

[डा० भाई महावीर]

किसी पद पर चिपके रहने की कोशिश न  
सफल हो ।

REFERENCE TO RECENT CIRCULAR  
ISSUED BY THE CHIEF MINISTER OF  
BIHAR DIRECTING STATE  
GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS TO USE  
HINDI IN OFFICIAL TRANSACTIONS

SHRI N. P. CHENGALRAYA NAIDU  
(Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I beg to bring to the  
notice of the Government the recent circular  
issued by the Chief Minister of Bihar asking  
that Government officials must use only-Hindi  
in their business. The Chief Minister also said  
that if anybody was found using English, he  
would be severely penalised. Sir, our Govern-  
ment is talking about the three-language  
formula, but the Chief Minister of Bihar is  
talking about only one-language formula. In  
South India we are having three languages. In  
Andhra, Karnataka, Maharashtra we are  
having three languages. In Kerala and Tamil  
Nadu they are having only two-language  
formula. As far as All-India Services are  
concerned, in the offices officials from North  
India, the Hindi-speaking people, cannot  
transact business in Tamil or Telugu or any  
other language except in English. When it  
comes to Bihar where non-Hindi speaking  
officers of the IAS or the IPS or other all-India  
services are posted, if they are forced to  
transact their business only in Hindi, how is it  
possible for them to do so? They may be able  
to learn Hindi, they may be able to read and  
write Hindi. But it is very difficult to write  
official notes in Hindi. Therefore, the central  
Government must come forward and advise  
the Bihar Government not to impose this res-  
triction. Even if the non-Hindi-speaking  
officers wish to learn Hindi and transact their  
business in Hindi, it will take at least three to  
four years for them to acquire the requisite  
standard in Hindi. All of a sudden the Bihar  
Chief Minister has passed

an order saying that anybody using; English  
will be punished severely. This is very bad. If  
the same thing happens in Tamil Nadu  
tomorrow that the officials must transact  
official business only in Tamil, what will  
happen, to the officials coming from the Hindi  
speaking areas? What will happen to the  
officials of the Hindi-speaking. States posted  
in Andhra if tomorrow they are asked to  
transact official business only in Telugu?  
What will happen to these Hindi-speaking  
officers of the All-India Services iff tomorrow  
in Karnataka the Government passes an order  
that they should transact business only in  
Kannada? Therefore, I request the Central  
Government to step into the matter because  
'language' comes under the Home Ministry.  
The Central - Government must advise the  
Chief Minister of Bihar to have two  
languages, English and Hindi.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE  
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S.  
D. PATIL): Mr. Deputy Chairman, the  
Government is. not in possession of  
information regarding the actual wording of  
the order. The honourable Member has stated  
quoting the order, "Any person using English  
will be severely dealt with". The Government  
is not in possession of the actual wording of  
the order. Therefore, it is very difficult to say  
whether this has been incorporated or not in  
the order . . .

SHRI N. P. CHENGALRAYA NAIDU: It  
has come in the newspapers.

SHRIMATI AMBIKA SONI  
(Punjab): Cannot the Government make an  
effort to get that wording? If the allegation is  
not correct, there should be a contradiction  
issued. The report has appeared in the news-  
papers. This is not a small matter.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us listen  
to what the honourable Minister has to say.  
Let him complete his statement.

SHRI S. D. PATIL: The position is like this. According to Article 345 of the Constitution,

the Legislature of a State may by law adopted any one or more of the languages in use in the State or Hindi as the language or languages to be used for all or any of the official purposes of that State,"

According to this Article a State is free, after due legislation, to adopt Hindi or any other language for the official purposes of that State. So far as the use of English is concerned, the same Article provides that,

..until the Legislature of the State otherwise provides by law, the English language shall continue to be used for those official purposes within the State for which it was being used immediately before the commencement of this Constitution."

Since the Bihar Government has taken the stop to authorise the use of Hindi for all official purposes, we presume that they would have done so after due legislation about the official language. This subject, however, is within the purview of the State Government. The Central Government strictly speaking does not come into picture. This has however been the policy of the Central Government that the use of the State languages should be progressively increased for the usual official purposes of the State.

SHRI N. P. CHENGALRAYA NAIDU: What will happen to the non-Hindi speaking officers who are working there?

SHRI S. D. PATIL: Government has not received any complaint from the IAS or IPS officers.

### THE APPROPRIATION (No. 3) BILL, 1978—Contd.

SHRI ERA SEZHIYAN (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, I thank you very much for allowing me an opportunity to participate in this discussion on the Appropriation Bill. This happens to be my maiden speech in this House, though for about 15 years I have been participating in the discussions on Appropriation Bills in the other House. I deem it a great honour to be among the speech in this House, though for time in the discussion in this House. Very many matters stem from the Bill and many charges have been trotted out in this House. During the course of this discussion we get an opportunity to ventilate our grievances and to speak out frankly. Sir, this opportunity to speak out one's mind was not there for about 18 or 19 months. Now we are having it.

We welcome every kind of criticism—criticism that the Janata Party has failed in this respect or that respect. That does not unnerve me or others on this side. We, in fact, welcome open criticism and we feel that there should be availability of communication between this House and outside. Whatever I say here goes out of the House and I feel that is a great thing.

Sir, criticism does not kill a Government. In Tamil we have a couplet in TIRUKKURAL: "Idippa rai Ilia Emara Mannan, Kednppar Ikanum Kedum". It says that a ruler who is devoid of hard critics shall destroy himself without anybody else destroying him. The Janata Party will go the same way, if they try to suppress criticism if they try to suppress dissent and then to suppress dissenters themselves. If Janata Party does not live upto the people's expectation, if Janata Party is not able to fulfil the promises given to the people, then it deserves not to be in the Government. It should be thrown out by the people and by the due process. If we have got a system where criticism is possible, where people can criticise the Government without fear and where