh by name when I said: "You think of Mr. Khushwant Singh. Who am I? Mr. Khushwant Singh is their man..." I think by his statement he has made it abundantly clear where he stands and where his situation is.

Sir, in another connection, jokingly, remembering our great leader Jawaharlal Nehru's humour, I said something when Mr. Madhavan was speaking and when the Chair wanted to stop him. Then I said: Mr. Vice-Chairman, allow him to complete the sentence. Perhaps he wanted to say: Join the Surya and come to the Rajya Sabha. I did not mention anything else. It was a good humour that Nehru told us one day: Join the peace movement and see the world. But Nehru himself was a great peace champion. I remembered that ex-

cellent phrase and I just transformed it a little and said: Join the Surya and come to the Rajya Sabha. That is all. Is there anything wrong in it? If Mr. Khushwant Singh thinks that the cap fits him, I am extremely sorry. Otherwise, I did not say anything with the intention of offending any Member except to do some public duty and to give some suggestions to the Minister as to what type of people should or should not be consulted. What views Mr. Khushwant Singh has, he has said. I have got a whole number of clippings of his writings after the 23rd June—that tragic day. May I have the authority or your permission to lay these on the Table of the House so that the House will know, well Sir, the meaning of the word 'sycophancy'. May I have your permission to lay this on the Table of the House?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I hope, Sir, you have listened to his speech.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will deal with the matter later.

Now, I have an announcement to make....

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: As far as apology is concerned, I would not be a Communist and patriot if I did not say that. Not a syllable of it I will withdraw. I think it will be my duty so long as I am here to expose all the sycophants....

SHRI KHUSHWANT SINGH: You are not a gentleman. You are a \*and a\* ....(Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Order, order.

SHRI KALYAN ROY (West Bengal): He called him a \* \* \*

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**SHRI YOGENDRA SHARMA** (Bihar): He used the words\*\*\*and\*\*\* You must expunge them... (Interruptions).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I will go through the entire record of the proceedings and expunge anything which is unparliamentary, undignified and unnecessarily derogatory to a Member.

**SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL:** \* \* \* is an unparliamentary word. What is there to be examined? He said \* \* \* and the whole House has heard it.... (Interruptions). It should be expunged.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I need not give my ruling. The speech is long. The words are many. There are good words; there are bad words. All the unparliamentary words will be expunged.

**SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL:** Only two words—\* \* \* and \* \* \*—are there \* \* \* is definitely an unparliamentary word and it should be expunged. It should not be delayed. It is very clear.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Have you got a dictionary? (Interruptions).

**SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL:** It is very clear, Sir. (Interruptions).

**SHRI SHIV CHANDRA JHA** (Bihar): Sir, it is a question of the dignity of the House. It is unparliamentary and it should be expunged. (Interruptions). The entire House wants to know what were the words. (Interruptions)

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** Sir, I hear, Mr. Khushwant Singh has called me a \* \* \* and \* \* \*. I have not used such words against him. Mr. Khushwant Singh...

**SHRI LAL K. ADVANI** (Gujarat): Mr. Chairman, Sir...

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** He has called me a \* \* \* (Interruptions).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Fortunately, there is a dictionary, a dictionary for the honourable Members in the House. It is not the dictionary which we normally read. It is a dictionary of unparliamentary words and I have consulted it and it is all a very long collection of data and I find that \* and \* \* \* are unparliamentary. (Interruptions). Just a minute. I am going by the dictionary. The word \* \* \*, if a person is specified, then it is unparliamentary. (Interruptions). Please sit down. (Interruptions). Please sit down. There is no debate in these things. Therefore, I am very sorry, these words will be expunged. But there will be much more which I will expunge. (Interruptions).

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE** (Maharashtra): Sir, on a point of order.

**DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA** (Maharashtra): Sir, with due deference to your ruling.... (Interruptions).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** What do you want to say, Mr. Zakaria? (Interruptions).

**DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA:** Sir, with due deference to . . .

**SHRI RAMANAND YADAV** (Bihar): What are they doing, Sir? (Interruptions).

**SHRI N. P. CHENGALRAYA NAIDU** (Andhra Pradesh): What are they doing, Sir? (Interruptions).

**SHRI RAMANAND YADAV:** What are they doing, Sir? (Interruptions).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Yadav... (Interruptions) ... May I address Mr. Yadav not to shout amidst this noise?

**SHRI RAMANAND YADAV:** Why don't you control them, Sir?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am controlling everybody... (Interruptions).

**SHRI RAMANAND YADAV:** No; you are not controlling.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** .... including yourself. (*Interruptions*). Go on, Mr. Zakaria. (*Interruptions*). Order, order.

**DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA:** Sir, with due deference to your ruling... (*Interruptions*)... may I submit for your consideration that this matter which Mr. Khushwant Singh has raised is a matter which concerns the dignity of the Members of this House and since, Sir, you have agreed that you will also go into it, will you also consider, in case you come to the conclusion that there is *prima facie* case, that the matter be referred to the Committee of Privileges?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I may also consider that.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** Sir, I want to submit one thing since you were a Judge and you are a judge in this matter and I will abide by your ruling. But there is one aspect of this matter which has to be looked into. Supposing an allegation is made which is palpably false, which is not based on truth, with reference to that particular allegation, how do you describe a Member? (*Interruptions*). Can I say, Sir... (*Interruptions*). You are a Judge, and therefore I am putting it to you. (*Interruptions*). I will not do anything; I accept your ruling.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Salve, I have given only one ruling so far and it is that on the basis of the dictionary of unparliamentary words and the large number of instances cited therein, the words are unparliamentary and, therefore, so far...

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** It cannot be absolute, Sir. (*Interruptions*).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please listen to me.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** What can I do if a false allegation is made against a Member? (*Interruptions*).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** There is the statement of Mr. Bhupesh Gupta which I am taking and I shall consider every word in it and I will expunge everything that is unparliamentary.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** Sir, while you are doing it, there is another aspect to it which I want you to consider. (*Interruptions*) I will not be cowed down like this. (*Interruptions*)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Salve.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** He is an hon. Member of this House. Today it is on this side. Tomorrow it might be on the other side. Therefore, let it not be taken as child's play. (*Interruptions*)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** It is too early to begin with this debate. I have not given my ruling on this. The only ruling I have given is on the other thing.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** Please give me two minutes. I want to make a submission.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** If you take two minutes, they will take 20 minutes.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** There is only one aspect of the matter on which I want to submit. Sycophancy of a man when he stood against a Government.... (*Interruptions*) I may kindly be given only two minutes.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You speak for two minutes. I will not listen to anybody except Mr. Salve and Mr. Advani.

**SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL:** It is a major issue. He is trying to discuss about the ruling. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE:** I am not discussing the ruling.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: It is wrong to challenge the ruling of the Chairman.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think I shall make the House feel... (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. Please sit down. I do not know what I should do. मुझे तो जौक का एक शेर याद आता है।

उसको सुन लीजिए, आप समझ जायेंगे — समझ में ही नहीं आता है कोई बात जौक उनकी, कोई जाने तो क्या जाने कोई समझे तो क्या समझे।

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Just two minutes, Sir. I am not discussing the ruling. There are only two aspects of the matter. We agree that what is unparliamentary must not be there. It is not only that. It is a question....

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know that Mr. Salve.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I sit down if you don't bear with me.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shall I assure you that I know my duties as the Chairman in respect of everything that is done here?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: We only believe that it is so. My submission is that there are only two aspects of the matter. Firstly, a member's dignity is flouted on an allegation which is absolutely false because he is known for his fearlessness. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are you starting a discussion on this?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I will not sit down unless I am given two minutes. I am only submitting that these people were the supporters of Mrs. Indira Gandhi. Now they are

backing out. How do we describe them? (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I don't describe you or anybody else. I want to see the proceedings and decide on the basis of the proceedings what should be kept on record and what should not be kept on record. I have also got Dr. Zakaria's observations. (*Interruptions*)

Now, Mr. Advani. I will give only two minutes.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I have not yet completed, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have got your observation.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would not have intervened in this matter had it not been for the fact that my name was mentioned by Mr. Khushwant Singh testifying to what he did during the emergency. When he did something right, I have always praised it. I would praise it today also. He stood up against press censorship; he stood up against detention of leaders. He wrote about it in the 'Illustrated Weekly'. (*Interruptions*) But this testimony was cited in the context of Mr. Bhupesh Gupta's speech. I hold that Mr. Bhupesh Gupta's speech on that day, was a remarkable speech which reflected the feelings of most of us.... (*Interruptions*). You have given me two minutes, Sir. I will not be irrelevant. I would merely like to appeal to Mr. Khushwant Singh, through you, Sir....

MR. CHAIRMAN: I wish this matter had concluded a little differently. But I find, Mr. Advani, that the more one speaks the more the Members want to speak on it. And, I think the matter is fairly in my hand. You have explained it.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: No, Sir. He spoke about my testimony. Let me complete. Sir, I will complete in a minute. There are two aspects

to the matter raised. First of all, he wanted Mr. Bhupesh Gupta to apologise. The second part was that he wanted you if he does not apologise, to expunge all he had said. So far as that second part is concerned, I would humbly submit that there is nothing unparliamentary in that speech which merited expunction. But, if there was anything offensive, as he said, it was on appeal made to Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, which Mr. Bhupesh Gupta has retorted by saying that he stands by every word of what he had said. I would like to appeal to Mr. Khushwant Singh that Mr. Bhupesh Gupta has expressed an opinion. That opinion may not be palatable to him. But he should accept it. Sir, a stronger opinion.... (Interruptions) Sir, here I have Mr. Khushwant Singh's own paper, the 'Hindustan Times' of last Friday. To what Mr. K. R. Sundara Rajan has written, I think, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta's remarks just cannot compare.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have read it.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Just a small quotation, Sir. After all....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Advani..

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: It goes to the credit of Mr. Khushwant Singh that he published even this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I say one thing? (Interruptions) We have not got Mr. Sundara Rajan here. If he had been here, I would have ruled against him or asked him to withdraw or do something else. But it is in his own newspaper. (Interruptions) I only control the proceedings in this House. I only rule on those. Otherwise, I will be ruling on every newspaper and every journal in India which is not expected of me.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am only saying that Bhupesh's is an opinion. There is nothing offensive about it.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, may I submit the cuttings of Mr. Khushwant Singh's writings?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You cannot. I am told that there is no placing of them on the Table.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: All right, I will give them to you.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, on the question which Mr. Salve raised, I want to make one small observation. I will take just a minute.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Please sit down.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: I will finish in half a minute.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Not even a half minute. Please sit down. Nobody speaks now. (Interruptions).

SHRI KALYAN ROY: What about the other 'Special Mentions', Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. As I said the other day, this has become an Irish quarrel. Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

## PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Notification of the Ministry of Steel, Mines and Coal (Department of Coal)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF ENERGY (SHRI VIKRAM MAHAJAN): Sir, on behalf of Shri A. B. A. Ghani Khan Chowdhuri, I beg to lay on the Table, under section 7A of the Coal Mines Provident Fund and Miscellaneous Provisions Act, 1948, a copy of the Ministry of Steel, Mines and Coal (Department of Coal) Notification G.S.R. No. 361, dated the 29th March, 1980, publishing Corrigendum to the English version of notification G.S.R. No. 1013, dated the 13th July, 1970. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-1037/80].