

where help from the State Government was not forthcoming

SHRI ANANT PRASAD SHARMA: Sir, my question has not been answered. My question is very simple. The question is that invariably the State Governments are not in a position to protect the railway property. That is proved from these instances. Therefore what specific steps is the Railway Ministry proposing to take to protect the railway property? That is my question.

SHRI PARIMAL GHOSH: I said that the State Government have contributed in protecting it. It is a fact that sometimes their force is not adequate. Whenever they ask for additional help, the Railway Protection Force is given to assist the police.

CENTRALISATION OF LEGAL REPORTING

97 *8 **SHRI A. D. MANI** †

† **SHRI S. A. KHAJA MOHI-DEEN**

Will the Minister of LAW AND SOCIAL WELFARE be pleased to state

(a) whether the Chief Justice of India, Shri M. Hidayatulla stated at a function in Delhi in the month of March 1969 that there should be centralisation of legal reporting

(b) whether the subject has been broached to Government by the Supreme Court, and

(c) if so what are Government's reactions to the suggestion?

47 **THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL WELFARE (SHRI MOHAMMAD YUNUS SALEEM)** (a) Yes, Sir

(b) No, Sir

(c) Does not arise.

SHRI A. D. MANI: Referring to (c), may I ask the Minister whether the administration of justice has been

harmed by the present system of reporting of judgments by the various High Courts and by the absence of centralisation of legal reporting?

SHRI P. GOVINDA MENON: It does not follow that because non-official agencies are reporting decisions of the High Courts, there has been any difficulty in the administration of justice. Often it happens that one High Court differs from another High Court, and a third High Court where both these decisions are cited comes to its own conclusion. When the matter goes to the Supreme Court, then a uniform decision comes out.

SHRI A. D. MANI: May I ask the Minister whether apart from this matter the question of publication of these legal reports in the regional languages and Hindi is also being considered by Government and the Supreme Court?

SHRI P. GOVINDA MENON: The State Governments have been advised to have reports of the High Courts and the Supreme Court in the regional languages and help has been offered by the Central Government. The Central Government itself is publishing the Supreme Court judgments and High Courts judgments in the Hindi language.

SHRI K. P. MALLIKARJUNUDU: At the present time there are a number of agencies publishing law reports. Our experience has been the larger the number of reports the greater the confusion. So, will the Government consider the advisability of seeing that one legal, authorised publication of law reports is made either under the direct supervision of the High Courts or the Central Government?

SHRI P. GOVINDA MENON: Under the supervision of the High Courts the Indian Law Report series are being published. But the legal profession does not appear to have taken kindly to those publications and to publish from Nagpur, the All

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri A. D. Mani.

India Reporter, is bringing out all these decisions, and that has become very popular with the legal profession. That is the position. No difficulty has been experienced by the legal profession. On the other hand the availability of decisions to suit any occasion which arises has been a great boon to the members of the legal profession.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: We are naturally interested in how the Central Government and the Law Ministry in particular are considering the proposals coming from so important a personality as the Chief Justice. Do we have the assurance that the Law Ministry is giving due consideration to the proposals, in view of the fact that the Secretary of the Law Ministry, Mr. Gae is reported to have insulted the Deputy Minister of Law, Mr. Mohammad Yunus Saleem? I should like to know whether the country is expected to have any faith or confidence in the Law Minister of the country when we read in the newspapers that a puny Secretary has the temerity to insult a Deputy Minister and nothing is done against the Secretary to stop such a thing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question does not arise.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: The Minister should answer the question. It is a matter for the Law Minister to consider. The Secretary is reported to have insulted... (*Interruption*)

SHRI P. GOVINDA MENON: It only shows the supreme irrelevance of the statement by Mr. Bhupesh Gupta.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Who made it irrelevant? According to me, Mr. Menon, your very existence is highly irrelevant.

SHRI P. GOVINDA MENON: According to me his existence is doubtful.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So far as your supplementary question is concerned, it does not arise out of this question.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I made it very clear. You are right in a way. The Chief Justice made a suggestion. It is for the Law Minister and the Ministry to consider, and we get reports in the newspapers that there is a conflict in the Ministry. They are in a crisis, the Secretary insulting the Deputy Minister. Do you think that they can apply their mind to a serious consideration of the problems suggested by the Chief Justice?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Put a separate question. I shall consider.

श्री राजनारायण : श्रीमन्, मैं एक स्पष्टीकरण चाहता हूँ। मेरा क्लैरीफिकेशन यह है आपकी बात सुन कर कि क्या यह सवाल इस समय यहाँ नहीं उठ सकता कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट के मुख्य न्यायाधीश ने जो सुझाव दिये हैं उन पर यह मंत्रालय इसलिये विचार कर सकने में असमर्थ है कि इस मंत्रालय के सेक्रेटरी में और इसके डिप्टी मिनिस्टर में तालमेल नहीं है और सेक्रेटरी इतनी हिम्मत करता है कि डिप्टी मिनिस्टर को मिनिस्टर की उपस्थिति में बेइज्जत करता है? यह मूल सवाल है और इस सवाल से उठ सकता है; क्योंकि यहाँ का जो लॉ मंत्रालय है, वह इतना निकम्मा हो गया है कि मंत्री महोदय के समक्ष डिप्टी मिनिस्टर की बेइज्जती करता है वहाँ का एक सेक्रेटरी, तो यह एक बड़ा भारी सवाल है और इसकी आपको इजाजत देनी चाहिये कि हम मंत्री महोदय से पूछें कि क्या मंत्री जी ऐसी दिक्कत महसूस करते हैं कि इन कारणों से उनको इतना समय नहीं मिल पा रहा है कि वह इसको तय कर सकें।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You raise this question.

श्री राजनारायण : श्रीमन्, यह स्पष्टीकरण है, क्वेश्चन नहीं है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question hour is over.