

## RAJYA SABHA

Monday, the 21st May, 1979/the 31st  
Vaisakha, 1901 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the  
clock, Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

### QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I have to in-  
form Members that I have received  
the following communication dated  
the 18th May, 1979 from the Speaker,  
Lok Sabha:—

“Shri Jyotirmoy Bosu, M.P. gave  
notice of a question of privilege  
regarding an alleged misleading  
statement made in the Lok Sabha  
on the 19th January, 1976, by Shri  
Pranab Kumar Mukherjee, M.P.  
(now of Rajya Sabha) when he  
was functioning as Minister of  
State of the Department of Re-  
venue and Banking on the subject  
of voluntary disclosure of income  
and wealth. Shri Jyotirmoy Bosu  
based this allegation on the obser-  
vations and recommendations made  
by Public Accounts Committee in  
their 123rd Report (Sixth Lok  
Sabha).

The matter came up in the Lok  
Sabha on 23rd April and 16th May,  
1979, and I enclose herewith the  
relevant extracts from the Lok  
Sabha Debates dated 23rd April  
and 16th May, 1979, for information  
and necessary action in terms of  
the procedure laid down in the  
Report of the Joint Sitting of the  
Committees of Privileges of Lok  
Sabha and Rajya Sabha, adopted  
by both Houses of Parliament.”

According to the procedure laid down  
in the Report of the Joint Sitting of  
Committees of Privileges of the Lok  
Sabha and the Rajya Sabha adopted  
by our House on 6th December, 1954,  
when a question of breach of privi-  
lege is raised in any House in which  
a Member of the other House is in-  
volved, the Presiding Officer shall  
refer the case to the Presiding Offi-  
cer of the other House. Upon the

415 RS—1.

case being so referred, the Presiding  
Officer of the other House shall deal  
with the matter in the same way as  
if it were a case of breach of privi-  
lege of that House or of a Member  
thereof.

Accordingly, I will examine the mat-  
ter contained in the Speaker's com-  
muniacion and, if I consider it neces-  
sary refer the same to our com-  
mittee of Privileges for examination,  
investigation and report.

**SHRI SHRIKANT VERMA** (Mad-  
hya Pradesh): How can that privi-  
lege issue be raised in this House?  
Shri Pranab Mukherjee is a Mem-  
ber of this House. Similar cases have  
arisen...

**SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD  
SHAHI** (Uttar Pradesh): Listen to  
the decision of the Chair. (*Interrup-  
tions*) The Chair has already taken  
notice of it.

**SHRI SHRIKANT VERMA:** I tried  
to raise a privilege issue against Shri  
Ram Jethmalani who belongs to the  
other House. You gave a ruling. So,  
you should immediately give your  
ruling...

**Mr. CHAIRMAN:** I have stated  
that I will examine.

**SHRI SHRIKANT VERMA:** ...and  
I request you to consider it as a mat-  
ter of dignity of this House. You  
should clearly state here that it per-  
tains to one who is a Member of this  
House and we should not admit any  
privilege issue.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** It is very sim-  
ple. I will examine in detail and I  
will also send a letter to the hon.  
Member concerned to give his com-  
ments also. Why unnecessarily dis-  
cuss it? There is no point at all. Just  
I have brought it to the notice of the  
Members of this honourable House  
that this is the fact which has been  
brought to my notice as **Chairman**,  
and I have brought it to your notice.  
There is nothing.

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE** (West Bengal): Only one point I would like to submit in this connection. You have mentioned while making your observations that it will be treated as if a privilege motion has been brought against a Member of this House. The normal practice when a privilege motion is brought against a Member of the existing House is that he is given an opportunity to explain his stand. Therefore, if it is treated as if a privilege motion has been brought on the floor of this House, opportunity should be given to the Member against whom the privilege motion is brought to explain his stand. And I would like to have that right from the Chair.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Papers to be laid on the Table.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

- I. Report (1976-77) on the working of the All India State Cooperative Banks, Federation, Bombay and related paper.
- II. Report (1977-78) on the working of the National Federation of State Cooperative Banks Limited, Bombay and related paper.
- III. Report and Accounts (1976-77 and 1977-78) of the National Cooperative Land Development Banks Federation Ltd. Bombay and related paper.
- IV. Administration Report (1977-78) of the Tea Board, Calcutta and related papers.

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE, CIVIL SUPPLIES AND COOPERATION (SHRI ARIF BEG):** Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a copy each (in English

and Hindi) of the following papers:—

I. Fourteenth Annual Report on the working of the All India State Cooperative Banks Federation, Bombay, for the year 1976-77, together with the Auditors' Report on the Accounts. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-4515/79].

II. Fifteenth Annual Report on the working of the National Federation of State Co-operative Banks Limited, Bombay for the year 1977-78, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-4516/79].

III. (i) Seventeenth Annual Administration Report and Accounts of the National Co-operative Land Development Banks Federation Limited, Bombay, for the year 1976-77, together with the Auditors' Report on the Accounts.

(ii) Eighteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Co-operative Land Development Banks Federation Limited, Bombay, for the year 1977-78, together with the Auditors' Report on the Accounts. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-4517/79 for (i) and (ii)].

IV. Twenty-fourth Annual Administration Report of the Tea Board, Calcutta, for the year 1977-78, and a Review by Government thereon, together with a statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the Report. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-4514/79].

**Notification of the Election Commission of India**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LABOUR AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. RAM KRIPAL SINHA):** Sir, on behalf of Shri S. D. Patil, I beg to lay on the Table, under sub-section (3) of section 13 of the Representation of