

certain supplies were contemplated to be had from certain NATO countries in this connection. The House is aware of the Pakistani attempt to get tanks from Germany first and from Italy and then also from . . .

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** West Germany.

**SARDAR SWARAN SINGH:** West Germany, I have said. But they did not succeed. There is one more matter which is already known to the House; that is, they got F-86 aircraft via Iran and they are likely to get some more tanks from Turkey, which is in the NATO circle. This is all the information that I have got.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Next question.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** Sir, you did not ask me.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Achuta Menon was the chief questioner.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** That is quite different. All that I want to say is . . .

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, you should help me. When I said, "Next question", you should bear with me and have patience.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** You did not allow me. I am not asking a question. I say the honourable Minister has not been fair. He has just told us . . .

(Interruptions)

**IMPLEMENTATION OF SCIENTIFIC POLICY  
RESOLUTION BY THE COMMITTEE ON  
SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY**

\*582. **SHRI R. P. SINHA:**  
**SHRI KRISHAN KANT†:**

Will the **PRIME MINISTER** be pleased to state:

(a) the progress in the study and implementation of Scientific Policy Resolution by the Committee on Science and Technology;

(b) whether any measures have been suggested to improve the implementation; and

(c) if so, the details thereof?

**THE DEPUTY MINISTER (SHRI-MATI NANDINI SATPATHY):** (a) to (c). In order to assess the progress made in the implementation of the Scientific Policy Resolution, it was essential to collect the relevant data and other information from various Ministries and Departments. This has been done. The information received is being analysed and a report containing the results of the analysis will be considered by the Committee on Science and Technology at its meeting in June 1969. Thereafter, it is proposed to hold a Conference of Scientists and educationists some time towards the end of 1969 to discuss the report, together with such recommendations as the Committee on Science and Technology might make.

**SHRI KRISHAN KANT:** While I welcome the programme of the COST and the conference, may I know if the COST has got a proper secretariat to receive and analyse information because the present secretariat of the COST seems to be very small with a Secretary who is also working in the Planning Commission? The work of the COST is very important and it needs a full-time Secretary to analyse and assess the various aspects of the Scientific Policy Resolution, as also to really spell out the Resolution in detail.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI:** Sir, the honourable Member is correct that

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Krishan Kant.

this was the situation earlier on. But for some time it does have a full-time Secretary and he is Dr. V. Ranganathan, who was formerly Deputy Chief Scientist in the Defence Research and Development Organisation. And two other posts have also been sanctioned, and I believe they are to be filled in soon.

**SHRI KRISHAN KANT:** While I welcome the announcement of the Prime Minister, I hope she will agree that these two posts and a Secretary will not be sufficient for really assessing the implementation of the Scientific Policy Resolution in the various Ministries and Departments of the Government of India. May I know from the Government and the Prime Minister whether they agree for an annual science report to be prepared by the COST which could be placed on the Table of the House and discussed as it is done in England?

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI:** Firstly, I forgot to mention that it was decided that the COST secretariat should have ultimately six scientists representing fields such as technology, life sciences, chemistry and physics, operational research and economics. The question of the annual report has been discussed here before and I think the COST itself will offer its comments on this, whether it wants to give such a report or not. As far as the Government is concerned, we do not have a closed mind on the question. But we would like to await their opinion.

**SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY:** I would like to know what the terms of reference to this Committee were and whether any interim report is being called for so that the whole matter may be thrashed out at the highest level.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI:** Sir, the terms of reference were given. I do not have the details here. I am closely in touch with them. I do not know whether they are going to give

formal reports. I am very closely in touch with the Chairman, namely, Dr. Nag Chaudhuri.

**SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA:** May I know from the honourable Prime Minister whether she is aware of the growing dissatisfaction and frustration among the scientists and technologists in this country because of the impediments being placed in the way of their working and, if she is aware of it, may I know from her what steps are being taken to see that our talents in science and technology do not leave this country and that they get proper conditions for working in this country itself.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI:** Sir, this is a very serious problem and we are all deeply concerned about it. But it is also very complex because obviously we do not have the sort of set-up or the resources which can give the opportunities to our brilliant young men which they can get in the more advanced countries. It is not only a question of money—of course, we are short of that—but it is also a question of having certain types of basic research which is already going on and where young persons could get much more freedom to work than is possible here. Here although we give the greatest importance to basic research, in the present economic situation we have to consider other aspects of the question. Take, for instance, the utilisation and application of research to industry. And this means that opportunities in certain specific directions become rather limited. Nevertheless, our senior scientists are going into these matters and we are trying to see what can be done. As I have said, it is a question which is faced not only by us, but even by some of the advanced countries.

**SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA:** I am grateful to the Prime Minister for the explanation. It is not a question of resources because every scientist knows the resources of the country. The real problem is the working

conditions being provided to the scientists and the impediments placed by the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research in the day-to-day working of the National Laboratories and the frustration caused thereby to our scientists.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI:** Every effort is being made that such impediments should not be there and our young scientists—and also the old scientists for that matter—should have greater delegation of power and greater opportunity to work in the direction which they like but I gave the previous explanation merely to show that it is not so simple where the areas of work are limited. Even if you want to give opportunity, it is sometimes not possible, but another difficulty which has to be met—I am not giving it as an excuse but merely stating a fact—is the attitude of mind which exists to-day. We are laying a certain stress on seniority and so on which do come in the way of the younger scientists but we are doing everything possible to try to change this state of affairs.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** Is the Prime Minister aware that the present Director General, Shri Atma Ram, is behaving like a bull in a China shop scaring away many good scientists?

**SHRI C. D. PANDE:** Like you and Rajnarain.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** You are an expert in night clubs. Is she aware that the maternal uncle of an estimable lady in the country is also running a campaign against the scientists and building up a lobby in order to carry on a witch hunt against those scientists who have dynamic and progressive views? Science has to be progressive.

**SHRI N. SRI RAMA REDDY:** Science has no socialism.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** You better write the chargesheet. You can-

not ever write a chargesheet in the Executive Committee.

**SHRI B. K. P. SINHA:** I am on a point of order. What is the content of the question?

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** Content is the content.

**SHRI B. K. P. SINHA:** The matters to which the Member refers are the subject-matter of an enquiry by a Parliamentary Committee. He cannot prejudice the progress of that enquiry by bringing in these allegations which are outside the purview of this question.

**SHRI AKBAR ALI KHAN:** As a Member of the Committee appointed by the Prime Minister, I say that the Committee under the chairmanship of ex-Chief Justice Sarkar is seized of this question.

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA:** I am on a point of explanation. In this House you have given a ruling that no Member will be allowed to raise a point of order during Question Hour. To-day two or three Members were allowed to raise points of order. So far as I am concerned I have not availed of the question time for points of order but other Members have done so. When this ruling is given by you I do not know which rule we should follow. Will you tell us whether you stand by your own ruling and, if so, then how the Members are allowed to raise points of orders?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Points of order are being raised at every step unfortunately from all sides of the House. It is unfortunate. If we really want more questions to be answered, we must make a determination in our minds and conscientiously feel that we should not have any points of order during Question Hour.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** I have taken your ruling very seriously. Every morning when I look at the questions, I say to myself 'No point of order'.

**SHRI B. K. P. SINHA:** I withdraw the words 'point of order'. It is my right and the right of any Member when supplementaries are put in violation of the Rules of Procedure to bring it to your notice, point of order or no point of order.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** In which category it falls?

**SHRI M. M. DHARIA:** That is why I said so far as points of order are concerned they could be raised any moment but because you gave the ruling I am following it I do feel that you should kindly reconsider your decision. As you have to-day said, if the Members feel that more time should be available for questions, then they should not raise points of order. That means you are providing in your ruling that if there is a genuine point, we can raise a point of order.

**SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA:** You have given the ruling but you have not given the ruling on points of disorder.

I have asked a simple question. It has nothing to do with the enquiry. So many things are going on. The Prime Minister can reply 'yes' or 'no' Let her advise me not to ask the question. I am quite amenable to discipline. I have put a simple question if she is aware that the scientists are going away leaving the institution because of the witch-hunt by this gentleman which is being carried on with the help of the maternal uncle of an estimable lady in the country.

**SHRI B. K. P. SINHA:** It is absolutely wrong.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI:** The hon. Member's simple questions are always full of insinuations. I would much rather be asked complicated questions. He has already been answered that this is not within the purview of this particular question. As far as the question of the scientists going away is concerned, this matter

is being looked into. The position is that it has been looked into and certain steps have been taken. Other factors arise and those things are continuing. It is not a question of saying, 'I am not going to look into the matter'. This is a continuous process.

**श्री सुन्दरसिंह भंडारी :** मेरा प्रधान मंत्री महोदया से निवेदन है कि साइंस एंड टेकनालाजी पर जो कमेटी नियुक्त की हुई है यह इस समस्या को ध्यान में रखकर कि यह कंसर्न यहां हाउस में प्रमट किया गया है कि यह तत्काल महत्व देने वाला सवाल है, क्या प्रधान मंत्री महोदया इस कमेटी के काम, जो अभी तक जिम जिस समय में समाप्त हुए हैं, प्रासेसिंग के या जो जो राय उन्होंने मंगाई, उसकी कोई टाइम की मर्यादा जो अभी तक जिम आधार पर जितना काम हुआ है वह हाउस के सामने रख सकेंगी। क्योंकि जो कंसर्न बताया जा रहा है वह इसमें शायद अनावश्यक देरी का है। तो अगर इन बात को समझने की कोशिश की जाय कि कब नियुक्ति हुई थी, कब मुझाव भागे गये, आज तक क्या कदम लिये गये हैं और आगे कौनसी चीज कब तक वे उम्मीद करती हैं, तो इस सारे काम को समझने में सहूलियत होगी।

**श्रीमती इन्दिरा गांधी :** यहाँ पर उन्होंने पांच वर्किंग ग्रुप्स बनाये थे और उन्होंने सब से ज्यादा महत्व दिया था Working Group on non-ferrous metals and minerals को। सकी दो रिपोर्ट्स आ गई हैं और भी वे इस पर चर्चा कर रहे हैं दूसरे चार वर्किंग ग्रुप ये हैं :

Working Group on Instruments.

Working Group on Water Resources.

Working Group on Irrigated Farming.

Working Group on Agro-Chemicals.

इनकी रिपोर्ट्स अभी नह आई है, लेकिन इनकी मीटिंग्स चालू और दो तीन मीटिंग्स हो चुकी हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Ramachandran.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: I rose first. He has no questions.

SHRI G. RAMACHANDRAN: When points of order were being raised, there was no interregnum between them and the questions which followed quickly one after the other. I only want to take one minute to go back to the point of order.

Sir, may I say that of all the rulings you have given so far nothing is more welcome, nothing is more necessary on the floor of the House than the ruling you have given, and please let us have that ruling standing and let no pressure be brought upon you to yield to the contrary.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, I want to make a correction.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: I am yet to put my question, Sir.

श्री राजनारायण : आपने माइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर के बारे में कोई भी कोई व्यवस्था नहीं दी है आपने यही कहा कि वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Sir, I am very sorry I made an error in asking the question. I used the word 'maternal uncle'; I am very sorry; I apologise for it; it is uncle from the maternal side.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour is over.

## WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

### EXTRAORDINARY PRICES CHARGED BY BIG INDUSTRIALISTS

\*583. SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Will the Minister of FOREIGN TRADE AND SUPPLY be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government are aware of a suggestion made at the meeting of the Advisory Council on Trade held on the 22nd and 23rd November, 1968 to the effect that firms on the list of the Director General, Technical Development which are allowed to import raw material are charging extraordinary prices of their end products which are the raw material for other Small or Medium Industry; and

(b) if so, whether Government have taken any steps to check such exploitation by Industrialists?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF FOREIGN TRADE AND SUPPLY (CHOWDHARY RAM SEWAK): (a) A suggestion was made at the last meeting of the Advisory Council on Trade that prices of indigenously manufactured goods used as raw materials in other Small-scale industries which are high should be controlled.

(b) Whenever cases of high prices are brought to the notice of the Government, efforts are made to secure reasonable reduction in prices taking into account the cost aspect.

### †CHINESE-TRAINED NAGA REBELS

\*428 SHRI M. K. MOHTA: Will the Minister of EXTERNAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government are aware that China has set up emergency supply depots on the Sino-Burmese border for supply of provisions and arms etc., to the stranded Chinese-trained Naga rebels in Northern Burma numbering between 1,000 and 1,500 who

\*Transferred from the 12th March, 1969.