

use for a long time. In fact, the Dako-tas are now as old as I am and therefore, I think they have given a very good service for they are an extraordinary type of plane.

(Interruptions)

Sir, as far as this question of connecting other places in India is concerned, naturally we are anxious, Sir, that every place of importance in India should be connected and we are steadily expanding our service. But, I am afraid the Dakotas, with the stage they have now reached with the depreciation and heavy cost, are not really the best planes for this purpose. We will continue to expand when we get new planes.

SHRI DALPAT SINGH : I would like to know whether there is anything on record about the price of Dakota or not.

DR. KARAN SINGH : The depreciated price of Dakota is Rs. 120 each.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Haryana should be allowed.

LOSS OF LIFE AND PROPERTY IN WEST BENGAL DUE TO NAXALITE ACTIVITIES

*182. SHRI M. K. MOHTA: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) the extent of loss of life and property in West Bengal since the imposition of President's rule and so far as a result of the activities of Naxalities, Communists and other political parties and trade unions; and

(b) the number of Naxalities arrested, convicted and killed as a result of encounter with the police during the same period in the State and the details of arms seized from Naxalites?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI K. C. PANT): (a) and

(b) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

STATEMENT

Up-to-date information in regard to the different points raised in the question is being collected. According to information readily available, about 105

persons are known to have lost their lives as a result of the activities of extremists, interparty clashes, etc. 2291 extremists had been arrested. Arms and ammunition recovered so far include:

(1) Rifles	2
(2) Guns	12
(3) Revolvers	8
(4) Pistols	3
(5) Improvised guns including pipe guns	16
(6) Countrymade small fire-arms	2
(7) Cartridges	78
(8) Ammunition	915 rounds
(9) Bombs	1,417
(10) Grenades	7
(11) Grenade shells	101
(12) Improvised mortars with detonating device	1
(13) Detonators	1,700
(14) Crackers	69
(15) Molotov Cock-tails	3
(16) Ingredients for bombs	105 kgs.
(17) Acid	12 litres
(18) Acid bulbs	2
(19) Petrol bottle	1
(20) Daggers	9
(21) Swords	12
(22) Khodali	8
(23) Bayonet	1

SHRI M. K. MOHTA : Sir, on a perusal of the statement . . .

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : Sir, the statement laid on the Table might be read over. After all we have not gone through it and how can we put supplementaries?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Then I will have to break the rules. You kindly examine it and I shall call you later; otherwise, I will have to do it for every question.

SHRI M. K. MOHTA : On a perusal of the statement laid on the Table I am extremely sorry to say that the statement is very sketchy does not give much information and the whole question is tried to be evaded. The statement says that up-to-date information in regard to the different points raised in the question is being collected. This is such an important question and it has come up before the House once or twice before also that the Government is expected to be not only having up-to-date but up-to-the-minute information. These Naxalite activities which are being dismissed by the Government as a law and order problem actually constitute a war against the State. The Naxalites have declared publicly time and again that what they are doing cannot be termed anything except war against the State and yet the Government says that up-to-date information is not available with them. The administrative machinery in West Bengal has dismally failed and the West Bengal Governor actually being not only the Constitutional head but also the Administrative Head of the State is personally responsible for the maintenance of law and order and for looking after this problem which he has failed to do. What is the Government's policy as regards the administrative machinery which requires a thorough overhaul starting from the Governor right up to the officials who are failing in their duty to maintain law and order? What is the Government's policy regarding it and what is the Government going to do about it?

SHRI K. C. PANT : The Government's policy is to strengthen the administrative machinery wherever necessary at all levels.

SHRI M. K. MOHTA : Referring to part (b) of my question, I had asked for the number of Naxalites arrested, convicted as a result of encounter, etc. The number has been given as 2291 extremists arrested but no information has been given as to whether any of them has been convicted or not. I do not know whether the Government has this information and, if not, why does not the Government have this information? Secondly, what action does the Government take to protect the school-going children and college students who are daily victims of the Naxalite activities? Is the Government going to take some positive steps to provide deterrent punishment to those

people who cause bodily harm to these young people of the country?

SHRI K. C. PANT : As indicated in the statement, 2291 extremists have been arrested.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : Is it another name for the Naxalites or are the extremists different?

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR : Three days ago the Prime Minister said that 'extremist' is an improper word to be used for people who are causing such damage to life and property. Again we are being given a statement giving the same words like extremists. It is trying to give respectability to all those people.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI : It is a matter of shame that the Naxalites are called extremists.

SHRI K. C. PANT : If, my friend thinks 'extremist' is better than 'Naxalite', I ask, how can you think that extremist is better? It is a matter of phrase but I will tell the reason why the phrase 'extremist' is given. Let me explain ; it is very simple.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Are not fascists extremists?

SHRI K. C. PANT : There is no great mystery behind this. The simple thing is that a certain expression 'Naxalites' began to be used on the basis of the happenings in Naxalbari. Later on there was the Nagi Reddy group in Andhra Pradesh. There was another group in some other State, and there have been a number of groups which have been following the same path. (Interruptions). They collectively are called Naxalites. This is the only reason for . . .

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : If I call Congress (R) as CPI (ML) because they are extremists, would you accept it?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please let us go on hearing the answer now. (Interruptions) Whether I am satisfied or not is not the question here.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR : Ministers should not get away with such lame explanations.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I shall call other hon. Members, but let the Minister complete his answer now.

SHRI K. C. PANT : So, Sir, this is the number of extremists who have been arrested. Now, as to the number who have been convicted. . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : How many are RSS?

SHRI K. C. PANT : As to the number convicted asked for by my friend, I have explained it in the Statement. To this one question we have asked the West Bengal Government for an answer. We want to get specific information on this. But I call tell you that it has been our experience that in many cases bail has been granted when these have been produced before magistrates. So we have taken it up with the West Bengal Government that the Prosecution Counsel should oppose this bail, and as a result, in many cases in recent weeks there has been an improvement in this regard.

(Interruptions)

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI: How many have been convicted, that figure has not been given. It means nobody has been convicted so far. Shall we take it that nobody has been convicted so far?

SHRI K. C. PANT: About that I do not have the figure now. I have called for the figure from the West Bengal Government.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Their question is whether anyone has been convicted.

SHRI K. C. PANT: I believe some have been convicted but I cannot offhand give the figure.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. S. N. Mishra.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Well, he is also an extremist.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: Yes, I am in a certain sense but I object to your concept of 'extremists'. (Interruptions) Now, Sir, you will recall that last time an objection was taken to the use of this generic concept of 'extremists', and I would now specifically ask for the categories of the parties which come under this term 'extremists', because certain parties have been mentioned in part (a)

of the question. So we would like to know which parties have been responsible for these kinds of violent raid subversive activities. Just with the use of the term 'extremists' we are not going to be satisfied. That is number one.

Then the second thing is that some time back Government had been pleased to say that there had been certain training camps, regular training camps specifically for these violent and subversive activities. Have those training camps been unearthed and demolished by now? That is number two.

Number three; are some foreigners also involved in these? If so, can he mention the number of foreigners who have been involved in these?

SHRI K. C. PANT: Sir, as to the names of the parties, CPI(ML) is one among them. Those who go by the name of 'Naxalites', they are among them, and generally the activities of this group are known, and if he would like me to specify them, some of their activities include raids on educational institutions and also disfiguring Gandhi-ji's portraits or Rabindranath Tagore's portraits or the like, hoisting of the Red Flag on buildings and attacks on public buildings as well as on police parties, vandalism or arson on public property and assassination of so-called class enemies, and so on.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: Any other party in this?

SHRI K. C. PANT: As I said there are other groups.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: Why don't you mention them?

SHRI K. C. PANT: I have mentioned.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: Sir, I would like to know which are the parties which are responsible for this.

SHRI K. C. PANT: I have already mentioned CPI (ML) and Naxalites. There is this group called the Nagi Reddy Group in Andhra Pradesh and other groups of that nature. There are a number of splinter groups. These are collectively called extremists in our answer but I have specified the nature

of the atrocities» in which they indulge so as to leave no doubt about whom we mean- in this respect.

{Many hon. Members stood up.}

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: Wait; there are three parts of the question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes; two more questions remain to be answered.

SHRI K. C. PANT: The other question was whether any training camps have been raided. All along the Bengal police and other police parties have been very active. It is not as though these extremists have been gaining ground everywhere. In Andhra Pradesh they have encountered very stiff resistance from the Administration there and to a large extent their activities have been put down and training camps have been raided, in many other States, in Kerala also.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: How many training camps have been unearthed in West Bengal?

SHRI K. C. PANT: I do not have the number, Sir.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: It was stated by the Minister that some training camps have been unearthed. We would like to know how many training camps have been unearthed.

SHRI K. C. PANT: I said I do not have the number. In Kerala also firm action was taken against the extremists during the regime of Mr. Namboodiri-Pad and later also during the previous regime. In many other States, for instance, in Bihar also as you know in one place a certain number were captured and the name of a foreign lady came in the papers in that connection but I cannot say specifically how many in each State have actually been raided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: One other question was how many foreigners are involved.

SHRI K. C. PANT: I do not have the number, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dharia.

SHRI S. C. SARDESAI: Sir, I was one of the earliest to get up.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down: anyone who catches my eye I call.

SHRI M. M. DHARIA: Mr. Chairman, may I know from the Government whether the Government has gone into the basic reasons for the spread of Naxalite activities in the country and is it not true that the failure of the parliamentary institutions in this country in rendering social and economic justice, the hindrance created by our Constitution and by our bureaucrats while protecting the feudal concepts of property rights of individuals and the lukewarm policy of the Government carrying out their politics of convenience have led to the spread of Naxalite activities in our country and if that is so may I know from the Government and from the Prime Minister what positive steps are being taken by the Government to see that this social and political injustice is removed and at the same time these violent Naxalite activities are also curbed with a heavy hand?

SHRI K. C. PANT: I think there is a certain confusion of ideas in this. No one can underestimate the need for taking steps to bring about socio-economic amelioration in this country and no one can gainsay the fact that it has not been as rapid as we would like it to be and steps are being taken, have to be taken, and in those areas where the Government have not succeeded in doing as much as they want to do, steps have to be speeded up but as to how it should be done, within what framework, I think on that we have to be clear. It has to be done within the democratic framework, within the framework of the Rule of Law, of the Constitution that we have in this country and if the failure of the Government machinery is responsible in the matter of socio-economic measures, the remedy also lies in the Constitution, in the democratic process. And I do not think that violence can be resorted to or ought to be resorted to for the resolution of these problems. On that I think there can be no compromise.

SHRI M. M. DHARIA: Sir, I asked for specific reasons. I asked whether it is not true that the parliamentary institutions have failed in rendering social and economic justice which has created unemployment, and is it not the duty of the hon. Member to say yes, they have failed and that they shall see

that they do not fail? I would like to warn this Government that if this policy continues, as it is continuing today without rendering justice, this violence is bound to take place . and the blame lies with the Government and not with the young boys who join the movement.

SHRI S. G. SARDESAI: I also want to object very strongly to the use of the word 'extremists' in the reply and I may tell you that it is not a question of one word being better or worse. The word is absolutely undefinable. No one can define it. If you use the word, then you will rope in all sorts of people by just calling them extremists. It is a question of civil liberties. .'

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put a question.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: He has added to the confusion. So, let him say it.

SHRI S. G. SARDESAI: When the Government are using words like this which are vague, the civil liberties of the common man are in danger. There is no definition of the word and by calling whomsoever an extremist you can arrest him, but my question is not that. My question is: that in the same period, to which this question relates, how many murders have been committed by the Jotedars? No. 1. Secondly, want to know how many murders committed by totally non-political criminals are attributed to the Naxalites by in crested parties. I want an answer to these two questions.

SHRI K. C. PANT: Firstly, I may assure my hon. friend that the use of the term 'extremist' or otherwise is certainly not intended to rope in anybody else.

SHRI S. G. SARDESAI: It is not a question of intention, but it is a question of the danger.

SHRI K. C. PANT: Let me explain. It is certainly not intended to rope in anybody else except those whose activities are well understood and well defined. As I have mentioned earlier...

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: What about the Swatantra Party?

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: You are an extremist, but you will not be roped in because you support the Government. So long as you support the Government why are you worried about it?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the business go on.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: You indulge in land grabbing.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : I protest. It is not land grabbing, but it is land occupation.

SHRI K. C. PANT: It is these mutual compliments between Members opposite which make it difficult to understand words. The point raised by my hon. friend is a serious one and I would like to answer it in all seriousness. We do not intend to rope in anybody who does not indulge in the kind of activities to which I referred earlier and which are well understood by now in the country. Calling any group of persons Naxalites is certainly not the intention. If any law is broken, then we shall take care to see to it that others are certainly not included in any definition that we will give. About the other question of how many murders were committed by the Jotdars, etc., I shall require notice.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI: So long as we have a cowardly Government at the helm of affairs. . .

HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI: ... it is not surprising to see that they are using words like 'extremists' or 'extreme patriots' and they can go about using them because of their lust for power. Their lust for power is responsible for it, but as a Government they carry some responsibility with them. It seems to me that they are quite aware of the criminal activities of the so-called extremist parties which are bombing police stations, bombing innocent boys and so on. That is going on. Have the Government had the courage to declare any of these criminal parties unlawful so far and, if not, why not ?

SHRI K. C. PANT: The Government certainly does not condone any of these activities. That is clear and, as I said earlier, if you look at the whole country. . .

SHRI S. N. MISHRA: Verbally.

SHRI K. C. PANT: If you just see the facts as they are, as I told you earlier, in many of the States, very firm action has been taken, e.g., in Andhra Pradesh, in Kerala and in other States. Now, in West Bengal we have inherited a certain situation and it will take time to put that right. I do not think that you should ignore the realities of the situation that exists there.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI: Have they been able to declare any of the parties unlawful? If not, why not?

SHRI K. C. PANT: I am very much on it. I am coming to the second part. The Government did call a meeting of the opposition leaders in 1969 to discuss the question of what legislative measures could be taken. . . (Interruption). In 1969 a meeting was called to discuss the question of communal and violent activities and these activities to which I have referred earlier. Very few parties attended that meeting, and in the absence of their attendance the matter could not be proceeded with. Later on in the Consultative Committee meeting also certain proposals were put up. They did not get adequate support and they could not be proceeded with. Even now we are contemplating legislative measures. I hope the opposition parties here in the House lend us their support, the Government is certainly prepared to consider whatever measures are feasible.

SHRI MAHAVIR TYAGI: Declaration of a party unlawful does not require any legislation.

SHRI K. C. PANT: This question has been examined. It does need a change in the present law. This matter has been examined by the legal experts.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: The Minister mentioned the crushing of the Naxalites in Andhra Pradesh. May I know if the Government has the figures of the Naxalites or the so-called Naxalites who have been shot dead without trial by the police in Andhra Pradesh in the name of suppression of the Naxalites, and if he does not have these figures, will he get them and place them before the Table of the House before the present session adjourns? Because my information is that the police in certain parts of Andhra Pradesh is indulging in headhunting of people in the

name of suppression of Naxalites. Killing people without trial in a country which is supposed to be a democracy and where the rule of law prevails is a very serious matter.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Morarji-bhai's line of operation under Indira Gandhi's Government.

SHRI S. S. MARISWAMY: Shri Charu Mazumdar in his paper "Desh-brati" has called his people to annihilate class elements and also to carry on a war in Srikakulam on the lines of the Vietnam war. This article has come all over India and excerpts have been published in the Indian Express this morning. I want to know what action has been taken against Charu Mazumdar and also his paper, whether the Government has tried to book this man or whether the Government will come out openly and confess that they have failed in their attempts to book this man as well as the paper.

SHRI K. C. PANT: This paper is no longer appearing on a regular basis. It is appearing illegally and clandestinely. The police did raid the press and this has now stopped coming out in a regular manner. It does it clandestinely and illegally, that is what I said. So far as Mr. Mazumdar is concerned, he is absconding.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: What action they have taken against the press which is bringing it out clandestinely, as he said. Sir, a part of the question is not answered. In the national interest he should answer this question.

SHRI K. C. PANT: Is it Mr. Misra's point or Mr. Mariswamy's?

SHRI S. S. MARISWAMY: For the last so many years the paper, whether clandestinely or otherwise, is coming out. The summary of it is published in all national papers. What I want to know is whether the mighty Government has failed to book a single individual, your entire Home Ministry, CBI, CIB, etc., has failed to book one single individual who is talking of a war, a regular war, and calling on people to agitate in the form of Vietnam.

SHRI K. C. PANT: According to my information, this paper is not appearing regularly, it is appearing

irregularly. So far as apprehending a single individual is concerned, it is far more difficult for any Government, however mighty, to apprehend a single individual than a large group of individuals.

SHRI S. G. SARDESAI: Take action against the Times of India.

SHRI K. C. PANT: I may also mention one important fact because he might be thinking that this is appearing from that very press in Calcutta. That is not appearing from that press any longer, it comes out in cycle-styled sheets.

SHRI K. P. SUBRAMANIA MENON: May I know from the Government whether the big press in India has been unduly and extremely bloating up the activities of the so-called Naxa-lites with a view to creating an atmosphere in this country to suppress the movements of agricultural labour, the Adivasis, etc. against exploitation? . . . (Interruptions) Look here, Sir. These are the extremists.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have got the question now.

SHRI K. P. SUBRAMANIA ME-NON: Secondly, May I know whether the Government has come to know that in the name of suppressing the activities of the Naxalites the State machinery itself is indulging in the most heinous violence against individual people who are arrested and shot dead without any trial as has happened in Srikakulam? And in Kerala one Verghese. . .

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

SHRI K. P. SUBRAMANIA MENON: . . . was shot; he was put in the boiled water.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Menon, if you do not stop I will call the next questioner.

SHRI K. P. SUBRAMANIA MENON : My question is this. We do not apologise for these Naxalites. We are one of the targets in Kerala. But at the same time I would not like a civilised Government to use the sort of method which is now being used in the country against the so-called Naxalites . . . -

MR. CHAIRMAN : I will call the next questioner. Mr. Mulka Govinda Reddy. He is not stopping.

SHRI K. P. SUBRAMANIA MENON : I have stopped.

Mr. CHAIRMAN : No, you have not stopped. We have taken half an hour on this.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY : In view of the fact that there is virtual breakdown of the law and order machinery in West Bengal, in view of the fact that the Naxalite activities are on the increase ever since the State of West Bengal has come under the President's rule, in view of the fact that, the universities and colleges are not at all functioning, in view of the fact that there is no security of life and property of the people there and in view of the fact that the West Bengal Governor, along with his superannuated Advisers^ has failed to implement the decisions of Parliament, will the Government of India take strict measures^ to see that the law and order situation is improved and effective action is taken to provide employment to the unemployed? Also I would like to know whether they would recall the Governor and his Advisers who are useless and incompetent people and replace them with competent persons.

SHRI K. C. PANT : Sir, the basic presumption that the law and order situation has deteriorated since the President's rule is not correct. After the President's rule the law and order situation showed distinct signs of improvement for two or three months, and it is only lately that the situation has again deteriorated. Lately it has deteriorated after certain programmes have been taken up in that State. So that is a basic presumption which I do not think is quite correct. As far as the measures that are being taken to improve the law and order situation as well as other measures that have been taken, they include, for instance, the strengthening of the Intelligence machinery and the proper utilisation of the forces that are available with the West Bengal Government. In every way possible the law and order machinery there is being strengthened. In fact the Prime Minister was there only some time ago and she also reviewed these measures.

SHRI BHU »ESH GUPTA: Surely, the Prime Minister is not responsible for law and order.

SHRI K. C PANT: In view of all this I do not think that any precipitate change is required in the top personnel of the Government there.

SHRI THILLAI VILLALAN : I would like to know from the Madam Prime Minister whether she is aware of the two old sayings. One is what can be removed by a needle, if not removed in time, then it cannot be removed by any other in a weapon. The second saying is, if the smell is poisonous, it is better to nip it in the bud. I would like to know from the Madam Prime Minister whether she believes in these two sayings, whether she is going to act on the advice derived from these two sayings. I want an answer from the Prime Minister and not from Mr. Pant.

SHRI BHI PESH GUPTA: She has never used a needle.

SHRIMAT INDIRA GANDHI: Unfortunately the situation has not started today as Mr. Pant said a little earlier. This is a situation which has been existing for some time and even when there was an elected Government there. So, perhaps the time when a needle could have been used is long since past, because at that time many actions were committed which have made the situation more difficult to deal with. Our young men as well as others were under the impression that such actions were permissible. We are now trying to deal with the situation very firmly. The law and order situation has improved not just a little bit. But as I said last week, what is a little worse is these kinds of planned attacks on specific educational institutions. I am not mitigating the matter. The situation is indeed very serious and it is a matter about which we are all gravely concerned. Every step is being taken both to deal with the situation from this point of view and to evoke public consciousness in these areas and also to take measure for the development of Calcutta and in the rural areas of Bengal. This should convince those who join such activities for economic reasons, because I think it is right that the people who are involved in this kind of thing, whether you call them Naxalites or not, should be convinced. It is

true that apart from the regular members of the C.P.M. there may be other elements also. A few people may be there for economic reasons and a few may be there for the excitement of publicity they get. This is not at all, as I said earlier, to mitigate the planned effort of a group of people whose activities are anti-national as well as anti-social. My hon'ble friend, Shri-Tyagiji, asked why it was not possible for us to ban a certain party. According to the present law we have been told that this is not possible. Therefore, we are trying to see what can be done. We shall discuss this matter in the House and, even before that, with hon'ble Members who are interested in it.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI: Sir, I would like to know from the Government whether it is not a fact that the emergence of these Naxalites and this kind of activities is partly as a result of the failure of the Government to provide proper employment and to eradicate poverty from this country. But that is not the main cause for this. I do not justify the activities of the Naxalites. But we must also go to the root of this business because just to treat it as a law and order problem is not going to eliminate this. Today it is the Naxalites. Tomorrow it will be somebody else.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not repeat.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI: The moment you interrupt. Sir, it takes more time.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. If you repeat it takes more time.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI: It does not.

श्रीमती विद्यावती चतुर्वेदी : आप डाइरेक्ट क्वेश्चन पूछिये ।

श्री गोडे मुराहरी : सब पूछेंगे आप घबड़ाइये मत ।

So, I would like to know from the Government whether it is not a fact that the basic cause of this is economic and social and the responsibility for this lies with the Government. After 22 years of free Government, we have not been able to provide the basic necessities of life to our countrymen. Another thing

I would like to know from the Government is whether the present law permits shooting down of people, as it is being done in Srikakulam and other areas. If that is so, I do not see any reason why the Government is unable to take steps to stop these activities in other parts of the country, in Bengal or elsewhere. So, it is not a question of the present law not permitting. I would like to know from the Government what is stopping them from resorting to the methods which are evidently being resorted to in Andhra Pradesh. I do not advocate that you go and shoot people down without any basis. But if there is some murder, then you can definitely take recourse to the method that the Andhra Government has taken. Another thing I would like to know is whether there is any connection between these Naxalites and foreign Governments because there was one Miss Taylor who was arrested along with some Naxalites—she is also in some jail, I am told—and she is a British national. Therefore, I would like to know whether the Chinese or the Pakistanis have been financing these Naxalites through these foreigners who come here and join them.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :

Sir, perhaps the hon. Member would like to inform us whether there is a single country in the world which has, even with a far longer period for development, been able to give basic necessities to everyone of its people. This is something which, certainly for India, was not possible in any circumstances, given the situation which was there when we became free. A great deal has been done, very much more still remains to be done. There are vast numbers of our people who lack the basic necessities. It is our endeavour to see that, step by step, we go in the direction which can provide them with these necessities, so that they can take full advantage of freedom and are themselves enabled to play a part in the development of the country.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are Naxalites receiving aid from foreign countries?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :

I am coming to that. Several questions were asked in one. One question was a little bit confused because when we said that the law does not permit action, it was in answer to a specific question put by Tyagiji. It was not a question of

whether we could arrest people. That is being done, and as far as the law and order question is concerned, whenever you catch a person, action is taken. The question about the law came in along with the question of banning a particular party. So far as the question of foreign help is concerned, I think that Miss Taylor was acting more in her personal capacity rather than as a representative of any Government. But at the same time, Naxalites may be taking inspiration from various thoughts and so on from other countries.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Bhupesh Gupta.

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA : Sir, may I know , .

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. {Interruptions} I have called a number of Members from this side.

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA : On a point of order, Sir. Are we going to put supplementaries party-wise?

MR. CHAIRMAN ; No, no.

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA : Then I am entitled to put a question. Please give me only one minute.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, I wish to make a submission to you. When I put my question . . .

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA : Sir, is he getting a second chance?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Arora, please sit down.

{Interruptions}

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, in the name of rule of law, I want to make a submission to you.

MR. CHAIRMAN : No, this is not the hour for submissions. Please sit down. Mr. Bhupesh Gupta.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: On a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No point of order during Question Hour.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, a point of order does arise out of the wrong replies given by the Ministers.

MR. CHAI IMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Arjun A; ora. Please do not take the time of the House unnecessarily. Let others also have a chance.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : A point of order does arise out of wrong and misleading information given to the House by the Ministers.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No point of order arises.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: Sir, it does arise. How can you say that it does not arise with me listening to me?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have already said that during the Question Hour no points of order should be raised unless there is some clear violation of procedure or some extraordinary point.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: As Mr. Mohan Dharia repeatedly said yesterday, if a point of order does arise, it will have to be listened to.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, please sit down. Mr. Bhupesh Gupta now.

SHRI M. A. DHARIA: Without listening to the Member how can you decide it, Mr. Chairman?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let us go on.

SHRI M. VI. DHARIA: Without listening to the Member how can you decide whether there is an extraordinary case or not? You will have to listen to the Member first and only then can you decide.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please listen to me. He has already said that a point of order arises out of misleading answers given by the Ministers. Now, misleading answers or wrong answers do not give rise to a point of order.

SHRI M. JI. DHARIA: Why not? The House has every right to say immediately that the answer is misleading and that the Chair should immediately intervene and call on the Minister to give a proper reply. It is a serious matter. If the answer is misleading, we have a right to ask for its correction. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please listen to me first.

SHRI M. M. DHARIA... and how can you say. . .

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you do not listen to me, all right, you go on then.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: Mr. Chairman, I would like to make a submission.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Arjun Arora, what is it that you wanted to say?

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: Mr. Chairman, I am on a point of privilege.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am asking Mr. Arjun Arora to speak.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY: I am on a point of privilege, Sir.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Mr. Chairman, I am on a point of lack of privilege.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Arora, I have ruled out your point of order. Still you are insisting on it. What is that extraordinary point you wanted to make?

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA: Mr. Chairman, please give me a chance.

(Many hon. Members stood up to put questions.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Mr. Arora, I appeal to you not to raise your point because I anticipate that it is not a real point of order.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: Sir, you have cast serious reflection on the impartiality and judgment of the Chair. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Have I cast it?

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: You have cast a very serious reflection on the impartiality, ability and judgment of the Chair by anticipating things. The Chair is not here to anticipate things. No Chair in the world has done it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, I ask you to put your point. Let me see what the extraordinary point is.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: When my point of order has already been prejudged, I do not want to waste my breath.

SHRI GANESHI LAL CHAU-DHARY: Sir, Mr. Arjune Arora is standing up again and again and speaking.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, if frustration in a question gives rise to this kind of a thing, I do not know what frustration in life gives rise to.

Is the Government aware that in the name of suppressing the Naxalites the West Bengal authorities are beating up people? On 16th June this year the CRP beat to death one Mr. Gopal Krishna Bakshi, an Assistant of the Information and Public Relations Department by entering his house. Is the Government aware of this? Is the Government aware that similar things are happening all over the country? When shooting by the police takes place, their assault leads to death. In other places also like Punjab and Andhra Pradesh the police kill people and then they say that those people have been shot in an encounter. I should like to know what assurance the country has got from this kind of operation by the CRP and other police officials killing people absolutely illegally without trial or any such thing. I should like to know from the Prime Minister whether she includes the RSS, the Shiv Sena and Jamiat-ul-Ulerna as the extreme rightist. . .

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR: The same things are being repeated and the same arguments are being given. . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Then I should like to know why again and again this question is coming up about legal action. When riots took place in Ahmedabad and other places, we never heard of legal action being taken or any law being amended or changed. We want an assurance from the Government. . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI K. C. PANT: What precisely is the question he has asked?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Did i not give you the name? Did I not give you the date when this person was killed?

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Do you raise here when the CHambal Valley dacoits are killed. . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Who are the Chambal Valley dacoits?

(Interruptions)

The Chambal Valley dacoits are sitting on these benches. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JAIRAMDAS DAULAT-RAM : Sir, may I request you to pass on to the next question ?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Where is the answer to my question?

SHRI K. C. PANT: Both the Police and the CRP are trying to maintain law and order in West Bengal under difficult circumstances. I think there should be an understanding for that in the House. . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: If you go and shoot people, the people will beat you also. If you go and enter houses to shoot people and beat men in front of their families, they will also beat you up.

SHRI K. C. PANT: I am sure that my hon. friend is aware that bombs are being hurled at the Police and some of them are injured and killed. He asked me: "Why do you need to consider other laws?". I would like to put it to him most respectfully that these violent activities go on and then they are prosecuted. Sometimes evidence is not forthcoming and some are released on bail and so on and so forth. Then sometimes there are violent clashes. Would it not be more humane—this is just by the way—to have preventive detention which would prevent all these?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Why was Gopalkrishna Bakshi killed in this manner by the CEJP?

MR. CHAIR MAN: I have called the I next question.

Re Starred Question No. 183

SHRI BANK A BEHARY DAS: Is it necessary to put the question?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have called you.

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA: What is the way open for Members who obey the rules and the Chair?

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have taken more than 50 minutes for this question. I have called Siiri Banka Behary Das.

CBI INVESTIGATION INTO FOREIGN ASSISTANCE TO NEWSPAPERS

*183. SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether CBI was requested by the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting to enquire into the question of assistance to news agencies and newspapers from foreign sources including foreign embassies located in India;

(b) if so, whether the enquiry has been complete; and

(c) the names of the agencies and the newspaper that are the beneficiaries of such foreign assistance, both in cash and kind?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI K. C. PANT): (a) to

(c) The report of the Intelligence Bureau has recently been received and is being examined.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS: Sir, there is no time. We want a half an hour debate on this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would request you to put your supplementary.

SHRI A. R. MANI: We want a half-an-hour debate on this

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS: Will you permit a half-an-hour discussion on this?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have to write to me. Are you putting supplementaries?

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS: I would like to know whether in the light of the report that they have received just now and in view of the financial assistance received by some news agencies, are they going to bring in legislation in this session or not, to prevent this?

12 NOON.

SHRI K. C. PANT: We have to consult the Leader of the Opposition in this matter.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: For what?

SHRI K. C. PANT: After consulting, we shall then decide whether legislation can be brought about.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS: Sir, may I know whether in the reference that has been made to the CBI, all these matters have been looked into by the Centre: help in getting news print, assistance for publicity material, advertisement at unnecessarily high rate, keeping a few journalists in their pay roll in the name of translating news for publicity purposes, collaboration with government-controlled agencies and getting assistance in the name of exchange service, bulk orders for printing though less number of copies are printed, correspondents in foreign countries being partially maintained and the cost of news despatch being borne by foreign governments? May I know whether all these matters have been looked into by the intelligence agency?

SHRI K. C. PANT: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over.