

औद्योगिक विकास, आन्तरिक व्यापार तथा समवाय, कार्यमंत्री (श्री फखरुद्दीन अली अहमद) : (क) नहीं जी। इन योजनाओं की अवधि में उत्पादन में तीन गुनी वृद्धि हुई।

(ख) प्रश्न ही नहीं उठता।

(ग) योजना आयोग योजनाओं का वार्षिक एवं पंचवर्षीय सिंहावलोकन करना चाहता है।

†[THE MINISTER OF INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT, INTERNAL TRADE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI FAKHRUDDIN ALI AHMED) : (a) No, Madam. The production has increased almost 3 times over these Plan years.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) The Planning Commission propose to carry out annual and five-year evaluations of the Plans.]

‡HIGH LEVEL BODY TO CO-ORDINATE WORKING OF PUBLIC SECTOR

269. SHRI BABUBHAI M. CHINAI : Will the Minister of INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT, INTERNAL TRADE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS be pleased to state :

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the report appearing in *Economic Times* dated the 20th May, 1969 to the effect that the Prime Minister will lead a high-level body to be set up for effective coordination and integration in the operation of public sector enterprises ; and

(b) if so, what are the details thereof ?

THE MINISTER OF INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT, INTERNAL TRADE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI FAKHRUDDIN ALI AHMED) : (a) and (b) Government have under consideration a proposal to set up a high-level committee for coordination of basic problems and issues relating to public sector plants including, *inter alia*, a periodical review of the order position of these plants, particularly, the heavy machine-building and heavy electrical units, consideration of resource requirements and allocations to ensure effective utilization of capacity besides review of capital

structure etc. wherever necessary, together with any major issues and problems relating to these plants. The details of composition of the committee are yet to be finalised.

†INTERNATIONAL CHILDREN FAIR

478. SARDAR RAM SINGH : Will the Minister of LAW AND SOCIAL WELFARE be pleased to state :

(a) whether the Indian Council of Child Welfare propose to hold an International Children Fair in India; and

(b) if so, when and what is the expenditure envisaged for the project ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL WELFARE (DR. SHRIMATI PHUL-RENU GUHA) : (a) Yes, Madam,

(b) The dates suggested are from 15th October to 14th November 1969. The expenditure envisaged for the project is Rs. 1,47,000.00.

12 NOON

CALLING ATTENTION TO A
MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC
IMPORTANCE

FORCIBLE ENTRY BY POLICEMEN INTO THE
WEST BENGAL LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now we go to the Calling Attention Motion. I have here about 25 names and many more Members want to ask questions. May I request Members to seek only clarifications by putting questions in a very specific and brief way so that many more may get a chance, besides the 25 names that I have got here ?

SHRI B. K. P. SINHA (Bihar) : Madam, I submit that this is a very serious matter which may be debated in this House. There must be a short debate at least for three hours.

SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY (Mysore) : I agree with him.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA (Orissa) : I support his suggestion for a debate.

†[] English translation.

‡Transferred from the 24th July, 1969.

†Transferred from the 29th July, 1969.

SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY : Madam, the matter is so serious that it requires a thorough discussion in this House, because for the first time, an act of greatest damage has been done. . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not want all that. I know that many of you want a discussion, not a Calling Attention Motion. In this Calling Attention Notice, there are 25 names and if everybody co-operates, we may add about 5 more Members. But if there is a discussion, very few Members will be able to participate. Therefore, I feel from the Chair that Calling Attention is better because many Members from both sides will be able to ask questions. I hope Members will accept this Calling Attention Motion.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL (Gujarat) : Madam, justice will not be done to this matter by merely asking questions. A discussion is very important and necessary in this case.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal) : There are two issues involved. The two issues should not be confused. The Calling Attention Notice is intended to get a statement from the Government and enable us to ask for clarifications, whereas a discussion leaves it open to the Members to express their opinions, make suggestions and so on, and also adopt a resolution, if they like. For example, I should like a resolution to be adopted deploring what happened in West Bengal.

SHRI C. D. PANDE (Uttar Pradesh) : No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not want to waste time. Mr. Rajnarain,

SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY : What is your suggestion ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have said that Calling Attention would give a chance to more Members.

SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY : What about the discussion ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not decided about the discussion.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Madam, Calling Attention should be proceeded with. After that, it should be debated. I wish to move a resolution. Let it be thrown out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. Mr. Rajnarain, will you begin ?

श्री राजनारायण (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मंडम 31 जुलाई, 1969 को पश्चिमी बंगाल की विधान सभा में, जब विधान सभा का सत्र चल रहा था, बड़ी संख्या में पुलिस कर्म-चारियों के जबरदस्ती घुस आने और सभा कक्ष में छीनाझपटी तथा अन्य विध्वंसक कार्य करने की ओर मैं गृह-कार्य मंत्री का ध्यान दिलाना हूँ ।

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYA CHRAN SHUKLA) : Madam Deputy Chairman, according to information furnished by the State Government, on July 31, 1969 some West Bengal police personnel became highly agitated in the 24 Parganas police lines, Alipur, over their demand for immediate handing over of the dead body of Naik Sankar Dutt Sarma from the Mominpore Police Morgue for taking out a funeral procession. The agitated and unruly police personnel then forcibly entered the office room of the Superintendent of Police, 24 Parganas and ransacked his office. After this violent demonstration about 500 West Bengal policemen went in a procession about 2.30 P.M. towards the Mominpore Morgue taking the Additional Superintendent of Police of 24 Parganas at the head of the procession. They brought out the dead body from a truck and came back to Alipur Police Lines at about 3.15 P.M. Thereafter, a funeral procession was taken out from the police lines.

The procession paraded along Reformatory Street, Debendra Lal Khan Road, Lower Circular Road, Kidderpore Road, Red Road and Rani Rashmani Avenue. At about 4.30 P.M. they reached near the South-East gate of the Assembly House. They wanted to get inside the Assembly compound but the Calcutta policemen posted at the Assembly gate tried to prevent them. This resulted in an altercation and scuffle.

A section of the processionists made their way forcibly and rushed inside

the Assembly building. They caused damage to the furniture and fittings of the lobby and forcibly entered the Assembly Hall. They also caused damage to microphones and other furniture and injury to some Members of the Legislative Assembly. The Assembly session was adjourned but the frenzied policemen caused damage to the furniture in the Speaker's room and ran towards the Deputy Chief Minister's room in the Assembly House. One of the security personnel of the Deputy Chief Minister was injured.

The Deputy Chief Minister, while sympathising with the death of the policeman, rebuked and castigated policemen for their utterly indisciplined behaviour in defiling the sanctity of the House and told them that they must apologise for their behaviour.

The remaining processionists along with the bier entered the Southern lawn of the Assembly compound and waited there. At about 5.50 P.M. the processionists were persuaded to leave the Assembly House to avoid a clash with another big procession which was coming towards the Assembly House. The funeral procession then proceeded to Dufferin Road where the dead body was removed in a West Bengal police truck and taken to the Keoratala burning ghat for cremation.

The State Government have decided to dismiss under the proviso to Article 311(2) of the Constitution a number of mutinous police personnel. They have also requested the Central Government to alert the local army authorities to keep themselves in a state of instant readiness to come to the aid of the civil power if and when required. Suitable instructions, as requested by the State Government, have been issued to the army authorities.

There can be no justification whatsoever under any circumstances for the reprehensible and objectionable conduct of the policemen who entered the West Bengal Assembly on July 31, 1969 and behaved in this manner. The disorderly and undisciplined conduct of some members of the police force in West Bengal deserves to be condemned in the strongest possible terms. I am glad that all sections of public opinion have deplored the disgraceful incidents of July 31, 1969.

SHRI C. D. PANDE : On a point of order. The other day when this question was raised, we requested the Minister that he should not give the report of the West Bengal Government only but should give the views of the Central Intelligence or whatever agency they have got in Bengal, to enable us to know the truth. After all, in this dispute the West Bengal Government is a party . . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: On a point of order.

SHRI C. D. PANDE: The version of the West Bengal Government is not enough. We are not satisfied with it. (Interruptions). You should give your side of it also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Have you got anything to say on what he has said, Mr. Shukla?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : If specific questions are asked, I will try to give information, whatever I have in my possession.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Rajnarain.

श्री राजनारायण : माननीया, मैं घर मंत्री की उस भावना से इत्तफाक करता हूँ।

एक माननीय सदस्य : जोर से बोलिये।

श्री राजनारायण : माननीया, हमारे एक मित्र संयुक्त मोशलिस्ट पार्टी के, जो राज्य मंत्री रह चुके हैं उनकी मेडिकल इंस्टीट्यूशन में मृत्यु हो गई और हम अभी वहीं से चले आ रहे हैं। हम एक मिनट के अन्दर अपनी स्वाभाविक आवाज में आ जायेंगे।

माननीया, मैं घर मंत्री जी की इस भावना में और मजबूती के साथ अपनी भावना भी मिलाना चाहता हूँ कि वंगाल की पुलिस ने, पुलिस की एक टुकड़ी ने जिस ढंग से विधान सभा में प्रवेश किया, वह सर्वथा निन्दनीय है, भर्त्सना के योग्य है और उसको जितना निन्दा को जाय वह थोड़ा है। यह बात मैं साफ कह देना चाहता हूँ क्योंकि हम को डेमोक्रेसी चलाना है और जब डेमोक्रेसी चलाना है तो थोड़ी भी अंगुली दबे और उसके बाद

[श्री राजनारायण]

कोई पार्लियामेंट में चढ़ जाय, सदन में घुस जाय, यह तो बिल्कुल खराब काम है, जम्हूरियत को कत्ल करने का काम है, जनतंत्र के गले पर छुरा चलाने का काम है और उसकी जितनी निन्दा की जाय वह थोड़ी है।

उपसभापति : सवाल पूछिये।

श्री राजनारायण : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या सरकार को यह जानकारी है कि आखिर ऐसी घटना हुई क्यों। इसके 3 क्रम हैं। एक मर्तवा किसी जोतदार की जमीन ले ली गई थी। उस जोतदार ने गोली चलाई दो आन्दोलनकारी कार्यकर्ता मर गये। हमारी खबर है कि उसके बाद एक जबरदस्त प्रोसेशन गया और जोतदारों में से 5 को मार डाला गया। जहाँ तक मुझे याद है इस घटना की निन्दा श्री ज्योति बासू ने की थी और श्री अजय मुकर्जी ने भी की थी। उसके बाद फिर चढ़ाई हुई और जब पुलिस को जानकारी हुई तो पुलिस एक स्पेशल आफिसर के साथ गई। उस समय पुलिस को चारों तरफ से इन लोगों ने घेर लिया और घेर कर पुलिस को ओवर पावर कर दिया। उस समय पुलिस का जो आदमी मिला उसी को मार डाला। उस समय पुलिस वाले चाहते तो फायरिंग कर सकते थे, गोली चला सकते थे, मगर जो आफिसर था उसने गोली चलाने की इजाजत नहीं दी। यहाँ पर पुलिस के रंज रहने का कोई खास कारण था, इसके बारे में सरकार को कोई जानकारी थी? पुलिस वालों का कहना है कि जिस ढंग से हमारे ऊपर हमला किया गया, जिस ढंग से हमारे जवान की जान गई और इस पर भी हमारे बार बार कहने पर भी हमें गोली चलाने नहीं दिया गया। यह तो है मूल कारण। उस पुलिस के सिपाही की लाश को लेकर वे लोग गये। मगर मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार को, पश्चिमी बंगाल की सरकार को, इस बात की जानकारी थी कि साढ़ेतीन बजे अलीपुर थाने में 5 हजार

पुलिस वाले जमा हो गये थे, करीब 1 बटे के बाद साढ़ेचार बजे असेम्बली बिल्डिंग के पास पहुँचे और साढ़ेपाच बजे वे लोग वहाँ से डिसपर्स हो गये। तो मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या एक घंटा पश्चिमी बंगाल सरकार के लिए काफी नहीं था कि वहाँ पर ऐसी व्यवस्था करती कि जो मजमा अलीपुर थाने के पास था और आगे बढ़ रहा था उसको वहीं पर रोक देती और इस प्रकार की घटना को न होने देती। तो यह बात मानो जा रही है और सही तरीके पर मानो जा रही है कि घर मंत्री ने इस तरह की कोई कार्यवाही नहीं की?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That will do. You must wind up now. If each Member takes ten minutes, how can we finish this? You must also cooperate.

श्री राजनारायण : माननीया हमारे पास अभी दो बजे रात श्री गोपाल बोस का एक तार आया है जो कि मयुक्त सोशलिस्ट पार्टी के एक्स सेक्रेटरी रह चुके हैं और एक बार राज्य के चेयरमन थे। उनका आज हमारे पास रात के दो बजे एक तार आया है जो मैं सदन के सामने पढ़ देना चाहता हूँ।

"Situation in Bengal grave due to police disturbances (.) Attended last meeting United Front (.) My opinion Ministry has failed (.) Suggest Central Party should immediately set up a committee of inquiry to go into the incidents to determine causes and expose the political game within United Front spelling danger to the country (.) Request come immediately to Calcutta with other leaders to apprise the situation first-hand (.) Request treat this most important and urgent(.)"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That will do... (Interruptions.) This shows you have no question. You cannot take so much time.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि श्री गोपाल बोस...

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE (West Bengal) : Who Mr. Gopal Ghosh is, we do not know.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं श्री भोपाल बोस को जानता हूँ। वे श्री मुभाष चन्द्र बोस के साथ बराबर काम करते थे। Your political life is a very... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please put your question; otherwise, I will pass on to the next Member. Please put a question.

श्री राजनारायण : हम सरकार से यह जानना चाहते हैं कि श्री भोपाल बोस ने जो तार में बात लिखी है उसकी सरकार को जानकारी है। क्या सरकार इस घटना की ठीक ठीक जानकारी करने के लिए कोई व्यवस्था करेगी ताकि पश्चिमी बंगाल में जनतंत्र को कुठाराघात करने की घटना न हो।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You have taken nearly fifteen minutes. You cannot go on like that.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं सरकार से यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि सविधान का धारा 311(2) मैं यह कहा गया है कि किसी को मस्पेड करने में, किसी को हटाने में किसी प्रकार की इन्क्वायरी की जरूरत नहीं है। मैं अपने मित्र श्री भूपेश गुप्त और श्री ए० पी० चटर्जी से कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमने बार बार इस क्लोज की निन्दा की है और कहा है कि बिना किसी को सफिशियन्ट टाइम दिये हुए, बिना किसी को एक्सप्लेनेशन का मौका दिये हुए अगर उसे मस्पेड किया जाता है तो उसे डिक्टेटोरियल पावर मिल जाती है। अगर पश्चिमी बंगाल की सरकार इस तरह की कार्यवाही करती है तो इसी तरह की तानाशाही कांग्रेस भी सारे देश में चलायेगी। आज पश्चिमी बंगाल की सरकार इस तरह का कदम उठाकर कांग्रेस पार्टी को मौका देती है कि वह भी इस तरह की कार्यवाही करे। हमने सविधान की इस धारा का जनतंत्र में विरोध किया है क्योंकि अगर इस धारा का इस तरह से इस्तेमाल किया जाता है तो फिर श्री शुक्ल और श्री चव्हाण इसकी जगह भी लागू करेंगे और यह बहुत बड़ा खतरा है। इसलिए हमारा इतना ही सवाल है।

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : माननीय सदस्य ने अलीपुर घटना के संबंध में केवल एक सवाल पूछा है और वह यह है कि अगर यहाँ के माननीय सदस्य इस दुर्घटना की जांच करना चाहेंगे तो भारत सरकार क्या मुविधा दे सकती है? जहाँ तक इस मामले का संबंध है, इस मामले में भारत सरकार द्वारा कोई मुविधा देने के बारे में प्रश्न ही नहीं उठता है क्योंकि अगर वे कलकत्ते जायेंगे तो वे इस संबंध में बंगाल सरकार से जांच करने की मुविधा माग सकते हैं क्योंकि यह मामला उसी से संबंधित है।

श्री राजनारायण : हम तो जांच करने के बारे में कह रहे हैं।

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : जहाँ तक हमारे द्वारा जांच करने का सवाल है, इस तरह की घटनाओं के बारे में जो नियम है हम उसी के मुताबिक काम करते हैं। इस तरह की जांच कभी भी दुर्घटना होती है तो राज्य सरकारों को उसको जांच पड़ताल करनी पड़ती है। हमने उसके बारे में जांच पड़ताल की और जो सूचना हमें उनसे प्राप्त हुई उसी के बाद माननीय सदस्यों के सामने यह वक्तव्य दिया गया है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now Mr. Kulkarni.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Madam,...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot ask a question.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : I am not asking a question. Is this the procedure for a Calling-Attention Motion? There are no further views coming from the Minister.

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA (Bihar): Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA : The honourable Minister has said that whenever such incidents take place, the enquiry is always made through the State Government. Here the State Government is a party and still he wants to make an enquiry through the State Government.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Mr. Kulkarni, please put your question.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra) : Madam . . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Then, Madam, the State Government also should hold an enquiry into the Central Government . . . (*Interruptions*). The Central Government is a party to this. The State Government should hold an enquiry into the Central Government's actions. It is indulging in all kinds of corruption. The Central Government is a party . . . (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Kulkarni.

श्री राजनारायण : मैडम, जब आप देख रही हैं कि मंत्री जी कुछ जवाब नहीं दे रहे हैं तो यह अच्छा होगा कि आप इस पर बहस कराइये। डेमोक्रेसी पर जो आज खतरा है उस पर सदन बहस करे।

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : I wanted to know from the Government clarifications on three points. I want to know whether it is a fact that during the last one month or so some 80 to 100 deaths have taken place in this area on account of some distribution of lands? Actually the land to be distributed is about 1 or 1.2 per cent. while the State Government and the constituents of the State Government are fighting among themselves to distribute that land among their own people. Is it a fact?

May I also know if in the meeting of the Cabinet on 30th or 31st there was a discussion on the lawlessness in the State and Mr. Ajoy Mukherjee felt that law and order had deteriorated and on this account there was a big scuffle and argument, as well as hot discussions among the constituents of the UF Government? Is it also not a fact that the UF Government has demoralised the Police Force by taking action and by talking to them that they should not take action against the *goondas* and members of their own political parties and, if so, how does the Government think that if such eruptions take place it is only the poor Police Force that is to be blamed and not Mr. Jyoti Basu and his clan?

Lastly, is it not a fact that the Central Intelligence information is something

different from the information given here in this House which has been cooked up by the State Government ?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA: It is a fact that in the 24 Parganas area there have been disturbances among the constituent political parties which constitute the UF Government. There had been some disturbances and the House knows that there was a firing in a village there and the Police party went there and this death resulted from the Police party going there to bring peace there. This very policeman who was killed in that village was brought back and the funeral procession was taken. In answer to the first question, I confirm that there have been disturbances in that area in which policemen have been involved. There have been allegations and counter-allegations about the inactivity of the police or involvement of the police in law and order matters. So there has been a background to this dispute. As far as the question of argument in the Cabinet is concerned we have no information about it. As regards the demoralisation in the police Force, this is a question about which I cannot give any opinion here. It is a matter on which every Member must form his own opinion after looking into the facts of the case.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I want your protection, Madam. I asked about the Central Intelligence report.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : He asked whether we have our own information. We do have our own information and our own sources of information but I would not be able to say here at all whether our information is in conformity with the information given by the Bengal Government or not.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : It should be laid on the Table. I demand it. I want your protection. When the Minister admits that he has information, why is he not placing it on the Table ?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Let him come out with it. What does he mean by saying: 'We have our information'. This is very mischievous. Either the Minister should . . . (*Interruptions*) When the Minister is making a statement here, he is making it not as the West Bengal Government man. He is making it as a member of the Central Government responsible to this Parliament. Now, normally in such matters the statement is based on the facts furnished by the State Government. He has made it. If he

has the courage, surely, instead of trying to suggest that he has his own sources of information, he should get up and say which part of the statement his source contradicts. Let him say that. Which part of the statement of Mr. Basu and Mr. Mukherji is contradicted? Are you running parallel agency there? This is an insinuation. You have to go by the West Bengal Government information. It is a constituent of the Indian Union. I am not afraid of it . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA : Whatever information he has, let him place it before the House.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : He should tell us which part of the statement is wrong

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR (Uttar Pradesh) : I rise on a point of order. I do not agree with the demand made by Mr. Kulkarni or Mr. Gupta because any information which the Central Government has, unless and until the West Bengal Government is dismissed, the Central Government has no right to divulge. As long as there is a properly constituted Government in the State and the matter relates to that part of the State, he cannot divulge it.

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA : Why discuss it here?

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : As long as that Government is there, the Minister has to give the information given from there and I do not agree that it is a matter of courage. If he takes up courage, the situation will be repeated which has been repeated in Bengal. Mr. Gupta may have any courage because he has not to rule or administer the country. He is not worried about law and order, and security or tranquillity or peace in the country. So he can demand any information from Mr. Shukla. Under the circumstances the Minister should not be asked and he has no right to place it on the Table.

(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Why should everybody stand up. I have 25 names here. I have a very long list and after this I want to give the others also a chance, specially those who are on this side and who come from that State, but if you are to go on, you must take the replies from the Minister and not force him to say otherwise. Let the whole list be over and after that we shall see, time permitting.

SHRI RAJNARAIN : Point of order.

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA : A very important point of order.

SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, he has accepted the charge that the things are being cooked up. Is the House listening to cooked-up things, or is the House listening to the facts as they are ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. All of you cannot stand up at the same time. Now Mr. Mitra.

SHRI P. C. MITRA (Bihar) : Madam, while the action of the demonstrating policemen is certainly condemnable and all support should be given to the West Bengal Government to enable them to take stern disciplinary measures against the miscreants, may I know from the hon. Minister whether he is aware of the extent to which the Deputy Chief Minister of West Bengal and his party are responsible for bringing about an all round atmosphere of lawlessness and violence in the State and, further, whether the hon. Minister will be pleased to give the following information : first, whether the Deputy Chief Minister, Shri Jyoti Basu, offered to resign from his office even before the Chief Minister in view of the fact that he utterly failed to give protection to the Speaker, Members of his Cabinet, and other Members of the Assembly, which he is supposed to provide as the Minister in charge of Police; secondly, . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Your questions are very long.

SHRI P. C. MITRA : . . . secondly whether in the meeting of the Co-ordination Committee of the United Front after the gruesome incidents in Madhusudanpur and Bharatgarh villages the Chief Minister himself said to Mr. Jyoti Basu that things had become unbearable and urged him to take effective steps to stop all this violence, and whether Mr. Jyoti Basu accepted that many of the anti-social elements had entered into the constituent parties of the United Front and he assured the Chief Minister in that meeting of the Co-ordination Committee that he would take action against all those anti-social elements and make them quit the United Front; thirdly . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : How many pages do your questions run into?

SHRI P. C. MITRA: . . . thirdly, whether the same Deputy Chief Minister, who was against the stationing of the Central Reserve Police in West Bengal, has now been compelled to allow the military to stand by and come to the aid of the civil authorities when called, which is also a Force completely under the control and administration of the Central Government; . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing more. You cannot go on like this, Mr. Mitra.

SHRI P. C. MITRA : . . . fourthly, whether the hon. Minister's attention has been drawn to a report that, taking advantage of the present situation, the Deputy Chief Minister as decided to do away with the services of a large number of police officers and police personnel of Calcutta and West Bengal and to replace them by his own party-supporters; fifthly, . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : How can I give chance to others if you go on like this ?

SHRI P. C. MITRA : I am finishing with this last question. What was the approximate number of policemen who entered the Assembly precincts? The Deputy Chief Minister has said that only a small number of them entered the Assembly precincts. Then how is there talk of dismissing about three hundred police officers when his own statement was that the number was only about a hundred?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA: Madam, the hon. Member asked me whether there was any atmosphere of lawlessness. As I have said earlier, there have been instances of lawlessness here and there, and the police personnel who went . . .

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: On a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Home Minister first finish the answer.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA :and the police personnel, who went to control those instances of law and order, were themselves subjected to lawlessness in many instances, where they could not fulfil their duties properly, and in one of the

instances I stated earlier, the police constable, whose funeral procession was taken out, this particular constable was shot dead in one of these incidents of lawlessness in 24-Parganas.

As far as the question of the offer of the Deputy Chief Minister to resign is concerned, Madam, we are not aware of any such offer having been made by the Deputy Chief Minister. As for the other questions asked by the hon. Member, they are of a general nature. And may I clarify, Madam, that whenever we have our information, we use it for our own purposes? And I refute the charge of Mr. Bhargava, that we are cooking up anything here, emphatically. I would not give any information to this hon. House which is believed to be untrue. They are facts which I have placed before this hon. House. Of course I may only say this, Madam, that we may have additional information and we may have much more information yet to come. But it is wrong and uncharitable to say that the information that I have given here is cooked up, or it is wrong. It is not wrong; it is right to the best of our belief.

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA : What about the replacement of policemen by their partymen? That point was raised by this hon. Member.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Yes, he asked that one more question. In the barrage of questions I forgot to answer that particular question. He asked whether the West Bengal Government have replaced certain police personnel with their own partymen. I have no information with me at present about that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now there are Members from other parties also who have tabled this Calling Attention Notice. I would first of all like one from each party to put their questions now. I shall go round in that manner first of all. Mr. Dahyabhai Patel.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : Madam, I would like to repeat once again that this is a matter for discussion, and question and answer like this is not going to satisfy this House. The general feeling in this House is that the law and order situation in Bengal has gone completely out of hand and it needs to be tackled properly. The Home Minister is not willing to come out with all the facts known to him from

all the sources for reasons best known to him, and so this House is not satisfied. Everybody knows that the situation in Bengal is deteriorating every day. There is no sense of security in the minds of the people. There is a reign of terror by their own young partymen there.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: On a point of order.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : What is this interruption so soon? Are you controlling the House, Madam, or is he controlling the House?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I am not opposed to a general discussion, but. . .

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : Madam, I am not to be interrupted by Mr. Bhupesh Gupta every time I speak on a subject such as this.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : On a point of order.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : Madam, this is disturbance to the order prevailing in the House, and this is what they are doing in Bengal, disturbing the law and order there. I can also repay him in the same coin when he speaks. But we want to observe a sense of restraint in whatever we do. Because we do not do as they do, this is what they are doing every day in Bengal. This is the type of law and order that they have in Bengal every day.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : What nonsense he is speaking, tommy-rot?

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : Madam, will the Home Minister tell this House honestly whether there is not a sense of frustration and demoralisation pervading the entire police force there and this is only a small outcome of the pent-up feelings in the police force? During so many months of the UF regime the police has been prevented from taking action where action was warranted, and prevented from protecting law-abiding citizens. Because of the interference of Ministers the police, when they have arrested people guilty of certain acts, have been forced to release them. On the contrary, people who have complained of lawless actions have had to be arrested, again because of the interference of Ministers. And all this

has culminated in this unfortunate incident. However condemnable the action of the police in going to the Assembly has been, one cannot shut one's eyes to what has been happening all these months under the United Front regime. Madam, I have been pointing out this from the day this House started this Session, have been saying that there is no law and order in Bengal, that it has completely broken down. And as always happens, when law and order is subverted, ultimately it recoils on the people who encourage it. Will the hon. the Home Minister give us a clear answer about the difficulties of the police force in West Bengal, how they have been demoralised, the amount of interference by the UF Ministers and how the police were being prevented from taking proper action whenever they had found it necessary?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That will do.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Madam, I have said in my main statement that whatever the provocation, whatever may be the reason, nothing can justify the action the policemen took in entering the Assembly and defiling the House.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : That was not my question.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I am coming to that. Having said that, I would say this. We can see a sense of frustration there and that frustration must have been behind this action of theirs. I am not saying that there is no frustration. Without some frustration no such action would have been taken. But I again want to emphasize that whatever the frustration, whatever the pent-up feeling, no hon. Member of this House could justify the policemen entering the Assembly Chamber and doing that kind of thing. But I cannot deny that there was some sense of frustration. . . .

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : Why is the Home Minister running away from the main question? My question was about the breakdown of law and order and interference in the functioning of the police by the UF Ministers who prevent the police from taking proper action. Why don't you answer that?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Some breakdown has taken place in somebody's head.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Pitamber Das.

SHRI C. D. PANDE : Madam, we have taken the trouble to raise the question and we must be given a chance.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me first call the major parties; otherwise they will not get their chance even after one hour. I am coming to all of you.

श्री पीताम्बर दास (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम मैं एक बात पूछना चाहता हूँ होम मिनिस्टर साहब से कि क्या यह बात ठीक है कि जो पुलिस के कुछ सिपाही विधान भवन में घुस गये उन को वहाँ के पुलिस मिनिस्टर ज्योति बसु साहब ने बहुत डाँटा फटकारा, लेकिन फिर भी सिपाहियों ने उन की बिल्कुल चिन्ता नहीं की। तो क्या इस से यह प्रकट नहीं होता कि उन के मन में वहाँ के मिनिस्टर के प्रति अनादर और तिरस्कार की भावना है? ऐसा क्यों है क्या इस का जानने की आपने कोशिश की।

दूसरी बात यह है कि उन्हीं सिपाहियों को जिस समय पुलिस कमिश्नर ने यह कहा कि तुम लोग पाँच मिनट के अदर विधानभवन खाली कर दो तो उन लोगों ने चुपचाप उस आदेश का पालन किया और पाँच मिनट के अदर अंदर ये लोग विधान भवन से चले गये। तो जहाँ तक उन की अनुशासनबद्धता का सवाल है क्या इस से उस का अदाजा नहीं लगता? इतने अनुशासनबद्ध लोग भी वहाँ के पुलिस मिनिस्टर के प्रति तिरस्कार की भावना क्यों रखते हैं क्या इस को जानने की कोशिश की गयी? अगर का गयी तो उस का क्या नतीजा निकला?

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : मैं ने इसके बारे में पहले कहा कि वहाँ पर उन के मन में कुछ इस प्रकार की भावना अवश्य होगी जिस के कारण उन्होंने इस प्रकार की, गैरअनुशासन की कार्यवाही की। उस कार्यवाही के कारण क्या है इस बारे में भी मैंने पहले कहा है कि इस की कुछ पृष्ठभूमि है। 24 परगना में और भरतगढ़ नाम के गांव में जो घटनाएँ

हुई और इन के पहले भी दो तीन घटनाएँ ऐसी हुई कि जिन के कारण इस तरह की भावना को बढ़ने में बल मिला और इस बारे में टीका-टिप्पणी भी काफी हुई थी और अखबारों में भी आया था कि इस प्रकार की भावना फैलती जा रही है और इसलिए यह कहा जा सकता है कि इस के पीछे कुछ पृष्ठ-भूमि अवश्य थी। इस के साथ ही साथ आप यह जो पूछना चाहते हैं कि उन्होंने वहाँ जा कर मिनिस्टरों से बात चीन की, मिनिस्टरों ने उन को डाँटा और फिर उन्होंने मिनिस्टर का अनादर किया उस का मनोवैज्ञानिक कारण क्या हो सकता है, यह मैं नहीं कह सकता क्या कारण हो सकता है लेकिन दुर्घटना हुई इस से साफ पता लगता है कि उन के मन में यदि कोई आदर सम्मान की भावना विधान सभा के प्रति या एम० एल० एज० के प्रति या मिनिस्टर के प्रति होती तो इस तरह की दुर्घटना होने की संभावना नहीं थी। इस तरह की दुर्घटना हुई इस के मायने है कि उन के दिल में उन के प्रति कोई आदर सम्मान की भावना नहीं थी। यह भावना क्यों नहीं है और क्यों नष्ट हुई इस बारे में मैंने कहा कि पृष्ठभूमि है। लेकिन उस को क्रियेट कैसे किया गया और उस के कारण क्या है, प्रश्नोत्तर काल में इस सब का जवाब नहीं दिया जा सकता।

श्री पीताम्बर दास : पुलिस कमिश्नर के आदेश पर एक दम से वे सब विधान भवन से बाहर चले गये इस से क्या उन की अनुशासन प्रियता नहीं मालूम पड़ती?

(Interruption)

SHRI G. H. VALIMOHMED MOMIN (Gujarat) : There is a reference in the Home Minister's statement that the police after having indulged in this vandalism dispersed because some procession of some other people was coming. Who were the other people who were coming? Because I am told that the Bengal Government also maintains a sort of citizens' militia and was it that which was coming and was it threatening to overrun these policemen? What is the Home Minister's reaction to that?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : The other procession that was coming was a procession of the supporters of the UF Government.

SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY : So the cat is out of the bag. *(Interruptions.)*

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : And there was an imminent danger of a clash between the two and therefore the police procession was advised to go away and they left.

SHRI A. D. MANI (Madhya Pradesh) : May I ask the hon. Minister of State whether his attention has been drawn to an extraordinary statement made by Mr. Jyoti Basu about this unfortunate and deplorable event the other day when he addressed a gathering in Calcutta? He said at a rally of UF supporters that thousands of youths will come forward to deal with such unruly policemen if necessary. May I ask the Minister whether the Government of India have conveyed its views on this open incitement of mobs against policemen and may I know whether he considers that such incitement would not reproduce Mao's China in West Bengal?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Wonderful interpretation. What is wrong? Suppose I say thousands of young men shall rally in favour of bank nationalisation *(Interruptions.)*

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Madam, this matter concerns the West Bengal Government directly and they would be responsible for whatever action they take and if they take any action which rebounds on them then they will be facing the consequences, not we.

SHRI C. D. PANDE : In judging this incident we should have a full idea of the background that has been simmering for the last five months. The Home Minister may not be aware but every Member of this House and every man in this country is aware that for the last five months a situation is developing in West Bengal—whether it is a question of Durgapur or Cossipore or looting of trains carrying arms and ammunition. . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Or whether it is C.D. Pande's head.

SHRI C. D. PANDE : . . . and the whole situation should be judged in that background. Is not the Home Minister aware that there has been a large number of representations from the Central Government employees in Calcutta that their life is not secure there. . . . *(Interruptions.)* The Home Minister should listen to this. Is he not aware that a large number of Central Government employees stationed in Calcutta have represented that their life is not secure there, that the way the things are moving is not proper, that their wives had been warned to be prepared for widows' lives? Is it not a fact that the officers are being *gheraoed*, that peoples' courts are being. . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your question?

SHRI C. D. PANDE : Is it not a fact that the policemen are not allowed to function properly to maintain law and order. . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Are you in Delhi or Ranchi?

SHRI C. D. PANDE : You are in Agra. You sit down, you damn fool.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think that should be withdrawn.

SHRI C. D. PANDE : I withdraw, provided Mr. Bhupesh Gupta withdraws.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : What is that? Withdraw what?

SHRI C. D. PANDE : Your asking whether I am in asylum.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Can't I ask whether we are in Delhi or in Ranchi?

(Interruptions)

SHRI C. D. PANDE : You always act like a buffoon in the House. Can you take liberties with the House? Are you a superman?

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, before the Minister answers, I want to know. . .

SHRI ABID ALI (Maharashtra) : He has withdrawn it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI C. D. PANDE : If he withdraws, I withdraw...

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : If he ceases to be a lunatic, I withdraw it. You are an esteemed colleague...

(Interruptions)

SHRI M. SRINIVASA REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, I want to know what is the fate of the nation, if such unparliamentary words are used...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : On your side.

SHRI M. SRINIVASA REDDY : On both sides...

(Interruptions.)

SHRI C. D. PANDE : I withdraw.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Everything stands.

(Interruptions)

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Madam, I can make out only one specific question that the hon. Member has asked and that is whether we have received complaints from the Central Government employees about lack of safety and lack of proper working conditions in Calcutta. I would say that we have received several complaints from the Central Government employees working in Calcutta and other areas of West Bengal about the unsafe conditions in which they have to work and that they do not have proper security and proper arrangements in which they can discharge the duties of their office.

श्री जगत नारायण (हरियाणा) : मैडम, मैं बड़े अदब के साथ होम मिनिसटर से यह दरिदापन करना चाहता हूँ कि क्या उन्होंने होम मिनिसटर, बंगाल, का वह बयान बड़े गौर से पढ़ा है जो कि उन्होंने बंगाल विधान सभा में 1 अगस्त को इस वाक्य को मजम्मत में दिया। इस बयान में उन्होंने यह तसलीम किया है कि उन्हें इस बात का डलम था कि जो नायक मारा गया था उसका जलूस निकल रहा है, उसमें उन्होंने यह भी तसलीम किया कि वह उस वाक्य की बहुत मजम्मत करते हैं मगर उसके साथ ही वह इस बात के लिये तैयार थे कि अगर वह उस नायक की लाश को ले

आयें तो वह हार भी पेश करें, वह हार भी मंगवाया गया था, और उसके जनाजे में, उसकी अर्थी में भी शामिल हों। क्या उन्होंने इस बयान को पढ़ा है? अगर मैडम इजाजत दें तो मैं उसको पढ़ कर सुना सकता हूँ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : But please be brief.

श्री डाह्याभाई व० पटेल : मुनाइये, मुनाइये

श्री जगत नारायण : यह बयान है :

"It is true that a constable was done to death in circumstances which we do not approve. It is understandable that his death will cause grief among his kinsmen and colleagues. It is appreciated that a solemn funeral procession will be taken out by them for expressing their grief. But let it not be forgotten that we are the co-sharers of that grief. Here we were waiting—the Chief Minister and I—with wreaths of flowers which we would have offered to the funeral procession in token of our participation in their grief and sorrow. I would have myself gone to the cremation ground."

यह सारा उनका अपना बयान है जो कि उन्होंने बंगाल विधान सभा में पढ़ा। इससे मुझे बिल्कुल साफ जाहिर होता है कि बंगाल के होम मिनिसटर और चीफ मिनिसटर को इस सारे वाक्यात का पता था, डलम था। तो अगर उनको डलम था तो उन्होंने इस बात का क्यों ध्यान नहीं रखा कि जब वह लोग प्रोसेशन ले कर वहाँ पर पहुँच रहे हैं तो जड़-बात उभर सकते हैं? एक बात और भी है। क्या उनकी नोटिस में यह बात आई है कि श्री ज्योति बसु ने यह वायदा किया था कि जिस वक्त वहाँ पर लाश की लायेंगे तो वह वहाँ उनको एंड्रेस करेंगे और जब उनको बुलाया गया तो उन्होंने एंड्रेस करने से इंकार कर दिया जिसकी वजह से ये तमाम वाक्यात हुये।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That will do.

श्री जगत नारायण : वाक्यात बहुत खराब हुये उसकी मज्जमन हर तरफ से होनी चाहिये इसके हक में मैं हू लेकिन मैं बड़े अदब से कहना चाहता हू कि इसकी सारी जिम्मेदारी चीफ मिनिस्टर और होम मिनिस्टर पर पड़ती है क्योंकि जब उनको इल्म था कि एक प्रोसेशन निकल रहा है, लाश ले आ रहे हैं और उन्होंने अपनी श्रद्धाजलि देने के लिये रोथस भी तैयार कर रखे हैं...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please do not repeat.

श्री जगत नारायण : तो इन हालत में क्या होम मिनिस्टर साहब यह मुनासिब नहीं समझते और मैं खास तौर पर श्री भूपेश गुप्त से कहूंगा कि वह इन हालात को मद्देनजर रखते हुये क्यों नहीं वहां के होम मिनिस्टर से कहते कि वह इस्तीफा दे दे।

मैडम, मेरा एक दूसरा सवाल भी है। मैं बड़े अदब से होम मिनिस्टर साहब से पूछना चाहता हू कि यही वाक्यात जो कि वेस्ट बंगाल विधान सभा में हुये वही राज्य सभा में, लोक सभा में भी न पेश आयें उसके लिये क्या प्रबन्ध हमारी सरकार कर रही है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That will do. Do you want others to be given a chance or not, if each of you take ten minutes?

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : जहां तक कि उपमुख्य मंत्री के वक्तव्य का सवाल है वह वक्तव्य हम लोगों के ध्यान में है और उन्होंने जो कहा था वहां पर कि उनका इरादा था कि वहां वह पुलिसमैन के शव के ऊपर एक हार चढ़ायें, यह सब बातें हम लोगों को मालूम है। इसके पहले भी वहां पर कई ऐसी दुर्घटनाएँ हुई हैं पश्चिमी बंगाल में, जिसके कारण कि वहां के उपमुख्य मंत्री को पुलिस लाइंस में जा कर पुलिस वालों के सामने भाषण देना पड़ा। एक खजहराना नाम से स्थान है वहां भी इस प्रकार की कुछ घटनाएँ हुई थीं, उसके बाद मई

में हुई और जिसके ऊपर उपमुख्य मंत्री वहां लाइंस में गये और उन्होंने पुलिस वालों के सामने भाषण दिया और उनको समझाने की कोशिश की। उससे पुलिस वालों का कितना समाधान हुआ या नहीं हुआ यह हम नहीं जानते। उसके बाद यह मामला बढ़ता रहा। उसके बाद दुर्गापुर में घटना हुई। इन सब दुर्घटनाओं के साथ किस तरह से उनके मन में असर हुआ और उससे यह दुर्घटना हुई उस पर मैंने पहले ही बताया कि उसमें मुख्य बात यह है कि वहां की सरकार को इस बात की सूचना होना आवश्यक थी कि वहां के जो पुलिस वाले हैं उनके मन में ऐसी दुर्भावनाएँ आ रही हैं, उपमुख्य मंत्री स्वयं पुलिस लाइंस में गये और भाषण दिया, उसके लिये जो प्रयत्न कर सकते थे किया, उसके बाद भी दुर्घटना हुई।

दूसरा सवाल मैं नहीं जानता कि माननीय सदस्य ने क्या किया, लोक सभा और राज्य सभा के लिये प्रश्न पूछ रहे थे, मैं समझ नहीं पाया कि वह क्या प्रश्न कर रहे थे।

श्री जगत नारायण : उस दिन उन्होंने क्या प्रबन्ध किया इस बात को रोकने के लिये जब कि उनको इल्म था।

श्री विद्याचरण शुक्ल : उपमुख्य मंत्री वहां स्वयं पुलिस लाइंस में गये और सरकार का जो दृष्टिकोण था वह वहां जा कर समझाया, इसके सिवाय और क्या प्रबन्ध किया मुझे मालूम नहीं।

श्री जगत नारायण : यहाँ राज्य सभा में और लोक सभा में...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Shri Niranjana Varma.

SHRI R. S. DOOGAR (West Bengal) : Madam, may I draw your attention to the position to which the debate is proceeding? So many things are coming out. I think no purpose will be served by continuing this Calling Attention Notice. I think we should have a proper and thorough discussion. (Interruptions.)

[Shri R. S. Doogar]

The present situation in my State is that the life and safety of the people are in danger. The law and order situation is also very serious in West Bengal. *(Interruptions.)* For instigating the police outrage, Congress is being blamed.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : On a point of order...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, please. Since there is a consistent demand for a discussion from the Swatantra Party, from your Party, from this side, you have to find the time. Now, that is all right, but there is a discussion on a motion regarding railway accidents. Find the time. *(Interruptions.)* Please sit down.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : May I say something? I suggest after lunch immediately we proceed to discuss this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The next item on the agenda is the motion of Mr. Yadav. Now, if you can finish that motion by cutting down the time, we can think of it.

1 P.M.

SHRI ABID ALI : One request ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please. I want to say something. We have an item on the Agenda, Mr. Yadav's motion on the railway accidents. According to the time allotted by the Business Advisory Committee it should finish at 4.30. But if by common consent and co-operation you can finish at 3.30 or 4, then we can begin this discussion at 4 or whatever the time....

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : May I say this? So far as this calling attention motion is concerned, the questions have been asked from a particular point of view only. Therefore, we, representing the United Government here, coming from West Bengal, should have a chance to speak on this, because questions have been asked from one particular point of view. So, this should continue. We can forego our lunch period.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI JAISUKHLAL HATHI) : Today or some time later.

SHRI R. S. DOOGAR : We have no time today. We have to find out another day for the discussion. The situation is very serious in Bengal. Democracy is being killed. People's property is being looted. A few hours' discussion will not do. A full day discussion should be allowed.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं एक सलाह यह दे रहा हूँ कि आज इस पर बहस न हो. . .

श्री निरंजन वर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश) : मैडम, आपने मुझे आज्ञा दी थी।

SHRI R. S. DOOGAR : Madam, I again repeat my suggestion ...

श्री निरंजन वर्मा : डूगर साहब, आप बैठ जाइये। मुझे पूछने दीजिए।

श्री राजनारायण : मेरा यह सुझाव है कि आप आज इस पर बहस न करें क्योंकि हम लोग भी कुछ इन्फोर्मेशन मंगा रहे हैं। हमारे भी लोग गये हैं और कल तक हमारे पास पूरी सूचना आ जायेगी। तो अधिकार में बहस नहीं हो सकती।

(Interruption)

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : We can forego the lunch recess. Let us continue. Let us continue.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You are all talking all the time. I am not able to listen.

SHRI JAISUKHLAL HATHI : If the House so desires, we can have it tomorrow. Tomorrow whole day. It would mean three hours. We can sit from 4 to 7 for this.

SHRI R. S. DOOGAR : Let us sit from 2 o'clock. This is my humble suggestion. I appeal to the Leader of the House to consider whether we can discuss the matter from 2 o'clock tomorrow. I would again submit that we take up the matter tomorrow at 2 o'clock.

श्री निरंजन वर्मा : मैडम, मेरी प्रार्थना यह है कि जो बोल चुके हैं अब उनको यह मौका न दिया जाये। क्या आप फिर उन लोगों को दुबारा मौका देगी जो इस विषय पर बोल चुके हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Tomorrow we have the motion on defections. That will have to go.

SHRI A G KULKARNI I have given a motion

SHRI ABID ALI : I have given at 11 o'clock

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN . Please sit down. There is a competition in this House, "I have given a motion", "I have given a motion". Let us be responsible Members of Parliament. This is a very serious issue. It is an affront to the parliamentary institutions. That is why we are concerned with it here. Otherwise it is a State subject. But because it is an affront to the parliamentary institutions, we must have a discussion here. Now the Leader of the House has said 4 to 7 tomorrow. I am suggesting that we sit from 2 to 6 on this particular business tomorrow afternoon, if that is agreeable.

श्री निरंजन वर्मा : मेरी एक प्रार्थना है कि इसमें जो अभी तक नहीं बोल सके इस कॉलिंग अटेंशन मोशन पर, उनके लिये पहला मौका दिया जाये।

श्री आबिद अली : कल देखा जायेगा।

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : I would like to make a suggestion. Are you going to make a precedent? If it is going to be against the West Bengal United Front Government, I am opposed to this. If it is against the attack on the West Bengal Assembly by some policemen, by all means you can have it. Then I shall give a motion also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN . The motion tomorrow will be exactly in the language that has been used today in this calling attention. That is number one. Number two, Members of all parties will have an opportunity to discuss

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : What is the calling attention ...

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR (Delhi) . What about the list, the remaining Members and those who have given their names?

श्री राजनारायण : हमने एक मोशन दिया है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN You cannot have both.

SHRI A G KULKARNI . Today at about 11 o'clock I have given a motion for discussion of the rowdiness by the police in the West Bengal Assembly and the general conditions of lawlessness. That motion was given at 11 o'clock. That must be admitted according to the rules. No other motion can be admitted.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA . Then I shall give a motion also. We should discuss the situation in Maharashtra.

SHRI R S. DOOGAR . Why are you afraid ? Do it.

SHRI A. G KULKARNI You have to admit it according to the rules.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : Both things should not be linked. Whatever the motion may be, if any Member wants to discuss the general law and order problem, it should be discussed separately. If we are linking it up with the rowdiness of the police, it will create a very wrong precedent. Whatever the circumstances may be, the action of the police is to be condemned, and there should not be any impression left outside that on any account we are going to give any indulgence to such sort of habit of policemen or any persons outside to attack the Assembly.

SHRI A G KULKARNI : I never said that. I do not accept that ..

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : Madam Deputy Chairman . . .

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA . Suppose the West Bengal Assembly discusses the conduct of Members of Parliament?

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : It will be very wrong if we take an unfortunate situation or incident to settle our political score. There is enough opportunity .

SHRI NIRANJAN VARMA : How is it wrong?

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : It is wrong. If Mr. Niranjan Varma sent five hundred volunteers to Rajya Sabha, are you going to discuss . . .

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : I do not understand . . . (*Interruptions.*) What we are discussing is what happened in the Assembly.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : You can discuss it. Now, Madam, I strongly oppose any attempt to mix up the law and order situation with the rowdiness of the police . . . (*Interruptions.*) You cannot dictate. Do you think I am going to be dictated by Mr. Bhargava? This House will be dictated by the rules of procedure.

श्री राजनारायण : माननीया, आप चन्द्र शेखर को समझा दीजिये कि यह ला एन्ड आर्डर का सवाल नहीं है।

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : We must give very serious consideration to the submission made by Shri Chandra Shekhar. I think he has made a very sensible suggestion. I am not opposing a discussion. But the discussion must be limited to the merits and demerits of the incident that took place in the West Bengal Assembly. I agree with the hon. Member that there should be no attempt to settle political scores during the discussion.

SHRI ABID ALI : That is correct. But one thing has to be remembered. This is not an isolated matter. It has resulted from some policy of the State Government and we cannot hide it here, it has to be brought out here.

श्री राजनारायण : मेरा चन्द्र शेखर और घर मंत्री से यह निवेदन है कि इधर उधर की बात करने से कोई फायदा नहीं होगा और न इस बारे में कोई चापलूसी हो सकती है। किस स्थिति में पुलिस गई, क्यों पुलिस गई। Why and how this must be discussed and this will be discussed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I want you to sit down please.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : We shall be discussing the particular incident, and what gave rise to that incident, Members can speak on that as they like. Nobody is barred. But all that we are saying is, you can even give your own motion about the incident. It is for Members to give interpretation and have an assessment of the situation. I am not prejudging it.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : I rise to support Mr. Chandra Shekhar. What I submit is . . . (*Interruptions from Mr. Rajnarain*) Mr. Rajnarain, will you sit down?

SHRI RAJNARAIN : I cannot sit down.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : You cannot monopolise the time of the House. Whenever somebody gets up, he rises and says.

SHRI RAJNARAIN : Madam, you can ask me to sit down, not he. You will find it in the Parliamentary Practice.

(*Interruptions.*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down, Mr. Rajnarain.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : My speech is not finished, Madam. I am on on my feet.

SHRI RAJNARAIN : On a point of order.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : This is an unprecedented situation that has taken place there.

(*Interruptions.*)

SHRI MAN SINGH VARMA (Uttar Pradesh) : What is this ? Two Members are simultaneously speaking. Whom did you allow first?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will admit a discussion tomorrow. (*Interruptions.*) No more submissions. I cannot go on. I am going to accept Mr. Chandra Shekhar's suggestion. And the Minister has suggested a limited scope and that will be only to discuss the forcible entry of a number of policemen into the West Bengal Assembly and so on, and the motion will have that limited scope, and nothing more on paper. That is all.

SHRI ABID ALI : Why should you rule out when we—the whole House—desire a discussion on this matter?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No esire.

SHRI ABID ALI : It should have sufficient scope. It is the doing of the West Bengal Government which has resulted in these incidents in the Assembly hall. Why should you give this ruling? Tell me. Why should you restrict it when we want it? Take the sense of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : It is for you to admit the motion in that form . . .

श्री राजनारायण : आपने अंत में क्या कहा, वह हमने नहीं सुना। कृपया आप उस बात को फिर से दोहरा दीजिये।

उपसभापति : आप चुप नहीं रहते हैं तो मैं क्या करूँ। There is no silence in the House.

SHRI KALYAN ROY (West Bengal) : The West Bengal Government has declared openly in the press and in the Assembly that they are enquiring into the matter and the report will be coming...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That will do. We have taken a decision.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : I can tell you. There shall not be an enquiry. They will not have an enquiry. You may shout here as you like. But Calcutta will not accept an enquiry. You shall be hounded out if you go there.

SHRI ABID ALI : You are doomed.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : You cannot hold an enquiry....

(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Papers be laid on the Table.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

SECOND ANNUAL REPORT AND ACCOUNT (1967-1968) OF THE BHARAT HEAVY PLATE AND VESSELS LIMITED, VISAKHAPATNAM AND RELATED PAPERS

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND HEAVY ENGINEERING (SHRI C. M. POONACHA) : Madam, I beg to lay on the Table, under sub-section (1) of section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956, a copy each of the following papers :

(i) Second Annual Report and Accounts of the Bharat Heavy Plate and Vessels Limited, Visakhapatnam, for the year 1967-68, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(ii) Review by Government on the working of the Company.

[Placed in Library See No. LT-1403/69 for (i) and (ii).]

I. APPROPRIATION ACCOUNTS (1967-68) OF THE DEFENCE SERVICES AND COMMERCIAL APPENDIX THERETO

II. AUDIT REPORT (DEFENCE SERVICES 1969)

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI JAGANNATH PAHADIA) : Madam, I beg to lay on the Table a copy each of the following papers (in Hindi) :

(i) Appropriation Accounts of the Defence Services for the year 1967-68 and Commercial Appendix thereto.

(ii) Audit Report (Defence Services), 1969.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-1488/69 for (i) and (ii).]

NOTIFICATIONS OF THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA) : Madam, on behalf of Shri K. S. Ramaswamy, I beg to lay on the Table a copy each of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Home Affairs :

(i) Notification S.O. No. 1820, dated the 1st May, 1969 (in English), publishing corrigenda to Government Notification S.O. No. 1303, dated the 28th March, 1969.