

SHRI SIKANDAR BAKHT; I do not think that the functioning of the DDA has got anything to do with the original question.

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: We have asked for a Committee to look into the increasing unauthorised construction and occupation in Delhi. He just says that this question does not relate to the original question.

SHRI SIKANDAR BAKHT; I will seek your guidance, Sir, to tell me whether this question originates from the original question.

SHRI B. N. BANERJEE; is the hon. Minister aware of a well-known co-operative house building society in Delhi, called the Home Ministry Co-operative House Building Society where senior officers of the Government of India managed to secure a big plot of land, sometimes 2,000 square yards, at a very low price? I would like to know whether any complaint has been received by the hon. Minister that in the bye laws of this society and other societies there is a provision whereby any member who desires to sell his house or land, has to sell it to another member of the society, and by virtue of this provision the executives of this society are compelling those members who want to sell their house or land, to sell it to persons in the waiting list of the society, who happen to be close relatives or friends of the members of the executive committee of the society. If this is the position, what steps the Minister proposes to take to remedy the situation?

SHRI SIKANDAR BAKHT; Sir, the original question is; whether it is a fact that some of the co-operative house building societies in Delhi to whom land was allotted over ten years back for development and allotment of plots to their respective members have failed to do so. Now this question of the hon. Member relates to the functioning of a particular society for which I will require a separate notice.

Non-Implementation of the Three Language Formula

•184. SHRI PRAKASH MEHROTRA; |
SHRI GURUDEV GUPTA; SHRI
SAWAISINGH SISODIA;
SHRIMATI HAMIDA HABIB-
ULLAH:

Will the Minister of EDUCATION, SOCIAL WELFARE AND CULTURE be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government are aware that some State Governments are not implementing the three-language formula;

(b) whether Government have taken up the matter with the concerned States, and

(c) if so, with what results?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EDUCATION, SOCIAL WELFARE AND CULTURE (SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BAR-KATAKI): (a) and (b) Yes, Sir. (c) The State Governments have been requested to implement the three language formula in letter and spirit and to avail of the facilities provided by Central Government for this purpose.

श्री प्रकाश महरोत्रा : मान्यवर,
इस विषय पर नेशनल इन्स्टीट्यूशन काऊन्सिल
में सन् 1961 में बहस हुई थी फिर सन्
64 में कोठारी कमीशन में भी लैंग्वेज के
विषय में काफी विस्तार में बातचीत हुई।
उसके बाद नेशनल एजुकेशन पालिसी
सरकार ने 1968 में बनायी इस पालिसी
पर पार्लियामेंट के दोनों हाऊसों में बहस
हुई थी। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि उन
पालिसी के फलस्वरूप उन प्रदेशों में जहाँ हिन्दी
कम बोली जाती है सरकार ने क्या कदम
उठाये हैं ताकि वहाँ उनका हिन्दी का स्तर

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Prakash Mehrotra.

उन प्रदेशों के स्तर के बराबर आ जाय जहां पर कि हिन्दी बोली जाती है। इन कदमों के क्या ठोस परिणाम अब तक निकले हैं तथा जो प्रदेश इस संबंध में सहयोग नहीं दे रहे हैं उनसे सहयोग लेने के लिए सरकार क्या कर रही है ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BAR-KATAKI: Sir, the three language formula has been accepted by practically all the States except Tamil Nadu, Pondicherry and the Karaikal area of Pondicherry. Tamil Nadu has adopted the two language formula. For the adoption of Hindi in those States, we are requesting the State Governments to take whatever facilities we have provided. Besides, we are encouraging the voluntary organisations, giving them special grants for promotion of Hindi in those States.

श्री प्रकाश महरोत्रा : मान्यवर, अभी मंत्री महोदय ने यह कहा कि प्रायः सभी स्टेट्स में यह तीन लैंग्वेज वाला फार्मूला मान लिया गया है। इस संबंध में कुछ नाम भी उन्होंने लिये लेकिन इन नामों में तमिलनाडु का नाम नहीं था। तमिलनाडु ने अपने यहां दो लैंग्वेज फार्मूला किया है। अतः उन्होंने जो पहली सूचना दी उसके विपरीत यह दूसरी बात कह दी है। बहरहाल मेरा प्रश्न इस संबंध में यह है कि तीन लैंग्वेज फार्मूले में यह हुआ कि एक तो प्रदेश की भाषा हो, दूसरी अंग्रेजी हो और तीसरी कोई मॉडर्न इंडियन लैंग्वेज हो। लेकिन इस फार्मूले में सबसे बड़ी कैंजुअल्टी उर्दू के साथ हुई है क्योंकि उत्तर भारत में कई ऐसे प्रदेश हैं जहां पर उर्दू बोली जाती है। परन्तु वहां सरकार ने यह किया कि मॉडर्न इंडियन लैंग्वेज की जगह क्लासिकल लैंग्वेज रख दी और वह लैंग्वेज संस्कृत है। इसलिए एक उर्दू भाषा जिसकी बड़ी पुरानी वृद्ध है उस संबंध में

सरकार क्या कर रही है क्या वह कोई ऐसा कदम उठायेगा कि जिससे ये जो क्लासिकल लैंग्वेज हैं इनको जगह मॉडर्न इंडियन लैंग्वेज का इन्ट्रॉड्यूस किया जा सके ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BAR-KATAKI: Sir, I did not say that. I said practically all the States except Tamil Nadu, Pondicherry and the Karaikal area of Pondicherry.

SHRI PRAKASH MEHROTRA: She did not say Tamil Nadu.

MR. CHAIRMAN: she said that.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BAR-KATAKI: I am sorry the hon. Member did not hear it. So far as the Hindi-speaking States are concerned, they have accepted the three language formula with a little modification. As the hon. Member has said, for the three language formula—two languages—Urdu and Sanskrit—they have not taken, but so far Urdu is concerned, facilities for the teaching of Urdu under the three language formula exist in Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Gujarat, Haryana, Himachal Pradesh, J & K, Karnataka, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Orissa, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, U.P., West Bengal and the Union Territories of Delhi, Meghalaya, Andaman and Nicobar Islands and Goa, Daman and Diu, and Government is taking steps so that Urdu should also be one of the languages in the three language formula.

श्री गुरुदेव गुप्त : श्रीमन्, मंत्री जी ने अभी बताया कि तीन राज्यों में त्रिभाषा फार्मूला लागू नहीं हुआ है और वे इसका कार्यान्वयन नहीं कर रहे हैं तो मैं उनसे यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इसको लागू कराने के लिए वह क्या कार्यवाही कर रही हैं और कब तक उनको आशा है कि यह लागू हो जायेगा ?

मेरा दूसरा प्रश्न यह है कि यह जो हिन्दी भाषा भाषी राज्य हैं जहाँ हिन्दी प्रथम भाषा है वहाँ तीसरी भाषा कौन सा पढ़ाया जा रही है क्योंकि दक्षिणी भाषाओं को यह शिकायत है कि हिन्दा उनके ऊपर लादा जा रहा है अतः हिन्दी भाषा भाषी राज्यों में सरकार के पास क्या कोई ऐसा प्रबंध विचारार्थ है जिससे कि दक्षिण भारत की कोई भाषा त्रिभाषा फार्मूले के अंतर्गत इन प्रदेशों में पढ़ाया जा सक ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: Sir, as I have mentioned, the implementation of the three language formula rests with the State Governments. It is the primary responsibility of the States. Many of the States have implemented the three language formula in letter and spirit. Many of the States have not implemented it to that extent. Under the three language formula, in the Hindi-speaking States, they have preferably to take one of the Southern languages, but many of these States have not adopted a southern language as one of the three languages. But to facilitate that, we have established many institutions in which we are imparting training to the teachers for the teaching of the regional languages and through that we are trying to impart teaching of one of the Southern languages in the Hindi-speaking States.

SHRI SAWAISINGH SISODIA: It is quite alright as a matter of policy that the three language formula has been agreed upon by the State Governments as well as the Central Government. But I would like to know from the hon. Minister regarding the implementation of this formula. How many States have not implemented the agreed formula? I would also like to know whether any conference of the representatives of the various States had been convened by the Central Government and the matter discussed, what the decisions were and whether they had demanded any

financial aid. I should also like to know whether the Centre has agreed to give aid to various States. And I should also like to know the meaning of the third language—whether it is the modern language or the classical language; and which are the languages including the modern language. Please reply specifically.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: Sir, the rationale behind the three-language formula, and its implication, has been clearly defined in the Resolution that Parliament adopted in 1968. Here it states "that this House resolves that an arrangement should be made in accordance with that formula for study of Modern Indian languages, preferably one of the Southern languages, apart from Hindi and English in Hindi-speaking areas and of Hindi along with regional languages and English in non-Hindi speaking areas". Sir, to promote this three-language formula, we are not merely depending on the State Governments, but we have also initiated some schemes. We have given financial assistance to non-Hindi-speaking States on 100 per cent basis for supplementing Hindi teaching in schools; 100 per cent financial assistance for establishment of Hindi teachers' training colleges in States like Andhra Pradesh, Assam, Kerala, Mysore, Nagaland, Orissa and West Bengal

MR. CHAIRMAN: Not Mysore now, but Karnataka.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: I am sorry, Sir. When it was established it was Mysore; now it is Karnataka.

... setting up of a Central Institute of Indian Languages in Karnataka with five Regional Language Centres at Mysore, Poona, Bhubaneswar Patiala and Solan to assist primarily in setting up of schools and for production of literature and material in the language, particularly bilingual nonmother-tongue teaching.

श्रीमती हामिदा हबीबुल्लह : सभापति महोदय, मुझे बड़े अफसोस के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि हमारी जनता पार्टी के मंत्री साहिबान या तो स्टडी नहीं करते हमारे सवालियों की या फिर वे उनका जवाब देना नहीं चाहते हैं। क्योंकि जो सवाल पूछा गया है उसका जवाब मिला नहीं है। यहाँ सवाल था कि —

Is the Government taking steps with the concerned States about implementation?

सभापति महोदय, इसमें इम्प्लीमेंटेशन का सवाल था कि थ्री लैंग्वेज फार्मुले का इम्प्लीमेंटेशन हो रहा है या नहीं हो रहा है। अभी जो जवाब दिया गया उससे पता चला कि जो हिन्दी, इंग्लिश और एक रोजनल लैंग्वेज का साथ इंडिया में ठीक से पालन नहीं हो रहा है। बहरहाल, मैं उसमें नहीं जा रही हूँ। मेरा सवाल है कि नार्दन इंडिया में जहाँ थ्री लैंग्वेज फार्मुले के अन्दर उर्दू को शामिल किया गया है, वहाँ पर इसका इम्प्लीमेंट किया गया या नहीं? बार बार यह आर्डर दिये गये हैं कि जो भी दरखास्तें हिन्दी, अंग्रेजी और उर्दू में आयें, उनको कबूल किया जाय। हाल ही में उत्तर प्रदेश के चीफ मिनिस्टर ने यह कहा है कि अगर कोई इसको कबूल नहीं करता है—उर्दू की दरखास्तों को—तो हम उसके उपर ऐक्शन लेंगे। एक तरफ तो यह हो रहा है और दूसरी तरफ थ्री लैंग्वेज फार्मुला इम्प्लीमेंट नहीं हो रहा है। उर्दू के सिलसिले में, उर्दू के बाबत मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि हम इसके लिये फैसिलिटीज दे रहे हैं। मैं फैसिलिटीज की बात नहीं कर रही हूँ। मैं थ्री-लैंग्वेज फार्मुले के इम्प्लीमेंटेशन की बात कर रही हूँ। यह तभी अच्छी तरह हो सकता है जब कि जो आफिसर है, जो कर्मचारी है वह इसको अच्छी तरह से समझे, तभी वह उस लैंग्वेज में जवाब दे सकते हैं नहीं तो वह कैसे देंगे?

MR. CHAIRMAN; It is all right. She has understood very well.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI; Sir. I am very sorry that...

MR- CHAIRMAN: It is between two ladies'

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: I can assure this much to the hon. Member that I am trying to be honest and sincere in replying to the questions. So far as Urdu and the three-language formula is concerned, I have said clearly that we have to depend upon the State Governments entirely for implementation. A few minutes before, the Hon. Education Minister' has said that in the present prevailing atmosphere of the Centre-State relations we cannot impose anything on the states. Whatever we impose and whatever we say, they take it either as mandatory or they oppose it. That is why it is only persuasion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Incentives and other things.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI; Yes, Sir. So far as Urdu is concerned, we are giving facilities. In the Taraqqi-e-Urdu Board last year we have spent Rs. 14 lakhs for the development of Urdu. In some States, even in the primary stages they have facilities to impart training in the Urdu language. They have got facilities at the secondary stage also. About the three-language formula, I have said that these are the facilities to take Urdu as one of the languages in the three-language formula.

SHRI BHAURAO DEVAJI KHOBRA; Sir, the Hon. Minister has just now mentioned that the three-language formula is accepted by almost all the states except a few ones. Therefore, I would like to know whether the hon. Minister is aware of the fact that the Bihar Government

has recently taken a decision to forbid the use of English language for official purpose. Not only that, but it has also decided to take disciplinary action against those Government officers who would write even a single sentence or even a single word in English. If this is a fact and if this is the implementation of the three-language formula, it would result in forbidding the officers from other States, who do not know Hindi, from accepting jobs, in Bihar and it will create obstacles and impediments in the way of the implementation of the integrated All-India Services. Therefore, what does the Government propose to do?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: Sir, the main objective of the three-language formula is to promote understanding and appreciation among different linguistic groups in the country and to provide some basis of equality between the Hindi-speaking areas and the non-Hindi speaking areas. If in some States they have taken that type of attitude that they cannot write in English, I think it is wrong on the part of the State Governments. The only thing we can do is that we can persuade them not to adopt that attitude. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NARASINGHA PRASAD NANDA: The Hon. Minister has replied clearly that the present Janata Government also accepts the three-language formula, but she admits that some of the States are not implementing this formula. May I know whether any of those State Governments who were not implementing this formula, have come forward with any of their practical difficulties which they are facing in the implementation of the formula? If those difficulties are there, what steps has the Government taken to see that this formula is implemented or is the Government contemplating to change the entire national policy which was accepted by Parliament?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: It is a fact that in spite

of a resolution of Parliament and repeated sentiments from all quarters, we have got only a limited success in the implementation of the formula. The main difficulties are; We have the general operation of a heavy language load in the school curriculum; secondly, lack of educational motivation for the State for an additional modern language in the Hindi-speaking areas; thirdly, resistance to the study of Hindi in some non-Hindi areas and the heavy cost of expenditure involved in providing for the teaching of the second and the third languages in the schools. These are the difficulties we are having, and we are trying to overcome these difficulties.

SHRI MANUBHAI MOTILAL PATEL: The problem of language is being unnecessarily confused by some hon. Members. The real problem regarding the three-language formula is not the problem of administrative usage of a language. It is also not a problem of medium of instructions in the educational institutions. The real idea behind the three-language formula, as explained by the hon. Minister, is for national integration and that is why the States in the South have to learn Hindi and the States in the North have to learn some southern language.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: On a point of order.

SHRI MANUBHAI MOTILAL PATEL: I never interrupted you. Why do you interrupt me??

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: On a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No point of order during Question Hour. (*Interruption*) Please wait. I will tell Dr. Zakaria who has come here just now that it has been decided not to raise any point of order during Question Hour. It has been accepted by the House. Now, Mr. Patel, please put in your supplementary.

SHRI MANUBHAI MOTILAL PATEL: My question is that the three-language formula as visualised by the Education Ministry and the Government long before, even by the previous Government, means in the South one regional language...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your supplementary?

SHRI MANUBHAI MOTILAL PATEL: In the North the difficulty is because Hindi is the regional language and Hindi is the mother tongue also, and they have got Urdu which is akin to Hindi. May I know in this context whether any State in the North, in the Hindi-speaking area, has adopted in the three-language formula any South Indian language like Tamil, Telugu or Malayalam? That is my question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But your preliminary speech was much longer.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: So far as our knowledge goes, one or two States have taken one or two South Indian language. Haryana is, one such State where they are teaching Telugu.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: Sir, the three-language formula has dug the grave of Urdu because it is neither a national language nor a regional language. Therefore, only to spell out certain facilities given and to say that Urdu, as a result, is receiving any kind of support or encouragement from the Government is not correct. I would, therefore, ask the Minister whether she is prepared to so modify the three-language formula that you have the national language, you have the regional language and you have the mother tongue. Where the regional language and the mother tongue are the same, it is perfectly all right. But unfortunately the position of Urdu being what it is, if the Government is really keen to see that Urdu is saved, there is no other way except a modification of the three-

language formula. Is the Minister prepared to consider it?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: No, Sir, we do not think we have to modify the three-language formula to promote Urdu. It is a question of motivating the States to take Urdu. Recently we had a meeting. The Home Minister invited the Chief Ministers of four States—Bihar, Rajasthan, Madhya Pradesh and Uttar Pradesh. These four Chief Ministers met together and they discussed about Urdu, and they have agreed to take steps for teaching Urdu in these States.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shrimati Alva.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: What is the achievement? Nothing. You want to kill Urdu. That is all.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: In view of the fact that it is the Hindi speaking States which have not really taken the trouble to implement the three-language formula, I would like to know what efforts the Janata Government is going to make—today you have your party Government in all these Hindi-speaking States—to see that the Governments in these States introduce a non-Hindi language in their States. I would like to know whether any steps have been taken to take up this matter with the State Governments since they are having their own Governments in these Hindi-speaking States now. What are you doing now?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: Sir, I do not know why the hon. lady Member is so excited on one year of our rule. They had taken 30 years and in 30 years they could not implement the three-language formula. *(Interruptions)* so far as the Janata Government is concerned...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The best way is to say "Government" instead of this Government or that Government.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI; Yes, Sir, but she asked what we were doing. So far as this Government is concerned, during this one year we have had meetings and we have also written letters to the State Governments on the implementation of the three-language formula. ' We have invited Education Ministers and Chief Ministers to discuss about this and I think they have agreed in principle that they will implement this formula.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Instead of implementing the three-language formula, they are doing away with English in Bihar.

PROF. RAMLAL PARIKH; The question that I would like to ask here is this. Even in Hindi-speaking States like Madhya Pradesh— I had written to the Education Minister on this point—in some schools for speaking in Hindi the students were penalised; the students were punished for speaking in Hindi...

MR. CHAIRMAN: So do you want that to be done in other States?

PROF. RAMLAL PARIKH: I do not want that. As regards the question raised about Bihar, since I know of it, the question here is whether the three-language formula is for teaching or it is for examination. In Bihar they have English; they have not removed it from teaching. So, I want to know from the Minister whether, according to the Kothari Commission's recommendation, the Ministry is making it clear to all the State Governments that this three-language formula is for teaching three languages and for examination schemes every State is free to evolve its own system of examination. I want to know whether the Government is going to clarify this point to all the State Governments.

SHRI G. LAKSHMANAN: The three-language formula is nothing but a fraud played on the people of the south.

SHRI PILOO MODY; Who is the author of the formula?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: So far as the question of Prof. Ramlal Parikh is concerned, we have already clarified the matter to the State Governments.

SHRI U. R. KRISHNAN: What are the Hindi-speaking States that are teaching Tamil under the three-language formula, and, what is the amount spent for the promotion of different languages after the Janata Government has assumed office?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI; As I have said before, I do not have the figures with me regarding southern languages being taught in the Hindi-speaking States. I would require notice for that.

SHRI U. R. KRISHNAN: The second part of my question has not been answered. What is the amount spent so far on the teaching of the different South Indian languages in the Hindi-speaking States

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI; We have spent a lot of money on the teaching of different languages. But I would require notice if he wants the figures.

SHRI U. R. KRISHNAN; My question was about the amount spent so far, after the Janata Government has assumed office, on the different languages.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You put a specific question for that and she will find out the information

SHRI YOGENDRA MAKWANA: The honourable Minister said that Telugu was accepted as the third language by Haryana. I would like to know the year in which it was so accepted,

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI; For- that also I would require notice.

SHRIMATI LEELA DAMODARA MENON: As a conscious effort to promote study of Hindi in non-Hindi speaking States, would the Government take up a special project and aid the State Governments in starting special study courses?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: As I have said, the Government of India has initiated many schemes to impart Hindi in the non-Hindi speaking States.

MR. CHAIRMAN: She comes from Kerala. She wants to know what assistance you are giving for the promotion of Hindi there.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: Many voluntary organisations are working for the promotion of Hindi in the non-Hindi-speaking States. Besides this, we have given money to the concerned States for appointment of Hindi teachers in the schools.

DR. V. P. DUTT: If I may recite an Urdu couplet, the real problem is,

मज्ज बढता गया ज्यू दवा की

Now the situation is getting worse every year. It is not a question of who is to blame. So far as the three-language formula is concerned, the situation is getting worse every year. You have said that some southern States have not accepted in principle the three-language formula. But is it not also a fact that at least they are implementing the two-language formula whereas you have States like Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh, which are implementing only one-language formula, and that is Hindi? Therefore, I would like to ask you what steps are being taken so that the people of the Hindi belt do not become illiterate by rejecting the three-language formula.

MR CHAIRMAN: She has already replied to it.

DR. V. P. DUTT: Is it a fact or not that the spoils in Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, and Madhya Pradesh are implementing only one language formula, that is, Hindi?

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: Our information is not the same as the hon. Member has.

SHRI G. LAKSHMANAN: The sons and daughters of all the politicians, M.L.As. and Ministers are admitted only in convents. They do not give them education in Hindi

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is all right. You are to elicit information. You are given some information.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: When the hon. Minister says on behalf of the Government of India that they have faith in the three language formula, may I know what action the Central Government is going to take against Shri Kar-poori Thakur, the Chief Minister of Bihar, who has issued a circular that no Government officer will...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That question was put and reply given.

SHRI ARVIND GANESH KULKARNI: I want to know from the hon. Minister what action is going to be taken against the Chief Minister *for* issuing that circular. Let the Minister give a clear reply.

SHRIMATI RENUKA DEVI BARKATAKI: We have no knowledge about that circular. Even if there is such a circular, I need Shri Kulkarni's advice in the matter as to what action we can take against the Chief Minister for issuing the circular.