

(ii) A copy (in Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue and Insurance) Notification G.S.R. No. 330(E), dated the 25th July, 1974, publishing a corrigendum to Government Notification G.S.R. No. 326 (E) (Hindi version), dated the 22nd July, 1974. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-8086/74.]

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Concern over WHO Research Projects being carried out in India under conditions of total secrecy

SHRI N.G. GORAY (Maharashtra): Sir, I call the attention of the Minister of Health and Family Planning to the reported serious concern of the scientific community over the research projects being carried out by or under the auspices of the World Health Organisation in India under conditions of total secrecy and reaction of the Government thereto.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY PLANNING (SHRI A. K. KISKU): Sir, There has been no secrecy with regard to any of the research projects being carried out by the Government of India through any of its agencies in collaboration with WHO. All these research projects are of direct relevance and importance to the country and are in our national interest. These projects have been initiated on our request. In the formulation of these projects our experts have been involved from the very beginning, and the projects have been periodically reviewed by appropriate project committees including representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Planning and the Indian Council of Medical Research. The results of these researches have been published from time to time in appropriate scientific journals.

Two such projects relate to the genetic control of mosquitoes and the efficacy of insecticide application by ultra-low volume machine. These two projects are of special contemporary importance in the context of

two difficulties in our malaria eradication programme, viz. resistance of mosquitoes to insecticides and difficulty in getting adequate supplies. The results on genetic control are being published from time to time in scientific journals. A comprehensive coverage, including the latest results, is being brought out shortly by the Indian Society for Malaria and other Communicable Diseases in a special issue of their journal. The entire work on genetic and biological control has been carefully reviewed by a Task Force set up by the Government of India composed of representatives of the Ministries of Health and Agriculture. Their report was submitted to the Government of India in 1973, and I am placing a copy in the Library of Parliament.

This approach of genetic control is a well-established one. In fact spectacular success has been reported with this technique in the matter of eradication of screw-worm fly, a cattle pest in the Americas, and the fruit-fly in the Mediterranean areas and in Mexico. The use of genetic control against mosquitoes appears to be a promising one, but considerable research is necessary to establish its feasibility under natural conditions. Research on this aspect is going on in many countries.

The application of insecticide by ultra-low volume machines is in connection with the control of malaria in urban areas, for which purpose a portion of Jodhpur City was selected. Through this machine it is possible to apply insecticides in extremely minute droplets from outside the houses. Preliminary results from the reduction mosquito density indicate that this strategy seems to be effective. Further work is in progress. This has no connection with genetic control and is only an improved technique for the application of insecticides.

WHO was interested in the study on the role of birds disseminating insect-borne virus diseases. In India, the Bombay Natural History Society was actively conducting investigations on bird migrations and their possible role as disseminators of viruses. At the request of the Society, the WHO contributed a total amount of US £22,000

from 1959 to 1965. In this field of study a valuable contribution has also been made by Dr. G.I. Netzkay of the USSR who visited India in 1962. His investigations were carried out under the general guidance of the Institute of Poliomyelitis and Virus Encephalitis of the Academy of Medical Sciences (Moscow) with the participation of the Biological Institute of Siberian Department of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR (Novosibirak) and in co-operation with the Bombay Natural History Society. It is, therefore, clear that the press reports are tendentious, unfair and misleading.

SHRI N.G. GORAY: Only last week when we were discussing the smallpox epidemic in Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and Assam the Minister of Health was frank enough to admit that India was receiving substantial assistance and help from WHO. Now right on the heels of that admission we are confronted with this long report emanating from such a well-known news agency as PTI. I was told that this particular report was submitted by one of their correspondents who is a very knowledgeable person, himself perhaps a Ph.D or a very high Degree-holder in the discipline of sciences. Therefore naturally when his report was flashed everywhere all of us felt perturbed because you will admit that in this report many facts have been put together and the whole report is presented in such a manner that if it is true then it really means that WHO is trying to do something very sinister in India taking advantage of our carelessness or perhaps our complacent attitude. If, however, this is not true as the Minister has just now said, very frankly it really amounts to a clear case of black mail. I would like him to tell us something more about the various charges that have been levelled at the Government officers, our own people, who are working in WHO, who are working in such prestigious institutions like the ICMR etc. The charges are very clear and unambiguous. The reporter has mentioned the names of Dr. Rajendra Pal, Dr. C. Gopalan and Dr. A.D. Mani, and by implication has accused them of keeping silent over the whole matter discouraging press reporters from getting at the truth. Now, Sir, if you go through the

whole report you will find that very serious charges have been levelled. One is that the whole thing is shrouded in mystery. It is kept secret. The whole investigation and research is going on in secrecy, in spite of the fact that our Health Ministry is associated with it. The Government Officers are not ready to give any information on the various points that have been raised by the reporter himself. Now, Sir, he says that this research is financed entirely from American funds, perhaps from PL 480 funds and the results of these research activities are communicated directly to MAPS which is nothing but a branch of the Pentagon. It is they who are using all the results of this research. He has also hinted that they are primarily concerned with viruses carried by birds from one country to another and very cleverly he has introduced the name of Dr. G.I. Netzkay. He says that he has confirmed the arrival of birds carrying viruses into India and the migrant birds spread complex viruses throughout India. I do not know how far he has quoted Dr. Netzkay correctly. Just now I heard the Minister saying that this particular scientist belongs to one of the Russian institutes situated in Siberia. So far as the migration of birds is concerned, this fact was known to us for centuries. I do not know whether he is well versed in Sanskrit. If Dr. Karan Singh had been here perhaps it would have been better. I would refer him to Kalidasa's Meghdoot in which the poet refers to "Krounch Randhra", that part of the Himalayas through which birds migrated outside and migrated into India from outside. I do not know whether Dr. Netzkay was conscious of the fact that bird migration has been taking place for centuries and if at all they are carrying viruses the probability is that they carry viruses from Siberia into India, not from any other country. So, I do not know how he was interested in saying that these birds were carrying viruses. Further, he has said that these migrant birds spread complex viruses throughout India. Even admitting this fact, I fail to link this particular fact with the research that is being carried on by WHO, ICMR, the Natural History Society in Bombay and the mosquito elimination research

[Shri N. G. Goray]

centre in Jodhpur. I would like to know from him whether some sinister thing is happening, as has been hinted at by this particular reporter. The sinister thing is that India, in collaboration with America—perhaps you know what they are doing—is helping America in using migratory birds to carry viruses from one country to another. In this report Vietnam has been mentioned. He has stated that viruses which would help in the process of defoliation have been discovered and they were used in Vietnam. Now, I do not know whether these viruses were discovered in India, but the whole report is prepared in such a manner that all sorts of suspicions can be created in the minds of other countries so far as India's research is concerned. I feel that this particular report should receive the attention of the Government. Only recently we had the explosion of a nuclear device in Rajasthan and all sorts of mis-statements were made and misunderstandings were created even to the extent that one of our best friends, Canada, was alienated. They misunderstood our purpose and they thought that India was on its way to nuclear weaponry. This is how the whole thing is linked up with our defence and they are thinking that India is secretly planning something which they do not know. Read in this particular context, it means that India is trying to evolve virus weaponry also which it can use, germ warfare or something like that. I want the Government to be very categorical—why is it that, in spite of the fact that this Report appeared yesterday and it was flashed throughout India, the Government did not think it fit to come out with a statement on their own saying that these are not facts, that this is not being conducted in secrecy, that there is no desire to hide anything from the people and that everything is done in an open manner and that those who want to know what the researches are about, it is possible for them to get at the truth. Therefore, I thought that this was very necessary and I wish that the Government took the earliest opportunity to go through this report and made a statement which would allay all doubts not only in India but in other countries also where per-

haps people are likely to take this report as the truth and are likely to misunderstand our position.

SHRI A.K. KISKU : Sir, we have gone through all the material that came out in the newspaper and I am glad that a Calling Attention Motion has been brought up on this because it gives us a chance immediately to come out with the truth and with all the information that we have at our disposal. Sir, we have all the respect for the scientific correspondent of the PTI, and I am not going to question his integrity or his motives. But the manner in which this news has come out in the newspaper is, of course, likely to create an atmosphere of suspicion in the whole country. The point that I am making is that there is absolutely no secrecy about any of the research projects that are being undertaken or about their findings. May I say that the research projects that are undertaken on various matters of health or health hazard in our country or in other countries of the world, as far as we are concerned, these are undertaken in collaboration with WHO, and we go with full confidence in WHO because WHO is an international organisation, a United Nations agency. It has about 143 member-states, member-nations, as well as associate members. Sir, we know that WHO is the sacred trust of the health of the nations throughout the world and on matters of general interest, researches are being undertaken by WHO. They pool the knowledge of the consultants throughout the world, and they are placed at the disposal of countries for the various researches that are undertaken. And it is in this context that this research was taken up some time back about this bird migration and the viruses that are carried by the migrating birds, as also the present research about anti-malarial programme. Sir, as I said, it is unfortunate that somehow an atmosphere has been created that there is some hush-hush about it.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : Yes, there is.

SHRI A.K. KISKU : We checked as to whether there was any omission on our part in giving information to this gentleman.

Sir, this correspondent did come to our Secretary and to the Director General of the I. C. M. R. At the moment, as you know and as all the hon'ble Members know we are overwhelmed about the small-pox, how it has exploded, and we are trying to tackle it. The W. H. O. Epidemiologists are also helping us to control this problem of small-pox. Therefore, Secretary had asked him to wait for a few days when he would be able to organise a conference with our officers or any responsible agency that he would like to meet. But somehow it seems that this man was rather impatient.

Sir, the Director General of the I. C. M. R. is an absolutely new man. He has just taken over. He is actually not responsible for any of these projects. He also wanted that it should be done in a manner where there can be a foolproof discussion of the whole thing. But somehow it seems that there was some impatience on the part of this man and he has come up with all this thing. I may again emphasise that there is no hush, no secrecy, about any of the research projects whatsoever.

Sir, some mention has been made about Mr. Rajendra Pal. He is an officer in charge of this research project. He also did not say anything because he is a W. H. O. personnel and the system within the W. H. O. is that no individual comes out with any hand out. If anything has to be given out by the W. H. O. it is given out by the Public Relations Officer. So Mr. Rajendra Pal did not want to say anything on his own as an individual.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): On a point of order. Is the Minister trying to explain the statement made by an individual who is not even working for the Government of India? What is it that he is trying to defend? How can you do that? How can you defend somebody who does not belong to the Government of India on the basis of what appeared in the newspapers?

SHRI RAJNARAIN (Uttar Pradesh): There is no government. It is like a joint

stock company with some shareholders. Why do you say that this is a government?

SHRI A. K. KISKU: I am only stating some facts about research projects that are being undertaken by the Government of India in collaboration with the W. H. O. and in what manner this whole thing has come out. That is all I am saying.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: The Director General cannot explain the position of somebody else.

SHRI A. K. KISKU: Certain details have come out in the newspapers and I am taking some of my time to give some clarification on one or two points. First of all, it was pointed out that some virus may have been spread by the migrating birds. In 1957, in Karnataka in South India the Kysanaur forest disease did mysteriously come out and the Virus Research Centre, Poona, which is our own institution, had made a very detailed investigation and in depth. They have come out with one or two very specific points. Firstly, this Kysanaur forest disease that had broken out, the virus that had been found, was of indigenous origin. Dr. J. Bosehell, an Epidemiologist of the Forest Research Institute from 1961-65 in this paper entitled "Kysanaur Forest Disease Ecologic Considerations" has ruled out introduction of virus by any extraneous source like migrant birds.

The point I am making is, it is true that sometimes birds do carry certain kinds of viruses, but in this specific case, it was of indigenous origin.

Sir, some reference has been made to some vaccine as if it is manufactured in America and it is coming to India. The truth is that this vaccine was actually developed in the Virus Research Centre at Poona and is manufactured at the Haffkine's Institute, Bombay. It is our product.

SHRI N. G. GORAY: Perhaps the reporter thinks that Poona is in America?

SHRI A. K. KISKU: Sir, about the project of Genetic control of mosquitoes, that is now going on, the laboratory part of it is almost over and we are going into

[Shri A. K. Kisku]

the operational part of it. This is with regard to Malaria control. Sir, a new technique has been evolved in which these insects which spread the diseases are sterilised by some chemical process and, as I have said in my main statement, it has already achieved some very spectacular results in America, in Mediterranean countries and in Mexico, specially for protection of cattle as well as for protection of fruit, where this technique was applied to control flies genetically. Now this genetic control of mosquito is being tried out. It is now being tried in some places in Delhi and in Jodhpur and it will be tried in other parts of the country.

Sir, about financing the project from America, from the American Army Agency etc., we have no such information. But may I make it very clear that the WHO receives its funds from various countries, from various governments, from various agencies, and we also contribute? For any project whatsoever, we receive our grants from the WHO. We have no information whatsoever whether some American Army Agency is financing any project with any motive, and we cannot say anything on this. But as I said, the Ministry of Health, the Government of India, the ICMR and the WHO are mainly concerned with the problems of health or the problems of health hazard. May I say in this connection that all research projects that are undertaken in our country are vetted by the ICMR: whether it is from USAID or from PL-480 or from whatever source it might be, all projects are vetted by the ICMR. Our Minister, Dr. Karan Singh, is the Chairman of the ICMR, and most eminent scientists and health experts are its members.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH (West Bengal) : What of that ?

SHRI A. K. KISKU : What I am saying is that all projects are being carefully screened and processed and undertaken under all kinds of precautions conditions. Sir, may I say finally that the findings of research are the property of science and as such the property of any country whatsoever. Whatever we publish, whatever we find from our researches is also available for any country

whatsoever, as in the case of nuclear weapons. We have done it with our own scientists and our own technology. And our research findings on matters of health also are published. There is no secrecy. It is available for anybody, any scientist or any country whatsoever. But it is very unfortunate that the manner in which this news item has come out, it has in an indirect manner created or cast some kind of an unfortunate impression in the minds of our countrymen, especially about our scientists. But I may say that we have not received any kind of letters conveying any kind of anxiety over these experiments up-to-date, from any of our scientists, and therefore, I can say there is no secrecy whatsoever about all the research that are being done in these matters of health, especially now in the matter of malaria.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We have taken exactly half an hour to dispose of one Member. And I have eight names on the list

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : Not we; he has taken the time in replying.

Sir, I regret to say that the Minister has made a tendentious, wrong and misleading statement perhaps under compulsion. And I also regret to say that the Minister's reply has not covered all the points raised here. I have got all these newspapers, today's, yesterday's. The Minister's statement has not covered all the points. Why? I do not know. When he made the statement, he should have covered all the points.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you wanted more points to be covered I think we will have to have a whole day.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : He has not covered all the points raised originally. And I also feel that since this is extremely serious, the Foreign Minister and the Home Minister should have been present here.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now come to your clarification.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : ... because I charge the Government with collusion knowingly with the US Intelligence Agency. I make

this charge with full responsibility, that this is the thing that is happening. Even on a question of tie-up of Indian intelligence with foreign agencies they are debarred from the informal Consultative Committee which they have no right to do. So it reveals the true picture. He has pleaded for Rajendra Pal. He has said that it would be sensitive to the Indian press. But he has not answered the point there. Is that statement correct or not? But when he came to his own officers, he said he knew it. Then why did that officer ask the press to be sympathetic to it? He should have said, I do not know anything, I have just taken over; you go to that person or some other person. Then there is the point that closed-door meetings are held from which Indian scientists are barred. They have complained of it. These things are there. And there is the question of DNA being experimented upon and being followed up particularly in the lower strata of animals which can spread and cause havoc of which the human beings are not aware, that they might be affected. You are doing it in Delhi, not in a malaria affected area. That also you did not explain. And everybody in the world knows and it is in the press reports that secret reports are being sent to MAPS, that is, Pentagon. What are those reports? Do you know? Are they entitled to send any such reports? What are those reports? Do you deny them? What is their connection? What is the Hopkins Institute doing in Calcutta? They are all founded with the CIA money funnelled through Ford Foundation and all such institutions. Everybody knows it; everybody is aware of it

Sir, the details are not known even to the Indian Scientists working in GCMU to control *aedes aegypti* a mosquito type that spreads Yellow fever which is non-existent in India. The Minister did not care to answer it. In their Bombay office MAPS agency is also there. And it is an agent of the Pentagon. They are in the same building. It is known that India is being made a guinea pig in order to develop bacteriological, germicidal warfare. This is what it is about. I do not want to go into details. You take down all the points that have appeared in the various newspaper

and reply to all those points one by one. I challenge the Government. Are they prepared to form a Parliamentary Committee composed of representatives of different parties so that they can go into all the details and place the truth before the country? Nobody will believe this Government because you are tied up with USA in many ways. PL 480 funds are used for this purpose. What are the conditions for it? It is used to conduct these secret experiments. You are closely tied up with them. You are fully and wholly connected with them. ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please wind up. There are eight names in the list. The Minister is taking quite some time to answer. This way, it will take the whole day.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH: The point is that the spraying has been stopped because it would not only kill anopheles, but also *aedes aegypti* which has been reserved for the WHO's multi-million rupee experiment. This project has been cleared by the Health Ministry without serious debate simply because WHO usually provides jobs to Indian officials after they retire from service. They are given jobs carrying a pay of Rs. 15,000 per month tax free. Why should they reveal? That is the whole thing. This is intelligence work and Indian Government is involved in it and they have deliberately allowed it. Who are you? The Home Ministry and External Affairs Ministry are more connected with it than the Health Ministry. I charge those Ministries and this Government seriously for deliberately involving themselves in it.

SHRI A.K. KISKU: I strongly repudiate all the charges that have been made by my hon friend Shri Niren Ghosh. As I said, we have checked up the conversation that was done with our officers and the correspondent. All our officers both in the Ministry as well as in the I.C.M.R. have denied the statement that appeared in the newspapers.....

SHRI K.P. SINGH DEO: Were they tape-recorded?

SHRI A.K. KISKU: I think we must have confidence in our scientists and officers who

[Shri A. K. Kisku] are conducting some very important scientific experiments and holding responsible positions. I may repeat that we have no information on the whereabouts about this MAPS.

What I say is that we have no information whatsoever about this agency and we have no connection with any such agencies. They might be existing as a kind of secret service or so. But we have no connection whatsoever with any such organisation because the Ministry of Health functions and all its research projects are undertaken strictly on the basis of public health. Then, Sir...

SHRI NIREN GHOSH: How is it that the BNHS is there in that building?

SHRI A.K. KISKU: Sir, about the GCMU..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In the same building different offices can be located.

SHRI A.K. KISKU: Sir, about the GCMU, there are about 4,000 different species of mosquitoes and as far as the very important diseases caused by mosquitoes are concerned, they are mainly malaria, filariasis, dengue, Chikanyunya etc. Sir, a reference has been made to *aedes aegypti* which is reported to carry germs which cause the yellow fever. Many important researches have already been done in different countries on this and for scientific purposes, it is necessary that all those findings are also consulted. But, as far as our country is concerned, our main study is on anopheles and culex and in order that the research might be complete and beneficial for our purposes, the findings of the study on *aedes aegypti* are to be taken into consideration.

A reference has also been made to some wells and ponds being contaminated by the insecticides. The point is that in this technique, when the mosquitoes are sterilised chemically, they are put into the wells, unused wells of course, I must say, where they breed easily and this itself is an experimental condition to many ways. Therefore I may say that no insecticide has ever been thrown into the wells or ponds in any form or in any manner whatsoever. But these mosquitoes which have been sterilized have been studied very thorough

by the WHO in 1972 to find out whether they carry any substantial amount of insecticide or toxin which may be harmful and it has been found that it is absolutely hazard-free.

Sir, I may point out that the research papers are published papers which are here. We have only limited number of copies. Otherwise, we would have placed them on the Table of the House. But we are keeping them open for anybody to come and go through and study them in any manner he may like. Sir, these literatures are open literatures and they are scientific literatures and they are there. It is our endeavour to use and encourage the use of the contents of such researches for peaceful purposes. We have produced the nuclear bomb which is for peaceful purposes only. There has been a demand to appoint a Parliamentary Committee to investigate matters. Sir, I do not think that there is any necessity for appointing a Parliamentary Committee for looking into all these things. These are all scientific findings and these are open.....

SHRI NIREN GHOSH: Thereby you have proved my charge to the hilt. You are afraid of saying that. But you have proved my charge to the hilt.

SHRI A. K. KISKU:....and anybody can study them in his own way.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Yes, Mr. Singh Deo

SHRI K.P. SINGH DEO (Orissa): Sir, the honourable Minister has, in his statement, referred to the experiments of the WHO which has been employing sophisticated technology and ultra-low volume scientific techniques for carrying on investigation into the genetic control of mosquitoes, bird migration and ecological, behavioural and dispersal data collection.

He also mentioned about the Bombay Natural History Society which is also conducting a study on migratory birds. But I think he has conveniently left out or forgotten to mention that this Bombay Natural History Society study on bird migration has been

sponsored by the Migratory Animals Pathological Society which is in other words Pathological Warfare Section of the US Army. Of course, he denied knowledge of the existence of any such body. I do not blame him for that because I cannot consider him an expert on all sides. He also said that the whole experiment is being monitored by the Indian Council of Medical Research, the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Agriculture. In view of the fact that all the fifteen nations in the world—the Soviet Union, the UK, Canada, Communist China or Nationalist China, France, Germany, West Germany, Sweden, Poland, Spain, Israel, Egypt, Cuba, South Africa and USA—have publicly revealed that they have been conducting research on CBW—Chemical and Biological Warfare—and since 1946 the USA has been the leader in this field and they have not hesitated to utilise this research development—and they applied the CBW—in various parts, in Vietnam and other parts, and Egyptians have used it in Yemen in 1962 and we do not know where else it has been utilised—I would like to know this point. The Minister very philosophically said that the results of these studies belong to science as a whole. At the moment the NATO countries have been carrying on studies on the biological capabilities through their missiles and also on the vulnerability of Soviet mechanised equipment—chemical and biological weapons system. I say this with particular reference because our armed forces are very much dependent on the Soviet mechanised equipment. So when he says that the results of this research belong to science, I only want to know whether this will be applied against our own armed forces. Then I would like to know another point about the GCMU—Genetic Control of Mosquito Units—which is carrying on studies on yellow fever—its biological name is *Aedes Aegypti*. Foreigners are rather puzzled that the virus in this is not a carrier of this particular disease whereas ideal conditions are existing in India for the proliferation of yellow fever. So these studies might give other countries a solution by which they can introduce certain virus to eliminate the protective virus which has been preventing

yellow fever from spreading in India. So now that the Minister is aware of all these things because honourable Members have brought to his notice the existence of MAPS—Migratory Animals Pathological Society which is associated with the US Army—and allegations have been made, charges have been made in this House. I would like to know from the Minister whether he will take pains to have them inquired into and whether he will also associate the Ministry of Defence and the Department of Atomic Energy in monitoring these experiments because in the Jodhpur unit of the GCMU research is being conducted very near to our Pokhran where the nuclear device was exploded. I would also like to know whether there are any other organisations or any other countries which have been given the same facilities or similar facilities for conducting research in this country and where they are located and whether the Minister will kindly lay on the Table of the House the reports of all these studies and researches, especially the report on the global impact of applied microbiology.

SHRI. A.K. KISKU. Sir, the hon. Member has asked a very specific question about the Bombay Natural History Society which, he claims, was sponsored by the Migratory Animal Pathological Service. Sir, the WHO was interested in the study of the role of birds disseminating insect-borne virus diseases. In India, the Bombay Natural History Society (BNHS) was actively conducting investigations on bird migration and on the role of migrating birds as disseminators of insect-borne viruses. At the request of the BNHS, the WHO contributed to BNHS a total amount of 22,000 dollars from 1959 to 1965. The WHO's contribution to the study was terminated in 1965. In this field, there is also contribution from Dr. G.I. Metzkay of the USSR who visited India in 1962. His investigations were carried out under the general guidance of the Institute of Poliomyelitis and Virus Encephalitis of the Academy of Medical Sciences (Moscow) with the participation of the Biological Institute of Siberian Department of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR and in co-operation with the Bombay Natural History Society. The principal in-

[Shri A. K. Kisku]

vestigation of this study was also along the same direction of the WHO and BNHS research, that is, in the field of migrant birds that can have influence on the spread of insect-borne viruses. Sir, as I said earlier, the Ministry of Health cannot give information on any research that may be going on in some parts of the country elsewhere about chemical or biological warfare materials. But as I said earlier, this research is open research, absolutely scientific, mainly for the purpose of eradication of malaria, filaria and other similar diseases. And the reference of *aedes aegypti* has come only because there has been a lot of study already done and that we could gain experience from that in our study on the control of malaria for the genetic control of anophles and culex. Sir, beyond this, I have nothing more to say.

SHRI K.P. SINGH DEO: Sir, my question has not been answered....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has nothing beyond that to say.

SHRI K.P. SINGH DEO: Sir, I put a categorical question. Now that it has been charged by the hon. Members that this Organisation is a part of the U.S. Army, will they now associate the Ministry of Defence and the Department of Atomic Energy in monitoring such projects?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He cannot take a decision on that. Yes, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta.

SHRI. BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, we are glad we have been treated to a bit of lecture on research. And anyhow, the hon. Minister is not competent to speak on scientific matters except that he can read the brief fairly well, it seems.

Now, Sir, the point is this. Again and again he has said that he has no knowledge of the fact that the Migratory Animal Pathological Service is a wing of the American Army, a wing of the Pentagon there. Sir, is it a plea of ignorance or something else? I should like to know. Sir, two to three months ago in the journal of our Party, the New Age, we published a report on the Pentagon study

on biological warfare. One point in that report referred to the blood groupings in South India, hinting thereby that certain viruses and germs would affect that group of people. And that article brought out such a mysterious thing that was going on, which has connection with the kind of a plan for biological warfare.

Even after that, do I understand that the Government inquiries so as to find out what the situation was? It is not that nothing was known to the Government. Now they do not believe the P.T.I. But, the same Government relied heavily on information and news supplied by the P.T.I. I believe, nearly half a crore of rupees is spent annually on this organisation, if not more. Suddenly, the P.T.I. has become an untouchable institution for them. I cannot understand this double standard.

Sir, the hon. Minister should explain one or two things. I would not go into the research part of it. I leave out his research part of it. Everybody knows that American money, American penetration and American interference are going on under the cover of research not only in our country but in various other countries and certain officials of the Government take advantage of this thing because apart from other considerations they bring material benefit to themselves. I should like to know whether it is true that Dr. Paul, who was Assistant Director of the National Institute of Communicable Diseases, at the time he left, had been holding lien on the N.I.C.D. job for more than ten years. Is it not a fact that this prolonged lien is extraordinary considering the fact that no Government servant is permitted to hold lien on his job for more than three years? That is my first question kindly answer that

Now, I want to know whether it is true that W. H. O. is providing jobs to top Health Ministry officials just before their retirement for after their retirement. I want a specific answer to this question and the names of such officials.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH: I also asked this information.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Now, tell me if it is true that Dr. P. Diesh, for whom the Ministry created a special post of Commissioner of Rural Health, quit his job two months ago to take up a job with the Regional Office of the W. H. O. in New Delhi. If you take a job with the W. H. O., the payment is very high. How many Health officials were given jobs by W. H. O. just before and after the Genetic Mosquito Unit came to be established? Some of these people, according to our information, are: Dr. H. P. Ramakrishna, ex-Director of the National Institute of Communicable Diseases, Shri Krishnaswamy, ex-Deputy Director of the N.I.C.D., Shri Sen Gupta of the Family Planning Department and Mr. Bawa, Deputy Secretary of the Health Ministry at the time of the agreement on genetic control. Now, are these facts correct or not? I am not asking you to give any research lecture here. How many top officials of the Health Ministry have received hospitality of W.H.O. to visit Geneva during the last five years and how many times each officials has made a trip? Is it not a fact that W.H.O. is paying Rs. 105 a day to senior Health Ministry officials as a part of the anti-small pox campaign in Bihar? Who are the people getting the W. H. O. money? Now, Sir, these are the facts which show how things are happening.

Now, here most of them are colluding in the name of research. Maybe, some research is going on. Maybe, something useful is going to come out. I cannot say. But, this data is being used for certain other preparations—maybe against our country or, maybe, some other countries. But, one aspect is very unsavoury. The officials of the Health Ministry are in direct league with them. They benefit while they are there. They benefit before their retirement and they benefit even after their retirement when they take up jobs with them and in some cases the salary is Rs. 15,000 per month. This is happening. Divulge it. Tell the whole story.

Sir, with regard to secrecy, what is the secrecy about it? Is it a defence research project and you are manufacturing some sophisticated weapons that it could not be divulged?

1 P.M.

Why should it be kept secret from the scientist of our country and not allowed to be known to them? What is the hush about it? This is an open research for the well-being of the people. Why should this be kept in so much secrecy?

Now, as you have said, I do not wish to ask many more questions here. Many questions have been asked by other hon. Members and I think more questions will follow. I demand, before I sit down, the Minister's answer has not been at all satisfactory and cannot possibly be satisfactory. The Ministry is guilty of the collusion on this kind of deals with the W. H. O. and I put it to them. They know it very well. Their officers know it very well as to what this MAPS is. They know it very well. Either they have not communicated their knowledge to the Minister or they have not shared it with the Minister or the Minister does not have the memory in order to reply when to answer questions in this House. This is an attempt, to take advantage of the situation that we are very good people, to suppress the truth. That is point number one. The other facts have been brought to light through newspapers including the PTI on whom you rely so much. We do not rely on PTI so much but you rely on PTI and the things are now going against you, you are disowning PTI, that is your own affair but in view of the material that has been published in the Press not today but for some time past, in view of the complaints which have been made by the scientists of the country and the popular feelings of the country, nothing short of a proper inquiry constituted of a Committee including Members of Parliament, scientist and others will satisfy the House. Therefore, Sir, I would like through you to impress upon the Government, the matter should not be allowed to rest at this point. Issues have come up and the ministerial answer can never remove the suspicions, apprehensions in the minds of the public over a matter of this kind when we see clearly glaring interference by a military outfit of the U. S. Government. Nothing short, therefore, of a public enquiry, competent enquiry by the scientist and others including

[Shri Bhupesh Gupta]

some Members of Parliament would satisfy the public. I would, therefore, demand such an inquiry be immediately instituted in the public interest and in the interest of national security of the country.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : Sir, certainly in front of a magnificent speaker like Mr. Bhupesh Gupta I will never indulge in giving a lecture. I was only trying to clarify certain matters that have come out of this Calling Attention. About MAPS I may repeat I have no information whatsoever from my ministry. If you want to get this information, kindly put this question to the Ministry of Defence.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : On a point of information. Why should I ask it from the Defence Ministry? Why should you not ask? You are running an institution and it is publicly stated that intelligence penetration is taking place, why should you not ask?

SHRI N. R. CHOUDHURY (Assam) : What is the harm if he asked it?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Harm or no harm, that is a different matter. What is the harm if you come on this side and enjoy here? That is not the point at all. They should ask . . .

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now let him answer.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : Mr. Bhupesh Gupta has asked some very specific questions about some specific persons and so on and so forth. I am not in a position to give detailed answers now, but I can assure the House that I will supply all the necessary information . . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : On a point of order. Kindly sit down, it is a serious point of order. I have brought in certain specific, you may call them, allegations but what I believe them to be truth. He can give the information now or if he does not have the information, like any other hon. Minister who believes in honour and public standard, he should take your permission so that he can lay the relevant information on the Table of the House at some later date

with regard to the specific issues I have raised and the questions I have asked.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is what he is saying.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : That is exactly what I was going to say. I would say that we must honour the House, the Members of the House and every individual Member of the House. Whatever questions are asked in this House by any Member, we are prepared to supply all the information but as I said, I cannot give it off-hand. I will surely collect the information and lay it on the Table of the House.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : You have come to answer the Calling Attention and you are not prepared.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is going to supply the information. That ends the matter.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : But it is very unfortunate that some names have been mentioned without specific allegations. May I say also that the W. H. O. recruit consultants and experts from all over the country and it is a matter of pride that many of our scientists and experts are being recruited and employed by the W. H. O. in different parts of the country and of the world.

AN HON. MEMBER : But your own officers only are being recruited.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : Our consultants are going to other parts of the country as well. The point I am making is, it is unfortunate that without any specific allegation, if we cast . . .

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : What specific allegation you want? (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Niren Ghosh, let him answer.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : We have made specific allegations, giving names and designations of the officers of your Ministry who are recruited and the officers that are recruited are only of your Ministry and not from the Universities or other academic bodies.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : I would like to categorically say that there is no secrecy whatsoever about the research projects that we undertake and about their findings.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : You did not reply when I asked the question and now he also asked you. What is your answer?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I call Mr. Rabi Ray now.

श्री रबी राय (उड़ीसा) : उप-सभापति महोदय, मैं मंत्री महोदय से कहना चाहता हूँ कि जो सदस्यों के मन में सन्देह उत्पन्न हुआ है, वह पी० टी० आई० की खबर से पैदा हुई है। इस सन्देह के पैदा होने के दो कारण हैं। एक कारण तो यह है कि यू० एस० डिफेंस डिपार्टमेंट जो है उसने जर्म वारफियर वियटनाम में शुरू किया था और वह इस बारे में लैटिन अमेरिका में भी रिसर्च कर रहा है जिसपर वह 1.6 मिलियन डालर खर्च कर चुका है। अब सवाल यह है कि हेल्थ मिनिस्ट्री का जो डिपार्टमेंट है आई० सी० एम० आर०, उसके डा० गोपालन डाइरेक्टर जनरल हैं। उन्होंने पी० टी० आई० के साइन्स के सम्बाददाता को जो भेंट दी और उससे जो बातचीत हुई, उसके बाद ही यह सारी की सारी बात उत्पन्न हुई। डा० गोपालन ने यह कहा कि मैं इस सम्बन्ध में कोई बातचीत करना नहीं चाहता हूँ क्योंकि इट विल इम्बैरेस डब्लू० एच० ओ०। इस तरह का उनका अपना बयान है। तो मैं मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस तरह का बयान डा० गोपालन ने क्यों निकाला और उन्होंने यह बात क्यों कही कि इट विल इम्बैरेस डब्लू० एच० ओ०? मंत्री जी इस बात

पर जिद्द कर रहे हैं कि यू० एस० ए० के साथ हमारा कोई ताल्लुक नहीं है, हमारा तो ताल्लुक डब्लू० एच० ओ० से ही है। मैं मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि जान हौपकिन्स इंस्टीट्यूट, जो बान्टीमूर में है और नारंगवाल जो पंजाब में एक जगह है, जहां पर रिसर्च हो रहा है, वह जान हौपकिन्स इंस्टीट्यूट के मातहत ही हो रहा है। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि नारंगवाल में इस सम्बन्ध में जो रिसर्च किया जा रहा था, क्या वह बन्द कर दिया गया है क्योंकि हमारी जानकारी तो यह है कि वह बन्द कर दिया गया है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जान हौपकिन्स इंस्टीट्यूट द्वारा वहां पर जो खोज की जा रही थी, वह क्यों बन्द कर दी गई। इससे यह साबित होता है कि वह इसलिए बन्द कर दी गई कि वहां पर इंटेलिजेन्स का काम कर रहे थे। इससे यह साबित हो जाता है कि नारंगवाल गांव में जो रिसर्च का काम किया जा रहा था वह डब्लू० एच० ओ० द्वारा नहीं किया जा रहा था बल्कि अमेरिका की इंटेलिजेन्स एजेंसी द्वारा किया जा रहा था, जो कि अब बन्द कर दिया गया है। मंत्री जी का यह कहना कि यह डब्लू० एच० ओ० द्वारा किया जा रहा था, सत्य नहीं है। मैं मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि अगर डब्लू० एच० ओ० की ओर से यह रिसर्च का कार्य चल रहा था, तो फिर नारंगवाल में इस रिसर्च के कार्य को क्यों बन्द कर दिया गया?

SHRI A. K. KISKU : Sir, the Indian Council of Medical Research recommended on

[Shri A. K. Kisku]

4-2-1970 research scheme entitled "Rural Health Services and Family Planning Utilisation" with an estimated cost of Rs. 28.74 lakhs as an extension of the previous project for a further period of five years. The basic goal of the project was to determine the effect of health services on family planning practices. An agreement was executed on 10-9-1970 between Government of India and John Hopkins University for assistance in the research project for a period of five years. The project was reviewed by an Advisory Committee under the Chairmanship of Director General of Health Services from time to time. The Government of India decided to terminate the above research project with effect from 1st January, 1972. PL 480 grant for the project was stopped. It was taken over by the Indian Council of Medical Research and expenditure met from its own regular budget.

The other points I have already replied.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, I will not take more time than Mr. Bhupesh Gupta and I hope you will equally liberal with me.

Firstly I would like to congratulate the science correspondent of the PTI for doing a first class investigative report of the type we very rarely have in this country. I only hope that the Government will not bring the entire steam roller on him, pursue him, persecute him and victimise him, but instead give him an award for doing a good straight job on a very difficult subject.

I would also like to draw the attention of House to the fact that last session I had raised the question of the MAPS. At that time the Minister was different; it was the Home Minister. At that time I had said that a contract has been signed between the United States army and the Bombay Natural History Society. For the record I would like to state the contract number. I would like the Minister to either check up with the Home Ministry or look into his own records to see if this is not correct and inform the House of the exact position. The contract number is DA-CRD-AFP-392-544-69-GI-37 signed between the United States army

which gives its address as APO which means Army Post Office, San Francisco. and Bombay Natural History Society. It names Dr. Salim Ali to be the principal investigator of this project. The project is entitled Migratory Animal Pathological Service which is abbreviated to MAPS. There are two conditions associated with it. The first is that whatever research is carried out two advance copies of the research would be first supplied to the United States army and only if the United States army agrees to its publication will publication be allowed. The second is that a radar station would be set up to be manned by the US army personnel in the NEFA area to track the birds going into China and back. Now, Mr. Zafar Fatehally, who is the President of the Bombay Natural History Society came out with a statement which the Minister may not have seen. In it he does not deny what I have said. He specifically refers to my charge; he does not deny it but he justifies it by saying that the Russians are also involved in this project. I never doubted that; I only brought out that an agreement has been signed between the U. S. army and the Bombay Natural History Society to which the Government is implicitly or explicitly a party. As far as the Soviet Union goes it is very difficult for me to get such information because of the way the Soviet Union is organised and the most unco-operative behaviour of people like Mr. Bhupesh Gupta who might otherwise be in a position to help me. We have to see the implications of this. It is tracking the birds flying into China and back in a sensitive terrain where you have the CIA and KGB agents crawling all over the place. We know that the Khampas go periodically into China and come back with documents. We know that the members of the Bombay Natural History Society and U. S. army personnel went into Bhutan and Sikkim as part of this project, not for sightseeing but for the purposes of this project. I would like to ask the Minister a question in this regard. Is it not a fact that a vast volume of secret documents relating to Chinese movement, organisation and so on was smuggled out of this country and taken to the United States CIA Headquarters in Washington and subsequently after some time it was

declassified and published by the Stanford University. The book is called 'The Politics of the Red Army'. It is all obtained from the Khampas by the CIA agents. Now bird watching is not as simple as the Haryana Government makes it out. There is a lot more in bird watching than just bird watching.

In particular it is a vehicle for virus warfare. This is another very serious implication and I want to know whether he has thought about it. Suddenly the WHO intervenes and expresses medical interest in bird watching. The mosquito unit, GCMU, says that they are interested in the same problem of mosquito migration and consequently they would also like to be a part of this project. They would like the reports to be submitted to them along with the U. S. Army. Of course, the Government of India is nowhere in the picture except that they attend the cocktail parties given by the WHO. Dr. Rajendra Pal has been quoted—there is no contradiction—as saying that he wants to keep the activities secret. The Minister says that it is not a secret, but an official of WHO says that he wants to keep the activities secret because the activities are sensitive to the Indian Press. I do not know what it means because the Indian Press would raise a hullabaloo and the Minister would have to sweat it out in Parliament. Consequently, not concerned with the Indian Government, WHO has decided not to make it public, but to keep it a secret. Another thing I want to ask the Minister. Most of the projects in which the WHO, the US Army and the Bombay Natural History Society are involved, are either around Delhi or around NEFA. Occasionally there is a project in Jodhpur where there is hardly any mosquito, but they are chasing mosquitoes there. Most of these projects are around here. Why? Can you give me a list of these projects? A majority of these mosquito projects are on the outskirts of Delhi. I would also like to draw the attention of the Government to the fact that Prof. H. Laven of West Germany, an eminent professor, was invited by WHO as a consultant for this particular project. After a couple of months, he announced in February, 1974 that (a) this programme was a hoax and (b)

the chemicals used for mosquito control are experimental in nature and dangerous to human population. His visa was cancelled and he had to report back to West Germany. We never heard anything more about it. Why is the WHO behaving like this? Is the Government in some kind of understanding with WHO? What is WHO's role in the propagation of medicines and drugs in this country? The foreign companies have a big liaison with WHO in their prescription and recommendation. I would like this also to be investigated. In conclusion, I would like that the whole problem should be viewed in its entirety. I am not going to focus on this as one way of baiting the United States. That is not the issue. The question is, what are India's interest? If the USSR were doing it, I would have been equally as vocal against them as the USA. The question really is this. Are we in this country in a position to keep research, whether in the medical field or otherwise, safe? My answer is 'No'. With a minute's indulgence I would like to point out that when I was in the Indian Institute of Technology as a professor, I wrote a letter to the Home Minister saying that there were suspicious people who had been appointed as professors in IIT. I did not include myself in that. One of them happened to be a British agent working for the Americans. This was my allegation. According to his bio-data, he was a truck driver, but he was made a professor of sociology. I wrote to people who are very big and very close to the Minister. Of course, what happened? I lost my job. I am still in the process of investigating it. The question is whether the Government is really serious in doing something about research. Can you deny that such a contract has been given? It is supposed to be secret. In view of that I have put the question.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : The Member has asked certain questions again about CIA and KGB. I am sorry I am not in a position to answer them.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I never asked about the CIA and KGB, but is it a fact that such a contract has been signed?

SHRI A. K. KISKU: I may again repeat that these matter of espionage or biological warfare are absolutely beyond our Ministry's jurisdiction, . . .

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I seek your protection. Whose jurisdiction is it, so that I can address a letter to him?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him answer.

SHRI A. K. KISKU: As far as WHO is concerned, I may repeat that WHO is an open agency of international importance for taking care of the health of the world at large. Every nation is collaborating honestly, scientifically and in all manner possible, so that the health of the nations may be preserved. And I may say that WHO is one organisation with which we have complete confidence and cooperation.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I would like to interrupt. We are not here now to hear about WHO. What about the consultant and why has he resigned?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has not yet come to it.

श्री राजनारायण: यह कौन नहीं जानता कि वर्ल्ड आर्गनाइजेशन है, इसको बताने की क्या आवश्यकता है? जो सवाल उन्होंने पूछे हैं उनका जवाब दें।

श्री एन० आर० चौधरी: इनके सवाल का जवाब वह कैसे देगा? . . .

(Interruption)

SHRI A. K. KISKU: I may say again that it is very unfortunate that this information has come out in a manner which has made some of the Members rather apprehensive. But as far as . . .

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: During the last session, long before this report appeared . . .

SHRI A. K. KISKU: You please put the question to the Ministry of Defence or the

Ministry of External Affairs. Then, about Prof. Laven, he asked a question. He is also working on another method of genetic control which is called cytoplasmic incompatibility in which experimental mosquitoes are released, which are not incompatible with the wild population and thus, there is reproduction failure. These are all technical matters. In fact, I am not in a position....

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is ridiculous.

SHRI A. K. KISKU: . . .to go into these technical details. But I may once again say that there is no secrecy whatsoever about the research projects, and all our documents, the WHO papers, are all here.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: But who invited him? On whose particular invitation did he come and did he not resign in disgust saying that the programme is a hoax and that chemical use will be injurious?

SHRI A. K. KISKU: I am sorry, I do not have it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He does not have it.

DR. K. NAGAPPA ALVA (Karnataka): Yesterday morning I read five papers which raised this question and the report of the PTI science correspondent and it pained me and worried me to a large extent as to what extent an article or report of this kind will have an impact on the public mind, on the politicians and on the Members of this august House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You ask clarifications.

DR. K. NAGAPPA ALVA: . . .and also the other countries of the world which are members of the WHO.

Sir, I am at the outset appealing to the Ministry and also the Central Government that this matter has to be looked into in detail because the W. H. O. has been an organisation which has been away from politics for years together. If politics has entered into it, it is for the Ministry to look into the matter.

Sir, it is also our pride that many of our scientists and specialist doctors have occupied high positions in all the fields of activity of the W. H. O. including research. One thing we have to admit, that in this country we are very backward in the matter of research, research in all aspects and, if I may say so, more so in the field of medicine. The entire country here is confused. The United States and Russia have been brought in in different angles. It is clear from the statement as if we have no confidence in our own people who have been eminent scientists, as if we have no trust in their *bona fides*. Dr. Rajendra Pal is in charge of the Genetic Control of Mosquito Unit (GCMU) at Delhi. Its headquarters is in Geneva. He is the man who is directing the research here. Then Dr. Gopalan, Director General of the I. C. M. R. who has already made a name not only in India but the entire world, is one of our greatest scientists. And if the kind of criticism goes on there will be utter confusion. I may submit, Sir, with all humility that the confidence that is there in the W. H. O. will be shaken and also other countries of the world will start thinking that in India even promotion of health and prevention of disease have been brought into politics. The calling attention draws attention to the reported serious concern of the scientific community. I do not think there is at all any serious concern in the scientific community. Rather I would say it has become the serious concern of the politicians and the press and it has created a kind of confusion.

I may also say that when these people were questioned by the correspondents the reply that has been given by Dr. Rajendra Pal or Dr. Gopalan was quite apt. It was not avoiding a question because it is a well known fact that the findings should be kept a secret till a time comes when the findings are to be given out to the people of the world, not only to India but to the different people of the World. But one thing I must say that the headlines have become an eye opener to the Government and to this august House. And it is for the Government to look into these things whether such headlines should come in the papers, whether

we should not as Members of Parliament look into the different aspects, more so into the health problems of the people of this country about which the Health Ministry is concerned.

Whatever it is, there are other aspects which have been brought out by these headlines, namely, the question of sovereignty of this country, the defence of this country and the freedom of the country itself. Sir, one thing we have to admit. It is a fact that two countries, Russia and America, are brought in this report very nicely. This Government and the present leadership of our country have always been saying that the C. I. A. is playing a very dangerous part. And there is no doubt whatsoever that the KGB is also playing a dangerous part. I want an inquiry to be held by the Central Government as to what part they are playing in such things.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, please wind up.

DR. K. NAGAPPA ALVA : My question is whether the Ministry will prepare a note on these research projects and the findings so far with different collaborations, to what extent they have succeeded, what are the other projects that are before them and in what way the diseases should be eradicated in this country, and to show at the same time that no agency or no country whatsoever plays any part which will be dangerous to the freedom, progress and happiness of this country.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, the Minister will answer now.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : Sir, Dr. Alva is a most knowledgeable person about matters of health. We have got a tremendous amount of help and guidance from him in different ways. And I appreciate his most objective assessment of 'to-days' Calling Attention motion.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : So you say that! You did not have a good word for us.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : The sovereignty of our country is most dear to us, to all of us and we are prepared to face any situation

[Shri A. K. Kisku]
 where the sovereignty will be at stake. But at the same time, in matters of science or in projects for human health or in matters like this, we consider all countries—America, USSR or Japan—as friendly countries. Sir, he said that the Ministry of Health should come out with a note on different research projects. Here is a report on Genetic Control of Mosquitoes, Genesis of Communicable Diseases, which is about to come. This will be placed in the Library of Parliament. Here is the report of the Task Force on Genetic Control and Biological Control of Pests. Here is the report of the WHO research projects that are undertaken in this country.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : What about MAPS?

SHRI A. K. KISKU : I told you the Ministry of Health has no knowledge of the activities of MAPS and we have no connection whatsoever with them. I would be very grateful to you if you would kindly put this question to the Ministry of Defence. Probably they will be able to give you the information. That is all I have to say.

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh) : Sir, I must unfortunately agree with my friends on the other side that the replies that we have received are far from satisfactory and do not throw full light on a question which has very seriously agitated all of us. I would also agree with Dr. Alva that the WHO is an established world organisation and it is working in 143 countries, doing good work in places and we should not do anything to tar the whole WHO with the black brush. But we have not also to forget that the WHO, like so many other United Nations agencies, is infiltrated by not very desirable people, by the CIA also.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : By the KGB.

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA : Yes, I do not mind. May be by the KGB, may be by MI-5 of Britain, may be by some West German organisation or by anybody. I am just referring to the CIA because here the co-operation has been with the US people. It is known—I will be very brief, I will just ask

a few questions—that the US spent about 21.6 million dollars over a seven-year period for research in weather war and the result of this research was used in a very effective way in Vietnam. We know that type of research is not excluded in American and CIA projects. Also it is well known in the whole world that some Latin American countries like Haiti, Uruguay and Paraguay were made use of by the CIA to conduct research in defoliation and that research results was used very effectively in Vietnam and entire areas were denuded of any crop. So this is the background. Certain very telling facts have been brought to the notice of the House by Dr. Subramanian Swamy. In fact, we must give credit to him that in the last session also, in referring to the Bombay Natural History Society, he had pointed out these things which were later confirmed, and even a Soviet scientist later said that certain birds flying from India were used to put some viruses, etc., in the USSR. So...

SHRI N. G. GORAY : Did the Soviet scientist say that? Will you corroborate it? He has been quoted here, I know...

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA : You may not have read it.

SHRI N. G. GORAY : I have read it.

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA : I have also read it.

What I mean to say is that the whole affair is not so clean and the Minister cannot just say WHO is very good and we trust it. May be, it is very good. But through WHO they have made this infiltration. Now I want to ask some very specific questions to which the Minister has just to say, "Yes" or "No". I do not want to say a roundabout thing. My first question is this: Is there a hush-hush atmosphere in the WHO research? It has been alleged in the newspapers, and it has been stated by knowledgeable people, that there is a hush-hush atmosphere and the results are **no** known and even there are closed-door meetings. Is it a fact? Is it a fact that the USA is financing the project and the US Army is the recipient of these research

findings? A question about this has been asked to which no reply has yet been given. Is it a fact that the USA is financing the project and the US Army is the recipient of those research findings? That is my question number two. Then my third question is this: Were the PL480 funds at the disposal of the US Embassy used to finance these research projects? If you not got the answer now, you may give it later. But these are very clear and concrete questions. Then my fourth question is: Were the experiments by the GCMU, the BNHS and the institution at Jodhpur actually conducted and, if they were conducted, will the Minister kindly place the results of these researches on the Table of the House? Then my fifth question is: Was the GCMU set up in 1969 against the advice of Indian scientists? Is it a fact that Indian scientists advised specifically against the setting up of the GCMU and that it was set up in spite of their advice against it? My last question is this: Is it a fact that in the WHO collaboration in this country most of the people employed are not people from the academic fields, but generally officers of the Ministry, health officers and Health Ministry officials, who draw fat salaries and who are very clever in hiding everything from the Minister and the Minister does not know anything? And then, Sir, my last point is I demand that a three-hour or Short Duration discussion may be allowed on this question in this House.

SHRI A. K. KISKU : Sir, many of the questions are only repetitions. About the first question whether there is any hush-hush, I would say, "No". About the US Army being supplied with the findings I would say, "No". About PL-480 funds, as I have already said, WHO receives funds from different sources. But whatever research project is undertaken in India, that is being vetted by the ICMR. About the GCMU research findings, I will surely see that all the research findings are placed on the Table of the House when they are ready. About the officers of the WHO, I have no information. But as I have already committed to Shri Bhupesh Gupta, I will surely look into it and place all the facts on the Table of the House.

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA : Was the GCMU set up against the advice of the Indian scientists?

SHRI A. K. KISKU : GCMU was set up with the full support of Health scientists. It does not have any non-technical Health Ministry officials.

REFERENCE TO DISCUSSIONS WITH SHEIKH ABDULLAH REGARDING FUTURE STATUS OF KASHMIR

(श्री प्रकाशवीर शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से जम्मू और काश्मीर राज्य के भविष्य के सम्बन्ध में एक विशेष उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ। पिछले कुछ दिनों से समाचारपत्रों में यह चर्चा चल रही थी कि पर्दे के पीछे काश्मीर राज्य के भविष्य को लेकर भारत सरकार, शेख अब्दुल्ला और उनके समर्थक जनमत मोर्चे के बीच कोई आख-मिचौनी चल रही है, लेकिन आज के समाचारपत्रों को देखने से पता लगता है कि वह आख-मिचौनी अब कुछ प्रत्यक्ष रूप लेने जा रही है। समाचारपत्रों में है, जीघ्र ही—उन्होंने तो तारीख भी तय कर दी है 9 अगस्त को उनको जम्मू और काश्मीर राज्य का मुख्य मंत्री बनाने की एक योजना चल रही है। भारत सरकार तीन बार इन्हीं शेख अब्दुल्ला के ऊपर परीक्षण करके देख चुकी है, जेल में रखने के बाद उनको निकाला, फिर जेल में रखा, फिर निकाला, फिर जेल में रखा, फिर निकाला और अब चौथी बार परीक्षण करने जा रही है। हो सकता है आगे चलकर इस प्रकार की कुछ स्थितियाँ हों, जैसी उन्होंने भारत सरकार के सामने रखी