

## RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 23rd July, 1969/the  
1st Shravan, 1891 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the  
clock, The DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the  
Chair

### ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ques-  
tion No. 61. M. Kulkarni.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रभाव यादव : माननीया,  
मेरा इस प्रश्न के संबंध में एक अनुरोध है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Please, nothing now. I have called  
Mr. Kulkarni.

PURCHASE OF PLANES FOR I.A.C.

\*61. SHRI A. G. KULKARNI:†

SHRI KRISHAN KANT:

SHRI CHITTA BASU:

SHRI M. K. MOHTA:

SHRI Z. A. AHMED:

SHRI SURAJ PRASAD:

SHRIMATI LALITHA  
(RAJA GOPALAN):

SARDAR KARCHARAN  
SINGH DUGAL:

SHRI PITAMBARDAS:

SHRI J. P. YADAV:

SHRI PREM MANOHAR:

SHRI RATTAN LAL JAIN:

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR:

SHRI RAJNARAIN:

SHRI BANKA BEHARY  
DAS:

SARDAR RAM SINGH:

Will the Minister of TOURISM  
AND CIVIL AVIATION be pleased  
to state:

(a) whether any decision regarding  
purchase of planes for the Indian Air-  
lines has been taken;

(b) if the answer to part (a) above  
be in the affirmative, what are the  
types of planes that have been finally  
approved and what are their respective  
prices and the names of the companies  
manufacturing them; and

†The question was actually asked on  
the floor of the House by Shri A. G.  
Kulkarni.

1-13 R.S./69

(c) whether it is a fact that Indian  
Airlines has submitted a new propo-  
sal to Government recommending Boe-  
ing 737 instead of DC-9 aircraft?

THE MINISTER OF TOURISM  
AND CIVIL AVIATION (DR. KA-  
RAN SINGH): (a) to (c) The whole  
matter is still under careful considera-  
tion, and a final decision is expected to  
be taken soon.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: May I  
know for how many years the Gov-  
ernment will have this matter under  
very serious consideration? Apart  
from that, is it not a fact that the  
Government wanted 100-plus planes and  
they have received offers from the  
American as well as Russian firms?  
Will the Government please tell us  
the priorities as per merits, stating ac-  
commodation, efficiency, etc., of the  
three types of planes. . .

SHRI A. D. MANI: And cost.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: . . .  
and cost of the three types of planes  
just now before the Indian Airlines  
Corporation? Then, is the Govern-  
ment aware that a large amount of  
pressure is being put on the Govern-  
ment, particularly from one Mr. Kosza-  
rek, the Agent for DC-9 planes? We  
understand that there is a letter from  
him in the Corporation files in which  
certain money has been offered to the  
officers of the Indian Airlines Cor-  
poration. I want to know whether the  
Government is succumbing to such  
types of tactics and pressures, or it  
will decide on the merits of the case  
and in the national interest.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Madam, it  
is true that the first recommendation of  
the Indian Airlines Board was receiv-  
ed by Government almost exactly one  
year ago, on the 19th July, 1968.  
But we have been very anxious to give  
this matter careful consideration from  
all points of view. I would like the  
hon. House to appreciate that the pur-  
chase we now make is going to set the  
contour of our whole aviation policy  
for the next decade or so. Therefore,  
we want to be very sure that we do  
not make a wrong decision. So, after  
the Indian Airlines recommendation  
was made to us, we made a series of  
studies and a series of checks, cross-  
checks and counter-checks to make

sure that we did not make a mistake on this issue. That process is now nearing culmination and I am hopeful that very shortly we will be in a position to take a final decision on this matter.

The hon. Member has mentioned that there are three main types of planes before the Corporation. Now the Corporation feels, and it is the Government's view also at present, that they require planes of 100-plus capacity at this time. In that range there are really only two planes in the running, the Boeing 737 and DC-9.

**SHRI ARJUN ARORA :** What about Caravelles?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** The Caravelle, of course, is a plane which is already in operation and it is already one decade out of date, as it were, because it was purchased a decade earlier. So all the aspects, the cost, traffic projections and cargo capacity, are being looked into very carefully. I can assure the hon. Members that none of these points is going to be overlooked.

The hon. Member raised another question with regard to pressure. I can assure him that as far as Government is concerned, there is no question of succumbing to any pressure whatsoever. We also received a photostat copy of the letter which he has referred to, which is reported to have been written by a representative of one of these companies . . .

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI :** Of which company?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** You referred to that—of the Douglas Company. This is reported to have been written by him to some official in the Indian Airlines. We made enquiries and the Douglas representative has denied that he has written it and has said it is a forgery. But I can assure the hon. Members that whatever pressures may or may not be existing, as far as the Government is concerned, we are determined to take a decision purely on the merits of the case and if we find that any official of the Airlines is in any way involved, if that can be proved to our satisfaction . . .

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI :** Including the Chairman.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** If it can be proved we will take the severest possible action.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Kant. Please be specific and brief.

**SHRI KRISHAN KANT :** May I know from the hon. Minister whether they have made enquiries against the officials or others who are involved in this graft and what the result of that enquiry is? The photostat copy of the letter to which he referred is here. It is not a typed letter; it is a handwritten letter. Even if they have denied it, has the Government got it examined from handwriting experts to see whether the handwriting is that of Koszarek or not? Secondly, may I know whether the Tatas have an agency for Boeing 737 in the U.S.A. and they are pressurising the Government to purchase Boeing 737? In view of the various pressures that are coming on the Government, may I know what steps they are taking so that they purchase a plane which is suited to India?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, regarding this question of graft, the only concrete thing—of course, we cannot go merely on rumours or on what people say—that came to our notice was this letter and we have asked the Corporation to make immediate enquiries. The man has denied this, but enquiries are still proceeding. I may mention that whenever anybody has said to me that there is a lot of pressure or that there are lobbies, I have requested, and I would reiterate that request on the floor of this House, that if any proof of this nature is available, I would personally be extremely grateful if it is given to me, because I am determined at least that there should be no *golmal* as far as is humanly possible.

**SHRI CHITTA BASU :** May I know from the hon. Minister what the proposals are that are now under the consideration of the Government with regard to the purchase of planes? In his reply to the main question he has said that only two proposals are there. May I know whether there has been any proposal from the Soviet union, particularly regarding the TU-154 type of plane? If so, has the Government considered or studied that particular proposal in depth? Secondly, may I also know from the hon. Minister if it is a fact that the present Chairman of

the Board is pressurising the Government to accept DC-9, and that he has got certain relations with the Douglas Company itself? If so, what is the reaction of the Government?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** I did not say that there were only two proposals. I had clearly said that there were three proposals before the Government, but in the plane range 100-plus there were two. T.U. 154, which is a Soviet plane, is also under consideration. This is a larger plane of 150 capacity. I can assure the hon. Member that the Soviet offer is also under our very careful consideration. The additional attraction in this offer is the possibility of rupee payment. But we have got to balance the whole situation. At present the general thinking of the Corporation is that we do not require a plane of that capacity, but the matter is still under consideration. As for the second point of the hon. Member that the Chairman is pressurising, the Board's recommendation has been made unanimously by the Chairman and all the other members. I am absolutely unaware of any relationship between the Chairman and the Douglas Company. As far as I know there is no such relationship whatsoever.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** The relationship will not be announced in advertisements.

**SHRI M. K. MOHTA :** The hon. Minister has stated that this is such an important question that it is bound to have repercussions on the aviation policy for a decade to come. What we are fearing is that it might take a decade for the Government to take a decision so that the decade will pass in any case. What I want to know from the Government is whether they have considered the possibility of taking over Boeing 707 from Air India—when Air India receives Jumbo jets, Boeing 707 would be free to be given—so that foreign exchange may be saved.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, jumbo jets are also going to be delivered in the beginning of 1971 and there is no question of any surplus being available before that. Even after the jumbo jets are delivered—Air India network today is very largely extended from New York to the Fiji Islands with only ten planes—our understanding is that with the extension of various Air India routes probably the

surplus capacity, if any, may be utilised. But if any surplus capacity is available, that will be considered in mid-70 when it does come up.

**SHRI Z. A. AHMAD :** Madam, despite the denial of the existence of any pressures by American interests in India there is a general feeling all round that though the matter is based on realities which are staring us in the face, the matter is being delayed because of a number of pressures and counter-pressures. Pressures and counter-pressures, both are there—counter-pressures within that set-up. You know what I mean when I say “counter-pressures”. The fact of the matter is that our planes are getting out of commission, that is, it is dangerous to fly them. In view of this, speedy action has to be taken, but no action is being taken. In that connection I would ask the honourable Minister whether it is a fact that the Soviet Government twice made an offer of their planes. The first offer was rejected on the ground that their running cost is too high. Well, then they made another offer. Now the argument is that the planes are too big and that the cost is too high. But obviously the great advantage we have is that we have not to pay foreign exchange. We can pay our own currency. In view of this will the Government now appoint a committee or a commission. . .

**SHRI A. D. MANI :** A parliamentary committee.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** No, no. . .

**SHRI Z. A. AHMAD :** . . . particularly of IAF experts to go into the whole matter, go to the Soviet Union, examine the running cost, the strength of the engines, the seating capacity and all that and then submit a report? After all if you are going to lay down the contours of your policy for the next ten years you have to go out of your way to examine the planes everywhere. Are you prepared to do that? Send a committee to the Soviet Union. Send a committee to America also.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** No, no, Mr. Ahmed, please be brief and specific in your question.

**SHRI Z. A. AHMAD :** . . . and then have the whole thing properly examined by the experts. Are you prepared to do that?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You cannot go on like this.

**DR. KARAN SINGH:** Madam, the honourable Member has made his remarks in two parts both of which appear to be somewhat contradictory. He has said in the beginning and rightly so and entirely endorse what he has said, that our present fleet position is becoming extremely precarious and therefore, a decision on this matter must be expedited. I entirely agree with him in this and I can assure him that I am personally interested in expediting it. However, the second suggestion that he has made that whole thing should be given to a committee and that the committee should travel all over the world, to my mind seems to be contradictory. I can assure him that the Soviet plane is also receiving fair and full consideration. As far as the Government is concerned, I can give a categorical assurance that there is no preconceived notion, that there is no ideology, as far as these planes are concerned. We want a plane which will be useful and which not only will be useful but will also be profitable because after all this is one of those public sector undertakings which, the Parliament very rightly expects, should make a profit every year. Therefore, all these matters are being considered and the Member can rest assured that the Soviet planes will receive fair and full consideration.

**SHRI NIREN GHOSH:** But how can we be sure? That is the whole trouble.

**SHRIMATI LALITHA (RAJAGOPALAN):** Madam, one thing is the Minister cannot deny, as suggested by other Members, that there is a lot of pressure regarding the purchase of these planes. With your permission, Madam, I just want to quote these few lines from the Indian Express. On May 26 the news appeared that—

“The Government will shortly take a decision on the controversial question of the purchase of new aircraft for the Indian Airlines. The matter is now being considered at the highest level and a decision is expected in a day.”

Then the second news item on May 27 says—

“The proposal of the Indian Airlines to purchase five DC-9 aircraft

with a seating capacity of more than a hundred passengers has been shelved a second time. The Union Cabinet which discussed this question today did not take any decision. The Indian Airlines feels the need for DC-9 planes to solve the problem of accommodation.”

This news item clearly shows that there is some pressure. The Minister has stated that he is very anxious to expedite this matter. He is not able to take a decision on his own. The purchase of planes for the Indian Airlines has been hanging in the air for too long and a greater number of planes are needed to meet the increasing tourist and domestic traffic, and also several old aircraft have to be replaced. In these circumstances it is the immediate need of the Indian Airlines to purchase these planes. I want to ask the Minister whether it is a fact that a team visited Moscow, London, and Washington to study the various possibilities and decided that DC-9 planes each costing Rs. 5 crores should be purchased. Is it also a fact that the Union Cabinet met in May and shelved the proposal of the purchase of DC-9 planes?

**SHRI ARJUN ARORA:** A very brief question.

**SHRIMATI LALITHA (RAJAGOPALAN):** Is it also a fact—just now Mr. Ahmad has also mentioned that a committee of experts should be appointed, that a sub-committee was appointed to study all aspects of the proposed purchase of these planes? If so, what are the recommendations of that sub-committee and what decisions is the Government taking?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I think some of the questions have already been answered.

**DR. KARAN SINGH:** Madam, in a democracy the process of decision-making is often a long and arduous one. That is one of the advantages of our democracy because one is quite sure that in the process of this decision-making every aspect is taken into consideration. Madam, I do not think it is necessary to get involved in the long history of what committee was appointed and all that and I would merely like to reiterate that the time is ripe for a decision and I am hopeful that it will be taken.

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** Madam, the Minister says that we should not go into the long history. But the short history is his letter written in handwriting to an officer of the Government of India offering 15,000 dollars... (*Interruptions*) ... and the Minister casually says that he will look into it. This is the way you are dealing with the Parliament. (*Interruptions*) Madam, I rise on a point of order. . .

**SHRI NIREN GHOSH :** Read that letter.

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** I rise on a point of order.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Will you please sit down? I want to say something. Points of order in this question are not really called for. I am going through the list. You may have something very important or you may have some information, but I have a list of names before me and let me finish all those names first. . .

(*Interruptions*)

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** Madam, I rise on a point of order. My point of order is this. The whole question pertains to one point, whether pressure is being exercised or not. Fifteen or twenty Members are there in the list. . .

**SHRI A. D. MANI :** Read that letter.

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** . . . and the Minister is going on giving replies that all aspects are being considered. This reply of the Minister will remain the same till the twentieth Member puts his question. The first questioner asked about the letter which really indicates that an officer of the Ministry was offered . . .

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** What is that letter?

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** . . . probably 15,000 dollars per plane and the Minister has nothing to say. He says that that letter is a forged one.

**SHRI NIREN GHOSH :** Read that letter.

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** It is in handwriting. I am not reading that letter now, Madam. And this letter was written sometime in 1967. Is it proper to deal with the Parliament in this way? Has the Minister enquired into it or not? The letter is in the handwriting of the person who has written it. Has any action been taken against the person in whose name this letter has been written? If nothing has been done, for that. . . (*Interruptions*) There is no tossing up of this question like that.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** Madam, on a point of order.

**SHRI RAJNARAIN :** I also want to rise on a point of order.

(*Interruptions*)

**SHRI SUNDAR SINGH BHANDARI :** On a point of order, Madam, the Minister cannot be asked to reply. It is for you to decide.

(*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** I cannot allow all of you to speak like that.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** Madam, we believe Mr. Chandra Shekhar but we are more concerned with the contents of the letter which proves attempted bribery on the part of an official. Therefore I would request you to ask Mr. Chandra Shekhar to give the particulars of the letter read out the contents of that letter.

श्री राजनारायण : मैडम, श्री चन्द्र शेखर जी किसी अफसर के खत को यहां पर रख कर यह सिद्ध कर रहे हैं कि प्रेशर डाला जा रहा है। उस लैटर का यहां पढ़ा जाना नितान्त आवश्यक है। इसलिए मैं निवेदन करूंगा कि आप श्री चन्द्र शेखर जी को मौका दें ताकि उस पत्र को वे पूरी तरह पढ़ें।

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** The Minister himself has accepted that he is in possession of the letter.

(*Interruptions*)

श्री राजनारायण : श्री चन्द्र शेखर को पढ़ने में क्या दिक्कत है, चन्द्र शेखर क्यों हेसीटेट कर रहे हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am asking Mr. Dugal.

श्री राजनारायण : मेरे प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर पर आपका क्या निश्चय है ?

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All of you cannot speak like that.

श्री राजनारायण : सुना जाय। यह संसदीय प्रथा है। संसदीय प्रथा में जब किसी अफसर के खत पर किमी नवीजे पर आना होता है तो उस खत को पढ़ा जाना आवश्यक होता है। इसलिए मैं निवेदन करना हूँ आपके जरिए कि आप चन्द्र शेखर से कहें कि उस खत को पढ़ें।

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Let the letter be read out here. Let the House know the contents of that letter. You ask him to read it out to the House. Either ask him to lay it on the Table of the House so that the Members can see it at their convenience or ask the hon. Member to read out the text of that letter.

SHRI AKBAR ALI KHAN : The Minister has said . . .

SHRI RAJNARAIN : Let him read it out, Madam.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : The House cannot allow this letter to remain unread. The hon. Member from the Government's side has referred to a letter and he is reading it out.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Let the Minister reply. After that hand over the letter to the CBI to enquire about the Chairman and the official concerned.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I had called Mr. Dugal. The House feels that the letter should be read out. We

do not know the authenticity of that letter. But Mr. Chandra Shekhar, if you want to read that out, you may do it.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : Madam Deputy Chairman. . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL : Madam, what is this? We have taken half an hour on this question. What is the procedure that is being resorted to? The question of this letter does not arise. If they want, they can have a half-an-hour discussion. We protest against this method of obstructing the proceedings of the House. They do not allow other questions to come up.

(Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : Madam, I want to ask a question.

(Several interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not think it was proper for Mr. Chandra Shekhar to intervene when there were so many names. He could have done it at the end. Now also whatever he has got with him, he can read it at the end when all the names have been called out. Mr. Dugal.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : You gave the ruling just now and you asked Mr. Chandra Shekhar to read it. Now you are calling Mr. Dugal. I think that is not fair.

SHRI RAJNARAIN : Get up and read it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Chandra Shekhar can do so at the end. Yes, Mr. Dugal.

SARDAR HARCHARAN SINGH DUGAL : May I know from the hon. Minister what is the number of planes that the IAC propose to buy at present and whether after the delivery of these planes it is proposed to retire either the Caravelles or other types of planes from service? According to the present projections of traffic when does the hon. Minister consider that additional planes will be required to meet the traffic?

DR. KARAN SINGH : The present proposal is that 5 planes should be purchased at this time which will be

delivered by the end of 1970 or the beginning of 1971 and later on 3 more may be purchased at the end of the Fourth Plan. That is the present recommendation.

About retiring the existing planes, DC-4 and Dakotas have nearly been retired. Sky-masters have been retired. Viscounts are going to be phased out by the end of 1972. The Caravelles will still go on probably until the middle of the next decade.

**SHRI PITAMBAR DAS :** Is it a fact that the planes that were offered by Russia were neither suitable from the point of view of speed nor from the point of view of seating capacity?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, the Russian planes are also under consideration, although the Corporation recommends that a hundred-plus capacity is required, not 150. We have not ruled out the Russian planes. The seating capacity of the Russian plane which is being offered to us—TU-154—at 32-inch pitch will be 146. About the speed I am not sure, but I do not think there is any substantial difference.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** मैं माननीय मंत्री महोदय का ध्यान प्रश्न 71 की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। इस प्रश्न का जवाब भी इसके साथ होता। इस प्रश्न के सन्दर्भ में प्रश्न 71 बहुत महत्वपूर्ण स्थान रखता है। वह प्रश्न है—

“क्या सरकार का ध्यान इंडियन एयर लाइन्स के असिस्टेंट जनरल मैनेजर श्री इसरानी द्वारा काठमांडू, नेपाल में दिय गये तथा सोमवार, 18 मई, 1969 ‘इंडियन नेशन’ में छपे इस आशय के वक्तव्य की ओर दिलाया गया है कि यदि सरकार ने उनके सुझाव के अनुसार सुधार न किया तो भारतीय वायुयान-सेवा पर प्रतिकूल प्रभाव पड़ेगा”... (Interruptions) यह महत्वपूर्ण सवाल है।

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** That is all right. But put your question on No. 61.

**श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव :** मेरा अनुपूरक इसी सन्दर्भ में है। इंडियन एयर लाइन्स के मैनेजर ने काठमांडू में जो वक्तव्य दिया है उसमें

यह सन्दर्भ आया है कि सरकार इंडियन एयर लाइन्स के लिए जो प्लेन खरीदने जा रही है उस बारे में अगर उनके विचार को ठीक से नहीं देखा गया तो अपनी प्रतिष्ठा के ऊपर प्रतिकूल प्रभाव पड़ेगा। दूसरा सवाल यह है कि सदन में प्रेशर की बात बहुत चली है, मैं मंत्री महोदय से यह जानना चाहता हूँ—डगलस कम्पनी का प्रेशर आपके ऊपर हो या न हो—कि रशियन कम्पनी की ओर से आपके ऊपर प्रेशर आ रहा है या नहीं?

**डा० कर्ण सिंह :** हाँ, मैं केवल यही विश्वास दिला सकता हूँ कि प्रेशर जहाँ से भी हो, और जहाँ से नहीं हों, लेकिन हम प्रेशर के नीचे दबने वाले नहीं हैं।

**श्री प्रेम मनोहर :** पिछले तीन साल में 7, 8 बार इस बारे में बैठक हुई और मंत्री महोदय ने जो प्वाइंट बताये उन पर हर बैठक में विचार हुआ। तो क्या मंत्री जी बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि कौन सा ऐसा स्पेसिफिक प्वाइंट है कि जिस पर इन बैठकों में निर्णय नहीं लिया जा सका जिसके कारण कि अभी तक हमारी सरकार ने इस पर निर्णय नहीं लिया? क्या इस का मतलब यह नहीं है कि जो रशियन प्रेशर हमारे ऊपर आ रहा है और कुमारमंगलम को यहाँ लाया जा रहा है वह इसीलिए कि जब तक यह डिजीजन न हो जाय कि रशियन प्लेन्स लिये जाय तब तक इसको डिफर किया जा रहा है?

**डा० कर्ण सिंह :** ऐसी बात नहीं है।

**DR. BHAI MAHAVIR :** I would like to know from the Minister as to how many planes are proposed to be purchased in the beginning, what period will be taken in getting delivery of them and whether there will be any need for our pilots or technicians being sent to any other country for the purpose of training, for their upkeep, maintenance or repairs or whether we will have to depend on the suppliers of those planes for these services for an indefinite period? Secondly, I should like to know from the Minister if there is any possibility of the planes being manufactured in India and being put to use for the purpose for which foreign planes are sought to be purchased.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** As I have mentioned in reply to an earlier question, the proposal at present is to purchase 5 planes. The delivery schedule normally is 18 months which means that if we take the decision by the end of this month, then the planes will be available by the end of 1970 or beginning of 1971. Once a decision is taken on the particular planes we are going to buy, then the question of sending our pilots for specialised training for those planes will be considered. It is correct that for planes of this nature and this sophistication, we will have to send our pilots for training. We may have to purchase a simulator or we may have to send the pilots for training. The HS 748 which is being manufactured in Kanpur, which is a nice plane, is not for the type of traffic that these planes are going to carry. The HS 748 Turbo Prop which is going to be our basic plane cannot be used for this purpose, but these are much faster jet planes. Therefore the two are entirely different.

**DR. BHAI MAHAVIR :** One portion has been left out.

**श्री राजनारायण :** मेरी आदत नहीं है कि जब कोई सज्जन बोल रहे हों तो मैं बीच में खड़ा हो जायं। मैं सरकार से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या भारतीय वायु सेवा को परिष्कृत करने के लिए असिस्टेंट जनरल मैनेजर ने कोई सुझाव दिया है और यदि उस के सुझाव दिया है तो क्या दिया है? उन के सुझाव की ओर सरकार ने विचार किया है या नहीं? क्योंकि जनरल मैनेजर इसरानी ने स्पष्ट कहा है कि यदि उस के सुझाव के मूलाबिक काम नहीं हुआ तो भारतीय वायु सेवा प्रभावित होगी। इस लिए मैं सरकार से इस बारे में जानना चाहता हूँ। और माननीया, इस के साथ साथ मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार के पास किसी ऐसे पत्र की जानकारी है जो कि किसी इंडामर कोर के प्रतिनिधि कजागर के द्वारा लिखा हुआ है और उस में पेमेंट का प्रामिस किया गया है कुछ अफसरों को और अन्य लोगों को और मुझे मालूम नहीं कि अन्य लोगों में कौन आते हैं। भरत राम चरत राम आसकते हैं, मिनिस्टर और डिप्टी मिनिस्टर पर इशारा किया जा सकता है, स्टेट मिनिस्टर

पर भी इशारा हो सकता है, मैं जानता हूँ कि मंत्री जी भले हैं, मैं उनकी भलमंसी को भी जानता हूँ, लेकिन उन के ऊपर भी आक्षेप आ सकता है। इसलिए इस सब की सफाई करना उनके हित में है।

**डा० कर्ण सिंह :** माननीया, जो पहला प्रश्न माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा कि असिस्टेंट मैनेजर, जनरल मैनेजर ने कोई विशेष बक्तव्य या सुझाव दिया वह कोई ऐसी बात नहीं है। जहाँ तक हमारी जानकारी है, उन्होंने तो केवल जो कुछ कहा उसका संबंध दूसरे प्रश्न से है और बड़ी चतुराई से माननीय सदस्य ने उसे इस समय पूछ लिया, लेकिन मुझे उम का उत्तर देने में कोई हिचक नहीं है। श्री इसरानी ने कटमांडू में भाषण किया था और उसमें उन्होंने कहा कि हमारे जो सुझाव इंडियन एयर लाइन्स के लिए हैं—प्लेन्स और एयर पोर्ट्स आदि के लिए, वह चीजें यदि नहीं होंगी तो हमारी वायु सेवा में हानि होगी। और इस में कोई दोरायें नहीं हो सकतीं। इस में कोई ऐसी अजीब, अद्भुत बात नहीं है; कोई अलग, नया सुझाव उन्होंने दिया हो ऐसी बात नहीं है। उसका केवल यह मतलब था कि जो सुझाव हैं उन पर विचार हो। वह सुझाव हमारे सामने हैं और हम उन पर विचार कर रहे हैं। वह सुझाव यह हैं कि नये प्लेन्स खरीदे जायें और जितने एयर पोर्ट्स हैं उन का नवीकरण किया जाय। यह सब हम कर रहे हैं जैसा कि माननीय सदस्यों ने देखा होगा कि हमारे एयर पोर्ट्स की उन्नति हो रही है और हम उन को देख रहे हैं।

**श्री राजनारायण :** ऐसे ही कि हमारा मारा पानी छत से एक दिन में ही आ गया नीचे?

**डा० कर्ण सिंह :** जहाँ तक माननीय सदस्य ने पत्र का जिक्र किया, पहले भी मैंने इस बात का उत्तर दिया था। चन्द्रशेखर जी ने भी इस चीज को उठाया था। इस पत्र की फोटो नोट कापी मेरे पास है। इंडामर कोर के कोर्ट रेप्रेजेन्टेटिव हैं मिस्टर कजागरक, ऐसा लगता है कि उन की ओर से हमारे इंडियन एयर लाइन्स



के कोई अफसर है उनके नाम यह पत्र था । यह पत्र 1967 का लिखा हुआ है कि जब यह प्लेन्स खरीदे जायें तो . . .

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** On a point of order. Now it is quite clear that the fascimile of the letter is in the possession of the Minister. It would be fair to the House if instead of trying to explain in his own language what the letter contains, he reads out the letter and it would be more precise and exact and save the time of the House. Let him read it.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** I do not have it here. It is on my file.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** Get it.

**डा० कर्ण सिंह :** तो मैं जैसा कह रहा था माननीया कि यह पत्र जब मेरे पास भेजा गया, पत्र की फोटो स्टेट वापी जब भेजी गयी तो . . .

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** Again I am on a point of order. Two courses are open. The questions have been serious. The Minister should have anticipated the questions relating to the letter which was in his possession. How, is it that he did not come with it. Now I see visibly Mr. Chandra Shekhar has passed on the letter. Let him say whether it is the same letter and read it out.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** This is the same fascimile. Do you want me to read it? I have no objection.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** I cannot compel him to read it.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** He says it is the same letter.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** If he will be patient for another fortyfive seconds. . .

**SHRI ARJUN ARORA :** He cannot be allowed to read it. Anybody can raise a point of order, not I because my face is bad. My point of order is this. The Minister has described that letter as a forgery. How can the Chair, at the instance of Mr. Gupta or anybody ask the Minister to read in this House a letter which is a forgery.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** I have not asked to read it.

**SHRI RAJNARAIN :** On a point of order.

**SHRI ARJUN ARORA :** I have not finished. As a matter of fact, even Mr. Chandra Shekhar can read that letter only if he is convinced and takes the responsibility that the letter is not a forgery but a genuine one. Nobody can ask. . .

(Interruptions)

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** I am under the Rules. The issue here is not whether the letter is forged or not. We are not adjudging that letter that way. The issue is whether a fascimile or a photostat copy of a letter alleged to have been or purported to have been received by an officer of the IAC is there. The only thing we want to know is that. It will be decided later, whether it is forged or not. And he can certainly read it out.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** That will do.

**SHRI KRISHAN KANT :** On a point of order I say this. In reply to my question about the letter the hon. Minister had said that the enquiry was made by the officers and they said that it was a forged letter. But when I asked the hon. Minister whether the Handwriting Experts has given any opinion, the Minister said that it is under investigation. So saying that it is forgery is not proving forgery. The letter should be read out in the House.

(Interruptions)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Everybody is giving his opinion.

**SHRI B. K. P. SINHA :** May I say something?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** I do not see how opinions are concerned in the question.

**SHRI B. K. P. SINHA :** About this point of order, the issue cannot be settled by a declaration by an officer that it is not a forged letter, nor can it be put against that officer. I write a letter to somebody, but unless that person receives that letter and acts on it, how can it be put against him? Therefore, at best this letter establishes that a certain gentleman wrote a letter. It does not mean that the officer receiving that letter was in collusion with the gentleman who wrote that letter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We cannot go on like this.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH : Madam,...

SHRI RAJNARAIN : Madam,...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I want to just appeal to the House. Are we going in for a discussion on this? You must leave it to the Chair. I have heard so many of you. I want the Minister to finally reply in any manner he wants to.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Madam, on this question of the letter I have not said that it is a forgery or that it is not a forgery. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, will you very kindly give me three minutes uninterruptedly? I am sure I shall be able to bring home my point if I can be allowed 180 seconds. Madam, I said in reply to a question that a photostat copy of a letter purported to have been written by a representative of the Douglas Company to an official of the Indian Airlines was received by us. We asked the IAC immediately to make enquiries. The IAC did so and also wrote to this man, Mr. Koszarek, who is purported to have written the letter. Now he has denied that he wrote the letter. (*Interruptions*) The official was also asked, "Have you received the letter?" He said he did receive the letter. And now we have asked the Indian Airlines to look into this matter. If the Government is not satisfied with the explanation of the IAC, . . .

(*Interruptions*)

Let me finish. After all, this is a Corporation matter. That man is an employee of the Corporation.

(*Interruptions*)

Please let me finish. That man is an employee of the Corporation. The first responsibility is on the Corporation. The Corporation is going to look into this whole matter very carefully. When the Corporation replies to us if we feel that the reply is not satisfactory, will certainly refer it to the C.B.I. Meanwhile, for the information of the House I may inform them that the officer to whom the letter was addressed has at present been relieved of his charge and he is on leave pending retirement.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Madam, on a point of order.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : On a point of order.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Madam, on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : This question must end now. No more.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : This is a very serious matter. The Minister thinks that it is not forged. . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Banka Behary Das.

SHRI M. M. DHARIA : Madam Deputy Chairman, on a point of order. I can understand the Minister saying that whether that officer is guilty or not cannot be said today. But if a particular company has written a letter like this through its agent or somebody, then why should not the Government declare that the Government will have no more dealings with that company?

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : Madam Deputy Chairman, from the reply of the Minister it is evident that the entire episode is very intriguing, because the very fact that the officer has gone on leave and has been relieved of his charge shows that there might be some truth in the matter. But I am not going into that and giving any definite opinion. That matter should be enquired into, and if it is found to be correct, then that firm should be blacklisted; there is no doubt about it. But I want to say this. For the last one year this matter has been pending with him, and because of Government's indecision only he is allowing these pressures and counterpressures to be brought on the Government. I hold the Government of India completely responsible for this situation. Whether it is the business interests of the U.S.S.R. or the U.S.A., because of the delay, they are exerting these pressures, and it is only because they see that the Government of India is amenable to pressures. Otherwise they will not have behaved like this. So, Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to know from the Minister about all this. It has been reported in the press that one of these companies has already informed the Indian Airlines Corporation that if the matter is not finalised by the end of this month then the price of the aeroplane will go up. So I want to know

from the Minister whether there is any basis in such report, and if there is any basis in the report, whether the Minister can assure that before the end of this month the matter will be finalised judging it on merits and commercial considerations only, and not on pressures either of the U.S.S.R. or the U.S.A., or their lobbies that have been operating for the last one year in favour of this plane or that plane.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, it is true that the price escalation on both the American planes will come into operation if an order is not placed before the 1st of July, and in fact this is one of the reasons why we have been anxious all this time to take a decision, and I am hopeful that we will be able to take the decision before that.

**SARDAR RAM SINGH :** May I know if the Minister has any knowledge as to how many DC 9, Boeing 737 and TU 154 are in service in the world? Is it not a fact that TU 154 is not yet sold to anyone and it is only in the prototype stage.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Yes, Madam, TU 154 has only recently been test flown. I saw it flying myself in the Paris Air Show. It is not yet in commercial operation. The other two planes are in fact in commercial operation.

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** Madam, with your permission I may read out this letter.

**SHRI ARJUN ARORA :** How can this be taken as a genuine letter?

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** This is what the letter reads :

"Phone : 534083

532344-88

Cabl : "ALBALDINI"

INDAMER COMPANY PRIVATE LTD.

Head Office : Juhu Air Port,  
Bombay 54 AS

Bombay Oct. 12, 1967.

Associates : Indamer Corp.,

P.O. Box 917.

Lafayette Indiana U.S.A.

Dear Capt. Huilgoyle,

Reference is made to our several discussions in connection with our mutual

interest in promoting business of sale of products marketed by me. Please be assured that on sale of any units we shall pay you on completion of sale and delivery a sum of \$ 15,000 per unit which part of will be paid to others as directed.

Please understand that you will not assist any other vendor of same items. You will report to me from time to time as to progress made.

J. P. KOSZAREK.

*Aircraft-parts-Accessories  
Agents for*

*Beechcraft-Piper-Bendix  
Continental Motors  
Nevardull Polish-  
Arc-King Radios"*

Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to make one point. The hon. Minister said that the letter was received in October 1967, near about two years back. The photostat copy of this letter is in handwriting. It is not a typed letter. The whole letter is in handwriting. Did the Minister consult the Handwriting Expert because these agents' handwriting can be easily found out if they were dealing with aircraft accessories? Was the CBI consulted, or only the Captain and the agent were taken into consideration and Government felt itself satisfied that everything had been done? And if nothing was done in this regard in the last two years may I know the reasons for that?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, the letter is alleged to have been written in 1967 but it did not come to the notice of Government until about. . .

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA :** When did it come to your notice?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** . . . two or three months ago. It was sent to us with the compliments of the Representative of the Boeing Company.

(Laughter)

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** Madam, the matter cannot be laughed off. What action did the hon. Minister take on this matter? I want to know whether he consulted the C.B.I., whether he had investigations made. Because

the Minister himself admitted that the Captain was allowed to go on leave, it means the high-ups in the Ministry are involved in the matter and the Minister cannot treat this thing lightly like that. It is a clear case of bribery and nepotism and the Minister should explain to the House.

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA :** Madam, I have to submit that the way in which the Minister is trying to handle this issue I feel that he is losing sight of the seriousness of the issue. This is a serious matter which has to be investigated. I want to know why this was not referred to the C.B.I. and why he has not been prosecuted. Let him face the trial. I fail to understand the whole thing. Madam, I have to say that there is tremendous influence of the bureaucrats even on the Minister. We want serious action to be taken. Madam Deputy Chairman, while replying to questions the Minister said that these are the inherent defects of democracy. I say this is not the defect of democracy; it is inefficiency of the Ministry and that is more material here. In the garb of democracy you should not endanger democracy. We want an assurance from the Minister that this matter will be immediately investigated and the offenders will be dealt with severely.

*(Interruptions)*

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, as I have said very clearly, as soon as this photostat came to our notice the Government took cognisance of it.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** When did it come to your notice?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** It came about two to three months ago.

**AN HON. MEMBER :** Most unsatisfactory replies.

*(Interruptions)*

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, I would like to assure hon. Members—right from the beginning I myself have been saying—that if anything is proved as a result of the investigations we would be the first to act against the people concerned. I can give that categorical assurance.

*(Interruptions)*

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** The Minister is treating this matter very lightly. This is a serious matter; yet he is ridiculing it.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** There is no question of ridiculing anything whatsoever. This is a very serious matter. If we are going to deteriorate to a situation in which foreign firms or any firm can go about openly bribing our officials I think we have no right whatsoever to be in these Treasury Benches. I am absolutely clear about it and therefore . . .

**SHRI NIREN GHOSH :** Don't pretend ignorance; they do bribe.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Therefore I have said right from the beginning that if anything is proved we will certainly take action. In this whole matter of aircraft purchase lots of rumours are going around with regard to many firms and with regard to many persons. As I said this is the first time anything concrete has come to our notice. You will remember, Madam, when this matter was discussed in this House earlier I requested hon. Members that if they had any concrete proof or evidence they should bring it to our notice. Madam, when we received this letter immediately within 24 hours we wrote to the Corporation. We said this is the letter we have received and we would like to have their . . .

*(Interruptions)*

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA :** What is the C.B.I. doing?

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR :** Why send it to the Corporation?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** As I said, Madam, as soon as the Indian Airlines Corporation came to know they wrote to this person and he naturally denied. Even if he has written he would obviously have denied. In any case that formality has been done. Now the Indian Airlines Corporation is going to consider this matter and report to us very soon. This official is an official of the Corporation and once the report comes to us we will then decide what action we should take in the matter including the suggestion that has been made that the letter may be handed over to the C.B.I. That is also one step which we have in mind.

**SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA :** Madam, the matter has become too serious. The letter in question has been in the hands of the Minister for two months and it seems from his replies that no serious attempt has been made to find the truth about it. He lightly says that this was received with the compliments of the other company. Does that minimise the offence? I personally feel that the time has come when we should grapple with this problem of corruption. I therefore propose that a Committee of three persons of this House be appointed to go into this whole deal and report back to the House and I will request the House to waive the rules of the House and give me permission to move the motion. We must do it.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** The hon. Minister has said that this letter has been in his possession for two months. I should like to know why immediately on receipt of the photostat order was not given to the C.B.I. or other proper agencies to immediately seize the papers of the office concerned from where the letter came. Why was it not done? The whole file should have been seized immediately in order to see first whether a person of that name exists, whether it is in his handwriting and whether there are other related papers in the office. Why was not that done? The hon. Minister should explain why two months have been allowed to lapse and why immediate action was not taken. It is no good sending it to the office of the I.A.C. Why did not the Government order immediately C.B.I. to search the house of the person concerned . . .

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** No speech now. You put your question.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** . . . and seize his paper. Why was this not done?

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, every time a letter of this nature is received making such serious allegations we have first of all to ask the Corporation to make an enquiry.

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA :** That is wrong. You are giving a long rope to the official to defend himself.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Let him finish.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA :** There is reference to other correspondence. Did you have that office searched?

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA :** By giving such a long rope to the officer you will help him to escape.

**DR. KARAN SINGH :** Madam, my understanding of the situation is that before any action is taken to turn it over to the C.B.I. some departmental enquiry has to be there.

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA :** I am sorry, you don't know the procedure even . . .

(Interruptions)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** The Question Hour is over.

## WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

### PRIVY PURSE

\*62. **SHRI CHITTA BASU :**

**SHRI Y. ADINARAYANA REDDY :**

**SHRI M. SRINIVASA REDDY :**

**SHRI S. K. VAISHAMPAYEN :**

**SHRI RAJNARAIN :**

**SHRI JAGAT NARAIN :**

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state :

(a) whether the Deputy Prime Minister had any discussion recently with the ex-rulers in respect of the abolition of Privy Purse and Privileges;

(b) if so, the outcome of the discussion; and

(c) at what stage the proposal of abolition of Privy Purse and Privileges rests now?

**THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN) :** (a) Yes, Madam.

(b) The talks have not concluded.

(c) As has already been stated earlier in this House, the Government have taken a decision in principle to abolish privy purses and privileges of the Rulers. The measures necessary for its implementation are being worked out.