

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 17th March, 2005/26 Phalguna, 1926 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS *New rail*

and bus links between India and Pakistan

*221. SHRI RAJ NATH SINGH:†

SHRI PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ:

Will the Minister of EXTERNAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) the details of the proposals for the new rail and bus links between India and Pakistan;

(b) whether Government have examined its viability;

(c) if so, the details thereof;

(d) whether the security implication of such links was taken into consideration before making such announcements; and

(e) if so, the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI E. AHAMMED): (a) to (e) A Statement is placed on the Table of the House.

Statement

New rail and bus links between India and Pakistan

During the visit of External Affairs Minister, Shri K. Natwar Singh, to Pakistan from February 15-17 2005 to Pakistan, agreements were reached to start bus services between Srinagar and Muzaffarabad, and between Lahore and Amritsar, including to religious places such as Nankana Sahib. Pakistan also agreed to work towards early restoration of the Khokrapar-Munabao rail link.

† The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Raj Nath Singh.

These links would significantly enhance people-to-people contacts, which have provided palpable support to the present process. Security implications of the above links have been taken into account and passengers will be allowed to travel on them only after due procedures and checks have been completed.

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सभापति महोदय, यह बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण विषय है और हमारी यह अपेक्षा थी कि जिस समय भारत के विदेश मंत्री जी ने पाकिस्तान के साथ भारत का इस विषय पर एग्रीमेंट किया, जो एग्रीमेंट होने के बाद निश्चित रूप से सरकार की तरफ से कोई न कोई स्टेटमेंट इस सदन के समक्ष प्रस्तुत किया जाएगा, लेकिन लंबा समय गुजर जाने के बाद भी सरकार की तरफ से कोई स्टेटमेंट सदन के पटल पर नहीं रखा गया और इसलिए बाध्य होकर मुझे इस महत्वपूर्ण विषय को लेकर यहां प्रश्न करना पड़ा। सभापति जी, माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने उत्तर में कहा है कि यह बस सर्विस और रेल सर्विस आरम्भ करने का जो फैसला किया गया है, वह भारत और पाकिस्तान के लोगो के बीच पीपुल टू पीपुल का कॉटेक्ट बढ़ाने के लिए किया गया है। इसमें किसी को कोई आपत्ति नहीं हो सकती कि भारत और पाकिस्तान के रिश्ते बेहतर होने चाहिए, इतना ही नहीं भारत और पाकिस्तान के बीच आवागमन के साधन भी सुगम होने चाहिए, सरल होने चाहिए, बिना किसी व्यवधान के होने चाहिए, लेकिन सबसे बड़ा महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न यह है कि सुरक्षा का ध्यान रखा जाना चाहिए। भारत और पाकिस्तान के रिश्ते ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : आप क्वेश्चन करिए।

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सर, मैं यही प्रश्न पूछना चाहता हूं कि सरकार भी इस बात से सहमत होगी कि आवागमन की सारी सुविधा उपलब्ध होने के बाद भारत की सेफ्टी के साथ किसी भी प्रकार की ढिलाई नहीं बरती जाए, जो इस प्रकार की सुरक्षा को कायम करने के लिए भारत सरकार ने क्या किया है ? मैं यह भी याद दिलाना चाहता हूं ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : नहीं, पहले सरकार को बोलने दीजिए।

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सर, मैं याद दिलाना चाहता हूं कि जिस समय श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी के नेतृत्व की सरकार ने यह फैसला किया। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, वाद — विवाद कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : आप क्वेश्चन करिए, भाषण नहीं देने दूंगा।

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सर, उस समय पासपोर्ट और वीजा का प्रावधान रखा था, लेकिन आपने पासपोर्ट और वीजा के प्रावधान को समाप्त करके एक सामान्य परमिट सिस्टम लागू किया है। मैं

यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इससे भारत को कौनसा राजनैतिक अथवा कूटनीतिक लाभ हुआ है ?
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : ठीक है, आपका प्रश्न हो गया ।

विदेश मंत्री (श्री के. नटवर सिंह) : सभापति महोदय, मैं एक बात यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि राजनाथ सिंह जी का हम सब सम्मान करते हैं, पिछले हफ्ते मैं एक बयान यहां देने वाला था, वह किन्ही कारणों की वजह से नहीं दे सका, इसलिए उसको मैंने सदन के पटल पर रख दिया था यह पहले सवाल का जवाब है । दूसरा सवाल आपने उठाया है सुरक्षा का, मैं बड़े अदब के साथ सम्मान के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमारी सरकार को भी उतनी फिक्र है, जितनी आपको सुरक्षा की है, मगर मैं यह याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ कि जब श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी और जसवंत सिंह जी लाहौर में गले मिल रहे थे, तो कारगिल में क्या हो रहा था ।

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सभापति महोदय, कारगिल में क्या हुआ, क्या नहीं हुआ
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : आप क्वेश्चन करिए । आप कारगिल को भूल जाइए । ...(व्यवधान)...
क्वेश्चन करिए ।

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सर, सुरक्षा जैसे महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न पर विदेश मंत्री जी इस प्रकार की टिप्पणी करते हैं, कारगिल के दौरान क्या हुआ । यह सारा देश जानता है कि कारगिल के समय क्या हुआ । कारगिल की लड़ाई में भारत की प्रतिष्ठा सारी दुनिया की नजरों में आई है । यह एक सच्चाई है । सर, मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर यहां सवाल दिया जा रहा है और मंत्री महोदय आरोप — प्रत्यारोप कर रहे हैं । ...(व्यवधान)... यह एक गंभीर विषय है । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : ठीक है । बैठिए, बैठिए आप । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, यह क्या है ? जब मर्जी हो, खड़े होकर बोल सकते हैं । कल भी यही किया था इन्होंने । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सवाल का जवाब मंत्री जी ने देना है यह क्यों बीच में खड़े हो जाते हैं ? ...(व्यवधान)... इस तरह से अगर आरोप — प्रत्यारोप होगा ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, एक रिकॉर्ड रखिए, ये कब कितनी बार उठते हैं ?
...(व्यवधान)...

अनिवासी भारतीय कार्य मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री (श्री जगदीश टाइटलर) : इनको इस तरह उठने के लिए टिकट मिलता है । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, may I ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सर, मेरा दूसरी सप्लीमेंट बाकी है । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : आपको इसलिए टिकट मिलती है, * ...**(व्यवधान)**... कौन है यह मंत्री ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : छोड़िए, बैठिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**... राजनाथ सिंह जी को बोलने दीजिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : यह दागी मंत्री कौन है, जो * ...**(व्यवधान)**... इनसे पूछा जाए...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : राजनाथ सिंह जी, आप बोलिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

AN HON. MEMBER: They should not disturb the House... **(Interruptions)**...

श्री मोती लाल वोरा : महोदय, जो * माननीय सदस्य ने कही है, उसे रिकार्ड से विलोपित किया जाना चाहिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**... उससे इसको कोई मतलब नहीं है । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : ये सदन में मंत्री बनकर बैठे हैं और ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप उस पर मत जाइए । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

एक माननीय सदस्य : यह जो कह रहे हैं, वह रिकार्ड में है, इसको ऐक्सपंज करें । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Nothing should go on record. ...**(Interruptions)**... What is this?

श्री सभापति : प्रोसीडिंग्स से रेक्सपंज कर दें । ...**(व्यवधान)**... It will not ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: How can you say like this? ...**(Interruptions)**...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI: Sir, they should be more responsible. ..
..(Interruptions)... This is wrong.... (Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति : यह रिकार्ड में नहीं हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**... जो बोला, यह रिकार्ड में नहीं हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह रिकार्ड में नहीं हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : हम मंत्री जी के सवाल कर रहे हैं, उन्हें जवाब देना चाहिए, लेकिन ये बैठे — बैठे इस तरह से बोलें ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह बड़ा गंभीर मामला है । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : रिकार्ड में नहीं आया है । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : उन्होंने क्यों कहा कि मैं * हूँ । ...**(व्यवधान)**....

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, it is a very important question. I am ready to give the answer, but they are not prepared to listen. ...**(Interruptions)**... It is a very important question. I am ready to give the answer. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट । ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, एक मिनट। ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, एक मिनट । रिकार्ड में नहीं है । ...**(व्यवधान)**... माननीय सदस्य, एक मिनट, बैठिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपने कहा है क्या यह ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER: No; Sir, I have not said this. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री सभापति : माननीय सदस्य, एक मिनट । ...**(व्यवधान)**... माननीय सदस्य, अगर ऐसा कोई रिमार्क है तो मैं उसको ऐक्सपंज करूंगा । ...**(व्यवधान)**... ऐसा कोई रिमार्क है जो मैं । उसको ऐक्सपंज करूंगा । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : सर, ऐक्सपंज करना ही काफी नहीं है । ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, वे एक मंत्री का पद पर बैठे हुए हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI RAVULA CHANDRA SEKAR REDD" Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Minister is making a running commentary, ...**(Interruptions)**... unfair comments. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : महोदय, विनम्रतापूर्वक मेरा आपसे निवेदन है कि आप कल की प्रोसीडिंग्स भी देखें, इसी सदस्य के द्वारा जिस प्रकार से चेयर के ऊपर लांछन लगाया गया, यदि यही सिलसिला जारी रहा जो हम यहां इस सदन की मर्यादा की हिफाजत नहीं कर पाएंगे ।

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have taken notice of that.

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : सभापति महोदय, सिक्योरिटी इम्प्लीकेशन्स से रिलेटिड हमने कुछ प्रश्न आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी के समक्ष रखे थे। मुझे खेद है कि उनका सही उत्तर हमें प्राप्त नहीं हो पाया। मैंने यह प्रश्न मंत्री जी से पूछा था कि जिस समय एन.डी.ए. की सरकार ने आवागमन की सुविधा को प्रारम्भ करने का फैसला किया था, उस समय पासपोर्ट और वीजा का प्रावधान किया गया था। सिक्योरिटी इम्प्लीकेशन्स को ध्यान में रखते हुए ही यह प्रावधान किया गया था, लेकिन पाकिस्तान के दबाव में आकर आपने उसे छोड़ दिया और परमिट सिस्टम या लाइसेंसिंग सिस्टम को स्वीकार कर लिया। मैं यह जानना चाहता था कि इसके माध्यम से भारत को कौन सा राजनीतिक अथवा कूटनीतिक लाभ प्राप्त हुआ है। यह मेरा पहला प्रश्न है आपसे।

सभापति महोदय इस पहले प्रश्न के साथ ही एक दूसरा प्रश्न है, जो मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ, वह यह है कि बहुत सारे ऐसे पंडित, ऐसे लोग पूँछ और राजोरी से आए, जो जम्मू में आज भी बसे हुए हैं, लेकिन आज भी उन्हें वहाँ की नागरिकता प्राप्त नहीं हो पाई है। ऐसे लोग, जो पूँछ, राजोरी या सिंध से आकर वर्षों से वहाँ पर बसे हुए हैं, जिन्हें नागरिकता की सुविधा आज तक भी प्राप्त नहीं हो पाई है, उन्हें इस बस सुविधा का लाभ कैसे मिल पाएगा, यह मैं जानना चाहता हूँ और साथ ही साथ यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि युनाइटेड नेशन्स मोनीटरिंग ग्रुप ऑफ इंडिया एंड पाकिस्तान, जो वहाँ पर इस समय काम कर रहा है क्या उसकी युटिलिटी आज भी बनी हुई है अथवा आप उसे समाप्त करने जा रहे हैं ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: He keeps putting so many questions. That is too much.

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट, एक मिनट। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपने कहा है क्या यह ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER: I did not make this statement. No; Sir. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : उन्होंने कहा कि तुमको टिकट किसने दिया, जो टिकट का सवाल कहाँ से आ गया बीच में ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : टिकट का नहीं है, यह जो बात कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, ...**(व्यवधान)**....

प्रो० राम देव भंडारी : अहलुवालिया बीच में खड़े क्यों होते हैं ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : टिकट का सवाल कहां से आया ? The Government should have more patience ...(Interruptions)... प्रधानमंत्री बैठे हैं, कम से कम You should also tell them ...(Interruptions)... बीच में *कहां से आया ? हरेक के * के बारे में कहते हैं । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : माननीय सदस्य, मैं आपसे यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि सदन में यदि सही वातावरण रहेगा तो उससे आपका भी लाभ होगा, देश का भी लाभ होगा । हम जो भी बात कहें, उसमें इस प्रकार की भाषा का प्रयोग नहीं हो, जिसके कारण दूसरों को वेदना हो और सदन में उत्तेजनात्मक वातावरण बनें मैं समझता हूं कि जो कुछ कहा गया है या जो कुछ समझा गया है अथवा जो कुछ सुना गया है, उसे प्रोसीडिंग से मैं स्वयं निकाल दूंगा, लेकिन माननीय सदस्यों से मैं निवेदन करना चाहूंगा कि व्यक्तिगत रूप से वे इस प्रकार की बातें नहीं कहें, जिसे सुनकर दूसरों की संवेदनाओं को ठोस पहुंचे ।

श्रीमती सविता शारदा : सर कल भी इस प्रकार के शब्दों का प्रयोग किया गया था ...**(व्यवधान)**.

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, I hope, if the hon. Member would like to know the special procedure that we have adopted in this matter, his grouse and whatever feelings that he has expressed could be dispelled. Sir, for the Srinagar-Muzzafarabad bus service, a special procedure has been worked out for travel across the LoC, which would preserve India's principled position on Jammu and Kashmir and also, take into account all the security concerns.

With your kind permission, hon. Chairman Sir, I would like to just explain that procedure. Then these doubts will be definitely removed. Application forms for travel by bus across the LoC would be available with the designated authorities in Srinagar and Muzzafarabad. In India's case, the designated authority is the Regional Passport Offices in Srinagar, Ministry of External Affairs. Further, the application forms would require information and details, including photographs, as is normally required for a passport and a visa.

The intending traveller on our side of the LoC would submit the application form to the RPO, Srinagar. The application would be subjected

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

to due verification on our side to establish the bona fides of the traveller. The verified form would be passed on to Muzzafarabad through the immigration control point at the LoC to decide on the acceptability of the traveller. Due verification would be carried out on the other side. The verified forms would be returned to the RPO, Srinagar through the same route. The returned form would indicate those who would be allowed entry to the other side.

In the course of the actual travel, based on this application, an entry permit would be issued by the other side at the immigration check point by its designated authority.

श्री राजनाथ सिंह : श्रीमान, इस अत्यंत लंबे उत्तर की क्या आवश्यकता है ?
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : बोलने दीजिए उन्हें । ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, I may be permitted to complete my answer...(Interruptions)...he just now asked about the procedure...I am just mentioning the special procedure. For travellers coming to J & K, from Muzaffarabad, the entry permit would be issued by the RPO, Srinagar, at the immigration checkpoint at the LoC. It would indicate the number of days allowed for the visit as well as the places allowed... (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your reply has been circulated to all the Members.
(Interruptions)

SHRI E AHAMMED: Sir, I just want to explain that all their concerns with respect to security have been taken into account. This is almost like issuing of a passport. And it is also as much as like issuing of a visa. It will be called a special application form and entry permit will be issued only after due verification by both sides. There should be no reason for any apprehension with respect to the security.

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: Sir, I congratulate the Government of India on taking this bold decision, as also the Prime Minister, who considered this question. Mr. Natwar Singh's contribution is also there. It is very timely. Here I would like to put a definite question. But before that I want to tell this House that this decision to open Srinagar-Muzaffarabad road has been very widely welcomed in the State of Jammu and Kashmir. It has brought relief in the minds of the people who got separated. I am

[17 March, 2005]

RAJYA SABHA

happy that the Government of India has taken measures in respect of security. Now, the point I have in my mind is that it is very good that Srinagar-Muzaffarabad route will be opened very shortly. There are two routes which are very important—Kargil and Skardu. That is very important for those backward, illiterate and poor people...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, come to the question. *(Interruptions)*

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: Sir, earlier there was a rail link between Jammu and Suchetgarh. We want that there should be a road link between Suchetgarh and Jammu as also a rail link. So my question is this. Will the hon. External Affairs Minister, Mr. Natwar Singhji, consider and take this House into confidence on Kargil-Skardu Road and Suchetgarh-Jammu Road?

श्री सभापति : यह इस क्वेश्चन की परव्यू में तो नहीं आता ।

प्रो० सैफुद्दीन सोज : आता है ।

श्री सभापति : तो मंत्री महोदय जवाब दे दें ।

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: Sir, we want relief in other areas.

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, I just want to say only one thing. There are number of such proposals in Kargil sector, Jammu and Sialkot. The Government would examine them soon after the Srinagar-Muzaffarabad route has been assessed.

SHRI YASH WANT SINHA: Sir, the Minister of State, Shri Ahammed, has explained to this House in detail the procedure that will be followed with regard to the travel documents. He has not indicated, however, certain other things. Therefore part (a) of my question is, which is the designated authority on the Pakistan's side which will entertain the applications and issue the permits?

Part (b) of my question is this. Is it a fact that when the Indian traveller goes to the LoC, he will be travelling in Pak-occupied Kashmir on the basis of an entry permit issued by the Pakistan designated authority? And will it therefore not amount to a situation where he will have some kind of a visa without a passport? Arising out of this, is it a fact that this will strengthen Pakistan's claim that the Jammu and Kashmir is a disputed territory and that the Government of India has lent legitimacy to the

authorities of Pak-occupied Kashmir including the Northern Areas?

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, I do not think it will strengthen their claims and legitimacy on the areas under their occupation. But, on the other hand, it will strengthen India's stated position that we did not accept their demand for local documents. They wanted only a local document. We said, "No, we cannot". Why we said that local document was not acceptable to us is because since 1950, such documents were used to travel not only in Jammu and Kashmir, but also across Punjab and Rajasthan borders. Therefore, we did not accept that. There would be...(Interruptions)... I am coming to Pakistan...(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: That was my first question: Who is the designated authority? That was my first question...(Interruptions)...

SHRI E. AHAMMED: They have their own Director-General...(Interruptions)...Sir, we are concerned about the designated authority that we have decided...(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, they must know as to who the designated authority on the Pakistani side is. You are saying on 17th March that the bus will be inaugurated by the Prime Minister on the 7th April and you do not know as to who the designated authority on that side is.

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Sir, designated authority is the discretion of the respective States...(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Who is it? (Interruptions)... Who have they decided?... (Interruptions)...

SHRI E. AHAMMED: Hon. Member, I may just be permitted to say that the only thing is whether the special procedure that we have adopted is implemented or not. As per special procedure our designated authority is to do our work and their designated authority to do their work... (Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Is their designated authority the Deputy commissioner of Muzzafarabad?

SHRI E. AHAMMED: It is a matter to be decided by Pakistan...(Interruptions)...We are not to dictate them as to who should

[17 March, 2005]

RAJYA SABHA

be theirs, and they are not to dictate to us as to who should be ours.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, this is breath-taking because the Minister will not answer it and I am sorry that the senior Minister is just sitting and not replying. I am asking as to who is the designated authority on the Pakistan side.

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: This proposal was put forward by your Government.

SHRI YASWANT SINHA: Yes, we are very proud of it. But we had insisted that it should be done on the basis of passport...(Interruptions)...

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: Let me assure you that we have looked very carefully at the discussions you had with the Prime Minister Jamali, their proposals for having passport and your proposals. All these details have been discussed *ad nauseam* and we are not recognising any local identity document. Pakistan can decide who they want to designate as their authority. We are not accepting on our side any document which we don't think is the right document. That is the first thing. Secondly, the composite dialogue that you started, we are taking it forward in every single area. And, the security aspect was also mentioned. The Prime Minister, I may mention, has informed your leadership about what has been done on this particular issue and every care has been taken that in no way India's security or India's national interests will be adversely affected... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat...(Interruptions)...Please take your seat...(Interruptions)...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : सर, मैंने ए. बी.सी. करके स्पेसिफिक सवाल पूछे हैं and expect a specific reply . क्या ये "general editorial" बोलकर निकल जायेंगे ?
...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: When your Minister is not in a position to explain, why do you shout?...(Interruptions)...He is not in a position to explain, why do you shout?...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: He is a senior Member... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister is here with his reply. Please take

your seat...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: Sir, I am trying my very best to answer the question. Even today, if people travel by normal route, it is okay. They would go on the basis of a Pakistani visa. So, presently, neither is there any compromise nor a change. What I am trying to say is that, please read the interview that you gave in October, 2003 in which you waxed eloquence about the marvellous thing that you were doing on Indo-Pakistan relations. Please read it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What has that to do with this?

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: It has everything to do with it. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am not opposing it. (*Interruptions*) He is diverting the attention... (*Interruptions*) I am not questioning the process. (*Interruptions*) I am asking a specific question, and I want an answer.

प्र० राम देव भंडारी : सर, इस सवाल में 25 मिनट निकल गए हैं। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: Sir, this is a very extraordinary situation. We are supposed to answer who will be the Pakistani authority... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You will be recognising Pak-occupied-Kashmir if we accept anything that Pakistan says. हमारे पार्लियामेंट का रेज़ोल्यूशन है ? उसकी कोई चिंता नहीं है, किसी चीज़ की कोई चिंता नहीं है। क्या बात कर रहे हैं ? I am not only disappointed, but also amazed at his reply. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: Let me very politely say that I entirely return your compliment, what you have given me. I am amazed and also disappointed by your compliment. Let me tell you one thing sincerely. The Chief Minister of Jammu and Kashmir telephoned the Prime Minister and came to see me in Delhi to say that he welcomed this step, the people of Jammu and Kashmir welcomed it and the whole of India welcomed it.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I had really no intention of either seeking any clarification or entering into this field, which has been converted into an area of contention from the very beginning by the hon. Minister, by traversing this question in a variety of ways. The question

and its elements are very simple. I am sure, they are, in general, maintenance of security, and there is no doubt that we are all committed to do it. We are all concerned about security. I don't think that was the question at all. We have a commitment, yet snide efforts are made as sarcasm by the hon. Minister. The fundamental question still remains that, when it is, a passport officer on this side, and a passport officer's system on the other side, when they would be checked through Customs, and when you are making a beginning, then, why have you moved away from the passport and visa, when in actuality, you are doing everything that a passport and visa are required. Plus, what you are doing is that you now say that any citizen of Pakistan from anywhere in Pakistan, can utilise this method, coming to Srinagar *via* the Muzaffarabad route, and thereafter, he has not the right to leave Jammu and Kashmir. We are fully convinced about your concern about security. I don't think the starting point of this discussion is that, and that is why, I find it strange when the hon. Minister, who must really have the maximum information, answers the question in this manner, because this permit becomes a very dangerous instrument. Then that is why, all that we wanted to know is that when you have shifted away from passport and visa, which, after all, is a method of establishing identity, and a means of travel, what additional benefit has accrued to India? What is visa? Visa is granting a permission to travel. That is the essence of what it is. when you have moved away from it, what my distinguished colleague, Shri Yashwant Sinha, wanted to know is that, why have you moved away? What additional political, diplomatic and security gains have accrued to India? Have you done this elsewhere in this region? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Let us have a debate on this subject. I think, within the framework of Question-Answer, we cannot really address all the issues. We have no problem in having a debate. (*Interruptions*) Question hour is not the appropriate forum. (*Interruptions*)

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : लीडर ऑफ दी ओपोज़िशन भी नहीं बोल सकते ।

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : यह क्या मज़ाक है ? ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी : सर, इस तरह से हाउस नहीं चलेगा । नेता विरोधी दल को बोलने नहीं देंगे तो इस तरह से हाउस नहीं चलेगा । ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री सभापति : इनको तो बोलने दीजिए । ...**(व्यवधान)**... इनको तो क्वेश्चन करने दीजिए । आप बोल रहे हैं, इनको तो बोलने दीजिए । आप बैठिए । बैठ जाइए ।

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : सभापति महोदय, इसमें कोई दो राय नहीं हैं कि पाकिस्तान और भारत के बीच में लोगो के, आवाम के, आने — जाने के रास्ते सुगम हों, सरल हों और ज्यादा से ज्यादा खुलें । इसीलिए हमने कहा कि आप जम्मू — लाहौर , अमृतसर — लाहौर, जम्मू — सियालकोट, जम्मू — सुचेतगढ़ — सब जगह खोलें ताकि पाकिस्तान का कोई भी नागरिक इस रास्ते से आ सके, लेकिन जब 35 आए और 31 गायब हो गए — आप तो 35 थे — तो अपने आप में एक सवाल उठ खड़ा होता है कि जब वीजा और पासपोर्ट के रास्ते ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : क्वेश्चन है या डिस्कशन है, कम से कम यह बता दिया जाए । ...**(व्यवधान)**... We can't misuse the Question Hour like this...**(Interruptions)**... Sir, if you kindly allow us to have a debate on this, we can all participate. ...**(Interruptions)**... And this is an important issue. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : यह हमने कहा था, यह सुझाव हमारा है, डेफिनिटली । यह तो माननीय अटल जी ने सन 2000 में किया । परन्तु 2000 से हमने कहा कि आप पासपोर्ट और वीजा के रास्ते आइए तो पाकिस्तान को यह मंजूर नहीं था । ...**(व्यवधान)**... उन दिनों में वह नहीं हुआ था । तब उन्होंने कहा था कि ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, आपका संरक्षण चाहिए । यह क्वेश्चन है या भाषण है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सुरेन्द्र लाठ : सर, वे बार — बार क्यों इंटरवीन करते हैं ? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him finish .

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : अब अगर पासपोर्ट — वीजा छोड़ा है तो क्यों छोड़ा है और भारत को, हमारे मुल्क को क्या फायदा हुआ है इससे ? ...**(व्यवधान)**....

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: May I, Sir, first, respectfully address the distinguished Leader of the Opposition there? I do not have your gift of obfuscation, and neither do I have your style of speech, fortunately, because you know... **(Interruptions)** **(Interruptions)**....

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: why is he saying all this? ...**(Interruptions)**.. From the first sentence, the hon. Minister of External Affairs has unnecessarily started saying...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, अगली बार हमें भी मौका दीजिएगा भाषण देने का ।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : बोलने दीजिए । ...(व्यवधान)... बोलने दीजिए उनको ।
...(व्यवधान)... बोलने दीजिए । ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: I will tell you ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him reply. ...{Interruptions}...

SHRI K. NATWAR SINGH: Let me answer you. ...(Interruptions)... Let me answer you. ...(Interruptions)... The people of Jammu & Kashmir have welcomed the step, and that is all that is important of what you think.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Is that all?... (Interruptions)... The people of Jammu and Kashmir have welcomed it. Is that all? (Interruptions)... is that all?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Farooq Abdullah ... (Interruptions)... Dr. Farooq Abdullah.

DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH: Sir, I would like to first congratulate the ex-Prime Minister of India, Mr. Vajpayee, for starting a dialogue with Pakistan. Then, I would like to congratulate the present Prime Minister for continuing the same process of dialogue that was started by this side. Now, Sir, there is only one problem. Let us be very clear on this. Are we, Kashmiris, Indians or are we, Kashmiris, disputed? Please answer that. This is part one of my question. Secondly, I would like to ask you, Sir, if you have read it that the Pakistan-Occupied Kashmir Assembly has announced that only Kashmiris will be travelling on this route, which means nobody from the rest of the country... (Interruptions)...

श्री मूल चन्द मीणा : क्वेश्चन क्या है ?

DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH: Maharaja of Kashmir might come, but Farooq Abdullah will not travel because I believe we are all part of India. I will not be; neither will carry me on the bus as these people did not carry me, nor will you carry me. I want to make one thing very clear, Sir, Let me be very clear. I have a lot of problems in my own party. Whereas we welcome this bus, you have opened a new route, but for God's sake,

don't compromise on India. Do not compromise on India. One day, probably, I will get a bullet here, but being an Indian. And I hope you won't cry on that day; nor would I want you to put flowers on my grave. I want to make one thing absolutely clear that while we welcome this bus, please, if Mr. Farooq Abdullah has to travel on a passport, why not a passport for a Pakistani from that side? Why should Pakistan dictate to us that there can be no passport? Why cannot the Indian passport stand correctly there? Please answer this though I welcome the bus. And it is not Mufti who started the bus; it is your Prime Minister and my Prime Minister who did this, and thanks to your diplomatic skill, you are able to do this.

SHRI NATWAR SINGH: They have allowed anyone from India and Pakistan including Jammu and Kashmir. You can today come to Delhi and then go to Pakistan. As regards what you said, let me assure you; I am as patriotic, an Indian, as anybody in this House, and I wish you 100 years of life. More likely, you will put flowers on my grave than I will be on yours, because I am 20 years elder to you. But the fact of the matter is that you have welcomed this step. It is a beginning. We are going ahead with the railway line ...*(Interruptions)*... The question is, India's security, India's sovereignty, India's nationality, will not be allowed to be compromised.

DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH: Sir, it is not a question of Indian sovereignty. I would like to know, every Indian would like to know, as to why they would not accept our passport, the document that you and I hold. You cannot travel to Pakistan without that document, or can I travel without that passport.

SHRI NATWAR SINGH: Our distinguished Prime Minister is flagging the bus on the 7th May I invite you to be there at the ceremony? And, I hope ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: The question is: Will he be able to travel by bus? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : मैं समझता हूँ ...*(व्यवधान)*... एक मिनट, एक मिनट ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : चेयरमैन सर, उन्होंने एक भी प्रश्न का सही जवाब नहीं दिया है । ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : ज्यादा अच्छा होगा कि इसके ऊपर चर्चा कर ली जाए ।
...(व्यवधान)... जिस समय तक चर्चा न हो, उस समय तक मैं इस प्रश्न को स्थगित करता हूँ और चर्चा का समय तय कर दिया जाएगा । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री नटवर सिंह : मैं विनम्रता पूर्वक ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : अब आप छोड़िए । ...(व्यवधान)... बैठ जाइए । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह : आदरणीय सभापति जी, ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट, एक मिनट । ...(व्यवधान)... बैठिए, बैठिए ।
...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट, आप बैठ जाइए । ...(व्यवधान)... ऐसा मत करिए ।

श्री शाहिद सिद्दिकी : सारी पार्टियाँ बोलेंगी, लेकिन हम नहीं बोल सकते ।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलिए, लेकिन प्रधानमंत्री कुछ कहना चाहते हैं ।
...(व्यवधान)... पहले प्राइम मिनिस्टर को सुन लीजिए । ...(व्यवधान)... आप प्राइम मिनिस्टर को सुन लीजिए । ...(व्यवधान)... बैठ जाइए ।

THE PRIME MINISTER (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Members on the opposite side have raised many issues. The first issue was with regard to the security of our country. I can assure you, and, through you, the House, that all agencies of the Government of India, which are concerned about the security of our country, were consulted, and they were fully on board that the mechanism that we have adopted, in no way, poses any danger to our country. The second thing I do want to say is that there was this reference about the use of passports or not. But we came to the conclusion that we were essentially dealing with the human problem, the problem of divided families. And I am satisfied with the fact that a particular document being used for this purpose does not in any way compromise our rights and obligation with regard to the State of Jammu and Kashmir...
..(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति : इस पर चर्चा होगी ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, what the Prime Minister has said is not reflected in the(Interruptions)..

श्री सभापति : सदन में मैंने पहले कह दिया है कि इस पर चर्चा होगी
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : डॉक्यूमेंट को लेकर क्या करना चाहते हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : मैंने आश्वासन दे रखा है कि इस पर चर्चा हो जाएगी ...*(व्यवधान)*.

Next Question. Dr. Ramaswamy. *(Interruptions)*

श्री एम० वेंकैया नायडु : प्रधान मंत्री ने जवाब दिया है, अच्छा हैं, लेकिन अगर सवाल का जवाब देंगे तो अच्छा होगा ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एकनाथ के० ठाकुर : सभापति जी ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : कह दिया है ...*(व्यवधान)*... देखिए आप बैठ जाइए, ...*(व्यवधान)*... यहां मत आइए...*(व्यवधान)*... वहीं जाइए, ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप वहां बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैं नहीं सुनुंगा ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैंने आपसे निवेदन कर दिया है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने जवाब दिया, विदेश मंत्री जी ने भी जवाब दिया ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप मेरी बात सुनिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप संतुष्ट है कि नहीं, यह दूसरी बात हैं, लेकिन मैंने कहा कि इसके ऊपर चर्चा करा देंगे ...*(व्यवधान)*... तब इस समय यह क्वेश्चन लेने की आवश्यकता क्या है ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह बाद में हो जाएगा, खत्म हुआ किस्सा ...*(व्यवधान)*... नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, with great hesitation ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: Sir, you have already called Dr. Ramaswamy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, there was a specific query. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : हम लोगों ने स्पेसिफिक सवाल उठाया, उधर से कोई जवाब नहीं आया ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: It is no longer Question Hour. It is 11:45 It is Zero Hour. And we are still on the first Question. What is happening, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : नहीं आया तो आप आगे उठा लेना ...*(व्यवधान)*... आपने यह मामला उठाया, जिस समय चर्चा होगी, उस समय उपस्थिति में हो जाएगा ...*(व्यवधान)*... नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन ...*(व्यवधान)*... नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन, डा० रामास्वामी ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री तरलोचन सिंह : सभापति जी ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : अब आप बैठ जाइए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री तरलोचन सिंह : एक मिनट सभापति जी । एक बड़ा इश्यू रह गया ...*(व्यवधान)*... वह है अमृतसर बस का ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : नेता ने जो सवाल पूछा, उसका जवाब दिया जाए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : इसलिए मैंने कहा कि इस पर चर्चा हो जाएगी ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री तरलोचन सिंह : माननीय सभापति जी ...*(व्यवधान)*... आज के अखबारों में छपा है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : आप बैठिए तो सही ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री राजू परमार : आपने कहा कि फुल फ्लेज डिस्कशन हो जाएगा ...*(व्यवधान)*... तब क्यों बार — बार उठा रहे हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट थोड़ी तसल्ली रखिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री राजू परमार : सभापति जी...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट रुकिए...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : सभापति जी, यह देश की एकता का मामला है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : बैठ जाइए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI MOTILAL VORA: Sir, you have given the ruling. Where is the question of ...*(Interruptions)*...The ruling of the Chair should be respected....*(Interruptions)*.. The Question Hour should not be disrupted like this...*(Intenvptions)*...

प्र० राम देव भंडारी : सभापति महोदय, आपने दूसरा सवाल भी call कर लिया है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI DEBABRATA BISWAS: Sir, it is a very serious issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

प्र० राम देव भंडारी : आपने दूसरा सवाल भी call कर लिया है...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : अभी तो अरुण जेटली जी खड़े ही नहीं हुए ...*(व्यवधान)*... हो गया क्वेश्चन ऑवर खत्म ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री मोती लाल वोरा : सभापति जी, एक बार आपने व्यवस्था दे दी और व्यवस्था देने के बाद भी उसी पर चर्चा हो रही है ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, they are violating the ruling of the Chair....(Interruptions)...They are playing to the gallery. ...(Interruptions)...They are disrupting the House... (Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति : बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान)... एक बार लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजीशन को बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... Please sit down .

श्री मोती लाल वोरा : आपने एक बार व्यवस्था दे दी है, उसके बाद किस बात पर चर्चा हो रही है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : जसवंत सिंह जी, बोलिए ।

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI JASWANT SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, ordinarily, after the Prime Minister has given voice to his views and expressed an opinion, we would have no interest whatsoever in creating further douse or any kind of questioning of what he has said. I fully believe, Sir, that the hon. Prime Minister and the hon. Minister of External Affairs are fully committed to the security of India. I don't think the starting point is that. What I have said is that if you have moved away from a visa and a passport system and have agreed to the alteration of the system, then, perhaps, it would do good, if you explain to us what advantage has accrued to India, what political and diplomatic gains have come. After that, the hon. Prime Minister said, "We will take all care of the security." There is no doubt about it. I don't, for a minute, doubt the intention, either of the Government or of the Prime Minister, but we do question the method that has been adopted. It is that method which has raised the kind of query and question that my good friend has also given voice to. ..(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: That we will discuss at the time of the full fledged discussion on this subject.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: The hon. Minister of External Affairs said that all that has happened is, this has been received with acclaim by the people of Jammu and Kashmir. I don't know if it has been received with acclaim by everybody in all parts of Jammu and Kashmir.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Not by you.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: After all, my friend, Dr. Farooq Abdullah is also a very distinguished representative of that State. We do support the accord; we have worked for that accord. The movement of the people of India and Pakistan must be facilitated, must be eased, but not at the cost of Indian nationalism...(Interruptions)...That is why I asked, Why have you done away with the visa and passport system?...(Interruptions)...What advantage has accrued to us?

श्री शाहिद सिद्दिकी : सर, हमें भी बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 222. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, इनको भी बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

Sir, I beg before you. Let us proceed with the Question Hour. ...(Interruptions)...The other Members should also be allowed to put supplementaries...(Interruptions)...As decided in the presence of the Leader of the Opposition, let...(Interruptions)...

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : इस पर गवर्नमेंट का रिस्पांस क्या है ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, in such a case, suspend Question Hour. ...(Interruptions) Sir, suspend Question Hour. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHAHID SIDDIQUI: Everyday this happens. (Interruptions) Might is right here. (Interruptions)

श्री सभापति : जवाब नहीं दे रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट, एक मिनट, मैं खड़ा हूँ, आप बैठ जाइए। यह किसका प्रश्न है और किसका प्रश्न नहीं है, मैं इस विवाद में नहीं पड़ना चाहता। इस संबंध में सरकार ने जो व्यवस्थाएँ की हैं, उन व्यवस्थाओं के ऊपर आपने कई प्रकार के प्रश्न खड़े किए हैं, कई प्रकार की भ्रांतियों का इन्होंने निराकरण करने की कोशिश की है ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठ जाइए ...(व्यवधान)... आपकी भावनाएँ मैं व्यक्त कर रहा हूँ ...(व्यवधान)... पहले मुझे सुन लीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... आप चेयर की अवहेलना कर रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)... आप चेयर की अवहेलना कर रहे हैं, बैठ जाइए, ...(व्यवधान)... मुझे सुन लीजिए। प्रधान मंत्री जी बोल लिए, विदेश मंत्री जी बोल लिए, लीडर ऑफ द ऑपोजिशन बोल लिए, कई एमपी बोल लिए ...(व्यवधान)... आप मेरी बात तो सुनिए ...(व्यवधान)... मैं आपको चांस दूंगा ...(व्यवधान)... मैं आपको चांस दूंगा, आप पहले बैठ जाइए

...(व्यवधान)... मैं इसलिए निवेदन कर रहा था कि सारे मामले पर चर्चा हो जाए। इस क्वेश्चन को मैं पोस्टपोन करता हूँ और इसके ऊपर चर्चा होगी ...(व्यवधान)... क्वेश्चन ऑवर खत्म हुआ ...(व्यवधान)... मेरी सुनिए, अगर इसके ऊपर चर्चा करना चाहें ...(व्यवधान)...

रेल मंत्री (श्री लालू प्रसाद) : महोदय, ये पाकिस्तान से संबंध खराब करना चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

प्रो० राम देव भंडारी : महोदय, ये नहीं चाहते कि पाकिस्तान और हिन्दुस्तान के संबंध सुधरें। ...(व्यवधान)... ये नहीं चाहते कि पाकिस्तान से हिन्दुस्तान के संबंध सुधरें।

श्री सभापति : सदन की कार्यवाही 12.30 बजे तक के लिए स्थगित की जाती है।

The House then adjourned at fifty-six minutes past eleven of the Clock.

The House reassembled at Thirty minutes past twelve of the clock.

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO STARRED QUESTIONS

New band of airwaves to operators

*222. DR. M.A.M. RAMASWAMY: Will the Minister of COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government propose to allocate a new band of airwaves (3 G applications) to operators;

(b) if so, the details thereof;