

occasions and the Government have informed the House that we have evidence in our possession to show that there is a certain connection between the Naga underground movement, and Pakistan and China.

SHRI M. K. MOHTA : If we have definite evidence of this, how is it that the Government of India is not taking up the matter in the international forum?

SARDAR SWARAN SINGH : This is not a matter which can be taken to courts. If the hon. Member will study the charter of the world court. . .

SHRI M. K. MOHTA : I said 'international forum' like the United Nations. I did not say 'international court'. Sir, my question has not been answered.

MR. CHAIRMAN : It has been answered.

SHRI M. K. MOHTA : I did not say 'court' at all.

SARDAR SWARAN SINGH : This is essentially our domestic matter. We are seized of the situation and any amount of help from Pakistan to the Nagas will not at all help them and we have succeeded in controlling the situation with the cooperation of the State Governments.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR : How is the Foreign Minister dealing with a domestic question? This is a very relevant question.

SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY : The hon. Deputy Minister said that 106 Naga leaders have surrendered. I would like to know how many out of these 106 are tribal leaders, how many of them are guerilla leaders and how many of them are trained by Pakistan and China.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : And how many of them are Charan Singh leaders?

SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH : All these 106 persons belong to the underground movement. It is difficult to say how many of them are guerillas and how many of them are tribal leaders.

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN : Sir, with regard to part (c) of the question, touching on the overall law

and order situation in Nagaland, I should think it was in respect of that that the hon. Prime Minister had talks with the Naga rebels. I would like to know when these talks were last held and why those talks are not being continued, and why the question of discussion with the Naga rebel leaders is not being taken up nowadays?

SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH : The last round of talks between the Naga representatives and the Government of India took place, I think, in October 1967. We have had no talks since then. And, as to the reason why we are not continuing those talks now, we have already explained the position to the House that as far as the Government of India is concerned, the Naga problem has been solved. We came to an agreement with the Naga leaders in 1960 and they now have a legal and constitutional government in Nagaland and we are dealing with Nagaland Government like any other state Government in India.

SHRI A. D. MANI : Sir, the hon. Minister says that 106 persons have surrendered. They must have made some statements to the authorities. Have they stated that they were China-inspired or Pakistan-inspired? And, what kind of arms were seized from them—Pakistan-made arms or China-made arms? I want the factual details on this question.

SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH : I am not in a position to give the contents of such statements. But I presume that they must have been interrogated and some kind of information must have been given by them. But, this much is a fact that it is not known how many underground Nagas were receiving aid in the past. They have received arms aid and other aids from China and other sources. This is already known to the House.

MINIMUM NEEDS OF THE PEOPLE

*503 **SHRI KRISHAN KANT :** †

SHRI ARJUN ARORA :

Will the **PRIME MINISTER** be pleased to state :

(a) whether Government have now evolved a strategy for meeting the

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Krishan Kant.

basic minimum needs of the people; and

(b) if so, the time by when the needs are likely to be met?

THE PRIME MINISTER AND MINISTER OF PLANNING (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) : (a) The aim of our planning is to raise the standard of living of the people as rapidly as feasible.

(b) According to present calculations a minimum consumption of Rs. 1600 per year family of five is expected to be possible by 1980-81. This could be improved upon if we succeed in further accelerating the pace of development beyond what is envisaged in the Fourth Plan.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Sir, may I know from the hon. Minister whether the attention of the Government and the Prime Minister has been drawn to the resolution of the AICC—the 10-point plan? . . . (*Interruption*). . . Just one minute. Not only that. By 1975, the government—of which those friends and we were a party together—decided that by 1975, the basic minimum needs will be fulfilled and in this very House, the former Deputy Prime Minister Shri Morarji Desai also answered to this question. May I refer to that question and may I know why there has been sliding back from the target and now why we do not want to fulfil the basic minimum needs by 1975 and how we want to do it?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : It is not a question of not wanting to do; but it is a question of what is possible in the given circumstances.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : The question is this; I had said that the strategy of the Fourth Plan does not say in any way that by 1975 the basic minimum needs will be fulfilled. Even in the Fourth Plan it is given that only Rs. 27/- is the minimum that you are providing in 1980. Even according to that, the statement which the Minister of State has made is contradictory. Even by 1980-81, you will not be able to fulfil the basic minimum needs and the statement made by the hon. Minister is in contradiction of the Fourth Plan as we have discussed. I want to know whether the Government is clear that they want really to provide the basic minimum needs of the people

or they want to slide back and go on postponing it.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : This is an extraordinary statement from a responsible Member of parliament. We know that it is not a question of Government not wanting to provide the basic needs to the people. This must be the aim of any Government, no matter what their political or economic opinions may be. This is certainly, a commitment but . . .

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : It is a failure. . .

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : It may be failure or not but everybody knows the difficulties through which this country has been passing and how those difficulties have been faced with courage and endurance by the Indian people. Many of these difficulties the people could not have faced without the help of the Government. (*Interruptions*). Hon. Members may have their views. We will leave this to the people to decide. I have no hesitation in saying that we will leave this for the people of India to decide. Hon. Members can shout or do what they like here. I do not think that shouting makes difference to the people of India but it is making. . .

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. M. DHARIA : Let this House be not degraded by the hon. Prime Minister saying . . .

(*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Nobody is degraded by what anybody else can say. People are degraded or not by what they themselves do or say.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : On a point of order. The point of order arises from the reply of the Prime Minister. She has made a very serious observation which negates parliamentary democracy. She has said that whatever may be said here is not going to make any difference to the people in the country. This is a very serious reflection on the functioning of Parliament. The incomplete answer is objectionable enough and you must ask her to withdraw it.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : The Prime Minister must withdraw what she has said.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : It would not detract from the dignity of the Prime Minister if she expresses regret about the use of that word (*Interruptions*) Such words can slip from the mouth of anyone, it might also slip from my mouth sometimes so I do not find much fault in that but since the Prime Minister happens to be the most important person she should observe certain rules and decorum about the use of words relating to hon. Members, I think it would be in keeping with her stature, status and dignity that she expresses regret about the use of this word.

SHRI PITAMBER DAS : I can very well understand the Prime Minister's dislike for shouting. Many of us ourselves do not like shouting. But shouting in this House does not make any difference for the people of India, that nobody can understand. It does make a difference. After all, the Members here represent the people outside.

SHRI SUKJIDEV PRASAD : On a point of order, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN : There is no point of order now.

श्री सुकदेव प्रसाद : श्रीमन्, मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर सुन लीजिए । माननीय प्रधान मंत्री ने इस शब्द का मंशन किया है—“शाउटिंग”, और पार्लियामेंट का डेमोक्रेसी में पार्लियामेंट के अन्दर कोई भी सवाल या कोई भी प्रश्न जो होता है वह पीमफुल रीम से हल किया जाता है । जब प्राइम मिनिस्टर जवाब देने के लिये खड़ी होती है तो यहाँ पर शाउटिंग शुरू होती है और इसलिये उन्होंने जानबूझकर “शाउटिंग” शब्द का इस्तेमाल किया है जो कि उनका बिल्कुल राइट है और माननीय सदस्य जो यह प्रश्न खड़ा करते हैं उनके लिये, श्रीमन् मैं आपसे रिक्वेस्ट करूंगा और आपसे प्रोटैक्शन चाहूंगा कि कृपया उन लोगों को मना करे कि जब प्राइम मिनिस्टर जवाब देने के लिये खड़ी होती है तो शाउट न किया करे । इसलिये मेरा कहना है कि उन्होंने “शाउटिंग” शब्द पर ही जोर दिया है और किसी दूसरे शब्द पर जोर नहीं दिया है ।

DR. (MRS.) MANGLADEVI TALWAR : Sir, the hon. Leader of the

opposition is very fond of asking the hon. Prime Minister to express regret. There is nothing to express regret in the present context. The hon. Prime Minister only stated a fact that there was shouting. At that moment mostly Members of the Opposition did shout when the hon. the Prime Minister was speaking. At least we should give her a patient hearing. There is nothing offensive in what she said. What she said in that context should not be taken in a bad light. It does not enhance the prestige of the House either.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Sir, I can understand the Prime Minister getting up and saying, “Please do not shout. Let me continue my answer.” But the Prime Minister said that the shouting in this House will make no difference to the people of this country. And it does reflect upon the House. Therefore . . .

(*Interruptions from Government Benches*)

This is all shouting. The very people, who have been defending the Prime Minister, now they are indulging in shouting, and then are advising us.

(*Interruptions from Government Benches*)

You please stop shouting. Let me have my say and then let us talk about shouting.

(*Interruptions from Government Benches*)

The shouting will go on, it seems. Whenever the Prime Minister's name is taken, Mr. Sinha gets up and shouts.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please sit down.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : You ask him to sit down first, Sir. I shall have my say now. (*Interruptions*) I am not going to sit like that. Let them all sit down. I shall have my say and then sit. I am not going to sit. I am not yielding to their interruptions. Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Prime Minister has talked about shouting. Still the shouting has been going on in this House and you see, Sir, what type of shouting has been going on. The Government Benches also shout. As soon as the Prime Minister's name is mentioned, there are some people on the Government Benches—some *** I should say—who just get up and shout and drown other

***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

people's voice. This kind of shouting is most objectionable. (*Interruptions*) This is the kind of shouting. This kind of shouting is most objectionable.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Are you going to listen to us or not, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please sit down.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : I am not going to sit. Let me have my say.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Are you going to listen to us or not, Sir?

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : He will listen to you. First let me have my say. Then he will listen to you. If you are going to control the House, Sir, you also control the Government Benches. After I have had my say, then I shall sit down.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Let him apologise.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Why should I apologise?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Will you please sit down now?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Sir, I want your ruling as to whether *** is a parliamentary word. (*Interruptions*) You please ask him to withdraw. You please expunge the word ***.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Sir, I would humbly request you to note who is shouting now.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Sir, he must take back the word ***. We are not *** here.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Are you able to control this man? Are you able to control the Government benches?

MR. CHAIRMAN : I will expunge the word if I find it necessary.

SHRI RAGHBIR SINGH PANJHARI : He should withdraw the word.

***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : If I must withdraw, the Prime Minister must also withdraw what she said.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Why no?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Sir, on a point of order. I am not bothered as to whether something should be withdrawn or not. The point of order is this that people's name should not have been taken because we know what the people feel. In fact, people want us to fight more. Their complaint is we are not fighting. If you think that the voice is loud, the microphone can be lowered a little. This is an important question and it should not be dealt with as if one side only represents the people. If they represent the people we too represent the people. Therefore let them hear what the point of view of this side is, which is representing at least a segment of the people. We see what is going on in the country: we know the position. Therefore I say it was most unfortunate that people's name should have been taken. The Prime Minister can say that; in fact I shout and if they say don't shout I should not shout. I am not quarrelling with that.

MR. CHAIRMAN : All right; sit down now.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Sir I have not yet. . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : What I say is I want the question to be properly dealt with. Let the people know. . .

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, my name is next; may I ask the question?

(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : I want the Prime Minister to complete the answer.

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : मान्यवर मैं एक निवेदन कर रहा हूँ . . .

श्री सभापति : नहीं, अब बहुत टाईम ले लिया है ।

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : एक मिनट । मान्यवर, गोडे मुराहारी ने जिम शब्द का प्रयोग किया है . . .

श्री सभापति : मैंने कह दिया कि मैं उसको देखूंगा ।

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : वह बर्ड एक्सपन्ज कर दिया जाये । मान्यवर, जैसा उनको अधिकार है वैसे दूसरों को भी प्राप्त है । ऐसी बात नहीं है कि वह इस तरह से दूसरों को धमकी देते रहे । जो अधिकार उनको प्राप्त है वह हमें भी प्राप्त है । (Interruptions) उन्होंने कल्याण चन्द को, स्टेट बैंक के, गाली दी, जब लठी चार्ज हुआ । मैंने प्रतिरोध किया । उन्होंने अनुचित शब्द प्रयोग किये । हम ऐसी बातों को बर्दाश्त नहीं कर सकते । मान्यवर, सोशलिस्ट पार्टी के साथ हमारे प्रदेश की जनता नहीं है, भूपेश गुप्ता के साथ प्रदेश की जनता नहीं है . . .

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : He represents the party of Mr. Charan Singh. These are the *** of the Prime Minister. They have been having a rule of the jungle in Uttar Pradesh.

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : . . . उनके साथ जनता नहीं है । इस तरह के अपशब्दों का प्रयोग करके केवल जनता के गुमराह करना चाहते हैं ।

(Interruptions)

(Mr. Chairman ordered the Reporters note to record any more)

(The hon. Member continued speaking.)

SHRI CHITTA BASU : Sir, what is happening in the House?

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : I ask hon. Members to resume their seats.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : You never control that side.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I have been trying to control everybody.

(Interruptions)

***Expunged is ordered by the Chair.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : I can see your difficulty. My friend there is emulating Mr. Rajnarain.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I appeal to hon. Members to let the business go on. We have taken so much time on this.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Let me have my say. He has made some allegations against me. I will take just three or four minutes.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let the business of the House go on.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : You never stopped him. You never stopped him . . .

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : I appeal to hon. Members to sit down and let the business go on. If they do not listen to my appeal I will have to think of something else.

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : ये झठा आरोप लगाते हैं और हमको उसका जवाब देने का मौका नहीं मिलता है । (Interruptions) मान्यवर, ये गलत एलिगेशन लगाया करते हैं ।

(Interruptions)

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Let me have my say. He has made certain allegations. He has said something about what happened outside the House. He has said something about the . . .

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : इनकी पार्टी झूठी है और इनके सब सार्थी झूठे हैं ।

(Interruptions)

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Let me have my say . . .

SHRI PITAMBER DAS : Just to avoid . . .

(Interruptions)

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : मान्यवर, ये मेशाह दूसरों पर आरोप लगाते हैं ।

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please do not take down.

श्री श्याम लाल यादव : मान्यवर, ...
(Interruptions)

SHRI PITAMBER DAS : Just to avoid Mr. Godey Murahari's personal explanation, whatever has been said about him may be expunged.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, please let us go on with the business. Madam Prime Minister, please complete your sentence.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Sir. . .

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : No, the point will have to be made clear. No, Sir. If you are not able to get the necessary kind of regret from the Prime Minister, then. . .

HON. MEMBERS : No, No.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : If you want us to maintain the dignity of the House, the example has to be set by the Prime Minister. Therefore, I make a very humble suggestion that the Prime Minister should express regret. Otherwise, it would be difficult for us to continue.

(Interruptions)

SHRI K. K. SHAH : You boycotted on that day the function connected with the National Flag.

(Interruptions)

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : It is because of the kind of audacity that you indulged in.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, please sit down.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : If the great Prime Minister does not set an example, then we will have to express our protest against it in the most effective manner.

श्री अवधेश्वर प्रसाद सिंह : चैयरमैन साहब, इन से पूछिये कि जब प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहिब बोल रही थी तो ये खड़े क्यों हो गये और इसके लिए इन्हें माफ़ी मांगनी चाहिये ।

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please sit down now.

SHRI SYED HUSSAIN : Sir, on a point of order. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : No point of order.

SHRI SYED HUSSAIN : On a point of order. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing the point of order. No point of order now.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : You should be pleased to expunge the remarks against the working of this House and the remark that it does not make any difference to the people. You should be pleased to expunge the remarks.

SHRI SYED HUSSAIN : Sir. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, this will not be recorded. Whatever he says will not be recorded.

Shri Sayed Hussain Spoke.

SHRI PITAMBER DAS : Let us hear the Prime Minister.

श्री महावीर त्यागी : मुझे एक मिनट का मौका दे दीजिए मेहरबानी करके ।

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : This aspect we can take up later. The Question Hour can go on.

श्री महावीर त्यागी : जनाब, जो हो गया सो हो गया । आपकी मार्फत, मैं हाउस से अपील करता हूँ कि जो हो गया सो हो गया, यह आपस की नाराजगी कब तक चलेगी? असलमें मुझे अफसोस है . . .

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : आप कांग्रेस में चले जाइए उधर । जब तक प्राइम मिनिस्टर माफ़ी नहीं मांगती . . .

(Interruption)

श्री महावीर त्यागी : इसमें कोई शक नहीं कि कुछ बात इधर से तेजी की हो गई । उस पर आप लोगों को खुश होना चाहिए क्योंकि उस तेजी की बात के हो जाने से हमारे बहुत से भाइयों को मौका मिला कि अपनी लायलटी प्राइम मिनिस्टर को रजिस्टर करा

दे लेकिन वह पोल इटली कराना चाहिए हमारे ऊपर हमले करें ताकि प्राइम मिनिस्टर को मालूम हो जाय के उनकी पार्टी में कौन-कौन लायल हैं लेकिन वह भी पोलाइटली करो। (Interruptions) हाउस से मुझे यह कहना है कि कोई अनपार्लियामेंटरी बात मेरी राय में नहीं हुई है लेकिन प्राइम मिनिस्टर को गुस्सा आ गया। एक बात समझ लेनी चाहिए कि पार्लियामेंट सुप्रीम है, जो मिनिस्टर्स यहां हाउस में आते हैं उनकी हैसियत मेम्बरों के वारवर होती है। वे जिम्मेदार होते हैं, जब दिह होते हैं मेम्बरों के शुबर्टे दूर करने के लिए, मेम्बरों की शिकायतें दूर करने के लिए कर्षिक मेम्बर जो हैं वह जनता के नुमाइन्दे हैं और हुकूमत से सफाई मांगने का उनको अस्तित्तर है। अगर कोई अनप्लेजन्ट बात हो जाय तो मेरा कहना यह है कि मिनिस्टर्स को खास तौर से डिकोरम रखना चाहिए, वे अपने आप पोलाइटली बात करें।

AN HON. MEMBER: It is a point of advice.

श्री महावीर त्यागी : बद किसमती से प्राइमिनिस्टर को कुछ गुस्सा आ गया किसी पर (Interruptions) कुछ उन्होंने कह दिया, लेकिन एब बात मुझको भी तकलीफ दे गई प्राइम मिनिस्टर ने जो यह कह दिया कि लोग आपके चिल्लाने की परवाह नहीं करते हैं। इससे कुछ ऐसा लगा...

(Interruptions)

श्री सभापति : वा, अब खत्म करिए।

श्री महावीर त्यागी : लोग अपोजीशन की परवाह करते हैं क्योंकि अपोजीशन पब्लिक के नुमाइन्दे की हैसियत से उनकी मांगें सरकार के सामने रखता है। उनकी आवाज का असर लोगों पर ज्यादा है, मिनिस्टर्स या प्राइम मिनिस्टर की आवाज का उतना नहीं है। इसलिए मेरा कहना यह है कि...

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN : You give your ruling on the points raised and let us proceed. The House is losing the Question Hour. The House

is really losing an answer to a very important and serious problem that has been raised. You should not keep quiet. You give a ruling and then proceed.

श्री महावीर त्यागी : आइन्दा के लिए हाउस के अन्दर एक अच्छी ट्रेडीशन बनाने के वास्ते मेरी दरखास्त होगी—हालांकि मेरी बात आजकल चलती नहीं है—प्राइम मिनिस्टर से दरखास्त है कि उनकी शान ऊंची होगी अगर वे हाउस से यह कह दें कि उन्हें अफसोस है।

SHRI K. CHANDRASEKHARAN : You give your ruling, Sir.

SHRI SYED HUSSAIN : We are also the representatives of the people. We have also to say something.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : It is ten minutes to twelve.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Sir, you call upon the Prime Minister. Let us hear her.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The Prime Minister.

श्री सुलतान सिंह (हरियाणा) : श्रीमन् वह कहते हैं कि अपरेजिशन का महत्व जनता में ज्यादा है, मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो कानून तोड़ते हैं, जो हंगामा पैदा करते हैं...

MR. CHAIRMAN : That should not be recorded.

(Shri Sultan Singh continued speaking.)

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : We are making our position clear, we are taking some steps. We are constrained to do this. The last appeal was very humbly made by a senior leader like Shri Tyagi, and that appeal has not been headed by the Prime Minister. If the Prime Minister responds to it, then of course...

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY : Sir, I want...

MR. CHAIRMAN : You please sit down.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY : Sir, you cannot make a distinction between Members and Members. When one gets up and shouts you allow it. But when we ask for permission. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : I cannot give permission to 240 Members.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY : Then you give a ruling on that.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Many from that side and many from this side. . .

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY : Sir, my friend spoke from that side—I rise on a point of privilege—without getting your permission. When a Member spoke from that side, in your discretion you did not ask that speech to be expunged. But when my friend from this side spoke, in your discretion, Sir, you ordered that speech to be expunged. It appears to me, it is unfair. You please revise your decision. This is the first point.

Secondly, while the Prime Minister was replying to the question, she had every right to express the view of the Government on that question. . . (*Interruptions*) Members may agree or Members may not agree with it. . . (*Interruptions*) I am in possession of the House and nobody can prevent me from speaking.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, when the Prime Minister, in her capacity as the Prime Minister, speaks in reply to a question put in this House, she is expressing the opinion of the Government on that matter. Members may not agree with that point of view or they may agree with that point of view.

SOME HON. MEMBERS : We know all that.

SHRIMATI PURABI MUKHOPADHYAY : The question, however, is meant for eliciting information from the Government. It is not the time to express the opinions of the Members. So, she is completely within her right when she said that. . . (*Interruptions*) There is a Member sitting there. Whenever a Member from this side spoke in favour of the Government he jumped and said that those who are supporting it are **. But I know. Whose ** are

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

they? Let that Member express his regret and so long as he does not express his regret, I move a motion to suspend him. So, while expressing her point, if the Prime Minister had said that a Member should not shout or that any amount of shouting cannot move her, she is perfectly within her right and the Prime Minister should. . .

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Sir, you have allowed Shrimati Purabi Mukhopadhyay to speak. Now you must have known that the Bengali ladies also can shout.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Jairamdas Daulatram.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : Sir, I am prepared to withdraw what I said provided the Prime Minister also corrects her sentence. . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : We cannot go on like this. We should maintain decorum.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : I might say that they are agents of the Government. Now it is perhaps a better word. I would also request the Prime Minister to correct her sentence.

SHRI JAIRAMDAS DAULATRAM : May I say a few words in regard to this matter? First, I should make the remark that the question hour is unfortunately allowed to become an occasion for a debate between the Members and the Government which, I think, leads to enormous complications. In the question hour we have to seek information and get information instead of allowing it to become a debate between the Government and the Members. I think this is one reason why this situation has arisen.

Secondly, I should seriously suggest that the use of the word "shouting" by anybody, whether on behalf of the Government or on behalf of any Member, should not be considered objectionable. After all, shouting does take place. If any Member does shout and a Minister points out that shouting would not do, there need be no objection. Similarly, if a Minister shouts and a Member says shouting would not do, there need be no objection. On the other hand, many more things have happened

in this House. If we are to speak the truth, even on the side of the Opposition, they have lowered the dignity of the House including my friend, Mr. Godey Murahari, who has today refused to obey the Chair repeatedly.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : I always obey the Chair.

SHRI JAIRAM DAS DAULATRAM : I suggest this matter should be allowed to close here and we should go to the next question. This is the decision which, I think, the Chair should take and proceed to the next question.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Prime Minister.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Shall I answer the question or the debate, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Question.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : May I ask whether I am expected to reply to this debate or to the question which was asked.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I want you to answer the question.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Thank you.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : You are yourself violating the dignity of the House... (*Interruptions*) Now by your asking her to answer the question you have added fuel to the fire. We are not prepared to hear the Prime Minister. We shall all walk out. May I ask you what you have done to safeguard the dignity of the House?

SHRI S. D. MISRA : We will not allow the Prime Minister to speak.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : You have allowed Members to express their opinion for forty minutes. You should have asked the Prime Minister to reply to them. Is that a proper way to conduct the proceedings of the House? It seems the Prime Minister weighs heavily in your scales and not the other hon. Members of the House...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please sit down.

SHRI S. N. MISHRA : The Chair is not safeguarding the dignity of the House and I must point out in all humility that the Chair is not holding the scale evenly. You allowed honble Members to express themselves for about forty minutes but you did not ask the Prime Minister to reply to the points raised by them... (*Interruptions*) Why did you then allow the Members to go on for forty minutes?

MR. CHAIRMAN : The question hour is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

STAND-BY PEACE FORCE UNDER WORLD COURT

*502. **SHRI LAL K. ADVANI :** Will the Minister of EXTERNAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state :

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the plea of the U.N. Secretary General for creating a stand-by peace force under the aegis of the World Court; and

(b) if so, what is the reaction of Government in this regard?

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SARDAR SWARAN SINGH) : (a) No, Sir. No such proposal has been made.

(b) Does not arise.

निर्यात व्यापार में वृद्धि के लिये कदम

* 505. **श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** क्या वैदेशिक व्यापार मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या सरकार द्वारा चौथी पंच-वर्षीय योजना की अवधि में देश के निर्यात व्यापार में वृद्धि करने के लिए कोई नई योजनाएँ तैयार की गई हैं;

(ख) परम्परागत चीजों को छोड़कर अन्य किन-किन वस्तुओं के निर्यात में वृद्धि हुई है और ऐसा किन-किन वस्तुओं के निर्यात में वृद्धि करने का विचार है;