

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

FINDINGS OF ENQUIRY INTO IAC BOEING CRASH NEAR PALAM AND REPORTED POSSIBILITY OF A TOTAL BAN ON FLIGHTS IN AND OUT OF INDIA BY INTERNATIONAL PILOTS.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA (Orissa).
Sir, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Tourism and Civil Aviation to the findings of the Court of Inquiry appointed to probe into the crash of the Indian Airlines boeing 737 near Palam on May 31, 1973, and the reported possibility of imposition of a total ban of flights in and out of India by the International Federation of Airline Pilots because of complaints from airline captains about safety at the main airports, particularly New Delhi and Calcutta.

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN IN THE CHAIR].

THE MINISTER OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (DR. KARAN SINGH):
A copy of Shri Justice Rajinder Sachar's report on the accident to Indian Airlines' Boeing 737 VT-EAM on the 31st May 1973 near Palam which was received late on the night of the 21st July, has been placed on the Table of this Hon'ble House. The Court's findings are as follows and I quote—

"Aircraft VT-EAM had valid certificate of Airworthiness and was fully serviceable and was properly equipped for the intended flight IC-440 on May 31, 1973.

XIII.2. The design of the spread out of parts of the aircraft structure of VT-EAM clearly indicate that there was no structural failure or explosion in the aircraft in the air. This also rules out the likelihood of any sabotage.

XIII.3. From the initial impact point and the various positions of the undercarriage, the nose wheel and the nose it is evident that the aircraft was under power and in normal approach.

XIII. 4. The court did not see any evidence of fire in the air on any part of

the aircraft. Fire started from a point about 5°8' from the high tension wires onwards after impact.

XIII.5. The Engines and all aircraft systems were operating normally. There is no evidence to show that there was any failure of either of the engines.

XIII. 6. The available Radio Navigation aids at Palam on 31-5-1973 were operating properly at the time of the crash.

XIII.7. The Radio navigation aids provided in the aircraft also were working normally as is evident from the recorded evidence and confirmed by the C.V.R. transcript.

XIII.8. The Trim Sheet of flight IC-440 indicates that the aircraft was loaded in accordance with the rules and was within landing limitations. The Centre of Gravity was within the prescribed rules.

XIII.9. There was no emergency on board the aircraft throughout the flight from Madras to Delhi.

XIII.10. Captain G.P.B. Nair and Co-pilot Reddy had valid licences for operation of the flight.

XIII.11. Captain Nair and Captain Reddy held valid endorsements and were as such qualified to undertake this flight.

XIII.12. Captain Nair and Capt. Reddy were medically fit on the day to undertake this flight.

XIII.13. The weather forecast given by Madras Met. Office and the Current Weather Observations at Palam had tallied mostly. The Weather passed at Palam was fairly accurate. The visibility was 800 M which is below the landing minima prescribed by the I.A. for N.D.B. let down.

XIII.14. The Commander and Co-pilot were physically and mentally fit.

XIII.15. The Flight Duty time of Captain Nair and Captain Reddy were well within the Flight Duty Time limitations accepted by the I.A. and pilots.

XIII. 16. Captain Nair had descended below his MDA of 606'.

[Dr. Karan Singh.]

XIII.17. Commander had selected flaps to 40° after Outer Marker as for an I.L.S. approach while he was required to maintain 15° flaps till such time as the runway was sighted. The runway was, however, never sighted till the crash.

XIII.18. After lowering 40 flaps during the next 45" the Captain kept on emphasising on the Co-pilot to look out for the runway and the aircraft continued to descend.

XIII.19. Fifteen seconds before the crash the Co-pilot called out the last height as 1100 feet on Q.N.H. which was acknowledged by the Captain. The last speed called out by the Co-pilot was 130 when the engine RPM increasing sound was heard. During the next six seconds the Co-pilot still kept looking out under Captain's instructions and merely three seconds before impact had shouted twice to Open up. Immediately thereafter the aircraft crashed.

XIII.20. Captain Nair's incorrect decision to attempt an instrument approach to land, even when the reported visibility was well below the laid down minima, and the faulty technique of flying and descent even below the O.C.L. in instrument flying conditions by him resulted into this crash of IC 440 on 31st May, 1973, at 2157.46.

XIII.21. As a result of the crash Boeing aircraft VT-EAM was totally destroyed.

XIII.22. As a result of the crash 5 crew members and 43 passengers had died. The Captain and Co-pilot survived with injuries. The details are as per Appendix 'A'.

XIII.23. The Captain, during the final stages of approach, did not receive the required assistance from the Co-pilot, regarding the 'Standard Call Outs.' "

At our instance the Civil Aviation Adviser in our High Commission in London has contacted the London Headquarters of the International Federation of Airline Pilots Associations in regard to their reported move to impose a ban on flights in and out of India. He has been informed by their spokesman that they are not aware of the alleged move nor did they authorise any newspaper to publish any such report.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Sir, before asking questions I would submit to you that reports of this type, when there is a calling attention matter pending in the House or when there is a debate pending in the House, should be placed on the Table of the House for the use of Members sufficiently in advance. Today he has just laid it on the Table of the House and probably fifteen minutes after Members would be eligible to get a copy of the statement. Therefore, it has not benefited Members so far as this is concerned.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): The Report should be discussed separately. I will give notice.

DR. KARAN SINGH: We received ten copies of the Report only this morning at 1.30 and the earliest opportunity I have taken to lay it on the Table of the House.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: That is the hon. Minister's internal arrangement. We have nothing to do with it. So far as Members are concerned, what we expect at least is the timely placing of it on the Table of the House before the debate starts.

Sir, it is a matter of great concern to all of us, because we have lost some of our esteemed colleagues in the air crash. Some other eminent persons were also there. On the whole it has given a feeling of lack of safety to every air passenger in this country. During the last so many months and may be one or two years we have had at least eight air crashes. Compared to the flights that we have in this country the percentage of air crash is tremendously high. I thought I would not be rude to the hon. Minister because he has been trying to do his best. Last time when he tendered his resignation it was an untimely tendering of resignation and when he withdrew it I thought it was purely a political manipulation. Frankly speaking this is the occasion when I can really demand his resignation and I think the entire House is with me when I demand his resignation. May be he is not responsible at all for this, but the standard of the Government could be maintained only if on occasions like this the Minister

shows an example. Now, I would not further press that point because it is for the ruling party to take care of it or the country would measure and size up the prestige of the ruling party.

SHRI VITHAL GADGIL (Maharashtra): You are not very serious about it.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Even if I am two hundred per cent serious about it, would Mr. Gadgil implement it? I am two hundred per cent serious about it. Now, Sir, I have certain questions to ask and I would beg of the hon. Minister, through you, Sir, to reply to all these questions.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: It is only one party suffering from navigational hazard.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: With Mr. Bhupesh Gupta as the navigator in the cockpit.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I have never said it.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Sir, firstly, Capt. Nair seems to have been responsible for this air crash. May I know from the hon. Minister whether he has gone through the progress report of Capt. Nair? He has squarely placed the entire responsibility on Capt. Nair. I would squarely place the entire responsibility on the Department of Civil Aviation. If you go through Capt. Nair's progress report on 8-2-1971, it says:

Progress rather slow—tends to forget procedures. This is his progress chart. He tends to forget the procedures. On 13-2-71, it says: "His speeds and height not within limitations—needs to make proper adjustments on down wind when approaching cross wind and landing."

This was said about him in 1971, and there are further reports like the one that I read out, almost the same thing, but here and there, there are some exceptions. After that, how was he allowed to continue as a pilot, as captain, and how was he promoted to become the pilot of a Boeing aircraft? Who was responsible for it? Has any action been taken regarding that?

Again, about Capt. Nair and Capt. Reddy, there is something: "called the proficiency check in every six months." I want to know whether this proficiency check was done in regard to those two pilots or was there any kind of relaxation in that? This is the second point.

Thirdly, I want to know whether the visibility from the control tower at Delhi Airport is only to the extent of 15 to 30° while in all other international airports the visibility is 360°, all round? Here, in a minute, I would like to explain. All the three sides are blocked, there is no possibility of having any vision of the aircraft coming to land unless it has already touched the ground. Therefore, the possibility of the control tower asking the aircraft to open up again and fly is not there. He does not have ...

SHRI K. P. SUBRAMANIA MENON (Kerala): The co pilot is there.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: It is the control tower. From the tower, if he sees the aircraft and sees that the weather is very bad, that it is unsafe for the aircraft to land, then he asks him to fly again. Here he does not see the aircraft at all. Any aircraft coming from Calcutta, from Lucknow, Kanpur from Srinagar, from those sides, he does not see, unless it has already landed and touched the ground. In the case of the Boeing that came from Madras and crashed, he sees it only to the extent of 45° because he is dumped in a house where there is a small hole, which is encased in a plastic sheet or maybe a glass sheet. It is not airconditioned. And they are allowed to work there for more than 8 hours at a time, contacting maybe at times 8 planes or maybe at times 10 planes, and they have to keep their heads cool in 118° temperature of Palam Airport. That is what they are expected to do, to keep their heads cool and to ask the aircraft to come and safely land.

And another point is, the jet planes are allowed to taxi just near the control tower. Their noise is so great that it almost upsets the entire atmosphere of the cabin there. So, it is impossible for anybody to keep his head cool in such an atmosphere. I do not know whether the Minister has had

[SHRI LOKANATH MISRA.]

any occasion to go and inspect all these things. If he has had the occasion, he should have given it top priority. What we need is not a passenger terminal. He might make it attractive. I thank him for that. But there must be a sense of priority also. If the flying becomes unsafe because of some lacuna somewhere, it is useless making the main structure more attractive because then you would not have a passenger.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How many more points?

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA. According to the rules every person working in the control tower has to go in the aircraft which is called "familiarisation flight". After 1960, I am told, nobody has had the opportunity of having a familiarisation flight. Familiarisation flight is one which gives an opportunity in the control tower to have a first hand knowledge about how a plane flies and what are the difficulties of landing while coming to land and while taking off. This training has not been given to anybody after 1960. Therefore, much of their efficiency has gone down.

In addition to this I would bring to your kind notice certain other facts. The Fire Services in the Delhi Palam airport are not enough as a result of which the Air Force Fire Services had to be summoned 41 times in eight months.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Have you finished? You have already taken 15 minutes.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA. One or two points more. Sir, this is a technical subject and, therefore, you will have kindly to bear with me. I am not a technical person but I have tried my level best to go into the technical points as far as I could.

Sir, the pilot training here has been defective. This does not conform, I am told, with the standards laid down by the IATA. Coming back to the point, I am extremely sorry for the way the Indian Airlines have been functioning and it is a matter of great regret that the Department of Civil Aviation has also become a party to the air crashes because they have been defectively functioning the control towers.

I would like the hon'ble Minister to explain to the House what action he is taking because the passengers have become panicky in this country. Nobody now appears anxious to go by plane. I have been saying a lot for years. Still there is no improvement. There was some improvement for sometime. It has again become rotten. The services are awful as far as the telephone service goes. You go on ringing 391203 or something but nobody bothers. Either it does not function or nobody bothers. That may be your experience too. They have only one telephone at the Palam Airport and you will never get it. You do not know whether the plane is six hours late or four hours late. So much national time is wasted. All these things must be attended to if you want to bring in efficiency to this particular Ministry. During the last three or four years the efficiency has gone down so much but I do not know whom to blame. I would only hold Dr. Karan Singh responsible for it because I have told him repeatedly that his officials have not been functioning properly. Therefore, ultimately he would be the person who would take the blame. You have to take the blame squarely because you are the Minister responsible in a democratic set up.

DR. KARAN SINGH. Sir, I entirely agree with the hon. Member when he said that the crashes that have taken place in the Indian Airlines are most deplorable and it is indeed a matter of great regret for everyone. In this particular case, the regret is heightened by the fact that we lost some Members of Parliament and our colleague in the Ministry.

Sir, before I reply to his questions, I may in two minutes, say that we have taken a package of measures recently to tone up and improve the administration both of the Indian Airlines and of the Department of Civil Aviation. We have changed very drastically the check procedures for Indian Airlines pilots. Whereas previously panels were drawn up in a different manner, now the DGCA has drawn up fresh panels. Every Commander is being put through certain new tests and several Commanders who have not been able to pass those tests have been taken off command. Also the breathaliser equipment has been

installed in the four major airports. And various other measures have been taken to improve the working of the airlines.

As far as the Civil Aviation Department is concerned, this department also has been in operation for many years and it is our feeling that the whole structure and functioning of this department needs to be looked into afresh, so that if there are any weaknesses in the light of modern aviation requirements, they can be removed. For this purpose, the Government has set up a committee, as the hon. House knows under the Chairmanship of Mr. J. R. D. Tata and including Air Chief Marshal P. C. Lal who, on the 1st of August, is going to take over as full-time Chairman-cum-Managing Director of the Indian Airlines, to look into the entire structure of the Civil Aviation Department and let us know what improvements need to be made.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: There is no representative of the workers on that committee.

DR. KARAN SINGH: But I have had occasion to speak to the Chairman of the Union. I met him just yesterday and I specifically asked him to be good enough to prepare his proposals and his suggestions so that they can be put before the committee.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: You have taken three people on the committee—Mr. Tata, your Secretary and the Chairman of the Indian Airlines. Why not a workers' representative?

DR. KARAN SINGH: I can assure the hon. Member that the workers' point of view will be carefully considered and given full weight in the committee.

Sir, the hon. Member has also raised two or three points. Of course, when the hon. Member reads the report, several of the questions he has raised will be answered therein. I must again regret that I could not lay the report on the Table earlier. Today was the earliest I could do it. It is true that Captain Nair's flying record has not been brilliant and many of the remarks that the hon. Member has mentioned are there. However, it is also true that despite these adverse remarks

he has been from time to time duly cleared by the various check procedure that are there.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Favouritism.

SHRI GOVIND BARBORA (Assam): Was he related to any big gun?

DR. KARAN SINGH: Not that I know or I do not know who he is related to. But as I said we have now drastically changed our checking procedure because we also are not satisfied with the procedures that are there now. I do not propose to go into great details, but the way in which the panels of instructors and check pilots were selected, I think, was not fully satisfactory. Various changes have been made.

As regards the control tower, I visited there myself recently. It is true that this tower is certainly not as good as it should be. It is part of the equipment that we inherited when we took over Palam from the old system. It was, I think, the Air Force control tower at one time. We have now given sanction for the construction of an entirely new control tower in Palam. The sanction was issued yesterday. A new air conditioned control tower with total visibility is going to be constructed. And another point that the hon. Member did not mention is that certain services are at Safdarjung still. These services will also be brought into Palam and in this new control tower on a top priority basis, they will also be installed.

As far as familiarisation flights are concerned, I am sorry I do not have that information with me immediately, but certainly it is an interesting point and I will get it looked into. Regarding fire services, certainly we called upon the Air Force fire services whenever necessary, and this is as it should be because we must take the maximum advantage of whatever facilities are there. But apart from that, we have ourselves now decided to place orders for crash fire tenders in India and abroad. I am hopeful that within a reasonably short period whatever deficiencies there are will be made up.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Only one question, Dr. Karan Singh. Why didn't

[Shri Lokanath Misra.]

you take these decisions earlier? Only after this crash all these things have been brought to your notice. Who were responsible for concealing all these facts from you?

DR. KARAN SINGH: It was not as if there was any attempt to conceal. Development and modernisation of airports is a continuous process. But there were shortcomings, we know it. Partly it is a question of resources, of how much money the Department has; and partly it is a question of what priorities should be given. We hope we will get as much money as will be required.

SHRI SHYAMLAL GUPTA (Bihar): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the statement as mentioned by the hon. Minister does not mention one point which was reported in a newspaper on the second or third day of the crash that the Captain was making love with the Stewardess in his cabin. It has not been cleared anywhere although it was mentioned in the newspapers. Sir, these things are very very common these days. In the Hindustan Times of July 22, there was a mention that "pimp pumps out permits from VIPs". And high placed people may be entangled into all these rackets. The Captain or the Pilot should not be allowed to talk to the Stewardess when they are flying. Moreover, Sir, will it not be possible to have men stewards there instead of women? Now, the Indian Airlines have a monopoly. We can do away with the beautiful girls so that the Captains or the Pilots have no time to lose on such things and avoid to some extent such accidents. Dr. Karan Singh is a philosopher and a follower of Arabindo Ghosh. On the Ayro question, he tendered his resignation and it was taken back on the insistence of the Prime Minister. Now, this is a much greater tragedy, as mentioned by my colleague, Mr. Misra. And he has not replied to that question. His call of conscience was there at that time. Where has that gone now when so many lives had been lost? Moreover, after the 31st of May incident there was a report in the newspaper about a Qantas flight where the Control Tower was not able to control, and it was only through the ingenuity of the pilot that a collision was averted. Otherwise, many lives would have been lost.

Therefore, Sir, on behalf of the House, I would ask Dr. Karan Singh to follow the advice of our late Shri Arabindo to be very honest in his duties as a Minister. Otherwise, it does not look nice for him to carry on as a Minister in such a responsible post.

Sir, it was reported in the *observer* London, which was quoted in the Indian press, that the International Federation of Airline Pilots have decided that they shall avoid Indian airports which are unworthy of landing and taking off.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. He has already replied to them.

SHRI SHYAMLAL GUPTA. If they do that, what will be the fate of our much-trumpeted foreign exchange earnings of 60 crores of rupees by the tourist traffic? Sir, I challenge Dr. Karan Singh if he can deny that this is a very peltiv amount of money if you consider any small country in the west which earns much more than what we, a big country like India, earn from the tourist traffic. Sir, I am sorry to note that the worthy Prime Minister who has such a mandate from the entire country is surrounded by incapable Ministers. Well incapacity is everywhere. We see it every day. Even now the Commerce Minister was being heckled.

Why do they not appoint as Ministers people who are good administrators...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us not discuss the philosophy of Ministers and how Ministers should be appointed.

SHRI SHYAMLAL GUPTA: The Prime Minister should go beyond party lines and have good administrators as Ministers rather than appoint Ministers who are not capable of functioning in a Department. I have the greatest regard for Dr. Karan Singh who is a very good writer, a very good philosopher and everything else. But he is not necessarily a good administrator. I would like the Minister to throw some light on my questions.

DR. KARAN SINGH: With regard to the question of the airhostess, it has been specifically dealt with by Justice Rajinder Sachar in his report and he has emphatically rejected any suggestion that it was,

as the honourable Member says, in any way a cause of the accident. If the honourable reads the report he will see that in 10 or 15 pages have been devoted to this. I must also say and I must categorically disagree with the honourable Member when he says that all girls should be taken off the plane and boys should be substituted there. I personally feel that it is very unfair in this age of women's lib; this is one of the few occasions and one of the few careers which are open to young girls and I do not think such suggestion is a fair one. I think it is very unfair to blame the accidents on the girls. Pilots are men. If anything the fault is on the other leg.

Then the question of resignation was raised. I should not specifically refer to it. Shri Lokanath Misra said it and Shri Gupta also raised it. But because this is really a personal matter, I am not quite sure whether this really should be mentioned. But as the honourable Member mentioned it, I would say only two things. It was not the Avro crash. I had defended on the floor of the House the Avro as a plane which was airworthy and which was safe. And when it crashed on a training flight I at that time assumed that perhaps I had been misleading the House and the nation. Subsequently of course it transpired as the Judge has held that the pilot was drunk. But at the time when I submitted my resignation I thought that perhaps I should take upon myself the responsibility because I had consistently defended the Avro on the floor of the House. That is a different matter. I think crashes take place. Even today there was a crash and you must have seen the newspaper report. Crashes are taking place in various countries, everywhere. Nobody likes a crash. But one has got to look into the causes for it and try and see that it does not recur. With regard to the Qantas episode it is a peculiar episode and an unfortunate one. It is true that the Qantas pilot made a complaint. As soon as the complaint was received the IIS equipment was recalibrated. It was found to be all right. Subsequently we requested every plane which came in to specifically come in on IIS and give us their readings. And we found that on the three days, 19th, 20th and 21st out of 44 aircraft which used it 40 aircraft put in a report that it was

satisfactory and there were one or two unsatisfactory reports. So we have also recalibrated it again. I may inform the honourable Members that is a measure of abundant precaution. I am getting a representative of the manufacturers of this IIS equipment. He is flying out from London today on an Air India plane and he should be in a day or two and we will again get the manufacturers to check it because I want to assure the honourable Members and the House that it is very much in our own interest and in the national interest that if there is in fact any weakness we should get at it. There is no question of trying in any way to hide a weakness or to cover it up because that would be disastrous. That is what we are doing now. As far as the other part is concerned I answered it in my earlier statement.

श्री ओउम् प्रकाश त्यागी (उत्तर प्रदेश) :

उपमहापति महोदय, मैं मंत्री महोदय को हार्दिक धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि उन्होंने बड़ी ईमानदारी के साथ इस बात को स्वीकार किया है और दुर्घटना के पश्चात् उन्होंने अपनी कमियों को अनुभव किया है और उनका सुधार करने की चेष्टा की है। मैं यही बात जानना चाहूँगा, मूलाधार में—जैसा कि आपने कहा—यह कंट्रोल टावर आऊट आफ डेट हो गया है, इसको नए ढंग से, एयर कंडिशन बनाने की भी चेष्टा आप कर रहे हैं। पाइलट्स के बारे में भी, आपने पढ़ा होगा, कि उनकी ट्रेनिंग में कितनी गड़बड़ है, बहुत कमी है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि उन सब बातों की ओर आपका ध्यान आकर्षित इस दुर्घटना के पश्चात् ही क्यों हुआ? आप का इससे पहले ध्यान क्यों नहीं गया? पाइलट्स की ट्रेनिंग के बारे में आपका पहले ध्यान क्यों नहीं गया ?

दूसरा प्रश्न मेरा यह है कि क्या यह सच है कि कैप्टन नायर जो इस हवाई जहाज को पाइलट कर रहे थे, उनकी

इस बात की योग्यता, इस बात की शमता ज्यादा नहीं थी कि इस प्रकार के हवाई जहाज को वे चलाए, उसको कमांड करे, और श्री कुमारमंगलम स्वयं जब चेयरमैन थे उस समय पर उन्होंने स्वयं ही उनको रिकमंड करके, उस पोजिशन पर लाकर खड़ा किया था। मैं जानना चाहता हूं, उनकी योग्यता और क्षमता के बारे में आपके पास क्या रिकार्ड है और उनके बाद जरा यह बताएं कि उसकी योग्यता इस पोजिशन के लिए, इस पद के लिए न होने हुए उसको यह काम अपरेट करने का क्यों दे दिया गया?

तीसरी बात मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या यह सच है कि दुर्घटना से पहले आपके कंट्रोल टावर के इन्स्ट्रुमेंट्स के बारे में शिकायत थी कि उनमें दोष है, वह ठीक वर्क नहीं कर रहे थे? तो आपने उनको ठीक कराने के लिए क्या चेष्टा की और चेष्टा कराने में क्या आपने रक्षा विभाग के इन्जीनियर्स से भी सहायता लेने की चेष्टा की? और यदि आपने सहायता नहीं ली तो उसका क्या कारण है?

चौथा प्रश्न मुझे यह पूछना है कि क्या जो विदेशी हवाईजहाज यहां आते हैं उनके विमानचालकों में बहुत से लोगों ने यह शिकायत की है कि कंट्रोल टावर ठीक संकेत नहीं कर रहा है, ठीक तरीके से सहायता नहीं करता है? क्या उनमें से अधिकांश की यह शिकायत नहीं है? अभी आस्ट्रेलिया के एक पाइलट ने शिकायत की थी जो पेपर में आया था। पीछे भी जब जापान के एक हवाईजहाज की यहां दुर्घटना हुई थी उस समय भी कहा गया कि वह कंट्रोल टावर के दोष से हुआ। तो इस दोष के भागीदार कौन थे और इस प्रकार के दोष को दूर करने के लिए पहले आपने चेष्टा क्यों नहीं की?

डा० कर्ण सिंह: उपमहापति महोदय, जहां तक कैप्टन नायर की क्षमता का है; मैंने अपने मल वक्तव्य में बताया है कि जज ने यह कहा है कि— Capt. Nair and Capt. Reddy had valid licences and endorsements. वे योग्य थे इस फ्लाइट को अपरेट करने के लिए।

श्री ओउम्प्रकाश त्यागी : मैंने कुछ और पूछा था। क्या उनका प्रमोशन श्री कुमारमंगलम ने . . .

डा० कर्ण सिंह: जी नहीं। ऐसी जानकारी नहीं है। जब कुमारमंगलम चेयरमैन रहे उस समय विशेषकर उनके साथ क्या किया होगा यह जानकारी मेरे पास नहीं है।

तीसरी बात यह है कि उन्होंने जो कहा आई० एल० एम० के बारे में यह ठीक है जिस दिन क्रैश हुआ था आई० एल० एम० नहीं चल रहा था, 24 मई को आई० एल० एम० खराब हो गया था स्टार्म की वजह से और उसको इमीडिएटली ठीक करने के जो क्रदम लिए जाने थे वह हमने लिए थे। जब राजेन्द्र मन्चर ने भी कहा है कि और जो जापान एयरलाइंस का एयरक्रैश हुआ था उस वक्त भी कहा गया था कि आई० एल० एम० होने न होने से हाइट का कोई संबंध नहीं है। मैं दो शब्दों में कह दूं कि ये जो इन्स्ट्रुमेंटल एड्स हैं, इनमें तो पाइलट को अपनी नजर से लैंड करना होता है। बिना एड के वह एक हाइट तक आ सकता है, एड के साथ वह लोवर आ सकता है। जब ये एड्स नहीं काम कर रहे हैं तो पाइलट को जो मेयर रखना है उससे नीचे नहीं आना चाहिए। वह जब तक अपनी आंखों में नहीं देखेगा “रनवे,” को, तब तक नहीं

नैन्ड करना चाहिए। इसीलिए मच्चर जी ने कहा है कि कैप्टन नीचे आ गए इसलिए दुर्घटना हुई।

उपसभापति महोदय, बहुत से लोगों ने कहा है, क्वान्टास वालों ने जरूर कहा कि इसमें आई०एल०एस० में कुछ गड़बड़ है और जैसा मैंने बताया, गुप्त जी के प्रश्न के दौरान, हमने कैलिब्रेट किया है, हमारे अपने हवाईजहाज है, उनसे कैलिब्रेशन करवाया है। जो भी हवाई जहाज आता है उसमें हम पूछ रहे हैं और इसके अलावा जो मैनुफैक्चरर्स हैं उनके भी प्रतिनिधि मैंने इसलिए बुलवाए हैं ताकि इसमें शक की कोई गुंजायश न रहे।

श्री प्रेम मनोहर (उत्तर प्रदेश)
आपने कंट्रोल टावर के बारे में नहीं बतलाया।

डा० कर्ण सिंह : जहां तक कंट्रोल टावर का सम्बन्ध है उसके सम्बन्ध में यह निर्णय किया गया है कि इसका फिर से नया बनाया जायेगा और उसमें जितनी सुविधाओं की आवश्यकता होगी वह दे दी जायेगी।

श्री ओउम्प्रकाश त्यागी : मैंने श्रीमान्, एक सवाल पूछा था परन्तु माननीय मंत्री जी ने उसका कोई जिक्र नहीं किया। जिस दिन यह दुर्घटना हुई थी उसके पहले कंट्रोल टावर में जो यंत्र लगे हुए थे वे काम नहीं कर रहे थे। मैंने इस सम्बन्ध में यह पूछा था कि वे यंत्र ठीक करा गये हैं या नहीं?

डा० कर्ण सिंह : आज इस सम्बन्ध में एक प्रश्न था, नम्बर 34, जो कि नहीं आ सका। उन्होंने पूछा था कि इन यंत्रों को ठीक करा दिया गया है? आज जो प्रश्न इस सम्बन्ध में आने वाला

था, उसके जवाब में यह बतलाया गया है कि चार जून और उन्नीस जून से इन यंत्रों को आपरेशन के लिए वापस डाल दिया गया है।

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, we all agree that the Boeing crash is a very sad event and we have lost so many valuable lives. But, Sir, when human lives are in danger and when our national prestige is at stake it is proper that we speak very frankly even to the point of being harsh.

Sir, my own feeling is that the Palam airport has been in a state of utter mess. I will give you some examples. I myself went there on the morning of the accident and I was there for some time. You will be surprised to know that for three days in the lounge where the passengers coming from abroad stay, there was no water. There was no water for three days, Sir, at Palam airport! Then, Sir, the ambulance unit there has been practically out of order and this was brought to the notice of the authorities about two years ago. But, Sir, on the day of the crash, even then, the ambulance unit was not working and the engine did not start and the bus did not move.

Then, Sir, the fire fighting equipment there was utterly in disuse and it did not work at the time of the crash. Not that these things were not brought to the notice of the higher authorities. I do not mean our honourable Minister. But there is the Director of Operations and there are certain other higher officers, the *bada sahibs*, there, and it was brought to their notice and nothing was done. I would appeal to the honourable Minister to make inquiries from lower people, from smaller people from the coolies and others working there and you will find that these are facts.

There is another thing also. Sir, I speak subject to correction. I am told that the weather radar at Safdarjung records the weather and there is a telephone call to Palam and this is how they work. It is fantastic, because, Sir, we know what sort of a telephone system we have. These are all some of the things.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI (Bihar). Is it a complaint against the telephones also?

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA. About telephones, it is all right. But at least the weather radar should be there.

Of course, Sir, our honourable Minister was abroad when the sad tragedy took place. He was in some tourist conference or some such thing. I do not know. Well, he was kind enough to fly back and appoint a committee and fly back again to Barcelona. Was it so important for the honourable Minister, after such a tragedy had taken place here, to go to Barcelona? Could he not have stayed back here at that time? I do not know whether he was kind enough to write letters of condolence to the families of those 48 passengers who died. Is it so important for him to be attending an international conference in some part of the globe or is it important for the Minister to be here when the tragedy had taken place?

Now, Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the House to the landing aids at Palam. Sir, Palam airport has several landing and navigational facilities. These are: the Instrument Landing System, the Airport Surveillance Radar, the very High Frequency Omni-Directional Radio Range, the Non-Directional Beacon, etc. Besides these there is the Distance Measuring Equipment and the Direction Finder. Excepting the first two aids, all the other instruments are old and dilapidated and they are of Second World War vintage and have been brought back from surplus stock. The first two aids were, however, not working, that is, the ILS and the ASR. The first two aids were not working when the plane crashed. The Instrument Landing System was out of order from May 29 and the Airport Surveillance Radar was out of order from May 24.

Further, we were told that some cables were not replaced. It is fantastic. We get at Palam so many international airlines. We are a country with a reputation. And we do not have replacements! The least that could have been done was that there should have been replacements provided in cases of an emergency.

Now, I want to draw his attention to another thing. The Director of Operations and other high-ups, it seems, in the entire Indian Airlines administration are apparently a set of 'bara sahibs'; so are even the pilots. These 'bara sahibs' when they speak to a plain clothed and simple lady, who tries to speak in Hindi, they speak in English. They are anglicized, they are not patriotic. Their whole demeanour and their whole approach is not very conducive to our feelings.

I have got a communication from the Indian Commercial Pilots' Association and it is said that in 1955, some of the weak characters who are given to alcohol have had to give an undertaking to the then Director General of Civil Aviation, Mr. I. C. Jain, regarding good behaviour and adherence to the rules. Due to circumstances, today these very gentlemen are occupying key positions and they are personal friends of the Director of Operations, who were found guilty in 1955.

Then, Sir, the Hyderabad Court of Inquiry has attributed the Avro crash near Madurai on 15th of March, 1973, to the Pilots who had undertaken the flight after consumption of alcohol. Justice Mr. Kuppuswamy has pointed out that Indian Airlines and Director General of Civil Aviation officials, inclusive of the Director of Air Safety, had full knowledge regarding this pilot's (Instructor) addiction to alcohol.

Then, Sir, it was also agreed that all pilots will undergo Breath Analyser Tests before going on a flight. But this order has never been carried out.

There are some other points...

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. You must wind up now.

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA: I shall take only two minutes more.

There are cases of Aircraft Maintenance Engineers certifying airworthiness of the aircraft without possessing valid qualifications and authority. In July 1971, Boeing aircraft were certified at Madras by the Dy Chief Engineer without valid authority. On 20-12-71, Svc 421 was operated by Operations Manager, Delhi, without the current

licence renewal check This executive pilot of Indian Airlines had not flown F 27 aircraft for a period of couple of years prior to 20th December 71 Captains Nair and B N Reddy, the two pilots of the illfated Boeing aircraft had also not undergone the proficiency check in the last six months which, if done in appropriate time, perhaps would have detected deficiency of the pilot This is something very serious I have the highest regard for our hon Minister He is a great gentleman He is a learned man He is a philosopher But I must admit the House must admit and the nation must admit that his management of this very important portfolio has been far from satisfactory While I would not demand his resignation, it would be worth while if he does a sort of self criticism and tries to find out himself whether he is the proper person to manage this portfolio or it may better be transferred to some other person and he may use his talents anywhere else

DR KARAN SINGH Sir, the hon Member has raised a number of points and very many of them are valid I think there is no doubt that our system of training and checking and the organisation of the various services need a good deal of improvement The hon Member has advised us self introspection I can assure you, Sir, that this crash has come as a very deep shock to all of us and from the very day that it occurred, we have been looking carefully and closely into the various structures It is not as if we were not considering them earlier But certainly this terrible tragedy lent a sense of urgency to the whole thing As I said some of the weaknesses are due to lack of resources Some of them are due to insufficient and inadequate organisation which we are also trying to remedy

Sir the hon Member mentioned two or three points I might say that ILS antenna was damaged on the 29th night due to storm Now, antenna is not a sort of thing which one keeps in stock Within 12 hours i.e. on the 30th morning an order was placed in London for the spare part

As far as the surveillance radar is concerned, a fresh cable was available in our

stock Naturally one had to find out where the trouble was and then only the cable could be replaced It took a certain amount of time During the course of his remarks, the hon Member said that our airhostesses were not patriotic I don't think that it is really so

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA I said so about the entire crew

DR KARAN SINGH I do not think it is correct to say so Certainly, there may be certain weaknesses and shortcomings I think that it should not be on record After all it is a very grave and serious charge

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA In any case they are extremely anglicised

DR KARAN SINGH As far as surveillance radar is concerned it is at Safdarjung Airport It is being shifted to Palam Airport shortly The hon Member said that I went to Barcelona in connection with an International Tourism Conference I may say on a point of personal explanation that it was not an International Tourism Conference It was a meeting of the Air India Officers from all over the world They had to collect at a certain place and the entire performance of the Fourth Plan had to be looked into and the perspective for the Fifth Plan had to be worked out This conference needed a great deal of preparation When the Judge was there, there was nothing further to be done immediately

So the hon Member also mentioned a lot of other points He was apparently reading from some documents There were various points with regard to certain individuals I do not have that document with me If he will be good enough to let me have that document, I would certainly supply him whatever further information he would like to have

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Dr Z A Ahmad

SHRIMATI SITA DEVI (Punjab) My name is there

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Your name is there But your party has already been called

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA (Nominated): It is a very important matter. You allowed the opener to speak for so long.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I won't allow you. Please take your seat.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: It is wrong on your part

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is according to the procedure.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: That is an important matter.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: May be. There are so many other important matters also. Yes, Dr. Ahmad.

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SITA DEVI: My point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your point of order has already been made and I have also told you that it is not a point of order. Yes, Dr. Ahmad.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: You had no courage to stop them but when we want to speak...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Alva, please take your seat. This is not the way to speak in the House.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: You won't baricade them at all. *(Interruptions)* My right.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your rights are very well protected and I know how to protect the Members' rights. And it is not anybody's monopoly here that he should be allowed on everything

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: My name is there.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So many other names are there. Mrs. Sita Devi's name also is there. *(Interruptions)* There is a procedure which I will follow and nobody is going to dictate to me what procedure is to be followed just because it suits him sometimes. *(Interruption by Shri Joachim Alva)*... You are not the

opener; I can't help it. If you had given notice first, probably you would have got that time.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: Three minutes, Sir. You have given him 30 minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is my discretion; I may give him one hour. It depends on how things proceed in this House. *(Interruption by Shri Joachim Alva)* This is very unfair Mr. Alva. *(Interruption)* You are very unfair. You have been given more chances than you actually needed. So many times you have been given chances and just once when you are not given you get up and create this kind of a thing. This is very very bad... *(Interruptions)* You are not the only person concerned with this serious affair. What about Mr. Kulkarni? He too has been sending chits but he is sitting there silently.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SITARAM KESRI: Deputy Chairman, Sir, my humble suggestion is, while so many Members here want to talk on this issue...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you want to discuss it you give notice of a motion.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI: Why not? I shall request the Minister, the House and you, let there be some discussion; let us fix some time—two or three hours—because it is a very important matter.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You must give notice of a motion.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I do not want to put forward suggestions or proposals of a technical nature because I think I am not qualified to do so. I can pick up odd things here and there. *(Interruption)* बहन जी, जरा बोलने दीजिये या मैं बैठ जाऊं। Sir, please control her or I will sit down.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Sita Devi, are you taking your seat or are you

going out of the House? You can't be standing there and giving out a speech.

एक माननीय सदस्य: बहुत जी, वाक आउट कीजिये।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. This is most unparliamentary.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: I do not want to put forward any suggestions of a technical nature because I think I am not qualified to do so. One could pick up odd things here and there, from reports and from newspapers, and make a show of being very profound or being very knowledgeable. I do not want to claim to be knowledgeable on the subject, but I think there is something very seriously wrong. In our country the weather is good, we have all sorts of facilities. We have instruments, we have talented flying staff. Still, why should there be repeated accidents of this nature? I think the Civil Aviation Department has to be shaken up properly, and I regret that an accident of this magnitude should have become the excuse for shaking it up. It should have been shaken up much earlier. *(Interruption)*. I think this lady cannot be controlled by you. She has come to the front bench.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She happens to be a lady!

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: We submit to the ladies in our own home all right but should it be so in this House also?

SHRI NAGESHWAR PRASAD SHAHI (Uttar Pradesh): Bachelors cannot control ladies!

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you want to say something to Mr. Om Mehta you say it; he is not disturbed.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: I think there seems to be something seriously wrong.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: You relax, Sir, you relax.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am relaxed but you are always tense, Mr. Alva. That is the trouble.

1 P.M.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: I am glad that they have been shaken but I do want to narrate a very sad experience I have had personally on that day of the accident. Then I actually became anti-Civil Aviation Department and I abused the officers quite a lot. I reached there at 10 o'clock. I want the Minister and the Deputy Minister to take note of this. The bodies were lying there. I detected one body; I recognised one body; I identified one body.

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN (Kerala): You mean 10 o'clock next day?

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: Yes; next morning; it was 9-30 or so. Satish Loomba's body was identified. His wife had come there; she recognised it she gave the certificates and other things. I asked the police to help us to shift that body. He said no, no. We cannot do anything. All the bodies will go together to the hospital. I said, what is this; we are about 4 miles away from the town; the taxis cannot be brought there. You can requisition vans; you can requisition buses. For any odd demonstration here some ten buses are standing full of policemen to beat up the people. You cannot requisition buses to take these dead bodies? The policeman said, these are the orders; we shall take them to the hospital or you can have your own private conveyance and take the body. I got quite annoyed. Then I thought that perhaps these people have been killed by the mistake or by an accident connected with the Airlines and so the Airlines must have made some arrangements. I went round and round searching for an officer of the Airlines in order to get one means of conveyance to shift that body. Till about 10.30 or 11.00 there was no one available. There was one jeep of the Airlines. This is the fact; I have seen myself; no one was available. Your officers will be telling lies if they tell you they were there. I saw no responsible person of the Airlines looking after those dead bodies or making arrangements as to how they are to be taken to the town. At 10.30 or 11.00 a South Indian gentleman, an officer of the Airlines came. They are all busbodies, preparing some sort of proforma and nothing and nothing. I told him I am a Member of Parliament. I introduced myself to him. Then I told him that I want this body which has been duly

urgent public importance

[Dr. Z. A. Ahmad]

identified and cleared by the police to be shifted from here to No. 4, Windsor place, our Party office. He said, I cannot do anything; I cannot help you. All those bodies we shall take together, just as in the Air Bus they take all the bodies charging Rs. 4/-per body. I am glad that he did not say, I will charge you Rs. 6/-for taking this body. He told me, it is not my responsibility. I said, Damn it; is jolly well your responsibility; you have killed these people. You make arrangements for their transport from the airport to the town when they are alive but when they have been killed you say it is not your responsibility to move their bodies. You are so cussed and callous that you cannot do even this much. My blood started boiling. I thought this is Dr. Karan Singh, this is Dr. Mahishi. His body was lying there; his wife was fainting and this man says it is not my responsibility. I got wild. I was ready to beat him up. I rolled up my sleeves. Some workers were there and I called them to beat him up. And I must give credit to those workers. They said, no sahib, we will take that body for you. This was the position. Then at 11.00 or 11.30 a van appeared from somewhere. All the time the sun was burning and it was a very difficult situation. This is how your Department functions. The Commission may give you wonderful reports about your functioning but the fact is there are callous people in your Department who had no feeling for this woman who was fainting and who say it is not their job; if you want to take away the dead body you have to make your own arrangements and your own means of conveyance. On that day I said I shall rise this in Parliament and I will question Dr. Karan Singh and Dr. Mahishi. Well, one little thing and it is a matter of personal experience. The control tower, is functioning all right, but obviously there are certain points about which care has to be taken. For example, during bad weather I think the officers should be there at the tower, but they are never there. Some petty officer is there. Technical experts are not there. They should be in the tower during bad weather. In most of the countries during bad weather the officers are there, but we have so much of good weather that officers are not worried about it. In other countries there is mostly bad weather and the officers are alert. Here in a loose,

slopply manner everything goes on. Technical officers should be available round the clock to give navigational aid. Then, I come to staff training. More training of staff is necessary. You will obviously look into the matter. Then, there is the question of discipline. I do not want that sort of fascist discipline to be imposed, but I do think if there is consumption of alcohol and the man is flying with alcohol in his stomach, he should be discharged. You should take severe steps. I really think that your rescue facilities are very inadequate. I think you should go into the whole question and find out whether your rescue facilities are adequate or not. Beyond that I do not want to give any opinion as to whether you should resign or you should not resign. From that side they say that you should resign and from this side some people say that you should resign. It is up to you to decide. It is up to your conscience whether you should stay on or you should go. Such a serious tragedy must shake up the department. It must shake up the whole Ministry. Some forty-eight human beings were killed and some of them were our best people, Members of Parliament and Ministers. Well, every human being's life is valuable. It should shake you up mentally. It should shake you up morally. Materially also your whole department should undergo a total metamorphosis. If you think that you are in a position to carry on and bring about that shake-up, well and good, stay on, but if you think that you will not be able to cope with the task, then you should take your own decision.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Sir, it is indeed a very unhappy episode that the hon. Member has related and there can be no excuse for callousness or lack of sympathy on an occasion like this. The only thing that I can think of at the moment is that when a crash like this takes place I understand that the police becomes responsible and nothing can be moved or removed until the police gives clearance.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: Clearance was given by the police.

DR. KARAN SINGH: If the police had given clearance, then there was no excuse.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: I asked them to shift this body, but they said that they

would do it all together and not individually

DR KARAN SINGH That is indeed most deplorable and I would certainly get that particular incident looked into to find out who is responsible

DR Z A AHMAD I can also identify that officer

DR KARAN SINGH Sir, two or three other points the hon Member has raised. One is the question of officers in the control tower. As I understand it, the control tower is always manned by people who have suitable technical qualifications. I agree with him that when the weather is bad more vigilance is required than otherwise, but I do not think that the control tower is ever left without adequately qualified technical personnel. It is a very technical job. With regard to training, I do not know whether the hon Member was referring to training of pilots or training of ground staff. Both are important. I have already mentioned that the pilots' training is being completely revamped and the ground staff training also certainly needs to be looked into, particularly when new equipment is installed. Then the question of discipline is a very valid one. Unfortunately a general deterioration in the standards of discipline has become very much a national feature and we in the Airlines cannot afford the luxury of this.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI At least now, will you take some steps?

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Let him complete

DR KARAN SINGH We certainly cannot afford to have any indiscipline. No indiscipline should be allowed whatsoever. As a matter of fact, a number of disciplinary actions have been taken against the pilots for various reasons, for unsatisfactory conduct before also and also after the crash. Two pilots' services have been terminated, one has been suspended and seven or eight have been taken off the command.

SHRI BRAHMANANDA PANDA (Orissa) Take action on them if they go on strike.

DR KARAN SINGH Certainly we are not going to tolerate any sort of indis-

cipline among the pilots. For example, I would feel it a gross irresponsibility if a pilot who is paid so heavily should have an alcoholic drink before he flies, this, surely is something which he himself should realise. They are highly paid—they are skilled people—drawing large salaries, they are not in any way underpaid. If they do not have this much basic sense, it is regrettable. I do not want to condemn all the pilots. But certainly there has been a deplorable lack of responsibility on the part of many pilots which is a very unfortunate matter and which places not only me but the whole nation in a very very awkward position that a highly paid and specially privileged group of this nature should behave in this manner. We are very cognizant of this and we will certainly do whatever is possible to see that the situation is improved.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR (Uttar Pradesh) Sir, I want to ask for a clarification from him. The hon Dr Z A Ahmad narrated a very tragic story and he gave the specific time, as between 9 and 10 the next day of the crash. The Minister said that he would look into it. What should we understand by it? Will he tell the House who were the officers posted on behalf of the Civil Aviation Department and the Indian Airlines at that time on the spot of the occurrence? Did anyone of them know Dr Ahmad or recognise him? Or could he hear him that he is an MP or not? Will he give a report whether the Civil Aviation Department's Secretary, Joint Secretary, Under Secretary Section Officer they were discussing something else, something more important? Who were the officers there between 9 and 10 and will he make a statement as to who were the officers from the Civil Aviation Department and the Indian Airlines on the spot between 9 and 10, and what they were doing?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA Sir, Mr Chandra Shekhar has very rightly made a constructive suggestion. The time should be known the deployment of the officials should be known to the Government, and the Minister should find out from the register and other records as to who were the people there, and from that he should draw up the list and locate that officer and that officer should be summarily dismissed from service.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him say what he is doing.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: That should be done, and we want to be told in Parliament what action he has taken. Dr. Ahmad says that if he parades the officers, he will be able to identify him. Therefore, parade them in your front, all the officers who were there; he will go and identify them.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Minister answer.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: He will identify that particular officer. He cannot remain there; such an arrogant and brutal type of person should not occupy any public position at all, leave alone this kind of position.

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA: Will you also please find out whether it is a fact that there was no water in the taps at Palam for 3 days?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Malaviya, you have had your say.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: The Minister should make a statement on this point.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has got up to answer Mr. Chandra Shekhar.

DR. KARAN SINGH: About this particular episode, had he been good enough to write to me or let me know, I would have found out. Now that he has said about it, I will find out what the facts of the case are.

DR. Z. A. AHMAD: If I had written to you earlier, the thing would have been lost; it would have been dealt with by some Under Secretary or Deputy Secretary and no attention would have been paid, and some routine answer would have been given.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: It is a tragic situation. I want your guidance specifically. Here is a Member of Parliament of the stature of Dr. Z. A. Ahmad who says on his personal knowledge that such an incident happened and happened at a particular time. As an ordinary person, as a layman who has no experience

of administration, as a human being I feel that some top people of the Civil Aviation Department and the Airlines should have been present at that moment on the scene of occurrence; some one responsible should have been there. And if someone responsible was there what was he doing? Why is he feeling shy to say that he will make a definite statement? Who were the persons on duty on that occasion? Or the Civil Aviation or the Indian Airlines did not think it at all necessary to post any senior or junior officer or even a peon at that particular time?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has already said that he will find out. Evidently he does not know at present.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I do not want to know anything from him. I want to know from you. After all, a Member of Parliament like Dr. Z. A. Ahmed makes a statement on such a tragic incident. Whether it was Mr. Satish Loomba or anybody else—Mr. Satish Loomba was a trade union leader with whom I may have differed—even an ordinary person deserves a human treatment when such a thing happens. I have every reason to believe that what Dr. Ahmad says is cent per cent. true. As a Member of Parliament am I not entitled to know from the Minister whether it was a fact or not that some officers were posted? If they were posted whether in the opinion of the Minister or in the opinion of the Government they failed to report at the place of occurrence, and if they failed what action has been taken against them? I want to know from you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, what is the way out for a Member of Parliament if such serious allegations are made? Is it enough for Ministers just to look into the brief prepared by their officers and get themselves satisfied and we remain as ignorant as we were before the incident narrated by Dr. Z. A. Ahmad? What is the way out for us? I want your ruling.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I suggest either you give a direction on your own or appoint a small Committee of this which would specifically go into this question.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no question of a Committee of this House being appointed.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Mr. Deputy Chairman, I also know what is the problem and I know the procedure. I suggest that all rules should be suspended and the House should hereby appoint a Committee. We shall know who oppose and who support the appointment of such a Committee. Let the country know who is opposing and who is supporting. Mr. Deputy Chairman, I know enough of Parliamentary rules. Nobody needs any coaching on this matter. I do not need any coaching. I know what are Parliamentary rules.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Chandra Shekhar, Dr. Ahmed had made a statement here. Evidently the Minister is not in possession of full information regarding the particular incident. He wants time to go through the information and then take whatever action has to be taken. So, I think, we leave it to the Minister to report to the House when the action is taken.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, this is a fair compromise. He should identify the officer. If he cannot identify the officer he will be open to the charge that he is not capable of even locating the officer concerned. Therefore, he has to identify the officer, tell us his name and action should be taken against him. I have got a list of officials of the I. A. C. who are a shame.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Chandrasekharan.

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, . . .

SHRI HARSH DEO MALAVIYA: Mr. Deputy Chairman, you fix a date for his reporting to the House—two days or three days.

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN: the hon. Minister has drawn the attention of this House to the important conclusions that the enquiry report of the High Court Judge has pinpointed. I am sure that the enquiring judge has also made a large number of recommendations for the consideration of the industry, the Department of Civil Aviation and the Government as a whole.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be brief.

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN: Even though these conclusions have been read out by the hon. Minister, I would take this opportunity of asking the hon. Minister to read between the lines through the whole report. I have been trying to follow this enquiry through the various newspaper reports and from what little I have been able to gather—whatever be the view one may take so far as the pilot and the co-pilot are concerned and whatever has been concluded against them by the enquiring judge—I have no doubt that the faults of the management of the Indian Airlines and the faults of the Civil Aviation Department, Particularly of the control tower, cannot be lightly taken. Sir, many defects have been pointed out so far as these two pilots are concerned. I put this question to the management of the Indian Airlines, through the hon. Minister: Who is responsible for these defects and for giving these pilots the command and co-piloting of the Boeing concerned, with all these defects? I charge the industry with setting pilots against the ICPA and favouring pilots who are not members of the ICPA, so that the only organisation of pilots in the industry can be reduced to a weak state. And for the purpose of setting pilot against pilot and pilots against the pilots' association, a certain method of treatment has been adopted consistently by the high-ups in this industry, and the result is that we are having commanders and co-pilots of this type. I say, Sir, that commanders and co-pilots of this type are still at large in this industry and they are continuing to command and co pilot some of the aircraft. I say, they are incompetent to do so. Their only competency is that the management shuts its eyes because they are not members of the ICPA. I submit, Sir, that a caste system is being attempted to be created by the industry so far as the pilots are concerned. A superior caste of weak pilots, defective pilots, is being sponsored by this industry. This sort of approach and policy which unfortunately began three or four years back in this industry should be given up by the management of this industry.

The second thing that I would like to state is that whatever be the defects in

[Shri K. Chandrasekharan].

the method of landing adopted by the commander and the co-pilot in this case, the fact remains that the aircraft was allowed to go to the Outer Marker; the fact remains that the control tower had told the aircraft that the localiser was off the air and this was likely to be misunderstood. Sir, the fact further remains, as the hon. Minister himself stated in his own words, that the flaps have been opened as if for an ILS let-down. All these clearly show that there has been some sort of misunderstanding between the cockpit and the control tower. And to what extent is this accident on account of that misunderstanding? And who are at fault in the control tower? These will have to be enquired into. It had come to light, Sir, at some stages of this Inquiry, that the Officer-in-Charge in the control tower at the time was not a person competent to be in charge. He had been superseded several times previously. And he had recently been granted his promotion, and the result of that promotion has been the creation of misunderstandings of the type we had on the night of 31st May. I would, therefore, request the hon. Minister that these points be investigated into.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Sir, in addition to the findings that I read out in response to the Calling Attention Notice, the Court has made certain observations and recommendations. And these will now be available to the hon. Members. And certainly all these will be looked into very carefully, processed and action taken wherever necessary on these recommendations.

Sir, as far as this question of the ICPA is concerned, without going into that matter in detail, I think it is not true to say that. If anything, from what I have gathered from this Report, the Judge has suggested that the selection of the check pilots should not be in the hands of the ICPA. It should be taken out of the hands of the ICPA and should be given to the management. In addition, we are now giving the DGCA two full time check pilots, drawn from the Indian Air Force. So far, the DGCA has no pilots of his own to check. He used to take from the Air Force. This is the system ever since the Air Corporation came into being 20 years ago. Now the time has come that the DGCA should be given check pilots of his

own, who are not members of the Airlines at all and who are directly under the DGCA. We are in close touch with the Indian Air Force which is the only other body from which we can draw expertise. I have been personally in touch with the Chief of Air Staff who is also a member of the Board of the Indian Airlines. And we are looking into that. As I said earlier, Air Chief Marshal Pratap Lal, a distinguished flyer himself, is taking over as full-time Chairman of the Indian Airlines from the 1st of August. I may assure the hon. Members that whatever weaknesses or lacunae are there in the training will be looked into on top priority.

SHRI SALIL KUMAR GANGULI (West Bengal): The latest reports indicate that there would be very many accidents in the near future in the Indian Airlines because of the haphazard action taken. One can understand the pilots being tested for the purpose of finding alcoholic contents and whether they have consumed alcohol. But of course, the ICPA itself demanded this for a long time. Now the system which has started is to have pilots examined before every take-off by employing 35 doctors. Without having anything else to do, these doctors are taking blood pressure and all these things. Now, Sir, if a person's blood pressure is required to be taken every morning, it is likely that the blood pressure may fluctuate because the employment of these pilots remains on keeping their bodies fit. This will keep their minds outside the cockpit thinking that whether they will be allowed to hold that flight at all because of these doctors and this beautiful system of medical examination. I have no doubt in my mind, Sir, that there will be many many accidents in future. I would request the hon. Minister to consider these aspects and not to push in too far.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Sir, we cannot have both the ways. On the one hand there is reason to believe that some of the pilot—again I want to go on record as saying that I do not condemn the pilots as a group—have been consuming alcohol. And there is a great demand that we should introduce checks. Now, when we introduce the checks, you say that you should not introduce because it will distract their minds.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: No, no. He did not say that.

DR. KARAN SINGH: What he said was that the medical test that we have now introduced in four international airports might distract the minds of the pilots, and therefore, we should reconsider it.

SHRI SALIL KUMAR GANGULI: I never said that. I said that if they are to be tested every morning, noon and afternoon and if the doctor comes and every-time tests their blood pressure which fluctuates and if the doctor asks them to stand on one leg and so on...

DR. KARAN SINGH: Obviously there is no desire whatsoever to harass the pilots. Number one. Then, number two: I agree that it is an unfortunate thing that we have to introduce these tests at all. The ideal situation would be that, as I said earlier, the pilots themselves have a self-denying ordinance and assure us that this is not happening. But when we have instances where, as, for example, in the Secunderabad crash, we found in various other crashes...

(Interruption)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: But how will you test every one?

DR. KARAN SINGH: We do not test every pilot. And I may also clarify that it is only if the doctor feels that *prima facie* the pilot has consumed something, only when we feel that, the test is conducted. But these tests have gone on for some time. I sincerely hope and I want it to go on record because sometimes a view is created that I am trying to denigrate the pilots' class; I am not doing that at all. Pilots are the highest paid. They are highly skilled technicians. But they must also improve their performance and we must also try to do our best.

SHRI BABUBHAI M. CHINAI (Maharashtra): Sir, I am not going to take much of your time. I must very frankly state here one thing that since morning I have been seeing something unusual in this House. It is this that the party in power, their own Members, are going and having a dig at the Ministers. They have another platform where they can do this, their Executive, their own committee, their own

separate meeting, and even their own leader. I do not understand why they are taking the time of the House to do this. Coming to discipline, Sir,—we are talking of discipline—we want hundred per cent discipline in the Aviation Department. There is no doubt about it. I would request the honourable Minister to look into this because I find that discipline has been lacking very much in every class so far as Aviation Department is concerned, among the pilots, the ground staff, and other categories of staff. Not only that. They are very highly paid. We are told that nearly 34 to 35 lakhs of rupees are being paid every month as overtime to these people. I do not think there is any other Department of the Government of India which pays Rs. 34 or Rs. 35 lakhs as overtime to its employees. In spite of such huge overtime paid, we find that the behaviour of the staff is so uncivic. Great discipline is desirable among the staff and Dr. Karan Singh will have to give an assurance to this House that he means business and that he will enforce discipline with every member of the staff irrespective of the consequences, and if he does it, we will all stand by him. If, in doing so, all the planes are to be grounded for months together, we do not mind it and we will travel by other means of transport. But discipline must be enforced so that (1) such accidents do not take place; (2) people are not inconvenienced; and (3) it will be a lesson to the other members of staff in other departments and other walks of life, and to Members of Parliament also.

DR. KARAN SINGH: I do appreciate and accept the sentiments which the honourable Member has expressed that discipline must be strictly enforced. And it is certainly our intention to try and do so.

श्री नागेश्वर प्रसाद शाही : श्रीमन्, मैं इस समय आज मे 3, 4 महीने पहले जो घटना हुई उधर ध्यान दिलाता हूँ। और सदन में कहता हूँ कि सदन को महाराजा साहब के साथ बड़ी सम्पैथी रखनी चाहिए, सहानुभूति प्रकट करनी चाहिए कि महाराजा साहब का कोई कंट्रोल उनके विभाग पर नहीं है। स्टाउवेज के केस में जो तीन यात्री बिना

[श्री नागेश्वर प्रसाद शाही]

टिकट चले गये थे तो इस सदन में इतना ही हल्ला हुआ था कि महाराजा साहब ने दो कर्मचारियों को मुअ्तल किया। उस पर वहाँ हड़ताल हो गयी और उस हड़ताल से घबड़ा कर महाराजा माहव सरेडर कर गये और अधिकारियों ने कर्मचारियों में कह दिया कि किसी के खिलाफ कोई ऐक्शन नहीं होगा। उम्मी का नतीजा श्रीमन् है कि इस तरह की गंभीर अन्शामनहीनता वहाँ पर व्याप्त है। श्रीमन्, अभी तक हम ने यह सुना था कि मोटर ड्राइवर्स ही आर०टी०ओ० को घूस-घास दे कर अपना लाइसेंस बनवा लेते हैं, लेकिन अब यह मालूम हुआ कि पायलट्स भी घूस दे कर और सिफारिश करा कर अपने लाइसेंस प्राप्त कर लेते हैं चाहे उन में हवाई जहाज उड़ाने की माकूल योग्यता और क्षमता हो या न हो। यह हालत इंडियन एयर लाइन्स की है। मैं मंत्री महोदय से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह सदन और इस देश के हवाई जहाज के यात्री कैसे सन्तुष्ट हों कि आप ऐसी व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं कि किसी अयोग्य पायलट को हवाई जहाज उड़ाने का कमांड नहीं दिया जायगा और उसे बिना क्षमता प्राप्त किये उड़ाने का लाइसेंस भी नहीं दिया जायगा?

डा० कर्ण सिंह उपमन्त्रापति महोदय, जो पहले छोटी सी बात माननीय सदस्य ने कही उस के विषय में मैं बता दूँ कि मैंने वैसा किसी हड़ताल के लिए नहीं किया था। मैंने एक जज उस की इक्वायरी के लिए एप्वाइट किया था और उस की रिपोर्ट आने के बाद मुझे जो कार्यवाही करनी थी वह मैंने की।

मैंने जैसा पहले निवेदन किया था, उपमन्त्रापति महोदय, कि हम अपना जो पायलट ट्रेनिंग प्रोसीजर है उस को बहुत

हद तक बदल रहे हैं। पहले यह हुआ करता था कि जो चेक पायलट्स की लिस्ट बनती थी वह वहाँ के यूनिन के लोगों के परामर्श से बनती थी। अब हम उस को बदल रहे हैं और यह कर रहे हैं कि उस को स्वयं डी०जी०सी०ए० ही बनाये और उस के बाद हम डी०जी०सी०ए० को दो चेक पायलट्स दे रहे हैं। तो हम उस में मूल परिवर्तन कर रहे हैं। लेकिन इस सब में कुछ समय लगेगा। हम इस का आश्वासन दे रहे हैं। ओवर नाइट चेज तो संभव नहीं होगा। हम कमांडर्स को फिर से चेक कर रहे हैं और सात, आठ कमांडर्स को हम ने हटा भी दिया है। तो जो संभव हो सकता है वह हम कर रहे हैं। इस से अधिक अद्यक्ष महोदय, इस समय हम कुछ नहीं कह सकते।

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA Sir, I apologise to you for being rude to you. I am grateful to you for having called me. I want to know one thing from the hon. Minister. How many times has he sat in the cockpits of our planes? I hope he has sat at least 10 to 15 times to have some chat with our pilots in order to know their troubles. I have sat with pilots all over the world except in China. I have sat with American pilots, Russian pilots, British pilots, Canadian pilots and Australian pilots. They have allowed me to sit with them so that I could know what their troubles were. Once an India pilot told me near Geneva that they were having a hell of a trouble with the Income tax people. The hon. Minister is a very competent man, he is a very decent man and he is a great gentleman. I would like to know whether he has sat with pilots to know what their difficulties are. (Interruptions) No, I am not yielding. I have sat with railway engine drivers in Calcutta, Bombay and Madras and other places just to know the hardships of the drivers. It is not easy to sit and travel in an engine. I am not an Engineer or a scientist. But I just wanted to know their difficulties.

Secondly, I want to ask the Minister whether the pride of our pilots has gone

away. They were efficient, they never used to drink before getting into the planes and they were really top class people. They were the best in the world. And, above all they were mostly teetotallers. Today, it is all gone. There was Captain Isaac. I met his family before crash. He was drunk and the plane crashed. Now you have introduced so many conditions. But that is all after the horse has run away. How many Air Force pilots have we got into Indian Airlines and Air India? When they are in the Air Force, they are prepared to die for their motherland. Many of them have sacrificed their lives. Many wives have lost their husbands. But the moment they come over here, they become black-mailers. They draw the highest salaries and they stop the planes in order to get more and more money. I want to know whether Capt. Bhattacharya was asked not to touch his plane as reported by Mr. Gatte, a former Manager of Hindustan Aeronautics, as published in his article "Asian Skyways". Then, Sir, I would like to know something about the fire services.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please wind up now.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: Just one minute. Sir, I have been fighting about the fire services for years together and I had been mentioning about the fire services quite often in the Lok Sabha. I had stated that we must have the best, top class and internationally accepted fire-fighting equipment. But, today, we have no such fire-fighting equipment and our planes and passengers suffer.

Then, Sir, I want to know from the honourable Minister as to why he is so averse to taking MPs on his Air Enquiry Committees. He takes his staff on the committees. Why not MPs? He has many people on his staff who should go and who should not be there at all. In early fifties when there were Enquiry Committees, MPs were there. We made this plea that MPs should also be taken on these Enquiry Committees. But it has not been accepted by them.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Alva, please finish.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: He has just taken off.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But he must land now.

SHRI JOACHIM ALVA: One last word, Sir. We are very much happy with the Report of Mr. Justice Sachai. He has not rated enough the tragedy of defective instruments and other facilities. But we are happy, that Civil Aviation Minister has brought in Air Marshal Lal now, one of the most patriotic officers. In the Lok Sabha we saw that Shri V. Shankar, then could not hold the double duties of Secretary of Communications, Ministry and Chairmanship of I.A.C., and boss over a most efficient, patronic General Manager, Air Marshal Lal.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right, Mr. Alva. Yes, Mr. Minister.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Sir, the honourable Member has asked many questions. But he has also asked whether I sit with the pilots or not. Yes, I do. In fact, whenever I fly, I take the opportunity to go into the cockpit and talk with the pilots. I talk with them in the air. Not only do I talk with them, but also I have made it a point to call the President and the General Secretary of the Indian Commercial Pilots' Association and I have discussed with them, because, as he says quite rightly, the pilots must behave in such a manner that the nation is proud of them. I do not want to denigrate the pilots as a lot and it is very unfortunate and painful for me that pilots' errors and pilots' shortcomings have been so prominent in the last year.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: You have talked to them?

DR. KARAN SINGH: Yes, I have spoken to them.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: With the officers also?

DR. KARAN SINGH: Which officers?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Your departmental officers.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Of course, I talk to the departmental officers also. Here I am talking about the pilots and I said that

[Dr. Karan Singh]

I talk to them and there are certain pilots in the IA and AI also with whom I have talked. Then, I do not know about Mr. Bhattacharji about whom he made a mention.

As far as the fire services are concerned, as I said, we have done a lot and new orders for crash fire tenders have been placed and these, we hope, will come as soon as possible.

As far as the question of including the MPs is concerned, the House is there and the Consultative Committee attached to my Ministry is there and, therefore, I do not think I should unnecessarily burden the MPs with the work of getting involved in accident committees.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Thillai Villalan.

SHRI THILLAI VILLALAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I will put only a one-line question for clarification because you do not allow me to put all the questions that I have.

I am putting this question with a heavy heart since the air crash is highly deplorable and we have lost so many precious lives. Sir, I understand that the Indian Commercial Pilots' Association has brought to the notice of the honourable Minister then and there the violations of the rules of safety by the pilots, by the administrative officers, for years together. I have got many instances and they have quoted them.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please. Do not quote them.

SHRI THILLAI VILLALAN: I am not quoting. They have sent letters stating that their pilots have been suspended for endangering the safety of aircraft operation, violation of weather minima, certification of Boeing-737 by unauthorised engineers, safety of operation, etc., etc. I would like to know from the honourable Minister whether those violations of safety rules were brought to the notice of the Minister and what steps have been taken. I would like to know from the honourable Minister.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, you have put your question. Please sit down. Yes, Mr. Minister.

DR. KARAN SINGH. Sir, I am not aware of what precise points the honourable Member is mentioning. But I can assure him, Sir, and through him this House that any specific points that are brought to our notice with regard to the violations will certainly be looked into. May I, Sir, before I conclude, say one thing? Of course, I was out of India. But Dr. Mahishi was here. If the honourable Member, Dr. Z. A. Ahmad, would send us all the details of the incident that he has mentioned, it will give us an opportunity to find out everything.

STATEMENT BY MINISTER RE-CORRECTING STATEMENT MADE ON DECEMBER 4, 1972, ABOUT ACCIDENTS TO 22 UP NEW DELHI-HYDERABAD DAKSHIN EXPRESS AND 39 UP JANATA EXPRESS ON 2ND AND 3RD DECEMBER, 1972, RESPECTIVELY

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI MOHD. SHAFI QURESHI): Sir, on 4-12-1972, the then Minister of Railways had made a statement in the House regarding accidents to 22 Up New Delhi-Hyderabad Dakshin Express and 39 Up Janata Express which took place on 2nd and 3rd December, 1972 respectively. In regard to the accident to 22 Up Dakshin Express, he had stated that 2 persons sustained serious injuries and that the Commissioner of Railway Safety would be holding a statutory inquiry into this accident at Bina from the 8th of December, 1972.

A statutory inquiry by the Commission of Railway Safety is obligatory in case of accidents in which trains carrying passengers are involved and which are attended with loss of human life and/or grievous hurt to passengers or damage to railway property exceeding Rs. 50,000. It has, however, been clarified subsequently by the railway administration that in the case of the accident to 22 Up New Delhi-Hyderabad Dakshin Express on 2-12-1972, the injuries sustained by the two persons were of a minor nature. This being so, no statutory inquiry was necessary and was, therefore, not held. I may, however, add that an inquiry into this accident has already been held by the railway administration.