

RAJYA SABHA

Friday, the 20th November, 1970 the 29th

Kartika 1892 (Saka) The House met at eleven of the clock, MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

AGRICULTURAL COMMISSION

- *236. DR. SALAG RAM :
SHRI RAJENDRA PRASAD
SINMA : SHRI KRISHAN
KANT : SHRI ARJUN ARORA :
SHRI J. P. YADAV : SHRI
FABUBHAI M. CHINAI: SHRI
CHITTA BASSU : SHRI M. K.
MOHTA : SHRI R.L. N. PRASAD .

Will the Minister of FOOD AND AGRICULTURE be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have appointed an Agricultural Commission;

(b) if so, what is its composition and terms of reference; and

(c) whether an interim report will be submitted and if so, by when it will be submitted?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FOOD, AGRICULTURE, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND COOPERATION (SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE) (a) Ye, Sir. The Government of India have set up the National Commission on Agriculture.

(b) and (c) A statement is placed on the Table of the Sabha [See Appendix LXXIV Annexure No. 39]

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : May I know from the hon. Minister whether when constituting the Commission it was seen that the members had belief in the basic agricultural policy of land to the tiller? Is it also a fact that there is a proposal under consideration to appoint an official as the Vice-Chairman of the Commission? Secondly, may I know whether the Commission will look into the problem of unemployment and under-employment in the rural areas in the agricultural sector, which is going to be a very important problem? Unless unemployment in the rural sector goes,

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Krishan Kant.

tensions will continue in spite of the green revolution. May I know whether the Commission will look into these things and give a report on them?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : Sir, regarding the first point raised by the hon. Member about the composition, of course, we do not go into the minds of the members to know their views about a particular problem. On this Commission we have some Members of Parliament and many experts, eminent experts. For instance, there are experts like Dr. Khusro, Dr. Swaminathan, Mr. T.A. Pai, Mr. B.S. Nag, Mr. Hari Singh, Mr. Panikkar, Dr. Bhattacharya and Mr. Mukherjee. There are also four Members of Parliament. Mr. M.V. Krishnappa, Mr. Randhir Singh, Dr. Z.A. Ahmed and Sardar Jogindra Singh. About the unemployment problem to which the hon. Member made a reference, we have considered that it is one of the urgent problems which the country is facing. Therefore, this is one of the problems on which interim recommendations are expected to be made by the Commission. The Commission has been given two years' time to make their final recommendations. But the Government feels that there are certain urgent problems on which the Commission will be expected to make interim recommendations. I hope the recommendations regarding employment would be useful and the Government would be able to implement those recommendations.

श्री राजनारायण : जरा मंत्री जी यह साफ कर दीजिए कि यह मेम्बर पार्लियामेंट किस-किस पार्टी से संबंधित हैं।

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा : जब आप का सप्लीमेंटरी आयेगा तब इस को पूछियेगा।

श्री राजनारायण : यह सप्लीमेंटरी नहीं है।

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : There is one question to which the hon. Minister has not given a reply. I asked whether they are proposing to have an official or retired official as Vice-Chairman of the Commission. Secondly, the green revolution—whatever you may call it, it may change to a red revolution—has touched only 5 to 10 per cent of small land holdings. Is the Government going to see that the green revolution and science and technology go to the small peasantry also? Unless this green revolution and science and technology go to the small peasantry—through service co-operatives and

all that—there will be no real change in the rural agricultural sector. What is the Government going to do about it? Then, the question of land reforms is also mentioned in this statement and on this a report is expected to be given within six months. May I know how the Government will see that these recommendations on land reforms are implemented, what mechanism will be there and what punitive action will be taken if the land reforms are not implemented? If land reforms are not implemented, no grant should be given to those States for agricultural development, because land reforms and agricultural production are so much interlinked. In this regard may I know whether the Government has issued any instructions that big land chunks for big business houses should not be allowed in this country? Have any instructions been issued or will the Commission look into it? What is the Government's policy in regard to this?

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : About some body being appointed as the Vice-Chairman, at the moment there is no such proposal before the Government of India. Regarding the green revolution touching only a smaller section of the farmers, the Government is also seized of this problem. It would not be correct to make a fiat statement that the green revolution is confined to a smaller section. By and large it is true, but take, for instance States like Punjab where large sections of the farming community have benefited as a result of the new technology, new development, in agriculture. But by and large, it is true that in major parts of the country this prosperity has not touched large sections of the farmers. Therefore, the Government has been making very specific endeavours to see how these large sections of peasants, particularly the small landholders and marginal farmers, can benefit from the new development in agriculture. As regards the land reforms we will attach the highest importance to the recommendations of the Commission. The Commission is a very important one because this is the first time that the Government has appointed such a Commission after independence. We will give the highest importance to its recommendations and do everything possible within Governments powers to implement its recommendations—which are accepted by Government.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : It is amazing that the Minister says that the minds and views

of the members appointed to the Commission were not taken into consideration. If at all, it shows that the Government has no sense of direction. The views of the members should have been taken into consideration and their minds on the basic problems of land and agriculture should have been probed before they were appointed on this high-power commission.

SHRI A. D. MANI : You must have a psychiatrist.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Psychiatrists and astrologers will not do. Politicians alone would have helped in the matter. It is really strange...

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : The Chair cannot control the Question Hour. What is the fun of all this? After all, there are some rules according to which supplementaries are to be put. That is very important.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Tyagiji I will talk to you about rules after 12 o'clock.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : Mr. Deputy Chairman, how long can you go on like this?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What's your grievance, Mr Tyagi?

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : My grievance is that the Chair is not controlling the supplementaries. ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I know in this House questions have been put in this fashion before also. This is not the first time that supplementaries are prefixed by observations. I think the observation made by Shri Tyagi is uncalled for. He is a very senior Member and he should appreciate the position. Now Mr. Arjun Arora, please put your question.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : You know why I said it...

SHRI S.N. MISRA : Probably a commission should be appointed to probe their minds.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : वह क्वेश्चन ही ऐसा है कि इस पर बड़ा क्वेश्चन पूछा ही जाएगा ।

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा : जी हाँ, जरूर, जरूर ।

श्री राजनारायण : त्यागी जी की जो भावना है वह अपनी जगह पर ठीक है और हम

श्री यह धीरे-धीरे महसूस कर रहे हैं कि सदन को आप कंट्रोल कर नहीं रहे हैं।

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिये।

श्री राजनारायण : अगर चेयर पालिटिक्स खेलेगा तो उसको हम लोग बर्दाश्त नहीं करेंगे। सप्लीमेंटरी के तरीके होते हैं। मंत्रियों के उत्तर देने के तरीके होते हैं अगर मंत्री लेक्चर देगा और सप्लीमेंटरीज लेक्चर के होंगे तो सदन में इसी तरह से अव्यवस्था होगी।

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा : पहले तो राजनारायण और अर्जुन अरोड़ा दोनों लेक्चर नहीं देंगे।

श्री राजनारायण : मैं अर्जुन अरोड़ा की भावना से कतई इतिफाक करता हूँ। जब वह न मरज जानते हैं, न माइंड जानते हैं तो क्या खाने के लिये, कमाने के लिये इस तरह से कर रहे हैं बेकार में सदन का समय ले रहे हैं।

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री राजनारायण : क्यों बैठ जाऊँ। क्या हमारा समय नहीं है, क्या हम सदन के मेम्बर नहीं हैं।

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा : आपने बहुत अच्छी बात कही है।

श्री राजनारायण : हमारा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है।

SHRI ARJUN <VRORA : Mr. Deputy Chairman, I will put my supplementaries after all this is over.

SHRI S.N. MISHRA : There is a general feeling that we are not using to the best advantage the instrument of questions which is one of the most effective instruments in the hands of the House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Is this the first occasion ?

SHRI S.N. MISHRA : No. But things are worsening. The situation is worsening. I know the anxiety of the Chair also...

AN HON. MEMBER : You are responsible for this.

SHRI S.N. MISHRA : May be I am responsible. The Chair also shares the anxiety of the Members on this point. We have had so many meetings in this connection. It may well be that we have reached a limit in this and therefore the Chairman should make further efforts to see that this instrument of questions is put to the best advantage of the House so that we are able to cover as many questions as possible.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : It is a very correct observation.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am glad that the Leader of the Opposition has expressed the same sentiments which other responsible Members of this House have. I would reiterate the same and seek the cooperation of the House so that this Question Hour can be utilised to the maximum benefit of the Members. Therefore, let there be no points of order and let us proceed with our business. I will appeal that the questions should be as brief as possible.

श्री राजनारायण : श्रीमन्, हमारा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर सुनिए।

श्री उपसभापति : प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर मत रेज कीजिए। उसमें क्वेश्चन आवर चला जाएगा। मेहरबानी करके बैठिए।

श्री राजनारायण : आप कृपा करके हमारा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर सुन लीजिए। मैं आपसे जानना चाहता हूँ कि आपने इस क्वेश्चन को अलाऊ क्यों किया? मैं आपसे चाहता हूँ, आप सब सप्लीमेंटरीज आज बंद कर दीजिए। क्यों मंत्री महोदय ने यह उत्तर दे दिया कि उन्होंने न तो किसी का मन्तव्य जाना, न तो उन्होंने किसी का माइंड जाना जब कि कृषि आयोग बनाने की बात है। जिस व्यक्ति का कृषि से कोई सम्बन्ध नहीं, जानकारी नहीं, जब मंत्री जी ने खुद पहले ही कह दिया, विदाऊट नोइंग हिज न्यूज, तो हम एक तरह से टाम डिक एन्ड हेरो किसी को उसमें लगा दें, इस पर मैं चाहता हूँ कोई सप्लीमेंटरी न हो, न देश का पैसा बर्बाद हो, न सदन का समय बर्बाद हो। यह हमारा प्वाइंट है। अब आप दूसरा सवाल ले लीजिए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. Shri Arjun Arora. Please be brief.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : I will be very brief. May I know why the views on the important question of land tenure of the members appointed on the commission were not taken into consideration? Secondly, may I know why the commission has been so constituted that out of 18 members only 7 are non-officials and the rest are officials? Why has not the government taken care to avoid the impression that this important commission is official dominated? Thirdly, may I know why any questions pertaining to land tenure have not been included in the terms of reference? I think this should be the model of brevity.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : Some of the Members of Parliament who are members of the commission. . .

श्री राजनारायण : श्रीमन्, देखिए, वह पार्लियामेंट के मेम्बर किस पार्टी के हैं, बताना चाहिये। कृपा करके बता दें कि किस पार्टी के हैं।

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : They are eminent Members of both the Houses and I do not think we should challenge the *bona fides* of any Member. I have already mentioned the names of the Members. I will read again the names of the Members. They are Shri M.V. Krishnapa. . .

SHRI S.N. MISHRA : Which party does he belong to?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : Shri Randhir Singh. Shri Z.A. Ahmed and Sardar Jogindra Singh.

श्री राजनारायण : अब कांग्रेस (आर) और कम्युनिस्ट। यह खिलाने की पार्टी बन गई। देश के पैसे पर इन लोगों को खिलवाया जाए। चेयरमैन हो गए सुब्रमण्यम, कांग्रेस की चेयरमैनी से हट गए और कृषि आयोग के चेयरमैन बना दिये गये। देश कहाँ जा रहा है? देश जहन्नम में जा रहा है।

श्री उपसभापति : अब आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री राजनारायण : उनकी पे क्या है और क्या-क्या सहूलियतें उन्हें दी जाती हैं?

SHRI A.P. SHINDE : Sir, I would like to make a submission that it would not be correct to say that this Commission is dominated by officials. There is an overwhelming majority of non-officials in this.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: No, no.

SHRI A.P. SHINDE: I would request him to look closely into this. For instance, about Shri C. Subramaniam, we may differ as far as his political thinking is concerned. Whatever may be his political thinking, his knowledge about agriculture is well known.

श्री राजनारायण : चेयरमैन की नालेज है मोती के दानों को असली से नकली बनाने में। तो मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि उनकी पे क्या है और सहूलियतें क्या हैं?

SHRI A.P. SHINDE : Then, about Shri S.K. Mukherji.

श्री राजनारायण : उनको तनख्वाह, भत्ता और सहूलियतें क्या देते हैं, यह तो बतलायें?

SHRI A.P. SHINDE: Shri S.K. Mukherji was Vice-Chancellor of Kalyani University, Bengal. Then, Dr. Bhattacharji. He is not a Government Officer now. He was the Animal Husbandry Commissioner. He is a knowledgeable person of international repute in the field of animal husbandry. Then, Dr. Swaminathan. He is a leading scientist not only in India, but he is known outside India also. I think this House knows his abilities and the contribution made by him to the agricultural development in this country. Then, Shri D.P. Singh. He is the Vice-Chancellor of Pant Nagar University. I think the Pant Nagar University today occupies an important place in the life of this country and it has made a valuable contribution and I do not think Shri D.P. Singh's association with this Commission should be a matter of controversy at all. Then, Sir, Shri T.A. Pai. The House is well aware that he is not a politician and he is not concerned with any political party as such. He has made a very special contribution in the field of rural credit, and the work of Canara Bank is well known.

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY : Syndicate Bank.

SHRI A.D. MANI: Syndicate Bank.

SHRI A.P. SHINDE: Yes, you are right. It is Syndicate Bank. Then, Shri Nag. He is a special officer having special knowledge in matt-

ers of irrigation i. Shri Nag was formerly Adviser in the Ministry of Irrigation and Power. Then, Sir, Shri A.N. Khusro, who is an economist and hi, standing in the field of agricultural econormics is well known. Then, Shri Hari Singh. He is the former Inspector-General of Forests. This being a comprehensive Commission, somebody representing forests should be theie. Now, Shri Hari Singh is a man who has a v :ry special knowledge in the field of forestry ami has done, during the last twenty years, considerable work in this particular field. Then, Sir, Dr. Panikkar and he is also a person wh< is internationally known and who has worked in the field of fishery. I do not, therefore, think that we should rush to conclusions and make charges which are not correct charges. I do not mind criticism and when some hon. Member has some valid criticism to make, he is free to make. But we have tried our best....

श्री राजनारायण : उनको पे क्या मिलनी है, भत्ता क्या मिलता है और क्या-क्या गढ़लियतें मिलती हैं ?

श्री उपसभापति : राजनारायण जी, आप बाद में पूछ लीजियेगा ।

SHRI A.J. SHINDE: But, we have tried our level best to see that only those in the field of agriculture are properly represented on the Commission. Mr. Rajnarain can put that question later. Then, there is only one point which remans to be replied. It is about Shri Arora's point about land reforms and the views of the membe rs. As I said, Sir, while nominating persons, we do not go into the views of the individual me -nbers. I may say that as far as the basic policy regarding land reforms is concerned, it is evolved in the forums like the Chief Minister's Conference, National Development Council, Planning Commission, etc. So, our basic policy regarding land reforms is evolved in these forums and the Government of India's commitment to implement radical land reforms in this country are well known and hon. Members should not unnecessarily level charges whicri are not valid.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yadav, please..... I have called Mr. Yadav.

श्री जगदन्धी प्रसाद यादव : श्रीमान उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, इस समिति के गठन और उसके अध्यक्ष

के नाम के सम्बन्ध में जैसे ही सूचना मंत्री महोदय ने दी थी ठीक उसके साथ ही मैंने मंत्री महोदय को 31 अगस्त को एक चिट्ठी लिखी थी कि इस समिति के बनाने का औचित्य क्या है, इस समिति का गठन किस प्रकार से किया जायेगा, उसका आधार क्या रहेगा और इन्होंने पत्र लिखा कि 'भारतीय कृषि' के विभिन्न पक्षों के लिए 'आयोग के गठन के सम्बन्ध में आपका पत्र 31 अगस्त 1970 को मिला । मैं इस मामले को देख रहा हूँ और इस बारे में आप को शीघ्र ही लिखने की आशा करता हूँ'। आज इतना काम आगे बढ़ गया, क्या-क्या हुआ लेकिन मंत्री महोदय ने—राज्य मंत्री और पूर्ण मंत्री दोनों को लिखने के बाद भी—इसके औचित्य के सम्बन्ध में जो जवाब देने के लिए कहा था वह दिया नहीं । इस लिए मैंने चिट्ठी का जवाब उनसे मांगा है । दूसरे मैं उनसे प्रश्न पूछना चाहता हूँ कि इस कमेटी के एपोन्टमेंट का गठन करने का औचित्य क्या था ? क्या यह सत्य नहीं है कि श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम जिस समय भारत के कृषि मंत्री थे उस समय भारत में अन्न की अपार कमी हुई और पी० एल० 480 के द्वारा भारतवासियों का पेट भरना पड़ा ? जब वे कृषि मंत्री इस में असफल रहे तो क्या यह सही नहीं कि उन्हीं को हर तरह के चुनाव में पराजित होने के बाद और कांग्रेस अध्यक्ष के पद से हटने के बाद सम्पूर्ण हिन्दुस्तान का भ्रमण करने के लिए, पार्टी का प्रचार करने के लिए इसका अध्यक्ष बनाया गया है । इसी के सिलसिले में मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ और सदन की भी इच्छा है जानने की कि इसका अध्यक्ष होने के नाते कौन सी सुविधाएं, कौन सी फेसिलिटीज इनको प्राप्त हैं ।

दूसरा प्रश्न मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ । बहुत सी जमीन तयार की पड़ी है । जैसे बिहार में गंगा नदी है, जो देश में 1500 मील में बहती है इसके दोनों पाट में लाखों नहीं करोड़ों एकड़ जमीन है, इस जमीन पर आज तक कोई अनुसंधान, कोई रिसर्च, कोई भी डेवलपमेंट का कार्य नहीं हुआ है । क्या सरकार ने इस

समिति से तयार की जमीन के बारे में जानकारी करने को कहा है ?

श्री उपसभापति : दो सवाल आपने पूछ लिए ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैं आपसे अनु-रोध करना चाहूंगा कि इस कमेटी पर, इसके औचित्य पर, इसके कार्यक्रम पर आप सचमुच में चाहते हैं तो इस सदन में दो-तीन घंटे की डिबेट रख दीजिए ।

श्री उपसभापति : डिबेट होगी या नहीं, आप मोशन दे दीजिए ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैंने पत्राचार किया था, पत्राचार में भी इन्होंने जवाब नहीं दिया जिसके कारण प्रश्न पूछने पड़े और अब मैं चाहूंगा कि सरकार इस बारे में खुलासा करे ।

श्री उपसभापति : आपने दो-तीन प्रश्न पूछ लिए ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : दूसरे मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि एग्रीकल्चर के आधार पर इंडस्ट्री कैसे बेस होगी इसकी जांच करने का क्या उन्होंने अधिकार दिया है ? हम यही पूछना चाहते हैं कि उनकी जो सिफारिशें होंगी—बहुत सी कमेटियाँ नहीं हैं, उनकी सिफारिशें आती हैं, बहुत सी कोठारी आयोग की सिफारिशें पड़ी हुई हैं, उनका शतांश भी कार्यान्वित नहीं होता है—क्या उनको शतप्रतिशत कार्यान्वित किया जाएगा या उन पर फिर से सरकार विचार करेगी ?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : I have received the letter from the hon. Member. I am sorry if there has been some delay in replying to him but I have already written a letter to him and it is in transit perhaps. He may receive it in a day or two.

Regarding the chairmanship of the Commission, since Mr. Subramaniam happens to be associated.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : यहां पर मैं एक और क्लैरोक्लेशन चाहता हूँ । आपने चिट्ठी में लिखा कि गठन के आधार के सम्बन्ध में फिर लिख कर पूछ लूंगा, अब जब समिति कायम हो गई तो अब जो चिट्ठी आएगी उसमें क्या बात होगी ?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : I was referring to the point of Mr. Subramaniam being nominated as Chairman. Since Mr. Subramaniam happens to be associated with a political party, perhaps in this House opinions may differ whether he should have been made the Chairman or not but I would submit for the consideration of the House that though Mr. Subramaniam was the Minister of Food in a very difficult period—in 1966-67—but the whole strategy of new agriculture, if the Members are aware, was really formulated at the initiative of Mr. Subramaniam. In fact the basic reorganisation of the I.C.A.R which means the research activities in this country, and the basic for the green revolution in the country was laid as a result of the initiative and leadership provided by Mr. Subramaniam and the Government honestly and sincerely feels that Mr. Subramaniam is preeminently suited to guide the deliberations of this Commission and we hope he would be making valuable contribution for the development of agriculture as the Chairman of the Commission. Then, Sir

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : खाद्य की समस्या क्या है यह तो बता दीजिए । इस का औचित्य बताना पड़ेगा, ऐसे कैसे चलेगा ।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't interrupt please.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : About the facilities or amenities (*Interruptions*) which are being provided to the Chairman and Members of this Commission, we have several Commissions functioning at the moment, and we have not given any special facilities to this Commission. The same facilities, which are available to the Chairmen and Members of other Commissions, they are available to this Commission. As far as Members of Parliament are concerned . . .

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : This is no reply. Why not tell them ?

SHRI S.N. MISHRA: Give us the information as to what we are going to pay.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : How much is the Chairman paid per month ? What other amenities are given to the Chairman? This is about all that we want.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : आप के पास इसका कोई हिसाब है या नहीं ?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : To enable me to mention a specific figure I will require notice, but particularly as far as the Members of Parliament are concerned, when the House is in session they don't get anything.

SHRI MAHAWIR TYAGI : The pointed question is regarding the Chairman of this Commission.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : I will require notice for that. If I mention some figure.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : You are ignorant of the fact, of the pay of the Chairman.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : If I gave a figure, it may not be precisely correct.

श्री राजनारायण : क्या यह उत्तर है ?

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : On a point of order. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order please.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : I have also a point of Order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Lokanath Misra.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: The Minister while replying to questions read from the terms of reference which have been issued by the Government. Why should the Minister feel shy to give the information demanded in the supplementary question? And here why should not you give protection to the House?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Have you got the information?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : I have laid the terms of reference on the Table of the House. Whatever information is with me, I am prepared to lay it on the Table of the House also because I do not want to conceal anything. I would not like to conceal anything.

SHRI S.N. MISHRA: I want to raise again a point of order, We are entitled to full infor-

mation on the questions that we put, which we put after a great deal of labour to frame the questions. Now was it not a simple expectation that with regard to this question there would be supplementary questions with regard to the pay, emoluments, facilities, amenities and so on? These do not require much imagination on the part of the Minister, and even so he has asked for a fresh notice so far as supplementaries are concerned. Then what is the object in putting any question? I ask you if such simple expectations are not fulfilled during the Question Hour? I would demand that, if at all the Minister should ask for notice, he should give us full information on this in the afternoon. He may have that much of notice and give us the information. Otherwise, the House is entitled to know here and now what we are going to pay this hon. gentleman for the duties assigned to him.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : I will lay the information. . . .

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI: Why is the hon. Minister fighting shy of this information? Perhaps the Chairman is getting something which he is ashamed of making known to us. If that is the case, let us have it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down, Mr. Mani. (Interruptions)

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : I am prepared to lay the information on the Table of the House.

SHRI S.N. MISHRA : When ?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : At least 24 hours I will require. What is the harm? This means, possibly on Monday it will be possible. Therefore I have nothing to conceal in this regard. Suppose I had said something slightly incorrect, then I would have been questioned, and that is not proper because when I place something before the House, I must give precise and correct information.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right. Mr. Chitta Basu.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : श्रीमन् हमारा जवाब नहीं हुआ । केवल अध्यक्ष के बारे में बात चली और किसी का जवाब नहीं मिला । क्या सारे सवालों का जवाब नहीं मिलेगा । आप हम को प्रेसाइस क्वेश्चन पूछने के लिए कहते हैं और फिर दोहराने के लिए कहते हैं । हम ने पूछा

[श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव]

है कि इस कमेटी के एक्वाइटमेंट का औचित्य क्या था। इस के रेफरेंस में जो गंगा के मैदान के कृषक हैं उन के बारे में विचार करने का इस को अधिकार है या नहीं और उनके बारे में कोई इन्वेस्टीगेशन हुआ या नहीं। मैंने पूछा था कि एग्रीकल्चर वेस्ट इंडस्ट्री डेवलप करने के लिए ताकि किसानों और मजदूरों को काम मिल सके और उनकी आर्थिक स्थिति सुधर सके यह समिति विचार करेगी या नहीं और मैंने पूछा था कि जो सिफारिशें यह समिति देगी क्या सरकार उन को वैसी की वैसी स्वीकार कर लेगी या उन पर फिर से विचार करेगी। तो मंत्री जी मेरे किसी प्रश्न का जवाब नहीं दे रहे हैं। केवल एक बात का जवाब दिया है।

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिये सुन तो लीजिए।

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: Sir, I was interrupted. Had I been allowed to complete, naturally all these points would have been covered. As far as the processing industries connected with agriculture are concerned, the terms of reference of the Commission are so wide that the Commission can I believe make recommendation in regard to this. As to whether those recommendations would be properly attended to or not I have in fact earlier replied that the Government of India would give the highest consideration to its recommendations as and when they are available. As far as the specific terms of Gangetic plain and other things are concerned these are matters of details and if the Commission wants to make any recommendation regarding specific areas we would welcome them. If the hon. Member is good enough to look at the terms of reference, they are so comprehensive that any matter connected with agriculture can be gone into by the Commission.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : काम्प्रेहेंसिव नहीं है, इसी लिए मैंने श्रीमन्, खस कर के पूछा एग्रो-इंडस्ट्रीज के बारे में। एग्रो-इंडस्ट्रीज के बारे में आप ने नहीं कहा।

श्री उपसभापति : वह टर्मस आफ रेफरेंस में सब कुछ आ रहा है।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : जी हां, मैंने पढ़ कर देखा है, नहीं है। इसको बनाने के पहले विचार करके देखा है और तब मैं श्रीमान से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि अभी भी उसके बारे में . . .

श्री उपसभापति : यह तीसरी या चौथी बार आप पूछ रहे हैं, बार बार आप उठते हैं।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : श्रीमन्, मैंने आपसे पहले भी आग्रह किया था जब कि आपने कहा था कि रिसर्पांसिबिल मेम्बरस को प्रेसाइज ढंग से सवाल करना चाहिये और इसीलिये मैंने वैसा किया और श्रीमन्, जब तक बात पूरी नहीं होगी, जब तक मंत्री महोदय एक एक बात का उत्तर नहीं देंगे तब तक कैसे होगा।

श्री उपसभापति : उन्होंने आपके सवाल का जवाब दिया, टर्मस आफ रेफरेंस के बारे में जवाब दे दिया।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : एग्रो-इंडस्ट्रीज और गैजेटिक प्लेन के बारे में मैंने पूछा था।

श्री उपसभापति : उन्होंने कह तो दिया।
They shall look into it.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : श्रीमन् इस टर्मस आफ रेफरेंस में वह नहीं है, मैंने पढ़ कर देखा है।

श्री उपसभापति : उसमें नहीं होगा, टर्मस आफ रेफरेंस में नहीं होगा। Do you want to add anything, Mr. Shinde?

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE Sir, normally I would not like to offend the feeling of any hon. Member but I am sorry for the ignorance of the hon. Member. One of the terms of reference is very specific.

"Development of transport, marketing and storage and processing industries with particular reference to food processing to support the programmes for growth in agricultural production, including horticulture and animal husbandry."

And I have also said that all matters connected with agricultural processing industries can be gone into by the Commission. He was referring to agro-industries and this one covers that aspect.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: Sir, it has been said that the terms of reference have been prepared bearing in mind the context of the agricultural situation of our country. May I know from the hon. Minister whether it is not a fact that the present agricultural pattern of our country is rich-peasant oriented and the Government wants to develop the strata of rich peasants in the rural areas?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please put your question now.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : You have not listened to me. What was I saying? I am putting my question. You have been biased against me and that is why you are saying, put your question.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no question of any bias. Please put your question.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : I was framing my question. I asked whether it is not a fact that the agricultural pattern of our country is rich peasant oriented and the Government of India's policy is to further enrich these rich peasants in order to create them as a social base for their political power. If that is not so why has no mention been made in the terms of reference about the condition of agricultural labour in our country? Will the Agriculture Commission look into this matter also? I also want to know about the indebtedness of the agricultural peasants and whether this Commission would also go into the matter of rural indebtedness. Finally I also want to know about rural unemployment. It is also a very big problem as has been admitted by the Minister himself.

May I know whether he can give us the details of the programme in order to solve the rural unemployment problem? All these things have not been specifically referred to in the terms of reference. I hope that it will be attended to and specific replies will be given to me.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: I have great respect for the hon. Member and I think when he participates in debates he comes prepared, looks into papers and studies the matter, but today he is completely off the mark.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : No, No.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: Please bear with me. For instance, he made a complaint that there is no specific reference to the conditions of agricultural labour and that it is an impor-

tant subject. Now, I would like to read it. It is from the terms of reference under the head 'employment and manpower.' It says:—

"Problems of small farmers and agricultural labour viewed in the context of social justice and equality of opportunity and as a factor in securing effective participation of the bulk of the Indian peasantry in stepping up agricultural production;" Now, I do not know how the hon. Member draws inferences which are not justified by the facts on record. Had he been careful enough, many of his questions could possibly have been avoided. I have full sympathy for his sentiments. Only I do not agree with him when he says that the whole approach of the Government of India is rich-peasant oriented. We do not subscribe to this. In fact, the interests of a very large number of poor farmers are dear to us and we wish to proceed in that direction.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : What about indebtedness? You have not mentioned it.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: All this can be gone into.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: Indebtedness and credit are not the same.

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE : Without looking into the credit problem, it can be gone into by the Agricultural Commission and the Government of India in detail. I realise that indebtedness is one of the important aspects of our rural economy. I assure him that if he wants I am prepared to suggest to the Agricultural Commission that this may be specifically examined.

SHRI M.K. MOHTA : It has been the experience of this House that innumerable committees and commissions are appointed by the Government. They take a very long time in coming to a decision and even thereafter a departmental enquiry goes on into their findings and decisions. Therefore, I would like to ask the hon. Minister whether it would not be advisable to split up the terms of reference, which are extremely wide in their scope, and have smaller terms of reference for several subcommittees under this Commission. I find that everything under the sun has been included, viz., agricultural, fishery, animal products, forestry, poultry, piggery, sheep, goats, etc. Nothing seems to have been left out.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : I wonder whether Congressmen are included in it.

SHRI M.K. MOHTA : Would it be advisable for this Commission to go into so many things ? To do justice to these subjects the Commission will take years and years. What are the Government's views in this respect ?

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : I appreciate the difficulty of the hon. Member, but agriculture is such an inter-related subject. How can you separate forestry, animal husbandry and such other subjects from agriculture? The reason is, as the House may appreciate, in the past, some fifty years earlier, a similar Commission was appointed during the British regime which was known as the Royal Commission on Agriculture.

As a result of the appointment of that Commission a number of recommendations were made and for the first time a well-knit agricultural administration developed in our country. The context had changed. Situations had changed. There was a need to have a comprehensive review of the agricultural policy. Therefore, various subjects have been included, but I appreciate the suggestion of the hon. Member that various Sub-Committees should go into it. We have specifically suggested to the Commission that they may set up Sub-Committees, if necessary, to go into the specialised subjects so that the Commission benefit from the experts in the various fields.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : May I know whether the total emoluments which the Chairman, Mr. Subramaniam, gets per month come to Rs. 4,000 or not ; whether Mr. Subramaniam goes about in the country on political business ; if so, why he draws his T.A. on the Commission's account ? He went to Cuttack last month where the students did not want him to address a meeting, because he went as Chairman of the Commission. That was the complaint of the students. The students complained that he had come as the Chairman of the Commission and therefore he should not address a political meeting, but he went on to do it and he was not allowed to address it. Therefore, I would ask the hon. Minister whether he is spending from the public exchequer in order to organise his party and address public meetings throughout the country in the pretext of having this Commission.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : As far as his emoluments are concerned, I have already assured this House that I am laying the state-

ment for the information of the hon. Members. Therefore, I would not like to refer to that point again.

SHRI CD. PANDE : About his T.A. ?

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : Everything would be included in that statement.

SHRI C. D. PANDE : The question is whether Government pays for it or not.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : When he goes as Chairman of the Agricultural Commission for the work of the Agricultural Commission, naturally he proceeds on Government work. But whether as Chairman of the Agricultural Commission he is prohibited from participating in political activity, I do not think that will be correct.

SHRI CD. PANDE : The point is whether Government pays for his travel or not.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He goes for the Commission's business. While going for the Commission's business he does other business.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : The point is it is a misuse of the privileges given to him.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : I would appeal to the hon. Members. Suppose if somebody, even a Minister, proceeds only for political work, naturally he is expected. . .

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : Minister is elected. He is a servant.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : He is not a servant.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : You are paying from your pocket. What else is he ?

SHRI A.D. MANI : Sir, on a point of order. One question is yet to be finished.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : I would only wish to appeal that I do not think we should make agriculture a controversial subject simply because we have some political differences; and Mr. Misra may have some grievances about Orissa politics, but I do not think he should bring those political differences here.

SHRI PITAMBER DAS : I would like to know if the hon. Minister was taken good care to tell the Commission that they have to send only these recommendations which may be acceptable to the Government.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : May I assure the hon. Member that Government would

not like to interfere with the work of the Commission. There are many eminent experts who are not politicians, and the Commission is free to make any type of recommendation it would like.

SHRI PITA UBER DAS: I am talking about the acceptability of the recommendation.

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE: We do not take into consideration what is acceptable. Unnecessarily we should not attribute motives to the Government's approach in this regard.

श्री गनशा लाल बाथरा : इस पाटा का भी एक आध क्वेश्चन करने दीजिए ।

श्री राजनारायण : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार ने चार संसद-सदस्यों को इसमें नियुक्त किया है, तीन तो इन्दिरा कांग्रेस के हैं और एक प्रौ-इन्दिरा कांग्रेस जेड० ए० अहमद हैं, ये इंडस्ट्री को तो रिप्रेजेंट कर सकते हैं लेकिन क्या ये एग्रीकल्चर को भी रिप्रेजेंट कर लेंगे ? क्या उसमें एस एस पी है, जनसंघ है, कांग्रेस-संगठन है, मार्क्सिस्ट कम्युनिस्ट पार्टी है ? मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या मूलभूत कारण है कि किसी आयोग के अन्दर सदस्यों की नियुक्ति के समय इस सरकार ने केवल इन्दिरा कांग्रेस से सम्बन्धित और भारतीय कम्युनिस्ट पार्टी से सम्बन्धित सदस्यों को उसमें नियुक्त किया ?

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : हमने इसी शंका के कारण उनको चिट्ठी पत्री लिखी थी कि आप आयोग किस तरह बनाने जा रहे हैं, इसी कारण उन्होंने इसका जवाब नहीं दिया ।

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए ।

श्री राजनारायण : मैं इसी के साथ साथ चाहता हूँ कि केवल चेयरमैन की तनख्वाह, भत्ते, सहूलियत के बारे में ही नहीं, इन मेम्बरों को भी क्या सहूलियत है, क्या भत्ता है, यह पूरी रिपोर्ट इस सरकार को इस सदन के सामने रखनी चाहिए । मूल प्रश्न यह है कि एक आल इंडिया किसान पंचायत है जिसके नेता—

(Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : आप सवाल पूछ लीजिए ।

श्री राजनारायण : यानी जो पढ़ा सकते हैं इन मंत्रियों को, गवर्नरों को, वे लोग नहीं पूछे जाते । राजनीतिक दृष्टि से एक मुख्य पार्टी को खिलाने के लिए यह आयोग बनाया जा रहा है । इस पर मेरी आपत्ति है ।

श्री उपसभापति : राजनारायण जी, आप सवाल पूछ लीजिए ।

श्री एस० डी० मिश्र : पूछने का तरीका है ।

श्री उपसभापति : इतना लम्बा नहीं होना चाहिए ।

श्री राजनारायण : इस आयोग में किस ढंग से लोगों की नियुक्तियाँ हुई हैं । उसकी अनुपयुक्तता को देखते हुए क्या सरकार इस आयोग को भंग करेगी और इसकी जगह पर दूसरा आयोग गठित करेगी ?

श्री महावीर त्यागी : यह खुद भंग हो जाएगी । भंग खिलाने के लिए यह नहीं है ।

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE: Sir, we selected members on the basis of their special interest in agriculture. For instance, about Dr. Ahmed, we may have differences with him, we may not agree with his party, but the whole of his life —

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, please. Do not interrupt him please,

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : Then, Sir....

SHRI S.D. MISRA : Was the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs consulted in this matter ?

SHRI ANNASAHAB SHINDE : The Commission being a limited one, however, desirable it may have been to give representation to the various political parties, it would have been very impracticable to give representation to all the parties.

श्री राजनारायण : अरे भाई, हमको तो बुलाओगे तो भी हम नहीं आएंगे ।

SHRI R.S. DOOGAR : There is a convention that the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs should be consulted in Committees in which Members of Parliament are to be represented.

SHRI S. D. MISRA : I want to know whether you have consulted him. Do you think they are incompetent ?

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : इनकी ठेकेदारी हो गई है ।

श्री उपसभापति : यादव साहब, आप बैठिए, 50 मिनट हो गए ।

(At this stage, Shri Satya Narain Sinha was seen going out.)

SHRI S.N. MISHRA: Where is that Minister going, the Minister of Information and Broadcasting ? We are going to raise that point today. The Minister must be here. If you want the House not to be disturbed, please ask him to come back.

देखिए सत्यनारायण सिंह को रोकिए । अब इसके बाद जो हालत होगी उसको उन्हें सम्भालने के लिए आप कहें । वे भाग रहे हैं ।

श्री राजनारायण : क्या सरकार यह भी जवाब देगी कि जो कोट-पतलून वाले हैं और शेरवानी पाजामे वाले हैं उनके मुकाबले में धोती-कुर्ता वाले और चौड़ी मोहरी के जो पाजामा पहनने वाले हैं उनको प्रतिनिधित्व नहीं मिला ।

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: Sir, I was not allowed to complete my reply, Sir.

श्री उपसभापति : राजनारायण जी, बैठिए ।

श्री राजनारायण : आप यह देख नहीं रहे हैं कि इसमें धोती-कुर्ता और चौड़ी मोहरी के पाजामे वाले नहीं लिए गए हैं, इसमें केवल पतलून वाले हैं ।

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: I was submitting that the Government has no intention to disband the Commission as has been suggested by the hon. Members. We would desire that this Commission should very effectively function. I seek the cooperation of this House and the public. This is not a controversial Commission. Let us see that cooperation and goodwill are created for the effective functioning of this Commission.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Next question. Mr. Mohta.

श्री राजनारायण : श्रीमन्, हमारा जवाब नहीं आया ।

श्री उपसभापति : यह बात तो ठीक नहीं है ।
I have passed on to another question.

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा : क्या मैं यह जान सकता हूँ कि श्री महावीर त्यागी कहाँ हैं ?

श्री राजनारायण : आप इसको देख नहीं रहे हैं । सरकार ने इस का पूरा जवाब नहीं दिया है । मैंने कहा था कि सरकार जब कोई कमेटी बनाये और उसमें पार्लियामेन्ट के सदस्यों को रखे तो उस समय पार्लियामेन्टरी एफेयर्स से संबंधित जो मंत्री हों उस से सलाह लेनी चाहिए । तो मंत्री जी ने इस का जवाब नहीं दिया कि इस मामले में क्या पार्लियामेन्टरी एफेयर्स के मंत्री से सलाह ली गयी थी जब पार्लियामेन्ट के सदस्यों को इस में शामिल किया गया ? इस का जवाब आप दिलवाइये ।

SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE: As I said the other day, the normal procedure was followed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mohta, please. I have called Mr. Mohta.

RURAL MARKETS

•237. SHRI BABUBHAI M. CHINAI:
SHRI M.K. MOHTA

Will the Minister of FOOD AND AGRICULTURE be pleased to state:

(a) whether there is any proposal under Government's consideration to have a net work of rural markets; and

(b) if so, what are the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FOOD, AGRICULTURE, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND COOPERATION (SHRI ANNASAHEB SHINDE) : (a) and (b) A statement is laid on the Table of the Sabha.

+The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri M. K. Mohta.