

RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 13th May, 1970/the 2nd
Vaisakh 1892 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

HIGHER STATUS FOR HINDI TRANSLATORS

•351. SHRI KALYAN ROY : f

DR. DEEPRASAD CHATTERJEE :
PADHYA : f

SHRI A. S. CHATTERJEE :

SHRI B. S. KEMPARAJ :

SHRI M. V. WHITISH PURAKA
YASTH :

SHRI C. P. ITTA BASU :

SHRI S. A. ANKASEKHAR
SANYA :

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be
pleased to state :

(a) whether Government have recently
raised the status of Hindi Translators working
under the Government of India and have given
them a higher status in comparison to the
Assistants and have also given them a higher
salary scale of Rs. 320-530 in comparison to
the Assistants' scale of pay of Rs. 210-530;

(b) if so, the reasons for not revising the
status and pay of other categories such as
Assistants who were previously on a higher
footing in comparison to the Hindi Translators
who were in a lower scale of pay; and

(c) the steps proposed to be taken by
Government to raise the status of Assistant
referred to in part (b) above ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI
VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA) : (a) and (b)
Most of the posts of Hindi Translators are
sanctioned in the scale of Rs. 210-425. There
are, however, a few posts of Translator
carrying higher scales of Rs. 210-530, Rs. 320-
530 and Rs. 325-575. These three higher grades
have been prescribed in cases where the duties
and responsibilities, the quality and the nature
of the translation work justified higher
emoluments.

†The question was actually asked on the floor
of the House by Shri Kalyan Roy, 1—33 R.
S./70

There has been no recent revision either in
the pay scales or the status of Hindi
Translators.

The lowest grade in the Central Secretariat
Service is that of Assistants in the pay scale of
Rs. 210-530. Unlike the Hindi Translators,
Assistants belong to an organised Service
with a graded structure. They have avenues of
promotion to the posts of Section Officer (Rs.
350-900), Under Secretary (Rs. 900-1250)
and Deputy Secretary (Rs. 1100-1800). There-
fore the status of Assistant is in no way
lower than that of the Translator in the
corresponding grade.

(c) Does not arise.

SHRI KALYAN ROY : While I thank the
Home Ministry for increasing the grade, I
would like to know why they have selected
a few people only. This is most unjustified
and unfair and it is a serious discrimination
against the non-Hindi people—the clerks
who are working—and this will lead to
serious bitterness among all sections of the
Government staff and this will be a serious
blow to integration. Is it not a fact that the
Hindi Translators are non-gazetted staff of
Class III and the Assistants are of Class
II. Now the Hindi Translators have been
brought on par with Class II so far as
salaries are concerned which means you
have given an increase to them and brought
them on par by giving the grade of Rs. 210 to
530. There are agitations among all sections
of employees for higher wages and that is why
the Third Pay Commission has been set
up. When the Commission is enquiring into the
matter, why do you select suddenly this
section and give them more increase than
what is drawn by Class II people ? The
anomaly is this. These people are good and
honest workers. I do not want to be
misunderstood but there are other honest
workers also. The Class III workers to-day
are getting more than Class II people.
Following from it, I would ask whether
you are not violating the Cabinet decision
not to revise the grades ?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA :

First of all there is no discrimination involved
because when the Official Languages Act was
passed, at that time we felt that there was need
for some Assistants who would translate
Hindi documents into English and English
documents into Hindi. Simultaneously we also
made provision for large-scale teaching of the
Central Government staff. Now the stage has
come

when it is not necessary to have special grade of Assistants who would do translating work. So recruitment has now been stopped. So it was not as if some people were being discriminated against. It was only that Hindi was sought to be used as one of the official languages of India and the work had to be put through, and they were employed to begin with. Secondly, about the case of revision of the pay scales, I may clarify that the pay scales have not been revised and actually the revision took place much before the announcement or before even the question of the setting up of the Pay Commission arose. It was done much earlier than that. As I have indicated, most of the Hindi Translators are in the non-gazetted Class III rank.

SHRI KALYAN ROY : They will be getting more than Glass II.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I will give the present position. We have a total of 116 posts of Hindi Translators. Out of this, 104 are in Class III non-gazetted rank and out of these 104 only 49 are in the pay scale of Rs. 330-530 and these are *ad hoc* posts which have no promotion avenues and therefore it is wrong to compare them with regular Assistants of the Government of India who have the regular grade promotion chances and they have a regular cadre constituted for them.

SHRI KALYAN ROY : As you have said, there are Hindi Translators. I hope he will agree that there are other translators translating other languages like Tamil, Telugu and Bengali. Why have they not been given this increase? Are they less qualified than the Hindi Translators?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : The official languages of the Government of India happen to be Hindi and English and most of the people we have employed are required to work either in English or in Hindi. At least I do not remember any Assistants or clerks of the Government who are required to work in languages other than these two except probably in the AIR which has multi-lingual broadcasts and they have to make translations and they have provided translators in the AIR but as far as this particular matter is concerned, we have not discriminated between the various language groups but as I explained earlier, we had some requirements of translators to begin with and these translators were appointed by the various Ministries in

an *ad hoc* manner and therefore to say that we did not appoint other language group people to do work here is not very sound because we did not require their assistance in the work of the Government of India.

SHRI KALYAN ROY : Are they less qualified than the Hindi Translators?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : There is no question of qualification. The work that has to be done was only in these two languages.

DR. DEBIPRASAD CHATTOPADHYAYA : I do not like to say that the salary should not be raised. It is good it has been raised but the problem is, there is some discrimination. Would the Home Minister tell us whether they think the nature of the job of the Assistants is less complex, less responsible, less serious than that of the translators? Will he say that the lowest grade of the Assistants compares favourably to the lowest grade of the Translators? Finally, will he enlighten about the number of translators whose posts and salaries have been up-graded and how many Hindi-speaking translators have been up-graded and how many of the up-graded posts belong to the non-Hindi categories?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I have already indicated that there is no comparison between the work of regular Assistants in the Government of India and the Hindi Translators. As the Member must be knowing, the Assistants in the Government do the work of noting, drafting, examination of cases, etc. whereas the Hindi translators do not do that. I must also clarify that Hindi translators need not necessarily be Hindi speaking. They can belong to any language group. Anybody who can do the work of translation of Hindi into English and English into Hindi would be employed. Unfortunately I do not have the breakdown as to how many of these 116 people are Hindi-speaking and how many are non-Hindi people but I know that even non-Hindi people who have competence in Hindi have been employed in this work. Therefore it is wrong to compare the work between Hindi Translators and regular Assistants of the Government of India.

As far as the pay scales are concerned I have already indicated that most of the Hindi Translators are in Class III which has a scale of pay of Rs. 320-530 whereas in the case of Assistants their pay scale is a little different. But the main thing is

that whereas these are isolated *ad hoc* posts without promotional chances etc., the Assistants have a regular cadre with regular chances of promotion and most of them on their competence do get promoted to higher ranks.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: I am grateful to the hon. the Home Minister for at least saying that there are even non-Hindi people who know Hindi. And taking my cue from that answer. . . .

SHRI CHITTA BASU: Unlike you.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: Yes; unlike me.

SHRI NIRAN "AN VARMA: No, no; he knows Hindi well.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: Taking my cue from that answer may I ask this question of him that if the Assistants are Class II people who also know Hindi—because they are required to know Hindi—what prevented the Government from making these Assistants who know Hindi do the work of translation and giving them this better scale of pay rather than create this kind of discrimination by causing a cadre of Hindi Translators to be created which has a higher scale of pay? That is my first question.

My second question is this. The hon. Minister has admitted that the Assistants are Class II non-gazetted and the Hindi Translators are Class III non-gazetted. If that is so, is it not a fact that the Assistants have really to do the most onerous and most important work in the shape of making drafts, making original documents while the Hindi Translators' job is merely derivative—they merely translate what has already been entered for them—and if that is so why is it that derivative work should be given greater salary than what I choose to call creative work. . . .

AN HON. MEMBER: Creative work?

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: ... well relatively creative work, not creative work in the sense of literature but it is the Assistants who make drafts, who make documents and that is not derivative work.

And may I ask a final question?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are entitled only to one question.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: Well, they are related questions really. The other question that I am asking is this. The hon. Minister has seen that this creation with a high salary of a special cadre of Hindi Translators has already begun to have its repercussion. Will the Ministry refer the matter, including the question of this repercussion, to the Pay Commission which the Government has set up? Will they refer this creation of a special cadre of Hindi Translators who have been given better salary scales and the question whether the Assistants should get a better salary or whether the Translators should get a better salary, and the repercussion that has begun to be felt as a result of the creation of this special cadre of Hindi Translators to the Pay Commission which the Government have set up?

These are the three questions which I want to be answered.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA: As I have explained earlier there is no special cadre of Hindi Translators. They are isolated *ad hoc* posts which have been created in various Ministries according to their requirements. At the time when these posts were created they examined among their own people first whether the Assistants, Section Officers, or Upper Division Clerks could do this translation work and wherever it was found the work was more than what the people who knew the translation work could handle then 1, 2, 3, 4 or 5 posts were created depending upon the quantity of work there. Therefore there is no regular cadre as such that has been created. I may again submit to the hon. Member that the Assistants are far better in promotion prospects as well as in their grades of pay. I will give their grades of pay. Now the grade of pay of Assistants is Rs. 210-530 in Class II non-gazetted. That is the lowest grade of Assistants. And the corresponding grade for Hindi Translators is Rs. 210-425; this is the grade of Hindi Translators in Class III non-gazetted.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: It is Rs. 320-530 that is given here.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA: I have already given the numbers. The majority of the Hindi Translators are in Class III non-gazetted and the pay scale of Class III non-gazetted Hindi Translators is Rs. 210-425 whereas for the Assistants the pay scale is Rs. 210-530. Therefore Sir, it is not correct to say that the Hindi Translators were given any extra benefit.

As far as the question of reference of this matter to the Pay Commission is concerned, I say the matter is going to be referred; not only this but the entire matter of pay, emoluments, all these things, are going to be referred to the Pay Commission and I am quite sure that they will also pay their attention to this matter.

SHRI B. T. KEMPARAJ: In view of the answer given by the hon- Minister I want to know which is the Department or Ministry that makes appointments of these Translators and what are the qualifications prescribed for those posts and thirdly, I want to know—the hon. Minister was pleased to say that there is no discrimination—why the Government could not consider the cases of the Second Division Clerks and Upper Division Clerks and why their pay scales also should not be raised.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I have already explained all these matters. I have already said that the Ministries have appointed Hindi Translators according to the quantity of work that they have to do in Hindi or from Hindi to English. And they had to do it by themselves without consulting other Ministries. They assessed the number of people who could do this work and if the work that was in the Ministry could not be handled by those who knew this kind of translation work they had to appoint extra hands.

As far as qualifications are concerned, I do not have the details of the qualifications prescribed but I assume that proficiency and knowledge of both English and Hindi would be the qualification for Translators' work and that must have been ensured before these people were appointed.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : Having regard to the fact that the Constitution of our country gives equal recognition to all the fourteen languages in our country . . .

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Fifteen.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: . . . Will the Government now consider the desirability of having a special cadre of Translators, keeping in view that the translation work will increase in volume in the coming days and may I know whether the Government proposes to have a special cadre of Translators for all the Indian languages instead of giving special consideration to the Hindi Translators ?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I have already referred to this matter but I will again clarify the position— Although the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution refers to fifteen national languages as far as the work of the Union Government is concerned it has to be done in English and Hindi—Hindi as the official language and English as the subsidiary official language—and therefore as far as the requirements of the Government of India and the Union Government are concerned ; they are limited only to the English-knowing and Hindi-knowing people and I must say that the English-knowing and Hindi-knowing people need not necessarily be Hindi-speaking or English-speaking¹ people; they could belong to any language group in the country. If they have proficiency in Hindi and English they could do this work. To avoid the need of having Translators we decided that everybody who works in the Government of India should have proper training in Hindi and English so that no translators will be needed. In the beginning they are needed. Now we have decided that everybody who works in the Government of India should have proficiency and working knowledge in both the languages and we feel that soon it would not be necessary for us to have Translators to translate from Hindi to English. I must here again clarify and remove the doubt from the minds of our non-Hindi speaking friends that in the recruitment to the Government of India services there is no bar and no discrimination and no insistence on advance knowledge of Hindi.

A person who does not know Hindi at all can get into the Union Service without knowing a word of Hindi. After he joins the Union Government Service, he is given in-service training in Hindi, so that he gets proficiency in one of the official languages of the country and he can do the work properly.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sanyal.

SHRI SASANKASEKHAR SANYAL : Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Next question. We have taken 21 minutes on this.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : श्रीमन्, एक क्वेश्चन हमारा रह गया है। इसमें सिर्फ एक तरफ का सुना गया है। उनका रप्रेजेंटेशन नहीं हुआ है श्रीमन्. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : All right, last question.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जो हिन्दी ट्रान्सलेटर्स को अभी वेतन दिया गया है, यह वेतन उनका कब से ड्यू था ? दूसरा प्रश्न यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इंग्लिश ट्रान्सलेटर के पे में और हिन्दी ट्रान्सलेटर के पे में क्या फर्क है ? तीसरी बात यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या इंग्लिश ट्रान्सलेटर रेगुलर बेसिस पर हैं और ये एड् हाक बेसिस पर हैं . . .

श्री सभापति : वह कह चुके हैं ।

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : यह एड् हाक बेसिस पर उनको क्यों रखा गया, रेगुलर बेसिस पर क्यों नहीं रखा गया है ?

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : माननीय सदस्य ने शायद ध्यान नहीं दिया मेरे उत्तर की तरफ । अंग्रेजी ट्रान्सलेटर नाम की कोई चीज नहीं है भारत सरकार में । जो हिन्दी से अंग्रेजी में ट्रान्सलेशन करते हैं वही अंग्रेजी से हिन्दी में ट्रान्सलेशन करते हैं । कोई अंग्रेजी का ट्रान्सलेटर अलग से नहीं है । वही व्यक्ति जो हिन्दी का ट्रान्सलेशन अंग्रेजी में करते हैं वही अंग्रेजी से हिन्दी में ट्रान्सलेशन करते हैं । उनका नाम हिन्दी ट्रान्सलेटर इसलिए रखा गया है; क्योंकि ज्यादातर उनको अंग्रेजी से हिन्दी में ट्रान्सलेट करना होता है, किन्तु जब कभी . . .

(Int. runtions.)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Do not stand up please. He is replying to your question.

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : मूल बात यह है सभापति महोदय कि अंग्रेजी ट्रान्सलेटर सरीखी कोई चीज भारत सरकार के अधीन नहीं है । जहां तक उनके ड्यू का सवाल है, मैं नहीं जानता कि कब से ड्यू है ! जब से उनको

रखा गया तब से यह ग्रेड तय किया गया है और तब से उनको यह वेतन मिलता है ।

*352. [The questioner (Shri A. G. Kul-kami) was absent for answer, vide cols. 41-42 infra.]

RECOVERY PROCEEDINGS AGAINST SHRI DHARMA TEJA

*353. SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : Will the Minister of PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND SHIPPING AND TRANSPORT be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that the Government of India have initiated recovery proceedings against the former Chairman of the Jayanti Shipping Company, Shri Dharma Teja for payment of Rs. One crore;

(b) if so, whether the attention of the Government of India has been invited to a report in the "Indian Monitor" of February 14, 1970 (page 4) and if so, the reaction of the Government of India in this regard ?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE DEPARTMENT OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND IN THE MINISTRY OF SHIPPING AND TRANSPORT (SAR-DAR IQBAL SINGH): (a) and (b) A statement is laid on the Table of the Sabha.

STATEMENT

(a) The suit in question is a suit filed in Delhi High Court on 29-1-70 by the new management of Jayanti Shipping Company against Dr. Teja and one Mr. Kulukundis for the recovery of Rs. 96,32,696 of which they had defrauded the company in connection with the purchase of the company's shares by them and the acquisition of 7 Liberty ships on behalf of the company. The total claim, including interest up to the date of filing the suit, is for Rs. 1,39,64,198.

(b) The news item quoted on page 4 of the 'Indian Monitor', dated the 14th February, 1970 viz- that the "Ministry of Commerce and Company Affairs" has filed a suit against Dr. Jayanti Dharma Teja for the recovery of rupees One crore which (to continue the report quoted) according to the suit, was advanced by Government to him for setting up Jayanti Shipping Company, is incorrect.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: The hon. Minister says in the statement that there is a suit filed against Dr. Dharma Teja for Rs. 1,39,00,000 and that it has not