MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, this is not the way of seeking clarifications. While he is replying, if you go on interrupting in between ...(Interruptions)... No, no, it is wrong. (Interruptions). Please sit down. Please ...(Interruptions)... This is not correct. Mr. Jothi, nobody is speaking why should you alone speak?

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: In the meanwhile Andhra Pradesh gave a proposal. That has been cleared. Pondicherry has given a proposal. That is under examination. There are some other proposals which are under examination. Therefore, we take a non-discriminatoy attitude on the approach of these matters. All States are part of India. I am the Finance Minister for the whole of the country. As an when the Tamil Nadu Government gives me proposal, money will be made available for the de-salination plant.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, it is very difficult to discuss Tamil Nadu problem in this House.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Finally, Sir Arun asked me about the retrospective amendments. I will deal with it in greater detail in the Finance Bill. But, I just want to point out that, apart from the ITC case, the orther retrospective amendments are, in fact, in one case, intended to give relief to Lijjat Papad, the other one is intended to implement the judgment of the CSTAT, where they said a head-note was missing and in other case the CSTAT said, 'you have provided for reversal of credit. But, there is a lacuna that after the reversal of credit you cannot recover the amount.' These are procedural ones, which don't substantively change the taxation law. The only retrospective amendment which has a significant revenue impact is ITC case. Anyway, I will deal with that in the Finance Bill.

Finally, I want to conclude by saying that the most important paragraph of the Budget Speech, according to me, is paragraph 100. It is not enough to have outlays; We must have outcome. For too long in this country we were carried away by the outlays—how much has this department spent, how much does this Minister have in the Plan and Non-Plan, how much has been given to such and such project, etc. We are now measuring outlays. We have to measure outcomes. And, I am happy to inform you that the hon. Prime Minister has yesterday written a letter to all the Ministries and departments and I quote that letter. It says, "For achieving our common objective to improve the quality of implementation of

developmental programmes, it is necessary to examine the programmes/ schemes being implemened and convert the financial outlays into physical outcomes with quaterly targets in respect of each. Keeping in view the importance of the matter, I..." --Prime Minister-" request you to carryout this exercise urgently and let me have a report by the 31 st March, 2005, in respect of the developmental programme/schemes being implemented by Ministry/department." So, by 31st March, I am confident, the hon. Prime Minister will have a complete Report on the outcomes of each department. I hope to compile these Reports and also hope, with the hon. Prime Minister's approval, to present it in a suitable manner to Parliament so that at the end of the year Parliament will be able to ask the Government, 'what have you delivered for the entire country?' I am confident that this Budget and this Government will deliver developmental outcomes as well as another year of high growth and I ask the support of the whole House... {Interruptions)...

†**श्री शाहिद सिद्दिकी :** सर, इन्होंने उत्तर प्रदेश के बारे में एक शब्द नहीं कहा है.....(व्यवधान)....

श्री कमाल अख्तर : सर, मंत्री महोदय ने उत्तर प्रदेश के लिए कुछ भी नहीं कहा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

### **GOVERNMENT BILLS**

### THE APPROPRIATION (VOTE ON ACCOUNT) BILL, 2005

## AND

# **APPROPRIATION BILL, 2005**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, you move the Appropriation (Vote on Account) Bill, 2005 and the Appropriation Bill, 2005.

THE FINANCE MINISTER (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of a part of the financial year 2005-06, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

<sup>†</sup>Transliteration of Urdu script.

Sir, I also beg to move:

That the Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 2004-05, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The questions were proposed.

†श्री शाहिद सिद्दिकी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, उत्तर प्रदेश की बात नहीं की गई है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री कमाल अख्तर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उत्तर प्रदेश के साथ यह व्यवहार ठीक नहीं है। यह माइनॉरिटीज का सवाल है।...(व्यवधान)...

†श्री शाहिद सिद्दिकी: सर, उत्तर प्रदेश के बारे में एक भी बात नहीं कही गई है। उत्तर प्रदेश का यह अपमान बरदाश्त नहीं किया जाएगा। हम वोटिंग में हिस्सा नहीं लेंगे, हम सदन से बाहर जाते हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

[तत्पश्चात् कछ माननीय सदस्य सदन से उठकर चले]

MR. DUPUTY CHAIRMAN: The question is:

"That the Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of a part of the financial year 2005-06, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The motion was adopted.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we shall take up Clause-by-Clause consideration of the Bill.

Clauses 2 to 4 and the Schedule were added to the Bill.

<sup>†</sup>Transliteration of Urdu script.

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill be returned."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the motion regarding the Appropiation Bill, 2005 to vote. The question is:

"That the Bill to authories payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 2004-05, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The motion was adopted.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we shall take up Clause-by-Clause consideration of the Bill.

Clauses 2.3 and the Schedule were added to the Bill.

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill be returned."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

### **MESSAGES FROM LOK SABHA**

- (i) The Goa Appropriation (Vote on Account) Bill, 2005.
- (ii) The Goa Appropriation Bill, 2005.

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report to the House the following messages received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:—

(I)

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Goa Appropriation (Vote on Account) Bill, 2005, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 18th March, 2005.