

copy each in (English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(i) Seventeenth Annual Report and Accounts of the Hindustan Teleprinters Limited, Madras for the year 1977-78, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(ii) Review by Government on the working of the company.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-2989/78 for (i) and (ii)]

REFERENCE TO THE SPEECH OF SHRI N. A. PALKHIVALA AT THE UNIVERSITY OF RICHMOND

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: On a point of order . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour is over. Something was said then. After that, I have gone to the second item. That is also over. Now, why are you raising point of order? I do not understand this. Even the second item is over.

SHRI ERA SEZHIYAN: I also wanted to raise a point of order.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: If you give me half a minute, then you will know whether there is point of order or not in what I am going to say . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: No, No.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Can these gentlemen decide whether you should allow me to raise it or not? Have you delegated your authority to Shri Sharma and Kalp Nath Rai?

MR. CHAIRMAN: They have no such authority.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Then, what I wish to state . . .

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Listen to me. The Question Hour is over. Something was discussed then. Then I went to the second item. That is also over. Now the Leader of the Opposition wants to say something. Let me hear him.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Is he on a point of order?

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no question of point of order.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: But I am on a point of order. I wish to state . . .

(Interruptions)

Should the floor of this House be defiled by making abusive references to high dignitaries . . .

(Interruptions).

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: You have called the Leader of the Opposition.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: My friend here has used highly objectionable language . . .

(Interruptions)

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी):

मान्यवर, मैं कह रहा था कि प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर की बात नहीं है . . .

(Interruptions)

श्री शिव चन्द्र झा : वह तो खत्म हो गई है ।

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : राष्ट्रीय प्रतिष्ठा का प्रश्न है, सदन की मर्यादा और प्रतिष्ठा का प्रश्न है जो भूपेश गुप्त जी ने आपके सामने रखा है . . . (Interruptions)
माननीय मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि एक्सटेम्पोरे स्पीच है . . .

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please do not raise it again.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Are Sir, how are you allowing it? Then, you allowing him? Sir, how are you

[Shri Banubhai Patel]

allowing it? Then, Mr. Sezhiyan also has got a point of order.

(Interruptions)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, I do not know how you are allowing them to make such meaningless and non-sensical charges.

(Interruptions)

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : श्रीमन्, हमारी यह मांग है कि उनकी स्पीच का विवरण यहाँ रखा जाये। उनकी स्पीच की एक प्रतिलिपि सदन में रखी जाये ...

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you are raising the same thing, then I will have to allow the Members on this side also.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, if he is not going to make a statement, then we will not allow any Minister to make any statement.

(Interruptions)

SHRI KAMLAPATI TRIPATHI: Sir, it must be on record. That copy should be put up before the House. That is my demand.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND (Punjab): Sir, the Minister cannot escape like that.

(Interruptions)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Sir, if somebody calls such a high dignitary as an American henchman, then I can also call them as the Russian henchmen. Will these things go on record? Will it be proper, Sir?

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can we now go to the next item, that is, the Calling Attention Motion?

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: Sir, what is your decision on this matter?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, what is your decision in the matter?

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: Sir, a statement from him and a copy of the speech of Mr. Palkhiwala should be made available to us.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, I fully support their demand.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, let him ascertain from Mr. Palkhiwala and make available to us what he has said.

SHRI ERA SEZHIYAN: Sir, I have a point of order to make.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: Sir, the only thing is this: If this is to be decided ... (Interruptions) ... let him call for a copy of that speech. He can get a copy of that speech. It must be a prepared one and it has been reported. Let him get a copy of that and then we shall go through it and we shall go by that and we shall not go by what is said here and we will find out if there is something to hide in it ... (Interruptions) Let him get a copy of that speech.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shall we go to the next item of business?

(Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: It has to be explained.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is there to explain?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Sir, the Ambassador spoke extempore.

SHRI U. R. KRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu): How do you know?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Very good.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Because he is the External Affairs Minister.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I am expected to know. No verbatim record of the speech was kept. When we received the same pamphlet which is in the possession of my honourable friend, Shri Kalp Nath Rai, we made inquiries. This pamphlet was circulated by a private individual...

AN HON. MEMBER: Like Mr. Kalp Nath Rai.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: ...who was in Allahabad for many years and he has given his own version of Mr. Palkhivala's speech. Sir, he spoke on the new birth of freedom in India.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: That is the point.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I have a gist of his speech. Sir, he condemned the proclamation of emergency... (Interruptions) ...and he castigated those who were instrumental in imposing the emergency in India.

(Interruptions)

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: Is it fair? (Interruptions). It is unfair.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, Mr. Palkhivala, if I may say so . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Sir, just hear me . . . (Interruptions). Please listen to me, Sir.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the honourable Minister has now come out with the statement that the gist of his speech is with him. So, please ask him to place it on the Table of the House.

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: (Karnataka): Sir, he has said that the gist is with him.

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute, Mr. Salve. Mrs. Alva, according to you...

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Mr. Palkhivala should have gone to lift the shoes of a lady . . .

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. (Interruptions). One minute, please. Now, according to the views of the honourable lady Member.... (Interruptions) ..he is coming out with something. Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, according to your statement, he is coming out with something. So, why not hear him?

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: We are hearing him, Sir.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, we are hearing him.

PROF. N. G. RANGA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, what we have been asking for is a copy of that speech. It has been the practice in both the Houses Sir, that the Chair, the Presiding Officer, has ruled, has always ruled, whenever a question is given notice of, is given due notice of, that the speech concerned, when it is made, by any one of the important functionaries of the Government whether

[Prof. N. G. Ranga]

a Minister or an Ambassador or anybody else, when a demand has been made that the speech must be placed on the Table of the House, it has been the custom, it has been considered to be the duty of the presiding officer...

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: It makes it incumbent on the Minister...

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. G. RANGA: You have authority, according to the practice, to insist that the report should be placed on the Table of the House. The Leader of the Opposition has asked you, but you were not good enough....

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: He should not have come to the House without the text... (Interruptions). You direct him to bring the text...

(Interruptions)

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : आपके पास जो है वह रख लीजिये ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : श्रीमान्, मैं सदन को आश्वासन देना चाहता हूँ और विरोधी दल के वरिष्ठ नेता को कि अगर मेरे पास उस भाषण की प्रतिलिपि होती, तो मैं जरूर सभा पटल पर रखता ।...

(Interruptions)

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : आप जिसकी चर्चा अभी कर रहे हैं उसको...

(Interruptions)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मैंने कहा उस भाषण का निचोड़...

(Interruptions)

श्री अनन्त प्रसाद शर्मा : निचोड़ रखिये...

(Interruptions)

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : विदेश मंत्री जी... (Interruptions). मामूली, अभी विदेश मंत्री जी जिक्र कर रहे हैं कि...

(Interruptions)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Let that gist be read out for the benefit of hon. Members...

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: What is this?

(Interruptions)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I do not have a copy of the speech-

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: He may be directed to get a copy of the speech. Let us take notes on this...

(Interruptions)

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Let him give an assurance that he will give it...

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Mr. Vajpayee has admitted that he has got a gist of the speech with him. The issue is two-fold: first, when he has a gist of the speech with him, he should have divulged to the House what precisely Mr. Palkhiwala said in his speech; secondly, something which is far more important: is it fair and proper because there are certain well-known norms of international diplomacy, and no diplomat of any country gets involved in any controversial matter. His job is supposed to be something else. In the circumstances, Sir, is it fair and proper on the part of the Government, this incompetent Government, to use a manlike Mr. Palkhiwala to aggrandise and subserve the interests of the party in the U.S.A. and wash the dirty linen...

(Interruptions)

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA (Maharashtra): On a point of order...

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: You have...

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salve, we are not discussing the subject today.

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : अभी आपने कहा । अभी मंत्री महोदय ने कहा निचोड़ है । आप उसे ही रख दीजिये ।

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: You have listened to Shri Bhupesh Gupta. You have listened to others. This is a matter which concerns the rights of the House...

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: This shall not go on record.

(Shri N. K. P. Salve continued to speak)

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is not being recorded. Why do you go on speaking?

(Interruptions)

(Shri N. K. P. Salve continued to speak)

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: Does he have the right to defy the Chair all the time?

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I cannot compel any Minister to answer a question in a manner in which the Members desire. This is clear. (Interruptions) You are talking. But you are not allowing me to talk. Is it the way? My point is that he is clear in his mind that there is no copy of the speech. (Interruptions) You are not allowing me to speak. The point is that when the Presiding Officer has to do something, he must do it correctly. The Minister says that he has not got a copy of the speech. That was not a prepared speech. It was

an extempore speech. He has got no copy. I cannot compel him.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: The gist of the speech is available with the hon. Minister. That should be made available to us.

DR. RAFIQ ZAKARIA: I respect your ruling. You are right in saying that the Minister has said that he has not got a copy of the speech and, therefore, he cannot place it on the Table of the House. But he has contradicted himself by his subsequent behaviour. When Mr. Kalp Nath Rai made the allegations, he said that he did not know anything and, therefore, he could not say anything. Sir, my point of order is this. When he was asked for a copy of the speech, he could have told the Ambassador that even if he did not have a copy, he could recollect what he had said. The Ambassador could give a gist of what was said and that should have been placed on the Table of the House. He is just trying to take cover which is making it rather suspicious. If there was nothing objectionable in what the Ambassador did or which the Foreign Minister thought was not objectionable, he could have come forward and said that though he did not make a prepared speech and there was no verbatim version kept, still that was what he had said. I do not think there is anything objectionable in doing it. Firstly, he tried to evade a reply to that question. Then he says that no record was kept. Sir, it is your duty as the custodian of the rights and privileges of the Members to direct him because he himself has indeed admitted that he has the gist. (Interruptions) He said various things. But why did he not say that he was trying to get the gist? I want your ruling on this. (Interruptions) Sir, when a point of order is raised, it is your duty to reply to it or to say that it is irrelevant or out of order. The Foreign Minister in his own reply has

[Shri Rafiq Zakaria]

contradicted his own position. Firstly he said that he did not know anything and subsequently he came forward to say that he knew what was said.

(Interruptions)

SHRI S. W. DHABE (Maharashtra): Sir, he has raised a point of order. Let it be replied. It is essential.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, the point at issue is...

SHRI S. W. DHABE: Mr. Chairman, Sir, you are not protecting the House. Mr. Zakaria has raised a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, I will give a ruling.

SHRI S. W. DHABE: Sir, you give us a ruling. And you must protect the House and not the Minister.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: How can I say if you all get up? I will find out from the record whether there is any contradiction between the earlier speech...

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: Let the Minister deny that he has not said that the gist of a speech is with him. Let him deny.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: There is no question of my denying. I did say that when the pamphlet was circulated, the Ambassador was contacted. And he informed the Ministry about his speech. He gave a gist of that speech.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: You should have laid it on the Table.

श्री कमलापति त्रिपाठी : आपसे मेरा निवेदन है मान्यवर कि विदेश मंत्री जी के पास जो निचोड़ है उनकी स्पीच का और जब इन्होंने पूछा था कि जो कुछ निचोड़

या जानकारी उन्होंने भेजी है इनको जिसका अभी जिक्र भी कर रहे हैं, आपसे मेरी प्रार्थना है कि आपका कर्तव्य है कि आप उनसे कह कि उस निचोड़ को सदन के पटल पर रख दें।

MR. CHAIRMAN: But he is prepared to say something.

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: During the Question Hour, he wasted half an hour. He should have placed the gist on the Table then.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: When the Minister is prepared to say something, you are not prepared to hear. How can we carry on like this?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : सभापति, महोदय सवाल यह पूछा गया था कि क्या सरकार उस भाषण की एक प्रतिलिपि सभा पटल पर रखने का विचार रखती है; उसका मैंने यह उत्तर दिया था कि भाषण पहले से तैयार नहीं हुआ था। अतः उसका पाठ उपलब्ध नहीं है। अगर यह पूछा जाता कि उस भाषण में क्या कहा गया था...

(Interruptions) तो मैं जरूर उत्तर देता कि उस भाषण में यह-यह बात कहीं गई थीं... (Interruptions).

सभापति महोदय, इसके बाद श्री कल्प नाथ राय जी ने कहा कि स्पीच उनके पास है...

(Interruptions)

श्री कल्प नाथ राय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : कापी है...

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: Sir, he is shifting the ground.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : ... (Interruptions). फिर कहा कि आप उसको सभा पटल पर रख दीजिये।

श्री नत्थो सिंह (राजस्थान) : यह कहा कि श्री कल्प नाथ राय जी के पास जो स्पीच का पाठ उपलब्ध है उस प्रतिलिपि को सदन की मेज पर रखें और यदि उन्होंने गलत बयान दिया है, तो उनको सजा दी जायगी ।

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: That gist should be placed on the Table of the House.

SHRI KAMLAPATI TRIPATHI: Sir, it is your duty to direct the Minister to place that gist on the Table of the House.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Sir, I am prepared to lay a copy of the gist of the speech on the Table and that will be done on Monday.

श्री नत्थो सिंह : लेकिन कल्प नाथ राय भी रखें वह कापी जो उनके पास है । जरूर रखें उस वह ।

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: Sir...

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not take down anything of Mr. Anand.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I have promised the Leader of the Opposition and the other Members of the Opposition that I will lay a copy of the gist of the speech on Monday on the Table of the House. Now, I would like Mr. Kalp Nath Rai also to lay his copy.

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: He is not obliged. (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kalap Nath Rai, as a Member of the Rajya Sabha, cannot lay it on the Table of the House. If at all he wants to lay it on the Table, it has to be sent through me. He cannot do it.

श्री नत्थो सिंह : तो आपके पास ही भेज दें ।

श्री मनुभाई पटेल : तब मालूम पड़ेगा हमें कल्प नाथ राय कितनी गंदी बात करते हैं ।

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: Sir, . . .

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Anand, I have not allowed you. You are unnecessarily creating confusion. Let us do some work. Please resume your seat. Now we will take up the Calling Attention Motion.

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: I am resuming my seat.

REFERENCE TO THE REQUEST FOR FIXING A DATE FOR DIS- CUSSION ON THE NO-DAY-YET- NAMED-MOTION

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA (Bihar): Sir, I seek your permission to raise a very important point. Mr. Bhupesh Gupta has given a notice for a motion to be moved in this House regarding the alleged corruption charges against Mr. Kantibhai Desai. Sir, I would like to know when you are going to take up that motion, namely, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta's motion regarding the alleged corruption charges against Mr. Kantibhai Desai. When are you and the Government going to take up that motion for consideration in the House?

(Interruptions)

REFERENCE TO THE SPEECH OF SHRI N. A. PALKHIVALA AT THE UNIVERSITY OF RICHMOND contd.

SHRI JAGJIT SINGH ANAND: Sir, let Mr. Vajpayee's conduct and mine be decided by the House. Half an hour of time of this House has been wasted because Mr. Vajpayee did not do the elementary duty by