

The House reassembled after lunch at forty-five minutes past two of the clock, MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

#### ALLOCATION OF TIME FOR DISPOSAL OF GOVERNMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have to inform Members that the Business Advisory Committee at its meeting held today, the 1st August, 1972, allotted time as follows for Government Legislative and other Business to be taken up during the current Session of the Rajya Sabha : —

<i>Business</i>	<i>Time Allotted</i>
<b>1. Consideration and passing of—</b>	
(a) the Dentists (Amendment) Bill, 1972	.. 1 hour.
(b) The Payment of Gratuity Bill, 1972.	.. 2 hrs. .. 30 mts.
(c) The Diplomatic Relations (Vienna Convention) Bill, 1972.	.. 1 hr.
(d) The Disturbed Areas (Special Courts) Bill, 1972.	.. 1 hr.
(e) The Coking Coal Mines (Nationalisation) Bill, 1972.	.. 3 hrs.
<b>2. Consideration and passing of the following Bills (to replace the Ordinances) :</b>	
(a) The Delhi University (Amendment) Bill, 1972.	.. 3 hrs.
(b) The Indian Iron and Steel Company (Taking Over of Management) Bill, 1972.	.. 3 hrs.
(c) The Income-tax (Amendment) Bill, 1972.	.. 2 hrs.
<b>3. Consideration of a motion for reference of the Adoption of Children Bill, 1972, to a Joint Committee of both Houses.</b>	.. 1 hr.
<b>4. Discussion on the statement made by the Minister of External Affairs on 31st July, 1972, regarding Agreement on bilateral relations between India and Pakistan.</b>	.. 2 days.
<b>5. Short Duration Discussion regarding the steep rise in prices of essential commodities.</b>	.. 2 hrs. .. 30 mts.

The Committee recommended that from

Wednesday, the 2nd August, 1972, the House should sit up to 6-00 P. M. daily and beyond 6-00 P. M., as and when necessary, for the transaction of Government Business.

SHRI DWIJENDRALAL SEN GUPTA (West Bengal) : Some time may be allotted for discussion on the drought situation in the country.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You were not here. The whole of this morning we discussed that.

AN HON. MEMBER : Is it over ?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is over.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : (बिहार) : ओवर कैसे हो गया। अभी तो पूरा चित्र भी राज्यों से नहीं आया है कि किस प्रकार का बहो ड्राउट है और क्या व्यवस्था होगी।

#### THE DENTISTS (AMENDMENT) BILL, 1972

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF, HEALTH AND FAMILY PLANNING (DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADHYAYA) : On behalf of Shri Umashan-kar Dikshitji, I would like to move the Bill. But before that I would like to state in brief the objects and reasons of bringing this piece of legislation before the House.

Under the existing provision of the Act the dental qualifications are laid down by the Indian Dental Council. Now we propose to vest this power in the Central Government, so that some sort of uniformity may be achieved in respect of dental qualifications all over the country.

Secondly, we want to see that the education and training imparted for dental subjects is given some sort of standard. Some dentists have come to our country after the establishment of East Pakistan, now Bangla Desh and some have come as repatriates from Burma and Ceylon having long experience without necessary dental qualifications. They are finding difficulty in rehabilitating themselves and this aspect of the problem will also be looked after and provided for in this legislation.

Another consideration is to extend the scope of the existing Act to Jammu and Kashmir. Sir, through this piece of legislation, although not very big and comprehensive, certain definite objectives are sought to be achieved.

[Dr. Debi Prasad Chattopadhyaya] With these remarks, Sir, I move the Bill for consideration of the House.

*The question was proposed.*

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव (बिहार) :** श्रीमन् उपसभापति महोदय, मैंने माननीय मंत्री जी से डेंटिस्ट्स की क्वालिफिकेशन के सम्बन्ध में कुछ जानना चाहा था, लेकिन वह अपनी बात कहते गये और कुछ बताते गये, और उनका भाषण तो पहले ही आ गया। इंग्लैंड में और दूसरे देशों में दांत के डाक्टरों के लिए कोई विशेष कालेज की क्वालिफिकेशन की आवश्यकता नहीं है। वहां कोई भी आदमी ट्रेनिंग लेकर दांत की प्रैक्टिस कर सकता है। लेकिन यहां पर बड़े बड़े डेंटल कालेज हैं और नये नये कालेज भी खुलते जा रहे हैं। अभी तक सभी अस्पतालों में चाहे वे डिस्ट्रिक्ट हेडक्वार्टर पर हों या ब्लाक लेबिल पर के हों, दांत के लिए डाक्टर उपलब्ध नहीं हैं और मैं नहीं समझता कि दांत के डाक्टरों के लिए कालेज की किसी विशेष शिक्षा की आवश्यकता है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ कि विदेशों में दांत के डाक्टरों के लिए प्रशिक्षण की क्या व्यवस्था है और उनको कालेज की कितनी शिक्षा की आवश्यकता है। अगर वहां उनके लिए कालेज की शिक्षा की आवश्यकता नहीं, सिर्फ उनको ट्रेनिंग देकर ही काम कराया जा सकता है और कोई भी आदमी ट्रेनिंग लेकर इस काम को कर सकता है तो वहां पर उसी प्रकार की व्यवस्था क्यों नहीं की गयी।

दूसरी बात, हमारे मंत्री जी ने बड़े शहरों में डेंटल डाक्टरों की बात कही और साथ ही उन्होंने बर्मा, सीलोन और बंगला देश के विस्थापितों की बात भी कही, लेकिन उसके साथ हमको चीनी डाक्टरों को भी नहीं भुला देना चाहिए जिनको हम डेंटिस्ट के रूप में करीब सारे देश के शहरों में देखते हैं। उनका कोई रेफरेंस इसमें नहीं आया है। उनके लिये आप क्या व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं। उनकी क्या क्वालिफिकेशन होनी चाहिए, उनकी नेशनैलिटी क्या है और देश के प्रति उनका क्या कारोबार

है इसके बारे में हमारे मंत्री महोदय ने कुछ नहीं बताया।

एक बात और इस बिल को जम्मू काश्मीर के ऊपर भी लागू किया जा रहा है। बात तो छोटी सी है लेकिन इस प्रकार की बात यहां बार बार आना कि यह ऐक्ट जम्मू काश्मीर के सिवाय सब जगह लागू होगा या वहां भी इसको लागू किया जाय, जम्मू काश्मीर भारत का अभिन्न अंग है यह प्रश्न उत्पन्न करने के समान है। इसलिए मैं चाहूंगा कि सरकार इस सवाल को एक बार तय कर लें कि अगर कोई ऐक्ट बनता है तो वह सम्पूर्ण देश पर लागू होगा और संपूर्ण देश का तात्पर्य जम्मू और काश्मीर उसमें माना जाय, उसे देश का अंग माना जाय। काश्मीर को मिला करके या उसको छोड़ करके, ये जो दो वाक्य लिखे जाते हैं उसको हटाया जाय। हमारे यहां काश्मीर के लोग मिनिस्टर बन जाते हैं और सारी सुविधाएं ले जाते हैं किन्तु हम वहां बसना भी चाहें, रहना भी चाहें तो इसकी सुविधा दूसरे भारतीयों को नहीं दे सकते हैं। इससे देश और देशवासियों के प्रति भिन्नता प्रकट होती है इसलिए हम चाहते हैं कि इसका कुछ निदान हो।

दो तीन मुद्दों के सम्बन्ध में इस बिल में व्यवस्था रखी गई जैसे कि एप्वाइंटमेंट आफ विजिटर्स की बात है, तो मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहूंगा कि अभी तक विजिटर्स क्यों नहीं थे और आज जो विजिटर्स का एप्वाइंटमेंट हो रहा है उससे सचमुच में क्या निदान हो सकेगा और विजिटर्स के एप्वाइंटमेंट की क्या मर्यादा होगी। इसी तरह हमारे मंत्री महोदय क्वालिफिकेशन आदि सारी चीजों का विश्लेषण कर रहे थे लेकिन डाक्टर बन जाने के बाद इम्प्लायमेंट की जो समस्या है उसका कोई निदान इसमें नहीं रखा है। उसका भी निदान कुछ बिल में हो। ठीक है कि मंत्री महोदय ने कहा है कि बाद में देख लेंगे। तो इसको देखना चाहिए। इसी तरह युनिफार्मिटी की बात है। दांत के डाक्टर तो

हैं लेकिन इसके देहाती ढंग से इलाज करने वाले भी हैं। इसी प्रकार से आंख का आप-रेशन भी देहाती ढंग से चलता था और अभी भी चलता हो यह पता नहीं। उसी तरह से कहीं कान का इलाज भी देहाती ढंग से चलता है और पता नहीं उससे लोगों का कितना नुकसान होता होगा और उसमें क्या खूबियां हैं यह पता नहीं। तो इस प्रकार के अनेक देहाती ढंग से इलाज चलते हैं और दांत का भी इलाज देहाती ढंग से चलता है, मंत्री महोदय एक चीज से युनिफार्मिटी ला रहे हैं लेकिन ऐसी अनेक चीजें हैं जिनका निराकरण नहीं कर पा रहे हैं। तो जब यह अवसर ऐसी बात के लिये आया है तब वह इन बातों पर भी कुछ ध्यान दें तो देश उनका अनुगृहीत रहेगा।

वैसे बिल में हमारे दोस्तों ने कहा कि कुछ नहीं है और मैं मंत्री महोदय से सिर्फ यही निवेदन करूंगा कि इस बिल के सम्बन्ध में कुछ विशेष विवेचन के लिये थोड़ा और बता दें क्योंकि सचमुच में दांत की खराबी जो है वही आज सारी बीमारियों की एक जड़ हो गई है और इसलिये दांत को उखड़वाने की जबरदस्त प्रथा चल रही है क्योंकि डेंटल की डाक्टरी में दांत के रहते हुए इलाज कर नहीं पा रहे हैं तो मैं मंत्री महोदय से पूछना चाहूंगा कि क्या इस पर कुछ रिसर्च, कुछ अनुसंधान कराया गया है कि दांत के उखाड़ने के सिवाय भी कोई इलाज बचा हुआ है और दांत की खराबी बिना दांत को उखाड़े भी ठीक हो सकती है क्या? मैं चाहता हूँ कि सिर्फ ऐक्ट ही पास नहीं हो बल्कि दांत भी इम्पैक्ट रहे। तो क्या इसका भी कोई उपाय कर रहे हैं?

इन शब्दों के साथ मैं मंत्री महोदय का ध्यान इस बिल की कमियों की ओर दिलाता हूँ।

SHRI BALACHANDRA MENON (Kerala) : While I welcome this Bill, I should say that. ...

SHRI MAHAVIRTYAGI (Uttar Pradesh): Your teeth are natural ?

SHRI BALACHANDRA MENON : Yes ; half of them are natural ; half not and that

is my difficulty. And the same difficulty is there with this legislation ; it goes halfway but not full. I feel that the time has come when we should have a comprehensive Bill. Here it seeks to bring about uniformity. That is necessary. As with doctors, so with dentists, they are in certain selected areas and no help from dentists can be had in smaller towns, in village panchayats and other places. So,

3 p. M.

Government, when it comes forward with a legislation, must also think in terms of extending the benefits arising out of the dental help that we want to get in this country and in seeing that it goes to the rural areas too. There is a good deal of unemployment among the dentists. Therefore, it can very well be that if the Government charges a little from those people who want to go and get dental help, they can get some small fee. But let this service be extended even to rural areas ; the time has come for that. And we have not a good number of people also who will be prepared to go. But somebody should help them. And because there is so much of unemployment among doctors, dentists and others, you should now think in terms of finding jobs for them and also making use of their skill for helping the rural people, the people in the panchayats and small towns also. This can be done. I also suggest that even in the case of those boys in colleges and children in schools, they must also have dental examination by those qualified people so that we may know whether they have got pyorrhoea, this disease or that disease. Here is an opportunity for you. When there are so many unemployed people you can use all of them so that we have a good dental service and medical service down below also. I hope such an attempt will be made and the Government will take into consideration these things and see that this problem today is tackled not merely from the point of view of uniform educational qualifications and all that, but something more than that, also from the point of view of how we serve the people and how we make use of the services of these dental surgeons so that, whether in villages or in small towns or in cities, we get their services.

Thank you.

DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADH-YAYA : Sir, I am thankful to the hon. Members who referred to the problem of unemployed dentists or dental surgeons and also expressed the desirability of the extension of

[Dr. Debi Prasad Chattopadhyaya] the dental services to the rural people. Now these are very pertinent and also very important questions no doubt and Government are aware of them. Sir, what we are primarily trying to achieve in this Bill is to see that the qualifications recognised by the Dental Council of India are kept always up-to-date. In the existing Act there is no provision for incorporation of the qualifications recognised for the purpose of practising dentistry all over the country. So that now the legal gap or lacuna is removed by providing a clause in the body of the Act, so that a Schedule is provided wherein all the recognised qualifications will be indicated, and incidentally that achieves the purpose, as I said before, of bringing about a sort of uniformity of qualifications and training among the practising dentists in the country. Three categories of dentists are being recognised. First, those who have acquired their qualifications in the country ; secondly, those who have acquired their qualifications outside the country and thirdly, those who have been practising dentistry outside the country, in formerly East Pakistan, now Bangladesh, Burma and Ceylon but have since migrated to this country. They are being treated as a special category so that they may earn their livelihood. So, these three categories of dentists are being accorded recognition under terms of this Bill.

About qualification, it may be remarked that the sort of qualification which we insist on is fair. I do not think it is very high. We do not insist on that. We must see at least that the people who practise dentistry do not prove to be a sort of dental hazard to the patients. What sort of dental qualifications are laid down and insisted upon in the UK and other countries, I am not at the moment quite sure of, but about one thing we are sure. It is the responsibility of the Government to see that the qualifications of the dental surgeons are good enough to ensure quality of the service. Having that aspect in view, I have set some uniform and minimum necessary qualifications for the people concerned.

About the Chinese dentists, that is a dwindling tribe. There are only some 200 odd, not many. They are not posing any problem. If the Chinese dentists pose any problem ———

SHRI J. P. VADAV: They are mostly in Calcutta.

DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADHYAYA: It is not a big number. It is dwindling.

ing. The main question is whether the Chinese dentists pose any dental problem or a law and order problem. So far as the dental aspect is concerned, we are sure that they are not posing any dental problem. About the law and order aspect, I think the Home Ministry will look after that. We need not be worried about that.

The other question and a more important one is the question of unemployment. It is a very serious question, but it is a general question as well. Unemployment is a general problem. It is also prevalent among the medical practitioners. I do not think that the problem of unemployment among dentists is quite apart from the other problem. Government is quite aware of it. So, we drew up a proposal for tackling this problem. It was referred to the Planning Commission. Unfortunately the Planning Commission did not find it possible to accept our proposal at that stage. However, we are working on the proposal and we hope that after reformulating it we will send it soon back to the Planning Commission for its consideration. I think on second thoughts the Planning Commission might come to the help of the dentists. It is a serious problem, because per year approximately 370 dental graduates are coming out of the training centres and colleges, etc. qualifying themselves for practising. The jobs, which are being newly created in that sphere, are quite inadequate, much less than the number supplied by the dental colleges. I find that nearly 38 per cent of the qualified dentists are either unemployed or are underemployed, but in most cases unemployed. It is a pretty serious thing. It is true that there are some banks which offer financial assistance to the tune of Rs. 15,000 or something like that for medical clinics, including dental clinics. In the case of dental clinics it has proved to be inadequate, but even so some people are availing themselves of this opportunity.

Another problem which they are facing is regarding the quality of the equipment. Now, these problems are very much related and Government is looking into the matter. Once our proposal for tackling the unemployment problem among dental surgeons is finalised and referred back to the Planning Commission for scrutiny and examination, I hope a decision would be taken at that end and something would be done in the matter. Also, you may be aware that in the country as a whole and in the different States medical services, including dental services, are being expanded and extended to the

semi-urban and rural areas. With the growing expansion and extension of dental services in course of time, apart from the project I have referred to, I hope some more dentists will find employment. Of course like other medical subjects dental research also receiving serious attention of ICMR, and I understand they are financing some projects.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : बच्चों के दांतों के सम्बन्ध में क्या कर रहे हैं ?**

DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADH-YAYA : As I told you the ICMR has undertaken certain projects about these dental problems.

In our country teeth are generally well looked after unlike in western countries where the dentists have lucrative practice. Generally the people, particularly the educated people, look after their teeth well so that the teeth will look after them in their old age. It is more or less a hygienic habit. It is family tradition which counts most in the matter. So far as Government is concerned, we are trying our best to provide this sort of facilities in all modern hospitals.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : ब्लॉक लेवल पर कर दीजिए सब समस्या आसान हो जायगी ।**

DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADH-YAYA : We are looking into it and because it is a specialist service at the Block level this specialist service we have not yet been able to extend, but given time and steady and adequate supply perhaps in future we will be able to look after that. But we will feel glad

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : बच्चों के दांतों के सम्बन्ध में बहुत कम्प्लेन्ट हैं ।**

DR. DEBIPRASAD CHATTOPADH-YAYA : There is good reason for complaint because after all we are a poor country, there is a gap between demand and supply and complaint in that context is quite understandable.

With these remarks I think I have met the points raised by the hon. Member.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The question is :

"That the Bill further to amend the

Dentists Act, 1948, be taken into consideration."

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We shall now take up clause by clause consideration of the Bill.

*Clauses 2 to 28 were added to the Bill.*

*Clause I, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.*

DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADH-YAYA : Sir, I move :

"That the Bill be passed."

*The question was proposed.*

SHRI KRISHAN KANT (Haryana) : Mr. Deputy Chairman, the difficulty is that the hon. Minister has spoken more as an ordinary Member than as a Minister. He has referred to all the problems of the dentists and medical practitioners. But one point which I would like to bring to the notice of the House and the Government about prevention of dental diseases. In this respect the Soviet Union has taken a very leading part. One aspect is once the disease is there you treat it. But the other is to create conditions by propaganda, by instruction in the schools and colleges and by treatment of students while they are studying and inculcating in them such habits. Of course families do make habits, parents do make habits, but the schools and colleges also can do much to inculcate habits in children for prevention of disease and to take health to their doorstep. The majority of diseases in this country of stomach and other things arise from bad teeth. If the teeth are good, the general health can also be good. All the diseases travel from the mouth to the stomach. So the question of prevention of dental diseases, prevention of their early decay should be a subject to which the Government should give much more attention. I think it has been given. I do not think that the Minister in his reply to the First Reading has dealt with this problem. In many other countries like America, Europe and Japan, dental care is there. But in the Soviet Union, prevention of dental decay at an early stage, has been given importance. We should take a lesson from that and do something in this country. The Dental Council should take action, whatever schemes they have for propagation of the actual methods as to how dental decay should be preven-

[Shri Krishan Kant] ted, how the teetli should be cleaned, how the whole approach should be there—a detailed working of all this should be there and should be propagated amongst the schools, the colleges and also outside so that the disease would not spread. I would like to know whether the Government is doing anything in this regard. If they are not doing anything, will they see that something is done in this respect ?

DR. R. K. GHAKRABARTI (West Bengal) : The Minister has mentioned three categories of dentists—those who are qualified in this country, those who have qualified themselves outside of this country and those who have migrated. I would like to get clarification as to what will happen to those people who are practising dentistry for more than 20 years but who do not possess any academic qualifications. I want to know whether their cases will be considered and if so, how they will be judged, what would be the criteria. How many years of service or experience will be taken in to consideration ?

DR. DEBI PRASAD CHATTOPADH-YAYA : My friend, Shri Krishan Kant, has drawn my attention to a very important aspect, the importance of publicity in making people aware of good dental habits. Sir, I would have been very glad if we could spend the sum which, I presume, is spent in Soviet Russia on this, and it must be a very respectable sum. In Soviet Russia the problem is a bit different. Being a very cold country, the people there are not very keen to wash their teeth ; so the dental problem is much more serious there, is more acute in that country and the publicity is required to be more widespread. When I say this, I do not mean to say that there is no need for publicity here. There is of course the question of priority. The much more fundamental question of family planning is there, for instance. On that front we are concentrating more. In all towns publicity and propaganda are going on. Time permitting, fund permitting, we will certainly do something about it. And we will draw the attention of the State Governments with whom lies the primary responsibility in this regard to spend more in making the people aware of the good habits, in promoting good habits, regarding dental care and health.

About the point raised by Dr. Chakrabarti there are some practitioners who are registered in terms of the Dental Council Act simply because of the length of their service or work. Now, in this Act we have not dealt with parti-

cularly that aspect. We have only provided the qualifications which are enumerated and recognised as recognisable qualifications ; about them we have drawn up a sort of an inventory and attached it to the Schedule of the Act. That is what we have achieved. But we have seen both at the time of the enactment of the original Act and also at this stage that the qualifications that we have laid down are not enough to cover the whole area.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The question is :

"That the Bill be passed,"

*The motion was adopted.*

### THE ADOPTION OF CHILDREN BILL, 1972

*Motion for reference to Joint Committee of  
the Houses*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE  
MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI NITI  
RAJ SINGH CHAUDHURY) : Sir, I beg to move :

"That the Bill to provide for the adoption of children and for matters connected therewith be referred to a Joint Committee of the Houses consisting of 45 members; 15 members from this House, namely :

1. Shri Nageshwar Prasad Shahi
2. Shri S. D. Misra
- : Shri Man Singh Verma
4. Shri Dahyabhai V. Patel
5. Shri S. Kumaran
- G. Shri V. V. Swaminathan
7. Shri Todak Basar
- !! Shrimati Sushila Shankar      Adivarekar
9. Shri B. R. Munda
10. Shri M. R. Krishna
11. Shri Joachim Alva
12. Shri Maqsood Ali Khan
13. Shri B. C. Bhagwati
14. Shri Shankarlal Tiwari
15. Shrimati Lakshmi Kumari Chundawat

and 30 members from the Lok  
Sabha ;

that in order to constitute a meeting of the  
Joint Committee the quorum shall